

**Asian Development Bank
External Forum on Gender and Development
Ninth Session, 15-17 October 2008
Outcome of Meetings**

I. Introduction

1. The External Forum on Gender and Development (EFG) of the Asian Development Bank (ADB) held its 9th session at ADB Headquarters from 15-17 October 2008. During this session, we met with ADB's senior management and staff from several departments. We were unable to meet with the ADB President as he was away on travel during our visit. We also conducted a seminar to inform ADB staff about regional activities supporting gender equality and women's empowerment, with a presentation on UNESCAP activities and a case study on the Japanese experience with "Financing for Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women". The final agenda for the session is included in Annex 1. This report synthesizes the main outcomes of our session and related recommendations.

2. We would like to thank Vice-Presidents Zhao and Greenwood, Managing Director General Nag, and senior staff from the Regional and Sustainable Development Department (RSDD), the Strategy and Policy Department, Regional Departments, the Human Resources Division (BPHR), Gender, Social Development and Civil Society Division (RSGS), the Gender and Social Development Committee of the Communities of Practice and the Professional Women's Committee for taking the time to meet with us. We appreciated the opportunity to discuss the declining percentages of ADB projects with significant gender mainstreaming and the worrying trends in the gender balance of ADB's professional and managerial staff. We also discussed how to reverse these trends to attain targets set under Strategy 2020. We were also briefed by gender specialist consultants from ADB's resident missions in Indonesia and Nepal on current challenges and achievements in gender mainstreaming in country partnership strategies and loan projects.

3. The main objectives of the 9th EFG session were to: (1) assess ADB's progress on gender mainstreaming and provide recommendations on how to improve performance with respect to opportunities and challenges under Strategy 2020 and strategic actions planned under GAD Plan of Action (2008-2010); (2) review ADB's progress under GAP III implementation to provide feedback and recommendations on improving gender balance among Bank professional staff; and (3) respond to the Options Paper developed by RSGS to inform a review of the EFG's mode of operations to enhance its effectiveness under the new long-term strategic framework.

II. Strategy 2020 and Gender

4. We appreciated the useful briefing provided by the Deputy Director General of the Strategy and Policy Department on Strategy 2020, the ADF X Fund, the ADB Results Framework and the Development Effectiveness Review. We are pleased that based on extensive consultations with gender and poverty experts, women's organizations and other civil society groups, Strategy 2020 recognizes women as the largest group among those excluded from the benefits of the Asia Pacific region's economic expansion in the past decade. Two EFG members participated in country consultations in Kyrgyzstan and Japan. We commend ADB for emphasizing gender equality and the empowerment of women as a fundamental element in achieving inclusive growth and identifying "Gender Equity" as one of the five "drivers of change" essential for poverty reduction, improved living standards and sustainable economic growth.

5. We also commend ADB for developing a new Results Framework that incorporates poverty and human development indicators to monitor its effectiveness in reducing gender disparities in health, education and employment levels in the region. Moreover, the 40% target set for the proportion of all ADB projects with significant gender mainstreaming and the 50% target for those with ADF X funding by 2012 reflect ADB's commitment to making gender equity a strategic focus in its operations. Similarly, the 35% target set for representation of women professional staff and 25% target set for the promotion of professional women by 2012 demonstrate ADB's commitment to make a renewed effort to improve the gender balance among its professional staff and managerial pool. While the gender-based indicators included in the current Results Framework (August 2008) are important, they should be reviewed to ensure they are adequate as the results framework is further refined and final indicators, baselines and targets are developed for Board approval. As the EFG has recommended consistently since its establishment, we believe that the relevant international law instruments, especially the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women and the Convention on the Rights of the Child, provide relevant and useful frameworks for ADB's work, and would be of particular utility in refining the Results Framework.

6. For the first time since the adoption of the Gender and Development (GAD) policy in 1998, Strategy 2020's Results Framework provides an organizational accountability mechanism for gender mainstreaming in all ADB operations. There is clearly an increased level of senior management awareness that ADB is accountable to its Board of Directors and shareholders to deliver on expected gender and development results. The EFG would welcome the opportunity to comment on the annual Development Effectiveness Review that will monitor and report to the Board on expected gender outcomes under Strategy 2020.

