

Rapid Gender Assessment II

ADB External Forum on Gender and Development

16 July 2009, ADB Manila

Juliet Hunt

The views expressed in this paper are the views of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the Asian Development Bank (ADB), or its Board of Governors, or the governments they represent. ADB does not guarantee the accuracy of the data included in this paper and accepts no responsibility for any consequence of their use. The countries listed in this paper do not imply any view on ADB's part as to sovereignty or independent status or necessarily conform to ADB's terminology. and its accuracy

Overview of presentation

1. Methodology – objective, sample, RGA questions, what's new in the approach
2. Findings by sector - common features, gender equality results, challenges, and what's new compared with RGA-I
 - Rural development and infrastructure loans
 - Social sector loans
 - Governance loan
3. Findings on links between gender equality results and loan outcomes & effectiveness
4. Findings on the effectiveness of GAPs
5. Findings on institutionalization of GAPs
6. Recommendations for discussion

RGA-II Objective

Assess the extent to which project-specific Gender Action Plans (GAPs), gender strategies or specific gender provisions:

- achieved gender equality results; and
- contributed to overall loan outcomes, effectiveness and sustainability.

Sample of 12 loans

Four countries –

- Indonesia (Kate Nethercott and Ruly Marianti)
- Mongolia (Helen Thomas and Oyuna Baasanjav)
- Sri Lanka (Helen Thomas and Nelun Gunasekera)
- Viet Nam (Kate Nethercott and Tuyen Nguyen)

Purposive (non-random) sample:

- GAD theme, gender-related purpose or activities; preferably a GAP
- Where few such loans existed, loans with some gender provisions included
- Advanced stage of implementation
- Mix of rural/urban locations & priority sectors

Sample of loans by sector

Six rural development &/or rural or urban infrastructure:

- 3 multi-sectoral (1 Indonesia, 2 Sri Lanka conflict-affected areas)
- 2 water supply & environmental sanitation (Viet Nam, Sri Lanka)
- 1 HIV/AIDS & human trafficking technical assistance (TA) grant attached to the Mongolia Regional Road Development Project

Five social sector loans:

- 2 education (Indonesia and Viet Nam)
- 2 health (Viet Nam and Mongolia)
- 1 social security sector reform (Mongolia)

One governance loan:

- Capacity building for regional government (Indonesia)

RGA questions

1. What gender equality results were achieved?

Results achieved for women/girls compared with men/boys:

- Participation in project activities
- Access to project resources
- Practical benefits
- Changes in gender relations – at individual/household or community level
- Other gender-related results – e.g. institutional or policy changes

RGA questions

2. How did gender equality results contribute to loan outcomes, and the effectiveness and sustainability of the loan investment?
3. What caused or contributed to these results?
 - What were the key features of GAPs and gender provisions that contributed to positive gender equality results?
 - What other factors contributed to the achievement of gender equality results?
4. To what extent were GAPs and gender provisions implemented and institutionalized into project management and monitoring systems by ADB and executing agencies?
5. What are the implications for ADB loan preparation, implementation and monitoring?

What was new in the RGA-II approach?

Explicit focus in RGA-II on:

- contribution of gender equality results to overall loan objectives, outcomes, effectiveness and sustainability (where possible)
- evidence of the institutionalization of GAPs by ADB and the executing agencies, and an assessment of how this impacted on the achievement of results
 - Design and monitoring frameworks, monitoring and reporting, loan assurances and covenants

Rural development and infrastructure loans

5/6 loans had common features and achieved similar results:

- Poverty-reduction objective
- Comprehensive GAPs and most GAP elements were implemented
- Significant community-based components, with GAPs highlighting women's participation in
 - community mobilization – through community based organizations (CBOs) or community management committees
 - access to credit
 - decision making regarding small-scale infrastructure

Mongolia Regional Roads TA on HIV/AIDS and human trafficking

- No gender provisions but implemented some features of a gender mainstreaming approach

Rural development and infrastructure loans: gender equality results (1)

