

# Project Administration Instructions

PAI 6.08  
Revised March 2009  
Page 1 of 3

---

---

## TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE COMPLETION REPORT

### A. Objective and Scope

1. The main objective of preparing a technical assistance (TA) completion report (TCR) is to benefit from the experience gained and use this to improve TA planning, formulation, and implementation.
2. The TCR
  - evaluates the rationale for the TA, adequacy of its formulation (including the level of stakeholder participation and ownership), and clarity and comprehensiveness of the terms of reference;
  - evaluates the achievement of the outputs and outcome, the delivery of inputs and conduct of activities;
  - evaluates the quality of the TA outputs and outcome including the reports produced, presentations made, technology transfer achieved (including number trained and staff retention), and achievement of time-bound targets;
  - describes TA implementation and any significant changes occurring between TA preparation and implementation (including changes in the context in which the TA was carried out);
  - reviews the performance of consultants;
  - identifies the major lessons for ADB and the recipient agency, and provides recommendations for follow-up actions and improving future TAs; and
  - rates the performance of the TA.

### B. Timing

3. A TCR is prepared within six months to one year of TA completion<sup>1</sup>. A longer period may be allowed for project preparatory TAs that do not immediately result in a loan and need to await an outcome. The TA is complete when a major part of the TA work program or services have been completed. This usually coincides with submission of the consultant's final report.

### C. Preparation

4. A TCR<sup>2</sup> is prepared for
  - ADB-financed and cofinanced advisory TA, (whether stand-alone or attached to a loan);
  - regional TA including conferences, seminars, and the like;
  - project preparatory TA that does not result in a loan project; and
  - cluster TA.

---

<sup>1</sup> TCRs need not be prepared for TAs that have been cancelled without any disbursements and related financial activities. Instead a Board information paper should be prepared to show the reasons for cancellation.

<sup>2</sup> For a technical assistance loan, a project completion report (PCR) should be prepared. Major topics to be included in the PCR and a description of its contents are provided in PAI 6.07, Appendix 2.

#### **1. Small-scale Technical Assistance**

5. A TCR is not required for a small-scale technical assistance, which is currently defined as a TA with an approved value of up to (and including) \$225,000.<sup>3</sup>

#### **2. Technical Assistance Resulting in a Loan**

6. A TCR is not required for a project preparatory TA that results in a loan. A project preparatory TA resulting in a loan should be evaluated in the PCR for the loan project.

#### **3. Advisory Technical Assistance Processed In Conjunction with Loans**

7. A TCR for an advisory TA processed in conjunction with a loan should be prepared separately from the project completion report (PCR) for the project or program loan concerned. However, the corresponding PCR must include the salient features of the TCR, including any variations from appraisal, in its text; note the TA rating, and provide a complete citation for the TCR in footnote. A TCR prepared concurrently with a PCR should be appended to the PCR with salient features, including any variations from appraisal, noted in the PCR text. When PCR Board circulation is requested, the Office of the Secretary (OSEC) should also be informed that a TCR is appended to the PCR. This will ensure that the TCR is recorded in OSEC's database and that it is noted in OSEC's circulation memo to the Board.

#### **4. Cluster Technical Assistance**

8. A TCR is prepared for a cluster TA upon completion of the last TA in the cluster. It should cover the entire cluster and be more comprehensive than a TCR for an advisory TA. Separate TCRs are not required for individual TAs within the cluster.

9. The TA supervising unit (TASU) is responsible for preparing the TCR. In general, a separate TCR mission is not required and the information is gathered during TA supervision. The TCR is brief, generally not exceeding two pages of text (excluding appendixes), unless detailed presentation of several issues is needed. The format and general guidelines for preparing the TCR is outlined in appendixes 1 and 2.<sup>4</sup> The *Guidelines for Preparing Performance Evaluation Reports for Public Sector Operations* (available at <http://www.adb.org/Documents/Guidelines/Evaluation/PPER-PSO/default.asp>) prepared by the Operations Evaluation Department should be referred to for guidance. A draft of the TCR (after clearance by the TASU director or head) is submitted for comments to the concerned department, offices, and divisions [(Central Operations Services Office (COSO), Loan Administration Division (CTLA), and Regional and Sustainable Development Department (RSDD)]. The TCR is finalized after receiving and incorporating the comments, with the approval of the department head. For projects administered by RMs, approval of the TCR is sought from the country director, RM. The secretariat officers (editing) do

---

<sup>3</sup> See Review of the Bank's Technical Assistance Operations, R119-97, dated 10 July 1997.

