

Education in Developing Asia

Volume 3

**The Costs and Financing of Education:
Trends and Policy Implications**

Mark Bray



Asian Development Bank
Comparative Education Research Centre
The University of Hong Kong



© 2002 Asian Development Bank

Jointly published by:

Asian Development Bank
6 ADB Avenue
Mandaluyong City
P.O. Box 789
0980 Manila
Philippines

Fax: (632) 636 2444
E-mail: adbpub@adb.org

and

Comparative Education Research Centre
The University of Hong Kong
Pokfulam Road
Hong Kong, China

Fax: (852) 2517 4737
E-mail: cerc@hkusub.hku.hk

Obtainable from either address.

Series: Education in Developing Asia
Series editor: Mark Bray

Layout and index by Sara Wong.

The findings, interpretation, and conclusions expressed in this study are entirely those of the author and should not be attributed in any manner to the Asian Development Bank or the University of Hong Kong.

A summary of an earlier version of this booklet was presented as an article in Vol.29, No.7 (1998) of the International Journal of Educational Research, published by Pergamon Press. The publishers of this booklet thank Pergamon Press for permission to reproduce some of the materials from the journal article.

ISBN 971-561-405-1
ADB Publication Stock No. 100501

The series

Education in Developing Asia

has five volumes:

1. Don Adams (2002): *Education and National Development: Priorities, Policies, and Planning*;
2. David Chapman (2002): *Management and Efficiency in Education: Goals and Strategies*;
3. Mark Bray (2002): *The Costs and Financing of Education: Trends and Policy Implications*;
4. W.O. Lee (2002): *Equity and Access to Education: Themes, Tensions, and Policies*; and
5. David Chapman and Don Adams (2002): *The Quality of Education: Dimensions and Strategies*.

Series Editor:

Mark Bray

**The Costs and Financing of Education:
Trends and Policy Implications**

Contents

List of Tables	iii
List of Figures	iv
List of Boxes	iv
List of Abbreviations	v
Foreword	vii
Introduction	1
Contextual Features	2
Scale and Nature of Existing Education Provision	4
Volume of Expenditures on Education	6
Public Expenditures	6
Private Expenditures	8
Economic Justification for Investment in Education	11
Unit Costs and their Determinants	17
Meanings and Examples	18
Goals, Determinants, and Manipulable Variables	20
Dropout and Repetition Rates	25
Technologies – New and Old	26
Cost Sharing in Education	31
Changing Frameworks for Policy	31
Political Forces and Budget Constraints	32
Forms of Cost Sharing	34
Alternatives to Cost Sharing	36
Cost Recovery and Student Support in Tertiary Education	38
Fees	38
Grants and Loans	39
Institutional Revenue-Earning Schemes	41
Privatization of Education	42
Models for Privatization	43
Effects of Privatization	44
Private Tutoring – A Sector Deserving Particular Scrutiny	46
International Aid for Education	48

Particular Strategies for Particular Groups of Countries	52
Poor, Middle-Income, and Rich Economies	53
Transitional and Long-Standing Capitalist Economies	54
Countries of Different Sizes	55
Conclusion	56
Note on the Author	59
References	60
Appendix	72
Index	74

List of Tables

Table 1: Basic Statistics for Developing Member Countries	3
Table 2: Gross Enrollment Rates in Selected Developing Member Countries, by Level	5
Table 3: Public Expenditures on Education in Selected Developing Member Countries	7
Table 4: Public Expenditures on Education as a Percentage of GNP, by Region, 1980-1995	7
Table 5: Private Enrollments as a Percentage of Total Enrollments, Selected Developing Member Countries, 1995	8
Table 6: Rates of Return to Education – International Comparisons	12
Table 7: Rates of Return to Education, by World Region and Level	13
Table 8: Unadjusted and Adjusted Social Rates of Return, by Level	14
Table 9: Estimated Recurrent Unit Costs by Level, PRC, 1994	19
Table 10: Unit Recurrent Costs per Full-Time Equivalent in Higher Education, Viet Nam, 1993-1995	19
Table 11: Unit Costs by Level and Province, PRC, 1995	20
Table 12: Primary School Teachers' Weekly Hours of Classroom Teaching, by Country and Region	22
Table 13: Official Class Hours during the First Four Years of Primary Education	22
Table 14: Primary School Pupil/Teacher Ratios and Teachers' Salaries as a Multiple of Per Capita GDP in Selected Developing Member Countries, Around 1992	23
Table 15: Percentage of Grade 1 Pupils Reaching Grade 4, Selected Countries	25
Table 16: Indicators of Internal Efficiency, Indonesia, 1976 and 1996	26
Table 17: Development Costs of Materials per Student Learning-Hour, by Medium, United Kingdom, 1996	28
Table 18: Distance Universities in Asia: Cost and Effectiveness Data	30
Table 19: Central Government Revenues as a Percentage of GDP, Selected Developing Member Countries	36
Table 20: Regional Breakdown of Taxation Revenue by Type of Tax	36
Table 21: Sources of Recurrent Income of Selected Indian Universities, 1989/90-1991/92	38
Table 22: Hidden Subsidies, Government Losses, and Average Loan Recovery Ratios on Selected Student Loan Programs	40
Table 23: Cost-Effectiveness of Private Secondary Schools, Selected Countries, Early 1980s	44
Table 24: Official Development Assistance Flows to Developing Member Countries	49

