

**ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK**

**PCR: PAK 22094**

**PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT**

**ON THE**

**TEACHER TRAINING PROJECT  
(Loan 1210-PAK [SF])**

**IN**

**PAKISTAN**

**November 2002**

## CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS

(as of 11 May 2002)

Currency Unit – Pakistan rupee (PRs)

		<b>At Appraisal</b> (1 Nov 1992)	<b>At Project Completion</b> (May 2002)
PRs1.00	=	\$0.04	\$0.02
\$1.00	=	PRs25.27	PRs59.98

## ABBREVIATIONS

ADB	–	Asian Development Bank
BCEEC	–	Bureau of Curriculum and Education Extension Center
BME	–	Benefit Monitoring and Evaluation
CT	–	certificate of teaching
CTA	–	chief technical adviser
Dipl. Ed.	–	diploma of education
EA	–	executing agency
ESR	–	Education Sector Reforms
FCU	–	Federal Coordinating Unit
GCE	–	Government College of Education
GCET	–	Government College for Elementary Teachers
GOP	–	Government of Pakistan
IA	–	Implementing Agency
MOE	–	Ministry of Education
NWFP	–	North-West Frontier Province
PC-1	–	Planning Commission Proforma-1
PCR	–	project completion report
PED	–	provincial education department
PITE	–	provincial institute of teacher education
PIU	–	project implementation unit
PTC	–	primary teacher certificate
TA	–	technical assistance
TEMIS	–	Teacher Education Management Information System
TO	–	training outpost
TOR	–	terms of reference
TPTE	–	Technical Panel on Teacher Education
TTI	–	teacher training institute
TTP	–	teacher training project

## NOTES

- (i) The fiscal year (FY) of GOP ends on 30 June.
- (ii) In this report, "\$" refers to US dollars.

## CONTENTS

	<b>Page</b>
BASIC DATA	ii
I. PROJECT DESCRIPTION	1
II. EVALUATION OF DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION	
A. Relevance of Design and Formulation	2
B. Project Outputs	3
C. Project Costs and Financing	6
D. Disbursement	7
E. Project Schedule	8
F. Implementation Arrangements	8
G. Conditions and Covenants	9
H. Consultant Recruitment and Procurement	9
I. Performance of Consultants, Contractors, and Suppliers	10
J. Performance of the Borrower and the Executing Agency	10
K. Performance of the Asian Development Bank	11
III. EVALUATION OF PERFORMANCE	
A. Relevance	11
B. Efficacy in Achievement of Purpose	11
C. Efficiency in Achievement of Outputs and Purpose	12
D. Preliminary Assessment of Sustainability	12
E. Environmental, Sociocultural, and Other Impacts	12
IV. OVERALL ASSESSMENT AND RECOMMENDATIONS	
A. Overall Assessment	12
B. Lessons Learned	13
C. Recommendations	13
APPENDIXES	
1. Comparative Analysis of Teacher Training Project with National Policy and Planning Strategies	15
2. The New Diploma in Education	16
3. Planned and Actual Key Project Outputs by Components and By Province	17
4. Overall Total Cost Summary by Category of Expenditures and Financing Arrangements—Comparison of Appraisal Estimates and Actual Costs	18
5. Overall Total Cost Summary by Category of Expenditures and Financing Arrangements—Comparison of Appraisal Estimates and Actual Costs Project Cost Variation at Appraisal and Completion	20
6. Loan Disbursement by year and by Quarter	22
7. Summary of Disbursements by Component and by Loan Category	23
8. Project Implementation Schedule	24
9. Compliance With Loan Covenants	25

**BASIC DATA****A. Loan Identification**

1.	Country	Pakistan
2.	Loan Number	1210-PAK (SF)
3.	Project Title	Teacher Training
4.	Borrower	Islamic Republic of Pakistan
5.	Executing Agency	(i) Federal Ministry of Education (MOE); and (ii) Provincial education departments (PEDs) of Balochistan, North-West Frontier, Punjab, and Sindh.
6.	Amount of Loan	\$52.1 million (SDR37.373 million)
7.	Project Completion Report	PCR:PAK 713

**B. Loan Data**

1.	Appraisal	
	– Date Started	12 August 1992
	– Date Completed	30 August 1992
2.	Loan Negotiations	
	– Date Started	16 November 1992
	– Date Completed	18 November 1992
3.	Date of Board Approval	15 December 1992
4.	Date of Loan Agreement	29 March 1993
5.	Date of Loan Effectiveness	
	– In Loan Agreement	27 June 1993
	– Actual	14 October 1993
	– Number of Extensions	2
6.	Closing Date	
	– In Loan Agreement	31 December 1998
	– Actual	31 December 2000 <sup>a</sup>
	– Number of Extensions	2
7.	Terms of Loan	
	– Interest Rate	1% per annum
	– Maturity	35 years
	– Grace Period	10 years
8.	Disbursements	

## a. Dates

	<b>Initial Disbursement</b>	<b>Final Disbursement</b>	<b>Time Interval</b>
	16 May 1994	18 July 2002	98 months
	<b>Effective Date</b>	<b>Original Closing Date</b>	<b>Time Interval</b>
	14 October 1993	30 June 1998	56 months

<sup>a</sup> The Project was physically completed by 31 December 2000 and the loan account was formally closed on 18 July 2002.

## b. Amount (\$)

CATEGORY	Original Allocation	Last Revised Allocation	Amount Canceled	Net Amount Available	Amount Disbursed	Undisbursed Balance
Civil Works	5,187,000	5,245,159	(272,888)	4,972,272	4,520,725	451,547
Equipment	5,875,000	4,802,930	(693,299)	4,109,631	3,101,106	1,008,525
Vehicles	579,000	336,202	(113,582)	222,620	206,348	16,272
Instructional Materials	11,043,000	3,618,971	(1,609,814)	2,009,157	457,142	1,552,015
Staff Development-Overseas	1,429,000	927,260	(130,245)	797,015	719,632	77,383
Consulting Services	2,504,000	3,161,913	(735,970)	2,425,943	2,310,484	115,459
LC-Library Facilities	1,092,000	1,382,274	(180,604)	1,201,669	671,564	530,105
LC-Staff Development						
- Local Fellowship	2,773,000	978,480	(104,232)	874,249	632,315	241,934
LC-In-service Training	9,187,000	6,086,899	(93,461)	5,993,438	5,978,308	15,130
LC-Research and Evaluation Studies	860,000	748,528	(64,653)	683,875	449,048	234,827
LC-Project Implementation Cost						
-FCU and PIUs	1,153,000	1,257,122	110,741	1,367,863	1,098,082	269,781
LC-Project Implementation Cost						
-O&M	5,904,000	630,763	(78,624)	552,139	317,060	235,079
Services Charge During Const.	1,590,000	1,552,528	0	1,552,528	964,583	587,945
Unallocated	2,954,000	36,077	(33,372)	2,705	0	2,705
<b>Total</b>	<b>52,130,000</b>	<b>30,765,105</b>	<b>4,000,000</b>	<b>26,765,104</b>	<b>21,426,397</b>	<b>5,338,707</b>

FCU = Federal Coordinating Unit, LC = local currency, PIU = project implementation unit, O&M = operation and maintenance.

9. Local Costs (ADB Financed)	
- Amount (\$ million)	14.1
- Percent of Local Costs	72.7
- Percent of Total Cost	52.8

## C. Project Data

## 1. Project Cost (\$ million)

Cost	Appraisal Estimate	Actual
Foreign Exchange Cost	13.5	7.3
Local Currency Cost	57.8	19.4
<b>Total</b>	<b>71.3</b>	<b>26.7</b>

## 2. Financing Plan (\$ million)

Cost	Appraisal Estimate			Actual		
	Foreign	Local	Total	Foreign	Local	Total
Implementation Costs						
ADB-Financed	11.9	38.6	50.5	6.3	14.1	20.4
Borrower-Financed	0.0	19.2	19.2	0.0	5.3	5.3
<b>Total</b>	<b>11.9</b>	<b>57.8</b>	<b>69.7</b>	<b>6.3</b>	<b>19.4</b>	<b>25.7</b>
IDC Costs						
ADB-Financed	1.6	0.0	1.6	1.0	0.0	1.0
Borrower-Financed	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
<b>Total</b>	<b>1.6</b>	<b>0.0</b>	<b>1.6</b>	<b>1.0</b>	<b>0.0</b>	<b>1.0</b>

ADB = Asian Development Bank, IDC = interest during construction.

## 3. Cost Breakdown by Project Component (\$million)

Cost	Appraisal Estimate			Actual		
	Foreign	Local	Total	Foreign	Local	Total
<b>A. Infrastructure Development</b>						
1. Land Acquisition	0.000	2.082	2.082	0.000	2.082	2.082
2. Detailed Engineering and Supervision	0.000	0.296	0.296	0.000	0.067	0.067
3. Civil Works						
a. Existing Institution	0.308	1.232	1.540	0.276	1.178	1.454
b. New Institutions	0.678	2.710	3.388	0.774	3.301	4.075
<b>Subtotal (A)</b>	<b>0.986</b>	<b>6.320</b>	<b>7.306</b>	<b>1.050</b>	<b>6.628</b>	<b>7.678</b>
<b>B. Equipment, Furniture and Vehicle</b>						
1. Equipment						
a. Office Equipment	0.650	0.163	0.813	0.445	0.038	0.483
b. Electronic Media Development	2.410	0.602	3.012	1.590	0.637	2.227
c. Laboratory Facilities	0.957	0.239	1.196	0.230	0.020	0.250
2. Furniture	0.000	1.146	1.146	0.000	1.304	1.304
3. Vehicles	0.579	0.145	0.723	0.207	0.051	0.258
<b>Subtotal (B)</b>	<b>4.596</b>	<b>2.295</b>	<b>6.890</b>	<b>2.472</b>	<b>2.050</b>	<b>4.522</b>
<b>C. Institution Building</b>						
1. Staff Development						
a. Local Fellowship	0.000	2.104	2.104	0.000	0.632	0.632
b. Overseas Fellowship	1.429	0.000	1.429	0.720	0.000	0.720
2. Curricula and Instructional Method Development	0.000	0.551	0.551	0.000	0.000	0.000
3. Instructional Materials Development	0.475	7.469	7.944	0.300	0.157	0.457
4. Library Improvement	0.000	0.829	0.829	0.000	0.672	0.672
5. Research and Evaluation Studies	0.000	0.653	0.653	0.000	0.449	0.449
6. Consultant Services						
a. International	1.450	0.000	1.450	1.762	0.000	1.762
b. Domestic	0.000	0.800	0.800	0.000	0.548	0.548
7. In-Service Training	0.000	7.047	7.047	0.000	5.973	5.973
<b>Subtotal (C)</b>	<b>3.354</b>	<b>19.453</b>	<b>22.807</b>	<b>2.782</b>	<b>8.436</b>	<b>11.218</b>
<b>D. Project Implementation and Incr. Recurrent Costs</b>						
1. Incremental Staff Salaries						
a. PIU	0.000	1.054	1.054	0.000	1.390	1.390
b. New Institutions	0.000	9.210	9.210	0.000	0.384	0.384
2. Operation, Maintenance, and Consumables	0.000	5.397	5.397	0.000	0.524	0.524
<b>Subtotal (D)</b>	<b>0.000</b>	<b>15.661</b>	<b>15.661</b>	<b>0.000</b>	<b>2.298</b>	<b>2.298</b>
Base Cost <sup>a</sup>	8.935	43.729	52.664	6.304	19.412	25.716
Physical Contingencies	0.496	2.384	2.880	0.000	0.000	0.000
Price Contingencies	2.458	11.745	14.203	0.000	0.000	0.000
Service Charge during Implementation	1.590	0.000	1.590	0.965	0.000	0.965
<b>Total</b>	<b>13.480</b>	<b>57.857</b>	<b>71.337</b>	<b>7.269</b>	<b>19.412</b>	<b>26.681</b>

