

ADB

Volume IV

Handbook for

Users of Consulting Services

Guidelines for Executing Agencies' Submissions

May 2005

Asian Development Bank

Volume IV

Handbook for
Users of Consulting Services

Guidelines for Executing Agencies' Submissions

May 2005

Asian Development Bank

HANDBOOK FOR USERS OF CONSULTING SERVICES

Volume IV

Guidelines for Executing Agencies' Submissions

May 2005
Consulting Services Division
Central Operations Services Office
Asian Development Bank
Manila, Philippines

ABBREVIATIONS

ADB	-	Asian Development Bank
BTP	-	Bio-data Technical Proposal
CRAM	-	Consultant Recruitment Activity Monitoring
CSC	-	Consultants Selection Committee
DS	-	Direct Selection
EA	-	Executing Agency
ETP	-	Evaluation Total Price
FP	-	Financial Proposal
FTP	-	Full Technical Proposal
QBS	-	Quality-Based Selection
QCBS	-	Quality and Cost-Based Selection
RFP	-	Request for Proposal
STP	-	Simplified Technical Proposal
TA	-	Technical Assistance
TOR	-	Terms of Reference
TP	-	Technical Proposal

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE		iv
1.0	<i>PROCEDURE FOR SELECTION OF CONSULTING FIRMS</i>	1
A.	Introduction	2
B.	Quality and Cost Based Selection (QCBS)	3
C.	Quality-Based Selection (QBS)	6
D.	Direct Selection (DS)	8
E.	QCBS Indicative Schedule of Consultant Recruitment Activities	10
F.	QBS Indicative Schedule of Consultant Recruitment Activities	11
2.0	PROCEDURES FOR SELECTION OF INDIVIDUAL CONSULTANTS	12
A.	Methods of Selecting Individual Consultants	13
B.	Competitive Selection	13
C.	Direct Selection	14
3.0	SUBMISSION FORMATS FOR RECRUITMENT OF CONSULTING FIRMS	15
A.	Quality and Cost-Based Selection (QCBS)	16
	SUBMISSION 1 - Report on Shortlisting of Consulting Firms	17
	SUBMISSION 2 - Report on Evaluation of Technical Proposals	19
	SUBMISSION 3 - Report on Financial Evaluation and Ranking of Proposals	20
	SUBMISSION 4 - Draft Negotiated Contract	21
	SUBMISSION 5 - Signed Contract	22
B.	Quality-Based Selection (QBS)	23
	SUBMISSION 1 - Report on Shortlisting of Consulting Firms	24
	Report on Evaluation and Ranking of	
	Proposals	26
	SUBMISSION 2 - Draft Negotiated Contract	27
	SUBMISSION 3 - Signed Contract	28
C.	Direct Selection (DS)	29
	SUBMISSION 1 - Report on Consulting Assignment	30
	SUBMISSION 2 - Draft Negotiated Contract	32
	SUBMISSION 3 - Signed Contract	33
4.0	SUBMISSION FORMATS FOR RECRUITMENT OF INDIVIDUAL CONSULTANTS	34
	SUBMISSION 1 – Engagement of Individual Consultant	35
	SUBMISSION 2 - Signed Contract	36
5.0	TEMPLATES	37
A.	Consulting Firms	38
	Technical Evaluation Sheets	39
	Financial Evaluation Sheets	47
	Data Sheets	53
	Minutes of Contract Negotiations	55
	CRAM	61
B.	Individual Consultant	63
	Technical Evaluation Sheets	63

PREFACE

The consultants for Asian Development Bank (ADB) financed and ADB administered projects are selected and engaged in accordance with the policies and procedures in the *ADB's Guidelines on the Use of Consultants by the Asian Development Bank and Its Borrowers* (the *Guidelines*). These guidelines follow the principles of transparency and competitiveness; consultants are recruited using a competitive process, and ADB closely monitors the progress of the borrower's consultant selection and engagement, supervision of the consultant's implementation of the services, and the borrower's performance evaluation of the services through a series of approvals.

This document provides an outline of the procedures used for borrower's selection of consultants and report formats used for submissions to ADB for such approvals. While outline procedures are discussed in this document, more detailed information on procedures and practices are found in Volumes I, II, and III of the Handbook for Users of Consulting Services.

PART I

PROCEDURE FOR SELECTION OF CONSULTING FIRMS

A. INTRODUCTION

1. Types of Proposals

1. Based on the complexity and budget of the consulting assignment, the consulting firms will be requested to submit one of the following three types of technical proposals.

a. Full Technical Proposal (FTP). FTPs are the most detailed technical proposal format and are commonly used for complex assignments. The FTP is the default type of proposal for contract budgets exceeding \$ 1 million. Forty-five (45) days are allowed for the preparation and submission of the proposal.

b. Simplified Technical Proposal (STP). STPs are the default type of proposal format when the contract budget is more than \$500,000 and equal to or less than \$1,000,000. The STP may also be used on a case-by-case basis when the budget is over \$1,000,000. Thirty five (35) days are allowed for the preparation and submission of the proposal.

c. Bio-data Technical Proposal (BTP). BTPs are the default type of proposal when the contract budget amount is \$500,000 or less, and when consulting firms are directly selected. Twenty one (21) days are allowed for the preparation and submission of the proposal.

2. Methods of Selecting Consulting Firms

2. The *Guidelines* provide for three methods of selecting consulting firms: (i) Quality and Cost-Based Selection (QCBS), (ii) Quality-Based Selection (QBS), and (iii) Direct Selection (DS). The choice of selection method depends on the nature and complexity of the assignment, and is determined during the processing of the loan project. QCBS is based on both quality of the technical proposals and the cost shown in the financial proposals, and it is the *Guidelines'* preferred method. QBS is based only on the quality of the technical proposals and is not frequently used for loan projects. Direct Selection is used only for exceptional cases and it requires adequate justification. Use of QBS Direct Selection require prior approval of ADB. The instructions to consultants and the relevant formats for submission of proposals are contained in the Request for Proposals (RFP).

3. Consultant Recruitment Activity Monitoring (CRAM) ¹

3. ADB maintains a computerized system called "CRAM" for monitoring the consultant recruitment activities in loan projects. CRAM identifies the main activities in the recruitment process, the time normally required for each activity, and target dates for completing each activity. It helps to identify delays and take appropriate remedial actions to get the recruitment process back on schedule.

4. Prior to the EA's shortlisting meeting, ADB sends to the EA the CRAM with planned dates for each activity, as agreed between the EA and ADB. The EA provides ADB the updates of the CRAM with details of achieved dates during each of their submissions. ADB in turn, updates the system and returns the CRAM to EA for further monitoring. On completion of the recruitment of consulting firms, ADB finalizes the CRAM and returns it to the EA for record.

¹ Refer to pages 61-62 for example of CRAM for selection using QCBS and QBS.

B. QUALITY AND COST BASED SELECTION (QCBS)

5. QCBS is a method of selecting consulting firms based on both the quality of their technical proposal and the costs shown in their financial proposal. This section briefly outlines the steps in the selection process and the submission requirements. The main steps are described in paragraphs 6 - 28.

Step 1. Shortlisting of Consulting Firms and Preparation of RFP

6. The Executing Agency (EA) Consultant Selection Committee (CSC) prepares (i) a long list of 15-20 consulting firms; (ii) shortlisting criteria; (iii) consulting services budget including details of provisional sum and contingency; (iv) narrative evaluation criteria; (v) shortlist of 5-7 consulting firms from the long list; and (vi) a draft RFP with terms of reference (TOR), datasheet, summary evaluation sheet and personnel evaluation sheet, and a draft contract. The EA's CSC updates and confirms the schedule in CRAM sent by ADB. Minutes of the meeting are prepared and signed by all members of the CSC.

Step 2. SUBMISSION 1 - Invitation Documents and Shortlist

7. The EA submits to ADB the following CSC approved documents (i) copy of the signed minutes of the CSC shortlisting meeting; (ii) long list; (iii) shortlisting criteria; (iv) narrative evaluation criteria; (v) consulting services budget including details of provisional sum and contingency; (vi) shortlist; (vii) the draft RFP with TOR, data sheet, summary evaluation sheet, personnel evaluation sheet, and a draft contract; and (viii) updated CRAM.

8. If ADB's recommendation (in **Step 3**) involves substantial amendments that require another review by ADB, a resubmission² of the invitation documents may be required.

Step 3. Approval of Invitation Documents and Shortlist by ADB

9. ADB reviews the documents included in SUBMISSION 1 and approves them or makes appropriate recommendations for amendments to be made by EA. Further processing of the consultancy selection by EA is pursued only after receipt of ADB's approval of SUBMISSION 1.

Step 4. Release of RFP to Consultants by EA

10. The EA, on receipt of approval from ADB incorporates ADB's comments as appropriate and sends the RFP to the shortlisted consultants. Narrative technical evaluation criteria are not attached to the RFP but retained by the EA for submission to EA's CSC for use during technical evaluation. Prior to the submission date for proposals, the shortlisted consultants have the right to seek clarifications on the RFP. The EA will send the clarifications in writing not only to the firm that sought clarification but also to all the shortlisted firms without disclosing the source of the query.

Step 5. Receipt of Proposals by EA

11. Under QCBS technical and financial proposals are received, at the same time, in two separate envelopes both placed in one cover envelope. The financial proposals are not opened and are safely stored by the EA until the technical evaluation process is completed and ADB's approval is received. The CSC members do not have access to the financial proposals until the receipt of ADB's approval of the EA's technical evaluation report.

² In general, when submissions are found to be incomplete or necessitate substantial amendments, re-submissions may be called for.

Step 6. Evaluation of Technical Proposals

12. The CSC members separately and independently evaluate the technical proposals using the narrative evaluation criteria prepared by the CSC during short-listing, and approved by ADB. Technical Proposals are scored out of a maximum of 1,000 points.

13. The CSC members jointly discuss the individual scores and arrive at consensus. The CSC disqualifies proposals with scores less than 750 points.

Step 7. SUBMISSION 2 - Evaluation of Technical Proposals

14. The EA submits to ADB the following CSC approved documents (i) copy of the signed minutes of the CSC evaluation meeting; (ii) narrative evaluation criteria; (iii) summary evaluation sheet; (iv) personnel evaluation sheets; (v) narrative comments on evaluation highlighting the strengths and weaknesses of each proposal; and (vi) updated CRAM.

Step 8. Approval of Technical Proposal by ADB

15. ADB reviews the report and approves the EA's technical evaluation or makes appropriate recommendations for amendments to be made by the EA. Further processing of the consultancy selection by the EA is pursued only after receipt of approval from ADB

Step 9. Invitation for Public opening of financial proposals

16. The EA informs, by fax or e-mail, the consultants whose technical proposals were found to be responsive (that is, scored 750 or more points), the time and place where their financial proposals will be publicly opened. The date of public opening should be at least a week after the notification. Attendance of the consultants is optional.

17. At the same time, the EA notifies the consultants whose proposal scored less than 750 points that they have been eliminated from the selection process.

Step 10. Public opening of financial proposals

18. In the presence of consultants who chose to attend the public opening, the EA reads out the scores of the qualified technical proposals (those with a score equal or greater than 750 points). The EA then opens the financial proposals and reads out the total price of each proposal. The EA does not read out any other details of the financial proposals or allow consultants to inspect financial proposals. Immediately after the public opening, the EA sends by fax or e-mail the record sheet with the technical scores and the total price shown in the financial proposals to all firms that submitted responsive proposals.