- **High levels of participation by women in CBOs**
 - Increased decision making, planning and management regarding small-scale infrastructure investments
- **Increased access to training by women**
 - Livelihood enterprises, financial management, village development planning, management of small-sale infrastructure
- **Increased access to credit and financial services by women**
- **Practical benefits**
 - Increased income and social capital
 - Water and sanitation (time savings)
 - Other benefits from infrastructure improvements

Rural development and infrastructure loans: gender equality results (2)

- **Contributed to/reinforced changes in gender relations**
 - More evidence of changes at community level than family level (due to GAP focus on increasing women's participation in decision making through CBOs)
 - Women reported greater openness and cooperation with husbands
- **Some institutional changes**
 - Increased respect for and capacity of the Women's Union to represent women's interests (Viet Nam)
 - Women female facilitators employed by local government (Indonesia)
 - High level task force to explore options for continued support for CBOs (Sri Lanka water supply and sanitation project)

Rural development and infrastructure loans: challenges

- Less attention paid to women's involvement in or benefit from large-scale infrastructure investments
- Gender stereotyping in enterprise development training
 - poorer returns for women's labor
- Inadequate data on credit and income
 - size of loans to women vs men
 - differences in income earned by women and men
 - control over income by women and men
- Policy and guidelines on credit
 - control over credit by women and men

Rural development and infrastructure loans: what's new compared with RGA-I?

GAPs and their implementation:

- RGA-I: 5 loans, all had GAPs, 3 GAPs fully implemented
- RGA-II: 6 loans, 5 had GAPs, 4 GAPs well-implemented

Increased access to financial services for women compared with RGA-I

What's not new:

- More investigation, analysis and monitoring needed on women's control of credit and income
- More focus needed on livelihood enterprises that increase the value of women's labor
- More focus needed on women's decision-making & management in large-scale infrastructure
- Sequencing of GAP software and hardware inputs (some projects)

Social sector loans

Education loans (Viet Nam and Indonesia)

- Both aimed to reduce poverty by increasing access to quality education in poor and rural areas
- Both implemented some GAP/gender provisions to address barriers to girls' access to education
- However
 - One had a poor quality GAP, not fully implemented (Viet Nam)
 - One had gender provisions, also not fully implemented (Indonesia)

Social sector loans

Health loans (Viet Nam and Mongolia)

- Both focused on maternal and child health, and explicitly identified women as beneficiaries
- Both had components that addressed non-medical barriers to women accessing health care (Mongolia through a linked JFPR grant)
- Both implemented GAPs (Mongolia partially)

Social security sector loan (Mongolia)

- No gender provisions
- No gender equality results demonstrated
- Significant opportunities were missed to promote and protect women's and men's rights and needs in the sector

Health loans: gender equality results (1)

- **High participation by women health workers in most training**
- **Increased access to health services**, particularly ante-natal care
 - due to GAP strategies and efforts to address non-medical barriers to accessing health care
- **Other practical benefits**
 - Training → increased skills and better understanding of women's health needs → better quality of care
 - Well-targeted IEC (Viet Nam)
 - Upgraded and new facilities (Viet Nam) → better quality of care
 - All these factors → increased confidence in the health system by women → increased use of health services

Health loans: gender equality results (2)

- **Potential to contribute to changes in gender relations**
 - Reduced burden of care for women—funds for food, transport (Viet Nam)
 - Women community based health workers have greater status and respect from other health care workers due to training (Mongolia)
- **Potential to promote or reinforce institutional changes**
 - GAP strategies likely to be applied to other projects & provinces, because staff understand how the GAP has helped to implement government policy & improve project effectiveness (Viet Nam)
 - Patient-focused approach institutionalized in project areas; inclusion of domestic violence in training has potential to change policy and practice (Mongolia)

Education loans: gender equality results (1)

