

TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR ADB STAFF AND CONSULTANTS

A. Objectives of the Operations Evaluation Mission

1. An Asian Development Bank (ADB) Operations Evaluation Mission (OEM) will carry out a postevaluation of the ADB-financed Road Development Project.¹ The OEM will collect and analyze information needed for the assessment of the Project in terms of the (i) relevance, (ii) efficacy and efficiency in achieving project outputs and purposes, (iii) sustainability of the outcomes, and (iv) institutional and capacity building impacts of the Project. Special attention will be given to identifying key issues, lessons, and follow-up actions for future ADB operations.

B. Terms of Reference for ADB Staff

2. The Evaluation Specialist/Mission Leader will be responsible for the overall planning and management of the OEM and report preparation. He will lead the evaluation and perform the following key tasks:

- (i) Supervise the planning and implementation of the project performance evaluation report (PPER);
- (ii) Coordinate the activities and progress of consultants;
- (iii) Integrate the outputs of the team members;
- (iv) Participate in interviews and focus group discussions with relevant stakeholders, together with team members;
- (v) Prepare the strategy assessment comprising the evaluation of the country strategy and program, sector positioning, harmonization with other development partners and ADB performance; and
- (vi) Coordinate and prepare the PPER report; rapid sector assessment report; and serve as a principal author, taking into account contributions from team members, and prepare final reports for knowledge dissemination.

3. The Evaluation Officer will carry out the following tasks:

- (i) Assist in collection of all data connected with the Project, as well as the transport sector of Mongolia.
- (ii) Provide a link between the domestic consultants and international consultants, ensuring that all the outputs of the domestic consultants (especially economic data) is in accordance with the needs of the international transport economist.
- (iii) Participate in the mission to Mongolia. While on mission, the Evaluation Officer will
 - a. assist in the supervision of the domestic consultants;
 - b. share part of the responsibility of interviewing government officials and resident mission staff. When the Mission Leader is visiting the project sites, the Evaluation Officer will carry out the perception surveys in Ulaanbaatar;
 - c. provide inputs for the aide-memoire to be prepared at the end of the mission.
- (iv) Analyze the perception data collected during the mission.
- (v) Assist the Mission Leader in collating the outputs of the consultants, especially the economic data.
- (vi) Work closely with the international transport economist in obtaining views of ADB staff.
- (vii) Update the matrix on loan covenants, design and monitoring framework, and related project data.
- (viii) Assist in report preparation, finalization, and dissemination.

¹ Loan 1364-MON(SF): *Roads Development Project*, for \$25 million, approved on 22 August 1995.