7. While the new strategic framework provides real incentives to enhance gender mainstreaming in ADB operations, we also heard serious concerns from all staff to the effect that there may be more limited opportunities for gender mainstreaming under ADB's changing sectoral focus and changing modalities for loan operations. In response, the EFG would like to emphasize that ADB's new core operational priorities, namely infrastructure (mostly energy, transport and roads), environment (including climate change), regional cooperation and integration, financial sector development, and education are all gendered. Under these five core areas, ADB should replicate the lessons learned from its successful approaches in gender mainstreaming in rural infrastructure, water supply and sanitation and education sectors in more countries. ADB should also consider exploring partnerships to learn from the good practices of gender mainstreaming in projects focusing on large infrastructure (e.g. transport, roads and energy), financial sector development, and climate change from other multilateral and bilateral institutions, non-governmental organizations and the private sector particularly given the human consequences of the current global economic and financial crises already felt by countries in Asia and the Pacific. The EFG would welcome conducting a seminar in its next meeting, ideally in collaboration with ADB staff, on a specific thematic area to assist in expanding ADB staff's technical knowledge on gender issues in hard sectors, and to draw on the expertise that already exists among ADB staff on these issues.

III. Gender Mainstreaming

A. Biennial Thematic Report on Overall Trends (2006-2007)

8. We appreciated RSGS's comprehensive synthesis of the Biennial Report (2006-2007) findings on ADB's recent performance in relation to gender mainstreaming in country partnership strategies, loan and technical assistance projects, capacity development initiatives and dissemination of GAD publications. Among positive developments, we applaud the South East

Asia Department for incorporating either a GAD theme or effective gender mainstreaming features in 41% of its loans processed in 2006-07. We were pleased to learn that most projects approved in 2006-07 with GAD themes or effective gender mainstreaming included a Gender Action Plan (GAP) and the quality of GAP implementation has been improving due to more diligent monitoring by gender specialists and increased investment in gender capacity development of executing and implementing agency partners.

9. Despite the good practices in certain regions and countries and improved dissemination of knowledge products on gender and development, the overall trends in the past four years (2003-2007) regarding ADB's performance on gender mainstreaming are worrying:

- The annual decline in numbers and percentages of ADB projects with "significant gender mainstreaming" features (total projects classified with either a GAD theme or effective gender mainstreaming). Specifically, the percentage of approved loan and grant projects with "significant gender mainstreaming" dropped from 49% in 2003 to 29% in 2007. In particular, the total number of projects with a GAD theme dropped from 25% to 11% during the same period.
- Declining range of sectors with a GAD theme (mostly in agriculture and natural resources, education, health, but less in water supply and sanitation, multi-sector, law and economic management projects).
- Declining trend of gender mainstreaming in new Country Partnership Strategies (CPS) due to the ambiguity of the new CPS guidelines (August 2007) on how to address thematic strategies. The core appendix on a Gender Strategy which is required by the ADB GAD policy in all CPSs has been made optional under the new CPS guidelines, leading to this ambiguity.
- Declining trend of ADB Projects classified with a GAD theme or effective gender mainstreaming in some regions such as South Asia.
- Declining trend of OCR (ordinary capital resources) loans which are classified with a GAD theme or effective gender mainstreaming (dropped from 22% in 2004-05 to 10% in 2006-07).
- Declining number of gender specialists in Regional Departments at ADB Headquarters.

10. Although the overall trends of the past four years give rise to significant concern, ADB's renewed commitment to gender-inclusive growth and the accountability mechanism provided under Strategy 2020 reassure us that these trends can be reversed. The briefings we received from the ADB Resident Mission gender specialist consultants from Indonesia and Nepal demonstrated once again the significant value added of human resources with GAD expertise to achieving gender inclusive results at the strategy, program and project levels. For example, in Nepal, GAD objectives at the country strategy level led to civil service policy reforms with a 45% reservation for women and socially excluded groups as well as the approval of a Gender Equality Act which has repealed discriminatory laws against women. Under the Nepal loan portfolio, with increased attention to gender-inclusive project designs, 44% of projects now have Gender Action Plans (GAP) as compared to 25% in 2004. Moreover, with systematic monitoring of GAP implementation under the *Community Based Water Supply and Sanitation Sector Project*, *Community Livestock Development Project* and the *Decentralized Rural Infrastructure and Livelihood Improvement Project*, women's participation in decision-making, training and livelihood generation activities have increased above 50%. In Indonesia, the resident mission gender specialist's mid-course interventions to understand the bottlenecks in implementing Gender Action Plans under the *Community Water Services and Health Project* and the *Neighborhood Upgrading*

and Shelter Sector Project have revealed the importance of developing a detailed GAP during the project design phase and improving the capacity of project gender specialists and executing agency staff during the project implementation phase. We understand the difficulty of the resident mission gender specialists' work as "change agents" in ADB and commend their significant contributions to date in GAD policy implementation.

