

TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR CONSULTANTS**Sector Assistance Program Evaluation Urban Sector and Water Supply and Sanitation
Bangladesh**

1. This terms of reference needs to be read in conjunction with the Approach Paper for the evaluation.

A. Methodology of the sector evaluations

2. The Sector Assistance Program Evaluation (SAPE) should primarily evaluate the approach and outcome of the Asian Development Bank (ADB) program in the urban sector and the water supply and sanitation (WSS) sector. A secondary objective of the SAPE is to assess the variety of approaches and aggregate outcomes of the programs of ADB, Department for International Development (DFID), Japan, and World Bank. The SAPE should also assess the positioning of ADB's assistance vis-a-vis that of development partners and Government (collectively did they do the right things?) and the contribution of the various assistance programs to overall development outcomes in the sectors (did they do things right?).

3. Some main elements of the sector analysis should be

- (i) A bottom-up assessment of ADB's and other partners' interventions in the sector
- (ii) A top-down assessment of the role of the sector within the economy, and the role of the assistance of the four donors in achieving or affecting this. This is needed in particular for sectors in which the involvement of the four donors is very substantial—say over half of the total donor involvement. Part of this analysis will have to be closely coordinated with the overview evaluation in order to reduce overlap and create synergy.
- (iii) An assessment of the degree of fragmentation of donor effort in the sector, and the transaction costs associated with this.
- (iv) An assessment or indicators of the relative effectiveness of programs supported by the four donors (individually or collectively) compared to any available indicators of the performance of activities (projects, programs) carried out without the support of these donors. The latter can count as one form of investigation of the counterfactual).

B. Cross-Cutting Themes

4. The following cross-cutting themes should be addressed in all sector evaluations (except where clearly and explicitly not relevant):

- (i) Capacity building
- (ii) Governance (including fiduciary safeguards, anti-corruption)
- (iii) Environment including natural disasters
- (iv) Role of private sector
- (v) Civil society and nongovernment organizations (NGOs), including as partners and as service providers
- (vi) Aid instruments and related issues of harmonization, including program coherence; also addressing relationships of lending, economic sector work, technical assistance, and policy dialogue
- (vii) Results focus in aid programs (attention to results, monitoring and evaluation [M&E], evidence-based policy systems)

- (viii) Gender
- (ix) Transaction costs

5. The cross cutting themes in each sector evaluation will be closely coordinated with the overview evaluation, and will later be major building blocks for the synthesis evaluation.

C. Special focus of the sector evaluations

6. An important implicit hypothesis of the Joint Country Assistance Evaluation (JCAE) is that a major determinant of overall development in a country like Bangladesh is the functioning of donors in the aggregate. Thus, especially in those sectors where the four donors represent a substantial share of the total donor interventions, the evaluation should try and look both at intended outcomes of the programs and projects and whether they were realized, and also unintended consequences of joint or fragmented donor activity; and into possible displacement of government or civil society intervention. This analysis could include

- (i) The objectives of the four donor agencies, as stated in country strategies, program and project documents;
- (ii) The alignment of these objectives with the country priorities, as reflected now in the National Rural Support Programme, and earlier in the key government planning documents;
- (iii) Actual and potential level of harmonization between the four donors in terms of sector priorities, themes, policies, and program planning. Has there been convergence or divergence over time?
- (iv) Differences in approach taken in the four donor-supported projects and programs with that of government projects and programs not funded and administered in part by donors—comparison of problems and opportunities encountered by each.

D. Timing

7. The period of field work, data collection and interviewing is from June to early September. A first draft of the consultant reports should be prepared by end-September 2008.

E. Organization of the main report output

8. There should be a concise main report (expected length of around 30 pages) with appropriate use of annexes, and a summary of not more than four pages. The authors should consider a format along the following lines:

- (i) **Introduction** (purpose of the evaluation, country context, background to the sector, importance of the sector)
- (ii) **Donor objectives and programs** (nature, similarities and differences; short overview of programs of other development partners; level of fragmentation of aid)
- (iii) **Donor allocations and expenditure** (by the four donors and estimate of overall contribution)
- (iv) **Sector developments and problems** (includes discussion of government 'only' operations in the sector, role of aid in general, capacity, governance, environment, role of private sector, role of civil society, monitoring by government, social and gender development, and cost/efficiency)
- (v) **Performance of the ADB program in the sector.** This in terms of relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability and impact.

- (vi) **Performance of the four donor programs in the aggregate** (this in terms of the objectives set, aid instruments and related issues of harmonization, capacity building, governance, environment, role of private sector, civil society and NGOs, results focus, social and gender development, and transaction costs). Appendixes to the main text can deal with the performance of individual donor programs.
- (vii) **Analysis: Sector outlook ‘with’ and ‘without’** (role of government, private sector, and contribution by donor aid; attribution issues; counterfactuals)
- (viii) **Alignment of donor aid with country priorities, policies, and systems**
- (ix) **Conclusions, lessons, and recommendations** (relevance and positioning of donor programs, efficiency, effectiveness, and sustainability of outcomes; special impacts, fragmentation effects, and displacement effects).

