



Technical Assistance Consultant's Report

Project Number: PAK 37188
October 2005

Pakistan: Sindh Coastal and Inland Community Development Project (Financed by the Japan Special Fund)

Prepared by ANZDEC Limited Consultants

ANZDEC Limited, New Zealand

in cooperation with

Resource Monitoring and Development Group, Pakistan and

SEBCON (Pvt) Limited, Pakistan

This consultant's report does not necessarily reflect the views of ADB or the Government concerned, and ADB and the Government cannot be held liable for its contents. (For project preparatory technical assistance: All the views expressed herein may not be incorporated into the proposed project's design.)

Asian Development Bank



PAKISTAN
SINDH COASTAL AND INLAND COMMUNITY
DEVELOPMENT PROJECT
ADB TA 4525-PAK

INCEPTION REPORT

October 2005

Prepared for the
Planning and Development Department
Government of Sindh, Pakistan
and the
Asian Development Bank

by
ANZDEC Limited, New Zealand

in association with
Resource Monitoring and Development Group, Pakistan

and
SEBCON (Pvt) Limited, Pakistan

CONTENTS

Contents	i
Abbreviations and Acronyms	ii
I. BACKGROUND	1
A. Terms of Reference and Scope of Work.....	1
B. Organization.....	1
II. ACTIVITIES DURING INCEPTION PHASE	1
A. Mobilization of Consultants	1
B. Project Steering Committee	2
C. ADB Inception Mission	3
D. Review of Existing Reports and Data	3
E. TA Facilities.....	3
F. Meetings and Consultations Held	4
III. WORK PLAN	5
A. Comments on Terms of Reference	5
B. Scope of Project.....	7
C. Proposed Work Plan	12
D. Issues	16
APPENDIXES	
1. Terms of Reference	18
2. Schedule of People Met and Meetings/Consultations Held	23
3. Project Steering Committee – Minutes of first meeting 15 August 2005	27
4. Revised Work Plan and Personnel Schedule	34

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

AD	Assistant Director
ADB	Asian Development Bank
CDA	Coastal Development Authority
DDG	Deputy Director General
DG	Director General
EA	Executing Agency
EGIS	Environment and GIS Project for Water Sector Planning
GIS	Geographic(al) Information Systems
GoS	Government of Sindh
ICLARM	International Center for Living Aquatic Resources Management (now 'The World Fish Center')
ICZM	Integrated Coastal Zone Management
IEC	Information, Education and Communication
IUCN	International Union for the Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources (a.k.a. 'World Conservation Union')
MSY	Maximum Sustainable Yield
NGO	Non-Government Organization
PFF	Pakistan Fisher-Folk Forum
PDI	Participatory Development Initiative
SCICDP	Sindh Coastal and Inland Community Development Project
SRDP	Sindh Rural Development Project
TA	Technical Assistance
ToR	Terms of Reference
WWF	World Wide Fund (now known as The World Wide Fund for Nature)

I. BACKGROUND

A. Terms of Reference and Scope of Work

1. The scope of work as identified in the TA documents requires the formulation of an investment project able to (i), address or at least contribute towards improving the condition of coastal and marine fisheries and related resources and (ii) increase incomes of coastal communities. This is to be accomplished by improving the management of coastal resources and ecosystems and minimizing threats to their ecological integrity. Elsewhere in the TA documents, under the heading of “Outputs, Activities and Inputs” there is a more specific itemizing of intended outputs. These however simply elaborate on the above work plan and again they reiterate the emphasis on coastal zone management and livelihood improvement.
2. The outline terms of reference for the TA is given in Appendix 1.

B. Organization

3. The Executing Agency (EA) is the Sindh Government Planning and Development Department. Practical implementation of day-to-day Project matters will be managed through the (Sindh) Coastal Development Authority (CDA). CDA is the Sindh Government’s coordinating authority, established by the Sindh Government under the CDA Act of 1994. CDA is tasked with the “development, improvement and beautification of the coastal areas of the Thatta, Badin and Karachi coastal districts”. To accomplish this, CDA works with line agencies to identify, develop and oversee the implementation of projects and to ensure the disbursement of project funds once these have been allocated. CDA works with its constituents to identify suitable interventions, evaluate such proposed interventions, seeks funding for them and subsequently supports and monitors their implementation. Actual implementation is usually undertaken by the line agencies, which in turn often work with NGOs and stakeholders.

II. ACTIVITIES DURING INCEPTION PHASE

A. Mobilization of Consultants

4. The Team Leader arrived in Karachi on 30 July 2005, and has been present throughout the Inception Phase, to date. He was accommodated in the CDA office and was provided with support from the Assistant Director Agriculture and the Assistant Director Infrastructure. The office accommodation was small and inadequate for the number of consultants to be accommodated. Rudimentary attempts were initially made to locate additional office space but a lack of counterpart funding made the task somewhat futile. At the end of September, ADB agreed a budget of USD 18,000 for “Office Accommodation and Facilities”, to be reallocated from the TA Contingency, and this has enabled the acquisition of additional, more suitable, office space in a meeting room at the Marriott Hotel.
5. During the Inception Phase, and up to early October, the following other consultant mobilizations and inputs have been effected:

