

TERMS OF REFERENCE (TOR)

A. TOR for Operation Evaluation Mission (OEM)

1. The objective of the OEM is to undertake necessary activities to prepare a Project Performance evaluation Report (PPER). These activities will include (i) informing the Government and other stakeholder groups of the PPER preparation, including visiting some project universities and polytechnic institutions; (ii) holding focus group discussions with them to solicit their views on the performance and impacts of the Project; (iii) collecting some secondary data and information; and (iv) validating the results of survey done prior the OEM.
2. The OEM will need two domestic staff consultants (education specialist) for 2 person-months, mainly for conducting beneficiary surveys and data analysis and impact assessment, with the TOR in para. 6. The lead local consultant will form a local data team, consisting of one data processing assistant (2 person-month), one administrative assistant (2 person-months), and 10 survey teams so that each team will go to the sampled universities prior to OEM. Each of the 10 survey teams will consist of three enumerators.
3. Tentatively, about 10 public (project) universities/polytechnic institutions in different provinces will be selected, and about two private (non-project) universities/polytechnic institutions and two public (non-project) universities/polytechnic institutions in some of these provinces will be selected for comparison. For each of the sampled public and private universities, three groups of respondents will be interviewed, using different sets of questionnaires. These groups include (i) education administrators (e.g., university administrators/dean/college secretary and administrative staff of concerned agencies), (ii) university professor/teachers, and (iii) alumni or students enrolled in the different sampled universities/polytechnic institutions during the project period.

B. TOR for Mission Leader

4. The Mission Leader will have the following TOR:
5. **General Responsibilities.** The Mission Leader will lead the Operations Evaluation Mission and have primary responsibility in producing the draft Project Performance Evaluation Report (PPER) on the Engineering Education Development Project in accordance with the ADB *Guidelines for Preparing Performance Evaluation Reports for Public Sector Operations* (the Guidelines). The Mission Leader will lead the meetings and discussions with the Government and other stakeholders, with active participation from the Principal Evaluation/Education Specialist and Local Consultant.

Specific Terms of Reference

- (i) Review relevant documents and background information related to the Project and obtain necessary information through meetings/discussions/interviews with the Government and other stakeholders.
- (ii) Provide overall guidance to the Operations Evaluation Mission.
- (iii) Hold focus group discussions with the National Development Planning Agency (BAPPENAS), Ministry of National Education (MONE), the Central Project Implementation Unit (CPIU), the Local project implementation units (LPIUs) established at each Project institution in different provinces which assisted the CPIU and other relevant agencies to gain insight on Project's performance identify

relevant issues relating to project design, implementation, outputs, impacts, and performance that need to be resolved as well as follow-up actions that need to be taken.

- (iv) Discuss with other funding agencies about the Project and their assistance plans in the education sector.
- (v) Design/prepare three sets of questionnaires for collecting primary data from three groups of respondents with inputs from the principal education specialist and the local consultant.
- (vi) Provide guidance to the local consultant in transforming the three sets of questionnaires into the structured form, in designing/conducting field surveys, and in processing/analyzing data.
- (vii) Assess the Project's relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability, and other impacts (social, environmental, and institutional) with inputs from the principal evaluation/education specialist and local consultant.
- (viii) Prepare the draft PPER based on the OEM's findings with inputs from the principal evaluation/education specialist and the local consultant.
- (ix) With the assistance of the consultant, and principal education specialist, address comments from peers and other departments on the draft PPER.

C. TOR for Principal Education Specialist/Advisor

6. The Principal Education Specialist/Advisor will have the following TOR:

7. **General Responsibilities.** The Principal education specialist will assist the Mission Leader in producing the draft Project Performance Evaluation Report (PPER) on the Engineering Education Development Project in accordance with the *ADB Guidelines for Preparing Performance Evaluation Reports for Public Sector Operations* (the Guidelines). He/she will participate in meetings and discussions with the Government and other stakeholders.

Specific Terms of Reference

- (i) Review relevant documents and background information related to the Project as well as information on national development plans for the education sector.
- (ii) Assist the Mission Leader in formulating the methodologies and criteria for evaluating the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability, other impacts (socioeconomic, environmental, and institutional) of the Project.
- (iii) Together with the Mission Leader and the Local Consultant, address the major issues of concern to the OEM as discussed in the Evaluation Approach Paper.
- (iv) Together with the mission leader, hold focus group discussions with the National Development Planning Agency (BAPPENAS), Ministry of National Education (MONE), the Central Project Implementation Unit (CPIU), the Local project implementation units (LPIUs) established at each Project institution in different provinces which assisted the CPIU and other relevant agencies to gain insight on Project's performance identify relevant issues relating to project design, implementation, outputs, impacts, and performance that need to be resolved as well as follow-up actions that need to be taken.
- (v) Evaluate the operations of engineering education facilities by visiting selected universities and polytechnic institutions with the Mission Leader and the Local Consultant, and conducting focus group discussions with key informants.

- (vi) Assess the physical quality of the civil works and quality of the O&M introduced by the Project.
- (vii) Assess the extent of success (or shortcomings) of the Project and how to sustain this success (or remedy the failure) in the long term.
- (viii) Identify key issues and lessons learned from the Project and formulate recommendations for future ADB assistance in the sector/country for sustainable engineering education development project.
- (ix) Submit all findings and recommendations related to the terms of reference together with background material, information, and analytical working papers. Assist in writing the aide memoire and the draft PPER.
- (x) Guide and advice mission leader on possible clarifications after OEM, revision of PPER draft during the internal and interdepartmental review process in ADB.

