

TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR ADB STAFF AND CONSULTANTS

A. Objectives of the Operations Evaluation Mission

1. A joint Asian Development Bank (ADB)-European Bank for Reconstruction and Development (EBRD) Operations Evaluation Mission (OEM) will carry out a postevaluation of the cofinanced Almaty-Bishkek Regional Road Rehabilitation Project.¹ The OEM will collect and analyze information needed for the assessment of the Project in terms of the (i) relevance, (ii) efficacy and efficiency in achieving project outputs and purposes, (iii) sustainability of the outcomes, and (iv) institutional and capacity building impacts of the Project. Special attention will be given to identifying key issues, lessons, and follow-up actions for future ADB operations.

B. Terms of Reference for ADB Staff

2. The ADB Evaluation Specialist will be responsible for the overall planning and management of the OEM and report preparation from ADB side. He will lead the evaluation and perform the following key tasks:

- (i) Supervise the planning and implementation of the project performance evaluation report (PPER);
- (ii) Coordinate the activities and progress of consultants;
- (iii) Integrate the outputs of the team members;
- (iv) Jointly lead the OEM in September 2008 and participate in interviews and focus group discussions with relevant stakeholders, together with team members; and
- (v) Coordinate and prepare the PPER and the Chapeau report (summary consolidated report) and serve as a principal author, taking into account contributions from team members, and prepare final reports for knowledge dissemination.

3. The Evaluation Officer will carry out the following tasks:

- (i) Assist in collection of all data connected with the Project.
- (ii) Provide a link between the domestic consultants and the Evaluation Specialist, ensuring that all the outputs of the domestic consultants (especially economic data) is in accordance with the needs of the Evaluation Specialist.
- (iii) Participate in the preliminary OEM to Kazakhstan and Kyrgyz Republic. While on mission, the Evaluation Officer will
 - (c) supervise the domestic consultants and direct them to start the field surveys;
 - (d) provide the foundation for the subsequent joint OEM that will take place in September 2008;
 - (e) interview government officials and resident mission staff; and
 - (f) prepare a brief aide memoire at the end of the mission.
- (iv) Analyze the perception data collected during the mission.
- (v) Assist the Mission Leader in collating the outputs of the consultants, especially the economic data.
- (vi) Prepare the economic analysis using the guidelines provided in ADB's *Handbook for the Economic Analysis of Subregional Projects*. This analysis will take on

¹ ADB. 2000. *Report and Recommendation of the President to the Board of Directors on Proposed Loans and Technical Assistance Grants to the Republic of Kazakhstan and to the Kyrgyz Republic for the Almaty-Bishkek Regional Road Rehabilitation Project*. (Loans 1774-KAZ and 1775-KGZ[SF], for \$52 million, approved on 31 October).

board the benefits derived from vehicle operating cost savings as well as time savings. It will include a distribution analysis of the differential benefits. The main parameters of comparison will be net present value and economic internal rate of return. The economic analysis will be compiled as an appendix to the PPER report.

- (vii) Update the matrix on loan covenants, design and monitoring framework, and related project data.
- (viii) Assist in the preparation, finalization, and dissemination of the PPER, as well as the Chapeau report.

