

## TERMS OF REFERENCE

### A. International Consultants

#### 1. Senior Strategy Advisor

1. Advise the ADB Country Assistance Program Evaluation (CAPE) team in analyzing the country assistance program context, evaluating and discussing ADB's performance with stakeholders in Mongolia. Specifically, the consultant will assist in the preparation and review of the CAPE for Mongolia, as directed by the OED task manager. The consultant will formulate recommendations based on findings of CAPE studies from OED and other MDBs.

- i. Advise the operations evaluation mission (OEM) on the evaluation approach and methods based on latest international best practice.
- ii. Advise the OEM on specific technical evaluation issues as they arise.
- iii. Carry out an independent review of work-in-progress papers and reports for the CAPE and provide feedback on technical content and consistency for the developing and final reports.
- iv. Provide an assessment of the CAPE team's approach to evaluation ratings and help develop and interpret ratings.
- v. Advise the CAPE team on the formulation of lessons learned, conclusions and recommendations.
- vi. Follow OED's Guidelines for the Preparation of Country Assistance Program Evaluation reports and assist the OEM in preparing and presenting reports in prescribed format on findings for points (ii) to (v), and as directed by the OED Task Manager.
- vii. Assist the OED Task Manager in preparing a consultative stakeholder workshop on the CAPE findings, as required.

#### 2. Urban Development Advisor

2. An international consultant will be recruited to assist the Rapid Sector Assessment (RSA) team in analyzing the Asian Development Bank's (ADB) assistance to the urban development sector in Mongolia. For the purposes of this study, the urban development sector comprises the following subsectors: water supply, sanitation, environment, and heating. The Consultant will be responsible for assessing sector assistance strategy and program in all the subsectors except urban heating subsector. He/she should be familiar with the Asian Development Bank's (ADB) operations and development issues and Government structure in Mongolia, particularly key issues relating to water supply, sanitation and urban environment. The Consultant will undertake the following tasks.

- i. Analyze recent developments in the urban development sector for all the subsectors except urban heating over the period 2002-2006. This should include an assessment of main indicators, development challenges, government responses to these challenges, and the policy agenda in each of the subsectors.
- ii. Assess the positioning of ADB's urban development sector strategy in Mongolia. This will include separate assessments of the basis for the sector strategy; the government's absorptive capacity and ownership; ADB's comparative advantage and relationship with other development partners; the focus, synergies and selectivity of the strategy; long-term continuity of the strategy; and the

- constraints/risks and adjustment and monitoring mechanisms adopted by the strategy to achieve sector outcomes/outputs.
- iii. Evaluate ADB's sector assistance program (including loans, grant projects, and technical assistance projects) in Mongolia for all the subsectors except urban heating. This will include separate assessments of each projects' relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability, and impact, as well as an overall assessment of the entire portfolio's performance in achieving the strategic outcomes/outputs in the sector.
  - iv. Identify factors affecting the implementation ADB projects/programs based on a review of project implementation documents, project completion documents, and evaluation reports, as well as feedback from relevant Government entities, executing agencies (EA), and project staff.
  - v. Identify critical factors affecting EA capacity and performance in urban areas and related sectors at the central, local Government and project implementing unit levels, and related Government capacity development efforts at the individual, organizational, networking and policy levels.
  - vi. Participate in consultation mission to Mongolia to assess ADB's urban development strategy and program. During this mission, prepare and organize key-informant interviews and conduct stakeholder surveys with selected beneficiaries of ADB's assistance. Also, Prepare and organize focus group interviews, as required, to discuss with executing agencies (EA) and other government and non-government entities development issues and concerns, including outcome and impact of ADB's assistance both in Ulaanbaatar and during the field trip to two provincial towns outside of the capital.
  - vii. Prepare a report on findings to an outline agreed with the RSA Team Leader and make necessary revisions based on feedback.
  - viii. Together with National Consultant, prepare a 1-2 page write-up on the overall environment (not just urban environment) plans, policies and strategies of Mongolia for inclusion as a thematic section of the Mongolia country assistance program evaluation (CAPE).
  - ix. Undertake other assignments related to the RSA, as requested.