Step 11. Financial evaluation

19. The EA's CSC reviews the financial proposals and calculates the evaluated total price (ETP) by correcting arithmetic errors, adjusting omissions, and deducting the non-competitive elements – provisional sum and contingency. Costs in currencies other than US dollars are converted to US dollars using the exchange rate from the source and date indicated in the RFP data sheet. The financial proposal with the lowest ETP is given a score of 1,000 and the other proposals are given scores that are inversely proportional to their prices.

The formula used to determine the score of each Financial Proposal is:

$$Sf = 1,000 \times Fm / F$$

Sf- financial score, Fm- lowest priced proposal, F- price of the proposal being considered

Step 12. Ranking of proposal

20. The TEA's CSC calculates the total score for each proposal by adding the weighted scores for technical quality and price. The weight for technical quality is 80 per cent and the weight for cost is 20 per cent. These weights are fixed.

Step 13. SUBMISSION 3 - Financial Evaluation and Ranking of proposals by EA

21. The EA submits to ADB the following CSC approved documents: (i) copy of the signed minutes of the CSC evaluation and ranking meeting; (ii) record of attendance at public opening; (iii) record of proposed total prices; (iv) completed financial evaluation sheets; (v) overall ranking; (vi) updated CRAM; and (vii) a request seeking ADB's approval for commencing contract negotiations with the first ranked firm.

Step 14. Approval of Evaluation and Ranking of proposals by ADB

22. ADB reviews the documents included in SUBMISSION 3 and approves them or makes appropriate recommendations for amendments to be made by the EA. Further processing of the consultancy selection by the EA is pursued only on receipt of approval from ADB.

Step 15. Contract Negotiations

23. Following receipt of ADB approval, the EA invites the first-ranked firm to contract negotiation. When the budget for consulting services is negotiation is normally conducted by fax. The negotiations include technical discussions on the methodology, comments on the TOR, the consultant's personnel and the EA's counterpart facilities. It is important that these discussions do not substantially alter the requirements in the TOR because this might materially alter the terms of the consultant's technical proposal and its costs. During financial negotiations, experts' remuneration rates and the other unit costs shown in the consultant's financial proposal are not subject to negotiation; however, minor changes of inputs and quantities of cost items may be made.

Step 16. SUBMISSION 4 - Draft Negotiated Contract

24. The EA submits to ADB a copy of the draft negotiated contract and updated CRAM.

Step 17. Approval of Draft Negotiated Contract by ADB

25. ADB reviews the draft negotiated contract together with appendixes and approves it or makes appropriate recommendations for amendments to the contract to be made by the EA and the consulting firm.

Step 18. Signing the Contract

26. After receiving ADB's approval of the draft negotiated contract, the EA and the consulting firm sign the contract.

Step 19. SUBMISSION 5 - Signed Contract

27. The EA submits a copy of the signed contract and updated CRAM to ADB for its record.

Step 20. Post Contract Negotiation Actions

28. After the contract has been signed, the EA advises, in writing, the shortlisted firms that were unsuccessful. The financial proposals of the firms that submitted technical proposals that scored less than 750 points are returned unopened.

C. QUALITY-BASED SELECTION (QBS)

29. QBS is a method of selecting a consulting firm based only on the quality of the technical proposals. QBS is not frequently used in loan projects and its use requires ADB approval. Many of the steps for recruiting a firm using QBS are similar to those using QCBS. This section briefly outlines the steps in the selection process and submission requirements. Main steps are described in paragraphs 30 - 45.

Key features of QBS

- (i) The short-listed consultants initially submit only technical proposals. If a financial proposal is submitted together with the technical proposal, the proposals are considered non-responsive.
- (ii) The technical proposals are evaluated and ranked using the same procedures described for QCBS.
- (iii) There is no public opening of financial proposals as no financial proposals are submitted with technical proposals.
- (iv) The first-ranked consultant is invited by the EA to submit its financial proposal prior to contract negotiations.
- (v) At the negotiations the consultant is requested to submit documents to substantiate all of the costs shown in the financial proposal and all these costs may be negotiated.

Step 1. Shortlisting of consulting firms and preparation of RFP

30. The EA CSC prepares (i) a long list of 15-20 consulting firms; (ii) shortlisting criteria; (iii) consulting services budget; (iv) narrative evaluation criteria; (v) shortlist of 5-7 consultants from the long list; and (vi) a draft RFP with appendixes on TOR, datasheet, summary evaluation sheet and personnel evaluation sheet, and a draft contract. The EA's CSC updates and confirms the schedule in CRAM sent by ADB. Minutes of the meeting are prepared and signed by all CSC members.

Step 2. SUBMISSION 1 - Invitation Documents and Shortlist

31. The EA submits to ADB the following CSC approved documents (i) copy of the signed minutes of the CSC shortlisting meeting; (ii) long list; (iii) shortlisting criteria; (iv) narrative evaluation criteria; (v) consulting services budget; (vi) shortlist; (vii) the draft RFP with of TOR, data sheet, summary evaluation sheet and personnel evaluation sheet, and a draft contract; and (viii) updated CRAM.

32. When ADB's recommendation (**in Step 3**) involves substantial amendments, a resubmission³ of the invitation documents may be necessary.

Step 3. Approval of Invitation Documents and Shortlist by ADB

33. ADB reviews the invitation documents included in SUBMISSION 1 and approves the shortlist and the draft RFP or makes appropriate recommendations for amendments to be made by the EA. Further processing of the consultancy selection by EA is pursued only after receipt of ADB's approval of SUBMISSION 1.

³ Resubmission. See footnote 2.

Step 4. Release of RFP to Consultants by EA

34. The EA, on receipt of approval from ADB, incorporates the comments as appropriate and releases the RFP to the shortlisted consultants. Narrative technical evaluation criteria are not attached to the RFP but retained by the EA for submission to EA's CSC for use during evaluation. Prior to the submission date for proposals, the shortlisted consultants have the right to seek clarifications on the RFP. The EA will send the clarifications in writing not only to the firm that sought for clarification but also to all shortlisted firms without disclosing the source of the query.

Step 5. Receipt of Proposals by EA

35. Consultants only submit technical proposals

Step 6. Evaluation and Ranking of Proposals

36. The CSC members separately and independently evaluate the technical proposals using the evaluation criteria approved by the CSC during short-listing, and approved by ADB. Proposals are scored out of a maximum of 1,000 points.

37. The CSC members jointly discuss the individual scores and arrive at a consensus. Based on the scores, the proposals are ranked.

Step 7. SUBMISSION 2 - Evaluation and Ranking of Proposals

38. The EA submits to ADB the following CSC approved documents: (i) copy of the signed minutes of the CSC evaluation and ranking meeting; (ii) narrative evaluation criteria; (iii) summary evaluation sheet; (iv) personnel evaluation sheets; (v) ranking of proposals; (vi) narrative comments on evaluation highlighting the strengths and weaknesses of each proposal; and (vii) updated CRAM. The EA seeks approval from ADB for commencing contract negotiations with first ranked firm.

Step 8. Approval of Evaluation and Ranking of Proposal by ADB

39. ADB reviews the documents and approves EA's technical evaluation or makes appropriate recommendations for amendments to the contract to be made by the EA and consultant. Further processing of the consultancy selection by EA is pursued only after receipt of approval from ADB.

Step 9. Contract Negotiations

40. The EA schedules contract negotiations with the first-ranked consulting firm. The EA requests the firm to submit a financial proposal before the negotiations. All aspects of technical and financial proposals are negotiable. The negotiations include technical discussions on the methodology and comments on the TOR, the staffing, and the EA's counterpart facilities. During financial negotiations, unlike QCBS, the firm must provide documents to substantiate the remuneration rates requested, and the EA may negotiate all aspects of the financial proposals using either the cost-plus-fee time-based contract⁴ or lumpsum contract.⁵

⁴ Cost-plus-fee time-based contract - Under this contract, the consultant provides details of all its costs, and a negotiated fee is then added to these costs. For experts' remuneration, the consultant must provide details including payslips (for full-time employees), and contracts of employment (for independent experts) together with details of the consultants' social cost and overhead costs. Refers to Volume I of the Handbook for Users of Consulting Services for further details.

⁵ Lumpsum contract - Under this contract, the details of the costs and fees are not reflected in the contract. However, the supporting documents are used to arrive at the lumpsum. Refer to Volume I of the Handbook for Users of Consulting Services for further details.

Step 10. SUBMISSION 3 - Draft Negotiated Contract

41. The EA submits to ADB a copy of the draft negotiated contract and updated CRAM.

Step 11. Approval of Draft Negotiated Contract by ADB

42. ADB reviews the EA's draft negotiated contract, together with appendixes, and approves it or makes appropriate recommendations for amendments to the contract to be made by the EA and the consulting firm.

Step 12. Signing the Contract

43. After receiving ADB's approval for the draft negotiated contract, the EA and the consulting firm sign the contract.

Step 13. SUBMISSION 4 - Signed Contract

44. The EA submits a copy of the signed contract and updated CRAM to ADB for its record.

Step 14. Post Contract Negotiation Actions

45. After a contract has been signed, the EA advises, in writing, the other shortlisted firms that were unsuccessful.

D. DIRECT SELECTION (DS)

46. Consulting firms are directly selected only in exceptional cases. This requires adequate justification and prior approval of ADB. The main steps in direct selection are described in paragraphs 47 - 56:

Key features of DS

- (i) The consultant is asked to submit both technical and financial proposals at the same time. Typically BTPs are used. However, when a discussion is required of approach and methodology, STPs may be used.
- (ii) During negotiations the consultant is asked to submit documents to substantiate all of the costs shown in the financial proposal and all these costs may be negotiated as described for QBS in para 40.

Step 1. Finalizing the TOR and Preparation of Request for Proposal

47. The EA CSC prepares (i) appropriate invitation letter; (ii) consulting services budget; (iii) narrative technical evaluation criteria; (iv) justification and approval for direct selection; and (v) draft RFP⁶ with TOR, data sheet, summary evaluation sheet and personnel evaluation sheet, and a draft contract.

Step 2. SUBMISSION 1 - Invitation Documents

48. The EA submits to ADB the following CSC approved documents: (i) copy of the signed minutes of CSC meeting; (ii) appropriate invitation letter; (iii) budget; (iv) narrative technical evaluation criteria; (v) justification and approval for Direct Selection; (vi) draft RFP with TOR, datasheet, summary evaluation sheet, personnel evaluation sheet, and a draft contract; and (vii) updated CRAM.

⁶ The RFP may use either FTP, STP or BTP. In DS, FTP will not include on qualification of the proposer.

Step 3. Approval of Invitation Documents by ADB

49. ADB reviews the documents and approves the draft RFP or makes appropriate recommendations for amendments to be made by the EA. Further processing of the consultancy selection by the EA is pursued only after receipt of approval from ADB.

Step 4. Release of RFP to Consultants by EA

50. The EA releases the RFP to the selected consulting firm.

Step 5. Receipt of Proposals by EA

51. The technical and financial proposals are received at the same time. The EA reviews the technical proposal to make sure it is acceptable.