C. Terms of Reference for Consultants

4. The consultants' terms of reference are detailed below.

Terms of Reference for International Transport Economist

CATEGORY	International	JOB LEVEL		Professional Group	
Position Title	Transport Economist	Inputs Required	Intermittent Assignment	1 person-month	PM
Professional Grouping		Director's Endorsement Director OED2			
<p>Objective/Purpose of the Assignments: The purpose of the consultancy is to assist the Operations Evaluation Mission (OEM) in carrying out a postevaluation of the ADB-financed Roads Development Project (Loan 1364-MON[SF]).</p> <p>Scope of Works: The scope of the consultancy includes (i) developing an economic model to update the economic internal rate of return (EIRR) for the Project; (ii) preparing a write-up on assigned sections of the draft project performance evaluation report (PPER) with focus on the economic performance and forecast benefits; and (iii) providing comments on ADB's transport strategy in Mongolia. The intermittent assignment will start on or about 15 August 2007 for a period of 1 person-month in ADB headquarters.</p> <p>Detailed Tasks: The tasks of the Transport Economist will be the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) These tasks need to be read in conjunction with the approach paper. (ii) Review relevant background documents (report and recommendations of the President, project completion report). (iii) Prepare data requirements and instructions for data collection to be carried out by the OEM and domestic consultants. (iv) Use data provided by the domestic consultants to prepare an economic model for updating the project EIRR. Prior to this, the Transport Economist will be expected to ensure that the data requirements are conveyed to the domestic consultants in advance of the transport surveys and primary data collection (this latter activity could be undertaken prior to start of contract to prevent delays). (v) Prepare an appendix for the PPER that will summarize and analyze the outputs of the economic model. (vi) Analyze ADB's transport sector strategy in Mongolia from the point of view of relevance of CSP/COS; provide comments on draft transport sector strategy, resources allocation (efficiency), and actual assistance program; analyze the likely sustainability; provide inputs for sector rating; and analyze lessons from past experience and future challenges and opportunities. (vii) To analyze the above themes, the Transport Economist will carry out discussions with ADB staff in ADB headquarters. (viii) The Transport Economist will prepare a questionnaire to ensure that all inputs for the PPER and the strategy assessment are collected. (ix) These tasks will be handled from ADB headquarters itself and the Transport Economist will not need to carry out any mission to Mongolia. (x) Undertake other tasks as maybe requested by the Mission Leader. <p>Output/Reporting Requirements: The Transport Economist will report to ADB Mission Leader.</p> <p>The economic analysis for the PPER will be an appendix of not more than 8 pages, excluding supporting appendixes. Besides the questionnaire for the strategy assessment, the Transport Economist will provide key inputs in the form of draft sections of the report on rapid sector assessment for the transport sector in Mongolia.</p> <p>Owing to the intermittent nature of the outputs, the Transport Economist could be requested to respond to emails before the start of the contract.</p>					
PLACES OF ASSIGNMENT			ESTIMATED WORKING DAYS		
Manila			1 person-month		

Terms of Reference for Domestic Road Engineer

CATEGORY	Domestic	JOB LEVEL		Professional Group	
Position Title	Road Engineer	Inputs Required	Intermittent Assignment	0.5 person-month	PM
Professional Grouping		Director's Endorsement Director OED2			
<p>Objective/Purpose of the Assignments: The purpose of the consultancy is to assist the Operations Evaluation Mission (OEM) in carrying out a postevaluation of the ADB-financed Roads Development Project (Loan 1364-MON[SF]). The evaluation will mainly cover the road sections on the Ulaanbaatar-Altanbulag road and the Darhan-Erdenet road.</p> <p>Scope of Works: The scope of the consultancy includes (i) providing technical inputs to the OEM during its field visit to Mongolia, and (ii) preparing a write-up on assigned sections of the draft project performance evaluation report with focus on the technical or engineering-related aspects of project performance. The intermittent assignment will start on or about 11 June 2007 for a period of 0.5 person-month.</p> <p>Detailed Tasks: The tasks of the Road Engineer will be the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) Review relevant background documents (report and recommendations of the President, project completion report). (ii) Participate in visiting road sections and bridges that were constructed and rehabilitated under the Project to assess whether they meet ADB specifications, to verify their conditions, and level of maintenance. The Road Engineer will validate actual project achievements and make recommendations on road maintenance required. (iii) Participate in consultations with project affectees and beneficiaries in the project road influence areas—village residents, road users and transport operators, to obtain feedback on road performance (e.g., travel time, vehicle cost savings). (iv) Assist Mission Leader in interpreting the results of the road traffic survey. (v) Assess road safety measures implemented in the project roads. The Road Engineer will accompany the Mission Leader to inspect other ADB financed roads in the country. (vi) Carry out a road roughness measurement to obtain a broad idea of the international roughness index for various sample road sections. (vii) Assist the Mission Leader in assessing road maintenance issues including the allocation of funds to operation and maintenance and implementation of appropriate vehicle load limits. Assist Team Leader in assessing whether local capacities are sufficient to undertake regular monitoring and maintenance of the roads and bridges financed by the Project. (viii) Assist the Mission Leader in identifying key issues, lessons learned, and follow-up actions for future ADB road operations. Review ongoing projects and see if lessons learned were incorporated. (ix) Under the direction of the Mission Leader, prepare a write-up on the technical findings, including among others, achievement of project purpose (operational performance, performance of the operating entity, and sustainability). (x) Undertake other tasks as maybe requested by the Mission Leader. <p>Output/Reporting Requirements: The consultant will report to ADB Mission Leader.</p> <p>The main outputs will be a report (not more than 10 pages main report excluding supporting appendixes) on the technical aspects of the Project.</p>					
PLACES OF ASSIGNMENT			ESTIMATED WORKING DAYS		
Ulaanbaatar, various project sites in Mongolia			0.5 person-month		