<sup>4</sup> A template for use in preparing the TCR is available in the ADB Portal (Guidelines and Templates for Board Documents) at URL: [http://eboard.asiandevbank.org/docs\\_refs/index.php](http://eboard.asiandevbank.org/docs_refs/index.php).

not edit the TCR. Printing and circulation of the TCR to the Board should be approved by the department head.

10. The TCR should only be circulated to the Board after the TA account has been closed by the Controller's Department.

**D. Intended Use of the Technical Assistance Completion Report**

11. The TCR is intended for

- the Board of Directors;
- vice-president concerned;
- vice-president (finance and administration);
- heads of departments and offices;
- country director, resident mission concerned; and
- borrowers, and executing and implementing agencies.

12. TASU monitors actions taken on the TCR's recommendations until the main outstanding issues are satisfactorily resolved.



**TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE COMPLETION REPORT<sup>1</sup>**

Division :

TA No., Country and Name  (TA XXXX-CCC: TA Title)		Amount Approved:	
		Revised Amount:	
Executing Agency(ies)	Source of Funding	Amount Undisbursed:	Amount Utilized:
TA Approval Date:	TA Signing Date:	Fielding of First Consultant(s):	TA Completion Date Original: Actual: Account Closing Date Original: Actual:
<p><b>Description</b> (Background and rationale)</p> <p><b>Expected Impact, Outcome and Outputs</b></p> <p><b>Delivery of Inputs and Conduct of Activities</b> (Adequacy of formulation, terms of reference, performance of consultants, other inputs, review missions, inputs of recipients, and changes made during implementation)</p> <p><b>Evaluation of Outputs and Achievement of Outcome</b> (Reports generated, institution building, training, analysis of quality using targets and indicators in the design and monitoring framework)</p> <p><b>Overall Assessment and Rating</b> (Highly successful, successful, partly successful, unsuccessful)</p> <p><b>Major Lessons</b> (if any)</p> <p><b>Recommendations and Follow-Up Actions</b></p>			

Prepared by: \_\_\_\_\_ Designation: \_\_\_\_\_

<sup>1</sup> A template is available in the ADB Portal (Guidelines and Templates for Board Documents) at URL: [http://eboard.asiandevbank.org/docs\\_refs/index.php](http://eboard.asiandevbank.org/docs_refs/index.php).



## **GENERAL GUIDELINES FOR PREPARING TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE COMPLETION REPORTS**

### **A. Description**

1. Extract information on background and rationale from the approved technical assistance (TA) paper and summarize.

### **B. Expected Impact, Outcome and Outputs**

2. Briefly describe the TA's expected outputs, outcome and impact as described in the design and monitoring framework. Evaluate the relevance of TA design (including appropriateness of objectives, terms of reference, executing arrangements, and implementation schedule) and formulation (including extent of stakeholder participation and ownership).

### **C. Delivery of Inputs and Conduct of Activities**

3. Assess

- the economy of input provision (the relative cost of input provision);
- the productivity of the inputs (conversion into outputs);
- the quality of inputs;
- reasons for deviating from planned inputs and activities;
- client satisfaction with the inputs provided; and
- the performance of ADB and the executing agency (EA) as highly satisfactory, satisfactory, less than satisfactory, or unsatisfactory.

4. Assessment of the performance of consultants must be consistent with their Performance Evaluation Report (PER). All PERs must be completed and forwarded to the Central Operations Services Office before TCR completion.

### **D. Evaluation of Outputs and Achievement of Outcome**

5. Evaluate performance issues, such as

- efficiency in the production of outputs (cost and process),
- effectiveness (achievement of outcome),
- quality of outputs (refer to qualitative benchmarks where possible),
- client satisfaction with outputs and outcome, and
- timeliness of delivery of outputs.

**E. Overall Assessment and Rating**

6. Provide an overall assessment including the issue of sustainability, and categorize the TA as highly successful, successful, partly successful, or unsuccessful following Operations Evaluation Department guidelines.

**F. Major Lessons**

7. Discuss only the significant lessons learned that can help improve formulation and implementation of similar TAs.

**G. Recommendations and Follow-Up Actions**

8. Recommend any action required after TA completion and make suggestions for changes to policies that can improve effectiveness of TAs in the future.