Step 6. Contract Negotiations

52. The EA schedules contract negotiation with the selected consultant firm. All aspects of technical and financial proposals are negotiable. The negotiations include technical discussions on the methodology and comments on the TOR, the staffing, and the EA's counterpart facilities. During financial negotiations, unlike QCBS, the firm must submit documents to substantiate the remuneration rates requested, and the EA may negotiate all aspects of the financial proposals using either the cost-plus-fee time-based contract⁷ or lumpsum contract.

Step 7. SUBMISSION 2 - Draft Negotiated Contract.

53. The EA submits to ADB a copy of the draft negotiated contract and updated CRAM to ADB for approval.

Step 8. Approval of Draft Negotiated Contract by ADB

54. ADB reviews the EA's draft negotiated contract together with appendixes and approves it or makes appropriate recommendations for amendments to be made by the EA and the consulting firm.

Step 9. Signing the Contract

55. After receiving ADB's approval for the draft negotiated contract, the EA and consulting firm sign the contract.

Step 10. SUBMISSION 3 - Signed Contract

56. The EA submits a copy of the signed contract and updated CRAM to ADB for its record.

⁷ Cost-plus-fee time-based contract. See footnote 4.

QCBS-FTP: Consulting Services Recruitment Activities – Tentative Schedule

ID	Task Name	Duration	-1	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13
0	EA QCBS FTP Recruitment Period	262 days	[Gantt bar spanning from -1 to 13]													
1	EA's CSC shortlisting	10 days	[Gantt bar from 1 to 1.1]													
2	EA's SUBMISSION 1 to ADB	7 days	[Gantt bar from 1.1 to 1.8]													
3	ADB approves SUBMISSSION 1	7 days	[Gantt bar from 1.8 to 2.5]													
4	EA receives ADB approval	7 days	[Gantt bar from 2.5 to 3.2]													
5	EA issues RFP	3 days	[Gantt bar from 3.2 to 3.5]													
6	EA receives consultant's proposals	45 days	[Gantt bar from 3.5 to 4.0]													
7	EA's CSC Evaluation of TP	31 days	[Gantt bar from 4.0 to 4.3]													
8	EA's SUBMISSION 2 to ADB	7 days	[Gantt bar from 4.3 to 5.0]													
9	ADB approves SUBMISSION 2	12 days	[Gantt bar from 5.0 to 5.12]													
10	EA receives ADB approval	7 days	[Gantt bar from 5.12 to 5.19]													
11	Opening of Financial Proposal	14 days	[Gantt bar from 5.19 to 5.33]													
12	EA's Overall Ranking of Proposals	21 days	[Gantt bar from 5.33 to 5.54]													
13	EA's SUBMISSION 3 to ADB	7 days	[Gantt bar from 5.54 to 6.21]													
14	ADB approves SUBMISSION 3	7 days	[Gantt bar from 6.21 to 6.28]													
15	EA receives ADB approval	7 days	[Gantt bar from 6.28 to 6.35]													
16	EA's Invitation to Consultant for CN	17 days	[Gantt bar from 6.35 to 6.52]													
17	EA's contract negotiations	10 days	[Gantt bar from 6.52 to 6.62]													
18	EA's SUBMISSION 4 to ADB	7 days	[Gantt bar from 6.62 to 7.29]													
19	ADB approves SUBMISSION 4	5 days	[Gantt bar from 7.29 to 7.34]													
20	EA receives ADB approval	7 days	[Gantt bar from 7.34 to 8.01]													
21	EA signs contract	10 days	[Gantt bar from 8.01 to 8.11]													
22	EA's SUBMISSION 5 to ADB	7 days	[Gantt bar from 8.11 to 8.78]													
23	Mobilization of consultant	14 days	[Gantt bar from 8.78 to 8.92]													

For STPs, the time taken to complete the Consultant Recruitment Process will be much less than that for FTPs.

QBS: Consulting Services Recruitment Activities – Tentative Schedule

ID	Task Name	Duration	-1	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
0	EA QBS FTP Recruitment Period	208 days								
1	EA CSC shortlisting	10 days								
2	EA's SUBMISSION 1 to ADB	7 days								
3	ADB approves SUBMISSION 1	7 days								
4	EA receives ADB approval	7 days								
5	EA issues RFP	3 days								
6	EA receives consultants' proposals	45 days								
7	EA's Evaluation and Ranking of TP	31 days								
8	EA's SUBMISSION 2 to ADB	7 days								
9	ADB approves SUBMISSION 2	12 days								
10	EA receives ADB approval	7 days								
11	EA's invitation to consultant for CN	17 days								
12	EA's contract negotiations	10 days								
13	EA's SUBMISSION 3 to ADB	7 days								
14	ADB approves SUBMISSION 3	5 days								
15	EA receives ADB approval	7 days								
16	EA signs contract	12 days								
17	EA's SUBMISSION 4 to ADB	7 days								
18	Consultant mobilization	14 days								

For STPs, the time taken for completion of Consultant Recruitment Process will be much less than that for FTPs

PART II

**PROCEDURES FOR SELECTION OF
INDIVIDUAL CONSULTANTS**

A. METHODS OF SELECTING INDIVIDUAL CONSULTANTS

1. For some assignments, recruitment of individual consultants is a more appropriate and cost effective approach compared to using consulting firms. Individual consultants may be engaged directly or through an organization, such as a consulting firm, an academic or research institution, or an international agency. EAs recruiting individual consultants for ADB-financed loan projects must follow ADB's requirements and procedures.

2. *ADB's Guidelines* provide for two methods of selecting individual consultants: (i) competitive selection, and (ii) direct selection. The choice of selection method depends on the complexity and budget for the assignment, and is decided during the processing of the loan project.

B. COMPETITIVE SELECTION

3. This section briefly outlines the main steps in the competitive selection process and submission requirements.

Step 1. Finalizing the TOR

4. The EA finalizes the TOR and the budget for the consulting assignment in consultation with ADB. The EA also decides whether an international or domestic consultant is required.

Step 2. Shortlisting of Candidates

5. The EA's CSC develops criteria for selecting the individual consultant based on the TOR requirements and prepares the budget for the consulting assignment and a shortlist of at least three qualified candidates. Normally not more than one candidate is selected from a particular ADB member country and the criteria must not include any price factors. If the EA requests, ADB will provide the names and qualifications of suitable candidates from its database on Individual Consultants (DICON). The EA may also advertise for suitable candidates in media.

Step 3. Ranking the Candidates

6. Using the criteria, the EA's CSC ranks the candidates, and the EA then makes non-committal inquiry about the availability of the first-ranked candidate.

Step 4. SUBMISSION 1 - Shortlist and Ranking of Candidates

7. The EA submits to ADB the following CSC approved documents: (i) copy of the signed minutes of the CSC shortlisting meeting; (ii) TOR; (iii) consulting services budget; (iv) evaluation criteria; (v) shortlist; (vi) CVs of proposed candidates; (vii) evaluation report, ranking and recommendation; (viii) report of non-committal inquiry; and (ix) a draft contract.

Step 5. Approval of Shortlist and Selection of Candidates by ADB

8. ADB reviews the documents submitted and approves the shortlist, individual consultant selection, and the draft contract.

Step 6. Contract Negotiations

9. The EA negotiates with the first ranked candidate and signs the contract. If the negotiations fail, the EA obtains ADB's approval to negotiate in turn with the next-ranked candidate until agreement is reached.

Step 7. SUBMISSION 2 - Signed Contract

10. The EA submits a copy of the signed contract it to ADB for its record.

C. DIRECT SELECTION

11. This section briefly outlines the steps in the Direct Selection process and the submission requirements.

Step 1. Finalizing the TOR

12. The EA finalizes the TOR and the budget for the consulting assignment in consultation with ADB. The EA also decides whether an international or domestic consultant is required.

Step 2. Identifying a Candidate

13. The EA develops criteria for selecting an Individual Consultant based on the TOR requirements. The EA's CSC then identifies and evaluates the candidates. The EA then makes a non-committal inquiry about their availability. If direct selection is not specified in the RRP or loan agreement, the EA provides justification for direct selection and asks ADB for approval.

Step 3. SUBMISSION 1 - Proposal for Engaging Candidates

14. The EA submits to ADB for approval, the following CSC approved documents: (i) copy of the signed minutes of the CSC meeting; (ii) TOR; (iii) consulting services budget; (iv) evaluation criteria; (v) CV of the proposed candidate; (vi) evaluation report; (vii) report on non-committal inquiry; and (viii) draft contract.

Step 4. ADB Approval of the Direct Selection of Candidates

15. ADB reviews the documents and approves the direct selection and the draft contract.

Step 5. Contract Negotiations

16. The EA negotiates with the candidate and signs the contract.

Step 6. SUBMISSION 2 - Signed Contract

17. The EA submits a copy of the signed contract to ADB for its record.

PART III

SUBMISSION FORMATS FOR RECRUITMENT OF CONSULTING FIRMS

A. Quality and Cost-Based Selection (QCBS)

SUBMISSION 1
REPORT ON SHORTLISTING OF CONSULTING FIRMS
(QCBS Method)

Loan Number/Country/Project Title : _____

Consulting Package Number : _____

Name of Executing Agency : _____

Report Submitted by : _____

Name : _____

Signature : _____

Position : _____

Date : _____

1. **The CSC Members**
(List names of members according to ministry/department/agency, and designation)
2. **Type of Proposal:** FTP/ STP/BTP
(Select types of proposal used)
3. **Budget for Consulting Services Contract:** US\$ _____
4. **Comments on draft RFP including Datasheet, TOR, and Draft Contract:**
[Prepare TOR and complete data sheet (Form 8.1). EAs are advised to avoid making modifications to the standard documentation unless absolutely necessary due to government policy, e.g. applicable law or arbitral procedure. Any proposed deviations from, and changes to, the standard ADB documents are highlighted in this section and a detailed justification must be provided for each such change.]
5. **Criteria for Evaluating Technical Proposals**
[Prepare appropriate summary evaluation sheets¹ (Forms: EV 1.1/EV 1.2/EV 1.3), personnel evaluation sheets² (Form EV 3.1) and the narrative evaluation criteria. Provide weights for each criterion in the summary evaluation sheet and detailed information on how to apply these weights and, if necessary, to distribute them to sub-criteria in narrative evaluation criteria.]
6. **Shortlisting Criteria**
[Apply the following criteria for the shortlisting of the consulting firms for the loan project:
 - (i) *Experience of the firm with projects of similar nature: (Insert further appropriate details)*
 - (ii) *Experience of the firm in the project country or in the region: (Insert further appropriate details)*
 - (iii) *Others: (Include other shortlisting criteria and provide appropriate details)]*

¹ The templates are given in Part 4 of the Handbook. Appropriate template for the 3 types of proposals are: (i) FTP – Form EV 1.1, (ii) STP – Form EV 1.2, and (iii) BTP – Form EV 1.3.

² The Form EV 3.1 is the same for all types of QCBS proposals.

