



## Aide-Mémoire

---

Project Number: 33418 / Loan 1939–CAM  
18 June 2004

# Aide-Mémoire of the Loan Review Mission for the Tonle Sap Environmental Management Project

Asian Development Bank

## CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS

(as of 14 June 2004)

Currency Unit	–	riel (KR)
KR1.00	=	\$0.0002461
\$1.00	=	KR4,062.96

## ABBREVIATIONS

ADB	–	Asian Development Bank
CFDO	–	Community Fisheries Development Office
CNMC	–	Cambodia National Mekong Committee
DOF	–	Department of Fisheries
FAO	–	Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
GEF	–	Global Environment Facility
MAFF	–	Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry, and Fisheries
MOE	–	Ministry of Environment
NGO	–	nongovernment organization
PIO	–	project implementation office
PIU	–	project implementation unit
PMCO	–	project monitoring and coordination office
PSC	–	project steering committee
TA	–	technical assistance
TSBR	–	Tonle Sap Biosphere Reserve
TSBR-ED	–	Tonle Sap Biosphere Reserve—Environmental Information Database
UNDP	–	United Nations Development Programme
UNESCO	–	United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization

## NOTES

- (i) The fiscal year (FY) of the Government ends on 31 December. FY before a calendar year denotes the year in which the fiscal year ends.
- (ii) In this Report, "\$" refers to US dollars.

## CONTENTS

	<b>Page</b>
I. BACKGROUND	1
II. STATUS OF PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION	2
A. Actions Taken on Issues Identified by the Last Loan Review Mission	2
B. Status of Project Components	2
1. Design Summary	2
2. Analysis of Output Accomplishment and Improvement of Activities	3
3. Selection of Service Providers	3
4. Overall Physical Progress	4
C. Project Cost and Financing	5
D. Project Implementation Arrangements	5
E. Project Monitoring and Coordination	7
F. Status of Compliance with Loan Covenants	7
G. Status of Consulting Services	7
III. OTHER MATTERS	8
A. Technical Assistance	8
1. Purpose and Scope	8
2. Evaluation of Inputs	8
3. Evaluation of Outputs	8
4. Major Lessons Learned	9
5. Next Steps	10
B. Cofinancing	10
1. Tonle Sap Conservation Project	10
2. Capacity Building for Sustainable Development in the Tonle Sap Region	10
IV. SUMMARY OF FOLLOW-UP ACTIONS	11
V. ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	12
 APPENDIXES	
1. Project Framework	13
2. Indicative Activities Schedule	18
3. Analysis of Output Accomplishment and Improvement of Activities	21
4. Compliance with Loan Covenants	28
5. List of Participants at the Wrap-Up Meeting	31

## I. BACKGROUND

1. On 21 November 2002, the Asian Development Bank (ADB) approved a loan in various currencies equivalent to \$10.91 million from ADB's Special Funds resources for the Tonle Sap Environmental Management Project.<sup>1</sup> ADB also approved technical assistance (TA) for \$540,000 from ADB's TA funding program for improving the regulatory and management framework for inland fisheries.<sup>2</sup> The Loan Agreement was signed on 7 February 2003, became effective on 27 March 2003, and closes on 30 June 2008. The project completion date is 31 December 2007. The period elapsed under the loan is 27%. As of 31 May 2004, cumulative disbursements amounted to 10% of the loan amount.

2. The goal of the Project is sustainable management and conservation of natural resources and biodiversity in the Tonle Sap basin.<sup>3</sup> Its objective is to enhance systems and develop the capacity for natural resource management coordination and planning, community-based natural resource management, and biodiversity conservation in the Tonle Sap Biosphere Reserve (TSBR) (Appendix 1). To accomplish its objective, the Project has three components: (i) strengthening natural resource management coordination and planning for the TSBR; (ii) organizing communities for natural resource management in the TSBR; and (iii) building management capacity for biodiversity conservation in the TSBR. It is intended that the consulting services required for project implementation and transfer of technology will be procured in packages, often under direct selection of agencies such as the Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) of the United Nations and the United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization (UNESCO).

3. The Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry, and Fisheries (MAFF) is the executing agency for the Project. DOF, within MAFF, is tasked with implementing the bulk of project activities that relate to strengthening natural resource management coordination and planning for the TSBR and organizing communities for natural resource management in the TSBR. The Ministry of Environment (MOE) is tasked with implementing the project activities that relate to building management capacity for biodiversity conservation in the TSBR. The Cambodia National Mekong Committee (CNMC) is tasked with monitoring and coordinating accomplishments and formulating common policy objectives for managing the TSBR through the TSBR Secretariat. The UNDP Country Office in Phnom Penh is tasked with implementing the GEF and Capacity 21 grants under the national execution modality.

---

<sup>1</sup> At appraisal, the total project cost, including contingencies, taxes, and duties, was estimated at \$19.4 million equivalent, consisting of foreign exchange of \$8.8 million (about 45%) and local currency of \$10.6 million equivalent (about 55%). The Global Environment Facility (GEF) determined to cofinance the Project for \$3.24 million through a grant to be implemented by the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP). GEF financing for the Tonle Sap Conservation Project covers the near entirety of component 3. Details are provided in the GEF Project Brief. In addition, UNDP's Capacity 21 program determined to provide \$627,030 as a grant to strengthen the ability of staff of the Community Fisheries Development Office (CFDO) within the Department of Fisheries (DOF) to engage communities in natural resource management. The World Conservation Society also determined to cofinance, for \$200,000, project activities to develop systems for monitoring and management in the core areas.

<sup>2</sup> ADB. 2002. *Technical Assistance to the Kingdom of Cambodia for Improving the Regulatory and Management Framework for Inland Fisheries*. Manila.

<sup>3</sup> The project area encompasses the TSBR and parts of its five adjoining provinces. It comprises the core areas, the buffer zone, and the transition area that extends to and is ultimately bounded by Highways No. 5 and No. 6. In 1998, about 2.9 million people lived in the project area, of whom about 38% were below the poverty line. About 10% depended wholly on fishing and about 40% had fishing as a secondary occupation. More than 1.2 million people lived in the area bordered by the highways; the population of the core areas was estimated at 4,200 and that of the buffer zone at 66,000.

4. ADB's first loan review mission was dispatched in May 2003, soon after loan effectiveness.<sup>4</sup> It prepared a detailed project administration memorandum to guide Project implementation. It also explained to the executing and implementing agencies ADB's guidelines and procedures on project implementation, consulting services, procurement, bid evaluation, and disbursement. In conformity with ADB's undertaking to carry out semiannual loan reviews, ADB's second loan review mission of ADB was fielded in November 2003 to conduct a detailed review of overall progress under the Project.<sup>5</sup> That mission reviewed the status of project components, analyzed output accomplishment with a view to improve activities if needed, focused on the issues that the Project was encountering and, in consultation with CNMC, DOF, the project management advisor, and the consultants for TA 3993–CAM: *Improving the Regulatory and Management Framework for Inland Fisheries* formulated measures to resolve these issues. ADB's third loan review mission visited Cambodia from 14–18 June 2004.<sup>6</sup> This aide-mémoire records the findings and recommendations of the Mission, which are subject to review and approval by higher authorities of the Government and ADB.<sup>7</sup>

## II. STATUS OF PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION

### A. Actions Taken on Issues Identified by the Last Loan Review Mission

5. The last loan review mission identified 12 follow-up actions that, by and large, related to routine matters of project administration. With few exceptions, the responsibility centers took time to act on any of them. In the early stages of project implementation, diffidence could be attributed to unfamiliarity with ADB procedures and regulations. But the responsibility centers have now worked on project activities for at least 1 year and consultants such as the fisheries management advisor have been available for some time. At long last, CNMC and MOE appear to have delegated more authority for routine matters of project administration to the project coordinator and the PIO head in MOE. (The Mission noted improvements in MAFF, although it could usefully emulate the implementing agencies further.)<sup>8</sup> In short, no more reasons can be found for delay in project implementation. Responsibility centers should take prompt steps on issues identified by ADB's loan review missions.

### B. Status of Project Components

#### 1. Design Summary

6. The project design anticipates that accomplishment of three components and their related outputs and activities will enable the Project to achieve its objective.

7. **Component 1: strengthening natural resource management coordination and planning for the TSBR.** The monitorable outputs of Component 1 are:

- (i) Establishing a Coordination Framework and Information Dissemination Mechanisms.
- (ii) Mapping the TSBR.

<sup>4</sup> Reference is invited to its aide-mémoire, dated 7 May 2003.

<sup>5</sup> Reference is invited to its aide-mémoire, dated 14 November 2003.

<sup>6</sup> The Mission comprised O. Serrat (Mission Leader).

<sup>7</sup> The work of the Mission was facilitated by the detailed quarterly progress report for the period February-April 2004, prepared by the project monitoring and coordination office (PMCO), and project implementation office (PIO) reports on actions taken on issues identified by ADB's second loan review mission.

<sup>8</sup> The functions that subordinate organizations perform effectively belong more properly to them than to a dominant central organization. Specifically, in this instance, the PIO in DOF should not have to seek time and again approval to access line items of a budget that has already been approved in MAFF.

(iii) Improving Regulation and Management Planning.

**8. Component 2: organizing communities for natural resource management in the TSBR.** The monitorable outputs of Component 2 are:

- (i) Formulating an Implementation Structure.
- (ii) Empowering Communities.
- (iii) Evaluating Technical Packages in Support of Sustainable Livelihoods.

**9. Component 3: building management capacity for biodiversity conservation in the TSBR.** The monitorable outputs of Component 3 are:

- (i) Enhancing Management Capacity.
- (ii) Developing Systems for Monitoring and Management.
- (iii) Promoting Biodiversity Conservation Awareness, Education, and Outreach.

## **2. Analysis of Output Accomplishment and Improvement of Activities**

10. Project implementation will span 5 years (Appendix 2). To focus attention on the cause-and-effect relationships between the basic elements of project design (as laid out in the project framework) and to work out measures to resolve the problems affecting project implementation, the Mission, CNMC, DOF, and MOE carried out detailed analyses of project output accomplishment for component 1 and 2.<sup>9</sup> The analyses related to whether the targets for each of the six project outputs are being achieved, how the activities required to accomplish each output are being implemented (giving details of strengths and weaknesses), and how implementation of the activities can be improved (proposing changes and justifying the recommendations). Based on these analyses, this aide-mémoire itemizes action plans to improve activities, building on the quarterly progress report for the period February-April 2004 prepared by the PMCO (Appendix 3). Comparison with the performance indicators and targets listed in the project framework and with the indicative activities schedule shows that almost all activities are at least 6 months behind schedule. The only output that has been accomplished on time relates to improving regulation and management planning. The bulk of this output was achieved under TA 3993–CAM: *Improving the Regulatory and Management Framework for Inland Fisheries*. Notwithstanding, the Mission reckons that much preparatory work has been made, that momentum has been gained and that all remaining outputs should, henceforth, be delivered expeditiously. CNMC, DOF, and MOE, in consultation with MEF as required, should debate each analysis of output accomplishment, refine it as warranted, and take the actions deemed necessary to improve activities.