B. GAD Plan of Action (2008-2010): Initial Implementation Results

11. We reviewed the Gender Plan of Action (2008-2010) and were briefed by RSGS on its first year implementation results. We are pleased to note that many of our recommendations from last year have been incorporated into the final approved plan. First, we congratulate ADB for recruiting Ms. Sonomi Tanaka in June 2008 as the new Principal GAD Specialist to lead the Bank's GAD policy implementation. We are also pleased with ADB's good progress in the initial implementation year of the GAD Plan of Action particularly in the following areas: (i) according to RSGS, the number of 2008 loans with either a GAD theme or effective gender mainstreaming seems to have been maintained at about the level for 2006-07 and has not continued to decline; (ii) four country gender assessments which will be finalized by the end of 2008 will hopefully ensure gender issues are appropriately addressed in prospective CPSs in the Philippines, Sri Lanka, Pakistan and Mongolia; (iii) improved balance of projects with gender mainstreaming across sectors, regions, funding sources and lending modalities; (iv) expansion of resident mission gender consultants to include Papua New Guinea and recruitment of a national gender officer in Pakistan; and (v) wider dissemination of ADB good practices in gender mainstreaming to other development partners at the UNESCAP Expert group meeting on CEDAW (July 2007), the Commission on the Status of Women meeting (February 2008), OECD/DAC GenderNet meeting (July 2008) and the Multilateral Development Banks' Gender and Infrastructure meeting (November 2008).

12. While the initial GAD Plan of Action implementation results are positive, to attain Strategy 2020's benchmarks on gender mainstreaming, we recommend that ADB consider the following actions and monitor them through the Gender Plan of Action:

Country Programming and Policy Dialogue:

- Clarify the ambiguity of CPS guidelines related to gender. In addition to addressing gender issues in sector roadmaps and CPS results frameworks, it would still be important to have a Gender Strategy as a core appendix of the CPS -- as required by the ADB GAD Policy. A Gender Strategy provides diagnostic background on country-based gender disparities and identifies how ADB will address GAD issues through its loan and grant assistance. Continue RSGS review of draft CPSs to ensure gender issues are properly addressed.
- Involve national machineries, sector agencies, NGOs as well as other civil society groups working on gender issues in consultations on ADB's country partnership strategies and in other policy discussions.
- Articulate potential gender equality and women's empowerment outcomes during project conceptualization so projects can be classified with a GAD theme as appropriate.
- Ensure that the forthcoming revision of the project classification system will maintain GAD theme as an area of focus.

Lending Operations:

- Continue to mainstream gender and to replicate good practices in rural and urban infrastructure, agriculture, water resources management, water supply and sanitation, governance, education and health projects.

- Expand gender mainstreaming in hard sector projects such as large infrastructure (energy, roads and transport), climate change and financial sector development and explore partnerships with multilateral and bilateral institutions, civil society organizations and the private sector to learn from gender mainstreaming initiatives in these areas.
- Expand expertise in gender mainstreaming in new loan modalities such as the Multitranches Financing Facility (MFF) and sector wide approaches. We hope the technical note prepared by RSGS on *Social Analysis in MFF* (2008) will enhance gender mainstreaming initiatives in MFF loans.
- Enhance loans with GAD themes and effective gender mainstreaming especially in South Asia, Central and West Asia, East Asia and Pacific regions.
- Continue to use the GAD Fund for technical assistance projects to leverage gender mainstreaming in larger loan operations with OCR funding. Grant funds can also be utilized to analyze regional differences in gender equity including emerging gender issues in middle income countries.
- Support partnerships at the country level between national machineries or sector agencies with greater gender capacity and Ministries of Planning or Finance to push forth gender-inclusive policy reforms under program lending.
- Support partnerships at the country level between national machineries and statistical agencies to institutionalize collection and dissemination of gender disaggregated data.
- Continue RSGS review of Project Preparatory Technical Assistance reports as well as draft project design documents (Report and Recommendation to the President-RRPs) to monitor compliance with ADB's GAD policy guidelines on project design.
- Improve measurement of gender-related impacts in project and program lending.

Organizational Effectiveness:

- Appoint a full-time gender specialist in all regional departments and in increasing number of resident missions.

We commend both the South Asia and Central West Asia regional departments for their current efforts to fill gender specialist staff vacancies to reverse declining gender-mainstreaming trends in the loan portfolios of these regions. We hope the vacant gender specialist position in the South East Asia regional department will also be filled soon. We are also pleased that the numbers of resident mission gender consultants are increasing with the addition of Papua New Guinea.

- Clarify the role of the Gender and Social Development Committee of the Communities of Practice in particular on how it can support RSGS and the Regional Departments in improving gender mainstreaming in loan operations.
- Conduct gender training and technical seminars for ADB staff in priority areas identified by the Regional Departments;
- Share ADB's experiences and disseminate lessons learned from successful gender mainstreaming in specific sectors through regional and international forums and production of practical tools, technical papers and case studies to support replication of good practices and gender capacity development of ADB and its development partners.

