

Key Governance Issues in Cambodia, Lao PDR, Thailand, and Viet Nam

Clay G. Wescott
Editor

Asian Development Bank

Programs Department (West)

April 2001

© Asian Development Bank 2001
All rights reserved

The findings, interpretations, and conclusions expressed in this study are entirely those of the authors and should not be attributed in any manner to Asian Development Bank (ADB) or the countries it represents.

Proofreading: Lily Bernal
Layout and typesetting: Wickie Baguisi

The Asian Development Bank encourages use of the material presented herein, with appropriate credit.

Published by the Asian Development Bank
P.O. Box 789
0980 Manila, Philippines

ISBN: 971-591-354-3
Publication Stock No. 030301

Contents

| | |
|--|------|
| ABBREVIATIONS | vi |
| FOREWORD | vii |
| ACKNOWLEDGMENTS | viii |
| BACKGROUND | 1 |
| ADB Approach to Effective Governance and Public Management | 1 |
| Anticorruption | 1 |
| Poverty Reduction | 2 |
| Indicators of Governance in the GMS | 2 |
| SUMMARY OF CAMBODIA GOVERNANCE ASSESSMENT | 5 |
| Basic Parameters of Governance in Cambodia | 5 |
| Historical Background | 5 |
| The 1993 Constitution | 7 |
| Economic System | 8 |
| The Public Sector | 8 |
| The Legislature | 8 |
| The Executive | 9 |
| The Judiciary | 10 |
| Civil Society | 11 |
| The Private Sector | 11 |
| Nongovernment Organizations | 11 |
| The Media | 12 |
| Present Reform Context | 12 |
| Public Finance Reform | 12 |
| Public Administration Reform | 12 |
| Civil Administrative Reform | 12 |
| Reform of the Military | 13 |
| Decentralization | 14 |
| Judicial and Legal Reform | 15 |
| Judicial Reform | 15 |
| Legal Reform | 16 |
| Regional Integration | 16 |
| Economic Implications of Reform | 16 |
| External Assistance for Governance Reforms | 17 |
| Key Issues | 17 |
| Recommendations for the RGC | 17 |
| Recommendations for Donors | 18 |
| Conclusion | 19 |
| SUMMARY OF LAO PDR GOVERNANCE ASSESSMENT | 21 |
| Basic Parameters of Governance | 21 |
| Historical Background | 21 |
| The Lao People's Revolutionary Party | 22 |
| The 1991 Constitution | 23 |
| The Public Sector | 24 |
| Structure of Government | 24 |
| The National Assembly | 25 |
| External Relations | 25 |
| The Civil Service | 26 |
| Public Financial Management | 26 |
| Selected Line Ministries and Departments | 27 |
| Subnational Government | 28 |
| Legal and Judicial System | 29 |
| Public-Private Interface | 29 |
| Accountability Institutions | 30 |
| Civil Society | 30 |
| The Media | 30 |

| | |
|---|----|
| Present Reform Prospects | 31 |
| The National Assembly | 31 |
| Public Administration Reform | 31 |
| Public Financial Management Reform | 32 |
| Line Ministries and Departments: Sectoral Reform | 32 |
| Subnational Government Reform | 32 |
| Legal and Judicial System Reform | 34 |
| Public-Private Interface Reforms | 34 |
| Reform of Accountability Institutions | 34 |
| Civil Society and Media Reform | 34 |
| Conclusion | 35 |
| SUMMARY OF THAILAND GOVERNANCE ASSESSMENT | 37 |
| Basic Parameters of Governance in Thailand | 37 |
| Historical Background | 37 |
| The 1997 Constitution | 38 |
| The Public Sector | 38 |
| Structure of Government | 38 |
| The Legislature | 39 |
| The Executive | 40 |
| Legal and Judicial System | 41 |
| Subnational Government | 42 |
| Political Parties | 43 |
| Civil Society | 43 |
| Relationship between the Public and Private Sectors | 44 |
| Financial Market Regulation | 44 |
| Privatization, Commercialization, and State Enterprise Reform | 44 |
| Accountability Institutions | 44 |
| National Counter Corruption Commission | 45 |
| Office of the Auditor General | 45 |
| The Ombudsmen | 45 |
| Present Reform Prospects | 46 |
| Civil Service Reform | 46 |
| Public Finance Reform | 46 |
| Reform of Service Delivery in Line Ministries and Departments | 46 |
| Decentralization | 47 |
| Opportunities | 47 |
| Recommendations | 47 |
| Accountability Institutions | 49 |
| National Counter Corruption Commission | 49 |
| Office of the Auditor General | 49 |