## **3. Selection of Service Providers**

11. At appraisal, it was envisaged that four contract packages for consulting services would be awarded to FAO and UNESCO under ADB's directed selection procedure. Those that concern UNESCO relate to (i) establishing the Tonle Sap Biosphere Reserve Environmental Management Information Database (TSBR-ED), and (ii) formulating and implementing a national environmental education and awareness campaign. Those that concern FAO relate to (i) component 2, and (ii) TA 3993–CAM: *Improving the Regulatory and Management Framework for Inland Fisheries*. The performance indicators and targets in the project framework specify that UNESCO should, in both instances, have been appointed by the end of the third quarter of year 1. This target was missed. The two technical proposals were forwarded to CNMC on

<sup>9</sup> A synopsis of accomplishments under component 3, including the Capacity 21 program grant, is given in section III. Details are to be found in UNDP's project reports.

11 November 2003. Six months later, however, CNMC still had not evaluated them for lack of understanding of ADB's direct selection procedure. This delay will impact other ADB assistance to Cambodia.<sup>10</sup> The performance indicators and targets in the project framework also specify that FAO should have been appointed by end-year 1 to provide long-term advisory support to component 2. This target too was missed, for the same reason, and it likewise took DOF several months to evaluate FAO's technical proposal. This delay will impact other ADB assistance to Cambodia.<sup>11</sup> ADB conducted direct selection of FAO for TA 3993–CAM: *Improving the Regulatory and Management Framework for Inland Fisheries* on schedule.

12. ADB's direct selection procedure has now been explained to CNMC and DOF and these responsibility centers are endeavoring to make up for lost time. In mid-May 2004, DOF evaluated FAO's technical proposal and noted deficiencies. FAO's revised proposal is expected to reach DOF in the third week of June 2004. This, will, hopefully permit contract negotiations in early July 2004. In late May 2004, CNMC evaluated UNESCO's technical proposals and found them found responsive. Contract negotiations are scheduled in late June 2004. CNMC and DOF should make every effort to progress direct selection of FAO and UNESCO to contract negotiations without delay. To smooth the progress of contract negotiations and abridge reporting requirements, MEF's representative should be at the level of deputy director.

#### 4. Overall Physical Progress

13. Overall physical progress so far has not been substantial and is estimated at 10%. This is not yet a matter for concern: the Project is still in its early stages of implementation and most large-scale activities are yet to come on stream. Counterpart funds<sup>12</sup> have finally been made available and CNMC and DOF have finally understood ADB's direct selection procedure. They have grown more confident in their ability to administer a complex project. Besides direct selection of FAO and UNESCO, DOF has also made good progress toward mapping the TSBP.<sup>13</sup> It aims to award the international competitive bidding contract for this output in October 2004, in order to use the December 2004 to March 2005 window for aerial photographing.<sup>14</sup> Still, the period elapsed under the loan is now 27%. Henceforth, project inputs and resultant activities will be more concentrated and delivered across the board. Slippages, if any, will snowball.

<sup>10</sup> See ADB. 2003. *Technical Assistance for Promoting Effective Water Management Policies and Practices (Phase 3)*. Manila, under which a pilot and demonstration activity for Developing and Testing Environmental Education and Awareness Methodologies and Tools was approved in February 2004. Consulting services were fielded for 8 months from May 2004. UNESCO's activities toward formulating and implementing a national environmental education and awareness campaign were intended to inform the pilot and demonstration activity. (All the same, the pilot and demonstration activity can usefully inform implementation of component 3, under which biodiversity conservation awareness, education, and outreach will be promoted. In the interest of efficiency, effectiveness, and relevance, UNESCO and the consultant for the pilot and demonstration activity have also begun to discuss opportunities for synergies.)

<sup>11</sup> See ADB. 2003. *Technical Assistance to the Kingdom of Cambodia for Preparing the Tonle Sap Sustainable Livelihoods Project*. Manila. The output of TA 4197–CAM: *Tonle Sap Sustainable Livelihoods* will be a feasibility study that builds on the community organization component of the Project, covering the five provinces that adjoin the Tonle Sap. Consulting services were fielded for 9 months from April 2004.

<sup>12</sup> In March 2004, counterpart funds in the amounts of \$25,000, \$60,000, and \$50,000, respectively, were transferred to the second-generation imprest accounts of CNMC, DOF, and MOE. Shrewdly, CNMC and MOE have already sought replenishment from MEF; DOF needs to do likewise.

<sup>13</sup> To maximize resource efficiency, DOF organized meetings with the Department of Local Administration within the Ministry of Interior to ensure that there would be no duplication with the aerial photography planned under the ADB-assisted Commune Council Development Project. See ADB. 2002. *Report and Recommendation of the President to the Board of Directors on a Proposed Loan to the Kingdom of Cambodia for the Commune Council Development Project*. Manila.

<sup>14</sup> Because of weather conditions, DOF must adhere to the procurement, delivery, and completion schedule rigidly, or lose another year.

CNMC, DOF, and MOE have no alternative but to adhere much more closely than up till now to the Project's indicative activities schedule.

### C. Project Cost and Financing

14. Out of ADB's loan of \$10.91 million equivalent, about \$1.17 million (10%) had been disbursed as of 31 May 2004. So far, disbursements have related to simple civil works for project implementation units (PIUs), procurement of office equipment and vehicles, and long-term contracts for consultants. However, contract awards and disbursement are expected to accelerate in FY2004 with direct selection of FAO and UNESCO and mapping of the TSBR.

#### Status of Loan Utilization<sup>15</sup> (\$)

Category	Category Name	Allocation	Contract	Uncontracted Loan Balance	Disbursed	Undisbursed Loan Balance	Undisbursed Contract Balance
01	Civil Works	324,609	-	324,609	-	324,609	-
02A	Vehicles	697,690	79,200	618,490	-	697,690	79,200
02B	Equipment & Boats	226,198	28,145	198,053	-	226,198	28,145
03	Training & Workshops	352,517	-	352,517	-	352,517	-
04A	International Consultant	3,687,865	1,161,892	2,525,973	167,400	3,520,465	994,492
04B	Domestic Consultant	2,184,135	27,000	2,157,135	-	2,184,135	27,000
05A	Aerial Photography & Mapping	831,352	-	831,352	-	831,352	-
05B	Surveys, Investigations & NGOs	829,883	-	829,883	-	829,883	-
06	Operation & Maintenance	1,617,171	11,214	1,605,957	-	1,617,171	11,214
07	Interest Charge	330,553	-	330,553	2,613	327,940	-
08	Unallocated	1,031,112	-	1,031,112	-	1,031,112	-
99	Imprest Account	(20,092)	-	(20,092)	1,000,000	(1,020,092)	(1,000,000)
	<b>Total</b>	<b>12,092,993</b>	<b>1,307,451</b>	<b>10,785,542</b>	<b>1,170,013</b>	<b>10,922,980</b>	<b>140,051</b>

<sup>a</sup> The allocation in the imprest account is a balancing figure.

<sup>b</sup> The total contract amount includes the claims in withdrawal applications no. C0008 and no. E0002 and the consultants' contracts for the project management advisor, the fisheries management advisor, the strategy and policy advisor, and the finance and administration specialist.

<sup>c</sup> The disbursed amount includes advances to the imprest account and consultant plus interest charges.

Source: Asian Development Bank.

### D. Project Implementation Arrangements

15. A project steering committee (PSC) chaired by the minister of MAFF has been established to advise on project implementation, provide a mechanism for resolving

<sup>15</sup> As of 14 June 2004.

implementation problems that go beyond single ministerial mandates, and review progress.<sup>16</sup> PIOs have been set up in DOF, the Department of Nature Conservation and Protection within MOE, and the TSBR Secretariat. Senior staff of these institutions has been appointed as PIO heads and are now supported by full-time administrative, financial, and secretarial staff to supervise and manage direct implementation activities under the Project. PIOs are responsible for planning and budgeting project activities and, as required, supervising and monitoring provincial-level field activities through the PIUs. PIUs have also been set up in the project provinces in the Office of Fisheries in the Department of Agriculture, Forestry, and Fisheries and in the Department of Environment. Senior staff of these institutions has been seconded on a full-time basis as PIU head and are supported by full-time administrative, financial, and secretarial staff to implement activities in the project provinces. Much effort has been devoted to activating the PIUs<sup>17</sup> and work toward rehabilitation of existing infrastructure or construction is well advanced. Rehabilitation of the PIUs in Battambang, Pursat, and Kompong Chhnang is expected to be completed in July 2004. Rehabilitation of the PIUs in Kompong Thom and Siem Reap is expected to be completed in July 2004 and August 2004, respectively.<sup>18</sup> The Mission, however, reckons that the human resource capacities of the PIUs will be stretched, perhaps unsustainably so (at least in the short term), during implementation of component 2. Since the design of the Project makes provision for multiple contracts for surveys, investigations, and associated services, DOF and MOE should consider engaging one volunteer per PIU and strengthening the PIO in DOF in like fashion.<sup>19</sup> If they wish to avail of the economical services offered by voluntary service organizations, DOF and MOE should flesh out the rationale, prepare cost estimates, and draw terms of reference for consideration in ADB.

16. PIU heads reporting to the Department of Environment have submitted monthly progress reports. All PIUs should be reminded that project performance and achievement of benefits depends on adherence to reporting requirements. In respect of PIUs, these are that PIUs heads will submit standardized quarterly reports during each year of implementation, detailing the physical and financial progress of activities against targets and summarizing monitoring and evaluation results. In turn, the PIOs are to submit to the PMCO consolidated quarterly progress reports. The PMCO will submit to the Government and ADB 6-monthly progress reports that pay close attention to output accomplishment and improvement of activities. To facilitate report preparation, PIU and PIO heads should call quarterly staff meetings. To improve project administration and coordination, schedule activities and work plans, prepare or refine budgets, monitor progress, and analyze output accomplishment, the project coordinator should call quarterly meetings of PIO heads. To ensure that it is apprised of progress and fulfills its project management functions before the large-scale activities associated with the services of FAO and UNESCO get underway, the PSC should be convened.<sup>20</sup> To prepare this first meeting, the PMCO should request PIO heads to suggest an appropriate agenda, in consultation with the PSC, highlighting the decisions to be made. Henceforth, the PMCO, in consultation with PIO heads, should also submit quarterly briefing notes to the PSC.<sup>21</sup>

---

<sup>16</sup> At appraisal, it was envisaged that the PSC would meet every 6 months and, if possible, concurrent with CNMC board meetings.

<sup>17</sup> A workshop to support activation of PIUs was held on 24–25 May 2004.

<sup>18</sup> Progress has also been made toward procurement of essential PIU inputs such as vehicles and boats as these must be purchased by international shopping. Draft procurement papers are being finalized. Procurement of office equipment, computers, furniture, et cetera for the PIUs will be conducted through local competitive bidding.

<sup>19</sup> Voluntary service organizations can source qualified and enthusiastic personnel at short notice and at low cost.

<sup>20</sup> The third week of July 2004 would appear to be the most propitious time.

<sup>21</sup> These briefing notes could be modeled on the monthly progress notes prepared by the fisheries management advisor.

## **E. Project Monitoring and Coordination**

17. The PMCO has been established to assume responsibility for integrating operations. It is located in the TSBR Secretariat, and the permanent deputy (environment) of the secretariat has been appointed as project coordinator. A project management advisor, a finance and administration specialist, and full-time administrative, financial, and secretarial staff was engaged early assist him. The PMCO is responsible for project coordination, including consolidating financial statements, harmonizing equipment specifications and procurement procedures, scheduling project activities, and general administration. The three divisions of the TSBR Secretariat provide the PMCO with day-to-day technical support. Coordination among PIUs at the provincial level does not yet exist because they are still in the process of structuring without clear work plans. PIO heads, in consultation with the PMCO, should organize a meeting of PIUs to establish coordination mechanisms, including information sharing, and define areas for joint activities.