IV. Internal Gender Action Program (GAP) III:

13. We appreciated the briefings provided by the Director and staff of the Human Resources Division (BPHR) as well as by Board members of the Professional Women's Committee (PWC) and GAP III Working Group regarding the recruitment, promotion and work environment of ADB's female professional staff. We heard serious concerns about the declining recruitment of professional women (dropped from 29.6% in 2006 to 28.3% by October 2008) as well as the low retention rates of professional women. Strategy 2020's focus on large infrastructure projects will inevitably change ADB's recruitment profile. Without significant attention, ADB may struggle to prevent further declines in the number of women professional staff. On the other hand, while the promotion of professional women to the managerial level (level 7 and above) appears to be a slow process, we commend ADB for its positive efforts in this regard last year (women at senior levels increased to 15.6% by October 2008 from 11% in 2006). New attempts to improve work-life balance such as maternity leave benefits are also in the right direction to improve the work environment and satisfaction levels of women professionals.

14. In light of the current status, we commend ADB for setting ambitious targets under GAP III which are incorporated in the Strategy 2020 Results Framework to improve the gender balance among professional staff (35% women), including at senior levels (25% for level 7 and above). We offer the following recommendations to support ADB's commitment to achieve these targets:

- Be more proactive in targeting advertising for recruitment of women professionals. EFG suggestions on recruitment sources such as women's associations, professional women's groups, and international resume banks for technical fields are listed in Annex 2. BPHR may consider dedicating a full-time staff/consultant to expand global outreach for recruitment of women professionals.
- Offer information on spousal employment options in ADB, in Manila and in the region to reduce the high rejection rates by married female applicants.
- Communicate with comparable institutions to learn about their experiences of provision of flexible work hours and child care services to improve the work environment for female professionals.
- Hold all regional and central departments accountable for achieving human resource targets to improve gender balance so they will have incentives to search for and nominate female candidates for staff and managerial vacancies.
- Improve collaboration between all regional and central departments and BPHR on career development programs to support promotion of female professional staff.
- Establish a more formal channel of communication between the PWC and BPHR so there is a record of PWC feedback related to GAP III progress.
- Improve ADB's staff grievance mechanism in order to retain women professionals. ADB may consider employing an Ombudsman to serve as a direct advocate for staff to raise and settle complaints informally prior to embarking on the formal grievance procedures.
- EFG would welcome commenting on the GAP III mid-term review in June 2009.

V. A Revised Role for the EFG

15. Following our last meeting, we were asked to respond to a survey (already completed) and an “EFG Options Paper” developed by RSGS to propose possible changes in the way the EFG provides support and advice to ADB. Our specific comments in response to the Options Paper are provided in Annex 3. During our 9th session, we also discussed how the EFG can improve its effectiveness in the changing context under Strategy 2020 and the new ADB Results Framework which provide a renewed commitment and an accountability mechanism to enhance gender based outcomes.

16. Our discussions with the ADB staff and senior management clearly revealed the need for the EFG to maintain its strategic focus but also to broaden its “assessment role” to encompass an “assistance role” in the operationalization of Strategy 2020’s gender commitments. The EFG welcomes this opportunity to work in partnership with the ADB to assist in the implementation of its GAD Plan of Action (2008-2010) and monitor progress in operationalizing its commitments to gender equity including in Strategy 2020’s gender related benchmarks. In this revised role, the EFG would (i) continue to advise ADB on specific gender issues in the Asia and Pacific region; (ii) strengthen RSGS GAD Principal’s links with ADB senior management to lead and monitor GAD policy implementation; and (iii) increase assistance to Regional Departments as needed, in providing suggestions for technical gender expertise, organizing seminars on gender issues in hard sectors, and monitoring implementation of the Gender Plan of Action by responding to the Development Effectiveness Review.

17. In terms of membership, the EFG recommends maintaining an average of 10-12 members given the more effective voice it perceives it can have in engaging in discussion with the ADB senior management with a wider group of experts and past experience that some members are sometimes unable to attend meetings. The EFG also believes its membership should include significant representation of persons with (i) technical expertise in development economics and gender analysis; (ii) technical gender expertise in ADB’s core areas of specialization under Strategy 2020; and (iii) a range of other experience and expertise to provide a view to the ADB about on the ground realities in countries where the ADB lends.

18. To maintain regular communication with senior management on ADB’s GAD progress, the EFG recommends continuing to hold its annual meetings at ADB headquarters. In addition, EFG members would welcome attending other regional or country-level consultations or ADB annual meetings upon request.

19. The June/July period is considered optimal timing for the annual meeting from the perspective of the EFG members, although the EFG understood that this was a difficult time for some ADB staff. Since the ADB Gender Specialists’ annual consultation workshops are always held in the fall, this would allow two distinct opportunities for ADB to focus on its GAD progress during the year.