| | |
|---|----|
| Relationship between the Public and Private Sectors | 50 |
| State Enterprise Sector Reform | 50 |
| The Legal and Regulatory Environment | 50 |
| Forms and Methods of Privatization | 51 |
| Corporate Governance and Performance Monitoring | 51 |
| Social, Labor, and Environmental Concerns | 51 |
| Public Information and Education | 51 |
| Conclusion | 51 |
| SUMMARY OF VIET NAM GOVERNANCE ASSESSMENT | 53 |
| Basic Parameters of Governance | 53 |
| Historical Background | 53 |
| The Public Sector | 54 |
| Structure of Government | 54 |
| The Executive | 55 |
| Legal and Judicial System | 58 |
| Civil Society | 59 |
| Accountability Institutions | 59 |
| Present Reform Prospects | 60 |
| Civil Service Reform | 60 |
| Public Financial Management Reform | 61 |
| Legal and Judicial Reform | 62 |
| Ensuring Wider Access to Justice | 62 |
| Creating a Level Playing Field | 62 |
| Local Government Reforms | 63 |
| Reforms to Increase Participation | 63 |
| Reforms to Improve Accountability | 64 |
| Conclusion | 64 |
| PROMOTING EFFECTIVE GOVERNANCE IN THE GMS THROUGH BANK OPERATIONS | 67 |
| Applying the ADB's Governance Policy to the GMS | 67 |
| Improving Government through Changes in Bank Operation | 67 |
| Conclusion | 68 |
| REFERENCES | 69 |
| LIST OF TABLES | |
| Human Development Rankings for GMS Countries, 1998 | 3 |
| Health System Attainment and Performance for GMS Countries, 1997 | 4 |
| Transition of Political, Legal, and Economic Systems in Cambodia | 5 |
| Recent Events Bearing on Governance, Lao PDR | 20 |
| FIGURE | |
| Conceptual Framework for Poverty Reduction | 2 |

Abbreviations

| | |
|-----------|---|
| ADB | Asian Development Bank |
| ADF | Asian Development Fund |
| ASEAN | Association of Southeast Asian Nations |
| CAR | Council of Administrative Reforms |
| CDRI | Center for Development Resources Institute |
| CPP | Cambodian People's Party |
| DMC | developing member country |
| EU | European Union |
| FDI | foreign direct investment |
| FUNCINPEC | National United Front for an Independent, Neutral, Peaceful, and Cooperative Cambodia |
| FY | fiscal year |
| GDP | gross domestic product |
| GMS | Greater Mekong Subregion |
| IMF | International Monetary Fund |
| Lao PDR | Lao People's Democratic Republic |
| LPRP | Lao People's Revolutionary Party |
| MEF | Ministry of Economy and Finance |
| NCCC | National Counter Corruption Commission (Thailand) |
| NEM | New Economic Mechanism (Lao PDR) |
| NESDB | National Economic and Social Development Board (Thailand) |
| NGO | nongovernment organization |
| OAG | Office of the Auditor General (Thailand) |
| OCSC | Office of the Civil Service Commission (Thailand) |
| OOG | Office of the Government (Viet Nam) |
| PAR | public administration reform |
| PDR | People's Democratic Republic |
| PRC | People's Republic of China |
| PRK | People's Republic of Kampuchea |
| RGC | Royal Government of Cambodia |
| SOE | state-owned enterprise |
| UN | United Nations |
| UNDP | United Nations Development Programme |
| UNTAC | United Nations Transitional Authority in Cambodia |
| US | United States |
| VAT | value-added tax |
| VCP | Viet Nam Communist Party |

Note:
In this book, "\$" refers to US dollars.

Foreword

The four Greater Mekong Subregion governments of Cambodia, Lao People's Democratic Republic, Thailand, and Viet Nam have stated their strong commitment to good governance, including sound macroeconomic and financial management, participatory pro-poor policies, effective delivery of public services, and enforcement of contractual and property rights.