## **F. Status of Compliance with Loan Covenants**

18. Major loan covenants relate to (i) the executing agency, (ii) the PSC, (iii) the PMCO, (iv) the PIOs, (v) nongovernment organizations (NGOs), (vi) counterpart funds, (vii) the regulatory framework, (viii) mapping, (ix) gender, (x) ethnic minorities, (xi) project performance monitoring and evaluation, and (xii) involuntary resettlement. Particular covenants have also been specified. Pleasingly, the Borrower and the executing and implementing agencies have complied in timely fashion with most of the provisions and requirements covenanted in the Loan Agreement for execution and operation of project facilities and financial matters (Appendix 4). To enable submission of the audited financial statement for FY2003 before September 2004, MEF should finalize selection of an independent auditor.

## **G. Status of Consulting Services**

19. At appraisal, it was expected that the Project would use, over the 5-year period of its implementation and in several packages, 271 person-months of international consulting services and 1,402 person-months of domestic consulting services. So far, only 10 person-months of international consulting services and 6 person-months of domestic consulting services have been utilized. The negotiations toward engagement of the project management advisor and the fisheries management advisor were particularly protracted, mainly because of Government procedures that require contracts to be approved at the highest level of a ministry, even in the case of individual consultants. Regrettably, the services of the project management advisor had to be terminated after 6 months of relative indolence aggravated, on occasion, by unscheduled absence from work.<sup>22</sup> The other noteworthy inputs of international consulting services related to recruitment of the policy and strategy advisor and the imagery and mapping specialist. As mentioned earlier, the bulk of international and domestic consulting services will be procured in packages upon direct selection of FAO and UNESCO.

---

<sup>22</sup> The PMCO is to be congratulated for the thoroughness with which it evaluated the project management advisor's performance and took early action. The replacement began his assignment on 16 June 2004. CNMC, DOF, and MOE should monitor the performance of all consulting services closely. The terms of reference for consultants specify that all are to prepare brief monthly progress notes and an end-of-assignment report.

### III. OTHER MATTERS

#### A. Technical Assistance

##### 1. Purpose and Scope

20. TA 3993–CAM: *Improving the Regulatory and Management Framework for Inland Fisheries* was approved with the Project, for \$540,000, to improve the regulatory and management framework for inland fisheries, with special attention to the subdecree on community fisheries. TA activities began in July 2003 and have just concluded. With hindsight, the relevance of TA design is judged to have been correct and its objective, terms of reference, executing arrangements, and implementation schedule are deemed to have been appropriate. TA formulation rightly placed emphasis on stakeholder participation and ownership.

##### 2. Evaluation of Inputs

21. The TA was expected to require 19 person-months of international resource specialists and 41 person-months of short-term domestic resource specialists, for which ADB entered into a TA agreement with FAO. Implementation was expected to span 12 months from January 2003. The consultants were fielded several months behind schedule in July 2003<sup>23</sup> and rendered its services over three distinct periods, each of which was the object of review by ADB. The range of expertise hired was sound and allowed a fair distribution of work among the consultants. The national team leader and the national specialists performed well. The first team leader's services were terminated swiftly, soon after TA inception, because of attitudinal difficulties. The team came together under the second appointee and functioned thereafter to everyone's satisfaction. The funds allocated to the TA were adequate and flexibility permitted reallocation of resources among the team members. Some problems were experienced with disbursements because of FAO's internal rules on clearance of invoices for payment and its practice of releasing only 80% of the sums until after receipts have been received confirming full payment. This put unnecessary pressure on DOF, the executing agency, which time and again had to draw upon scarce departmental funds to meet the balance until the final 20% were released. The vehicle was delivered quite late, in end-December 2003, after the initial series of field consultations but in time to perform a useful role during the review consultations in the project provinces. Office equipment was of good quality and adequate for the volume of work, except for report copying. ADB's desk officer attended the initial and final tripartite meetings, and participated in the mid-term tripartite review by video link. TA inputs were economical: adequate with no surplus. They were productive, enabling thorough participatory consultations, and drafting of all required reports. The performance of DOF, FAO's team, and ADB is rated as highly satisfactory.

##### 3. Evaluation of Outputs

22. At appraisal, it was intended that the main outputs of the TA would be (i) a regulatory framework report, leading to the completion on a priority basis of the draft Fisheries Law and the subdecree on community fisheries, and (ii) a 5-year Tonle Sap fisheries management plan. Subsidiary outputs were to include establishment in DOF of a Tonle Sap Fisheries Management

---

<sup>23</sup> The services of FAO were engaged under ADB's direct selection procedure and a simplified technical proposal was used as the basis for contract negotiations. Notwithstanding, ADB requested changes to several drafts of the technical proposal before it was judged satisfactory.

Task Force.<sup>24</sup> TA outputs were generated efficiently, effectively, and on time. All were of high quality and the Minister of Agriculture, Forestry, and Fisheries has expressed his satisfaction. The most valuable outputs included (i) comments and recommendations on the draft Fisheries Law and its Subdecree on Community Fisheries, which are now in the National Assembly, (ii) the draft Proclamation on Community Fisheries By-Laws and Area Agreement, (iii) revised Guidelines for the Establishment of Community Fisheries Management Organizations, and (iv) the first-ever General Fisheries Plan for Management and Development of the Tonle Sap. These outputs will play vital roles in improving the regulatory and management framework for inland fisheries. In the immediate, they will facilitate implementation of component 2. The reports on stakeholder consultations and the national consultative conference are also valuable, not only on account of their technical content, but also because of the manner in which the consultations were planned, organized, and conducted.<sup>25</sup> The General Fisheries Plan for Management and Development of the Tonle Sap addresses all major concerns for sustainable management and conservation of the lake's fisheries, including social equity. It details measures to deal with illegal and destructive fishing practices, preserve endangered species, and minimize environmental degradation. It identifies and articulates pro-poor, sustainable development activities. It is founded on a grass roots survey of stakeholders and was confirmed and refined by a representative cross-section of these stakeholders at the national consultative conference, at which competing interest groups reached agreement. The regulatory framework documents will provide a useful reference for years to come. This is because the Fisheries Law and associated Sub-Decree on Community Fisheries are not yet in force: they could be progressed further. (Areas for improvement were identified at the national consultative conference.) Therefore, the TA called attention to the need for short-term legal inputs in support of component 2. Training of counterparts and target stakeholders took place largely through intense participation in the fisheries review that initiated the TA and related discussions in the project provinces and at the national consultative conference. The Tonle Sap Fisheries Management Task Force that was established under the TA appears to be equipped to take on the challenge of updating the plan on a regular basis.

#### 4. Major Lessons Learned

23. The TA is categorized as highly successful. Its accomplishments will, as intended, strongly underpin implementation of component 2. The major lessons learned include:

- (i) **Professionalism, Teamwork, and Ownership.** The success of the TA owes to individual professionalism and teamwork, empowered by a true sense of ownership in DOF. Consultants must be temperamentally suited as well as professionally experienced: should any fail to meet expectation, and this threatens the performance of the team, a prompt replacement must be considered.
- (ii) **Participation.** Active participation by stakeholders smoothed the progress of the TA. This involved considerable efforts in bridge building, providing information, and listening to concerns. The success of the component 2 will also depend on this factor. This lesson holds true for many projects.
- (iii) **Financial Management.** TA implementation needs effective systems of financial control and disbursement. The TA encountered difficulties because FAO has its own, well-developed rules and procedures. If a United Nations agency is to be

<sup>24</sup> After completion of the TA, the taskforce is expected to continue to meet regularly to monitor fisheries management, advise on the implementation of legal instruments and various elements of the plan, and prepare 5-yearly updates.

<sup>25</sup> Reportedly, FAO plans to prepare an illustrated summary of these two reports as a guide to how participatory fisheries development and management can be achieved.

engaged to implement an ADB project, administrative and accounting matters should be agreed in advance.

## **5. Next Steps**

24. The ADB TA review mission that visited Cambodia on 4–5 May 2004 to attend a presentation on accomplishments and join the third and final tripartite discussions for the TA sought ways to promote the draft Fisheries Law and the 5-year General Fisheries Plan for Management and Development of the Tonle Sap.<sup>26</sup> Because about 20 laws await endorsement in the National Assembly, DOF agreed to that mission's recommendation that the Minister of Agriculture, Forestry, and Fisheries should request Prime Minister Hun Sen to contact the Standing Legal Committee of the National Assembly, with a view to prioritizing the draft Fisheries Law in the agenda. DOF also agreed to send the 5-year General Fisheries Plan for Management and Development of the Tonle Sap to the Council of Ministers for formal recognition. DOF should apprise ADB of the actions it has taken to prioritize the draft Fisheries Law in the National Assembly's agenda and to send the 5-year General Fisheries Plan for Management and Development of the Tonle Sap to the Council of Ministers for recognition.

## **B. Cofinancing<sup>27</sup>**

25. As noted earlier, the GEF determined to cofinance the Project through a grant to be implemented by UNDP. Financing for the Tonle Sap Conservation Project covers the near entirety of component 3. In addition, UNDP's Capacity 21 program determined to provide grant assistance to strengthen the ability of CFDO to engage communities in natural resource management.

### **1. Tonle Sap Conservation Project**

26. The chief executive officer of the GEF approved the project document for the Tonle Sap Conservation Project on 19 April 2004 and the document was submitted to the Government on 4 May 2004. The signed copy was returned to UNDP on 10 June 2004. The next steps will entail recruitment of the team leader and the national project manager. Upon recruitment, an inception phase of 3–6 months will begin.

### **2. Capacity Building for Sustainable Development in the Tonle Sap Region**

27. Implementation of this TA began in earnest in July 2003 upon recruitment of a project coordinator, capacity building advisor, and administrative assistant. Major accomplishments thus far relate to (i) building the capacity of the CFDO, (ii) implementing a training program for staff of relevant provincial line agencies,<sup>28</sup> (iii) carrying out environmental awareness, education and outreach activities in the core areas, and (iv) promoting cooperation with local NGOs and community-based organizations.

<sup>26</sup> Reference is invited to the minutes of the tripartite meeting, dated 5 May 2004.

<sup>27</sup> This section draws on inputs provided by UNDP Country Office in Phnom Penh.

<sup>28</sup> The TA enabled staff of provincial line agencies to attend prioritized trainings and conduct field site visits to community fisheries and fish sanctuaries. The prioritized training related to co-management of freshwater inland fisheries, community fisheries development, community fisheries management plan development, fisheries statistics, conflict management, monitoring and evaluation, data collection, use of geographic positioning systems and mapping, information technology, and English language training

28. TA activities are set to continue: CFDO's capacity is still limited and its staff needs to know better how to disseminate information and conduct stakeholder consultation. This will become even more urgent when the Fisheries Law and associated Sub-Decree on Community Fisheries are passed in the National Assembly. CFDO's capacity to conduct research and development and monitoring and evaluation is also quite limited. Elsewhere, provincial line agencies must develop the capacity to advise communities on establishment of community fisheries. Elsewhere still, CFDO's capacity to coordinate and cooperate with other line agencies, NGOs, and the Seila Program remains to be strengthened.

29. An annual review workshop will be held in mid-July 2004 in Sihanoukville. This review will be carried out in close consultation with CFDO. The SWOT methodology will be used to review what has been achieved so far, what problems have been faced, what lessons have been learned, and what future activities might be. A tripartite review will be conducted in August 2004. The completion date of the TA is 31 December 2005.