- **Targets for women's participation** in professional development activities were generally achieved or almost achieved
- **Increased enrolments**
 - Primary school and transition to junior secondary by boys and girls (Indonesia)
 - Increased enrolment by girls in upper secondary (Viet Nam)
 - Increased enrolments due to:
 - school construction and upgrading (both projects)
 - Construction close to disadvantaged areas, boarding schools (Viet Nam)
 - Equal access to a range of measures in Indonesia – scholarships (few), remedial teaching, supplementary food, transport assistance
- **Access to other resources (Viet Nam)**
 - Equal access to vocational education support
 - Schoolgirl's handbook
 - Involvement of Ministry of Education and Training's Committee for the Advancement of Women in curriculum development workshops; curriculum committee for gender sensitivity reviewed curriculum materials

Education loans: gender equality results (2)

- **Other practical benefits**

- Upgraded school facilities improved the learning environment for both boys and girls (both projects)
- Text books (Indonesia) and in-service training → improved exam results

- **Potential to contribute to changes in gender relations**

- Scholarships and other activities to keep girls in school helped to address early marriage (one school in East Lombok, Indonesia DBEP)
- Teacher training included a focus on equal access to and participation in schooling (Indonesia)
- Some schools now have 1 or 2 women on school management committees (Indonesia)
- Some efforts made to review curricula for gender sensitivity (Viet Nam USEDP)

Social sector loans: challenges

Missed opportunities in the 2 education projects and Mongolia social security project to enhance benefits, and returns on loan investment

- **GAP/gender provisions not fully implemented, not well known and not monitored** (Indonesia & Viet Nam education)
- Women poorly represented in training overseas and at higher post-graduate levels (Viet Nam health and education)
- More attention needed to analysing and targeting the different barriers faced by girls and boys in accessing education, for example:
 - Few female teachers in some rural areas in Indonesia
 - Decreases in boys enrolments in some areas (both Indonesia and Viet Nam)
- No data available on construction of toilets for girls (both Indonesia & Viet Nam education projects)
- Inadequate attention to involving women in school committees, and building their capacity for this (both Indonesia & Viet Nam education projects)

Social sector loans: what's new compared with RGA-I?

GAPs and their implementation:

- Improved implementation of GAPs in the health sector
- Increased focus on non-medical barriers to accessing health care
- Increased focus on effective behaviour change communication strategies

What's not new?

- More attention to gender analysis and issues needed in the education sector
- Inadequate attention to equipping and involving women in school management committees and decision-making

Governance loan

Indonesia Sustainable Capacity Building for Decentralization

- Tranche release conditions
 - GAPs to be included in district-level capacity building action plans (first tranche release)
 - Gender provisions to be implemented and monitored (subsequent releases)
- Some changes in institutional structures
 - Women's empowerment offices, increased budgets
- Implementation delays and nature of project design → few practical benefits demonstrated to date

Gender equality results and overall loan outcomes, effectiveness and sustainability

The implementation of GAPs and the achievement of gender equality results are clearly contributing to overall loan outcomes and effectiveness

- Sound evidence in multi-sectoral, water supply and environmental sanitation, and health projects

Less evidence regarding the link between sustainability of loan outcomes and gender equality results

- The involvement of women has the potential to yield sustainability gains in infrastructure projects
- But this depends on the sustainability of the CBOs themselves

Multisectoral and infrastructure projects: gender equality results and loan outcomes

Increased income for women in the three multisectoral projects
→ reduced vulnerability to poverty and increased food security

GAP “software activities” including focus on women’s participation in community mobilization

→ increased effectiveness of project implementation (5 projects)

- Women’s involvement in decision making enhanced ownership and commitment to build, manage and maintain small infrastructure
- For example, in Viet Nam Central Region Urban Environmental Improvement Project (CRUEIP) GAP software activities
 - prepared the ground for implementation of small- and large-scale infrastructure construction and upgrading
 - effectively highlighted the link between the goal of improved living conditions and health and sanitation practices
 - were recognized as critical for project success by some provincial management units

Findings on the effectiveness of GAPs

Loans with well-implemented and quality GAPs achieved comprehensive gender equality results

RGA-I findings validated regarding those features of GAPs that are likely to enhance gender equality results:

- Good social and gender analysis
 - Realistic and achievable targets clearly linked to loan components
 - Consistent monitoring by EAs of GAP implementation and gender equality results
 - **Gender capacity building, gender and social development expertise during implementation, GAP ownership and understanding of WHY the need to focus on gender issues**
- **Involvement of RM GS is critical to improve the quality of loan design and implementation**

What's new in the RGA-II findings on GAPs?