D. TOR for Two Domestic Staff Consultant—Education Evaluation Specialists

(Local Lead Survey Consultant, intermittent for 2 person-months or 60 working days from 1 July 2008 to 15 September 2008)

(Local Survey Member/Coordinator Consultant, intermittent for 1 person-month or 30 working days from 7 July 2008 to 30 August 2008)

8. The consultant to be engaged should have relevant background and work experience in education evaluation, project evaluation and engineering, with the following TOR:

9. **General Responsibilities.** The local consultant will assist the Mission Leader and the Education Specialist/Advisor in producing the draft Project Performance Evaluation Report (PPER) on the Engineering Education Development Project in accordance with the ADB *Guidelines for Preparing Performance Evaluation Reports for Public Sector Operations* (the Guidelines). He/she will participate in meetings and discussions with the Government and other stakeholders. The lead local consultant will form a local data team, consisting of 1 Data Processing Assistant (2 person-month), one Administrative Assistant (2 person-months), and 10 survey teams so that each team will go to the sampled universities prior to OEM.

Specific Terms of Reference

- (i) Review relevant documents and background information related to the Project, and obtain necessary information through the collection of statistics and interviews/discussions.
- (ii) Assist the Operation Evaluation Mission Team in reviewing Government policies and regulations related to the education sector more specifically in the field of engineering and in assessing the Project's contribution to the sector's development;
- (iii) Assist the Mission Leader and Principal Education Specialist in holding focus group discussions with MONE, CPIU, LPIU and other relevant agencies to identify relevant issues relating to project design, implementation, outputs, impacts, and performance that need to be resolved as well as follow-up actions that need to be taken.

- (iv) Transform the three sets of questionnaires into structured form for perusal by the Mission Leader and transform all sets of questionnaires into the structured form in Bahasa for use in the field surveys.
- (v) For lead survey consultant, form a local data team, consisting of one data processing assistant (2 person-months), one administrative assistant (2 person-months) and 10 survey teams (3 enumerators per team) so that each team will be sent to different universities/polytechnic institutions at the same time. Each of the 10 survey teams will consist of at least three enumerators so that each enumerator will be sent to interview different groups of respondents at the same time covering the whole month of July.
 - Train enumerators under his/her survey team to pretest the questionnaires and to conduct field surveys.
 - Lead his/her survey team to pretest the questionnaires, and to conduct the surveys from all groups of respondents in the assigned provinces.
 - Work closely with the enumerators and data processing assistant at the beginning of data processing and analysis to ensure that they have the right understanding of the data coded in the questionnaires before coding them in the computerized form and to (a) ensure that both the collected primary and secondary data are filled out, (b) prepare additional tables to summarize the remaining primary data from the questionnaires, and (c) check the accuracy of the data filled out in all of these tables to ensure that they are consistent throughout.
- (v) Provide guidance to the members of the local data team in their respective areas of assignments.
- (vi) Assist the OEM team in assessing overall implementation arrangements and practices.
- (vii) Identify problems (or success factors) in project design and implementation to ensure the sustainability of engineering education development and management in the future.
- (viii) Assess the institutional, socioeconomic and environmental impacts of the project.
- (ix) Prepare an initial draft of narrative analysis and tables of the results of the survey for submission to the Mission Leader by 24 July 2008.
- (x) Assist in mission logistics—the organization of itineraries and meetings, preparing a list of persons met. Contribute to interviews and meetings; translate proceedings conducted mainly in Bahasa.
- (xi) Submit a draft report on the results of the field assessment.
- (xii) Undertake other project-related assignments as required by the Mission Leader or Principal Education Specialist, including the provision of clarifications after OEM, revision of PPER draft during the internal and interdepartmental review process in ADB.

- (xiii) Revise the draft report in accordance with all comments/suggestions provided by the Mission Leader, and submit to the Mission Leader within one week after getting her comments/suggestions.

E. TOR for Local Data Team

10. All members of the local data team will be selected and recruited by the lead survey consultant, with approval of the Mission Leader prior to the OEM. The team members should have relevant background and work experience in their areas of assignments as follows: (i) data collection and analysis for the Enumerators; (iii) statistical analysis and use of computer programs (especially EXCEL) for the Data Processing Assistant; and (iv) typing and use of basic computer programs (Word and Excel) for the Administrative Assistant. Their TORs are shown below:

1. Three Enumerators per survey team

- (i) Work closely with the 2 local consultants, the lead survey consultant/education specialist and the survey coordinator/education specialist and other enumerators to pretest the questionnaires, and to conduct the field surveys from assigned groups of respondents in the assigned provinces.
- (ii) Assist the lead survey consultant and survey coordinator in other survey-related tasks (preparation of questionnaires, etc.) as requested.

2. One Data Processing Assistant (2 person-months)

- (i) Key in and process all the primary data collected from the field surveys, together with the collected secondary data, in the computerized form.
- (ii) Work closely with the consultant to (a) fill out the collected primary and secondary data in table templates/format, (b) prepare any additional tables to summarize the remaining primary data from the questionnaires, and (c) check the accuracy of the data filled out in all of these tables to ensure that they are consistent throughout.
- (iii) Assist the consultant in analyzing both the primary and secondary data presented in tables as requested.
- (iv) Assist the consultant in other project-related tasks (collection of necessary secondary data, etc.) as requested.

3. One Administrative Assistant (2 person-months)

- (i) Provide all kinds of logistic support (typing, communications, arrangements of meetings/travels/surveys, etc.) to the consultant and data team members.