#### IV. SUMMARY OF FOLLOW-UP ACTIONS

30. Several follow-up actions need to be taken to accelerate and promote the efficient, effective, and sustainable accomplishment of project outputs, and to meet the Project's immediate objective. These actions, and their responsibility centers, are:

Follow-up Actions	
a.	Responsibility centers should take prompt steps on issues identified by ADB's loan review missions.
b.	CNMC, DOF, and MOE, in consultation with MEF as required, should debate each analysis of output accomplishment, refine it as warranted, and take the actions deemed necessary to improve activities.
c.	CNMC and DOF should make every effort to progress direct selection of FAO and UNESCO to contract negotiations without further delay. To smooth the progress of contract negotiations and abridge reporting requirements, MEF's representative should be a deputy director.
d.	Since the design of the Project makes provision for multiple contracts for surveys, investigations, and associated services, DOF and MOE should consider engaging one volunteer per PIU and strengthening the PIO in DOF in like fashion. If they wish to avail of the economical services offered by voluntary service organizations, DOF and MOE should flesh out the rationale, prepare cost estimates, and draw terms of reference for consideration in ADB.
e.	All PIUs should be reminded that project performance and achievement of benefits depends on adherence to reporting requirements.
f.	To facilitate report preparation, PIU and PIO heads should call quarterly staff meetings.
g.	To improve project administration and coordination, schedule activities and work plans, prepare or refine budgets, monitor progress, and analyze output accomplishment, the project coordinator should call quarterly meetings of PIO heads.
h.	To ensure that it is appraised of progress and fulfills its project management functions before the large-scale activities associated with the services of FAO and UNESCO get underway, the PSC should be convened. To prepare this first meeting, the PMCO

Follow-up Actions	
	should request PIO heads to suggest an appropriate agenda, in consultation with the PSC, highlighting the decisions to be made. Henceforth, the PMCO, in consultation with PIO heads, should also submit quarterly briefing notes to the PSC.
i.	PIO heads, in consultation with the PMCO, should organize a meeting of PIUs to establish coordination mechanisms, including information sharing, and define areas for joint activities.
j.	MEF should finalize selection of an independent auditor.
k.	CNMC, DOF, and MOE should monitor the performance of all consulting services closely.
l.	DOF should apprise ADB of the actions it has taken to prioritize the draft Fisheries Law in the National Assembly's agenda and to send the 5-year General Fisheries Plan for Management and Development of the Tonle Sap to the Council of Ministers for formal recognition.

## V. ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

31. The Mission thanks CNMC, DOF, MOE, and the consultants for their assistance and insights. It places on record the conscientiousness with which the project coordinator and the PIO head in DOF accomplish their pressing duties. This aide-mémoire incorporates revisions and comments from the wrap-up meeting held on 17 June 2004 in the TSBR Secretariat. The list of the persons who attended the meeting is attached (Appendix 5).

Phnom Penh, 18 June 2004.

Olivier Serrat  
Asian Development Bank

**cc:**

CNMC; DOF; FAO; MEF; MOE; UNDP; UNESCO; Project Consultants; Cambodia Resident Mission, ADB

## PROJECT FRAMEWORK

Design Summary	Performance Indicators/Targets	Monitoring Mechanisms	Assumptions and Risks
<b>Goal</b>			
1.1 Sustainable management and conservation of natural resources and biodiversity in the Tonle Sap Basin	1.1 Systems and capacity for natural resource management and biodiversity conservation are in place and functioning	1.1 Project performance audit report 1.2 Parameters of ecosystem (i.e., flooded forest cover, hydrology, biodiversity) from project monitoring and evaluation system	
<b>Objective</b>			
1.1 To enhance systems and develop the capacity for natural resource management coordination and planning, community-based natural resource management, and biodiversity conservation in the Tonle Sap Biosphere Reserve (TSBR)	1.1 Natural resource management coordination and planning strengthened by end-year 5 1.2 Community-based natural resource management in the TSBR facilitated by end-year 5 1.3 Management capacity for biodiversity conservation in the TSBR built by end-year 5	1.1 Project framework 1.2 Project completion report 1.3 Frequency of inter-Ministerial meetings organized by the TSBR Secretariat 1.4 Number of communities organized and uptake of recommendations from natural resource management plans 1.5 Periodic survey and inventory of appropriate indicator species for biodiversity and habitat monitoring 1.6 Socioeconomic indicators in the five project provinces	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Government and communities are committed to sustainable management of the TSBR for multiple use.</li> <li>The Government is committed to community-based natural resource management.</li> <li>The Government is committed to biodiversity conservation.</li> </ul>
<b>Components, Outputs, and Activities</b>			
<b>Strengthening Natural Resource Management Coordination and Planning for the TSBR</b>			
1.1 <i>A coordination framework and information dissemination mechanisms are established.</i>			
1.1.1 Strengthen the TSBR Secretariat's structures and facilities	1.1.1 TSBR Secretariat structures and facilities strengthened by end-year 1	1.1.1 Project reports 1.1.2 Project reports and policy documents	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Service provider is mobilized on time.</li> <li>Interministerial cooperation takes place and endorses the common policy objectives for management of the TSBR.</li> </ul>
1.1.2 Create in the TSBR Secretariat capacity to address legal and policy issues	1.1.2 Policy, Strategy, and Networking Division in the TSBR Secretariat strengthened by end-year 1	1.1.3 Minutes of interministerial meetings and policy documents of ministries	
1.1.3 Formulate common policy objectives for management of the TSBR	1.1.3 Common policy objectives formulated by the TSBR Secretariat by the end of the first quarter of year 2, and quarterly interministerial meetings held to refine and adopt them by end-year 2	1.1.4 Records of database usage and additions 1.1.5 Number of messages and feedback from audiences	
1.1.4 Develop a TSBR Environmental Information Database (TSBR-ED)			
1.1.5 Formulate and implement a national environmental education and awareness campaign	1.1.4 Service provider appointed by the end of		

Design Summary	Performance Indicators/Targets	Monitoring Mechanisms	Assumptions and Risks
	<p>the third quarter of year 1, TSBR-ED operational by mid-year 2, and TSBR-ED updating carried out on a continuing basis thereafter</p> <p>1.1.5 Service provider appointed by the end of the third quarter of year 1 and environmental education messages formulated by mid-year 2 and disseminated through appropriate media outlets and schools from mid-year 2 and on a continuing basis thereafter</p>		
<p>1.2 <i>The TSBR is mapped.</i></p> <p>1.2.1 Prepare orthophotomaps at scale 1:5,000 from new aerial photographs at scale 1:25,000</p> <p>1.2.2 Delineate biosphere zonation and boundaries of commercial and community fishing lots, fish sanctuaries, administrative regions, and physiographic features</p>	<p>1.2.1 Aerial photography completed by mid-year 2 and orthophotomaps prepared immediately thereafter</p> <p>1.2.2 Biosphere zonation and other boundaries delineated from mid-year 2 and zonation maps prepared by end-year 2</p>	<p>1.2.1 Contract for aerial photography and processing</p> <p>1.2.2 Number of zonation maps prepared</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Aerial photography is contracted without delay.</li> <li>Weather conditions allow aerial photography on schedule.</li> <li>Mapping is carried out in full consultation with the Ministry of Land Management, Urban Planning, and Construction.</li> </ul>
<p>1.3 <i>Regulation and management planning are improved.</i></p> <p>1.3.1 Prepare, complete, or as necessary amend the Fisheries Law and the subdecrees, proclamations, and directives or circulars associated with it and develop the 5-year Tonle Sap fisheries management plan</p> <p>1.3.2 Set standards and guidelines for formulation of community and commercial fisheries management plans</p> <p>1.3.3 Build the capacity of the Community Fisheries Development Office (CFDO) within the Department of Fisheries (DOF)</p>	<p>1.3.1 Regulatory framework prepared, completed, or amended and 5-year Tonle Sap fisheries management plan developed by mid-year 2</p> <p>1.3.2 Standards and guidelines for formulation of community and commercial fisheries management plans set by end-year 1 and disseminated thereafter</p> <p>1.3.3 Six key staff of CFDO trained by mid-year 2 and study tours conducted by mid-year 3</p>	<p>1.3.1 Gazette records, plan publication, and advisory technical assistance (TA) reports</p> <p>1.3.2 Standards and guidelines publication and advisory TA reports</p> <p>1.3.3 Staff and performance records</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Regulatory and management framework improvements feed into the common policy objectives formulated by the TSBR Secretariat.</li> </ul>
<p><b>Organizing Communities for Natural Resource Management in the TSBR</b></p> <p>2.1 <i>An implementation structure is formulated.</i></p>			

Design Summary	Performance Indicators/Targets	Monitoring Mechanisms	Assumptions and Risks
<p>2.1.1 Refine approach to community organization</p> <p>2.1.2 Strengthen provincial office structures and facilities in the five project provinces</p> <p>2.1.3 Implement a training program for staff of relevant provincial line agencies</p> <p>2.1.4 Develop a selection process and identify communities for organization</p>	<p>2.1.1 Previous approaches to organizing communities for natural resource management reviewed, preferred approach refined, and service provider appointed by end-year 1</p> <p>2.1.2 Provincial office structures and facilities strengthened by mid-year 2</p> <p>2.1.3 In each of the five project provinces, 16 staff from the Department of Agriculture, Forestry, and Fisheries, 4 staff from the Department of Environment, and 4–5 staff of selected nongovernment organizations (NGOs) nominated and trained by end-year 2</p> <p>2.1.4 Fisheries and forestry communities identified in each project provinces by end-year 2</p>	<p>2.1.1 Design document approved</p> <p>2.1.2 Project reports</p> <p>2.1.3 Training records</p> <p>2.1.4 Number of communities identified</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Service provider is mobilized on time.</li> <li>• Preferred approach to community organization is sufficiently practicable to enable rapid replication.</li> <li>• Staff of suitable quality and orientation are made available and are retained.</li> </ul>
<p>2.2 <i>Communities are empowered.</i></p> <p>2.2.1 Activate commune councils and appropriate village-level structures for natural resource management</p> <p>2.2.2 Conduct community organization for natural resource management</p> <p>2.2.3 Review boundaries and describe community resource rights</p> <p>2.2.4 Encourage formulation by communities of natural resource management plans</p> <p>2.2.5 Conduct independent progress audits</p>	<p>2.2.1 Commune council and village-level meetings address natural resource management by end-year 2</p> <p>2.2.2 Commune councils and village-level structures actively networking by mid-year 3 with support from NGOs (e.g., Community Aid Abroad, Leucaena Japonica, Southeast Asia Development Program, Community Capacity for Development)</p> <p>2.2.3 Agreements and endorsements on boundaries and resource rights obtained not later than end-year 3</p> <p>2.2.4 Formulation of natural resource management plans by communities encouraged from year 3</p> <p>2.2.5 Independent progress audit reports submitted annually from end-year 2</p>	<p>2.2.1 Number of commune council meetings and records of the meetings</p> <p>2.2.2 Number of fisheries and forestry communities organized each year in each project province</p> <p>2.2.3 Number of formal agreements</p> <p>2.2.4 Number of plans prepared</p> <p>2.2.5 Independent progress audits by an external research institute (e.g., Cambodia Development Resource Institute)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Commune councils are able to successfully mobilize interest groups.</li> <li>• Line agencies and resource users recognize community organizations.</li> <li>• The Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry, and Fisheries directs the interdepartmental cooperation necessary to encourage formulation by communities of natural resource management plans.</li> <li>• The judicial system effectively validates conflict resolution by community organizations.</li> <li>• Suitable NGOs are contracted for community organization and ground truthing.</li> <li>• Stakeholder agreement on boundaries is forthcoming.</li> </ul>
<p>2.3 <i>Technical packages in support of sustainable livelihoods are evaluated.</i></p>			