Table 25: Trends in External and Internal Mobilization of Resources for Education, Nepal	51
Table 26: Official Development Assistance to Education and Training, Viet Nam, 1991-1995	51

List of Figures

Figure 1: Household and Government Resourcing of Public Primary Education in Selected Developing Member Countries	9
Figure 2: Annual Costs Per Student, by Level, Viet Nam, 1994	18
Figure 3: Contributions of Major Aid Agencies as a Proportion of the Total National Education Budget, Indonesia	50
Figure 4: Agency Contributions to Education, by Subsector, Indonesia	50

List of Boxes

Box 1: Public versus Private Education – A False Dichotomy?	10
Box 2: The Balance between General and Technical/Vocational Education	17
Box 3: Internal Inefficiency in Education Systems – Lessons from Bangladesh	29
Box 4: Fees and Cost Sharing in Nepal	33
Box 5: Locally Imposed Taxes for Education in the PRC	37
Box 6: The Negative Impact of Transition on Preschools in Central Asia	55
Box 7: What Role for the State in Financing Education?	58

List of Abbreviations

ADB	—	Asian Development Bank
DMC	—	Developing Member Country
FTE	—	Full-Time Equivalent
DMC	—	Developing Member Country
GDP	—	Gross Domestic Product
GNP	—	Gross National Product
HPAE	—	High-Performing Asian Economy
Lao PDR	—	Lao People's Democratic Republic
OECD	—	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
PPP	—	Purchasing Power Parity
PRC	—	People's Republic of China
UNDP	—	United Nations Development Programme
UNESCO	—	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNICEF	—	United Nations Children's Fund
VET	—	Vocational Education and Training

Currency Equivalents (As of 15 March 2000)

	Currency Unit	
Baht (B)	B1.00 = \$0.02644	\$1.00 = B37.8200
Dong (D)	D1.00 = \$0.00007138	\$1.00 = D14,009
Nepalese Rupee (NRe/NRs)	NRe1.00 = \$0.01448	\$1.00 = NRs69.0500
Pakistan Rupee (PRe/PRs)	PRe1.00 = \$0.01927	\$1.00 = PRs51.8900
Pound Sterling (£)	£1.00 = \$1.5787	\$1.00 = £0.6334
Singapore dollar (S\$)	S\$1.00 = \$0.5821	\$1.00 = S\$1.7180
Taka (Tk)	Tk1.00 = \$0.01967	\$1.00 = Tk50.8500
Yuan (Y)	Y1.00 = \$0.1208	\$1.00 = Y8.2800

Note

In this booklet, "\$" refers to US dollars, unless otherwise specified.

Foreword

The Asian Development Bank (ADB) is a major source of funds and technical advice for the education sector in the Asian and Pacific region. ADB has provided nearly \$3.5 billion for education since 1990, representing an average of about 6 percent of total ADB lending per year during that period. ADB recognizes that human development is the basis for national and economic development, and that education – particularly basic education – is a fundamental element of human development. ADB seeks to ensure that its education investment is effectively targeted and efficiently utilized. It further recognizes that a clear policy framework based on careful analysis of the status and development needs of the education sector is necessary for effective investment.

ADB has therefore committed itself to a comprehensive process of review and analysis as the basis for preparing a new education sector policy paper. The policy paper will guide ADB in its support for education in the first years of the 21st century. It will be based on a series of activities, all designed to ensure that the education policy adequately reflects the rapidly evolving circumstances of the region.

ADB commissioned eight country case studies and five technical working papers as inputs to the policy formulation process. The case studies, undertaken by leading education research institutes in the countries concerned, analyzed the issues in education and the policies that had been developed to address the issues. The technical working papers examined selected cross-cutting issues in education development in the region. The case studies and the technical working papers were discussed at a major regional seminar involving representatives of government ministries of education, finance, and planning. Later, the case studies and working papers were integrated into a single publication *Education and National Development in Asia: Trends, Issues, Policies, and Strategies*. This study in turn was an input into ADB's education sector policy paper.

The five technical working papers contain a great deal of useful data and analysis, and it is important to ensure that they are fully available to education policymakers, practitioners, and scholars in the region and elsewhere. Consequently, revised versions are being published separately in their entirety jointly by ADB and the Comparative Education Research Centre of the University of Hong Kong as part of this series entitled *Education in Developing Asia*. ADB hopes that the papers and their wider availability will contribute to a

better understanding of the emerging challenges of education development in the region. ADB is pleased to have the partnership of a well-known academic institution in this publication, and thanks the authors and their associates for their contribution.

Nihal Amerasinghe
Director
Agriculture and Social Sectors
Department (East)
Asian Development Bank

Akira Seki
Director
Agriculture and Social Sectors
Department (West)
Asian Development Bank