PIU = project implementation unit

a Including taxes and duties of \$2.5 million

## 4. Project Schedule

Item	Appraisal Estimate	Actual
Civil Works		
Balochistan		
Engineering Designs		May 1995
Date of Award	Oct 1993	Sep 1995
Completion of Work	Jun 1995	Dec 2000
North West Frontier		
Engineering Designs		Jan 1996
Date of Award	Oct 1993	Feb 1996
Completion of Work	Jun 1995	Sep 1999
Punjab		
Engineering Designs		
Date of Award	Oct 1993	Mar 1996
Completion of Work	Jun 1995	Jul 2000
Sindh		
Engineering Designs		
Date of Award	Oct 1993	Jun 1994
Completion of Work	Jun 1995	Jun 2000
Equipment and Supplies		
First Procurement	Mar 1993	Sep 1994
Last Procurement	Dec 1995	Mar 2000
Consulting Services		
Start of Services	Mar 1993	Sep 1995
Completion of Services	Dec 1997	Jul 1999
Staff Development		
Local Fellowship		
First Training	Mar 1993	Apr 1995
Last Training	Dec 1997	Dec 1999
Overseas Fellowship		
First Award	Mar 1993	Jun 1998
Return of Last Fellow	Dec 1995	Sep 1998
Project Implementation Units		
Beginning of Start-Up	Jan 1993	Oct 1993
Completion	Dec 1997	Dec 2000

## 5. Project Performance Report Ratings

Implementation Period	Ratings	
	Development Objectives	Implementation Progress
(i) Oct 1993–Dec 1993	Satisfactory	Satisfactory
(ii) Jan 1994–Dec 1994	Satisfactory	Satisfactory
(iii) Jan 1995–Dec 1995	Satisfactory	Satisfactory
(iv) Jan 1996–Dec 1996	Satisfactory	Satisfactory
(v) Jan 1997–Dec 1997	Satisfactory	Partly Satisfactory
(vi) Jan 1998–Dec 1998	Satisfactory	Satisfactory
(vii) Jan 1999–Dec 1999	Satisfactory	Satisfactory
(viii) Jan 2000–Dec 2000	Satisfactory	Satisfactory

Name of Mission	Date	No. of Persons	No. of Person-Days	Specialization of Members
Fact-finding	May–Jun 1992			
Appraisal	12–30 Aug 1992	8	152	a, c, d, f, i
Inception	30 May–3 Jun 1994	2	10	a, d
Review–1	11 Feb–2 Mar 1995	1	20	d
Special Loan Review–2	3 Dec 1995	1	1	b
Review–3	11–30 Mar 1996	1	20	a
Review–4	15–18 Sep 1996	1	4	a
Review–5	16–17 Jan 1997	1	2	a
Review–6	10–12 Apr 1997	1	3	a
Special Loan Review–7	18–23 Aug 1997	1	6	h
Midterm Review–8	29 Sep–15 Oct 1997	2	34	a, g
Review–9	9–21 Mar 1998	1	13	a
Review–10	10–24 Oct 1998	2	30	a, e
Review–11	15–20 Feb 1999	2	12	a, e
Review–12	23–29 Nov 1999	2	14	a, h
Review–13	19–29 Jun 2000	2	22	a, h
Review–14	17–27 April 2001	2	22	a, h
Project Completion Review	13 May–1 Jun 2002	3	60	b, i, j

<sup>a</sup> a–senior education specialist, b–senior project specialist, c–programs officer, d–education specialist, e–project specialist, f–counsel, g–senior assistant project analyst, h–assistant project analyst, i–staff consultant, j–associate project analyst.

<sup>b</sup> Project Completion Report was prepared by W. D. Ferguson (Sr. Project Specialist), E. Franco (International Consultant, Teacher Training Specialist), and R. Balbago (Associate Project Analyst), who visited Pakistan in May 2002.

## E. Related Loans

Loan No.	Project Title	Date of Agreement	Amount (\$million)
For the Same Executing Agency (Ministry of Education)			
0419-PAK(SF)	Technical Teacher's Training and Polytechnic Institutes	3 Dec 1979	18.7
0759-PAK(SF)	Science Education for Secondary Schools Sector	21 Mar 1986	28.8
1278-PAK(SF)	Middle Schools	17 May 1994	78.0
1301-PAK(SF)	Social Action Program I	1 July 1994	100.0
1373-PAK(SF)	Technical Education	18 Jan 1996	60.0
1454-PAK(SF)	Second Girls Primary School (Sector)	28 Feb 1997	44.9
1493-PAK(SF)	Social Action Program Project II	8 Jan 1997	200.0
1534-PAK(SF)	Second Science Education (Sector)	7 Sep 1998	40.0

## I. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

1. In spite of impressive economic growth in the previous two decades, Pakistan in the early 1990s had some of the world's lowest social indicators. Out of 160 developing countries, Pakistan ranked 120th and suffered from widespread poverty and low quality of life. Annual population growth rate was 3.1%; infant mortality rate, 107 per 1,000 live births; life expectancy, 55 years; overall illiteracy rate, 69% (85% for women); and primary-school enrolment was very low (less than 50%), particularly for females.

2. In 1992, the Government of Pakistan (GOP) launched the Social Action Program (1992–1995) to emphasize human resource development, which is essential to promote economic development, reduce poverty, and improve social well-being. The program allocates resources for universal primary education to increase the literacy rate to about 80% by the end of the decade. GOP also adopted the National Education Policy in the 1990s. This policy reflected issues identified in the 1988 studies that strengthened the rationale for the Teacher Training Project (TTP): (i) the Asian Development Bank (ADB) Sector Study on Education, which identified the shortage of trained teachers as a major constraint on improving education; and (ii) a British Council survey of teacher education, which confirmed that the teacher training system required substantial expansion and quality improvement. A consistent theme of ADB policy dialogue was the need to increase access to education, particularly for females and in rural areas, and to improve teacher training. In 1990, ADB provided project preparatory technical assistance<sup>1</sup> (TA) to prepare a detailed proposal for the TTP. The TA findings were reviewed by principal stakeholders, policymakers, administrators, and beneficiaries at a national conference in Islamabad in 1992, and recommendations incorporated to improve the project design.

3. As envisaged at appraisal, the TTP<sup>2</sup> aimed to support the national goal to improve the quality of teacher training in all provinces as it did not measure up to international standards. The objectives of TTP included the following:

- (i) an expanded teacher training system to solve the teacher shortage, which at appraisal was estimated to reach 525,800 by 2000 (234,600 for primary schools; 96,100 for middle schools; and 195,100 for secondary schools);<sup>3</sup>
- (ii) increased access to training, especially for women in rural and disadvantaged areas, which at appraisal was available mostly to urban males;
- (iii) improved quality of teacher training programs, which at appraisal were dominated by the 9-month primary teacher certificate (PTC) training course, and the 12-month certificate of teaching (CT) course, and which, after over 25 years, had become obsolete; and
- (iv) improved planning, management, and efficiency of teacher training institutions (TTIs), which were under multiple chains of command and responsibilities at the federal and provincial levels.

4. Anticipated benefits upon project completion included the following:

- (i) training for over 160,000 teachers, of whom at least 60% would be women; staff development through overseas fellowship and in-country training for about 5,000

---

<sup>1</sup> TA 1386-PAK:Teacher Training, for \$260,000, approved on 11 October 1990.

<sup>2</sup> Loan 1210-PAK(SF):Teacher Training Project, for SDR37.373 million (\$52.10 million equivalent), approved on 15 December 1992.

<sup>3</sup> Report and Recommendation of the President for the Teacher Training Project, November 1992, Table 2, p.11.

Ministry of Education (MOE) and provincial education department (PED) senior staff and officials involved in teacher training;

- (ii) improvement of 59 TTIs; and
- (iii) establishment of six new TTIs to
  - a. increase training capacity, quality, and research;
  - b. increase access to teacher training in disadvantaged rural areas, especially for women;
  - c. improve the quality of methodologies and teaching environment in TTIs; and
  - d. strengthen planning and management.

5. At appraisal, TTP comprised the following:

- (i) **Part A.** Expansion of teacher training capacity by (a) establishing a provincial institute of teacher education (PITE) in each province, and Government College for Elementary Teachers (GCETs) for females in Punjab; (b) upgrading GCETs and establishing model GCETs; (c) upgrading and establishing training outposts (TOs); (d) providing new classrooms in GCETs, government colleges of education (GCEs), and TOs; and (e) providing civil works, equipment, furniture, vehicles, and consulting services to support project implementation.
- (ii) **Part B.** Greater access to training in rural areas and to females by establishing TOs and upgrading training units to TOs at selected (mainly female) rural high schools.
- (iii) **Part C.** Improved quality of training by overhauling teacher training curricula, supplying instructional materials and library books to training programs, providing overseas and local fellowships to trainees, and training trainers and teachers.
- (iv) **Part D.** Improvement of teacher training policy, and management and coordination of government TTIs.

6. The total project cost at appraisal was estimated at \$71.3 million. ADB provided a loan of SDR37.373 million (\$52.1 million equivalent) and GOP committed \$19.2 million for local currency costs. The loan, approved on 15 December 1992 and declared effective on 14 October 1993, was to cover the entire foreign exchange costs of \$13.5 million, and part (\$38.6 million equivalent) of the total local currency costs. The actual project cost was \$26.7 million, including \$21.4 million financed by an ADB loan and \$5.3 million by GOP. After five loan cancellations amounting to \$29.7 million, the loan account was finally closed on 18 July 2002. No major changes were made to the project scope during implementation, including the midterm review, although changes to the project schedule were required due to long delays.

## II. EVALUATION OF DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION

### A. Relevance of Design and Formulation

7. The project design and formulation were relevant. TTP, as conceived, focused on increasing access to teacher training, particularly for female teachers and trainees from rural and disadvantaged areas, by expanding teacher training facilities, as was consistent with ADB's development strategy for Pakistan and overarching objective of poverty reduction. Through its networking and linkage programs between the Federal Coordinating Unit (FCU) in Islamabad and the project implementation units (PIUs) in Lahore, Karachi, Peshawar, and Quetta, TTP promoted GOP's administrative devolution plan to improve social infrastructure and accountability at the grassroots. TTP also built upon ADB's strategy to improve the quality of

primary and secondary education in rural areas, especially for the poor. This rationale was supported by the GOP's 10-Year Development Plan (2001–11) and 3–Year Development Program (2001–04)<sup>4</sup>, which emphasized that the “low quality of education at all levels required improved standards of teachers.” The Project's continuing relevance is emphasized in the 2001 Education Sector Reforms (ESR)<sup>5</sup> strategic plan which emphasizes that “quality is the centerpiece of our education system.” ESR cited the need to strengthen PITEs and upgrade elementary teachers by improving educational qualifications, which TTP promoted through the new diploma of education (Dipl. Ed.) program and its bridging courses for PTC and CT trainees. Appendix 1 illustrates the cohesion of TTP objectives/outputs with national development goals/policies.

8. TTP was implemented as a systemic whole for teacher training, comprising a network of TTIs ranging from the provinces (with PITEs at the apex), to the districts (with upgraded GCETs and GCEs), to the lowest administrative units (union councils), operating through the TOs. The institutional interrelationships were driven by the new 3–year Dipl. Ed. program (Appendix 2). Overseeing this network was to be the systematic improvement of decentralized project and institutional management implementation, supported by a wide range of institution-building activities. The network was designed to deliver teacher training with reputable national institutions in three ways: (i) improved formal education systems for traditional institutions, through the PITEs, GCETs, and GCEs; (ii) nonformal education, through the Aga Khan University and other public and private TTIs; and (iii) distance education, through Allama Iqbal Open University and Pakistan Television.

9. The TA, implemented in 1991, was also relevant and properly designed. It adopted a highly participatory planning process involving all project participants in the four provinces. The TA developed a needs-based and sound project design, which met the approval of stakeholders; was highly appreciated by GOP, MOE, and PEDs; and allowed training of primary and secondary-school teachers to be significantly upgraded.

## **B. Project Outputs**

10. Part A: Capacity Expansion. This included establishing a PITE in 4 provinces and two new model GCETs for females in Punjab; upgrading of eight GCETs to model GCETs; establishing 66 TOs (34 new, 32 old); and providing 157 classrooms, equipment, furniture, vehicles, and consulting services.

11. The civil works planned were completed, except for a few GCETs in Sindh and the increased provision of classrooms, within the cost estimates. The Midterm Review Mission approved the reallocation of loan funds to strengthen the PITEs and finance the cost of related hostels for teachers and trainees and staff residences in Balochistan that had not been included in the original design. Identification of project sites for PITE was delayed up to 4 years due to Government authorities' indecision, resulting in delayed acquisition or construction of buildings in Punjab, North-West Frontier Province (NWFP), and Sindh; and late implementation of associated components, particularly procurement of equipment, staff salaries of personnel in the new institutions, operation and maintenance, academic training programs, and other capacity-building activities. In general, the physical infrastructure was completed only after ADB had approved two extensions to project completion. However, Balochistan established the physical

<sup>4</sup> 10-Year Perspective Development Plan (2001-11) and 3-Year Development Program (2001-04). Planning Commission, Government of Pakistan, September 2001.