7. Proposed Shortlist of Consultants

(List the names of Consulting Firms, and their country of incorporation)

8. Comments on Shortlisted Firms

(Reasons for including more than one firm per country, if it is the case)

9. Proposed Schedule of Recruitment Activities³

	Date
(i) CSC shortlisting meeting	_____
(ii) SUBMISSION 1 submitted to ADB	_____
(iii) Receipt of ADB's approval of SUBMISSION 1	_____
(iv) Issuance of RFP	_____
(v) Deadline for receipt of proposals	_____
(vi) CSC technical proposal evaluation	_____
(vii) SUBMISSION 2 submitted to ADB	_____
(viii) Receipt of ADB's approval of SUBMISSION 2	_____
(ix) Public opening of financial proposals	_____
(x) CSC financial evaluation and ranking of Proposals	_____
(xi) SUBMISSION 3 submitted to ADB	_____
(xii) Receipt of ADB's approval of SUBMISSION 3	_____
(xiii) Commencement of contract negotiations	_____
(xiv) SUBMISSION 4 submitted to ADB	_____
(xv) Receipt of ADB's approval of SUBMISSION 4	_____
(xvi) Signing of Contract	_____
(xvii) SUBMISSION 5 submitted to ADB	_____
(xviii) Notice to proceed and mobilization	_____
(xix) Commencement of services	_____
(XX) Completion of services	_____

10. Consultant Recruitment Activity Monitoring (CRAM)

(Update and confirm schedule on CRAM)

We request ADB's approval of our shortlist of consulting firms, the criteria for evaluation of technical proposals, the draft RFP, and the draft contract.

Attachments:

Attachment 1	Minutes of CSC meeting
Attachment 2	Budget for consulting services including details of provisional sum and contingency
Attachment 3	Draft RFP with TOR, Datasheet (Form EV 8.1), Summary Evaluation Sheet ⁴ (Forms EV 1.1/EV 1.2/EV 1.3), Personnel Evaluation Sheets ⁵ (Form EV 3.1), and Draft Contract
Attachment 4	Narrative Evaluation Criteria (QCBS)
Attachment 5	Updated CRAM

³ Lead time for each activity could be based on the CRAM given in Page 56.

⁴ The templates are given in Part 4 of the Handbook. Appropriate template for the 3 types of proposals are: (i) FTP – Form EV 1.1, (ii) STP – Form EV 1.2, and (iii) BTP – Form EV 1.3.

⁵ The Form EV 3.1 is the same for all types of QCBS proposals.

SUBMISSION 2
REPORT ON EVALUATION OF TECHNICAL PROPOSALS
(QCBS Method)

Loan Number/Country/Project Title : _____

Consulting Package Number : _____

Name of Executing Agency : _____

Report Submitted by : _____

Name : _____

Signature : _____

Position : _____

Date : _____

- 1. The CSC Members**
(List names of members according to ministry/department/agency, and designation in a table format)
- 2. Result of CSC Evaluation of Technical Proposals:**
(List name of consultant, country, and score in a table format)
- 3. Narrative Comments on the Technical Proposals:**
(CSC's comment on the strengths and weaknesses of each technical proposal including comments on personnel evaluated as "below average.")
- 4. Proposed Date for Public Opening of Financial Proposals:**
(Indicate the location and date of public opening)
- 5. Consultant Recruitment Activity Monitoring (CRAM)**
(Update CRAM. Indicate reasons for any delay and remedial actions taken.)

We request ADB's approval of our evaluation of the technical proposals. We will then publicly open the financial proposals of the technically qualified consultants for financial evaluation and ranking.

Attachments:

Attachment 1	Summary Evaluation Sheet ¹ (Forms EV1.1/ EV 1.2/ EV 1.3) <i>(Provide the appropriate evaluation sheet for the type of proposal selected)</i>
Attachment 2	Personnel Evaluation Sheets ² (Form EV 3.1)
Attachment 3	Updated CRAM

¹ The templates are given in Part 4 of this Handbook. The appropriate templates for the 3 types of proposals are:
 (i) FTP – Form EV 1.1, (ii) STP – Form EV 1.2, and (iii) BTP Form EV 1.3.

² The Form EV 3.1 is the same for all types of QCBS proposals.

SUBMISSION 3
REPORT ON FINANCIAL EVALUATION AND RANKING OF PROPOSALS
(QCBS METHOD)

Loan Number/Country/Project Title : _____

Consulting Package Number : _____

Name of Executing Agency : _____

Report Submitted by : _____

Name : _____

Signature : _____

Position : _____

Date : _____

1. The CSC Members

(List names of members according to ministry/department/agency, and designation in a table format)

2. Evaluation

(The calculation sheets¹ used for the evaluation of financial proposals will have to be submitted to ADB upon request; List name of consultant, country, score and rank on a table format; Provide narrative comments on adjustments/corrections made to the financial proposals of the firms.)

3. Consultant Recruitment Activity Monitoring (CRAM)

(Update CRAM. Indicate reasons for any delay and remedial actions taken.)

We request ADB's approval to have contract negotiations with *(insert name of first-ranked firm)*, the first ranked evaluated firm, commencing on *(insert date)* at *(insert location)*.

Attachments:

Attachment 1	Minutes of CSC meeting on evaluation
Attachment 2	Record of attendance at public opening (Form EV 4.1)
Attachment 3	Record of proposal total prices (Form EV 4.2)
Attachment 4	Completed Summary Evaluation Sheet of financial proposals of individual firms (Form EV 5.6)
Attachment 5	Completed Summary Evaluation Sheet for financial proposals for all firms (Forms EV 6 and EV 6.1)
Attachment 6	Completed Summary Ranking Sheet (Form EV 7)
Attachment 7	Updated CRAM

¹ ADB will provide templates of calculation sheets upon request.

**SUBMISSION 4
DRAFT NEGOTIATED CONTRACT
(QCBS Method)**

Loan Number/Country/Project Title : _____

Name of Executing Agency : _____

Report Submitted by : _____

Name : _____

Signature : _____

Position : _____

Date : _____

1. Comments on Contract Negotiation

(Any changes to ADB's standard contract should be highlighted and explained with adequate justification. In case of unsuccessful negotiations, ADB is to be informed in detail on the reasons for the failure of negotiations. ADB approval must be requested before the next ranked consultant can be invited for contract negotiations.)

2. Consultant Recruitment Activity Monitoring (CRAM)

(Update CRAM; Indicate reasons for any delay and remedial actions taken.)

We request ADB's approval of the negotiated contract with the successful consulting firm
(Name of Firm).

Attachments;

Attachment 1	Minutes of Contract Negotiations
Attachment 2	Draft negotiated contract with appendixes A, B, C, and D
Attachment 3	Updated CRAM

**SUBMISSION 5
SIGNED CONTRACT
(QCBS METHOD)**

Loan Number/Country/Project Title : _____

Name of Executing Agency : _____

Report Submitted by : _____

Name : _____

Signature : _____

Position : _____

Date : _____

Consultant Recruitment Activity Monitoring (CRAM)

(Update CRAM. Indicate reasons for any delay and remedial actions taken)

We are submitting hereto a copy of the signed contract with the consulting firm for ADB's record *(Name of Firm)*.

Attachments:

Attachment 1	Signed contract with appendixes A, B, C and D
Attachment 2	Updated CRAM

B. Quality Based Selection (QBS)

**SUBMISSION 1
REPORT ON SHORTLISTING OF CONSULTING FIRMS
(QBS METHOD)**

Loan Number/Country/Project Title : _____

Consulting Package Number : _____

Name of Executing Agency : _____

Report Submitted by : _____

Name : _____

Signature : _____

Position : _____

Date : _____

1. **The CSC Members**
(List names of members according to ministry/department/agency, and designation in a table format)
2. **Type of Proposal:** FTP/ STP/BTP
(Select the type of proposals used)
3. **Budget for Consulting Services Contract:** US\$ _____
4. **Comments on Draft RFP including TOR, and Datasheet, and Draft Contract:**
[Prepare TOR and complete data sheet (Form 8.2). EAs are advised to avoid making modifications to the standard documentation unless absolutely necessary due to government policy, e.g. applicable law or arbitral procedure. Any proposed deviations from, and changes to, the standard ADB documents are highlighted in this section and a detailed justification must be provided for each such change.]
5. **Criteria for Evaluating Technical Proposals**
[Prepare appropriate summary evaluation sheets¹ (Forms EV 2.1/EV 2.2/EV 2.3), personnel evaluation sheets² (Form EV 3.2) and the narrative evaluation criteria. Provide weights for each criterion in the summary evaluation sheet and detailed information on how to apply these weights and, if necessary, to distribute them to sub-criteria in narrative evaluation criteria.]
6. **Shortlisting Criteria**
[Apply the following criteria the shortlisting of the consulting firms for the Loan project.
 - (i) *Experience of the firm with projects of similar nature: (Insert further appropriate details)*

¹ The templates are given in Part 4 of the Handbook. Appropriate template for the 3 types of proposals are: (i) FTP – Form EV 1.1, (ii) STP – Form EV 1.2, and (iii) BTP – Form EV 1.3.

² The Form EV 3.2 is the same for all types of QBS proposals.

- (ii) *Experience of the firm in the project country or in the region: (Insert further appropriate details).*
- (iii) *Others: (Include other shortlisting criteria and provide appropriate details)]*

7. Proposed Shortlist of Consultants³

(List the names of consulting firms and their country of incorporation)

8. Comments on Shortlisted Firms

(Reasons for including more than one firm per country if it is the case)

9. Proposed Schedule of Recruitment Activities

	Date
(i) CSC shortlisting meeting	_____
(ii) SUBMISSION 1 submitted to ADB	_____
(iii) Receipt of ADB's approval of SUBMISSION 1	_____
(iv) Issuance of RFP	_____
(v) Deadline for receipt of technical proposals	_____
(vi) CSC technical proposal evaluation and ranking	_____
(vii) SUBMISSION 2 submitted to ADB	_____
(viii) Receipt of ADB's approval of SUBMISSION 2	_____
(ix) Receipt of financial proposal	_____
(x) Commencement of contract negotiations	_____
(xi) SUBMISSION 3 submitted to ADB	_____
(xii) Receipt of ADB's approval of SUBMISSION 3	_____
(xiii) Signing of contract	_____
(xiv) SUBMISSION 4 submitted to ADB	_____
(xv) Notice to proceed and mobilization	_____
(xvi) Commencement of services	_____
(xvii) Completion of services	_____

10. Consultant Recruitment Activity Monitoring (CRAM)

(Update and confirm schedule in CRAM)

We request ADB's approval of our shortlist of consulting firms, the criteria for evaluation of technical proposals, the draft RFP, and consulting services contract.

Attachments:

Attachment 1	Minutes of CSC meeting
Attachment 2	Budget for consulting services showing major items
Attachment 3	Draft RFP with TOR, Data sheet (Form EV 8.2), Summary Evaluation Sheet ⁴ (Forms EV 2.1/EV 2.2/EV 2.3), Personnel Evaluation Sheets (Form EV 2.1), and Draft Contract
Attachment 4	Narrative Evaluation Criteria (QBS)
Attachment 5	Updated CRAM

³ Lead time for each activity should be based on the CRAM given in Page 57.

⁴ The templates are given in Part 4 of this Handbook. The Appropriate template for the 3 types of proposals are (i) FTP – Form EV 2.1, (ii) STP – Form EV 2.2, and (iii) BTP – Form EV 2.3.