- The need to develop and implement **quality** GAPs
 - Many GAPs are more detailed compared with RGA-I but they also need to be:
 - Comprehensive (elements for every component)
 - Good communication tools
 - Focused on higher level results as well as participation targets
 - Focused on strategies to achieve results
 - Focused on monitoring results
- Investment in lateral learning has paid off
 - Leadership from project directors remains critical/essential
- Need to use project gender specialists strategically
 - Most employed part-time

Institutionalization of GAPs: what's new?

- Small improvement in the integration of GAPs into design and monitoring frameworks than RGA-I
- More loan covenants refer to either GAPs or some gender provisions, but:
 - Unsystematic approach to drafting covenants
 - Reporting was often cursory & sometimes inaccurate re compliance
 - Missed opportunities to engage in policy dialogue when covenants not complied with

What's not new?

- DMFs still very weak on gender-related outcomes, outputs and indicators
 - Health projects still have the greatest attention to gender-related outcomes and indicators in DMFs
- Poor attention to gender indicators in Project Performance Reports (PPRs)
- Poor attention overall to sex-disaggregated data, monitoring and reporting of results, and use of baseline data

Draft recommendations (1)

1. Trial a rating scale for GAPs

- At design and mid-term review
- Linked to quality at entry processes & capacity building
- Mentoring Resident Mission Gender Specialists to draft quality GAPs, where needed

2. Integrate GAP elements into RRP DMFs, PAMs and PPRs

- Outcomes, outputs, indicators, sex-disaggregated data
- Develop good practice examples of DMFs

3. Policy dialogue around loan covenants

- Greater care on reporting re compliance

4. Strategic use of project gender advisers

Draft recommendations (2)

5. Continue to invest in **lateral learning**
6. **Strategic focus for Resident Mission Gender Specialists**
 - Needs to be supported/facilitated by Country Directors, project officers and headquarter staff
7. **Gender equality results and indicators in country partnership strategies (CPS)**
 - Link more to country gender assessments and national gender equality priorities
8. Future RGAs should focus on high priority Strategy 2020 sectors
 - Assess results at program as well as project levels

Examples of GAPs/gender provisions and gender equality results

1. Indonesia Community Empowerment for Rural Development (CERD)
2. Viet Nam Central Region Urban Environmental Improvement Project (CRUEIP)
3. Viet Nam Health Care in the Central Highlands (HICH)
4. Indonesia Decentralized Basic Education Project (DEBP)

Community Empowerment for Rural Development (CERD) Indonesia Loan 1765/1766

Project components	GAP elements
<p>Objective: increased incomes of the rural poor; empowered rural communities</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Women identified as beneficiaries •Women’s entrepreneurial activities seen as key to reducing poverty
<p>Capacity building for decentralized planning:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Institutional & HRD 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •20%-30% targets for women in EA staff training •Women encouraged to apply for positions •3/11 district project managers to be women
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Village grants for community training 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Women 50% participants in community training •2 women on each village planning committee
<p>Rural financial institutions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Participatory village planning •Community-based savings and loans organisations (CBSLOs) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Women organized into separate groups •Women to be 50% of CBSLO membership & trainees; encouraged to run for elective office on CBSLOs; CBSLOs to emphasize inclusion of women in all aspects of operations
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Financial services 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Loan products to meet women’s needs •At least 50% of borrowers to be women
<p>Rural infrastructure</p>	<p>To be selected using a participatory approach</p>
<p>Project management & monitoring</p>	<p>Project gender specialist; gender training at all³¹ levels; indicators for women’s participation</p>

