

EVALUATION DESIGN MATRIX FOR THE TOP-DOWN AND BOTTOM-UP ASSESSMENT

Evaluation Criteria	Key Issues/Guide Questions	Major Indicators and Information Requirement	Data Sources, Collection Methods, and Analysis
<b>Top-Down Performance Assessment</b>			
<p><b>1. Overall Country Positioning</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Relevance.</b> Considering the sector situation, was the Asian Development Bank’s (ADB) sector assistance strategic in terms of its potential for poverty reduction of the poorest?</li> <li>• <b>Responsiveness to client.</b> Given ADB as a lead development partner in the sector, has ADB responded adequately and in a timely way to changing the country’s needs?</li> <li>• <b>Operational flexibility.</b> Were ADB policies, systems, lending instruments, and assistance modalities appropriate for country evolving conditions?</li> <li>• <b>Portfolio Management.</b> The extent to which ADB implemented the agreed sector program assistance?</li> <li>• <b>Capacity and competencies.</b> Does ADB have adequate capacity in the sector at the regional department (including resident mission) to provide support as a key development partner in the sector?</li> <li>• <b>Partnership.</b> The extent to which ADB was able to forge productive</li> </ul>	<p><u>Note: The following information is needed for multiple questions listed on the left column</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Priority in Country Partnership Strategies (CPSs) and needs of the country given the sector status and performance of various subsectors.</li> <li>• Appropriateness of policies, procedures, and funding approaches pursued for continued engagement in the sector.</li> <li>• ADB’s and the government-agreed development assistance (i.e., planned and actual assistance provided).</li> <li>• Changes made over time to make the Agriculture and Natural Resources (ANR) sector assistance program more relevant.</li> <li>• Adaptive and mitigating strategies developed and adopted to facilitate operations in</li> </ul>	<p><b><u>Possible data/information sources:</u></b></p> <p><b>Government offices</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• National Planning Commission</li> <li>• Ministries of Finance</li> <li>• Ministry of Agriculture and Cooperative (MOAC)</li> <li>• Ministry of Local Government</li> <li>• Ministry of Water Resources</li> <li>• Ministry of Physical Planning and Works</li> <li>• Ministry of Women and Welfare</li> <li>• National Agricultural Research Council</li> <li>• Documents of executing and implementation agencies of various ministries and line agencies listed above.</li> </ul>

Evaluation Criteria	Key Issues/Guide Questions	Major Indicators and Information Requirement	Data Sources, Collection Methods, and Analysis
	<p>relationship with other development partners in the sector?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Externalities/ Exogenous factors.</b> How adequately did ADB assistance incorporate external factors (i.e., India’s agricultural policy, conflict situation) that have direct relevance in the performance of the sector?</li> </ul>	<p>conflict regions.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Evidence of adjustments following various sector reviews (i.e., mid-term review, agricultural prospective plan etc.).</li> <li>• National and ADB’s ANR sector plans, policies and strategies for different production zones/regions.</li> <li>• Development assistance provided by ADB and other development partners to the ANR sector.</li> <li>• Staff capacity in terms of number and quality for leadership role and adequate supervision</li> <li>• ADB’s role as a leader among the development partners in the sector (support to governments, other development partners etc)</li> <li>• Policies, strategies and plan for mitigating any desirable effect on the neighboring countries.</li> </ul>	<p><b>ADB and Project related documents</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Nepal Country Partnership Strategies, ANR sector road maps,</li> <li>• Loans, technical assistance (TA), and grants projects in the sector.</li> <li>• Regional technical assistance (RETA) projects supporting ANR research and rural road projects implemented in Nepal.</li> </ul> <p><b>Others</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Key development partners and donors based in the country (i.e., World Bank, Department for International Development, International Fund for Agricultural Development, United States Agency for International Development, World Food Program and</li> </ul>
<p><b>2. Contribution to Development Results</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Sector performance.</b> How has the ANR sector performed against the key development indicators (i.e., performance of the crops and livestock</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Agricultural productivity growth of various subsectors and overall contribution to the growth of Gross Domestic Product (GDP).</li> </ul>	