### **3. Social Sector Specialist**

3. Rapid assessment of the social sector (health, education and social protection sectors) in Mongolia which will contribute to the preparation of the Mongolia CAPE.
  - i. Review and assess the key features of the Government's policies and plans for the social sector (health and education sectors) as well as provision of social safety net (as well as in the context of pension system and social insurance).
  - ii. Review ADB's sector work in social sector including provision of social safety net (as well as in the context of pension system and social) and assess whether these provided a reasonable assessment of the situation in the sector that was taken to a logical and practical conclusion for positioning ADB's social sector programs in relation to Government plans and priorities.
  - iii. Assess the relevance, responsiveness, effectiveness, sustainability, and to some extent impact of ADB's development strategies and assistance in the social sector (including provision of social safety net).
  - iv. Review assistance programs of other development partners supporting the social sector (including provision of social safety net) and assess how ADB's sector strategy and program complemented those of other development partners.

- v. Assess the selectivity, focus, and sequencing of ADB support in the social sector (including assistance provided to social protection), types of counterpart institution, and suitability of modalities and instruments, considering Government priorities, opportunities for development and reform, capacity of counterpart institutions, private sector opportunities, ADB's comparative advantage against Mongolia's other development partners, and effectiveness and impact considerations.
- vi. Assess whether experience gained from past ADB operations with individual projects/programs (i.e. lessons identified) in Mongolian social sector was used in designing or implementing subsequent strategies and interventions in the country.
- vii. Identify progress on key outputs and outcomes of ADB assistance in the social sector including provision of social safety net in Mongolia based on available documents including OED studies and previous surveys carried out for the social sector.
- viii. Assist in rating the education and health (including social protection) sector programs from a 'top-down' perspective using OED's Guidelines for the Preparation of Country Assistance Program Evaluation.
- ix. Formulate lessons and recommendations for future strategies in the social sector.
- x. Assist in preparing sector assistance evaluation reports (one each for education, and health, nutrition and social protection). Also submit brief overall assessment of social sector assistance in Mongolia including a synthesis of issues on social sector as a whole with background material, information, and analytical working papers.
- xi. Perform other tasks as requested by OED staff in relation to evaluation of the social sector in Mongolia.

## **B. Domestic Consultants**

### **1. Macroeconomic and Public Policy Specialist**

- i. Assist the international Senior Strategy Advisor and the OEM team leader in reviewing recent trends and performance of Mongolian economy over the past 10 years. Assist in the sourcing and reviewing relevant documents on the economic and social situation in the country, government strategies and programs, and other reports and documents that are relevant to ADB's operations in the country.
- ii. Collect and collate secondary and primary data on economic, social, and sector developments for the country overall and selected regions. Data collection and collation includes MDG achievements, poverty levels, economic growth, and relevant sector development achievements and outputs.
- iii. Assist to analyze and interpret collated data and information, prepare statistical tables, graphs and other forms of illustration.
- iv. Review available literature on linkages between economic growth and poverty reduction at the national and regional levels. Assess the actual and potential role of various sectors in poverty reduction efforts.
- v. In the context of the macro-level assessments and top-down evaluation process assist in identifying key development constraints and challenges.
- vi. Identify significant macro and sector reforms at the central Government and regional levels over the last 10 years and assist in identifying ADB's role and contribution in supporting reforms.

- vii. Assist the OEM in reviewing the support programs of other development partners and assess the extent to which they complement and integrate with ADB's support program, in particular policy reform initiatives. Help to identify good practices in program lending.
- viii. Help OEM in assessing ADB's overall development impact and positioning of the program as a whole, given constraints and opportunities in the country as a whole.
- ix. Identify significant Government/donors' private sector development strategies/initiatives and measures, including the public-private-partnership (PPP), over the last 10 years and prepare a brief private sector development assessment report (3-5 pages).
- x. Assist the OEM in carrying out semi-structured survey on ADB perception by identifying 100-150 key informants (e.g. relevant public agencies, development partners, private sector, NGOs, academia in Ulaanbaatar) and distributing the survey form and collecting the survey answers.
- xi. Prepare a short paper on the country context over the past decade, covering growth, poverty reduction, major policy reforms, and role of external assistance in a prescribed format. A rough interim draft should be submitted by early March 2008, which will be refined during the OEM's CAPE mission and be finally submitted to the team leader immediately after the CAPE mission tentatively scheduled in March/April.
- xii. Finally, assist the OEM's Government consultation mission (through assisting the OEM in organizing and providing a workshop to stakeholders on the outcomes of the CAPE) in Ulaanbaatar in around June/July 2008.