SUBMISSION 2
REPORT ON EVALUATION AND RANKING OF PROPOSALS
(QBS Method)

Name of Executing Agency : _____

TA Number : _____

Country/Project Title : _____

Report Submitted by : _____

Name : _____

Signature : _____

Position : _____

Date : _____

- 1. The CSC Members**
(List names of members according to ministry/department/agency, and designation)
- 2. Result of CSC Evaluation of Technical Proposals:**
(List name of consultant, country, score and rank on a table format)
- 3. Narrative Comments on the Technical Proposals:**
(CSC's comment on the strengths and weaknesses of each technical proposal including comments on personnel evaluated as "below average.")
- 4. Consultant Recruitment Activity Monitoring (CRAM)**
(Update CRAM; Indicate reasons for any delay and remedial actions taken)

We request ADB's approval of our evaluation and ranking of the technical proposals. We will then request a financial proposal from the first ranked evaluated consulting firm *(insert the name and country of the first-ranked consulting firm)* and commence contract negotiation.

Attachments:

Attachment 1 Summary Evaluation Sheet¹
 (Forms EV1.1/ EV 1.2/ EV 1.3)
(Provide the appropriate evaluation sheet for the type of proposal selected)

Attachment 2 Personnel Evaluation Sheet² (Form EV 3.1)

Attachment 3 Updated CRAM

¹ The templates are given in Part 4 of this Handbook. The appropriate template for the 3 types of proposals are: (i) FTP – Form EV 2.1, (ii) STP – Form EV 2.2, and (iii) BTP – Form EV 2.3.

² The Form EV 3.1 is the same for all types of QBS proposals.

**SUBMISSION 3
DRAFT NEGOTIATED CONTRACT
(QBS Method)**

Loan Number/Country/Project Title : _____

Name of Executing Agency : _____

Report Submitted by : _____

Name : _____

Signature : _____

Position : _____

Date : _____

1. Comments on Contract Negotiation

(Any changes to ADB's standard contract should be highlighted and explained with adequate justification. In case of unsuccessful negotiations, ADB is to be informed in detail on the reasons for the failure of negotiations. ADB approval must be requested before the next ranked consultant can be invited for contract negotiations)

2. Consultant Recruitment Activity Monitoring (CRAM)

(Update CRAM; Indicate reasons for any delay and remedial actions taken)

We request ADB's approval of the negotiated contract with the successful consulting firm
(Name of Firm).

Attachments;

Attachment 1	Minutes of Contract Negotiations
Attachment 2	Draft negotiated contract with appendixes A, B, C, and D
Attachment 3	Updated CRAM

**SUBMISSION 4
SIGNED CONTRACT
(QBS Method)**

Loan Number/Country/Project Title : _____

Name of Executing Agency : _____

Report Submitted by : _____

Name : _____

Signature : _____

Position : _____

Date : _____

Consultant Recruitment Activity Monitoring (CRAM)

(Update CRAM. Indicate reasons for any delay and remedial actions taken.)

We are submitting hereunto a copy of the signed contract with the consulting firm for ADB's record *(Name of Firm)*.

Attachments:

Attachment 1	Signed contract with appendixes A, B, C and D
Attachment 2	Updated CRAM

C. Direct Selection (DS)

**SUBMISSION 1
REPORT ON CONSULTING ASSIGNMENT
(DS Method)**

Loan Number/Country/Project Title : _____

Consulting Package Number : _____

Name of Executing Agency : _____

Report Submitted by : _____

Name : _____

Signature : _____

Position : _____

Date : _____

1. **The CSC Members**
(List of name of member according to ministry/department/agency and designation)
2. **Type of Proposal:** FTP¹/ STP/BTP
(Select the type of proposals used)
3. **Budget for Consulting Services Contract:** US\$ _____
4. **Comments on draft RFP including TOR, Datasheet, and draft Contract:**
[Prepare and complete Data sheet (Form 8.2). EAs are advised to avoid making modifications to the standard documentation unless absolutely necessary due to government policy, e.g. applicable law or arbitral procedure. Any proposed deviations from, and changes to, the standard ADB documents are highlighted in this section and a detailed justification must be provided for each such change.]
5. **Criteria for Evaluating Technical Proposals**
[Prepare appropriate summary evaluation sheets² (Forms: EV 2.1/EV 2.2/EV 2.3), personnel evaluation sheets³ (Form EV 3.2) and the narrative evaluation criteria. Provide weights for each criterion in the summary evaluation sheet and detailed information on how to apply these weights and, if necessary, to distribute them to sub-criteria in narrative evaluation criteria.]

¹ For DS Method, FTPs will not include the section on qualification of proposer.

² The templates are given in Part 4 of the Handbook. Appropriate template for the 3 types of proposals are: (i) FTP – Form EV 1.1, (ii) STP – Form EV 1.2, and (iii) BTP – Form EV 1.3.

³ The Form EV 3.2 is the same for all types of DS proposals.

6. Proposed Schedule of Recruitment Activities

	Date
(i) CSC meeting for preparation of RFP	_____
(ii) SUBMISSION 1 submitted to ADB	_____
(iii) Receipt of ADB's approval of SUBMISSION 1	_____
(iv) Issuance of RFP	_____
(v) Deadline for receipt of technical and financial proposals	_____
(vi) CSC technical proposal evaluation	_____
(vii) Commencement of contract negotiations	_____
(viii) Signing of contract	_____
(ix) SUBMISSION 2 submitted to ADB	_____
(x) Notice to proceed and mobilization	_____
(xi) Commencement of services	_____
(xii) Completion of services	_____

7. Consultant Recruitment Activity Monitoring (CRAM)

(Update and confirm schedule in CRAM)

We request ADB's approval of our invitation documents including the draft RFP with TOR, and draft contract.

Attachments:

Attachment 1	Minutes of CSC meeting
Attachment 2	Budget for consulting services showing major items
Attachment 3	Draft RFP with TOR, Data Sheet (Form EV 8.1), Summary Evaluation Sheet ⁴ (Forms: EV 2.1/EV 2.2/EV 2.3), Personnel Evaluation Sheets (Form EV 3.2), and Draft Contract
Attachment 4	Narrative Technical Evaluation Criteria
Attachment 5	Updated CRAM

⁴ The templates are given in Part 4 of the Handbook. The appropriate template for the 3 types of proposals are (i) FTP – EV 1.1, (ii) STP – EV 1.2, and (iii) BTP – EV 1.3.

**SUBMISSION 2
DRAFT NEGOTIATED CONTRACT
(DS Method)**

Loan Number/Country/Project Title : _____

Consulting Package Number : _____

Name of Executing Agency : _____

Report Submitted by : _____

Name : _____

Signature : _____

Position : _____

Date : _____

1. Comments on Contact Negotiation

(Any changes to ADB's standard contract should be highlighted and explained with adequate justification. In case of unsuccessful negotiations, ADB is to be informed in detail on the reasons for the failure of negotiations. ADB approval must be requested before the next ranked consultant can be invited for contract negotiations.)

2. Consultant Recruitment Activity Monitoring (CRAM)

(Update CRAM. Indicate reasons for any delay and remedial actions taken.)

We request ADB's approval of the negotiated contract with the successful consulting firm
(Name of Firm).

Attachments;

Attachment 1	Minutes of Contract Negotiations
Attachment 2	Draft negotiated contract with appendixes A, B, C, and D
Attachment 3	Updated CRAM

**SUBMISSION 3
SIGNED CONTRACT
(DS Method)**

Loan Number/Country/Project Title : _____

Consulting Package Number : _____

Name of Executing Agency : _____

Report Submitted by : _____

Name : _____

Signature : _____

Position : _____

Date : _____

Consultant Recruitment Activity Monitoring (CRAM)

(Update CRAM. Indicate reasons for any delay and remedial actions taken.)

We are submitting hereunto a copy of the signed contract with the consulting firm for ADB's record *(Name of Firm)*.

Attachments:

Attachment 1 Signed contract with appendixes A, B, C and D
Attachment 2 Updated CRAM

PART IV

SUBMISSION FORMATS FOR RECRUITMENT OF INDIVIDUAL CONSULTANTS

**SUBMISSION 1
ENGAGEMENT OF INDIVIDUAL CONSULTANT**

Loan Number/Country/Project Title : _____

Name of Executing Agency : _____

Report Submitted by : _____

Name : _____

Signature : _____

Position : _____

Date : _____

1. **Positions:**
(Indicate the expertise required)
2. **Budget for Consulting Services Contract:** US\$ _____
3. **Dates:**
(Indicate the commencement and completion date).
4. **Inputs:**
(Indicate calendar days or person month)
5. **Type of Assignment:**
(Indicate whether continuous or intermittent)
5. **Proposed Consultants:**
(List name of selected consultants by country)

We request ADB's approval to engage the above individual consultant

Attachments:

Attachment 1	Curriculum Vitae (CV) of candidate
Attachment 2	TOR
Attachment 3	Details of budget
Attachment 4	Individual consultant's evaluation sheet

Additional Attachment (if applicable)

Attachment 5	Minutes of CSC Meeting
Attachment 6	Approval for direct selection

**SUBMISSION 2
SIGNED CONTRACT**

Loan Number/Country/Project Title : _____

Name of Executing Agency : _____

Report Submitted by : _____

Name : _____

Signature : _____

Position : _____

Date : _____

We are submitting herewith a copy of the signed contract with the individual consultants (*Name*).

Attachments:

Attachment 1 Signed Contract

PART V
TEMPLATES

A. CONSULTING FIRMS

1. Technical Evaluation Sheets:

Form EV 1.1 - Summary Evaluation Sheet FTP (QCBS)
 Form EV 1.2 - Summary Evaluation Sheet STP (QCBS)
 Form EV 1.3 - Summary Evaluation Sheet BTP (QCBS)
 Form EV 2.1 - Summary Evaluation Sheet FTP (QBS)
 Form EV 2.2 - Summary Evaluation Sheet STP (QBS)
 Form EV 2.3 - Summary Evaluation Sheet BTP (QBS)
 Form EV 3.1 - Personnel Evaluation Sheet (QCBS)
 Form EV 3.2 - Personnel Evaluation Sheet (QBS)

2. Financial Evaluation Sheets:

Form EV 4.1 - Record of Attendance
 Form EV 4.2 - Record of Technical Scores and Proposal Prices
 Form EV 5 - Summary Evaluation Sheet for Firm's Financial Proposal
 Form EV 6 - Summary Evaluation Sheet of Financial Proposals
 Form EV 7 - Summary Proposal Ranking Sheet

3. Data Sheets

Form EV 8.1 - Data Sheet (QCBS)
 Form EV 8.2 - Data Sheet (QBS)

4. Minutes of Contract Negotiations:

Contract Negotiation Minutes (QCBS) - CN-MIN (QCBS)
 Contract Negotiation Minutes (QBS) - CN-MIN (QBS)

5. Consultant Recruitment Activity Monitoring (CRAM) Guide for Completing CRAM

CRAM (QCBS)
 CRAM (QBS)

B. INDIVIDUAL CONSULTANT

1. Technical Evaluation Sheet

Form EV 9.1 - Individual Consultant's Evaluation Sheet

ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK
SUMMARY EVALUATION SHEET FOR BIODATA TECHNICAL PROPOSALS (QCBS)

CONFIDENTIAL

Loan No./Title:

EVALUATION CRITERIA	Max. Weight ¹	Firm 1		Firm 2		Firm 3		Firm 4		Firm 5	
		Rating	Score	Rating	Score	Rating	Score	Rating	Score	Rating	Score
I. Personnel Schedule & Work Plan	100										
II. Personnel (Areas of Expertise)	900										
International Consultants	450										
a. Team Leadership ²	70										
b. Expert 1	100										
c. Expert 2	70										
d. Expert 3	70										
e. Expert 4	70										
f. Expert 5	70										
Domestic Consultants	450										
a. Expert 1	90										
b. Expert 2	90										
c. Expert 3	90										
d. Expert 4	90										
e. Expert 5	90										
TOTAL	1000										

Rating: Excellent - 100% Very Good - 90% Above Average - 80% Average - 70% Below Average - 50% Non-complying - 0% (Please use exact rating. For example, 80% for above average)

Score: Maximum Weight x Rating / 100

Note: ¹To be determined by the CSC ²Team Leader shall be the _____ expert.