Evaluation Criteria	Key Issues/Guide Questions	Major Indicators and Information Requirement	Data Sources, Collection Methods, and Analysis
	<p>subsectors, food security situation, and progress towards the first millennium development goal [MDG] target)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>ADB's contribution.</b> What were major contributions of ADB to the changes in the sector (i.e., taking into consideration the financial assistance [loan/TAs/grants], policy dialogue, knowledge products)?</li> <li>• <b>Synergy.</b> Were there synergies in the assistance provided to other subsectors, directly to related sector (i.e., rural road) and through different funding modalities (i.e., RETA projects to support ANR research)?</li> <li>• <b>Executing Agencies (EAs) from Several Ministries.</b> How ADB's effectiveness in sector assistance is affected by having EAs from several ministries (i.e., Finance, Agriculture and Cooperatives, Water Resources, Local Government, Physical Planning and Works, and Women and Welfare)?</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Performance as per the MDG targets and indicators related to eradication of hunger (Goal number one).</li> <li>• Production trends for major food crops, cash and high value crops; livestock and forestry products.</li> <li>• The extent of commercialization and diversifications in various agricultural subsectors</li> <li>• Performance in the sector/ subsector linked to ADB's assistance.</li> <li>• Poverty reduction (employment, incomes, subsistence and commercialization production systems).</li> <li>• Specific plans, policies and strategies that may have direct links to assistance provided by ADB.</li> <li>• Regions and districts where two selected rural road projects were implemented and links with ANR projects.</li> </ul>	<p>Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, and International Agricultural Research Centers).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Sector specific national and international studies, economic development journals, etc.</li> <li>• The national development plans and other authoritative documents in the sector</li> </ul> <p>• <b><u>Possible collection methods and analysis:</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Document reviews</li> <li>• Trend analysis</li> <li>• Key informant interviews</li> <li>• Focus group discussion</li> <li>• Trend analysis</li> <li>• Sample surveys/questionnaires</li> <li>• Field visits/ observations</li> </ul>

Evaluation Criteria	Key Issues/Guide Questions	Major Indicators and Information Requirement	Data Sources, Collection Methods, and Analysis
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Types of research/issues supported by RETA projects and links to loan projects.</li> <li>• Synergy across ADB's support to different sectors with other development partners and within the sector.</li> <li>• Decision making processes for engagement with ministries other than MOAC.</li> </ul>	
<b>3. ADB's Performance</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Critical Constraints.</b> Were ADB's support focused on critical constraints to sector development?</li> <li>• <b>Fostering client ownership.</b> Adequacy of consultations with various stakeholders (i.e., government and their line agencies, NGOs, other development partners/donors) in fostering ownership of the sector assistance?</li> <li>• <b>Alignment.</b> The extent to which ADB aligned the sector assistance to the plans and priorities of the country's sector policies?</li> <li>• <b>Harmonization.</b> To what extent was ADB's support coordinated with the activities of other development partners?</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Consistency with stakeholders' objectives, government structure and institutions, and other development partners.</li> <li>• Analysis of development options for program purpose and output.</li> <li>• Policy dialogue on alternative directions and policy reform.</li> <li>• National development priorities and strategies in succeeding Five-Year Development plans</li> <li>• Priority in CPSs and needs of the country given the sector status and performance.</li> <li>• Priority in the context of ADB's institutional objectives.</li> </ul>	

Evaluation Criteria	Key Issues/Guide Questions	Major Indicators and Information Requirement	Data Sources, Collection Methods, and Analysis
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Capacity Development.</b> The extent to which ADB contributed in capacity development of the sector in general and of the executing and implementation agencies?</li> <li>• <b>ADB's Corporate Strategy.</b> The extent to which the ADB's corporate strategy of social inclusiveness was fostered in the sector assistance provided.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Efforts at making aid more effective such as Partnership for Development.</li> <li>• Complementarities with policy changes and institutional developments with other sectors.</li> <li>• Coherence and consistency with strategy and program for the country.</li> <li>• Capacity at ADB in HQ and the Nepal Resident Mission (NRM) planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation.</li> <li>• Coordination with of ADB's assistance with other development partners and donors</li> <li>• Fostering coordination among different ministries and their line agencies for enhancing the sector performance.</li> <li>• Other major development partners/donors' portfolio for the ANR sector (i.e., their strategies, approach and level of support).</li> </ul>	
<b>Bottom-Up Performance Assessment</b>			
<b>1. Relevance</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• How was the ADB supervision at the time of <b>design</b> and the resultant <b>quality of entry</b>?</li> <li>• To what extent was ADB's support to</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Readiness/appropriateness for implementation of the project/ program/technical assistance.</li> <li>• EA and line agencies, beneficiaries and other</li> </ul>	<p><b><u>Possible data sources:</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Data and information sources listed above.</li> <li>• Project/program, TAs</li> </ul>