Design Summary	Performance Indicators/Targets	Monitoring Mechanisms	Assumptions and Risks
<p>2.3.1 Survey previous and ongoing approaches to technical packages based on sustainable natural resource management</p> <p>2.3.2 Recommend selected technical packages based on sustainable natural resource management for replication or further development</p>	<p>2.3.1 Technical packages for sustainable fisheries, aquaculture, agroforestry, and community forestry surveyed by the end of the third quarter of year 2</p> <p>2.3.2 Selected technical packages recommended for replication or further development by end-year 2</p>	<p>2.3.1 Number of technical packages for sustainable fisheries, aquaculture, agroforestry, and community forestry surveyed</p> <p>2.3.2 Number of technical packages recommended</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Cooperation with other international bodies and line agencies is forthcoming (e.g., Mekong River Commission, Oxfam-America).</li> </ul>
<p><b>Building Management Capacity for Biodiversity Conservation in the TSBR</b></p> <p>3.1 <i>Capacity for management is enhanced.</i></p> <p>3.1.1 Establish and equip protected area management units and core area management centers</p> <p>3.1.2 Institute a process for identifying additional core areas and fish sanctuaries</p> <p>3.1.3 Formulate and implement staff training for protected area management and biodiversity conservation</p>	<p>3.1.1 Two protected area management units and three core area management centers established and equipped by mid-year 2</p> <p>3.1.2 Identification process for additional core areas and fish sanctuaries instituted by end-year 2 and applied on a continuing basis thereafter</p> <p>3.1.3 Training needs analysis conducted by the third quarter of year 2 and training program implemented on an annual basis from year 3 until end-year 5</p>	<p>3.1.1 Project reports</p> <p>3.1.2 Frequency of identification exercises</p> <p>3.1.3 Training records</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Staff are made available for training and are retained.</li> </ul>
<p>3.2 <i>Systems for monitoring and management are developed.</i></p> <p>3.2.1 Design and implement a biodiversity monitoring system</p> <p>3.2.2 Establish a rapid-response mechanism for seasonal protection of biodiversity</p> <p>3.2.3 Develop a strategy, carry out an awareness campaign for the control of exotic species, and conduct management trials</p> <p>3.2.4 Develop and implement a strategy to enforce laws and regulations in and around the core areas and other important sites</p> <p>3.2.5 Identify income-</p>	<p>3.2.1 Indicator species for monitoring system identified by the fourth quarter of year 1, system designed by end-year 1, and system implemented from year 2 and on a continuing basis thereafter</p> <p>3.2.2 Fully resourced rapid-response team in operation by end-year 2</p> <p>3.2.3 Strategy and campaign in place by the fourth quarter of year 2 and management trials operational by end-year 2 and on a continuing basis thereafter</p> <p>3.2.4 Strategy in place by end-</p>	<p>3.2.1 Biodiversity assessment reports and the TSBR-ED</p> <p>3.2.2 Frequency of rapid-response exercises</p> <p>3.2.3 Surveys indicating that exotic species are being controlled</p> <p>3.2.4 Records on apprehended poachers and illegal users</p> <p>3.2.5 Reduction in the number of persons involved in livelihood activities that threaten biodiversity</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Monitoring accurately targets indicator species and feeds back into decision making.</li> <li>Exotic species are controllable at existing limits of spread with the resources available.</li> <li>Officials are not amenable to bribery.</li> <li>Alternative livelihoods can be identified and sustained, and can replace biodiversity threatening activities.</li> </ul>

Design Summary	Performance Indicators/Targets	Monitoring Mechanisms	Assumptions and Risks
<p>generation activities that directly threaten biodiversity in the core areas and develop alternative livelihoods to modify these activities</p>	<p>year 2 and enforcement operational from year 3 and on a continuing basis thereafter 3.2.5 Detrimental activities identified by the fourth quarter of year 2, alternative livelihoods developed by end-year 2, and disseminated thereafter</p>		
<p>3.3 <i>Biodiversity conservation awareness, education, and outreach are promoted.</i></p> <p>3.3.1 Develop and implement an environmental awareness, education, and outreach program (EAEOP) for the TSBR</p> <p>3.3.2 Provide floating environmental education centers</p> <p>3.3.3 Incorporate the EAEOP into selected schools around the TSBR</p>	<p>3.3.1 EAEOP developed and implemented by end-year 2</p> <p>3.3.2 Four floating environmental education centers provided by mid-year 2</p> <p>3.3.3 EAEOP incorporated in the cluster schools program of the Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sports from year 3</p>	<p>3.3.1 Number of villages and schools hosting outreach events</p> <p>3.3.2 Number of visitors to floating environmental education centers</p> <p>3.3.3 Changes to the school curriculum</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sports cooperates in preparing EAEOP.</li> <li>• Existing school curriculum is sufficiently flexible to allow uptake of EAEOP.</li> <li>• Teachers are made available.</li> </ul>

**Figure A2.1: INDICATIVE ACTIVITIES SCHEDULE  
Component 1 Activities**

ACTIVITY		PROJECT YEAR					
		1	2	3	4	5	
<b>Initial Activities</b>							
MAFF-MOE-ADB	Recruitment of consultants for Components 1 & 2	■					
	Recruitment of consultants for Component 3	■					
	Recruitment of consultants for Regulatory & Management Framework TA	■					
	Recruitment of UNESCO consultants	■	■				
	Recruitment of consultants for Community Organization (FAO contract)	■	■				
<b>A. Component 1: Strengthening Natural Resource Management Coordination &amp; Planning for the TSBR</b>							
<b>1.1 Coordination Framework &amp; Information Dissemination Mechanisms are Established</b>							
TSBR	MOE	1.1.1 Strengthen the TSBR Secretariat's Structures & Facilities					
		- incremental staff appointed (research, monitoring, data management)	■				
		- office equipment procured & set-up	■				
		- working plan for TSBR prepared	■				
		- training program designed & implemented	■	■	■	■	■
		1.1.2 Create in the TSBR Secretariat capacity to address legal & policy issues					
	- incremental staff appointed (policy, strategy, networking)	■					
	- training program designed & implemented	■	■	■	■	■	
	1.1.3 Formulate common policy objectives for management of the TSBR						
	- national workshops conducted		■			■	
	- common policy objectives formulated		■	■	■	■	
	- quarterly interministerial meetings held		■	■	■	■	
UNESCO-1	1.1.4 Develop a TSBR Environmental Information Database (TSBR-ED)						
	- office equipment procured & set-up		■				
	- library materials & publications procured		■	■	■		
	- website designed & installed		■	■	■		
MOE	UNESCO-2	- database designed & developed		■	■	■	■
		- database updating mechanism developed & continued		■	■	■	■
		1.1.5 Formulate & implement a national environmental education & awareness campaign					
		- equipment & vehicles procured		■			
		- campaign for national environmental education & awareness formulated		■			
		- contract for production of videos prepared & implemented		■	■	■	■
- publicity & educational material designed & produced		■	■	■	■		
- training, seminars & conferences implemented		■	■	■	■		
- school education campaign implemented		■	■	■	■		
<b>1.2 The TSBR is Mapped</b>							
DOF	DOF	1.2.1 Prepare orthophotomaps at scale 1:5,000 from new aerial photographs at scale 1:25,000					
		- specifications & contract documents for aerial photography & mapping prepared	■				
		- aerial photography & mapping contract implemented	■	■	■	■	■
		1.2.2 Delineate biosphere zonation & other boundaries					
		- GIS equipment procured		■			
		- natural physiographic features & other boundaries delineated		■	■	■	■
- digitizing & processing of data		■	■	■	■		
- ground verification (by consultants & field staff of DOF & MOE)		■	■	■	■		
- maps prepared		■	■	■	■		
<b>1.3 Regulation &amp; Management Planning are Improved</b>							
DOF	FAO TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE	1.3.1 Prepare, complete, or amend fisheries legislation & develop 5-year management plan					
		- regulatory framework prepared, completed, or amended		■	■	■	■
		- 5-year fisheries management plan developed		■	■	■	■
		- provincial workshops conducted		■	■	■	■
		- national workshops conducted		■			
		- regional study tours designed & implemented (4 tours)		■	■	■	■
	1.3.2 Set standards & guidelines for formulation of community & commercial fisheries management plans						
	- standards & guidelines prepared		■				
	- provincial workshops conducted		■	■	■	■	
	- stakeholder consultation & information dissemination conducted		■	■	■	■	
	1.3.3 Build the capacity of the Community Fisheries Development Office (CFDO)						
	- vehicles & equipment procured		■				
- staff training conducted (6 key staff)		■	■	■	■		
- regional study tours designed & implemented (18 tours)		■	■	■	■		

Figure A2.2: Component 2 Activities

ACTIVITY		PROJECT YEAR				
		1	2	3	4	5
<b>B. Component 2: Organizing Communities for Natural Resource Management in the TSBR</b>						
<b>2.1 An Implementation Structure is Formulated</b>						
CFDO	2.1.1 Refine approach to community organization					
	- previous approaches to organizing communities reviewed	■				
	- preferred approach refined		■			
	- service provider contracted & mobilized		■			
DAFF FAO SERVICE CONTRACT	2.1.2 Strengthen provincial office structures & facilities in the 5 provinces					
	- incremental staff appointed	■				
	- Department of Agriculture Forestry & Fisheries offices renovated in 5 provinces		■			
	- office equipment procured & set-up		■			
	- vehicles, motorcycles, & boats procured		■			
	2.1.3 Implement a training program for staff of relevant provincial line agencies					
	- training needs assessed, candidates selected, & curriculum defined		■			
	- training demonstration & materials prepared		■			
	- provincial workshops conducted (in conjunction with those under 2.1.4)			■		
	- national workshops conducted			■		
	- training conducted		■	■	■	■
	2.1.4 Develop a selection process & identify communities for organization					
	- baseline information surveys conducted throughout project area (by NGO contracts)		■			
	- provincial workshops conducted (in conjunction with those under 2.1.3)		■			
<b>2.2 Communities are Empowered</b>						
DAFF FAO SERVICE CONTRACT	2.2.1 Activate commune councils & appropriate village-level structures for natural resource management					
	- field consultations conducted		■	■	■	■
	- commune council & village-level meetings conducted		■	■	■	■
	2.2.2 Conduct community organization for natural resource management					
	- NGO contracts implemented		■	■	■	■
	- communities assisted to develop & support process of organization (300 meetings)		■	■	■	■
	2.2.3 Review boundaries & describe community resource rights					
	- public presentation of maps & walk-throughs		■	■		
	- delineation of agreed boundaries by communities		■	■		
	- community meetings conducted to formally agree on boundaries		■	■	■	■
	- resource use rights elaborated through consultative meetings		■	■		
	2.2.4 Encourage formulation by communities of natural resource management plans					
	- plans formulated (with assistance of contracted NGOs)		■	■		
	- plans & maps printed & disseminated		■	■	■	■
	2.2.5 Conduct independent progress audits					
- independent auditor selected		■				
- progress audits conducted		■	■	■	■	
<b>2.3 Technical Packages in Support of Sustainable Livelihoods are Evaluated</b>						
DAFF FAO SERVICE CONTRACT	2.3.1 Previous & ongoing approaches surveyed					
	- technical packages surveyed		■			
	2.3.2 Selected technical packages recommended for replication or further development					
	- results of survey analyzed		■			
	- provincial workshops conducted		■	■		
	- recommendations made for replication or further development		■			