<sup>5</sup> Education Sector Reforms, Strategic Plan (2001-04), Ministry of Education, December 2001.

infrastructure efficiently and on time because (i) the PITE site was acquired early and the PITE building completed on schedule; (ii) the long tenure of the project director and project manager ensured continuity throughout important stages of project implementation; and (iii) a cooperative and prompt approval process existed between PIU, PITE, and the PED secretary. In spite of delays in completing the planned civil works, the other PITEs and PIUs performed commendably in accomplishing the planned outputs or activities under their direct responsibility.

12. In general, the PIUs completed as planned the procurement of furniture, laboratory equipment, office equipment, and vehicles. However, the provinces received only five of seven packages of electronic media equipment for PITEs due to late procurement by FCU. The equipment intended for audiovisual studios, for various reasons, remains unutilized as operators lack training and the PITEs have no studios. ADB is working with the executing agency (EA) to help ensure the equipment is made operational. In Sindh, furniture, equipment, and other facilities were not provided to PITE under TTP due to limited funds under Planning Commission Proforma 1 (PC-1). The provincial government is seeking to address this shortcoming.

13. **Part B: Increased Accessibility.** This increased access mainly for women and rural areas by upgrading 32 training units to TOs in Punjab and building new TOs at 34 secondary high schools in Sindh, Balochistan, and NWFP.

14. The Project provided 218 new classrooms, including 67 in old and new TOs. Initial enrolment indicate a slow but steady increase in female admissions, mainly in rural areas, to the new 3-year Dipl. Ed. program. The new PITEs and TOs, supplemented by GCETs and GCEs, are implementing the 3-year test-piloting of the Dipl. Ed., which, after evaluation, will be recommended for introduction in all TTIs under the control of the Bureau of Curriculum and Education Extension Center (BCEECs). Following formal adoption of the Dipl. Ed. program, a professional career ladder will be established for teachers for the first time. The institutions are operational and generally well staffed.

15. In the PITEs, GCETs, and GCEs male students are generally predominant, although female students are increasing. In some institutions, females already have a higher rate of internal efficiency due to higher retention rates. In the TOs, females tend to outnumber males who have commenced in-service training. Of the 30,700 teachers who have enrolled in Dipl. Ed, 21,110 are females and 9,590 males. Should this trend continue, the male-dominated teaching profession may become female dominant in the near future. As part of NWFP's austerity campaign, PED reduced the number of GCETs from 31 to 20 and plans to reduce it further to 7 by consolidating the male and female GCETs. As a result, there is a temporary surplus of trained teachers.

16. **Part C: Quality Improvement.** This improved the quality of curricula, including the development and provision of instructional materials, supply of library reference books, overseas and local fellowships, and training for trainers.

17. The new 3-year Dipl. Ed. is a silent "quality revolution," which is expected to replace the PTC and CT and significantly upgrade in-service and preservice teacher training. Teacher training programs developed by PITE include the "10 + 3" and "12 + 1.5" models that are being pilot-tested in the GCETs and PITEs. The Dipl. Ed. pilot program began in 1999 under the "10 + 3" model consists of grades 1–10, plus 3 years under the Dipl. Ed. course. The second model, "12 + 1.5" model, consists of primary and secondary education, plus 2 years of intermediate education [equivalent to 2 years of college] plus 1.5 years of the Dipl. Ed. course. A policy is

being developed to allow graduates of the Dipl. Ed. program to be promoted to grades 12–14 with increased salary, 5–year tenure, and prospective appointments to specific schools. This should dramatically change enrolment trends in primary education: in other countries, the presence of female teachers, especially in grades 1–2, strengthens retention and completion rates in primary education and nurtures children's interest in learning. Further details of the Dipl. Ed program and curriculum are given in Appendix 2.

18. Approximately 138,500 managers and staff of project-related institutions, master trainers, teachers, and administrators have completed needs-based training, in-country and abroad. PITE in NWFP is at the forefront of developing the Dipl. Ed. program, having established the first model in 1999 and the second shortly after. The program will have the first PITE graduates by 2002. In NWFP, 14,612 teachers have finished in-service training; 1,038 completed in-country fellowships; 170 master trainers have undergone advance training; and 18 senior staff completed their overseas training. In Punjab, preservice training programs developed by PITE include (i) a "10 + 3" model being piloted in four GCETs, (ii) a "12 + 2" model, and (iii) a "14 + 1" model. Furthermore, 93,130 teachers have finished in-service training; 400 have completed in-country fellowships; 678 master trainers have undergone advance training; and 33 have trained abroad. Draft modules (38 for science, Pakistan studies, and mathematics) have been completed in curriculum workshops but have not yet been tested in the classroom.

19. The frequent changes in PITE directorship in Punjab (seven project directors were appointed in 1993-2001) and lack of skilled staff severely weakened academic programs. In Balochistan, 8,000 staff finished in-service training; 226 master trainers finished advanced courses; 14 received fellowships abroad; and 121 modules have been prepared and are awaiting final review. In Sindh, 19,465 completed in-service training; 256 finished in-country fellowships; 440 master trainers took advance training; and 21 received fellowships abroad. Sindh PITE developed 10 instructional modules and 6 research projects, as required.

20. Of the 21 textbooks to be prepared, 12 for Dipl. Ed. ("10 + 3" model) have been completed; 3 are being printed; and 6 are being edited. All local books have been purchased and some of the foreign books have been acquired. MOE is seeking additional financial assistance to complete the printing of textbooks. GOP and ADB are working together to make the printing equipment operational, so that all 21 textbooks will be completed. Moreover, more than 200 modules have been printed, including 50 modules in Punjab for science, mathematics, and English; 11 in NWFP; 27 in Sindh; and 121 in Balochistan, in addition to FCU-developed materials. A committee, established in Technical Panel on Teacher Education (TPTE), helped the PITEs or PIUs review and evaluate the instructional materials. The provinces also set up their own panels of academics and curricula specialists to review the modules and new curricula. In NWFP, a Monitoring and Assessment Cell was set up to evaluate student performance.

21. All 28 planned research projects were satisfactorily completed and discussed at a national conference in Islamabad. The studies are rich in primary data and useful for policy analysis by TPTE and PEDs. The provinces, however, could not send more participants for training abroad because FCU did not approve phase 2 on time. The design, development, and production of instructional materials were not completed due to delays by FCU in arranging the bidding and evaluation process of the remaining modules, with payments to be made by PIUs. Due to FCU's inaction, the remaining modules were not finalized.

22. **Part D: Improved Management and Coordination.** This component improved teacher training management and coordination of TTIs by establishing a TPTE, FCU in Islamabad, and PIUs in the 4 provinces; and training principals and staff of MOE, PEDs, and BCEECs.

23. Under TTP, teacher training management and coordination were improved by the establishment of TPTE in the Curriculum Wing of MOE; and by the in-house and training abroad for human resource development of staff in the Curriculum Wing, FCU, PIUs, MOE, and PEDs, and of principals of TTIs. However, the lack of adequate staff in TPTE prevented it from helping the Curriculum Wing advise provincial TTIs on policy formulation, development plans, and the establishment of teacher training standards. An effective benefit monitoring system and Teacher Education Management Information System (TEMIS), while established, were not implemented in all provinces. These activities should be strengthened with the assistance of TPTE.

24. Capacity building was generally satisfactory in terms of the PIUs' direct responsibilities, including in-service training, library and reference books, research and evaluation studies, and staff development. The TEMIS master plan was prepared by the international consultant who also conducted a 2-week training session in NWFP. TEMIS operates only in NWFP and Balochistan. The international consultant for teacher training curriculum and material development also prepared a manual for operations for TOs. After the ADB Midterm Review in 1998, GOP recruited a chief technical adviser (CTA) for six months. The CTA consulted with the directors of PITEs in the provinces, jointly producing with them a PITE manual of operations and helping complete 28 research projects and convene the interministerial meeting of secretaries to consider the Dipl. Ed. program.

25. During appraisal, TTP followed a participatory process of planning and development with stakeholders not only to build awareness of the purpose and benefits of TTP but also to generate a sense of co-ownership. ADB and consultants conducted research surveys, field interviews, and workshops with stakeholders in all provinces, culminating in a national conference in Islamabad. Preliminary drafts of the Dipl. Ed. curriculum contents, teaching and learning materials and methodologies, and assessment tools were reviewed in consultative meetings held over three years with all stakeholders. However, during project implementation, stakeholders' involvement was not adequate due to a lack of familiarity or training of senior managers of the FCU and TPTE, and PITEs or PIUs in the tools and techniques of participatory management and social marketing.

26. The Project Completion Report (PCR) Mission prepared a comparative analysis of planned and actual outputs (Appendix 3). A project framework was not prepared at appraisal. Implementation progress was normally satisfactory. However, it was rated partly satisfactory in 1997, due to delays in civil works and failure to submit timely audited/progress reports to ADB.

### **C. Project Costs and Financing**

27. The project cost at appraisal was estimated at \$71.3 million equivalent, including taxes and duties, of which the foreign exchange cost was \$13.5 million (19%) and local currency cost \$57.8 million (81%) equivalent. The ADB loan amounting to \$52.1 million (73% of the total project cost) was envisaged to finance the entire foreign exchange costs of TTP (including \$1.6 million for service charges during implementation), and \$38.6 million equivalent to finance part of the local currency costs. The Government was estimated to contribute \$19.2 million (27% of the estimated total project cost) to finance the remainder of the local currency costs, which was equivalent to PRs475 million under the original PC-1 and was fully utilized.

28. The actual project cost at completion was \$26.7 million, comprising \$7.3 million (27%) in foreign exchange costs and \$19.4 million (73%) equivalent in local currency costs. Of the actual project cost, the ADB loan financed \$21.4 million (80%), and GOP, \$5.3 million (20%). Details of the variations in TTP's actual and estimated foreign and local costs are in Appendixes 4 and 5.

29. The main reasons for the lower-than-expected costs were (i) the severe depreciation of the local currency (about PRs25:\$1 at appraisal to PRs48:\$1 during project implementation, and PRs60:\$1 during PCR), resulting in substantial savings in foreign exchange; (ii) overestimation of some project cost items at appraisal, particularly price and physical contingencies, which amounted to 24% of the Project's base costs; (iii) delays in site selection and, therefore, construction of project buildings and facilities, which led to deferred procurement of vehicles, electronic media equipment, preparation of the audio and television studios, and provision of operation & maintenance expenses, including staff salaries; and (iv) reduction in project scope, e.g., cancellation of instructional material development and some capacity-building activities.

#### **D. Disbursement**

30. Total disbursement on TTP was \$26.7 million, including \$21.4 million from the loan and \$5.3 million from government funding. Disbursement from the loan amounted to 41% of the original loan, comprising \$7.3 million in foreign exchange costs and \$14.1 million in local currency costs. The GOP disbursed \$5.3 million for local currency costs. Due to the severe depreciation of the rupee versus the dollar, there were five loan cancellations during project implementation, amounting to about \$29.7 million, including the unutilized loan amount of \$5.3 million that was cancelled after the PCR Mission to close the account. The loan account was left open to allow for liquidation of remaining funds and balances in the imprest accounts of Sindh, NWFP, and Punjab, and was finally closed on 18 July 2002. Cumulative actual disbursements from May 1994 to July 2002, by quarter and loan, are in Appendixes 6 and 7.

31. PITE or PIU of Balochistan disbursed \$3.7 million or 85% of the original loan to the province. The other provinces disbursed about 33% of their original loan amounts. During the PCR Mission, arrangements were made to complete processing of withdrawal applications to ADB where applicable and to close the imprest accounts. The GOP commitment of \$19.4 million for local currency costs such as project implementation and incremental recurrent costs for PIU and the new institutions far exceeded the actual disbursement of \$5.3 million equivalent. The substantial variation was due to depreciation of the rupee and delays in land acquisition and civil works construction, which delayed recruitment of PIU and institution staff, resulting in lower disbursement on salaries, operation and maintenance, office equipment, electronic media equipment, laboratory facilities, and furniture due to lack of time.