VI. Conclusion and Future Work:

20. While Strategy 2020 includes “Gender Equity” as one of the drivers of change, the achievement of gender equality objectives and outcomes in ADB’s work will still be challenging given its changing sector focus and changing lending modalities. However, the EFG is encouraged by the current positive context and the accountability mechanism established through the ADB Results Framework and the GAD Plan of Action (2008-2010) to achieve improved results in the future. Senior management and staff have a better understanding of the importance of gender mainstreaming for achieving expected development results by 2020. Next year, we look forward to

“celebrating” the reversal of declining trends with increased number of ADB loans demonstrating significant gender mainstreaming across sectors, regions, funding sources and loan modalities as well as improved gender balance of professional staff. We continue to urge ADB to make greater use of international human rights standards, such as the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women and the Convention on the Rights of the Child, in all aspects of its work.

21. In summary, to achieve Strategy 2020’s expected gender-based results, we recommend that ADB (i) raise awareness of government agencies in partnership with national machineries through policy dialogue on existing gender disparities which pose obstacles to poverty reduction; (ii) expand its good practices in gender mainstreaming in rural infrastructure, water supply and sanitation, agriculture, water resources management, governance, health and education sectors across the region while improving its technical capacity to address gender issues in hard sectors such as large infrastructure and climate change; (iii) improve methods of measuring gender-related impact in project and program lending; (iv) increase the number of its dedicated gender specialists in resident missions and appoint a gender specialist for each regional department; (v) enhance the gender analysis and mainstreaming capacity of ADB staff and executing agencies through knowledge sharing and lateral learning events on good practices; and (vi) develop an organogram to identify the Bank’s institutional gender structure and related responsibilities to implement the GAD Plan of Action (2008-2010). On internal gender issues, we recommend that ADB expand its outreach to identify women professionals suitable for ADB’s positions in order to increase female recruitment rates, and to continue to make improvements in its work environment and in the promotion of female professionals to managerial levels.

22. To be more effective in this changing context, the EFG would like to offer the following recommendations and timetable in preparation for next year’s meeting:

- The EFG meeting agenda be set collaboratively by RSGS and the Regional Departments in consultation with the EFG.
- The EFG meeting could include a thematic focus based on needs and priorities identified by Regional Departments on an annual basis.
- The EFG would provide expertise for a technical seminar on gender issues related to the selected thematic area identified as a top priority for the ADB providing inputs and examples of case studies on successful gender mainstreaming.
- The EFG would like to meet with ADB’s senior management of all departments and the President if possible to discuss progress related to gender mainstreaming in operations and internal gender issues.
- The EFG would benefit from meeting with the PWC to get staff perspectives on GAP III progress.
- The EFG would recommend the continued practice of two gender specialist consultants and/or national officers attending EFG meetings, as they provide direct feedback on challenges and good practices with gender mainstreaming in loan operations.

We suggest the following tentative timetable for follow up on the results of our meeting:

<u>EFG Tasks</u>	<u>Schedule</u>
◆ Outcome Document	End-Nov. 2008
◆ ADB Response to Outcome Document	February 2009
◆ RD’s identify regional GAD priorities and concerns under Strategy 2020	March 2009
◆ EFG Input to Development Effectiveness Review	Spring 2009
◆ RSGS/RDs/EFG decide on the thematic focus of	

- | | |
|---|----------------|
| the next EFG meeting | April 2009 |
| ◆ RSGS/RDs set EFG meeting agenda
in consultation with the EFG | May/June 2009 |
| ◆ EFG 10 th annual meeting | June/July 2009 |

23. Finally, in Smita Notosusanto's absence, we are grateful to Andrew Byrnes for kindly serving as acting chairperson of our 9th session and for coordinating our feedback to ADB through the Outcome Document. We would like to inform ADB that we have selected Vanessa Griffen from Fiji as the EFG's next chairperson.

24. We thank ADB once again for the opportunity to discuss its vision and specific objectives for improving gender equality and women's empowerment in the Asia and Pacific region and in its own institutional structure. The EFG would greatly appreciate ADB's formal response to this Outcome Document as well as its wide circulation to ADB Board of Directors and staff at all levels.

FINAL AGENDA

ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK 9th Meeting of the External Forum on Gender and Development (EFG) Conference Room 4653/54 East, ADB Headquarters, Manila 15–17 October 2008

Background:

The External Forum on Gender and Development (EFG) was established in 2001 to promote and facilitate dialogue between ADB and external groups on gender and development issues. To date, the EFG has met eight times at ADB Headquarters and the corresponding Outcome Documents of the meetings are posted on ADB's website (www.adb.org/Gender/forum.asp).

Of the eleven EFG members with a range of gender and development (GAD) expertise and from within and outside of the region, seven will be attending the 9th Session (see the list of members at the end of Agenda). From ADB, Gender, Social Development and Civil Society Division of Regional and Sustainable Development Department (RSGS) will be facilitating the EFG discussion as a secretariat.