Terms of Reference for Domestic Transport Expert

CATEGORY	Domestic	JOB LEVEL	NA	Professional Group	NA
Position Title	Transport Expert	Inputs Required	Intermittent Assignment	1 person-month	PM
Professional Grouping	NA	Director's Endorsement Director OED2			
<p>Objective/Purpose of the Assignments: The purpose of the consultancy is the completion of surveys and other activities to obtain road traffic and other data for use by the Operations Evaluation Mission in evaluating the Roads Development Project (ADB Loan 1364-MON[SF]). The evaluation will mainly cover the road sections on the Ulaanbaatar-Altanbulag road and the Darhan-Erdenet road.</p> <p>Scope of Works: The consultant assignment will primarily comprise of a traffic and commodity survey. The surveys will include traffic counts (e.g., for 7 days over 24 hours) as well as origin-destination and commodity surveys. Field observations on vehicle and cargo traffic will involve project road sections on the Ulaanbaatar-Altanbulag road and Darhan-Erdenet road.</p> <p>The intermittent assignment will commence on or about the 11 June 2007 for 1 person-month.</p> <p>Detailed Tasks: The tasks of the Domestic Transport Expert will be the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) Review relevant background documents (report and recommendations of the President, project completion report). (ii) Assist Mission Leader in finalizing survey methods including survey locations along the project roads, control areas, etc., and sample size. (iii) Assist Mission Leader in finalizing survey data requirements and structured interview formats including translation to local language. (iv) Select, recruit, and prepare a team of enumerators for carrying out the traffic count, the origin-destination, and the commodity surveys. He/she will work closely with the Social Sector Expert. The survey expenses will be paid in lump sum separately. The Transport Expert will be responsible for providing an estimate of the survey costs in advance of his/her appointment. The transport surveys will be the responsibility of the Transport Expert. The International Transport Economist will oversee this activity. (v) The Transport Expert will interview select local transport operators, truck owners, bus passengers on traffic-related information (before and after the project) such as (i) changes in bus fares, freight rates, travel times, range of vehicle types providing service, number of service vehicles and frequency of services, vehicle utilization rates, and (ii) transport issues related to road condition and road safety. (vi) Collect data on road safety in terms of frequency, intensity and volume of road accidents; on environment and green house gas emissions; and compare the environmental impact assessment conducted at appraisal with the actual situation now. (vii) Tabulate traffic data and provide inputs for developing an economic model. This model will be developed by the International Transport Economist based in Manila. (viii) Prepare a brief report on the traffic/commodity survey and the field interviews. (ix) Assist the Mission Leader in interpreting the results of traffic/commodity survey. (x) Undertake other tasks as may be requested by the Mission Leader. 					

Output/Reporting Requirements:

The main outputs will be (i) tabulated data on the transport surveys, (ii) analysis of the inputs to the economic model, and (iii) a brief report summarizing the results of the transport surveys.