Figure A2.3: Component 3 Activities

ACTIVITY		PROJECT YEAR				
		1	2	3	4	5
<b>C. Component 3: Building Management Capacity for Biodiversity Conservation in the TSBR</b>						
<b>3.1 Capacity for Management is Enhanced</b>						
DOE-Office of Nature Conservation & Protection	3.1.1 Establish & equip protected area management units (PAMs) & core area management centers (CAMs)					
	- incremental staff appointed	■				
	- vehicles & motorcycles procured	■				
	- new building constructed (Environment Office, Battambang)	■	■			
	- office renovated (Environment Office, Kompong Thom)	■	■			
	- 5 new buildings constructed (2 PAMs & 3 CAMs)	■	■			
	- office equipment & furniture procured & set-up	■	■			
	- communications base & transmitter stations procured & set-up	■	■			
	3.1.2 Institute a process for identification of additional core areas & fish sanctuaries					
	- surveys & studies conducted		■	■	■	■
	- provincial workshops conducted		■	■	■	■
	- national workshop conducted		■	■	■	■
	- maps & materials prepared		■	■	■	■
	- manual of standard procedures prepared & disseminated		■	■	■	■
3.1.3 Formulate & implement staff training for protected area management & biodiversity conservation						
- training needs assessed, candidates selected, & curriculum defined		■	■	■	■	
- training demonstration & materials prepared		■	■	■	■	
- provincial workshops conducted		■	■	■	■	
- national workshops conducted		■	■	■	■	
- training conducted		■	■	■	■	
<b>3.2 Systems for Monitoring &amp; Management are Developed</b>						
MOE-Department of Nature Conservation & Protection	3.2.1 Design & implement a biodiversity monitoring system					
	- indicator species identified	■				
	- provincial workshops conducted	■				
	- boats procured	■				
	- monitoring system designed & implemented	■	■	■	■	■
	- training materials & manuals prepared	■	■	■	■	■
	- equipment procured & set-up	■	■	■	■	■
	- training implemented	■	■	■	■	■
	- regional study tours designed & implemented	■	■	■	■	■
	3.2.2 Establish a rapid response mechanism for seasonal protection of biodiversity					
	- incremental staff appointed		■	■	■	■
	- boats procured		■	■	■	■
	- training program designed & conducted		■	■	■	■
	3.2.3 Develop a strategy, carry out an awareness campaign for the control of exotic species & conduct management trials					
	- strategy prepared		■	■	■	■
	- equipment procured & set-up		■	■	■	■
	- management trials set-up		■	■	■	■
- training program & awareness campaign designed & conducted		■	■	■	■	
- regional study tours designed & implemented (12 p-m)		■	■	■	■	
3.2.4 Develop & implement a strategy to enforce laws & regulations in & around key sites						
- provincial workshops conducted (coincident with workshops under 3.2.5)		■	■	■	■	
- strategy prepared		■	■	■	■	
- training materials & manuals prepared		■	■	■	■	
- training program designed & conducted		■	■	■	■	
3.2.5 Identify income-earning activities that directly threaten biodiversity & develop alternative livelihoods						
- surveys & studies conducted		■	■	■	■	
- provincial workshops conducted (coincident with workshops under 3.2.4)		■	■	■	■	
- special study of alternative livelihoods conducted		■	■	■	■	
- alternative livelihood systems disseminated		■	■	■	■	
<b>3.3 Biodiversity Conservation Awareness, Education &amp; Outreach are Promoted</b>						
MOE-Department of Environmental Education & Communications	3.3.1 Develop & implement an Environmental Awareness, Education & Outreach Program (EAEOP)					
	- strategy for the EAEOP developed		■	■	■	■
	- training demonstration, materials, & manual prepared		■	■	■	■
	- provincial workshops conducted		■	■	■	■
	- national workshops conducted		■	■	■	■
	- training program designed & conducted		■	■	■	■
	3.3.2 Provide floating environmental education centers					
	- large boats procured		■	■	■	■
	- training equipment procured		■	■	■	■
	3.3.3 Incorporate the EAEOP into selected schools around the TSBR					
- strategy for incorporation of EAEOP in cluster schools developed		■	■	■	■	
- school teaching materials prepared		■	■	■	■	
- local education institutes contracted to implement school outreach program		■	■	■	■	
- program implemented		■	■	■	■	

**Table A3.1: ANALYSIS OF OUTPUT ACCOMPLISHMENT  
AND IMPROVEMENT OF ACTIVITIES**

Component	Strengthening Natural Resource Management Coordination and Planning for the TSBR		1
Output	A coordination framework and information dissemination mechanisms are established.		1.1
Targets	Strengthen the TSBR Secretariat's structures and facilities.		1.1.1
	Create in the TSBR Secretariat capacity to address legal and policy issues.		1.1.2
	Formulate common policy objectives for management of the TSBR.		1.1.3
	Develop a TSBR Environmental Information Database (TSBR-ED).		1.1.4
	Formulate and implement a national environmental education and awareness campaign.		1.1.5
Is the output being accomplished?			Yes Partially No
What are the targets?			
1.1.1	The project design anticipated that TSBR Secretariat structures and facilities would be strengthened by end-year 1.		
1.1.2	The project design anticipated that the Policy, Strategy, and Networking Division in the TSBR Secretariat would be strengthened by end-year 1.		
1.1.3	The project design anticipated that common policy objectives would be formulated by the TSBR Secretariat by the end of the first quarter of year 2, and that quarterly interministerial meetings would be held to refine and adopt them by end-year 2.		
1.1.4	The project design anticipated that the service provider would be appointed by the end of the third quarter of year 1, that the TSBR-ED would be operational by mid-year 2, and that TSBR-ED updating would be carried out on a continuing basis thereafter.		
1.1.5	The project design anticipated that the service provider would be appointed by the end of the third quarter of year 1 and that environmental education messages would be formulated by mid-year 2 and disseminated through appropriate media outlets and schools from mid-year 2 and on a continuing basis thereafter.		
How are the activities being implemented?			
<u>Strength</u>		<u>Weakness</u>	
1.1.1	The policy and strategy advisor has begun to analyze the structural requirements of the TSBR Secretariat. Offices have been equipped and cars have been procured.	1.1.1	The identification of appropriate Secretariat structure was delayed by the late appointment of the Policy and Strategy Advisor. It is becoming clear that as the Secretariat develops there will be insufficient space for adequate functioning of the Secretariat.
1.1.2	A preliminary training needs assessment was conducted by the project management advisor and will be expanded and upgraded by the policy and strategy advisor. Staff of the Policy and Strategy Division of the TSBR Secretariat made a familiarization field visit. This staff has commenced informal technical capacity building through regular discussions with the policy and strategy advisor.	1.1.2	Junior staff of the TSBR Secretariat have limited skills and experience.
1.1.3	The policy and strategy advisor was fielded on 4 June 2004 and has begun to work toward the achievement of this target. Outputs from TA 4212-CAM: <i>Establishment of the Tonle Sap Basin Management Organization</i> are expected to provide useful and complementary inputs.	1.1.3	The person-months allocated to the policy and strategy advisor may be insufficient.
1.1.4	Local staff are already in place and have been developing preliminary equipment specifications. The PIO in the TSBR Secretariat has created a directory of existing GIS coverage.	1.1.4	This activity was delayed by the need to clarify ADB's direct selection procedure.
1.1.5	The PIO in MOE has developed a work plan and a quarterly bulletin on the Tonle Sap has been issued in the Khmer language. T6123-REG: <i>Promoting Effective Water Management Policies and Practices</i> (Phase 3), under which a pilot and demonstration activity for Developing and Testing Environmental Education and Awareness Methodologies and Tools was approved in February 2004, is expected to provide important inputs.	1.1.5	This activity was delayed by the need to clarify ADB's direct selection procedure.
How can the activities be improved?			
<u>Proposed Change</u>		<u>Justification</u>	
1.1.1	The TSBR Secretariat's structure should be designed in light of outputs from TA 4212-CAM: <i>Establishment of the Tonle Sap Basin Management Organization</i> .	1.1.1	TA 4212-CAM: <i>Establishment of the Tonle Sap Basin Management Organization</i> has basin-wide implications that the structure of the TSBR Secretariat should give expression to.
1.1.2	The preliminary training needs analysis should be deepened and finalized and a training plan should be elaborated.	1.1.2	Junior staff of the TSBR Secretariat have limited skills and experience.
1.1.3	Outputs from TA 4212-CAM: <i>Establishment of the Tonle Sap Basin Management Organization</i> should feed	1.1.3	TA 4212-CAM: <i>Establishment of the Tonle Sap Basin Management Organization</i> has basin-wide implications

Component	Strengthening Natural Resource Management Coordination and Planning for the TSBR	1
<p>development of the common policy objectives.</p> <p>1.1.4 The person-months of international consulting services in environmental database design should be increased by 2 person-months.</p> <p>1.1.5 The person-months of international consulting services in environmental education should be reallocated. The requirement is for 3 person-months of international consulting expertise in environmental education and 3 person-months of international consulting expertise in media-related matters.</p>	<p>that the common policy objectives should give expression to.</p> <p>1.1.4 The project design made inadequate provision for consulting expertise.</p> <p>1.1.5 The project design made inadequate provision for consulting expertise.</p>	
Action plan to improve the activities		
<p style="text-align: center;"><u>Action</u></p> <p>1.1.1 The strategy and policy advisor should initiate discussions with the constituent members of CNMC to better locate the TSBR Secretariat, especially in the context of outputs from TA 4212–CAM: <i>Establishment of the Tonle Sap Basin Management Organization</i>. Organization change in the TSBR Secretariat may call for additional office space.</p> <p>1.1.2 The strategy and policy advisor should complete the training needs analysis and develop and implement a training plan. He should review the suitability of current staff, based on the revised terms of reference to be developed during the review of the TSBR Secretariat's structure and the training needs analysis.</p> <p>1.1.3 The strategy and policy advisor should familiarize himself with outputs from TA 4212–CAM: <i>Establishment of the Tonle Sap Basin Management Organization</i> and monitor further developments regarding the proposed Tonle Sap basin management organization. He should also initiate discussions with the constituent members of CNMC.</p> <p>1.1.4 Contract negotiations should be entered promptly.</p> <p>1.1.5 Contract negotiations should be entered promptly.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><u>Target Date</u></p> <p>1.1.1 The TSBR Secretariat's structures and facilities should be strengthened by 30 September 2004.</p> <p>1.1.2 The Policy, Strategy, and Networking Division in the TSBR Secretariat should be strengthened by 30 September 2004.</p> <p>1.1.3 Common policy objectives should be formulated and the process of holding quarterly interministerial meetings to refine and adopt them should be in place by 31 December 2004.</p> <p>1.1.4 The service provider should be appointed by 30 June 2004.</p> <p>1.1.5 The service provider should be appointed by 30 June 2004.</p>	