F. Confidentiality

9. All evaluation staff and consultants working on the sector evaluations will be bound by the confidentiality requirements of the partners.

G. Disclosure

10. The consultant report will provide input to (i) the subsequent work on the synthesis evaluation, which will be the key output from the Joint Country Assistance Evaluation work, and (ii) Operations Evaluation Department’s subsequent country assistance program evaluation. However, the consultant report should be prepared to a standard (content and form) that would permit us to share with operational parts of the four donors, as well as presentation to the government and subsequent disclosure. Such separate disclosure would depend, however, on agreement in each case of the four partners that the evaluation meets reasonable evaluative and professional standards.

I. International Consultant Urban Sector and Water Supply and Sanitation

11. **Key Qualifications.** The assignment requires a qualified and experienced urban planning and finance expert with a minimum of 20 years of experience in the field. Extensive experience in South Asia is required. Ability to work under pressure and tight deadlines is a must. Experience with WSS systems is also a must.

12. **Inputs.** The total duration of the assignment is 6 weeks or 45 calendar days; 4 weeks of which will be spent in Dhaka, and 2 weeks in the consultant’s home base.

13. **Scope.** A mainly top down assessment of progress in the sectors of urban development and WSS in Bangladesh, and the role of ADB in this, as well as, to a lesser extent, other development partners such as the World Bank, DFID, and the Government of Japan.

14. **Duties and Responsibilities.** Under the formal guidance of the team leader, the consultant will provide technical and intellectual leadership in the evaluation. A main focus will be the assessment of the ADB’s program and approach in terms of its relevance and positioning, its efficiency, effectiveness, sustainability, and impact. The duties will include, though not be limited to, the following:

- (i) Advise on the methodology and work plan for the evaluation, and help guide the domestic consultants;

- (ii) Review of approaches (and changes in approaches) to sector work of ADB, and to a lesser extent other main development partners such as DFID, Japan Bank for International Cooperation and Japan International Cooperation Agency, and World Bank;
- (iii) Read project and technical assistance (TA) documents, and visit a few loan, grant, and TA projects in the field, focusing on outputs and outcomes;
- (iv) Study other relevant documentation and literature on the subject;
- (v) Assess progress with Millennium Development Goals relevant to the sectors at hand, and with sector objectives as expressed in the National Poverty Reduction Strategy and the 2005 joint outcome matrix of the development partners ADB, DFID, Japan, and World Bank. Attempt to relate the progress to interventions by donors and Government and NGO sector;
- (vi) Review selected issues such as financing arrangements for the sector, urban and WSS portfolio management by ADB and the three other development partners, capacity development pursued by ADB and others, harmonization and alignment issues at the sector level, and commonalities and discrepancies in the various approaches pursued. This is to be based on extensive reading and interviewing of relevant observers.
- (vii) Prepare a report on this, in a format yet to be decided in coordination with the evaluation team leader. Integrate comments from the team leader and present a final version.

15. **Reporting relationship.** The consultant will report to the mission leader for the special evaluation study.

16. **Outputs.** The consultant is expected to deliver a final report in hard and soft copy.

17. **Timing and Duration of the Assignment.** The consultant is expected to start on 1 July 2008, and complete the assignment by latest 30 September 2008. The mission needs to be conducted together with the evaluation team leader, in August.

II. Domestic Consultant Urban Development¹

18. **Key Qualifications.** The assignment requires a qualified and experienced urban planning expert with a minimum of 15 years of experience in the field, and with some knowledge of ADB procedures and practices. Good knowledge of waste management, flood protection management, and urban drainage will be an advantage.

19. **Duty Station.** Dhaka.

20. **Inputs.** The total duration of the assignment is 2 months (60 calendar days); 4 weeks of which will be spent in Dhaka, and 4 weeks outside.

21. **Scope.** The consultant will conduct a mainly bottom up evaluation of ongoing and completed ADB projects in Dhaka and outside; with special attention for issues related to financing of urban investment, governance, and safeguards.

¹ To be funded by OED's regional TA for special studies in 2005.