Gender equality results from Indonesia CERD

Project components	Gender equality results
Objective: increased incomes	Average monthly income doubled – women’s income contributed to increased household income
Capacity building for decentralized planning •Institutional & HRD	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •High women’s participation in formal EA training •43% project facilitators were women; employed by district govt at completion of project
•Village grants for community training	8,300 women participated in community based planning & management (40% compared with target of 50%)
Rural financial institutions: CBSLOs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •55% of CBSLO members & trainees were women •Women in CBSLO leadership positions; trained in savings & loan management & service delivery
•Financial services	More than 65% of borrowers were women; borrowed independently of husbands & controlled credit & income <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Reduced reliance on money-lenders; incr social capital •Increased mobility & status of women
Rural infrastructure	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •32% village level cadres were women; women’s confidence to speak in meetings increased •Improved HH lighting & drinking water
Project management & monitoring	Targets for women’s participation & benefits were monitored & reported

Gender equality results from CERD

- **Women's participation—many targets achieved**
 - CBSLO membership & community-based planning
- **Good access to project resources**
 - financial services; & community-based training (livelihood enterprise, financial services & management, CBSLO management, community-based planning)
 - Department of Rural Development staff – diploma, graduate & post-grad
- **Practical benefits**
 - increased skills, income & livelihood opportunities (snack making, food processing, small shops)
 - increased social capital from CBSLOs
 - benefits from infrastructure (access to markets, water & sanitation)
- **Contribution to changes in gender relations**
 - more women involved in community decision making
 - increased confidence & mobility of women; increased cooperation with husbands
- **Institutional changes**
 - female facilitators recruited to local government positions

Central Region Urban Environmental Improvement Project (CRUEIP)

Viet Nam Loan 2034

Project components	GAP elements
<p>Goal: improved quality of life, health & poverty reduction</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Participation & benefits to women a priority, due to roles in sanitation & waste management (HH & community) •Loan covenant on GAP implementation & resourcing
<p>Awareness & pro-poor sanitation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Comm’y awareness & participation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Women’s Union responsible for implementation through community management committees (CMCs) •Training on gender & sanitation; 50% target for female motivators & training participants
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Community based sanitation (CBS) 	<p>WU to review proposals; 30% target women’s participation in community groups; participatory process for communities to determine contributions to CBS works with exemptions for female headed households</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Household sanitation program 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •WU capacity building-project implementation & management •75% target for women as beneficiaries of revolving loan fund
<p>Drainage, flood protect’n; Waste water & public sanitation</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •IEC targeted at & consultation with both women & men •Different needs of women & men to be addressed in design, operation & maintenance
<p>Solid waste management</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •IEC to improve men’s & women’s awareness & practice •Special needs of women URENCO staff to be addressed
<p>Institutional strengthening</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Gender awareness training for all stakeholders; leadership training for URENCO female staff; gender sensitive indicators, gender sensitive resettlement plans

Gender equality results from CRUEIP

- **High participation by women** in all activities
 - all targets exceeded → decision making, community-based planning & management re small & large-scale infrastructure
- **Good access to project resources by women**
 - Training (management, IEC, gender & sanitation) → new skills
 - Credit for household sanitation improvements (preference to female headed households)
- **Many practical benefits**
 - Improved waste management & public sanitation
 - Better awareness about links between health, sanitation & waste disposal → changed solid waste disposal practices
 - Both of these reduced women's time burdens
 - Better designed hand-carts & garbage cans for female sweepers
- **Contribution to changes in gender relations**
 - Female headed household relocated given title to land
 - Increased visibility & decision making by women (including commune & ward levels)
 - Increased participation by men in community sanitation activities
- **Institutional changes** – increased capacity of WU to implement small-scale civil works & represent women's interests
- **Gender equality results & GAP implementation directly contributed to loan outcomes and effectiveness during implementation**