32. Five imprest accounts were established, one in each province and one in FCU, to ensure timely disbursement and efficient project implementation in accordance with ADB's *Guidelines on Imprest Fund and Statement of Expenditures Procedures*. The amounts deposited were based on project quarterly expenditures and anticipated monthly withdrawals. The disbursement schedule and arrangements made at appraisal were reasonable. In general, disbursement from the imprest funds was slow during project implementation and did not improve despite two project completion extensions to December 2000. PITE or PIU of Balochistan was the exception as utilization of the imprest accounts increased during project implementation from a ratio of about 1 in 1995 to over 2 in 1998–2000. FCUs and PIUs did not disburse funds under advance procurement although the facility could have been used to

reimburse GOP for costs of furniture, office equipment and vehicles, and salaries of PIU staff procured/paid from November 1992 to October 1993. FCU and PIUs did not avail themselves of advance procurement because they were not familiar with the facility and failed to submit to ADB the relevant withdrawal applications for reimbursement. The EAs and ADB review missions could have been more proactive to ensure that advance action and retroactive financing were fully utilized.

## **E. Project Schedule**

33. The loan was approved on 15 December 1992, and signed on 29 March 1993. The original date of loan effectiveness was 27 June 1993, but the loan became effective on 14 October 1993, as more time was needed to comply with the conditions precedent to loan effectiveness. TTP was expected to be implemented over 5.5 years, with physical completion by 30 June 1998, and loan closing by 31 December 1998. However, significant delays were caused mainly by (i) late site selection of PITEs in Punjab, Sindh, and NWFP, which, in turn, set back procurement of equipment, furniture, recruitment of staff, and operation and maintenance; and (ii) late decisions by FCU on fellowships abroad, curriculum and instructional material development, consultancy services, and procurement of electronic media equipment. TTP was extended twice for a total of 24 months at the request of GOP, initially to complete the physical infrastructure, in-service and training abroad, and other institution-strengthening activities, and subsequently to try and complete the capacity-building activities for the PITEs and the instructional material development. Ultimately, the civil works, in-service training, and other capacity-building activities were generally completed, but not installation of the electronic media equipment and related operational training and printing of the remaining textbooks for Dipl. Ed. A comparison of scheduled and actual project implementation is in Appendix 8.

## **F. Implementation Arrangements**

34. As envisaged, project implementation was organized around five EAs, one at the federal level and one in each province. MOE's Curriculum Wing served as overall EA, and the MOE secretary was responsible for overall planning and supervision of TTP. The Teacher Education Development Steering Committee chaired by the MOE secretary, was responsible for policy formulation and monitoring and evaluation of TTP. In the provinces, the PED through its Implementing Agency (IA)—BCEEC, was the project EA. In each province, the PED secretary was responsible for overall supervision and implementation of the project components. Each province was to establish a provincial coordinating council (PCC) chaired by the PED secretary. TTP built new structures upon this existing layer.

35. Project implementation involved too many administrative layers linked to the overly centralized administrative structure in the federal ministry and PEDs which generally failed to help IAs operate effectively and efficiently. The situation was complicated by weak management supervision and control by FCU and PIUs. In Punjab, PCC was not established during project implementation, thereby denying TTP effective supervision and guidance by the PIU. Capacity building suffered from uneven and irregular training, lack of systems manuals of operations, incomplete TEMIS and Benefit Monitoring and Evaluation (BME), and ineffective networking and decentralization. The Punjab experience confirmed the need to consider granting full authority and responsibility to the provincial PIU without the need for an FCU.

36. In general, project implementation delays were caused or exacerbated by FCU's failure to (i) manage and supervise PIUs; (ii) closely monitor and coordinate project activities; (iii)

procure what was needed on time; (iv) properly supervise the consulting firms; (v) coordinate the participatory processes and activities during project implementation; and (vi) fully implement the training abroad. FCU was unable to complete the development and printing of instructional materials for the Dipl. Ed program; installation of the electronic media equipment; and training of the operators, and to issue a contract variation for a reduction in the consultants man-months as agreed in September 1996. FCU also failed to prevent and correct disbursement delays during project implementation and to unite and coordinate the various project stakeholders and institutions. Yet, PITE or PIU of Balochistan and NWFP generally completed their project-related activities efficiently and on time.

37. Better project management, supervision, and planning by the FCU and PIUs could have helped reduce the delays caused by (i) frequent turnover of PIU project directors and project managers; (ii) ineffective training in project management, procurement, project accounting and auditing, capacity building, and quality development; (iii) lack of management skills, including failure of project staff and some consultants to prepare operations manuals, handbooks, and guidelines for staff to ensure standards, consistency of practices, and benchmarking; (iv) general absence of TEMIS and BME, with TEMIS operating only in NWFP and Balochistan, creating problems arising from lack of baseline data, benchmarks, and internal project statistics; and (v) the late recruitment and fielding of consultants.

#### **G. Conditions and Covenants**

38. In general, EAs and IAs complied with the loan covenants prepared at appraisal (Appendix 9). Due to the federal and provincial governments' lack of funds, the following covenants were only partly complied with: (i) equitable provision of allowances for urban and rural teachers, (ii) introduction of financial incentives for teachers and master trainers, (iii) draft regulations for the establishment and operation of TTIs in the private sector with the sponsorship of a government education foundation, and (iv) establishment of a PCC in Punjab. In Balochistan, stipends and allowances to trainee teachers were provided although delayed, and a draft PC-1 on establishing TTIs in the private sector was submitted to the PCR Mission. ADB needs to monitor compliance with the policy-related covenants.

39. The EA satisfactorily followed reporting procedures and prepared and submitted a PCR to ADB. Audited financial statements, project accounts, and the auditor's report were generally submitted to ADB on time and in accordance with sound auditing standards. The PCR Mission reviewed with the director of audit the outstanding audit observations and queries relating mainly to delayed or breached procedural matters. TPTE and ADB had earlier answered these queries. The PCR Mission, TPTE, and director of audit also prepared an action plan to respond to them. The PCR Mission gave TPTE helpful suggestions on 14 June 2002, and requested MOE and TPTE to answer the remaining queries.

#### **H. Consultant Recruitment and Procurement**

40. Six international and six domestic consultants, as specified at appraisal, were selected and engaged by GOP in accordance with ADB's *Guidelines on the Use of Consultants*. The terms of reference (TOR) of the consultants specified postings at the FCU and PIUs to help TPTE, PITEs, and PIUs develop curriculums, courses, educational technology, and materials; and prepare TEMIS and BME. The consultants were fielded from 1995 to 1999, and utilized a total of 207 person-months compared to the planned 300. Due to delays in project implementation, the Midterm Review Mission recommended in 1998 that the Government recruit

a project management specialist for each PIU and CTA for FCU to strengthen project management and supervision and expedite project implementation. The CTA was appointed but the GOP neglected to engage the project management specialists who could have improved the rate of project implementation at the provincial level. All procurement, mainly local competitive bidding, was undertaken in accordance with ADB's *Guidelines for Procurement*.

### **I. Performance of Consultants, Contractors, and Suppliers**

41. The consultants started late due to delays in their engagement; some were terminated early due to unsatisfactory performance. Overall, the output of consultants was generally not satisfactory. This was due to errors in their selection, difficulties in reconciling work schedules, failure to clearly understand expected outputs and schedules, weak monitoring and supervision by the consulting firms and FCU and PIUs, inappropriate expenditures, and the lack of attention by ADB review missions' to closely monitor the consultants' outputs (compared to their TOR) and recommend remedial action in a timely manner. This could have helped the consultants complete their work programs and planned outputs such as the curriculum and instructional materials development. In general, the consultants failed to establish a participatory and cohesive work environment in FCU, TPTE, PITEs, and PIUs, and generate a sense of project ownership among domestic experts, project entities, managers and staff, and beneficiaries. The consultants' outputs were inadequate and incomplete. The performance of civil works contractors and suppliers of equipment, vehicles, library books, and instructional materials was generally satisfactory. A recent policy decision by GOP to adopt only ADB's procurement guidelines will make procurement less cumbersome and time consuming in future.

### **J. Performance of the Borrower and the Executing Agency**

42. In general, the performance of the GOP and EAs was satisfactory as they complied or partly complied with the loan covenants, cooperated well with project entities and ADB missions, and coordinated well with other project agencies. Overall, the performance of TPTE, PIUs, and PITEs was also satisfactory as they efficiently accomplished most of their assigned tasks and direct responsibilities.

43. However, the performance of FCU was unsatisfactory due to its weak or inadequate project leadership, monitoring, evaluation, and supervision of consultants, participatory management, TEMIS and BME programs to provide baseline data and improve decision making, frequent turnover of project director and project manager; delays to or non-implementation of centralized activities such as overseas training, curriculum and instructional material development; institutionalization of TPTE; and failure to change PC-1 in accordance with the Loan Agreement and changes in the project implementation plan. FCU failed to fully utilize the 2-year extension to complete implementation of outstanding project activities, in particular to provide effective training in curricula design, training and assessment methodologies, especially in the configuration and management of electronic media equipment and production of audio visual materials, and installation of equipment for the studio operations in PITEs. As a result, media equipment and facilities and studio dens are still not being utilized. Finally, FCU and TPTE neglected to maximize networking arrangements with Allama Iqbal Open University (for distance education and audiovisual materials), Academy of Educational Planning and Management (for staff and material development), and Aga Khan University (for nonformal education) to institutionalize formal, nonformal, and distance education for teacher training.

## **K. Performance of the Asian Development Bank**

44. ADB generally handled approval, disbursement, and related project procedures efficiently and on time. Fourteen review missions were conducted from 1995 to 2001. Although adequate staff time was provided for review missions, field supervision of project activities to help FCU and PIUs solve their problems, given the complexity of the umbrella-type design of the project, could have been more effective. For example, the review missions could have promoted closer cooperation between the EAs (MOE and PEDs) and IAs (PIUs) led by FCU, which did not properly coordinate and implement the project components adequately or on time. The review missions could have recommended closer supervision of the consultants who stationed themselves in Islamabad rather than in the provinces as required under the TOR. During project implementation, the review missions could also have recommended further training of FCU and PIU staff in ADB's procurement and disbursement procedures to expedite completion of project components, and advised EAs to have funds reimbursed under advance action and retroactive financing. The EAs said that the review missions could have been more supportive of finalizing outstanding project activities, particularly during the extensions to project completion. ADB's performance was considered partly satisfactory.

## **III. EVALUATION OF PERFORMANCE**

### **A. Relevance**

45. TTP as designed and implemented supported the strategic thrusts to improve the quality of teacher training and strengthen the "literacy for all" movement. These were objectives and priorities in (i) the Memorandum of Understanding- Country Strategy Program Mission, ADB and GOP, 22 March 2002; (ii) 10-Year Perspective Development Plan (2001–11) and 3-Year Development Program (2001–04), Planning Commission, GOP, September 2001; and (iii) ESRs, Strategic Plan (2001–04), MOE, GOP, 2001. Policymakers agreed that the improved teacher training work force would be the mainstay of education reforms. The reforms to the quality of teacher training to meet the country's human development requirements were highly justified, although not all project components were fully implemented. The project design is rated as relevant.<sup>6</sup>

### **B. Efficacy in Achievement of Purpose**

46. In general, TTP accomplished its overall objectives of capacity expansion and increased access to training, as well as intermediate and long-term goals of pre-service quality through the Dipl. Ed. course. Consistent with the targets, the physical infrastructure was practically all completed and more classrooms were constructed than planned. However, specific objectives such as the provision and installation of electronic media equipment and laboratory equipment, vehicles, furniture, curriculum and instructional material development, in-service training, and TEMIS and BME were partly accomplished. Through the new PITEs, TOs, and GCETs the planned development of management and coordination of teacher training subsector was improved. TTP is assessed as partly efficacious.<sup>6</sup> Details of planned versus actual achievements by components and province are shown in Appendix 3.

---

<sup>6</sup> A quantitative assessment of the Project was computed as follows: (i) relevant (2x20%=0.40); (ii) partly efficacious (1x25%=0.25); less than efficient (1x20%=0.20); (iv) sustainable (2x20%=0.40). Institutional development was partly successful (1x15%=0.15). Total score of 1.40 = partly successful.

### **C. Efficiency in Achievement of Outputs and Purpose**

47. The specific objectives of TTP were partly achieved. The objectives of establishing physical infrastructure and increased access were either largely accomplished or moving in the right direction. The 3-year Dipl. Ed. program, which is being tested nationwide, will raise the academic standard of primary and secondary-school teaching and result in more advanced teaching methods, and better employment prospects, image, and professional career for teachers. The Dipl. Ed. models, which are in their pilot phase, indicate qualitative improvements in terms of higher enrolments and retention of females in rural areas, and lower drop-out rates. However, no solid empirical evidence is available at this early stage. Teacher training was partly achieved: over 138,500 mainly women teachers benefited through local training and 95 through fellowships abroad. The objective of improving the quality of teacher training through curriculum reform, and textbook and instructional material development was not fully achieved. No economic evaluation or cost-effectiveness analysis was attempted at appraisal nor during the PCR mission. TTP is considered to be less than efficient.