Terms of Reference for Domestic Transport Expert

CATEGORY	Domestic				
Position Title	Transport Expert	Inputs Required	Intermittent Assignment	1.5 person-month	PM
Professional Grouping	NA	Director's Endorsement		Director OED2	
<p>Objective/Purpose of the Assignments: The purpose of the consultancy is the completion of surveys and other activities to obtain road traffic and other data for use by the Operations Evaluation Mission in evaluating the Almaty-Bishkek Regional Road Rehabilitation Project (Kazakhstan and Kyrgyz Republic) (Loans 1774-KAZ and 1775-KGZ[SF]).</p> <p>Scope of Works: The consulting assignment will primarily comprise of a traffic and commodity survey. The surveys will include traffic counts (e.g., for 5 days over 18 hours), travel times, as well as origin-destination and commodity surveys. Field observations on vehicle and cargo traffic will involve project road sections on the Almaty-Bishkek road. The consultant will also evaluate the institutional development within the Governments of Kazakhstan and Kyrgyz Republic in relation to the road development and maintenance.</p> <p>The intermittent assignment will commence on or about the 16 June 2008 for 1.5 person-months.</p> <p>Detailed Tasks: The tasks of the Transport Expert will be the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) Review relevant background documents (report and recommendations of the President, project completion report); (ii) Assist in finalizing survey methods including survey locations along the project roads, control areas, etc., and sample size; (iii) Assist Mission Leader in finalizing survey data requirements and structured interview formats including translation to local language. Prepare questionnaires and other such survey instruments; (iv) Select, recruit, and prepare a team of enumerators for carrying out the three transport surveys—traffic count, origin-destination, and commodity. The survey expenses will be paid in lump sum separately. He/she will work closely with the Social Sector Expert. The Transport Expert will be responsible for providing an estimate of the survey costs in advance of his/her appointment. Carrying out the transport surveys will be the responsibility of the Transport Expert; (v) The traffic survey will be conducted at three locations on the Almaty-Bishkek road for a continuous period of 5 days from 4am to 10pm. The origin-destination survey will be carried out at the same locations and will be based on a set of parameters identified by the Mission Leader. It will include estimation of the time savings after project completion. (vi) The Transport Expert will interview select local transport operators, truck owners, bus passengers on traffic-related information (before and after the project) such as (a) changes in bus fares, freight rates, travel times, range of vehicle types providing service, number of service vehicles and frequency of services, vehicle utilization rates, and (b) transport issues related to road condition and road safety; (vii) Collect data on road safety in terms of frequency, intensity and volume of road accidents; impediments to road safety; (viii) Collect data on barriers to growth in trade using the Almaty-Bishkek road, e.g., speed of 					

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> (ix) (x) (xi) (xii) (xiii) 	<p>customs clearances. This will include assessing the time and cost of border formalities before project construction and after project completion;</p> <p>Tabulate traffic data and provide inputs for developing an economic model. The Transport Expert will enter the traffic data along with the related macroeconomic parameters into a standard vehicle operating costs (VOC) model (preferably use the World Bank's Road Economic Decision [RED] model) and obtain the VOCs for the project. The outputs of this model will be submitted to ADB for further processing of the VOC savings and economic internal rate of return;</p> <p>Prepare a brief report on the traffic/commodity survey and the field interviews;</p> <p>Assist the Mission Leader in interpreting and analyzing the results of traffic/commodity survey;</p> <p>Provide logistic assistance for the Mission Leader to meet government officials, businessmen and other people connected with the development and the use of roads in Astana, Bishkek, and Almaty;</p> <p>Undertake other tasks as may be requested by the Mission Leader.</p>
<p>Output/Reporting Requirements:</p> <p>The main outputs will be (i) tabulated data on the transport surveys, (ii) VOCs using the RED model; (iii) analysis of the outputs of the RED model; and (iv) a brief report summarizing the results of the transport surveys.</p> <p>Draft outputs, including appendixes to be submitted by 31 July 2008. Final outputs by 15 August 2008.</p>	
PLACES OF ASSIGNMENT	ESTIMATED WORKING DAYS
Bishkek, Almaty, Astana, and various project sites	1.5 person-months

Term of Reference of Domestic Social Sector Expert

CATEGORY	Domestic				
Position Title	Social Sector Expert	Inputs Required	Intermittent Assignment	1.5 person-month	PM
Professional Grouping	NA	Director's Endorsement		Director OED2	

Objective/Purpose of the Assignment:

The purpose of the consultancy is collect data on socioeconomic conditions in the project road influence areas (RIAs) for use by the Operations Evaluation Mission in evaluating the Almaty-Bishkek Regional Road Rehabilitation Project (Kazakhstan and Kyrgyz Republic) (Loans 1774-KAZ and 1775-KGZ[SF]). The assignment will assess the impact on the intended beneficiaries and what are the socioeconomic changes directly or indirectly attributable to the Project. The evaluation will mainly cover the road sections on the Almaty-Bishkek regional road.