## **2. Fiscal and Public Expenditure Management Specialist**

- i. Review the main fiscal trends (expenditure, revenue, public debt) during the past decade.
- ii. Summarize key fiscal reforms that took place during the past decade.
- iii. Review ADB's assistance in fiscal/public expenditure management/public management in terms of: (a) goals and objectives of ADB assistance in these areas; (b) strategies for developing improved institutional capacity; and (c) results of the assistance in terms of outputs and outcomes.
- iv. Formally assess ADB's assistance in the area of public sector financial management using a rating methodology to be supplied by the OEM.
- v. Identify key fiscal challenges (debt sustainability, adequacy of recurrent resources for sustaining and maintaining public capital stock etc.) and the implications that these would have for future ADB support.
- vi. Assist the OEM in developing and carrying out semi-structured interviews with relevant public agencies.
- vii. Prepare a report on findings to an outline agreed with the OEM team leader and in a prescribed format. A rough interim draft should be submitted by early March 2008, which will be refined during the OEM's CAPE mission and be finally submitted to the team leader immediately after the CAPE mission tentatively scheduled in March/April.

## **3. Agriculture Sector Specialist**

- i. Assist the OEM team leader in by drafting a rapid sector assessment in a prescribed format.

- ii. Update the review of ADB-financed agriculture/rural development assistance programs and assess their relevance, effectiveness, sustainability, and impact towards the strategic objectives in the sector.
- iii. Assist the OEM team leader in carrying out evaluation of projects addressing agriculture sector development at the local level.
- iv. Assist in preparing and undertaking key-informant interviews and conduct stakeholder surveys with selected beneficiaries of ADB's assistance.
- v. Assist in preparing and organizing focus group interviews, as required, to discuss with Executing Agencies and other government and non-government entities development issues and concerns, including outcome and impact of ADB's assistance.
- vi. Assist in identifying institutional issues affecting the implementation ADB projects/programs based on a review of project implementation documents, evaluation reports, and feedback from relevant Government entities, Executing Agencies, and project staff.
- vii. Assist in identify critical factors affecting EA capacity and performance rural areas and related sectors at the central, local Government and Project Implementation Unit levels, and related Government capacity development efforts at the individual, organizational, networking and policy levels.
- viii. Assess how ADB's operations have contributed to environmental improvement efforts in rural areas of Mongolia.
- ix. Assist in assessing the incorporation of environmental concerns in ADB's projects, as required.
- x. Prepare a report on findings that include a brief agriculture sector assessment in a format agreed with the OEM team leader and the ADB sector program/project evaluation prescribed format. A rough interim draft should be submitted by early March 2008, which will be refined during the OEM's CAPE mission and be finally submitted to the team leader immediately after the CAPE mission tentatively

#### **4. Rapid Assessment of Trade Facilitation: Survey Expert**

4. The purpose of the consultancy is to assist the Asian Development Bank (ADB) Mission Leader in assessing the effectiveness of regional cooperation in facilitating trade between Mongolia and the People's Republic of China (PRC). The Survey Expert will carry out a perception survey in the two border towns of Zamyn Uud and Yarant to assess the issues faced by truck operators, traders, shipping companies, and freight forwarders in carrying out trade.

5. The assignment will primarily involve carrying out interviews with Government officials in Zamyn Uud and Yarant; businessmen, and traders (i.e., shipping companies, truck operators, and freight forwarders) in those locations. It will require a stakeholder survey in each of these locations with 10 days in Zamyn Uud and 7 days in Yarant. The intermittent assignment will commence on or about 27 November 2007.

6. The tasks of the Survey Expert will be the following:
- i. Review relevant background documents relating to regional cooperation initiatives including those relating to Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation (CAREC), as well as those relating to trade with the PRC.
  - ii. Assist the ADB Mission Leader in finalizing the perceptions surveys questionnaires and interview formats for the two locations of Zamyn Uud and Yarant, including translation to local language.
  - iii. If possible, the survey can extend to the border towns in the PRC.