Evaluation Criteria	Key Issues/Guide Questions	Major Indicators and Information Requirement	Data Sources, Collection Methods, and Analysis
	<p>ANR sector <b>aligned</b> to ADB country and sector strategies?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• To what extent did the support to ANR sector matched the Government's <b>sector priorities</b>?</li> <li>• To what extent the <b>design</b> of ANR support considered the sector conditions and scope for sector development?</li> <li>• How <b>technically sound</b> was the design of the project/program support?</li> <li>• To what extent were the <b>past lessons</b> incorporated in design of succeeding support?</li> <li>• To what extent did the <b>stakeholders have ownership</b> of the ADB's support (i.e., EAs other relevant government agencies, beneficiaries)?</li> <li>• Was the ANR support <b>inclusive of marginalized members</b> of the society (i.e. women, landless and marginal farmers, lower caste and minority ethnic groups, and low income groups)?</li> </ul> <p>To what extent was support provided to ANR sector <b>appropriate in its design</b> in terms of EA's capacity for implementation?</p>	<p>stakeholders ownership and commitment to the programs and projects.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Significance, feasibility, and clarity of intervention measures.</li> <li>• Appropriate design, plan and implementation mechanisms clearly stated.</li> <li>• Commitment and capacity of executing and implementing agencies.</li> <li>• Coordination and capacity of ADB project/TA officials</li> <li>• Changes in ADB projects officers during the project development and implementation.</li> <li>• Appropriateness of contribution of preparatory and advisory technical assistances.</li> <li>• Mid-course corrections measures taken and determinants of output and outcome.</li> <li>• Adequate and effective demand for program/project services or products.</li> <li>• Policies, institutions, markets, and regulatory conditions, and risks of change.</li> <li>• The extent of participation, incentives, and continued support from stakeholders.</li> </ul>	<p>and grants related documents (i.e., Project/Program preparatory technical assistance reports, Reports and recommendations of the President, Project/Program performance reports, Back-to-office reports, Mid-term review reports, Project/Program completion reports (PCRs), Executing Agency's PCRs, Technical assistance completion reports</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• OED's reports and other documents (i.e., Technical Assistance Performance Audit Reports, Project/Program Performance Reports, Special Evaluation Study on the ANR related studies, Nepal Country Assistance Program Evaluation 2004), and OED</li> </ul>

Evaluation Criteria	Key Issues/Guide Questions	Major Indicators and Information Requirement	Data Sources, Collection Methods, and Analysis
<p><b>2. Effectiveness</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Has ADB's assistance <b>responded to needs</b> and achieved useful results in terms of outputs and outcomes?</li> <li>• To what extent were the <b>policy dialogue and advisory services effective</b> in achieving desired outputs and outcomes?</li> <li>• To what extent did <b>ADB provide assistance</b> during the implementation stage?</li> <li>• To what extent was support to ANR sector <b>aligned with good practices</b> and international standards (where appropriate)?</li> <li>• Was the performance of ANR programs monitored and evaluated and <b>corrective actions taken</b> where necessary?</li> <li>• How <b>satisfied</b> are <b>beneficiaries</b> with good and services provided as a result of the assistance?</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Appropriate design, plan and implementation of Monitoring and Evaluation mechanisms.</li> <li>• Capacity and coordination of ADB project staff /TA officials</li> <li>• Reasons for selection of EA from ministries other than MOAC for ANR projects implementations</li> <li>• Mid-course corrections measures taken and determinants of output and outcome.</li> <li>• Changes in ADB projects officers during project design and implementation.</li> <li>• Achievement of stated outputs and outcomes.</li> <li>• Commitment and capacity at ADB HQ and NRMs for planning and design and supervision during implementation.</li> <li>• Commitment and capacity of EAs and IAs.</li> <li>• Significance, feasibility, and clarity of intervention measures.</li> <li>• Financing arrangements- timely disbursement/transfer of funds across agencies.</li> <li>• Effectiveness in procurement of goods and services, and recruitment of consultants</li> <li>• Considerations of endogenous</li> </ul>	<p>reports that have included</p> <p><b><u>Possible collection methods and analysis:</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Document reviews</li> <li>• Trend analysis</li> <li>• Key informant interviews</li> <li>• Focus group discussion</li> <li>• Trend analysis</li> <li>• Sample surveys/questionnaires</li> <li>• Field visits/observations</li> </ul>