**Table A3.2: ANALYSIS OF OUTPUT ACCOMPLISHMENT  
AND IMPROVEMENT OF ACTIVITIES**

Component	Strengthening Natural Resource Management Coordination and Planning for the TSBR		1
Output	The TSBR is mapped.		1.2
Targets	Prepare orthophotomaps at scale 1:5,000 from new aerial photographs at scale 1:25,000.		1.2.1
	Delineate biosphere zonation and boundaries of commercial and community fishing lots, fish sanctuaries, administrative regions, and physiographic features.		1.2.2
Is the output being accomplished?			Yes <b>Partially</b> No
What are the targets?			
1.2.1	The project design anticipated that aerial photography would be completed by mid-year 2 and orthophotomaps would be prepared immediately thereafter.		
1.2.2	The project design anticipated that biosphere zonation and other boundaries would be delineated from mid-year 2 and zonation maps would be prepared by end-year 2.		
How are the activities being implemented?			
<u>Strength</u>		<u>Weakness</u>	
1.2.1	The Imagery and Mapping Specialist provided valuable support and clarification of the scope of work required to meet the joint needs of CNMC, DOF, and MOE. His inputs also clarified that there would be no overlap of activities between this output and the ADB-assisted Commune Council Development Project. The resolutions required are different, i.e., 1:40,000 against the Project's requirement of 1:25,000, and black and white against the Project's requirement for color.	1.2.1 The scheduled delivery of aerial photographs will be delayed by 1 year.	
1.2.2	The achievement of this target is contingent on finalization and delivery of inputs toward target 1.2.1.	1.2.2 The achievement of this target component will also be delayed because of its dependency on inputs toward target 1.2.1.	
How can the activities be improved?			
<u>Proposed Change</u>		<u>Justification</u>	
1.2.1	It is proposed to expand the scope of work for aerial photography by including a set of aerial photographs at 1:12,000 for the three core areas of the Tonle Sap.	1.2.1 Aerial photography under the Project offers a unique opportunity to underpin natural resources management in the Tonle Sap region. It is an opportunity that might not arise again for years to come. The expanded scope of work will considerably strengthen the utility of aerial photographs and offer a sound basis for future environmental comparisons. The incremental cost of the proposed work is \$70,000. It is within the budget will easily be offset by the higher utility and broader application of the output.	
1.2.2	None.	1.2.2 Not applicable.	
Action plan to improve the activities			
<u>Action</u>		<u>Target Date</u>	
1.2.1	It is necessary to vigorously monitor and follow-up on all procurement activities to avoid slippages and delay.	1.2.1 The aerial photographs and their related materials in various formats are expected on or about 30 June 2005.	
1.2.2	Preparatory actions will be initiated to ensure the different maps are being produced as soon as possible after the delivery of aerial photographs.	1.2.2 It is expected that the various types of maps will start being prepared from 1 September 2005 onwards.	

**Table A3.3: ANALYSIS OF OUTPUT ACCOMPLISHMENT  
AND IMPROVEMENT OF ACTIVITIES**

Component	Strengthening Natural Resource Management Coordination and Planning for the TSBR		1
Output	Regulation and management planning are improved.		1.3
Targets	Prepare, complete, or as necessary amend the Fisheries Law and the subdecrees, proclamations, and directives or circulars associated with it and develop the 5-year Tonle Sap fisheries management plan.		1.3.1
	Set standards and guidelines for formulation of community and commercial fisheries management plans.		1.3.2
	Build the capacity of the Community Fisheries Development Office (CFDO) within the Department of Fisheries (DOF).		1.3.3
Is the output being accomplished?			Yes Partially No
What are the targets?			
1.3.1	The project design anticipated that the regulatory framework would be prepared, completed, or amended and that a 5-year Tonle Sap fisheries management plan would be developed by mid-year 2.		
1.3.2	The project design anticipated that standards and guidelines for formulation of community and commercial fisheries management plans would be set by end-year 1 and disseminated thereafter.		
1.3.3	The project design anticipated that six key staff of CFDO would be trained by mid-year 2 and that study tours would be conducted by mid-year 3.		
How are the activities being implemented?			
<u>Strength</u>		<u>Weakness</u>	
1.3.1	TA 3993–CAM: <i>Improving the Regulatory and Management Framework for Inland Fisheries</i> led to recommendations for improving the regulatory fisheries framework and the first ever 5-year General Fisheries Plan for Management and Development of the Tonle Sap.	1.3.1 The new Fisheries Law awaits approval in the National Assembly. This delays approval of the associated Subdecree on Community Fisheries and further strengthening of the regulatory framework. The administrative and operational status of the General Fisheries Plan for Management and Development of the Tonle Sap remains unclear.	
1.3.2	TA 3993–CAM: <i>Improving the Regulatory and Management Framework for Inland Fisheries</i> generated draft guidelines for establishment of community fisheries management organizations and guidelines for preparing fisheries management plans for community and commercial fisheries. It also generated draft terms of reference for the Tonle Sap Fisheries Management Task Force.	1.3.2 Linkages between community and commercial fisheries management plans and natural resource management, resource use rights, and obligations are lacking.	
1.3.3	Six key staff of the CFDO participated in the implementation of TA 3993–CAM: <i>Improving the Regulatory and Management Framework for Inland Fisheries</i> and, by so doing, gained valuable practical experience that will be further strengthened by other activities toward this output.	1.3.3 None.	
How can the activities be improved?			
<u>Proposed Change</u>		<u>Justification</u>	
1.3.1	The mandate of the Tonle Sap Fisheries Management Task Force should be extended so that the taskforce may become an integral part of fisheries management on the Tonle Sap. The task force should also act as coordinating agency to operationalize outputs from the Project.	1.3.1 Activating the Tonle Sap Fisheries Management Task Force and expanding its mandate will provide vital linkages between the Government and fishing communities on the Tonle Sap. An active task force would also disseminate legal and administrative provisions and keep the process of improving the regulatory and management framework alive.	
1.3.2	Same as above.	1.3.2 Same as above.	
1.3.3	None.	1.3.3 Not applicable.	
Action plan to improve the activities			
<u>Action</u>		<u>Target Date</u>	
1.3.1	The progress of the new Fisheries Law and associated Subdecree on Community Fisheries should be monitored closely and activities to promote awareness of the regulatory framework should be planned. The draft terms of reference of the Tonle Sap Fisheries Management Task Force should be expanded and finalized and the taskforce should be activated.	1.3.1 No target date can be set for approval of the Fisheries Law and its associated Subdecree on Community Fisheries. Activities to promote awareness of the regulatory framework will be initiated as soon as it is approved. The terms of reference of the Tonle Sap Fisheries Management Task Force should be expanded and approved by 1 September 2004. The task force should be activated immediately after that.	
1.3.2	The achievement of this target would also be facilitated by the action mentioned above.	1.3.2 Not applicable.	
1.3.3	The planning and organization of regional study tours and staff training could be initiated.	1.3.3 Planning and scheduling to be completed by mid-2005.	

**Table A3.4: ANALYSIS OF OUTPUT ACCOMPLISHMENT  
AND IMPROVEMENT OF ACTIVITIES**

Component	Organizing Communities for Natural Resource Management in the TSBR		2
Output	An implementation structure is formulated.		2.1
Targets	Refine approach to community organization.		2.1.1
	Strengthen provincial office structures and facilities in the five project provinces.		2.1.2
	Implement a training program for staff of relevant provincial line agencies.		2.1.3
	Develop a selection process and identify communities for organization.		2.1.4
Is the output being accomplished?		Yes	Partially
What are the targets?			
2.1.1	The project design anticipated that previous approaches to organizing communities for natural resource management would be reviewed, that the preferred approach would be refined, and that the service provider would be appointed by end-year 1.		
2.1.2	The project design anticipated that provincial office structures and facilities would be strengthened by mid-year 2.		
2.1.3	The project design anticipated that, in each of the five project provinces, 16 staff from the Department of Agriculture, Forestry, and Fisheries, 4 staff from the Department of Environment, and 4–5 staff of selected nongovernment organizations would be nominated and trained by end-year 2.		
2.1.4	The project design anticipated that fisheries and forestry communities would be identified in each project provinces by end-year 2.		
How are the activities being implemented?			
<u>Strength</u>		<u>Weakness</u>	
2.1.1	FAO's revised technical proposal is due within the next few days.	2.1.1	The slow selection process for the service provider has delayed community fisheries development as well progress toward sound management of natural resources.
2.1.2	Contracting for PIU rehabilitation has started and is progressing well. Local bids have been evaluated for the PIUs in Battambang, Pursat, Kompong Chhnang, and Siem Reap.	2.1.2	None.
2.1.3	The PIO in DOF and UNDP, by means of the UNDP Capacity 21-funded TA for <i>Capacity Building for Sustainable Development in the Tonle Sap Region</i> , provided preliminary training.	2.1.3	A training needs analysis has not yet been carried out. Hence, a detailed and consolidated training plan has not yet been developed.
2.1.4	TA 3993-CAM: <i>Improving the Regulatory and Management Framework for Inland Fisheries</i> provided valuable inputs, in the form of guidelines, toward the achievement of this target.	2.1.4	The fielding of FAO's team was delayed by several months.
How can the activities be improved?			
<u>Proposed Change</u>		<u>Justification</u>	
2.1.1	None.	2.1.1	FAO needs to accelerate submission of an acceptable draft technical proposal to prevent wide-ranging target slippages across the Project.
2.1.2	None.	2.1.2	Scheduled project activities are not yet due.
2.1.3	None.	2.1.3	Scheduled project activities are not yet due.
2.1.4	None.	2.1.4	Scheduled project activities are not yet due.
Action plan to improve the activities			
<u>Action</u>		<u>Target Date</u>	
2.1.1	After it has been received, FAO's revised technical proposal should be reviewed at the first opportunity. If it is found to be responsive, contract negotiations should be entered promptly.	2.1.1	The target date for review and approval of FAO's revised technical proposal is 30 June 2004. Contract negotiations should be completed by 31 August 2004. Consulting services should be fielded by 1 October 2004 at the latest.
2.1.2	The strengthening of provincial office structures and facilities in the five project provinces should be monitored closely.	2.1.2	All rehabilitation work should be completed by 31 August 2004. Office equipment should be purchased and installed in all offices not later than 30 September 2004. Procurement of transport facilities should be completed for all offices by 1 November 2004 (see procurement schedule).
2.1.3	DOF and MOE should activate to activate the PIUs through follow-up workshop activities and training. Additional training will be planned and scheduled once the consulting services have been fielded.	2.1.3	As soon as possible.
2.1.4	The PIUs should organize field trips to support existing community fisheries and identify areas for additional community development activities.	2.1.4	As soon as possible.

**Table A3.5: ANALYSIS OF OUTPUT ACCOMPLISHMENT  
AND IMPROVEMENT OF ACTIVITIES**

Component	Organizing Communities for Natural Resource Management in the TSBR	2	
Output	Communities are empowered.	2.2	
Targets	Activate commune councils and appropriate village-level structures for natural resource management.	2.2.1	
	Conduct community organization for natural resource management.	2.2.2	
	Review boundaries and describe community resource rights.	2.2.3	
	Encourage formulation by communities of natural resource management plans.	2.2.4	
	Conduct independent progress audits.	2.2.5	
Is the output being accomplished?	Yes	Partially	No
What are the targets?			
2.2.1	The project design anticipated that commune council and village-level meetings would address natural resource management by end-year 2.		
2.2.2	The project design anticipated that commune councils and village-level structures would be actively networking by mid-year 3 with support from nongovernment organizations (e.g., Community Aid Abroad, Leucaena Japonica, Southeast Asia Development Program, Community Capacity for Development).		
2.2.3	The project design anticipated that agreements and endorsements on boundaries and resource rights would be obtained not later than end-year 3.		
2.2.4	The project design anticipated that formulation of natural resource management plans by communities would be encouraged from year 3.		
2.2.5	The project design anticipated that independent progress audit reports would be submitted annually from end-year 2.		
How are the activities being implemented?			
<u>Strength</u>		<u>Weakness</u>	
2.2.1	Scheduled activities are not yet due.	2.2.1 None.	
2.2.2	Scheduled activities are not yet due.	2.2.2 None.	
2.2.2	Scheduled activities are not yet due.	2.2.3 None.	
2.2.4	Scheduled activities are not yet due.	2.2.4 None.	
2.2.5	Scheduled activities are not yet due.	2.2.5 None.	
How can the activities be improved?			
<u>Proposed Change</u>		<u>Justification</u>	
2.2.1	None.	2.2.1 Not applicable.	
2.2.2	None.	2.2.2 Not applicable.	
2.2.3	None.	2.2.3 Not applicable.	
2.2.4	None.	2.2.4 Not applicable.	
2.2.5	None.	2.2.5 Not applicable.	
Action plan to improve the activities			
<u>Action</u>		<u>Target Date</u>	
2.2.1	None.	2.2.1 None.	
2.2.2	None.	2.2.2 None.	
2.2.3	None.	2.2.3 None.	
2.2.4	None.	2.2.4 None.	
2.2.5	None.	2.2.5 None.	