Scope of Work:

The assignment will primarily involve planning, organizing, and conduct of field surveys in the RIAs to identify changes in socioeconomic and environmental conditions, if any, due to Asian Development Bank (ADB) road improvements. Survey data to be collected will attempt to assess progress in achieving the Millennium Development Goals in the project RIAs. The intermittent assignment will commence on or about 16 June 2007 for 1.5 person-months.

Detailed Tasks:

The tasks of the Social Sector Expert will be the following:

- (i) Review relevant background documents (report and recommendations of the President, project completion report).
- (ii) Assist Mission Leader in finalizing survey methods including questionnaires, survey locations along the project roads and control areas (if possible), and the sample size.
- (iii) Assist Mission Leader in finalizing survey data requirements and structured interview formats including translation to local language.
- (iv) Organize a team of enumerators and supervise the team to conduct field interviews during the socioeconomic survey. He/she will work closely with the Transport Expert. The survey expenses will be paid in lump sum separately. The Social Sector Expert will be responsible for providing an estimate of the survey costs in advance of his/her appointment. The socioeconomic survey will be the responsibility of the Social Sector Expert.
- (v) The survey will comprise a combination of key informant interviews and focus group discussions. The interviews will involve key village informants, shop keepers, business/bus/transport operators, and farmers and other households. The focus group discussion will cover road users and people living and working near the road. Survey data to be collected will attempt to assess progress in achieving the Millennium Development Goals. It will include, among others, (a) per capita income, changes in livelihood patterns, prices of indicator consumer commodities, and agricultural inputs and outputs; (b) ease of obtaining freight and passenger transport; (c) presence of access of and/or access to health, education, advisory, credit, and other services; (d) use of transport by households; (e) changes in agricultural and business activities; and (f) impacts on environment and road safety.
- (vi) The Social Expert will analyze the differential impact of the road in the two countries. This impact will need to be measured in terms of local impact as well as country level impact.

	<p>Use of secondary data could be made to supplement the information collected from the field surveys.</p> <p>(vii) Information of resettlement related issues will be updated in terms of current economic situation of the project affectees.</p> <p>(viii) The Social Sector Expert will identify complementary investments necessary to stimulate and synergize demand for road use.</p> <p>(ix) Tabulate all data and prepare a brief report on the results of the field interviews. Assist ADB Mission Leader in interpreting the results of the socioeconomic survey.</p> <p>(x) Assist ADB Mission Leader and the international consultant during the field visit by providing logistical support, i.e., organize meetings with stakeholders in the project areas; translate during meetings; or organize for translation and transportation. Participate in meetings with stakeholders to collect information on project implementation and outcomes.</p> <p>(xi) Collect secondary data on (a) bilateral trade between Kazakhstan and Kyrgyz Republic using the project road as well as overall trade; (b) movement of people between the two countries; (c) migration patterns; (d) number of tourists and change in the nature of tourism; (e) regional domestic product; (f) per capita income in the RIA; and (g) social and poverty indicators in the project area from relevant government sources and documentation.</p> <p>(xii) Provide case studies from other parts of Kazakhstan or Kyrgyz Republic in relation to the impact of road improvements and in relation to the issues faced by people living in areas with poor access.</p> <p>(xiii) Undertake other tasks as maybe requested by the Mission Leader.</p> <p>Output/Reporting Requirements:</p> <p>The main outputs will be (i) tabulated data on the socioeconomic and environmental impacts, and (ii) a brief report summarizing and analyzing the results of the survey.</p> <p>Draft socioeconomic report containing tabulated data on all the surveys, including appendixes to be submitted by 31 July 2008. Final report by 15 August 2008.</p>				
	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>PLACES OF ASSIGNMENT</th> <th>ESTIMATED WORKING DAYS</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Bishkek, Almaty, Astana, and various project sites</td> <td>1.5 person-months</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	PLACES OF ASSIGNMENT	ESTIMATED WORKING DAYS	Bishkek, Almaty, Astana, and various project sites	1.5 person-months
PLACES OF ASSIGNMENT	ESTIMATED WORKING DAYS				
Bishkek, Almaty, Astana, and various project sites	1.5 person-months				

Terms of Reference for International Roads Engineer (to be funded by EBRD)**Independent Technical Assessment****A. Purpose**

1. In the context of a joint postevaluation by the Asian Development Bank (ADB) and the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development (EBRD) of their common Almaty-Bishkek Road Rehabilitation Project, the background and details of which are described in the attached Outline Paper (Attachment 1), the EBRD Evaluation Department (EvD) seeks to procure the services of a senior road engineer/civil engineer.