### **D. Preliminary Assessment of Sustainability**

48. The National Education Policy seeks to increase GOP's budgetary allocation for education, normally about 3% of gross national product. Teacher training gets about 2% of the education budget. TTP is likely to be sustainable considering the institutionalized budgetary provisions for the four PITEs by the PEDs in the latest GOP 5-year plan. PED's budget provisions for recurrent expenditures of PITEs and TPTE have been approved and included in the Annual Development Programme budgets of GOP for FY2002-04. The ESR also accords priority to and provides budgetary support for ongoing in-service teacher training through PITEs. ADB and the World Bank routinely include in-service teacher training through PITES, TTIs, and TOs, all of which will help to sustain TTP.

### **E. Environmental, Sociocultural, and Other Impacts**

49. TTP did not have any adverse environmental or socio-cultural impacts. In terms of institutional capacity strengthening, including the development of management capacity in the new institutions, the Project had a significant beneficial impact by increasing the number of academic institutions and access thereto and improving teacher training facilities and methods. However, due to the weak performance of FCU, the delay to fully install and train staff in TEMIS that weakened the monitoring and evaluation systems; and the failure to complete the in-country and overseas training program as designed, institutional development is partly satisfactory.

## **IV. OVERALL ASSESSMENT AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

### **A. Overall Assessment**

50. Overall, TTP is rated partly successful. TTP accomplished: (i) its targets for physical infrastructure, although delayed; (ii) an early positive enrolment trend in favor of women from rural areas into the Project Institutions; (iii) the basis for long-term quality improvement of primary and secondary teacher training through the introduction on a pilot basis of the Dipl. Ed. program; and (iv) a major impact by benefiting about 138,500 teachers through in-service and overseas training programs, including about 3,200 senior staff from MOE and PEDs involved in teacher training programs. The latter training program achievements were below appraisal targets. Moreover, TTP suffered from long delays in completing the civil works components and

weak project management and supervision by FCU which led to delays in the completion of training and underutilization of loan funds for capacity building, consultants and procurement of furniture, vehicles, and equipment.

## **B. Lessons Learned**

51. Due to the failure of FCU to properly supervise and coordinate project activities, particularly at the provincial level, such umbrella-type project management should be discontinued and replaced largely by a decentralized system led by PITEs or PIUs and coordinated by TPTE. Due to the high turnover of project directors and project managers, the appointment of deputy project managers from external candidates with strong project management experience would help maintain continuity of project supervision. During appraisal, ADB staff should ensure that project cost estimates are calculated accurately. FCU failed to revise the original PC-1 in accordance with changes in the project implementation plan and loan agreement. This omission could have been resolved at appraisal through the parallel development of the loan agreement and PC-1. In future, PC-1s should be revised as required during the midterm review. At the outset a social marketing campaign could have raised awareness among intended rural female students and parents and the existing teaching force. Closer supervision by FCU, the consulting firms, and ADB review missions could have improved the outputs of the international and domestic consultants.

## **C. Recommendations**

### **1. General**

52. To ensure the future sustainability and autonomy of the fledgling TTIs, GOP needs to nurture and promote them by providing further training in-service and abroad relevant to the Dipl. Ed programs.

53. Project implementation could be further strengthened by decentralizing project management and supervision at the provincial level while maintaining a minor role of project coordination at the federal level. Staff in the various IAs and PIUs should be provided with more intensive training in project implementation, including technical, procurement, disbursement, project accounting, problem solving techniques, and reporting and documentation. A full or part-time deputy project manager could provide institutional memory if the project director or project manager are changed frequently and assist in conducting the updated training seminars in project implementation.

### **2. Project Specific**

54. GOP should ensure that adequate annual budgetary allocations are provided for recurrent expenditures of the new project-related institutions, including funding for maintenance and repairs of the new PITEs and related buildings, beyond FY2004; instructional materials development, and staff training; and traveling allowances for staff to attend seminars and workshops and to evaluate teacher training courses in the TOs.

55. Full support by GOP is needed for continuous capacity building of PITEs, GCETs, and TOs to sustain the early initiatives of the Dipl. Ed. program and nurture the quality development and sustainability of the project institutions. Following completion of the pilot phase and

evaluation of the Dipl. Ed. program, GOP should implement the program on a permanent basis to replace PTC and CT.

56. To allow GOP to complete outstanding activities as shown in the action plan below, it is proposed that the Project Performance Audit Review should be undertaken in 2004 to further assess TTP's operational performance and development impact.

<b>Action Plan</b>		
<b>Outstanding Activity</b>	<b>Responsible Agencies</b>	<b>Proposed Action</b>
Institutionalize the Dipl. Ed. program and professional career ladder for teachers	Federal and provincial governments	The policy should be approved by the federal and provincial governments.
Institutionalize incentives in teacher training to elevate Dipl. Ed. graduate salaries to grades 12-14, stipends for trainees, and rewards for scholastic performance	Federal and provincial governments	The measures should be approved by the federal and provincial governments.
Install audiovisual electronic equipment; train staff to use it	TPTE and PITEs	GOP and ADB are working together to make the equipment operational.
Print remaining nine textbooks for the Dipl. Ed. program	MOE and PITEs	GOP and ADB are working together to make the equipment operational.
Draw up a policy framework for active participation of TTIs in the private sector	MOE and PITEs	The measure should be approved by the federal and provincial governments.
Develop instructional materials	PITEs/TPTE/AIOU/PTV	AIOU should be engaged. Funds should be provided under ESR.
Establish a computer laboratory in each PITE	PITEs and MOST	The activity is to be funded under ESR. MOST will provide computer/trainers.
Resolution of outstanding FCU account audit queries.	MOE/TPTE/Director of audit	TPTE will submit responses/documents to the director of audit for regularization/condonation.
Completely install TEMIS/BME in two PITEs	TPTE/PITEs in Sindh, Punjab	TPTE will ensure that systems are implemented.

**COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF TEACHER TRAINING PROJECT WITH  
NATIONAL POLICY AND PLANNING STRATEGIES**

<b>OBJECTIVES AT APPRAISAL</b>	<b>INTENDED RESULTS</b>
1. Teacher Training Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Capacity expansion of TT system</li> <li>2. Increased access for rural female students</li> <li>3. Improved quality of TT programs</li> <li>4. Upgraded planning, management, and efficiency of TT</li> </ol>
2. 10-Year Development Plan (2001–11) and 3-Year Development Program (2001–04)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Improved literacy rate</li> <li>2. Education for all</li> <li>3. Improved participation rate in secondary education</li> <li>4. Quality education</li> </ol>
3. National Education Policy (1992)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Acknowledgement of the acute shortage of trained teachers and their critical role in universalizing primary education</li> <li>2. Reform of teacher training to allow recruitment of women for primary-school teaching</li> <li>3. Implementation through the Teacher Training Project</li> </ol>
4. Education Sector Reforms Action Plan (2001–04)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Teacher education/training and professional development</li> <li>2. Revision of curriculum</li> <li>3. Networking with PITEs</li> <li>4. Upgrading of elementary-school teachers by improving educational qualifications through bridging courses</li> </ol>
5. Country Strategy Plan	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Priority areas include primary education (particularly for rural girls), secondary education (priority for rural girls), and recruitment and deployment of trained teachers with focus on females in rural areas</li> <li>2. Incorporation of these factors in the project design and implementation scheme</li> </ol>
6. Sector Study on Education in Pakistan	The study concluded that lack of trained teachers is the major constraint in achieving education goals. Demand/supply analysis confirmed that TT system required substantial expansion and quality improvement.

## THE NEW DIPLOMA IN EDUCATION

1. Before the Teacher Training Project (TTP) was initiated, a primary teacher certificate (PTC, 10.5 months) was required for primary-school teachers. It was the responsibility of the provincial education departments (PEDs). For middle schools, a certificate of teaching (10.5 months) was required. It was the responsibility of the boards for intermediate and secondary education. The new diploma in education (Dipl. Ed.) is common to all teachers in primary and middle schools and has many implications: heavy costs, greatly enhanced status of teachers, and increased instructional capability of teachers who will have completed the Dipl. Ed. in 3 years after grade 10. After 3 years of intensive consultation with academic peers and administrators throughout the country, the new program was submitted and approved by the Curriculum Wing of Ministry of Education (MOE), then for further review and approval to the committee composed of the chairs of the boards for intermediate and secondary education, and finally to the Interprovincial Conference of Education Ministers. In 1999, the Dipl. Ed. was approved for 3-year pilot-testing in the TTPs' new and old project Institutions: provincial institutes of teacher education (PITEs), government colleges of elementary teachers (GCETs), government colleges of education (GCEs), and the rural-based training outposts (TOs).
  
2. The Dipl. Ed. may be obtained either through a 3-year program after 10 years ("10 + 3") or through a 1-year program after F.A. or F.Sc. ("12 + 1"). The goal of the Dipl. Ed. is to replace primary teacher certificate and certificate of teaching, making the Dipl. Ed. acceptable as a preservice training course up to international standards. It will give equal status to all teachers of the elementary level (grades 1–8), providing them a professional ladder of opportunity commensurate with their responsibilities and vital to the growth of quality education.
  
3. The Dipl. Ed.'s curriculum includes the following:
  - (i) Theory and History of Education in Pakistan
  - (ii) Child Development and Learning
  - (iii) School Organization and Classroom Management
  - (iv) Testing Evaluation and Basics of Research
  - (v) Curriculum and Instruction
  - (vi) Teaching of English
  - (vii) Methodology and Content
  - (viii) Subject Matter
  - (ix) Teaching of Social/Pakistan Studies
  - (x) Teaching of Sindhi (as an example of language teaching)
  - (xi) Teaching of Mathematics and Science
  - (xii) Teaching of Islamiat: Arabic
  - (xiii) Teaching of Arts and Crafts
  - (xiv) Teaching of Home Economics
  - (xv) Teaching of Agriculture
  - (xvi) Computer Science
  - (xvii) Teaching of Industrial Arts Teaching of Calligraphy

**PLANNED AND ACTUAL KEY PROJECT OUTPUTS BY COMPONENT AND BY PROVINCE**

Activity	Balochistan		North-West Frontier Province		Punjab		Sindh		Federal		Total	
	Planned	Actual	Planned	Actual	Planned	Actual	Planned	Actual	Planned	Actual	Planned	Actual
<b>Part A: Expansion of Teacher Training Subsector</b>												
<b>Enrolment Capacity</b>												
- New PITE	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	-	-	4	4
- Upgraded GCETs	-	-	12	12	25	25	12	8	-	-	49	45
- Model GCETs	-	-	2	2	4	4	2	2	-	-	8	8
- Upgraded GCEs	-	-	-	-	7	7	3	3	-	-	10	10
- New GCETs for Girls	-	-	-	-	2	2	-	-	-	-	2	2
- Number of classrooms	12	38	26	59	88	88	31	33	-	-	157	218
<b>Part B: Increased Access to the Teacher Training Subsector by Rural Females</b>												
- New Training Outposts	-	1	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1
- Upgraded Training Outposts	12	12	10	10	32	32	12	12	-	-	66	66
- Equipment:												
(i) Electronic Media Equipment	7	5	7	5	7	5	7	5	-	-	28	20
(ii) Laboratory Equipment		Procured		Procured		Procured		Procured	-	-	0	0
(iii) Vehicles	3	3	3	3	5	1	1	1	-	-	12	8
(iv) Mobile Vans	1	1	-	-	-	-	1	1	-	-	2	2
(v) Furniture		Procured		0Procured		Procured		Procured	-	-	0	0
<b>Part C: Improved Quality of Teacher Training Subsector Inputs</b>												
- Instructional Materials (72 packages) <sup>a</sup>		121	13	11		50	24	27	-	-	37	209
- Library Materials for Resource Centers for TTIs		Procured		Procured		Procured		Procured	-	-	0	0
- Overseas Training	15	14	20	18	35	33	25	21	5	9	100	95
- In-Country Training Programs	375	226	1,038	1,208	2,230	1,078	1,342	696	15	15	5,000	3,223
- In-Service Training	11,000	8,000	24,000	14,612	96,000	93,130	32,000	19,465	-	-	163,000	135,207
- Research Studies	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	-	-	28	28
<b>Part D: Development of Teacher Training Subsector Management and Coordination</b>												
- Technical Panel										-Established		-Established
- Benefit Monitoring System										-Established		-Established
- Personnel Development for Curriculum Wing										-Established		-Established
- Consulting Services										300	207	300 207

GCE = Government Colleges of Education, GCET = Government College for Elementary Teachers , PITE = provincial institute of teacher education, TTI = teacher training institutions

<sup>a</sup> Figures represent number of modules completed.