PLACES OF ASSIGNMENT	ESTIMATED WORKING DAYS
Ulaanbaatar, various project sites	1 person-month

Term of Reference of Domestic Social Sector Expert

CATEGORY	Domestic	JOB LEVEL	NA	Professional Group	NA
Position Title	Social Sector Expert	Inputs Required	Intermittent Assignment	1 person-month	PM
Professional Grouping	NA	Director's Endorsement Director OED2			
<p>Objective/Purpose of the Assignments: The purpose of the consultancy is to collect data on socioeconomic, environmental, and road safety conditions in the project road influence areas (RIAs). This will enable an Operations Evaluation Mission to determine if the project impacts from the Roads Development Project (ADB Loan 1364-MON[SF]) are reaching the intended the beneficiaries with the desired impact and what are the socioeconomic changes directly or indirectly attributable to the Project. The evaluation will mainly cover the road sections on the Ulaanbaatar-Altanbulag road and the Darhan-Erdenet road.</p> <p>Scope of Works: The assignment will primarily involve the planning, organizing and conduct of field surveys in the RIAs (i.e., project road sections and select roads subjected to periodic maintenance) to identify changes in socioeconomic, environmental, and road safety conditions, if any, due to ADB road improvements. Survey data to be collected will attempt to assess progress in achieving the Millennium Development Goals in the project RIAs. The intermittent assignment will commence on or about 11 June 2007 for 1 person-month.</p> <p>Detailed Tasks: The tasks of the Social Sector Expert will be the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) Review relevant background documents (report and recommendations of the President, project completion report). (ii) Assist Mission Leader in finalizing survey methods including survey locations along the project roads and control areas (if possible), and the sample size. (iii) Assist Mission Leader in finalizing survey data requirements and structured interview formats including translation to local language. (iv) Organize a team of enumerators and supervise the team to conduct field interviews during the socioeconomic survey. He/she will work closely with the Transport Expert. The survey expenses will be paid in lump sum separately. The Social Sector Expert will be responsible for providing an estimate of the survey costs in advance of his/her appointment. The socioeconomic survey will be the responsibility of the Social Sector Expert. (v) The survey will comprise a combination of key informant interviews and focus group discussions. The interviews will involve key village informants, shop keepers, business/bus/transport operators and farmers and other households. The focus group discussion will cover road users and people living and working near the road. Survey data to be collected will attempt to assess progress in achieving the Millennium Development Goals. It will include, among others, (a) per capita income, changes in livelihood patterns, prices of indicator consumer commodities and agricultural inputs and outputs; (b) ease of obtaining freight and passenger transport; (c) presence of access of and or access to health, education, advisory, credit and other services; (d) use of transport by households; (e) changes in agricultural and business activities; and (f) impacts on environment and road safety. (vi) Information of resettlement related issues will be updated in terms of current economic situation of the project affectees. (vii) The Social Sector Expert will identify complementary investments necessary to stimulate and synergize demand for road use. (viii) Tabulate all data and prepare a brief report on the results of the field interviews. Assist the ADB Mission Leader in interpreting the results of the socioeconomic survey. (ix) Assist the ADB Mission and the international consultant during the field visit by providing logistical support, i.e., organize meetings with stakeholders in the project areas, translate during meetings or organize for translation, and organize for transportation. Participate in meetings with stakeholders to collect information on project implementation and outcomes. (x) Collect secondary data on (a) gross domestic product and economic activity, (b) per capita income, 					

<p>and (c) social and poverty indicators in the project area from relevant government sources and documentation.</p> <p>(xi) Assist the international consultants during the field visit by providing logistical support, i.e., organize meetings with stakeholders in the project areas, translate during meetings or organize for translation, and organize for transportation. Participate in meetings with stakeholders to collect information on project implementation and outcomes.</p> <p>(xii) Undertake other tasks as maybe requested by the Mission Leader.</p>	
<p>OUTPUT/REPORTING REQUIREMENTS:</p> <p>The main outputs will be (i) tabulated data on the socioeconomic impacts, environmental impact, and changes in road safety; and (ii) a brief report summarizing the results of the survey.</p>	
PLACES OF ASSIGNMENT	ESTIMATED WORKING DAYS
Ulaanbaatar, various project sites	1 person-month