**Table A3.6: ANALYSIS OF OUTPUT ACCOMPLISHMENT  
AND IMPROVEMENT OF ACTIVITIES**

Component	Organizing Communities for Natural Resource Management in the TSBR	2
Output	Technical packages in support of sustainable livelihoods are evaluated.	2.3
Targets	Survey previous and ongoing approaches to technical packages based on sustainable natural resource management.	2.3.1
	Recommend selected technical packages based on sustainable natural resource management for replication or further development.	2.3.2
Is the output being accomplished?		Yes      Partially      No
What are the targets?		
2.3.1	The project design anticipated that technical packages for sustainable fisheries, aquaculture, agroforestry, and community forestry would be surveyed by the end of the third quarter of year 2.	
2.3.2	The project design anticipated that selected technical packages would be recommended for replication or further development by end-year 2.	
How are the activities being implemented?		
<u>Strength</u>		<u>Weakness</u>
2.3.1 Scheduled activities will benefit from the work done in connection with TA 3997–CAM: <i>Chong Kneas Environmental Improvement</i> and TA 4197–CAM: <i>Tonle Sap Sustainable Livelihoods</i> .		2.3.1 Delays in generating the output may result in lost opportunities to reduce fishing pressure through the generation of alternative income opportunities.
2.3.2 Same as above.		2.3.2 Same as above.
How can the activities be improved?		
<u>Proposed Change</u>		<u>Justification</u>
2.3.1 None.		2.3.1 Not applicable.
2.3.2 None.		2.3.2 Not applicable.
Action plan to improve the activities		
<u>Action</u>		<u>Target Date</u>
2.3.1 DOF should instruct the service provider for component 2 to prioritize and accelerate implementation of this output in relation to the work program.		2.3.1 Previous and ongoing approaches to technical packages should have been surveyed and a report should have been presented by 30 June 2005.
2.3.2 Same as above.		2.3.2 Recommendations on selected packages should be made available by 30 September 2005.

### COMPLIANCE WITH LOAN COVENANTS

Reference in Loan Agreement	Covenant	Responsibility	Status of Compliance
LA, Sch. 6, Para. 1	<b>Project Executing Agency.</b> MAFF shall be the project executing agency and shall directly implement components 1 and 2 of the Project relating to the strengthening natural resources management coordination and planning for the TSBR and organizing communities for natural resources management in the TSBR.	MAFF	Complied with.
LA, Sch. 6, Para. 2	<b>Project Steering Committee.</b> A Project Steering Committee (PSC) consisting of the Minister of MAFF, Minister of MOE, Minister of MEF, Chairman of CNMC and the Governors of the project provinces, or their representatives, shall be chaired by the Minister of MAFF and shall be responsible for (i) providing advice on project implementation, (ii) providing mechanism for resolving project implementation problems beyond single ministerial mandates and (iii) reviewing project progress. PSC shall hold meetings every 6 months and, to the extent possible, concurrent with CNMC Board meetings.	CNMC, MAFF, MEF, MOE	Complied with.
LA, Sch. 6, Para. 3	<b>Project Monitoring and Coordination Office.</b> A Project Monitoring and Coordination Office (PMCO) shall be responsible for integrating project operations, including consolidating financial statements, harmonizing equipment specifications and procurement procedures, scheduling project activities and general administration. The PMCO shall be located in the TSBR Secretariat. The Permanent Deputy Secretary (Environment) of the TSBR Secretariat shall be the project coordinator. An international project management advisor, a domestic finance and administration specialist, a strategy and policy advisor, and other local staff for clerical, financial matters, shall assist the project coordinator. The three divisions of the TSBR Secretariat shall provide day-to-day technical support to serve the PMCO.	CNMC	Complied with.
LA, Sch. 6, Para. 4	<b>Project Implementation Offices.</b> The Project Implementation Offices (PIOs) shall assume responsibility for planning and budgeting of project activities and, as required, supervision and monitoring of provincial level field activities through Project Implementation Units (PIUs). The PIOs will be set up, respectively, in the DOF, the Department of Nature Conservation and Protection within MOE and the TSBR Secretariat. Each of the PIOs shall be staffed by, at least, one full-time staff designated to supervise and manage direct implementation activities under the Project. A PIU shall be set up within 3 months of the Loan Effectiveness in each of the project provinces and to be located in the Office of Fisheries in the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries and in the Department of Environment. The PIUs shall be responsible for implementing project activities at the provincial level.	CNMC, MAFF, MOE	Complied with.
LA, Sch. 6,	<b>NGOs.</b> The Borrower shall select and engage	MAFF	Not yet due.

Reference in Loan Agreement	Covenant	Responsibility	Status of Compliance
Para. 5	NGOs, with expertise in community organization for natural resource management, to assist in executing component 2 of the Project from the second year and to undertake annual independent progress audits from the end of the second year. The NGOs shall be selected from a shortlist agreed upon between ADB and MAFF.		
LA, Sch. 6, Para. 6	<b>Counterpart Funds.</b> Without prejudice to Section 4.02 of the Loan Agreement, the Borrower shall ensure that all necessary counterpart funds for project implementation are provided in a timely manner and, to such end, the Borrower shall make timely submissions of annual budgetary appropriation requests and take all other measures necessary or appropriate for prompt disbursement of appropriated funds during each year of project implementation.	CNMC, MAFF, MEF, MOE	Complied with.
LA, Sch. 6, Para. 7	<b>Regulatory Framework.</b> The Borrower shall ensure that it will prepare an amendment to the current legislation on fisheries, including the law, sub-decrees, proclamations and directives or circulars, on time and in the form and substance proposed and developed by the accompanying Technical Assistance on Improving the Regulatory and Management Framework for Inland Fisheries (the TA). Within 18 months of the Effective Date, the draft amendment to the Fisheries Law developed under the TA will have been submitted to the National Assembly. Within 6 months of the promulgation of the amended Fisheries Law, the Borrower shall issue the sub-decrees or the necessary implementing regulations.	MAFF	Complied with.
LA, Sch. 6, Para. 8	<b>Mapping.</b> The Borrower shall ensure and shall cause the executing agency to ensure that all maps and database products developed under Project will be made available to all interested parties.	MAFF	Not yet due.
LA, Sch. 6, Para. 9	<b>Gender.</b> The Borrower shall ensure that the Project will provide full opportunities for women, particularly female-headed households, to participate in community organization, representation and decision-making. At least 40 percent of seats in community organizations shall be allocated to women. Women shall be organized for training and capacity building for participation and leadership development. The Borrower shall further ensure that women will be selected for training on livelihoods development, value adding activities and preparation of linkages with ongoing micro finance programs.	MAFF	Not yet due.
LA, Sch. 6, Para. 10	<b>Ethnic Minorities.</b> The Borrower shall ensure that ethnic minorities will have equal opportunities to participate in training in community organization. The Project's impact on ethnic minorities will be observed during Project's monitoring and evaluation.	MAFF	Not yet due.
LA, Sch. 6, Para. 11	<b>Project Performance Monitoring and Evaluation.</b> The Borrower shall ensure that the progress of the Project and the achievement of its	CNMC, MAFF, MOE	Complied with.

Reference in Loan Agreement	Covenant	Responsibility	Status of Compliance
	benefits are monitored based on the project framework. The Borrower shall further cause PMCO to submit to the Borrower and ADB 6-monthly progress reports with close attention to project output accomplishment and improvement of activities.		
LA, Sch. 6, Para. 12	<b>Involuntary Resettlement.</b> The Borrower shall ensure that persons who have traditionally lived within the TSBR be included as part of the environment planning and management activities, as their existence is recognized and guaranteed under the TSBR decree; and the rights of non-titled land users to remain within the area shall be recognized. The Borrower shall further ensure that prior to the award of civil works contracts, it shall screen for involuntary resettlement effects, to ensure that there are no losses of land, income, housing, community facilities and resources that would require compensation to be paid in accordance with ADB's <i>Policy on Involuntary Resettlement</i> .	MEF, MAFF	Not yet due.
LA, Art. IV, Sect.4.03 (a)	<b>Particular Covenants.</b> In the carrying out of the Project, the Borrower shall cause competent and qualified consultants and contractors, acceptable to the Borrower and ADB, to be employed to an extent and upon terms and conditions satisfactory to the Borrower and ADB.	CNMC, MAFF, MOE	Complied with.
LA, Art. IV, Sect. 4.06 (b)	<b>Particular Covenants.</b> The Borrower shall (i) maintain, or cause to be maintained, separate accounts for the Project; (ii) have such accounts and related financial statements audited annually, in accordance with appropriate auditing standards consistently applied, by independent auditors whose qualifications, experience, and terms of reference are acceptable to ADB; (iii) furnish to ADB not later than 9 months after the end of each related fiscal year, certified copies of such audited accounts and financial statements and the report of the auditors relating thereto; and (iv) furnish to ADB such other information concerning such accounts and financial statements and the audit thereof as ADB shall from time to time reasonably request.	CNMC, MAFF, MEF, MOE	Not yet due. MEF should finalize selection of an independent auditor.
LA, Art. IV, Sect. 4.07 (b)	<b>Particular Covenants.</b> The Borrower shall furnish, or cause to be furnished, to ADB quarterly reports on the carrying out of the Project and on the operation and management of project facilities.	CNMC, MAFF, MOE	Complied with.
LA, Art. IV, Sect. 4.07 (c)	<b>Particular Covenants.</b> Promptly after physical completion of the Project, but in any event not later than 3 months thereafter or such date as may be agreed for this purpose between the Borrower and ADB, the Borrower shall prepare and furnish to ADB a report, in such form and in such detail as ADB shall reasonably request, on the execution and initial operation of the Project, including its cost, the performance by the Borrower of its obligations under the Loan Agreement, and the accomplishment of the purposes of the Loan.	CNMC, MAFF, MOE	Not yet due.

**LIST OF PARTICIPANTS AT THE WRAP-UP MEETING**

Name	Organization
Pich Dun	Deputy Secretary General, CNMC
Neou Bonheur	Project Director, L1935–CAM: Tonle Sap Environmental Management
Eng Cheasan	Deputy Director, DOF
Choeu San	Finance and Administration Specialist
Olivier Serrat	ADB
Paulin Van Im	ADB
Wolfram Jackel	CARM, ADB
Ernst Petersen	Fisheries Management Advisor
Gordon Claridge	Policy and Strategy Advisor
Imke Gilsing	UNESCO
Tim Whittington	Project Management Advisor