Source: Federal and provincial project implementation units

## TOTAL COST SUMMARY BY CATEGORY OF EXPENDITURES AND FINANCING ARRANGEMENTS

### Table A4.1: Comparison of Appraisal Estimates (\$ million)

Project Components	Appraisal Estimates								
	Asian Development Bank			Government			Total		
	Foreign	Local	Total	Foreign	Local	Total	Foreign	Local	Total
<b>A. Infrastructure Development</b>	<b>0.986</b>	<b>3.190</b>	<b>4.176</b>	-	<b>3.130</b>	<b>3.130</b>	<b>0.986</b>	<b>6.320</b>	<b>7.306</b>
1. Land Acquisition	-	-	-	-	2.082	2.082	-	2.082	2.082
2. Detailed Engineering and Supervision	-	0.184	0.184	-	0.112	0.112	-	0.296	0.296
3. Civil Works	0.986	3.006	3.992	-	0.936	0.936	0.986	3.942	4.928
a. Existing Institution	0.308	0.939	1.247	-	0.293	0.293	0.308	1.232	1.540
b. New Institutions	0.678	2.067	2.745	-	0.643	0.643	0.678	2.710	3.388
<b>B. Equipment, Furniture, and Vehicle</b>	<b>4.596</b>	<b>1.422</b>	<b>6.018</b>	-	<b>0.872</b>	<b>0.872</b>	<b>4.596</b>	<b>2.294</b>	<b>6.890</b>
1. Equipment	4.017	0.622	4.639	-	0.382	0.382	4.017	1.004	5.021
a. Office Equipment	0.650	0.101	0.751	-	0.062	0.062	0.650	0.163	0.813
b. Electronic Media Development	2.410	0.373	2.783	-	0.229	0.229	2.410	0.602	3.012
c. Laboratory Facilities	0.957	0.148	1.105	-	0.091	0.091	0.957	0.239	1.196
2. Furniture	-	0.711	0.711	-	0.435	0.435	-	1.146	1.146
3. Vehicles	0.579	0.089	0.668	-	0.055	0.055	0.579	0.144	0.723
<b>C. Institution Building</b>	<b>3.354</b>	<b>19.453</b>	<b>22.807</b>	-	-	-	<b>3.354</b>	<b>19.453</b>	<b>22.807</b>
1. Staff Development	1.429	2.104	3.533	-	-	-	1.429	2.104	3.533
a. Local Fellowship	-	2.104	2.104	-	-	-	-	2.104	2.104
b. Overseas Fellowship	1.429	-	1.429	-	-	-	1.429	-	1.429
2. Curricula and Instructional Method Development	-	0.551	0.551	-	-	-	-	0.551	0.551
3. Instructional Materials Development	0.475	7.469	7.944	-	-	-	0.475	7.469	7.944
4. Library Improvement	-	0.829	0.829	-	-	-	-	0.829	0.829
5. Research and Evaluation Studies	-	0.653	0.653	-	-	-	-	0.653	0.653
6. Consultant Services	1.450	0.800	2.250	-	-	-	1.450	0.800	2.250
a. International	1.450	-	1.450	-	-	-	1.450	-	1.450
b. Domestic	-	0.800	0.800	-	-	-	-	0.800	0.800
7. In-service Training	-	7.047	7.047	-	-	-	-	7.047	7.047
<b>D. Project Implementation and Incremental Recurrent Costs</b>	-	<b>5.354</b>	<b>5.354</b>	-	<b>10.307</b>	<b>10.307</b>	-	<b>15.661</b>	<b>15.661</b>
1. Incremental Staff Salaries	-	0.875	0.875	-	9.389	9.389	-	10.264	10.264
a. Project Implementation Unit	-	0.875	0.875	-	0.179	0.179	-	1.054	1.054
b. New Institutions	-	-	-	-	9.210	9.210	-	9.210	9.210
2. Operation and Maintenance	-	4.480	4.480	-	0.917	0.917	-	5.397	5.397
<b>Subtotal</b>	<b>8.936</b>	<b>29.419</b>	<b>38.355</b>	-	<b>14.309</b>	<b>14.309</b>	<b>8.936</b>	<b>43.728</b>	<b>52.664</b>
Physical Contingencies	0.496	1.564	2.060	-	0.820	0.820	0.496	2.384	2.880
Price Contingencies	2.458	7.637	10.095	-	4.101	4.101	2.458	11.738	14.196
<b>Subtotal</b>	<b>2.954</b>	<b>9.201</b>	<b>12.155</b>	-	<b>4.921</b>	<b>4.921</b>	<b>2.954</b>	<b>14.122</b>	<b>17.076</b>
Service Charge during Implementation	1.590	-	1.590	-	-	-	1.590	-	1.590
<b>Total</b>	<b>13.480</b>	<b>38.620</b>	<b>52.100</b>	-	<b>19.230</b>	<b>19.230</b>	<b>13.480</b>	<b>57.850</b>	<b>71.330</b>

Table A4.2: Comparison of Actual Cost (\$ million)

Project Components	Asian Development Bank			Actual Cost Government			Total		
	Foreign	Local	Total	Foreign	Local	Total	Foreign	Local	Total
<b>A. Infrastructure Development</b>	<b>1.050</b>	<b>3.471</b>	<b>4.521</b>	-	<b>3.157</b>	<b>3.157</b>	<b>1.050</b>	<b>6.628</b>	<b>7.678</b>
1. Land Acquisition	-	-	-	-	2.082	2.082	-	2.082	2.082
2. Detailed Engineering and Supervision	-	0.042	0.042	-	0.025	0.025	-	0.067	0.067
3. Civil Works	1.050	3.429	4.479	-	1.050	1.050	1.050	4.479	5.529
a. Existing Institution	0.276	0.902	1.178	-	0.276	0.276	0.276	1.178	1.454
b. New Institutions	0.774	2.527	3.301	-	0.774	0.774	0.774	3.301	4.075
<b>B. Equipment, Furniture, and Vehicle</b>	<b>2.472</b>	<b>0.835</b>	<b>3.307</b>	-	<b>1.215</b>	<b>1.215</b>	<b>2.472</b>	<b>2.050</b>	<b>4.522</b>
1. Equipment	2.265	0.003	2.268	-	0.692	0.692	2.265	0.695	2.960
a. Office Equipment	0.445	0.003	0.448	-	0.035	0.035	0.445	0.038	0.483
b. Electronic Media Development	1.590	-	1.590	-	0.637	0.637	1.590	0.637	2.227
c. Laboratory Facilities	0.230	-	0.230	-	0.020	0.020	0.230	0.020	0.250
2. Furniture	-	0.832	0.832	-	0.472	0.472	-	1.304	1.304
3. Vehicles	0.207	-	0.207	-	0.051	0.051	0.207	0.051	0.258
<b>C. Institution Building</b>	<b>2.782</b>	<b>8.436</b>	<b>11.218</b>	-	-	-	<b>2.782</b>	<b>8.436</b>	<b>11.218</b>
1. Staff Development	0.720	0.632	1.352	-	-	-	0.720	0.632	1.352
a. Local Fellowship	-	0.632	0.632	-	-	-	-	0.632	0.632
b. Overseas Fellowship	0.720	-	0.720	-	-	-	0.720	-	0.720
2. Curricula and Instructional Method Development	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
3. Instructional Materials Development	0.300	0.157	0.457	-	-	-	0.300	0.157	0.457
4. Library Improvement	-	0.672	0.672	-	-	-	-	0.672	0.672
5. Research and Evaluation Studies	-	0.449	0.449	-	-	-	-	0.449	0.449
6. Consultant Services	1.762	0.548	2.310	-	-	-	1.762	0.548	2.310
a. International	1.762	-	1.762	-	-	-	1.762	-	1.762
b. Domestic	-	0.548	0.548	-	-	-	-	0.548	0.548
7. In-service Training	-	5.978	5.978	-	-	-	-	5.978	5.978
<b>D. Project Implementation and Incremental Recurrent Costs</b>	-	<b>1.415</b>	<b>1.415</b>	-	<b>0.883</b>	<b>0.883</b>	-	<b>2.298</b>	<b>2.298</b>
1. Incremental Staff Salaries	-	1.098	1.098	-	0.676	0.676	-	1.774	1.774
a. Project Implementation Unit	-	1.098	1.098	-	0.292	0.292	-	1.390	1.390
b. New Institutions	-	-	-	-	0.384	0.384	-	0.384	0.384
2. Operation and Maintenance	-	0.317	0.317	-	0.207	0.207	-	0.524	0.524
<b>Subtotal</b>	<b>6.304</b>	<b>14.157</b>	<b>20.461</b>	-	<b>5.255</b>	<b>5.255</b>	<b>6.304</b>	<b>19.412</b>	<b>25.716</b>
Physical Contingencies	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Price Contingencies	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
<b>Subtotal</b>	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Service Charge during Implementation	0.965	-	0.965	-	-	-	0.965	-	0.965
<b>Total</b>	<b>7.269</b>	<b>14.157</b>	<b>21.426</b>	-	<b>5.255</b>	<b>5.255</b>	<b>7.269</b>	<b>19.412</b>	<b>26.681</b>

**TOTAL COST SUMMARY BY CATEGORY OF EXPENDITURES AND FINANCING ARRANGEMENTS**  
**Table A5.1: Project Cost Variation at Appraisal and Completion**

Project Components	Variation from Appraisal (\$ million)								
	Asian Development Bank			Government			Total		
	Foreign	Local	Total	Foreign	Local	Total	Foreign	Local	Total
<b>A. Infrastructure Development</b>	<b>0.064</b>	<b>0.281</b>	<b>0.345</b>	-	<b>0.027</b>	<b>0.027</b>	<b>0.064</b>	<b>0.308</b>	<b>0.372</b>
1. Land Acquisition	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
2. Detailed Engineering and Supervision	-	(0.142)	(0.142)	-	(0.087)	(0.087)	-	(0.229)	(0.229)
3. Civil Works	0.064	0.423	0.487	-	0.114	0.114	0.064	0.537	0.601
a. Existing Institution	(0.032)	(0.037)	(0.069)	-	(0.017)	(0.017)	(0.032)	(0.054)	(0.086)
b. New Institutions	0.096	0.460	0.556	-	0.131	0.131	0.096	0.591	0.687
<b>B. Equipment, Furniture, and Vehicle</b>	<b>(2.124)</b>	<b>(0.498)</b>	<b>(2.622)</b>	-	<b>0.417</b>	<b>0.417</b>	<b>(2.124)</b>	<b>(0.081)</b>	<b>(2.205)</b>
1. Equipment	(1.752)	(0.619)	(2.371)	-	0.310	0.310	(1.752)	(0.309)	(2.061)
a. Office Equipment	(0.205)	(0.098)	(0.303)	-	(0.027)	(0.027)	(0.205)	(0.125)	(0.330)
b. Electronic Media Development	(0.820)	(0.373)	(1.193)	-	0.408	0.408	(0.820)	0.035	(0.785)
c. Laboratory Facilities	(0.727)	(0.148)	(0.875)	-	(0.071)	(0.071)	(0.727)	(0.219)	(0.946)
2. Furniture	-	0.121	0.121	-	0.037	0.037	-	0.158	0.158
3. Vehicles	(0.372)	-	(0.372)	-	0.070	0.070	(0.372)	0.070	(0.302)
<b>C. Institution Building</b>	<b>(0.572)</b>	<b>(11.017)</b>	<b>(11.589)</b>	-	-	-	<b>(0.572)</b>	<b>(11.017)</b>	<b>(11.589)</b>
1. Staff Development	(0.709)	(1.472)	(2.181)	-	-	-	(0.709)	(1.472)	(2.181)
a. Local Fellowship	-	(1.472)	(1.472)	-	-	-	-	(1.472)	(1.472)
b. Overseas Fellowship	(0.709)	-	(0.709)	-	-	-	(0.709)	-	(0.709)
2. Curricula and Instructional Method Development	-	(0.551)	(0.551)	-	-	-	-	(0.551)	(0.551)
3. Instructional Materials Development	(0.175)	(7.312)	(7.487)	-	-	-	(0.175)	(7.312)	(7.487)
4. Library Improvement	-	(0.157)	(0.157)	-	-	-	-	(0.157)	(0.157)
5. Research and Evaluation Studies	-	(0.204)	(0.204)	-	-	-	-	(0.204)	(0.204)
6. Consultant Services	0.312	(0.252)	0.060	-	-	-	0.312	(0.252)	0.060
a. International	0.312	-	0.312	-	-	-	0.312	-	0.312
b. Domestic	-	(0.252)	(0.252)	-	-	-	-	(0.252)	(0.252)
7. In-service Training	-	(1.069)	(1.069)	-	-	-	-	(1.069)	(1.069)
<b>D. Project Implementation and Incremental Recurrent Costs</b>	-	<b>(3.939)</b>	<b>(3.939)</b>	-	<b>(9.424)</b>	<b>(9.424)</b>	-	<b>(13.363)</b>	<b>(13.363)</b>
1. Incremental Staff Salaries	-	0.223	0.223	-	(8.713)	(8.713)	-	(8.490)	(8.490)
a. Project Implementation Unit	-	0.223	0.223	-	0.113	0.113	-	0.336	0.336
b. New Institutions	-	-	-	-	(8.826)	(8.826)	-	(8.826)	(8.826)
2. Operation and Maintenance	-	(4.163)	(4.163)	-	(0.710)	(0.710)	-	(4.873)	(4.873)
Physical Contingencies	(0.496)	(1.564)	(2.060)	-	(0.820)	(0.820)	(0.496)	(2.384)	(2.880)
Price Contingencies	(2.458)	(7.637)	(10.095)	-	(4.101)	(4.101)	(2.458)	(11.738)	(14.196)
Service Charge during Implementation	(0.625)	-	(0.625)	-	-	-	(0.625)	-	(0.625)
<b>Total</b>	<b>(6.211)</b>	<b>(24.374)</b>	<b>(30.585)</b>	-	<b>(13.901)</b>	<b>(13.901)</b>	<b>(6.211)</b>	<b>(38.275)</b>	<b>(44.486)</b>