Expected Outcomes:

The expected outcomes of the 9th Session are:

- Agreement among EFG members on ways forward (e.g., membership, mode of operations, strategic focus, etc.)
- EFG's recommendations to ADB on improving effectiveness of ADB GAD work
- EFG will prepare a draft outcome document for submission to RSGS at the end of the meeting.

Program:

Wednesday, 15 October

- | | |
|----------|--|
| 09:00 am | <p><i>Welcome Remarks</i>
Ma. Carmela D. Locsin, Deputy Director General, Regional and Sustainable Development Department (RSDD)</p> <p><i>Introductions, purposes of the meeting and report back on ADB's response to the recommendations in the EFG's 2007 Outcome Document</i>
Robert J. Dobias, Director, RSGS</p> <p><i>Greetings from Gender and Social Development Committee</i>
Shireen Lateef, Chair, CoP</p> |
| 09:25 am | <p><i>Proposed Agenda and Planning</i>
Sonomi Tanaka, RSGS; Tulin Pulley, Consultant, EFG members</p> <p>Coffee Break</p> |
| 10:30 am | <p><i>Briefing by Strategy and Policy Department (SPD) on key strategic issues relevant to GAD:</i></p> |

- Strategy 2020: The Long-Term Strategic Framework of ADB 2008-2020
 - GAD in Asian Development Fund X (2009-2012)
 - Development Effectiveness Review and Results Framework
- Christopher MacCormac, Deputy Director General, SPD
Shigeko Hattori, SPD

12:00 pm *Welcome Lunch* hosted by DDG, RSDD
(with participation of D/RSGS, R. Marianti and S. Subba, and selected RSDD staff)

01:30am *Briefings and discussion of recent gender-related developments at ADB:*

- Summary of the GAD Biennial Thematic Report 2006–2007 and Implementation of GAD Plan of Action 2008-2010 by Sonomi Tanaka, RSGS
- Implementation status of Gender and Development Cooperation Fund by Francesco Tornieri, Social Development Specialist (GAD), RSGS

3:00 pm *Strengthening gender equality and women empowerment results – Case Studies from Indonesia and Nepal*

- Indonesia – Ruly Marianti, Gender Specialist, Indonesia Resident Mission

Coffee break

04:00 pm *Video Conference* with Ursula Schaefer-Preuss, Vice President Knowledge Management and Sustainable Development

04:45 pm *Strengthening gender equality and women empowerment results – Case Studies from Indonesia and Nepal [Continuation]*

- Nepal – Suman Subba, Gender Specialist, Nepal Resident Mission

06:30 pm Bus from Discovery leaves for dinner at Residence of Aurora de Dios.

Thursday, 16 October

09:00 am Meeting with ADB's Professional Women's Committee Board and Gender Action Program III

Coffee break

10:30 am *Dialogue with DGs/Directors of East Asia, Southeast Asia, and Pacific Departments* on prospects for implementing the GAD Policy Plan of Action (2008-2010), including resources (introductions by S. Tanaka, RSGS, discussions facilitated and led by EFG Members)

12:00 pm Working Lunch with Gender and Social Development Committee on the role of EFG in the era of Strategy 2020 (brainstorming session)

01:30 pm *Meeting with Human Resources Division (BPHR) on ADB's Internal Gender Action Plan III and GAD staff issues*

Hyong-Jong Yu, Director, BPHR

Rosario Abad Santos, Head, Policy and Recruitment Planning Unit, BPHR

- 02:30 pm *Meeting with Mr. Xiaoyu Zhao, Vice-President (Operations 1) responsible for South Asia Department, Central and West Asia Department, and Private Sector Operations Department. Venue: 8733E*
- 03:15 pm *Dialogue with DGs/Directors of South Asia and Central/West Asia Departments (under Operations Group1) on prospects for implementing the GAD Policy Plan of Action (2008–2010), including resources Introductions by S. Tanaka, RSGS, discussions facilitated and led by EFG Members*
- 04:30 pm *Meeting with the Rajat Nag, Managing Director General. Venue: 8733E*
- 05:30 pm EFG Working Session
- Discussion on EFG Option Paper and questionnaire responses
 - Any other internal businesses
- 07:30 pm Dinner at Residence, Director, RSGS (pickup from hotel at 7:15 pm)

Friday, 17 October

- 09:00 am *Meeting with Mr. Lawrence Greenwood, Vice-President (Operations 2) responsible for East Asia, Southeast Asia Department, and Pacific Department. Venue: 8733E*
- 09:45 am EFG Working Session
- 12:00 pm EFG Lunchtime Seminar:
- Supporting Gender Equality and Women’s Empowerment and Coordinating Regional Activities – A Case of UN ESCAP (Vanessa Griffen)
 - Financing Gender Equality and Women’s Empowerment (Yasuko Muramatsu)
- 01:30 pm EFG Working Session (cont’d)
- 04:00 pm EFG feedback to DDG, RSDD, RSGS and Committee
- 04:45 pm Closing remarks by Director, RSGS