- iv. Select, recruit, and prepare a team of enumerators for carrying out the surveys. The two surveys will be carried out by two independent teams to ensure that there are no delays in obtaining the data. The survey expenses will be paid in lump sum separately. The Survey Expert will be responsible for providing an estimate of the survey costs in advance of his/her appointment. The estimate will include all travel, administrative, and other costs associated with carrying out the survey, including the payment to the enumerators. The supervision and implementation of the surveys will be the responsibility of the Survey Expert. The Mission Leader will oversee this activity.
- v. The field survey will cover two broad areas – quantifying the factors related to trade facilitation and seeking the perceptions of the stakeholders.
- vi. Quantifying the factors related to trade facilitation. The Survey Expert will interview select local transport operators, truck owners, bus passengers, businessmen, freight forwarders, and shipping company employees to obtain information.
- vii. Perceptions of the stakeholders. The Survey Expert will carry out a perception survey using a questionnaire drafted by the Mission Leader. This questionnaire will be translated into Mongol and Russian languages for use by the survey enumerators. The findings of the survey will be analyzed and the analysis provided in the Survey Expert report to the Mission Leader.
- viii. The Survey Expert will analyze the key barriers to movement of trade between Ulaanbaatar and Port of Tianjin in the PRC. These can be compared in different contexts such as the barriers to trade movement between Ulaanbaatar and the Russian ports.
- ix. Compare the cost of moving goods from UB to Tianjin (Xingang), Qingdao and Qing Huang Dao ports. Since port congestion is however very common at Xingang port, the study will calculate the cost of logistic delays borne by the traders.
- x. The Survey Expert will also compare the cost of moving goods by rail vis-à-vis road. The study could use various options such as UB to Tianjin by rail; UB to Zamyn Uud by rail and further by road; UB to Tianjin by road (if physically possible). Similar analysis could be done in Yarrant.
- xi. Conduct comparison of prices between the international border and the market place. For imported goods, the study will compare the price of a sample of commodities at the border with the price of the same commodities in the market place in Ulaanbaatar, excluding the taxes and duties. For exported goods, it will compare the price of commodities at the farm gate or at the wholesale market with the price at the border, excluding the taxes and duties. The difference in the prices could provide an understanding of the cost of trade movement.
- xii. Assist the ADB Mission Leader during the field visit by providing logistical support, i.e., organize meetings with stakeholders in the border town, translate during the meetings, and organize for transportation.
- xiii. Collect secondary data on trade available from the border towns. This data could be current and historical information relating to the quantum of commodities, transit fees, customs duties, other taxes and duties, transport costs, etc.
- xiv. Undertake other tasks as may be requested by the Mission Leader.

7. **Output/Reporting Requirements.** The main outputs will be a brief report summarizing the results of the survey and secondary data. The draft report will be submitted by 4 January 2008 and the final report by 18 January 2008.

## 5. Rapid Assessment of Trade Facilitation: Policy Expert

8. The **purpose** of the consultancy is to assist the Asian Development Bank (ADB) Mission Leader in assessing the policy changes and institutional developments relating to regional cooperation and trade facilitation in Mongolia. The Policy Expert will provide inputs for identifying policy, institutional, and regulatory changes required for increasing the efficiency of trade.

9. The assignment will primarily involve carrying out interviews with Government officials, ADB staff, World Bank and other donors' officials, and businessmen and traders based in Ulaanbaatar. It will require gathering secondary data from Government sources as well as shipping companies, truck operators, and freight forwarders. The assignment will be based in Ulaanbaatar only. The intermittent assignment will commence on or about 27 November 2007.

10. The tasks of the Policy Expert will be the following:

- i. Review relevant background documents relating to regional cooperation initiatives including those relating to Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation (CAREC), as well as those relating to trade with the People's Republic of China (PRC).
- ii. Assist the ADB Mission Leader in finalizing the perceptions surveys as well as evaluation parameters of regional cooperation.
- iii. Assist the ADB Mission Leader in finalizing data requirements and interview formats including translation to local language.
- iv. Gather study reports, Government data and donor reports on regional cooperation and trade facilitation in Mongolia, and prepare a database of the main findings of these reports.
- v. Analyze the secondary data and reports with a view to understanding the changes in the national policy and international agreements over time.
- vi. Obtain data relating to institutional developments taking place in terms of changes in legislations, distribution of authority and responsibility, and institutional capacity.
- vii. Compare the cost of moving goods via the ports of PRC (e.g. Tianjin) with the cost of moving goods the Trans-Siberian Railway/Highway. This cost could also be compared with the cost of moving goods via the new Euro-Asia Railway/Highway. This comparison study could use one point in Europe and another point in North America to assess the relative costs of using different routes.
- viii. Assess the effectiveness of international donor interventions in terms of assistance for policy development and for regional projects.
- ix. Identify areas of improvement for ADB assistance.
- x. Prepare a questionnaire for obtaining the views of the Government officials, businessmen, traders, shipping companies, truck operators, and freight forwarders about the issues and bottlenecks faced in international trade and carriage of goods.
- xi. Carry out interviews with these stakeholders and prepare an analysis of their perceptions.
- xii. Assist the ADB Mission Leader during the meetings with Government officials and select people from the private sector. During the Mission Leader's visit, the Policy Expert will provide logistical support, i.e., organize meetings, translate during meetings or organize for translation, and organize for transportation.
- xiii. Collect secondary data on (a) transport costs, customs duty, unofficial payments, and storage costs per ton equivalent unit (TEU) of various commodities; (b) freight rates per TEU of various commodities; (c) share of each commodity in the