Criteria Approved by: CHAIRPERSON	Date Approved:	Evaluation Done by: CHAIRPERSON	Date Evaluated:
---	----------------	---	-----------------

FORM EV 1.3

CONFIDENTIAL

ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK SUMMARY EVALUATION SHEET FOR SIMPLIFIED TECHNICAL PROPOSALS (QBS)

Loan No./Title:

EVALUATION CRITERIA	Max. Weight ¹	Firm 1		Firm 2		Firm 3		Firm 4		Firm 5	
		Rating	Score	Rating	Score	Rating	Score	Rating	Score	Rating	Score
I. Approach and Methodology	300										
a. Quality of Approach and Work Plan	200										
b. Personnel Schedule	50										
c. Proposal presentation	50										
II. Personnel (Areas of Expertise)	700										
International Consultants	500										
a. Team Leadership ²	50										
b. Expert 1	90										
c. Expert 2	90										
d. Expert 3	90										
e. Expert 4	90										
f. Expert 5	90										
Domestic Consultants	200										
a. Expert 1	40										
b. Expert 2	40										
c. Expert 3	40										
d. Expert 4	40										
e. Expert 5	40										
TOTAL	1000										

Rating: Excellent - 90 -100% Good - 80 - 89% Average - 70 - 79% Below Average - 0 - 69%

Score: Maximum Weight x Rating / 100

Note: ¹To be determined by the CSC, ²Team Leader shall be the _____ expert.

Criteria Approved by: <div style="text-align: center;">CHAIRPERSON</div>	Date Approved:	Evaluation Done by: <div style="text-align: center;">CHAIRPERSON</div>	Date Evaluated:
---	----------------	---	-----------------

FORM EV - 2.2

ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK

CONFIDENTIAL

PERSONNEL EVALUATION SHEET FOR TECHNICAL PROPOSALS (QCBS)

Loan No./Title:

Name of Firm:

POSITION/AREA OF EXPERTISE	NAME	Maximum Weight ¹	A		B		C		D		TOTAL SCORE (A+B+C+D)
			General Qualifications		Project-Related Experience		Overseas/Country Experience		Full-Time Permanent Staff ²		
			Expert	TL	Expert	TL	Expert	TL	Expert	TL	
			%	%	%	%	%	%	5%	10%	
International Consultants			Rating	Score	Rating	Score	Rating	Score	Rating	Score	
a.	Team Leadership										
b.	Expert 1										
c.	Expert 2										
d.	Expert 3										
e.	Expert 4										
f.	Expert 5										

Domestic Consultants	NAME	Maximum Weight ¹	A		B		C		TOTAL SCORE (A+B+C+D)
			General Qualifications		Project-Related Experience		Others ³		
			%		%		%		
			Rating	Score	Rating	Score	Rating	Score	
a.	Expert 1								
b.	Expert 2								
c.	Expert 3								
d.	Expert 4								
e.	Expert 5								

Rating: Excellent - 100% Very Good - 90% Above Average - 80% Average - 70% Below Average - 50% Non-complying - 0% (Please use exact rating. For example, 80% for above average)

Score: Weight x Rating

Notes: ¹Weight and Percentages are determined by CSC. ²Applicable to both lead and associate firms. ³Requirements are optional and to be decided at the CSC-SL.

FORM EV - 3.1

ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK

CONFIDENTIAL

PERSONNEL EVALUATION SHEET FOR TECHNICAL PROPOSALS (QBS)

Loan No./Title:

Name of Firm:

POSITION/AREA OF EXPERTISE	NAME	Maximum Weight ¹	A		B		C		D		TOTAL SCORE (A+B+C+D)
			General Qualifications		Project-Related Experience		Overseas/Country Experience		Full-Time Permanent Staff ²		
			Expert	TL	Expert	TL	Expert	TL	Expert	TL	
			%	%	%	%	%	%	5%	10%	
International Consultants			Rating	Score	Rating	Score	Rating	Score	Rating	Score	
a.	Team Leadership										
b.	Expert 1										
c.	Expert 2										
d.	Expert 3										
e.	Expert 4										
f.	Expert 5										

Domestic Consultants	NAME	Maximum Weight ¹	A		B		C		TOTAL SCORE (A+B+C+D)
			General Qualifications		Project-Related Experience		Others ³		
			%		%		%		
			Rating	Score	Rating	Score	Rating	Score	
a.	Expert 1								
b.	Expert 2								
c.	Expert 3								
d.	Expert 4								
e.	Expert 5								

Rating: Excellent - 90-100% Good - 80-89% Average - 70-79% Below Average - 0-69%

Score: Weight x Rating

Notes: ¹Weight and Percentages are determined by CSC. ²Applicable to both lead and associate firms. ³Requirements are optional and to be decided at the CSC-SL.

FORM EV 3.2

**ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK
RECORD OF ATTENDANCE AT OPENING OF FINANCIAL PROPOSALS (QCBS)**

LOAN NO./TITLE:

CONSULTING FIRM

Name of Firm	Nationality	Representative's Name	Designation	Signature

GOVERNMENT STAFF

Name of Staff	Ministry/Department	Designation	Signature

Venue:

Date:

Time:

FORM EV - 4.1

**ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK
RECORD OF TECHNICAL SCORE AND PROPOSAL PRICES
AT OPENING OF FINANCIAL PROPOSALS**

Loan No./Title

Name of Firm	Nationality	Technical Score	Currency	Total Price	Signature of Consultant Representative ¹	Remarks
Firm A	Australia	880	A\$	1,213.00		
Firm B	U.S.A.	870	US\$	920.00		
Firm C	U.K.G.	800	UK£	508.00		
Venue:		Date:			Time:	
Prepared by:		Position:			Signature:	

FORM EV - 4.2

ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK		
SUMMARY EVALUATION SHEET FOR FIRMS FINANCIAL PROPOSAL (IN US\$)		
Loan No./Title:		
Name of Firm:		
<u>Competitive Components¹</u>		
<i>Remuneration</i>	<u>600,000</u>	
<i>Out-of-Pocket Expenses</i>	<u>170,000</u>	
<i>Discount (%) Applied to Rem & OPE</i>	<u>0</u>	
<i>Sub-Total (Evaluated Total Price)</i>		<u>770,000</u>
<u>Non-Competitive Components²</u>		
<i>Provisional Sum</i>	<u>120,000</u>	
<i>Contingencies</i>	<u>80,000</u>	
<i>Sub-Total</i>		<u>200,000</u>
Adjusted Total Price		<u>970,000</u>
Prepared by:		

FORM EV - 5

¹ After adjustments for errors, omissions and discounts

² As per requirements of the RFP

**ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK
SUMMARY EVALUATION SHEET OF FINANCIAL PROPOSALS**

Loan No./Title:

Name of Firm	Price at Opening of Financial Proposals (US\$)				Adjustments ³ (US\$)	Adjusted Total Price (US\$)	Provisional Sum ⁴ and Contingencies	Evaluated Total Price ⁵
	Currency ¹	Amount	Exchange Rate ²	US\$ Equivalent				
	1	2	3	4 = 2X3				
Firm A	A\$	1,213,000	0.75	910,000	+ 60,000	970,000	(200000)	770,000
Firm B	US\$	920,000	-	920,000	-	920,000	(200000)	720,000
Firm C	UK£	508,000	1.83	930,000	+ 20,000	950,000	(200000)	750,000
Prepared By:					Position:			
Signature:					Date:			

FORM EV - 6

¹ Currency - Currency of submission
² Exchange Rate - The rate from the source indicated in the Datasheet of the RFP
³ Adjustment - Includes corrections for the mathematical errors, adjustments for omissions and discounts. See detail in Form EV - 6.1
⁴ As for RFP requirement
⁵ Evaluated Total Price = Adjusted total price less provisional sum and contingency

**ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK
FINANCIAL PROPOSAL PRICE ADJUSTMENTS**

Loan No./Title

	US\$	US\$
<p>Firm A</p> <p><i>Bidders financial proposal price</i></p> <p><i>Adjustments:</i></p> <p style="padding-left: 20px;"><i>(1) Increase in provisional sum as per RFP requirement</i></p> <p style="padding-left: 20px;"><i>(2) Increase in contingency as per RFP requirement</i></p> <p><i>Adjusted Total Price</i></p>	<p></p> <p><u>50,000</u></p> <p><u>10,000</u></p> <p></p>	<p><u>910,000</u></p> <p></p> <p><u>60,000</u></p> <p></p> <p><u>970,000</u></p>
<p>Firm B</p> <p><i>No Adjustment</i></p>		
<p>Firm C</p> <p><i>Bidders financial proposal price</i></p> <p><i>Adjustments:</i></p> <p style="padding-left: 20px;"><i>(1) Increase in international consultancy inputs for expertise A by one person month at 20,000 person-month as per Tehnical Proposal</i></p>	<p></p> <p><u>20,000</u></p>	<p><u>930,000</u></p> <p></p> <p><u>20,000</u></p> <p></p> <p><u>950,000</u></p>

FORM EV - 6.1

Note: Provide details of adjustment made on each of the financial proposal prices as per the above format.

**ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK
SUMMARY PROPOSAL RANKING SHEET**

LOAN NO./TITLE:

FIRM NAME	TECHNICAL EVALUATION			FINANCIAL EVALUATION					COMBINED	RANKING
	Technical Score Points	Technical Wt. Factor (80%)	Technical Points	Firm Proposed Price (US\$)	Evaluated Total Price ¹ (US\$)	Financial Score Points ²	Price Wt. Factor (20%)	Price Points	Total Evaluation Points	
	1	2	3 = 1 x 2	4	5	6	7	8 = 6 x 7	9 = 3 + 8	
Firm A	880	0.8	704.00	910,000.00	\$770,000.00	935	0.2	187.00	891.00	2
Firm B	870	0.8	696.00	920,000.00	\$720,000.00	1000	0.2	200.00	896.00	1
Firm C	800	0.8	640.00	930,000.00	\$750,000.00	960	0.2	192.00	832.00	3
			Lowest Evaluated Price:		\$0.00					
Prepared by:					Position:					
Signature:					Date:					

FORM EV - 7

¹ Excluding price of non-competitive elements - Provisional sum and Contingencies.