B. Objective

2. The objective of the technical consultant services is to allow the ADB/EBRD evaluation team, prior to their joint evaluation mission tentatively scheduled during September 2008, to obtain an independent professional opinion on the physical (i.e., road rehabilitation) work envisaged at appraisal and performed during project implementation.

C. Tasks

3. The Consultant is expected to assess the appropriateness of:
- (i) the technical design of the road/bridge rehabilitation and applied standards;
 - (ii) the structure of implementation arrangements;
 - (iii) the procurement process for (a) the construction company, and (b) for the supervising engineer;
 - (iv) the work carried out by (and performance of) (a) the construction company, and (b) the supervising engineer (i.e., validation of actual project achievements).
4. In view of these tasks the Consultant will
- (i) review relevant background documents (e.g., ADB/EBRD appraisal and self-evaluative completion reports, procurement files) to determine adequacy of the design with respect to traffic use, vehicle type, etc.;
 - (ii) conduct a site visit to the road sections and bridges that were constructed and rehabilitated under the joint ADB/EBRD project to assess, based on a visual inspection,
 - (a) whether they meet the stipulated specifications to verify their conditions and level of maintenance; this includes carrying out a random visual inspection of the pavement surface to assess the quality of the pavement design and construction of the project road (the Consultant will need to give an opinion on any significant signs of distress or premature failure and suggest possible causes and remedies. Particular attention should be paid to any areas where asphalt overlays may have been applied to existing concrete pavements); a key question might be to which standards the road should have been and actually has been built;
 - (b) the quality of the EBRD-funded project road with ADB-funded road to assess whether the level of design and construction were adequate in light of the current and future traffic (note: reportedly EBRD-funded sections were upgraded to 13 tons axle load while ADB-funded road sections were designed observing 10 tons axle load);

- (iii) assess road safety measures (accident prevention/response systems, lighting, etc.) implemented in the project roads and assess road maintenance issues including the allocation of funds to operation and maintenance and implementation of appropriate vehicle load limits;
- (iv) assess the institutional capacity of the responsible road authority to undertake regular monitoring and maintenance of the roads and bridges financed under the Project;
- (v) complementing the document review and site inspections by discussions with stakeholders, notably Government officials, to gain further insight which, together, shall lead to “lessons learned” for future reference; and
- (vi) prepare a report on the technical findings, including operational performance, performance of the operating entity, and operational sustainability.

D. Consultant Qualifications

5. The Consultant should be a senior civil engineer specialized in road construction with at least 10 years experience and with at least several years of international experience. He/she should be fully conversant with road construction and rehabilitation practices, experience in the supervision of works, design of pavements and surface treatments, and supervision of road contracts. The ideal candidate should have worked both in the road sector for both private firms (contractors/consultants) and the public sector (road administration). Fluency in spoken and written English—the report language—is required, and experience in countries of the Former Soviet Union (FSU) would be an asset.

E. Implementation Arrangements

6. **Reporting.** The assignment will involve desk study work and a field visit. The Consultant will work under the supervision of a Senior Evaluation Manager of EBRD’s EvD.

7. **Duration and Timing.** The assignment is expected to start in early June 2008 and be completed within June 2008 to involve up to 20 working days, an indicative only distribution of which is presented below (activity/working days [WDs]):

- (i) EBRD/Home-based file studies (5 WDs);
- (ii) Field visit (8 WDs), including travel time;
- (iii) Report drafting (5 WDs); and
- (iv) Report finalizing (2 WDs).

8. **Payment.** The consultant contract will be based on an all inclusive lump sum (exclusive of value added tax) arrangement, and payment to the Consultant will be made upon receipt of the Consultant’s satisfactory final report.