The four studies included in this publication are expected to contribute to a better understanding of these governance issues, and encourage citizens and their development partners to help meet the governments' commitments to tackle the challenges ahead. Another Asian Development Bank (ADB) study¹ has clearly indicated that good governance has been essential for successful economic management in East and Southeast Asia in recent decades. Sustained political stability in most countries has enabled governments to be consistent in their approach and to implement long-term strategies focusing on market competition, openness, and export

orientation. At the same time, leaders understood that political legitimacy and stability depended in part on a well-managed and growing economy, and on improving the welfare of the rural poor. Governments consistently placed well-trained, highly competent economic technicians in charge of macroeconomic management. Long-term goals for economic development were built on dialogue and information sharing among the public and private sectors, research and scientific communities, and civil society.

These studies were prepared under the overall direction of the Programs Department (West) of ADB. The perspectives and judgments expressed in the studies do not necessarily reflect the views and policies of ADB or its Board of Directors.

Finally, I wish to thank colleagues from the four countries at all levels of government and society who contributed their insights to the study teams. The studies benefited greatly from their comments and suggestions.

Tadao Chino
President and Chairman of the Board of Directors
Asian Development Bank

¹ *Emerging Asia: Changes and Challenges*. Manila: Asian Development Bank, 1997: 113-116.

Acknowledgments

The Cambodia study was carried out by a team from the Cambodia Development Resources Institute (CDRI) comprising Toshiyasu Kato (Economist/Team Leader), Jeffrey A. Kaplan (Lawyer), Chan Sophal (Economist), and Real Sopheap (Lawyer). The team received invaluable support, encouragement, and suggestions from Ok Serei Sopheap and Sok Hach who shared with us useful insights through formal and informal discussions at CDRI, and Martin Godfrey who gave the team continuous encouragement and guidance throughout the project. Special thanks go to His Excellency Sum Manit (Secretary of State, Council of Ministers and Secretary General, Council for Administrative Reforms), and His Excellency Dr. Aun Porn Moniroth (Secretary General, Ministry of Economy and Finance and Economic Adviser to the Prime Minister) who provided the team with useful guidance and suggestions. Urooj Malik, ADB Resident Representative in Cambodia, also made substantial contributions to the study.

The Lao PDR study was carried out by Clay Wescott, Senior Public Administration Specialist from the Asian Development Bank (ADB), drawing from earlier internal reports. Special thanks go to Somphavanh Inthavony, Minister, Prime Minister's Office and Auditor General, National Auditing Office, Ms. Kempheang Pholsena, Vice-Minister, Prime Minister's Office; Ket Kietisak, Vice Minister, Ministry of Justice; Langsy Sibounheuang, Director, Prime Minister's Office; and Mary S. Flipse, J.D. Dirksen Flipse, Doran & Le.

The Thailand study was carried out by Craig Steffensen, Resident Advisor, Extended Mission to

Thailand, ADB and Robert Beschell, a former officer of ADB's Strategy and Policy Department. The summary also draws from a follow-up study carried out by consultant Gary Suwannarat. Special thanks go to His Excellency Anand Panyacharun; Tippavadee Meksawan, Secretary-General, Office of the Civil Service Commission; Orapin Sopchokchai, Thailand Development Resources Institute; Prof. Chai-Anan Samudavanija, Director, Vajiravudh College; Dr. Pisanu Suntharaks from the Faculty of Political Science at Thammasat University; and Bidhya Bowornwathana, Professor of Political Science, Chulalongkorn University, among many others.

The Viet Nam study draws on work by consultants Brian van Arkadie and Nguyen Quoc Hung, Ed Attridge, and Mahalingam Mariappan. Special thanks go to senior officials from the General Organization of Personnel, the Office of the Government, the State Bank of Viet Nam, and the Ministry of Planning and Investment, and to John Samy, ADB Resident Representative in Viet Nam, among many others.

Toru Tatara, Head, GMS Unit, ADB conceived of the project of putting summaries of the four governance studies in a single volume. Doug Porter, Senior Governance Specialist, ADB helped update the Cambodia summary. Alice Faintich of Word Doctor provided invaluable editorial assistance, and Lily Bernal and Wickie Baguisi skillfully carried out the proofreading, layout, and design of the report.

The four reports were completed over the period November 1998-December 2000. The summaries in this volume have been compiled and updated by Clay Wescott.

Yoshihiro Iwasaki
Director
Program West Department, ADB