² $S_f = 1,000 \times F_m / F$ where S_f is the financial score, F_m is the lowest priced proposal, F is the price of proposal being considered

**DATA SHEET
(QCBS)
Loan No./Country/Title**

Form EV – 8.1

Ref. No.: LOI/LNXXXX-Country

Reference Clauses		
1.1	Method of Selection	QCBS
4.2 (i)	Type of Technical Proposal required	<i>(Insert details)</i>
6.5	Submission time and date of Proposal ¹	<i>1600 hours</i>
8.1	Expected date public opening of Financial Proposals	<i>(Insert details)</i>
10.1	Expected date to start contract negotiations	<i>(Insert details)</i>
13.1	Expected date for commencement of consulting services	<i>(Insert details)</i>
1.7	Budget for consulting services assignment	<i>(Insert details)</i>
5.4	Provisional sums (US\$ Amount)	<i>(Insert details)</i>
5.4	Contingency (US\$ Amount)	<i>(Insert details)</i>
8.1 (iv)	Reference exchange rate	<i>(Insert details)</i>
5.8	<p>Amounts payable by the Client to the Consultants under the contract to be subject to local taxation: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p>In the affirmative, the Client will reimburse the Consultants for any such taxes paid by the Consultants: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p>The Client will pay such taxes on behalf of the Consultants: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	
1.12	Validity of Proposal ¹	<i>(Insert details)</i>
7.3	Evaluation Sheet	<i>Please refer to Data Sheet Appendix 1</i>
1.2	REPRESENTATIVE/CONTACT PERSON AND ADDRESS OF THE EXECUTING AGENCY <i>(INSERT DETAILS)</i>	
4.3 (vii)	The Executing Agency will provide the following:	<i>(Insert details)</i>
2.1	Name and Address of the Client where correspondence concerning this Request for Proposal is to be sent: <i>(Insert details)</i>	
6.4	Consultants must submit an original and 2 copies of the Technical Proposal, and an original Financial Proposal to the Client at the following address: <i>(Insert details)</i>	
6.5	3 copies of the Technical Proposal to ADB with the following address: <p style="text-align: center;"><i>The Director, Consulting Services Division Asian Development Bank P.O. Box 789, 0980 Manila, Philippines</i></p>	
6.5	1 COPY OF THE TECHNICAL PROPOSAL TO THE ADB RESIDENT MISSION WITH THE FOLLOWING ADDRESS:	

¹ Proposal consists of Technical and Financial Proposals.

FORM CN-MIN (QCBS)

[INSERT NAME OF EXECUTING AGENCY IN CHARGE OF NEGOTIATIONS]

MINUTES OF CONTRACT NEGOTIATIONS WITH
 [CONSULTING FIRM]
 in association with
 [Associate Firm]
 [Date]
 (QCBS)

SUBJECT: ***[Loan No. and Title]***

PRESENT: **For the [Name of the Executing Agency]**

[Names and Designations of Government Representatives]

For the Consultant

[Names and Designations of Consultant's Representatives]

Observers *[if any]*

[Name and Designation of Observers]

1. Opening Remarks

On behalf of *[Name of Executing Agency]*, *[Name of Chief Negotiator]* welcomed the representatives from the Consultants to the contract negotiations.

2. Submission of Written Authorization

On behalf of the Consultant, *[Name of Representative]* expressed his/her thanks for being invited to contract negotiations for the above-mentioned project. The Representative submitted an authorization letter to negotiate and sign a contract with *[Name of the Executing Agency]* on behalf of *[Name of Consulting Firm]*.

3. Scope of Work/Terms of Reference (TOR)

(Insert here any changes and modifications to the scope of work and the TOR that have been agreed during the Contract Negotiations)

4. Work Program and Personnel Schedule

(Insert here any modifications or changes of the Work Program, the Staffing Schedule, the Personnel, etc.)

It was agreed that the Services will commence [*commencement date*] and the assignment will be completed, after submission of the Final Report, on [*completion date*].

The complete reporting schedule was agreed as follows:

	<u>Date</u>
i. Inception Report	_____
ii. Mid-Term Report	_____
iii. Draft Final Report	_____
iv. Final Report	_____

5. Personnel

The Consultant has confirmed the availability of all experts in the team for their respective assignments in accordance with the Staffing Schedule.

6. Counterpart Support

(*Name of Executing Agency*) confirmed to provide the following to the Consultant:

(*Insert here all items agreed upon to be provided by the Executing Agency to the Consultant*)

7. Equipment

The following equipment will be purchased by the Consultant using the budget specified in the contract:

(*Insert here all equipment agreed upon to be procured by the Consultant for the project*)

All the equipment shall be used by the Consultant for the entire duration of the assignment and shall be handed over to the EA upon completion of the assignment.

8. Financial Terms

The Executing Agency (EA) and the Consultant reviewed the Consultant's financial proposal, including the adjustments made by the EA for computation and miscellaneous errors, for currency conversions and to ensure consistency with the Consultant's technical proposal. Some minor adjustments were agreed during the negotiations. Details of the financial terms appear in Appendix C of the Contract.

In accordance with Section 7.02 of the *General Conditions of Contract*, the Consultant will permit the duly authorized representatives of the EA and if so required, ADB, including auditors selected by the EA and ADB, to audit the Consultant's accounts and records relating to the payments made under this Contract. Where an audit identifies that a Consultant, during negotiations or implementation of a project, has misled the EA and/or ADB or contravened the principles stated in ADB's *Guidelines on the Use of Consultants (Guidelines)*, the EA and/or ADB may sanction the Consultant from participating in any future consulting services assignments financed by ADB.

9. Anti-corruption

In accordance with relevant Government regulations and the terms of ADB's Anti-corruption Policy and ADB's *Guidelines*, the Government, the Consultant, and ADB must observe the highest standard of ethics during the execution of the TA. No fees, gratuities, rebates, gifts, commissions or payments other than those shown in the Contract have been, or are to be given or, received in connection with Contract execution.

10. Consultant's Contract

The draft negotiated contract prepared by the *[Executing Agency]* was reviewed and agreed upon. A signed copy of the negotiated contract is attached to these minutes. The EA and the Consultant will execute the Contract upon receiving approval by Government authorities concerned and ADB.

[11. Observer

The Observer, *(if any)* is signing these minutes in his or her capacity as observer to the negotiations only, and is not a party to the contract.]

12. Performance Evaluation

The method that *(Executing Agency)* and ADB would use for evaluating the performance of the Consultant was explained and the Consultant agreed to undergo this evaluation.

13. Contract Administration

Detailed procedures for processing payment and contract administration are specified in the Contract.

Signed this _____ day of _____ 200_

FOR THE **CONSULTANT**

FOR THE **[EXECUTING AGENCY]**

Consultant's Authorized Rep.

Chief Negotiator

THE **OBSERVER** *[if any]*

[Name of Observer]

FORM CN-MIN (QBS)

[INSERT NAME OF EXECUTING AGENCY IN CHARGE OF NEGOTIATIONS]

MINUTES OF CONTRACT NEGOTIATIONS WITH
 [CONSULTING FIRM]
 in association with
 [Associate Firm]
 [Date]
 (QBS)

SUBJECT: **(Loan No. and Title)**

PRESENT: **For the (Name of the Executing Agency)**

(Names and Designations of Government Representatives)

For the Consultant

(Names and Designations of Consultant's Representatives)

Observers *(if any)*

(Name and Designation of Observers)

1. Opening Remarks

On behalf of *(Name of Executing Agency)*, *(Name of Chief Negotiator)* welcomed the representatives from the Consultants to the contract negotiations.

2. Submission of Written Authorization

On behalf of the Consultant, *(Name of Representative)* expressed his thanks for being invited to contract negotiations for the above-mentioned project. The Representative submitted an authorization letter to negotiate and sign a contract with *(Name of the Executing Agency)* on behalf of *(Name of Consulting Firm)*.

3. Review of Documentation

The documentation submitted by the Consultant in support of the financial proposal was reviewed and found in order.

4. Scope of Work/Terms of Reference (TOR)

(Insert here any changes and modifications to the scope of work and the Terms of Reference that have been agreed during the Contract Negotiations)

5. **Work Program and Personnel Schedule**

(Insert here any modifications or changes of the Work Program, the Personnel Schedule, the Personnel Allocation, etc.)

It was agreed that the consultant service will commence (*commencement date*) and the assignment will be completed upon submission of final report on (*completion date*).

The complete reporting schedule was agreed as follows:

	<u>Date</u>
i. Inception Report	_____
ii. Mid-Term Report	_____
iii. Draft Final Report	_____
iv. Final Report	_____

6. **Personnel**

The Consultant has confirmed the availability of all experts in the team for their respective assignments in accordance with the personnel schedule.

7. **Counterpart Support**

(Executing Agency) confirmed to provide the following on a no-cost basis to the Consultant:

(Insert here all items agreed upon to be provided by the Executing Agency to the Consultant]

All the counterpart support, facilities and information shown above would be provided by the Government in kind and would be free of charge to the Consultant.

8. **Equipment**

The following equipment will be purchased by the Consultant using the budget specified in the contract:

(Insert here all equipment agreed upon to be procured by the Consultant for the project)

All the equipment shall be used by the Consultant for the entire duration of the assignment and shall be handed over to the EA upon completion of the works.

9. **Financial Terms**

The Consultant's financial proposal, generally substantiated by the required supporting documents was reviewed and upon discussion of relevant items, revisions and adjustments were made in agreement with the Consultant. Details of financial terms appear in Appendix C of the Contract Agreement.

In accordance with Section 7.02 of the *General Conditions of Contract*, the Consultant will permit the duly authorized representatives of the EA and if so required, ADB,

including auditors selected by the EA and ADB, to audit the Consultant's accounts and records relating to the payments made under this Contract. Where an audit identifies that a Consultant, during negotiations or implementation of a project, has misled the EA and/or ADB or contravened the principles stated in ADB's *Guidelines on the Use of Consultants (Guidelines)*, the EA and/or ADB may sanction the Consultant from participating in any future consulting services assignments financed by ADB.

10. **Anti-corruption**

In accordance with prevailing Government regulations and the established policy in ADB's Guidelines on the Use of Consultants in October 1998, the Government, as well as ADB and the Consultant must observe the highest standard of ethics during the execution of this project. No fees, gratuities, rebates, gifts, commissions or payments other than those shown in the Contract are to be given or received in connection with the contract execution.

11. **Consultant's Contract**

The draft contract prepared by the *[Executing Agency]* was reviewed and agreed upon. A signed copy of the contract is attached to these minutes.

[The Observer, (if any) is signing these minutes in his or her capacity as observer to the negotiations only, and is not a party to the contract.]

12. **Performance Evaluation**

The method that *(Executing Agency)* would use for evaluating the performance of the Consultant was explained and the Consultant agreed to undergo this evaluation.

13. **Contract Administration**

Detailed procedures for processing payment and contract administration are specified in the contract.

Signed this _____ day of (month) 200_

FOR THE **CONSULTANT**

FOR THE **[EXECUTING AGENCY]**

Consultant's Authorized Rep.