22. **Duties and Responsibilities.** The consultant will work under the formal guidance of the team leader. The duties will include, though not be limited to, the following:

- (i) Familiarization with the evaluation.
- (ii) Preparation for a field trip of ADB projects and the projects of other agencies that are relevant to the subject.
- (iii) Study the relevant project reports, TA consultant outputs, ADB studies, publications and outputs of special initiatives, in areas of current concern
- (iv) Assessment of the importance of ADB's program in the urban sector of Bangladesh in light of the issues and other contributions to urban development.
- (v) A comparison with government financed and run projects in the sector, as a way of obtaining counterfactual information.
- (vi) Assessment of issues in the sector such as capacity building, governance, environment, role of private sector, civil society and NGOs, aid instruments and related including program coherence, results focus in aid programs (attention to results, M&E, evidence-based policy systems), gender, and transaction costs. A special subject will be an assessment of the recent trend in many projects to introduce performance based allocation and cost recovery mechanisms.
- (vii) Obtaining views from relevant staff on ADB's program and that of World Bank, DFID, and Japan Bank for International Cooperation and Japan International Cooperation Agency. Assess issues of harmonization and alignment, overlap and gaps
- (viii) Obtaining views from relevant authorities on the program of the four development partners, and on urban sector needs and difficulties. Contribute to a possible questionnaire survey for executing agencies and development partners.
- (ix) Assessment of the performance of ADB and the Government, in relation to the ADB funded program, and in relation to the performance of some other major donors.
- (x) Assessment of (likely) relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, sustainability, and impact of ADB interventions in the sector that were ongoing in the period 2000–2008, and to a lesser extent of overall donor aid in the sector.
- (xi) Presentation of the preliminary findings to main agencies involved at the end of the mission.
- (xii) Preparation of a final report including a set of issues, lessons, and recommendations for the SAPE.
- (xiii) Incorporation of comments on the final report from the mission leader and resubmission to ADB.

23. **Reporting relationship.** The consultant will report to the mission leader for the SAPE.

24. **Outputs.** The consultant is to deliver a final report in hard and soft copy.

25. **Timing and Duration of the Assignment.** The consultant is expected to start on 1 July 2008, and complete the assignment by latest 30 September 2008.

III. Domestic Consultant Water Supply and Sanitation

26. **Key Qualifications.** The assignment requires a qualified and experienced WSS expert with a minimum of 15 years of experience in the field, and with some knowledge of ADB procedures and practices. Good knowledge of arsenic contamination issues is an advantage.

27. **Duty Station.** Dhaka.
28. **Inputs.** The total duration of the assignment is 2 months (60 calendar days); 4 weeks of which will be spent in Dhaka, and 4 weeks outside.
29. **Scope.** The consultant will conduct a mainly bottom up evaluation of ongoing and completed ADB projects (and TA) in Dhaka and outside; with special attention for issues related to financing of urban investment, governance, and safeguards. Some other projects of main development partners will also be reviewed.
30. **Duties and Responsibilities.** The consultant will work under the formal guidance of the team leader. The duties will include, though not be limited to, the following:
- (i) Familiarization with the evaluation.
 - (ii) Preparation for a field trip of ADB projects and the projects of other agencies that are relevant to the subject.
 - (iii) Assessment of the importance of ADB's program in the WSS sector, both urban and rural, in light of overall WSS situation in the country.
 - (iv) Assessment of (likely) relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, sustainability, and impact of ADB interventions in the sector that were ongoing in the period 2000–2008, and to a lesser extent of overall donor aid in the sector.
 - (v) Assessment of issues in the sector such as capacity building, governance, environment, role of private sector, civil society and NGOs, aid instruments and related including program coherence, results focus in aid programs (attention to results, M&E, evidence-based policy systems), gender, and transaction costs. A special subject will be an assessment of the recent trend in many projects to introduce performance-based allocation and cost recovery mechanisms.
 - (vi) Obtaining views from relevant staff on ADB's program and that of World Bank, DFID and JBIC/JICA. Assess issues of harmonization and alignment, overlap and gaps.
 - (vii) Obtaining views from relevant authorities and stakeholders on the program of the four development partners, and on WSS sector needs and difficulties. Contribute to a possible questionnaire survey for executing agencies and development partners.
 - (viii) Assessment of the performance of ADB and the Government in relation to the ADB funded program, and in relation to the performance of some other major donors
 - (ix) Presentation of the preliminary findings to main agencies involved at the end of the mission.
 - (x) Preparation of a final report including a set of issues, lessons, and recommendations for the SAPE.
 - (xi) Incorporation of comments on the final report from the mission leader and resubmission to ADB.
31. **Reporting relationship.** The consultant will report to the mission leader for the SAPE.
32. **Outputs.** The consultant is to deliver a final report in hard and soft copy.
33. **Timing and Duration of the Assignment.** The consultant is expected to start on 1 July 2008, and complete the assignment by latest 30 September 2008.

IV. Research Analyst (for background studies)

34. **Qualifications Required.** The research analyst should have a master's degree, experience with quantitative analysis of project documentation, and preferably a good understanding of ADB systems and procedures.
35. **Duty Station.** Manila, ADB headquarters.
36. **Inputs.** The total duration of the assignment is 4 months (120 days).
37. **Scope and Reporting Relationship.** The main task will be to collect and analyze information from internal ADB reports regarding the urban sector and WSS and flood protection sector in Bangladesh. This will be done under the guidance of the special evaluation study team leader.
38. **Outputs.** The consultants will submit reports for each of the studies undertaken.