List of EFG Members:

Attending:

Andrew Byrnes (Australia)	Professor of Law at the University of New South Wales (Acting Chair)
Vanessa Griffen (Fiji)	UN Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific
Aurora Javate-de Dios (Philippines)	Executive Director, Women and Gender Institute
Khunying Supatra Masdit (Thailand)	Former parliamentarian
Yasuko Muramatsu (Japan)	Chair, Japan Research Center for Gender and Development
Md. Wahidur Rahman (Bangladesh)	Additional Chief Engineer, Administration, Project Monitoring and Evaluation, Local Government Engineering Department
Eugene Ryazanov (Kyrgyz)	Civil Engineer and Business Development Specialist
Wu Qing (PRC)	Board Member, Beijing Cultural Development Center for Rural Women

Not attending:

Savitri Goonesekere (Sri Lanka)
Caren Grown (United States)

Senior Professor of Law Emeritus, University of Colombo
Economist-In-Residence, American University, Washington
DC

Smita Notosusanto (Indonesia)

Executive Director, Centre for Electoral Reform (Current
Chair)

Contact Persons in ADB:

Sonomi Tanaka

Principal Social Development Specialist (GAD), RSGS, ext.
5339

Francesco Tornieri

Social Development Specialist (GAD), RSGS, ext. 5983

Zarah Zafra

Assistant Operations Analyst, RSGS, ext. 6585

Tulin Pulley

Consultant (Secretariat), RSGS

EFG'S SUGGESTED LIST:

RECRUITMENT SOURCES FOR PROFESSIONAL WOMEN

1. Local Women NGOs
2. Associations of Engineers
3. Women on Boards (Australia): see <http://www.womenonboards.org.au/about/>
4. Promotea Project: see <http://www.prometea.info/>
5. IEEE Women in Engineering : see <http://www.ieee.org/web/membership/women/index.html>
6. Economics Society of Australia – Committee for Women in Economics: see <http://www.ecosoc.org.au/cc/women-economics>
7. The International Organization of Pakistani Women Engineers (IOPWE): see <http://www.iopwe.net/>
8. Society of Heterodox Economists: see http://www.economics.unsw.edu.au/nps/servlet/portalservice?GI_ID=System.LoggedOutInheritableArea&maxWnd=T_Heterodox_home
9. Association for Women's Rights in Development (AWID): see <http://www.awid.org/>

28 November 2008

Mr. Robert J. Dobias
 Director
 Gender, Social Development and Civil Society Division
 Asian Development Bank
 6 ADB Avenue
 Mandaluyong City, Metro-Manila
 Philippines

Re: EFG Options Paper

Dear Bob:

On behalf of the External Forum on Gender and Development (EFG), thank you for inviting our review and comment on the EFG Options Paper to renew the EFG's effectiveness in advancing ADB's efforts to mainstream gender in all its operations and improve internal gender balance. Our feedback is as follows:

Option 1:

Composition: Reduce membership to 6/7

Activities:

- The annual meeting is held on alternative years, still with an outcome document.
- Activities expanded according to suggestions listed in Option 2.

EFG Response to Option 1:

Composition: Reducing membership size to 6/7 is not advisable as some members are unavailable to attend meetings and we would lose our "group strength".

Activities: Holding the annual meeting in alternative years is not advisable as the EFG would lose momentum and would not be able to keep abreast of new developments and monitor ADB's GAD progress effectively. The EFG would welcome opportunities to participate in other ADB events such as annual meetings, international women's day, in-country consultations on country gender assessments and regional meetings on emerging GAD issues or gender capacity development.

Option 2

Composition: Reduce membership to 6/7

Activities:

- Only 3-4 members meet annually; this would consist of visits to senior managers and staff on specific issues agreed with RSDD; an outcome document prepared on the basis of these meetings and input from other activities (see below), and agreed by all EFG members through email; a final version of the document presented to CoP, management and staff at HQ (possibly by Professor Aurora Javate de Dios), then disseminated.
- Three visits annually of EFG members to projects sites selected by RSDD, initially in DMCs where EFG members reside and where ADB has gender specialists. Visits may be carried out in conjunction with gender assessments planned by RSDD and ADB (linked to loans, TA, and CPS).
- Possible additional activities: participation of EFG members to ADB events (e.g. International Women's Day, Eminent Speakers Forum of RSDD, Annual meetings, gender training, consultations for Country Gender Assessments; desk review of key policy documents).

EFG Response to Option 2:

Composition: We do not advise reducing the group's size to 6/7 so we do not lose our "group strength" and we do not see any rationale for having only a "core group" of members meeting annually. The contributions of all EFG members should matter equally and they should meet together in annual meetings and contribute equally to the Outcome Document.