**Table A5.2 : Project Cost Variation at Appraisal and Completion**

Project Components	Variation from Appraisal (%)								
	Asian Development Bank			Government			Total		
	Foreign	Local	Total	Foreign	Local	Total	Foreign	Local	Total
<b>A. Infrastructure Development</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>8</b>	-	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>
1. Land Acquisition	-	-	-	-	0	0	-	0	0
2. Detailed Engineering and Supervision	-	(77)	(77)	-	(77)	(77)	-	(77)	(77)
3. Civil Works	6	14	12	-	12	12	6	14	12
a. Existing Institution	(10)	(4)	(6)	-	(6)	(6)	(10)	(4)	(6)
b. New Institutions	14	22	20	-	20	20	14	22	20
<b>B. Equipment, Furniture, and Vehicle</b>	<b>(46)</b>	<b>(35)</b>	<b>(44)</b>	-	<b>48</b>	<b>48</b>	<b>(46)</b>	<b>(4)</b>	<b>(32)</b>
1. Equipment	(44)	(100)	(51)	-	81	81	(44)	(31)	(41)
a. Office Equipment	(32)	(97)	(40)	-	(43)	(43)	(32)	(77)	(41)
b. Electronic Media Development	(34)	(100)	(43)	-	178	178	(34)	6	(26)
c. Laboratory Facilities	(76)	(100)	(79)	-	(78)	(78)	(76)	(92)	(79)
2. Furniture	-	17	17	-	8	8	-	14	14
3. Vehicles	(64)	-	(56)	-	128	128	(64)	49	(42)
<b>C. Institution Building</b>	<b>(17)</b>	<b>(57)</b>	<b>(51)</b>	-	-	-	<b>(17)</b>	<b>(57)</b>	<b>(51)</b>
1. Staff Development	(50)	(70)	(62)	-	-	-	(50)	(70)	(62)
a. Local Fellowship	-	(70)	(70)	-	-	-	-	(70)	(70)
b. Overseas Fellowship	(50)	-	(50)	-	-	-	(50)	-	(50)
2. Curricula and Instructional Method Development	-	(100)	(100)	-	-	-	-	(100)	(100)
3. Instructional Materials Development	(37)	(98)	(94)	-	-	-	(37)	(98)	(94)
4. Library Improvement	-	(19)	(19)	-	-	-	-	(19)	(19)
5. Research and Evaluation Studies	-	(31)	(31)	-	-	-	-	(31)	(31)
6. Consultant Services	22	(32)	3	-	-	-	22	(32)	3
a. International	22	-	22	-	-	-	22	0	22
b. Domestic	-	(32)	(32)	-	-	-	-	(0.315)	(0.315)
7. In-service Training	-	(15)	(15)	-	-	-	-	(15)	(15)
<b>D. Project Implementation and Incremental Recurrent Costs</b>	-	<b>(74)</b>	<b>(74)</b>	-	<b>(91)</b>	<b>(91)</b>	-	<b>(85)</b>	<b>(85)</b>
1. Incremental Staff Salaries	-	26	26	-	(93)	(93)	-	(83)	(83)
a. Project Implementation Unit	-	26	26	-	63	63	-	32	32
b. New Institutions	-	-	-	-	(96)	(96)	-	(96)	(96)
2. Operation and Maintenance	-	(93)	(93)	-	(77)	(77)	-	(90)	(90)
Physical Contingencies	(100)	-	(100)	-	-	-	(100)	-	(100)
Price Contingencies	<b>(100)</b>	-	<b>(100)</b>	-	-	-	<b>(100)</b>	-	(100)
Service Charge during Implementation	(39)	-	(39)	-	-	-	(39)	-	(39)
	<b>(46)</b>	<b>(63)</b>	<b>(59)</b>	-	<b>(72)</b>	<b>(72)</b>	<b>(46)</b>	<b>(66)</b>	<b>(62)</b>

**LOAN DISBURSEMENTS**

Year	Quarter	Actual Disbursement (\$ million)	Actual Cumulative (\$ million)	Cumulative Percentage of Actual Disbursement
1994	I			
	II	1.336	1.336	6.24
	III	0.407	1.743	8.13
	IV	1.570	3.313	15.46
1995	I	0.504	3.817	17.81
	II	0.138	3.955	18.46
	III	0.589	4.544	21.21
	IV	1.911	6.455	30.13
1996	I	0.427	6.882	32.12
	II	0.402	7.284	34.00
	III	0.421	7.705	35.96
	IV	1.975	9.680	45.18
1997	I	0.212	9.892	46.17
	II	0.265	10.157	47.41
	III	1.756	11.913	55.60
	IV	1.719	13.632	63.62
1998	I	0.645	14.277	66.63
	II	1.493	15.770	73.60
	III	1.065	16.835	78.57
	IV	1.761	18.596	86.79
1999	I	0.427	19.023	88.78
	II	0.511	19.534	91.17
	III	0.767	20.301	94.75
	IV	0.163	20.464	95.51
2000	I	1.148	21.612	100.87
	II	0.134	21.746	101.49
	III	0.103	21.849	101.97
	IV	0.000	21.849	101.97
2001	I	0.184	22.033	102.83
	II	(0.088)	21.945	102.42
	III	0.098	22.043	102.88
	IV	(0.646)	21.397	99.86
2002	I	0.089	21.486	100.28
	II	(0.065)	21.421	99.98
	III	0.005	21.426	100.00
<b>Total</b>		<b>21.426</b>		

**SUMMARY OF DISBURSEMENTS**  
**By Component and by Loan Category**

Category No.	Categories	In \$					Total
		Balochistan	NWFP	Punjab	Sindh	Federal	
01	Civil Works	1,325,756	703,172	1,616,831	874,966	0	4,520,725
02	Equipment	115,336	138,791	842,049	357,606	1,647,324	3,101,106
03	Vehicles	79,256	95,513	11,555	20,024	0	206,348
04	Instructional Materials	332,816	40,817	0	36,016	47,493	457,142
05	Staff Development-Overseas	0	0	0	0	719,632	719,632
06	Consulting Services	0	0	0	0	2,310,484	2,310,484
10	LC-Library Facilities	395,579	70,877	193,941	11,167	0	671,564
11	LC-Staff Development-Local Fellowship	109,039	71,791	221,197	229,462	826	632,315
12	LC-In-service Training	472,228	720,623	3,580,948	1,003,358	201,151	5,978,308
13	LC-Research & Evaluation Studies	135,652	71,120	98,344	88,210	55,722	449,048
15	LC-Project Implementation Cost-FCU and PIUs	317,186	159,339	282,081	136,118	203,358	1,098,082
16	LC-Project Implementation-Operation and Maintenance	79,264	23,681	0	52,131	161,984	317,060
17	Service Charge During Construction	136,797	108,600	368,410	145,125	205,651	964,583
	<b>Total</b>	<b>3,498,909</b>	<b>2,204,324</b>	<b>7,215,356</b>	<b>2,954,183</b>	<b>5,553,625</b>	<b>21,426,397</b>



### COMPLIANCE WITH LOAN COVENANTS

	<b>Covenants</b>	<b>Reference</b>	<b>Status of Compliance</b>
1.	The Borrower will cause TTP to be carried out with due diligence and efficiency and in conformity with sound administrative, financial, engineering, environmental, and educational practices.	Loan Agreement (LA) Section 4.01(a)	Complied with
2.	The Borrower shall make available, promptly as needed, the funds, facilities, services, land, and other resources which are required, in addition to the proceeds of the loan, for the carrying out of TTP and for the operation and maintenance of TTP facilities.	LA Section 4.02	Complied with
3.	In the carrying out of TTP, the Borrower shall cause competent and qualified consultants and contractors, acceptable to the Borrower and the Asian Development Bank (ADB), to be employed to an extent and upon terms and conditions satisfactory to the Borrower and ADB.	LA Section 4.03(a)	Complied with
4.	The Borrower shall cause TTP to be carried out in accordance with plans, design standards, specifications, work schedules, and construction methods acceptable to the Borrower and ADB. The Borrower shall furnish, or cause to be furnished, to ADB, promptly after their preparation, such plans, specifications, and work schedules, and any material modifications subsequently made therein, in such detail as ADB shall reasonably request.	LA Section 4.03(b)	Complied with
5.	The Borrower shall ensure that the activities of its departments and agencies with respect to the carrying out of TTP and operation of the project facilities are conducted and coordinated in accordance with sound administrative policies and procedures.	LA Section 4.04	Complied with
6.	The Borrower shall maintain, or cause to be maintained, records and accounts adequate to identify the goods and services and other items of expenditure financed out of the proceeds of the loan, to disclose the use thereof in TTP, to record the progress of TTP (including the cost thereof), and to reflect, in accordance with consistently maintained sound accounting principles, the project-related operations and financial condition of the agencies of the Borrower responsible for the carrying out of TTP and operation of the project facilities, or any part thereof.	LA Section 4.06(a)	Complied with
7.	The Borrower shall, through Federal Coordinating Unit (FCU) (i) maintain, or cause to be maintained, separate accounts for TTP; (ii) have such accounts and related financial statements audited annually, in accordance with sound auditing standards, by auditors acceptable to ADB; (iii) furnish to ADB, as soon as available but in any event not later than 6 months after the end of each related fiscal year, unaudited copies of such accounts and financial statements, and not later than 9 months after the end of each related fiscal year, certified copies of such audited accounts and financial statements and the report of the auditors relating thereto, all in the English language; and (iv) furnish to ADB such other information concerning such accounts and	LA Section 4.06(b)	Partly complied with. Outstanding issues still need to be resolved under FCU accounts.