- volume of trade between Mongolia and the PRC; and (d) other such data that would enable an analysis of the trade costs and efficiency of trade.
- xiv. Undertake other tasks as maybe requested by the Mission Leader.

11. **Output/Reporting Requirements:** The main outputs will be a brief report summarizing the findings of the policy level assessment and the analysis of the trade costs and efficiency of trade. The draft report will be submitted by 4 January 2008 and the final report by 18 January 2008.

## **6. Water Supply and Sanitation Specialist**

12. A national consultant with previous exposure to ADB work and water supply and sanitation (WSS) and urban sector issues in Mongolia will be recruited to:

- i. Assist the RSA Team Leader and the International Consultant in carrying out the Rapid Sector Assessment (RSA).
- ii. Assist in analyzing the recent developments in the WSS and urban sectors over the period 2002-2006. This will include the collection and collation of statistics regarding main sector performance indicators, as well as collection of reports and other information regarding the development challenges, government responses to these challenges, and the policy agenda in the sectors.
- iii. Assist in assessing the positioning of ADB's WSS and urban strategies in Mongolia. This will mainly consist of collection and collation of data and information on donor agencies' policies and programs.
- iv. Assist in evaluating ADB's WSS and urban sector assistance program in Mongolia.
- v. Assist in identifying factors affecting the implementation ADB projects/programs, particularly factors affecting EA capacity and performance in urban areas and related sectors at the central, local Government and project implementing unit levels.
- vi. Participate in consultation mission to Mongolia to assess ADB's WSS and urban strategies and program. During this mission, assist in preparing and organizing key-informant interviews, conducting stakeholder surveys with selected beneficiaries of ADB's assistance, and preparing and organizing focus group interviews with EAs and other government and non-government entities.
- vii. Taking into account current and future strategies of main donor agencies (e.g., World Bank, Millennium Challenge Corporation, UNDP, EBRD, USAID, JICA, and GtZ) in WSS and urban sectors, suggest ways that ADB's new strategy could best position itself in the sectors.
- viii. Undertake other assignments related to the RSA, as requested.

## **7. Urban Environment Specialist**

13. A national consultant with previous exposure to ADB work and urban environment issues in Mongolia will be recruited to:

- i. Assist the RSA Team Leader and the International Consultant in carrying out the Rapid Sector Assessment (RSA).
- ii. Assist in analyzing the recent developments in the urban environment sector over the period 2002-2006. This will include the collection and collation of statistics regarding main sector performance indicators, as well as collection of

- reports and other information regarding the development challenges, government responses to these challenges, and the policy agenda in the sector.
- iii. Assist in assessing the positioning of ADB's urban environment sector strategy in Mongolia. This will mainly consist of collection and collation of data and information on donor agencies' policies and programs.
  - iv. Assist in identifying factors affecting the implementation ADB projects/programs, particularly factors affecting EA capacity and performance in urban areas and related sectors at the central, local Government and project implementing unit levels.
  - v. Participate in consultation mission to Mongolia to assess ADB's urban development strategy and program. During this mission, assist in preparing and organizing key-informant interviews, conducting stakeholder surveys with selected beneficiaries of ADB's assistance, and preparing and organizing focus group interviews with government and non-government entities, both in Ulaanbaatar and during the field trip to two provincial towns outside of the capital.
  - vi. Taking into account current and future strategies of main donor agencies (e.g., World Bank, Millennium Challenge Corporation, UNDP, EBRD, USAID, JICA, and GtZ) in urban environment, suggest ways that ADB's new strategy could best position itself in the sector.
  - vii. Prepare a 4-5 page write-up on the overall environment (not just urban environment) plans, policies and strategies of Mongolia for inclusion as a thematic section of the Mongolia CAPE.
  - viii. Undertake other assignments related to the RSA, as requested.