Health Care in the Central Highlands (HICH) Viet Nam Loan 2076

Project components	Gender and ethnic minorities plan (GEMAP)
Goal: improved health status	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Women's participation & increased access to health services a priority; project outcomes focus on MCH
Upgrading health facilities & equipment: curative; preventative	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •At least 1 staff member trained in women's health in each medical facility •Auditory & visual privacy for women
Human resource development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •33% target for women's participation in training, or equivalent to proportion of female staff employed •IEC materials to integrate gender equality messages; to be developed in consultation with women; & focus on health issues that disproportionately affect women
Strengthen financing & management: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •capacity building for project staff; •management information system 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •One woman trained in gender-specific issues in all provincial project management units •Gender capacity building for implementation staff •Equality between women & men in recruitment; priority to ethnic minority women •Sex-disaggregated data & reporting on gender equality
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •health care fund for the poor (HCFP) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Staff capacity building on HCFP to be gender sensitive •Measures to reduce direct & opportunity costs targeted to both women & men

Gender equality results from Viet Nam HICH

Project components	Gender equality results
Goal: improved health status	Increased access to health care by women & children •More women with ante-natal care (45% to 67%: Da Lat)
Upgrading health facilities & equipment: curative; preventative	•New obstetrics & pediatric wards & equipment •At least 1 staff member trained in women's health in each medical facility; staff have a good understanding of women's health issues →strengthened capacity to respond to women's needs Separate toilets built for women; canteens
Human resource development	•Increased skills of female health staff; high participation by women in training; construction workers trained in HIV •Increased confidence in health services & staff by patients •IEC targeted topics that directly affect women
Strengthen financing & management	•Gender focal point for GAP implementation in each provincial project management unit •Women & men aware of their rights to free health care
•health care fund for the poor (HCFP)	•Outreach activities effective at increasing men's & women's awareness of their right to free health care •Food & travel allowances reduced opportunity costs

Gender equality results from HICH

- **High participation by women** in most training
 - most targets achieved
 - Women also participated in the design of IEC materials
- **Increased access to health services**
 - More women attending for ante-natal care & childbirth
 - Health care for the poor component – funds for food & transport
 - Women specifically targeted for outreach medical services & IEC
- **Practical benefits**
 - Training → increased skills, better understanding of women's health needs; + upgraded and new facilities → better quality of care → increased confidence in the health system by women + well-targeted IEC → increased use of health services
- **Potential to contribute to changes in gender relations**
 - Reduced burden of care for women (less reliant on money from husbands due to health care for the poor initiatives)
- **Potential to contribute to institutional changes**
 - Staff understand how the GAP helped to implement government policy & improve project effectiveness → GAP strategies likely to be applied to other projects & provinces

Decentralized Basic Education Project (DEBP) Indonesia Loan 1863

Project components	Gender provisions in the project design
<p>Goal: poverty reduction & improved access to quality basic education</p>	<p>Special measures to promote the participation of & benefits for women & girls included in loan assurances & covenants (all the provisions below)</p>
<p>School development:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Capacity building •School development fund 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •School committees, sub-district committees, & board education committees to include at least 2 women •Separate sanitation facilities for girls & boys •Girls to receive at least 50% of scholarships
<p>District basic education development:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Capacity building for decentralization •District development fund 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Women to be at least 50% of teachers in in-service training & development programs •Women to be at least 30% of participants in workshops on school-based management training
<p>Monitoring, evaluation and reporting</p>	<p>None</p>

Gender equality results from DEBP

- **Women's participation** in training – overall target almost achieved (47% vs 50%) but varied markedly between provinces
- **Increased enrolments** - in primary & junior secondary for boys & girls (decreased for boys in Bali)
- **Equal access by boys & girls to special measures**
- **Practical benefits**
 - Upgraded school facilities improved the learning environment for both boys & girls
 - Text books & in-service training → improved quality of education → improved exam results
- **Potential to contribute to changes in gender relations**
 - Scholarships & other activities to keep girls in school helped to address early marriage (one school in East Lombok)
 - Teacher training included a focus on equal access to & participation in schooling
 - Some schools now have 1 or 2 women on school committees (but often these are teachers)