Chief Negotiator

THE **OBSERVER** *[if any]*

[Name of Observer]

Consultant Recruitment Activity Monitoring (CRAM)

A. Loan No. and Title	Loan 2021-BAN: Road Network Improvement - Road Master Plan		SAMPLE SHEET	Last edited by: Rafael E. Aquino on 17/05/2005 02:23 PM
B. Contract Budget (US\$)	1,000,000			
C. Selection Method	QBS			
D. Type of Technical Proposal	Full			
E. Executing Agency (EA)	Roads and Highways Department			
F. EA Contact Person	A.K.M. Faizur Rahman	Initials: AFR		
G. Loan Supervision Division of RM	BRM			
H. ADB Project Officer	Stefan Ekelund	Initials: SEK Project Assistant:		
I. ADB COCS Officer	Sivaguru Sahajananthan	Initials: SS		
J. Actual Date of Short-Listing (SL) by EA	13/04/2005			

Activity	Responsible Staff	NORM	Planned			Actual			Deviation		Explanation and Action
			Calendar Days	Dates	Calendar Days	Cummulative Days	Achived Date	Days	Cummulative Days	Days	
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12
From:	To:										
1 EA CSC-SL meeting	EA submitting shortlist to ADB	AFR	10	23/04/05	10	10	20/04/05	7	7	(-3)	(-3)
2 EA submitting shortlist to ADB	ADB CSC-SL meeting	SEK	7	30/04/05	7	17	27/04/05	7	14	0	(-3)
3 ADB CSC-SL meeting	Signing of the CSC-SL minutes	SEK	5	05/05/05	5	22	10/05/05	13	27	+8	+5
4 Signing of the CSC-SL minutes	ADB sending approval of the shortlist to EA	SEK	2	07/05/05	2	24	12/05/05	2	29	0	+5
5 ADB sending approval of the shortlist to EA	EA issuing RFP	AFR	7	14/05/05	7	31	17/05/05	5	34	(-2)	+3
6 EA issuing RFP	Proposal submission	AFR	45	28/06/05	45	76	01/07/05	45	79	0	+3
7 Proposal submission	EA CSC-EV meeting	AFR	21	19/07/05	21	97	22/07/05	21	100	0	+3
8 EA CSC-EV meeting	EA submitting technical evaluation report to ADB	AFR	10	29/07/05	10	107	27/07/05	5	105	(-5)	(-2)
9 EA submitting technical evaluation report to ADB	ADB CSC-EV meeting	SEK	7	05/08/05	7	114	03/08/05	7	112	0	(-2)
10 ADB CSC-EV meeting	Signing of CSC-EV meeting	SEK	5	10/08/05	5	119	18/08/05	15	127	+10	+8
11 Signing of CSC-EV meeting	ADB sending approval of technical evaluation to EA	SEK	2	12/08/05	2	121	20/08/05	2	129	0	+8
12 ADB sending approval of technical evaluation to EA	EA issuing invitation for contract negotiations	AFR	3	19/08/05	3	124	23/08/05	3	132	0	+8
13 EA issuing invitation for contract negotiations	Commencement of contract negotiations	AFR	14	24/10/05	14	138	06/09/05	14	146	0	+8
14 Commencement of contract negotiations	Completion of contract negotiations	AFR	14	07/11/05	14	152	20/09/05	14	160	0	+8
15 Completion of contract negotiations	EA submitting negotiated contract to ADB	AFR	21	28/11/05	21	173					
16 EA submitting negotiated contract to ADB	ADB approval of the negotiated contract	SEK	7	03/12/05	7	180					
17 ADB sending approved negotiated contract	EA signing of the contract	AFR	14	17/12/05	14	194					
18 EA signing of the contract	Consultant mobilization	AFR	14	31/12/05	14	208					
Total number of days				208							

Footnotes:

- Activity NORMS [column 3] are based on calendar days
- The base date for planning and monitoring is the date of Short-Listing by EA
- PLANNED dates, days and cumulative days [columns 5 and 6 respectively] are derived from the NORMS and are computed as calendar days
- ACTUAL achieved dates [column 7] are input by the responsible project officer from the concerned User Division
- DEVIATIONS are computed in calendar days and cumulative calendar days [columns 10 and 11]

Guide for completing CRAM sheet:

- Row A-J and columns 2-6 are completed by ADB
- Columns 7 and 12 - EA to input information at the time of submission to ADB
- Columns 8-11 are automatically generated by ADB's CRAM system based on column 7 inputs

Consultant Recruitment Activity Monitoring (CRAM)

A. Loan No. and Title	Loan 2021-BAN: Road Network Improvement - Road Master Plan			<h1>SAMPLE SHEET</h1>	Last edited by: Rafael E. Aquino on 17/05/2005 02:23 PM
B. Contract Budget (US\$)	1,000,000				
C. Selection Method	OCBS				
D. Type of Technical Proposal	Full				
E. Executing Agency (EA)	Roads and Highways Department				
F. EA Contact Person	A.K.M. Faizur Rahman	Initials: AFR			
G. Loan Supervision Division of RM	BRM				
H. ADB Project Officer	Stefan Ekelund	Initials: SEK	Project Assistant:		
I. ADB COCS Officer	Sivaguru Sahajananthan	Initials: SS			
J. Actual Date of Short-Listing (SL) by EA	13/04/2005				

Activity	Responsible Staff	NORM Calendar Days	Planned			Actual			Deviation		Explanation and Action	
			Dates	Calendar Days	Cummulative Days	Achived Date	Days	Cummulative Days	Days	Cummulative Days		
1												12
From:	To:											
1 EA CSC-SL meeting	EA submitting shortlist to ADB	AFR	10	23/04/05	10	10	20/04/05	7	7	(-3)	(-3)	
2 EA submitting shortlist to ADB	ADB CSC-SL meeting	SEK	7	30/04/05	7	17	27/04/05	7	14	0	(-3)	
3 ADB CSC-SL meeting	Signing of the CSC-SL minutes	SEK	5	05/05/05	5	22	10/05/05	13	27	+8	+5	ADB Required resubmission of EA's draft RFP.
4 Signing of the CSC-SL minutes	ADB sending approval of the shortlist to EA	SEK	2	07/05/05	2	24	12/05/05	2	29	0	+5	
5 ADB sending approval of the shortlist to EA	EA issuing RFP	AFR	7	14/05/05	7	31	17/05/05	5	34	(-2)	+3	
6 EA issuing RFP	Proposal submission	AFR	45	28/06/05	45	76	01/07/05	45	79	0	+3	
7 Proposal submission	EA CSC-EV meeting	AFR	21	19/07/05	21	97	22/07/05	21	100	0	+3	
8 EA CSC-EV meeting	EA submitting technical evaluation report to ADB	AFR	10	29/07/05	10	107	27/07/05	5	105	(-5)	(-2)	
9 EA submitting technical evaluation report to ADB	ADB CSC-EV meeting	SEK	7	05/08/05	7	114	03/08/05	7	112	0	(-2)	
10 ADB CSC-EV meeting	Signing of CSC-EV meeting	SEK	5	10/08/05	5	119	06/08/05	3	115	(-2)	(-4)	
11 Signing of CSC-EV meeting	ADB sending approval of technical evaluation to EA	SEK	2	12/08/05	2	121	08/08/05	2	117	0	(-4)	
12 ADB sending approval of technical evaluation to EA	EA issuing invitation for public opening	AFR	7	19/08/05	7	128	13/08/05	5	122	(-2)	(-6)	
13 EA issuing invitation for public opening	Public opening	AFR	14	02/09/05	14	142	27/08/05	14	136	0	(-6)	
14 Public opening	EA signing of overall ranking minutes and submitting to ADB	AFR	21	23/09/05	21	163	17/09/05	21	157	0	(-6)	
15 EA signing of overall ranking minutes and submitting to ADB	ADB-CSC-OR meeting	SEK	7	30/09/05	7	170	24/09/05	7	164	0	(-6)	
16 ADB-CSC-OR meeting	Signing of CSC-OR minutes	SEK	5	05/10/05	5	175	09/10/05	15	179	+10	+4	ADB required reevaluation and resubmission.
17 Signing of CSC-OR minutes	ADB sending approval of overall ranking to EA	SEK	2	07/10/05	2	177	11/10/05	2	181	0	+4	
18 ADB sending approval of overall ranking to EA	EA issuing invitation for contract negotiations	AFR	3	10/10/05	3	180						
19 EA issuing invitation for contract negotiations	Commencement of contract negotiations	AFR	14	24/10/05	14	194						
20 Commencement of contract negotiations	Completion of contract negotiations	AFR	14	07/11/05	14	208						
21 Completion of contract negotiations	EA submitting negotiated contract to ADB	AFR	21	28/11/05	21	229						
22 EA submitting negotiated contract to ADB	ADB approval of the negotiated contract	SEK	5	03/12/05	5	234						
23 ADB sending approved negotiated contract	EA signing of the contract	AFR	14	17/12/05	14	248						
24 EA signing of the contract	Consultant mobilization	AFR	14	31/12/05	14	262						
Total number of days												
			262									

Footnotes:

- a. Activity NORMS [column 3] are based on calendar days
- b. The base date for planning and monitoring is the date of Short-Listing by EA
- c. PLANNED dates, days and cumulative days [columns 5 and 6 respectively] are derived from the NORMS and are computed as calendar days
- d. ACTUAL achieved dates [column 7] are input by the responsible project officer from the concerned User Division
- e. DEVIATIONS are computed in calendar days and cumulative calendar days [columns 10 and 11]

Guide for completing CRAM sheet:

- a. Row A-J and column 2-6 are completed by ADB
- b. Columns 7 and 8 are completed by the EA
- c. Columns 8-11 are automatically generated by ADB's CRAM System based on Column 7 inputs

**ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK
INDIVIDUAL CONSULTANT'S EVALUATION SHEET**

Project Title:

Expertise required:

NAME OF CONSULTANT	NATIONALITY	GENERAL QUALIFICATION (A)		Project Related Experience (B)		Regional Experience & Others (C)		Overall Rating	Ranking
		20%		70%		10%			
		Rating	(1) A x Rating	Rating	(2) B x Rating	Rating	(3) C x Rating		

Name and signature of Rater (Responsible EA Staff):

Date:

TECHNICAL ASSESSMENT:

1. GENERAL QUALIFICATIONS (20%)

This includes academic attainment, professional attainment, publications, etc. In normal cases, the attainment of a Bachelor's Degree should be sufficient qualification for the award of maximum points. Only in rare special case should higher attainments (M.Sc., Ph.D.) be required to gain maximum points. (Ensure that the M.Sc. and Ph.D. are actually in the area of expertise being sought.)

2. PROJECT RELATED EXPERIENCE (70%)

This should be measured by the relevance of project related experience and not the quality of projects undertaken in the past ten years. The expert with the greatest number of projects should not automatically receive maximum points. It should be decided prior to the evaluation, exactly how many relevant projects for which the expert provided same input as required for the present services (or preferably what length of time), would provide necessary depth of experience required, e.g. 1 project, 3 projects, 2 years, 5 years, etc.

3. REGIONAL EXPERIENCE AND OTHERS (10%)

This section covers the experts experience in the project country/region or similar cultural and climatic environment or any other criterion decided prior to the evaluation as well as proficiency in written and oral English (and the language of the project country if relevant).

RATING:

- Excellent = 90 - 100%
- Good = 80 - 89%
- Average = 70 - 79%
- Below Average = 0 - 69%