Evaluation Criteria	Key Issues/Guide Questions	Major Indicators and Information Requirement	Data Sources, Collection Methods, and Analysis
		<p>and exogenous factors influencing the achievement of project/program outputs and outcomes.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Decentralization of the local governance and effect on ADB operations in the sector.</li> <li>• Considerations of endogenous and exogenous factors influencing in the achievement of project/program outputs and outcome.</li> </ul>	
<b>3. Efficiency</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Have ADB sector operations <b>maximized the ratio</b> of outputs and outcomes to resource levels?</li> <li>• Was ADB assistance formulated and implemented in a <b>cost-effective and efficient manner</b>?</li> <li>• The extent to which the procurement and consultant/contractors <b>recruitment processes managed efficiently</b>?</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Economic analysis such as internal rates of return for PCR and PPER, if available</li> <li>• Cost effectiveness considerations for providing/generating outputs.</li> <li>• Role of pricing in optimizing outcomes.</li> <li>• Organization and management capacity of executing agencies.</li> <li>• Timeliness and adequacy of counterpart funding.</li> <li>• Timeliness of contract award for consultants and contractors</li> <li>• Quality of services rendered by consultants and contractors</li> </ul>	
<b>4. Sustainability</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What is the likelihood of <b>sustaining achieved outputs and outcomes</b>?</li> <li>• Is there <b>continued need</b> for outputs generated by the project? If so, how are</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Institutional capacity and conducive policies for to take follow-up actions.</li> <li>• Government ownership and commitment to the programs and</li> </ul>	

Evaluation Criteria	Key Issues/Guide Questions	Major Indicators and Information Requirement	Data Sources, Collection Methods, and Analysis
	<p>the recurrent costs financed?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Are <b>conducive</b> technical, fiscal, political, and environmental <b>conditions</b> in place? Is there continued capacity to provide the services?</li> <li>• Has any components of the project's <b>outputs</b> been <b>disseminated</b> and/or <b>replicated</b> within (or outside) the sector?</li> </ul>	<p>projects.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Adequate and effective demand for program/project services or products.</li> <li>• Operating performance, and financial viability of recurrent costs including capacity developemnt.</li> <li>• Appropriate policy, procedures, and funding for continued operation and maintenance.</li> <li>• The extent of participation, incentives, and continued support from stakeholders.</li> <li>• Outcome's resilience to changes in policy, economic conditions, changes in government and institutional arrangements.</li> <li>• Conducive policies, institutions, markets, and regulatory conditions, and risks of change.</li> <li>• Appropriate policy, procedures, and funding for continued operation and maintenance.</li> <li>• Institutional capacity and conducive policies for to take follow-up actions.</li> </ul>	
<b>5. Impact</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• How has <b>ADB contributed to sustainable economic growth, poverty reduction, achievement of the target one of MDG, one inclusive</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Performance as per main economic indicators (such as Poverty reduction, employment, incomes, subsistence, household</li> </ul>	

Evaluation Criteria	Key Issues/Guide Questions	Major Indicators and Information Requirement	Data Sources, Collection Methods, and Analysis
	<p><b>social development?</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• How have ADB sector operations contributed to <b>long-term sector development?</b></li> <li>• What are the <b>major policy changes</b> in the ANR sector as a <b>result of ADB's support?</b> How has this affected the development of the ANR sector?</li> <li>• How has the ANR support contributed to <b>ADB's thematic priorities</b>, in particular the development of capacity, gender equity, partnerships with private sector, NGO, community-based organizations, and good governance (i.e., accountability, participation, predictability and transparency)?</li> <li>• How has ADB's ANR sector support contributed towards fulfillment of the <b>Paris Declaration commitments?</b></li> </ul>	<p>food security and nutrition, MDGs etc).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Enhancement of laws, regulations, and procedures for the ANR sector.</li> <li>• Institutionalization in norms and practices that facilitates gender development and equity, social inclusiveness, environmental sustainability.</li> <li>• Improved good governance and use of resources in the sector.</li> <li>• Enhanced capacity and institutional skills in the sector.</li> <li>• Efforts at making aid more effective such as Partnership for Development.</li> <li>• Enhancement of laws, regulations, and procedures for the ANR sector.</li> </ul>	