Activities: The EFG would welcome opportunities to participate in other ADB events such as annual meetings, international women's day, in-country consultations on country gender assessments and regional meetings on emerging GAD issues or gender capacity development. EFG members would also welcome participating in field visits to project sites as requested by RSGS in countries where they reside and where there are resident mission gender specialists.

Option 3:

Composition: the number of members of the EFG is reduced to 7 or 8, of which:

- at least three (of considerable standing and renowned through the region and beyond) represent a 'core' and the more public face of the EFG in meeting with senior managers and be present at international events. Future selection of members to ensure better representation of civil society and expertise on priority areas of the ADB. Selection of members to be made more systematic and transparent. ToRs to be simplified. The opportunity for renewing membership may arise in 2008, since at least two of the most experienced members may wish to resign.

Key Activities:

- The annual meeting to continue as a more interactive dialogue (including with lower and mid level managers); in a more congenial and comfortable physical environment when at HQ and occasionally to be held at project sites; focused on one or two topics (carried through to the next year), and with regular attention to critically unchanging areas, where responsiveness has been limited; with meetings with the President at the beginning and at the end; as much as possible meetings to overlap with GS workshop.
- Communications with ADB in between meetings to be intensified, perhaps via a 'committee' set up for the purpose. This will also allow the EFG members to learn of the progress made on their recommendations in a more gradual and realistic manner.
- Dissemination of findings: the outcome document still to be prepared but dissemination improved, using GNN, ADB Review and other outlets, with different audiences targeted differently. Recommendations also to be sent directly to relevant Departments and staff. One of the members to deliver an Eminent Speaker Forum Seminar on a topical subject and on findings of the group.

Other activities:

- The three more eminent members of the group to be invited to participate in the Annual Meetings (Bali 2009 for example), and comparable international and HQ events.
- All members to be involved as appropriate in raising awareness at HQ, and in country based activities, such as: preparation of CGA; national and where possible regional level training and lateral learning, sharing relevant best practices or strategies observed, practiced or drafted for other organizations; interaction with urban development in Manila. Visits to project sites and RMs are essential.

EFG Response to Option 3:

Composition: We do not advise reducing group size to 7/8. The EFG recommends maintaining a group size of about 10/12 to ensure "group strength" in annual meetings even if some members are not available to attend. The EFG also does not see any rationale for having only a "core group" of members meeting annually. The contributions of all EFG members should matter equally and they should meet together in annual meetings and contribute equally to the Outcome Document. In light of Strategy 2020, the EFG should ensure having the right composition of people with relevant gender expertise to provide

strategic feedback on the implementation of the ADB's Gender Plan of Action. Continuing to have a strong development economics expertise and some members with technical gender expertise in ADB's core areas of specialization are seen essential for the next phase of the EFG.

Activities:

- We recommend the EFG annual meetings continue to be held at ADB headquarters to maintain links with senior management on GAD progress. We would appreciate meeting with the ADB President when he is in Manila during our future visits.
- We welcome meeting in a more comfortable environment than the closed atmosphere of the RSDD conference rooms.
- We also welcome having distinct area(s) of focus for future EFG meetings to improve effectiveness but we suggest the areas of focus be determined in collaboration with the Regional Departments.
- Although we have benefited in the past from an overlap of the EFG meeting with the Gender Specialists annual workshop, we understand this is burdensome for RSGS and other ADB staff; therefore, we recommend including two gender specialist representatives in our annual meetings to continue receiving invaluable direct feedback on field operations.
- We would welcome opportunities to participate in other ADB events such as annual meetings, International Women's Day, in-country consultations on country gender assessments and regional meetings on emerging GAD issues or gender capacity development. We would also be interested in participating in field visits to project sites as requested by RSGS in countries where we reside and where there are resident mission gender specialists.
- We would benefit from increased level of communication throughout the year with RSGS and the Regional Departments. Two suggestions include including EFG members on the distribution list of knowledge products as well as inviting the EFG to comment on the annual Development Effectiveness Review regarding progress towards Strategy 2020's gender commitments.
- We agree that the EFG should continue to prepare an Outcome Document to record its observations and recommendations following its annual meetings.
- We trust the ADB will share the EFG Outcome Document with senior management and the ADB Board of Directors for their information and disseminate it broadly through the ADB gender website to staff at all levels at headquarters and the resident missions.

Thank you for this opportunity to comment on the "EFG Options Paper". We look forward to our collaboration in advancing ADB's gender-based goals in its operational work and institutional structure in a more effective way.

Very truly yours,



Andrew Byrnes
Acting Chair
External Forum on Gender and Development

cc: Ms. C. Locsin
Mr. R. J. Dobias
Ms. S. Tanaka

Ms. S. Lateef
EFG members