	<b>Covenants</b>	<b>Reference</b>	<b>Status of Compliance</b>
	financial statements and the audit thereof as ADB shall from time to time reasonably request.		
8.	Without limiting the generality of the foregoing, the Borrower shall furnish, or cause to be furnished, to ADB quarterly reports on the carrying out of TTP and on the operation and management of TTP facilities. Such reports shall be submitted in such form and in such detail and within such a period as ADB shall reasonably request, and shall indicate, among other things, progress made and problems encountered during the quarter under review, steps taken or proposed to be taken to remedy these problems, and proposed program of activities and expected progress during the following quarter.	LA Section 4.07(b)	Complied with
9.	Promptly after physical completion of TTP, but in any event not later than 3 months thereafter or such later date as may be agreed for this purpose between the Borrower and ADB, the Borrower shall prepare and furnish to ADB a report, in such form and in such detail as ADB shall reasonably request, on the execution and initial operation of TTP, including its cost, the performance by the Borrower of its obligations under the LA and the accomplishment of the purposes of the Loan.	LA Section 4.07(c)	Final PCR submitted to ADB. Delayed compliance.
10.	MOE shall be the overall Executing Agency of TTP, and the secretary of MOE shall be responsible for the overall planning, organization, and implementation of TTP.	LA Schedule 6, para.1	Complied with
11.	Each PED shall be the project Executing Agency for the components of TTP to be implemented in the four provinces, and the secretary of PED shall be responsible for the overall implementation of such components.	LA Schedule 6, para. 2	Complied with
12.	Prior to the effective date, MOE shall establish a FCU in the Curriculum Wing of MOE and shall appoint a full-time FCU project director to head the FCU and core staff consisting of a project manager, an FCU deputy project manager, a procurement officer, an accounts officer, and a training and staff development officer. The Joint Educational Advisor (Curriculum Wing) shall serve as the FCU director and shall report directly to the secretary of MOE. The appointment of the FCU project manager and the FCU deputy project manager shall be acceptable to ADB.	LA Schedule 6, para. 3	Complied with
13.	The FCU director shall oversee the day-to-day implementation of project components at the federal level and shall ensure close coordination with other international donors undertaking related activities.	LA Schedule 6, para. 4	Complied with
14.	FCU shall be staffed by an adequate number of full-time technical and administrative personnel, including the project manager, the deputy project manager, a research and evaluation officer, a BME officer, a training and staff development officer, a procurement officer, and an accounts officer. These personnel, with appropriate qualifications and experience, shall be recruited from among MOE officials or from the private sector during project implementation.	LA Schedule 6, para. 7	Complied with

	<b>Covenants</b>	<b>Reference</b>	<b>Status of Compliance</b>
15.	Prior to the effective date, each province shall establish a PIU within PED and appoint a PIU director to head the PIU, and core staff on a full-time basis, consisting of a project manager, a PIU deputy project manager, a procurement officer, an accounts officer, and a research and evaluation officer. The director, Bureau of Curriculum and Education Extension Center (BCEEC), Balochistan; director, Bureau of Curriculum and Education Services, NWFP; director, Education Extension Center, Punjab; and director, Bureau of Curriculum and Education Extension Wing, Sindh, shall serve as the PIU directors in their respective provinces and shall report directly to their respective secretary of PED. The appointment of the PIU project managers and the PIU deputy project managers shall be acceptable to ADB.	LA Schedule 6, para. 8	Complied with
16.	Each PIU director shall be responsible for the day-to-day implementation of the project components in the province.	LA Schedule 6, para. 9	Complied with
17.	Each PIU shall be responsible for the day-to-day implementation of the project components in the province, including in-service training, engagement of consultants, recommendations to the FCU for the award of fellowships, liaison with the FCU, design and construction of the project facilities, preparation of procurement documents and required reports, and monitoring the progress of its project components.	LA Schedule 6, para. 10	Complied with
18.	Each PIU shall be staffed by an adequate number of full-time technical and administrative personnel, including the project manager, a research and evaluation officer, a training and staff development officer, an architect, a procurement officer, and an accounts officer. These personnel, with appropriate qualifications and experience shall be recruited from among PED officials or from the private sector during the project implementation period.	LA Schedule 6, para. 11	Complied with
19.	The Borrower shall, within 3 months after the effective date, establish within MOE a teacher education development steering committee (TEDSC). The chairman of TEDSC shall be the secretary of MOE, and the secretary of TEDSC shall be the FCU project manager. The members of TEDSC shall also include at the minimum, the joint educational advisors (primary and nonformal education, secondary education curriculum, and planning and development wing); chief, Planning and Development Divisions (at the federal and provincial levels); education secretaries of the province; and PIU directors.	LA Schedule 6, para. 12	Complied with
20.	The Borrower shall, within three months after the Effective Date, establish a Technical Panel on Teacher Training (TPTE) within MOE and appoint its members. TPTE shall be responsible for improvement of curriculums, management, and planning of teacher education, under TTP and generally. The joint educational advisor (Curriculum Wing) of MOE shall serve as chairman of TPTE and its members shall also include the head of the Training Department of Allama Iqbal Open University; one principal from a female	LA Schedule 6, para. 14	Complied with

	<b>Covenants</b>	<b>Reference</b>	<b>Status of Compliance</b>
	college of elementary teachers in each province; provincial director, BCEEC or its equivalent; head, Education Extension Services; and a director of the Institute of Educational Research. TPTE shall meet as often as required, but at least once every 3 months.		
21.	Each province shall, within 3 months after the effective date, establish within its PED a provincial coordinating committee (PCC) to coordinate and oversee all project activities in the province under the supervision of the PIU director. Each PCC shall be chaired by the secretary of PED, and the PIU project manager shall be the member-secretary to the PCC. Membership in the PCC shall also include, at the minimum, the PIU director; provincial directors, BCEEC or its equivalent; and representatives of the Department of Planning and Development, Department of Finance, Provincial Directorate of Rural Development and Local Government, and Communications and Works Department, Education Engineering Works Division, Education Engineering Cell. Each PCC shall meet as often as required, but at least once every 2 months, to consider and advise on the progress and problems of project implementation in the province.	LA Schedule 6, para. 15	Partly complied with. Punjab did not establish a PCC during the project implementation period.
22.	Each PED shall ensure that its PITE is responsible for the training of master trainers, subsector research and data, and interpretation of findings with the BCEEC or its equivalent under TTP.	LA Schedule 6, para.16	Complied with
23.	Each PIU shall prepare an institutional development program (IDP) and submit it to ADB for approval and to FCU for information and consolidation by 1 October 1993. IDP shall include a fellowship program and a project monitoring master plan (PMMP)	LA Schedule 6, para. 17	Complied with
24.	The Borrower and each province shall ensure that a strict system of selection and bonding shall be adopted in connection with such fellowship program to ensure that recipients of such fellowships shall continue their services for a reasonable period upon completion of their training.	LA Schedule 6, para. 18 (c)	Complied with
25.	Prior to the award of fellowships abroad, FCU shall consult with ADB concerning the candidates for such fellowships and seek the approval of ADB for (i) the qualification and experience of the proposed candidates; (ii) the venue proposed for the training; (iii) the course or type of training to be followed and its duration; and (iv) details of the fellowship cost, travel cost, per diem, book allowance, and the terms and conditions to be imposed on the candidates for fellowships and study tours. Selected fellows shall be sent to such institutions as may be agreed upon between the Borrower and ADB.	LA Schedule 6, para. 18 (d)	Complied with
26.	The Borrower, through MOE, in consultation with the provinces, through the PEDs, shall periodically review the curriculums for preservice training of teachers to ensure that such curriculums are relevant to the needs of national development. Recommendations for improvement of	LA Schedule 6, para. 19	Complied with

	<b>Covenants</b>	<b>Reference</b>	<b>Status of Compliance</b>
	instructional materials to be made by the consultants included under TTP shall be taken into consideration by the Borrower in implementing educational reforms. The Borrower shall keep ADB informed of such developments and of any major changes in its policies affecting teacher training and TTP.		
27.	The Borrower shall ensure that the institutions to be assisted under TTP have an adequate number of qualified teaching and nonteaching staff. The Borrower shall also ensure that the present government ban on new appointments for government positions will not be applied to these institutions and that staff shall be recruited to fill vacancies in existing government TTIs and for new positions in these institutions. In cases where qualified staff are not available in a province, prompt measures shall be taken by the Borrower to allow recruitment of nonindigenous staff from other provinces.	LA Schedule 6, para. 20	Complied with
28.	In connection with PMMP, which will be submitted to ADB for approval as part of IDP, FCU and PIUs shall collect and compiled no later than 1 October 1993, such data as may be required to establish baseline indicators for appropriate educational, social and economic factors to enable ADB, MOE, and PEDs to monitor and evaluate TTP during implementation and upon completion. Such data shall be obtained at the commencement of project implementation to establish a baseline, and continuing records shall be kept to enable ADB, MOE, and PEDs to evaluate the extent to which the project objectives are achieved.	LA Schedule 6, para. 21 (a)	Complied with
29.	A midterm review shall be carried out by MOE, PEDs, and ADB in the last quarter of the second year of project implementation. The results of the midterm review, including an evaluation of the progress made in relation to the targets set, shall be discussed by MOE, PEDs, and ADB and, if required, strategies shall be revised to ensure more effective implementation, monitoring, and evaluation of TTP.	LA Schedule 6, para. 22	Complied with
30.	The Borrower and each province shall take suitable measures to implement a maintenance program for the project facilities. Each PIU shall assist institutions or agencies participating in TTP to maintain such facilities properly and adequately. MOE and PEDs, in collaboration with FCU and PIUs, respectively, shall maintain buildings, repair equipment, and organize and conduct appropriate training programs in building and equipment maintenance for teachers and technical staff. For this purpose, the Borrower and each province shall make adequate allocations in their respective budgets for each fiscal year starting in 1993 to meet incremental recurrent costs for the operation and maintenance of the project facilities.	LA Schedule 6, para. 23	Complied with
31.	Without limiting the generality of the provisions of Section 4.02 of this LA, each province shall ensure that all land, rights of way, easements, leases, and other property rights required for the construction of project facilities are acquired or made available in a timely manner, free from any liens or	LA Schedule 6, para. 24	Complied with

	<b>Covenants</b>	<b>Reference</b>	<b>Status of Compliance</b>
	other impediments. In particular, within 3 months after the effective date, each province shall ensure the acquisition of all land required for its PITE, and Punjab shall also ensure the acquisition of all land required for the two GCETs to be established.		
32.	Within 3 months after the effective date, (i) Balochistan, NWFP, and Sindh shall appoint, on a full-time basis (a) the core staff of its PITE, consisting of a principal, five master trainers, a librarian, and an accounts officer; and (b) a manager for each TO; and (ii) Punjab shall appoint, on a full-time basis, (a) the core staff of its PITE, consisting of a principal, five master trainers, a librarian, and an accounts officer; (b) the core staff of each of the two new GCETs, consisting of a principal, five master trainers, a librarian, and an accounts officer; and (c) a manager for each TO.	LA Schedule 6, para. 25	Complied with
33.	The Borrower and each province shall create adequate incentives for the staff of the four PITEs, the two new GCETs, eight model GCETs, and the TOs to ensure appropriately qualified persons become teacher educators, and shall ensure the timely appointment of such qualified persons. The Borrower and each province shall make adequate budgetary allocations in their respective recurrent budgets for these staff under TTP.	LA Schedule 6, para. 26	Complied with
34.	The Borrower and each province shall make adequate budgetary allocations in their respective budgets from the annual development plans (ADPs) for TTP for each fiscal year to provide for the required amounts of funds, in addition to the loan proceeds for the timely and effective implementation of TTP. For this purpose, the Borrower and each province shall provide ADB with a draft financing plan for TTP for its review prior to 30 April of each fiscal year during project implementation. The draft financing plan shall reflect the annual budgetary allocations for TTP, indicating the allocations made by the Borrower and each province, in addition to the loan proceeds.	LA Schedule 6, para. 27	Complied with
35.	Each Province shall submit to ADB by 31 December 1993 an implementation plan, with its timetable, for an equitable provision of allowances for rural and urban teachers and shall discuss the plan with ADB, and agreed modifications thereof shall be introduced by 1 July 1996.	LA Schedule 6, para. 28 (a)	Partly complied with. The Government requested deferment of compliance with these covenants until the economy improves. However, Balochistan has implemented, NWFP is implementing, and Punjab has prepared an implementation

	<b>Covenants</b>	<b>Reference</b>	<b>Status of Compliance</b>
			plan. Sindh is also working out the appropriate formula.
36.	The Borrower shall discuss with ADB an evaluation of the cost of incentive measures for teachers to attract teachers with high academic qualifications and its impact on teaching effectiveness no later than 30 June 1994, and suitable policy changes shall be introduced as mutually agreed between the Borrower and ADB.	LA Schedule 6, para. 29	Partly complied with
37.	The Borrower shall review the current practice of assigning teaching staff and a librarian for each government TTI, irrespective of its size, and shall prepare an action program addressing such practice for discussion with ADB no later than 31 December 1993; and suitable policy changes shall be introduced as mutually agreed between the Borrower and ADB.	LA Schedule 6, para. 30	Complied with
38.	The Borrower shall submit to ADB by 31 December 1993 drafts of regulations in respect of the establishment and operation of TTIs which may be set up in the private sector with the sponsorship of government education foundation, and such regulations shall become effective upon mutual agreement of the Borrower and ADB.	LA Schedule 6, para. 31	Partly complied with. Not complied with in Punjab.