Name	Position	Input
<u>International Consultants</u>		
Roger McIntyre	Rural Sociologist / Community Development Specialist	Mobilized 16 August Demobilized 5 September
James Keddie	Enterprise Development Specialist	Mobilized 4 September Demobilized 17 September Mobilized 2 October
Ian Hancock	Farming Systems Specialist	Mobilized 1 September Demobilized 15 September Mobilized 4 October
John Carter	Coastal Resource Management	Mobilized 30 September
Robert Lindley	Fisheries Infrastructure Specialist	Mobilized 3 October
Rebecca de Cruz	Coastal Environmental Specialist	Mobilized 9 October
Geoff Bastin	Economist	Mobilized 9 October
<u>Domestic Consultants</u>		
Arif Naseer Pervaiz	Coastal Institutions & Policy Specialist/Deputy Team Leader	Mobilized 8 August
Fayyaz Rasool	Coastal Resources Management Specialist	Mobilized 15 August
Qamaruddin Baloch	Coastal Fisheries Infrastructure Specialist	Mobilized 22 August
Syed Husain Niaz Rizvi	Coastal Environment Specialist	Mobilized 22 August
Waheed Ahmed	Fisheries	Mobilized 15 August
Syed Hussain Mustafa Rizvi	Infrastructure Development	Mobilized 1 September
Suqlain Haider	Financial Management	Mobilized 1 September
Shaheen Khan	Sociologist	Mobilized 19 September
Mubashara Atif	Gender Specialist	Mobilized 1 September
Saad-us Samad	Enterprise Specialist	Mobilized 1 September
Samiullah Agha	Farming Specialist	Mobilized 1 September

B. Project Steering Committee

6. The Government of Sindh has notified the establishment of a Project Steering Committee¹ (see Appendix 3). The first meeting of the Committee occurred on Monday 15 August. The minutes of the meeting is attached at Appendix 3. The main outcomes of the meeting were an increased awareness of intended Project outcomes amongst Steering Committee members and initial arrangements for greater discussion with stakeholders on the issues that they felt needed to be examined. The meeting also allowed the TA Team Leader the opportunity of broadly outlining the approach that the specialists would adopt and their preference for selecting fewer but sustainable interventions.

¹ Notification No.SO(C-IV)/SGA&CD/(04)P&D/2005

C. ADB Inception Mission

7. The ADB's Inception mission, comprising Ahsan Tayyab (Project Economist) and Vidhisha Samarasekara (Natural Resources Management Specialist), visited the Project over the period 19 to 25 August. A series of meetings with indicative stakeholders and with senior officials were held (see Appendix 2) and a working outline of the Projects likely direction was discussed. The discussions culminated in a wrap-up meeting attended by senior officials from Government Departments and civil society organizations with a draft Aide Memoire.

8. A second mission (Tripartite Review Mission) took place from 27 September to 4 October 2005. The Inception Report, submitted on 19 September 2005, was reviewed during this mission, and this final Inception Report takes account of that review where appropriate. An Aide Memoire was issued, detailing the key points of the discussions and agreements reached.

D. Review of Existing Reports and Data

9. Reports and data have been procured from the key implementing agencies of the Sindh provincial government and from established civil society agencies, reputable NGOs and from district governments. Wherever possible attempts have been made and will continue to be made to test the veracity of the information prior to utilizing it in the design phase of the project.

10. What emerges from these reports highlights the problems confronting Sindh and stresses that the effects of the problems are serious and extensive. Of considerable concern is that these difficulties are being confronted largely through a series of project based interventions that are coordinated only by the willingness of project individuals and teams to cooperate during implementation phases. Furthermore a number of the interventions tackle problems that whilst seemingly important are vulnerable to external influences beyond the immediate reach of that particular project. And so whilst many of the reports make for compelling reading they appear to fail to clearly distinguish between symptoms and causes, a weakness that is carried forward into the design of the interventions. A critical issue for the TA is to clearly identify the underlying causes of many of the issues within the coastal zone and then to ascertain if there is consensus over which of the project underlying causes will be addressed. Fundamental issues relating to hydrology and hydrologic flows into the Project districts, land use issues, institutional issues relating to mandates, jurisdiction, and authority, and vertical and horizontal coordination factors, are unlikely to be resolved during the project timeframe. The scope of the proposed project will need to clearly identify which of these constraints can be addressed as well as reflect the real constraints that will persist throughout the Project. There needs to be a clear understanding and recognition of this at the first tripartite meeting.

E. TA Facilities

Office and Support Facilities

11. As per the TA documents, the intention was that the Government's counterpart funds would provide office accommodation and support facilities for the duration of the TA. Accordingly there was only a minimal provision for these items in ANZDEC's

proposal. However in the absence of counterpart funds and/or facilities up to now, alternative arrangements have had to be made, in order to correct the unsatisfactory situation for consultants where there was a lack of cohesion and inability to exchange ideas and interact. These alternative arrangements include seeking a contract variation for funds to rent suitable office space for twenty consultants. The need, whilst critical, is only likely to remain critical until early December. The outcome is that consultants, some two months after the Project began, are now working from a meeting room in the Marriott Hotel whilst Project administrative matters are managed from a small office within CDA.

Vehicles

12. As per the TA documents, there is some provision in the TA budget for hire of vehicles; however, the additional support of Government vehicles has not eventuated and the Project team has been funding field trips from funding that was originally intended to provide for additional vehicles and for transport within Karachi. The situation was not sustainable, especially given that it has proved impossible to hire satisfactory four wheel drive vehicles which are better to access the rural areas covered by the Project. The effect of this situation has been to limit field access during the inception phase. Up to now, no counterpart support for vehicles has been received. Included within the earlier mentioned contract variation was a request to increase the TA budget for vehicle costs, to cover these costs for the life of the TA.

F. Meetings and Consultations Held

13. It will be important during the TA to maintain close consultation with ADB, Government, and other stakeholders and concerned parties. A list of people met and meetings and consultations held during the Inception Phase are given in Appendix 2.

14. Many of these meetings, especially the ones held in Thatta and Badin with the District Governments, have demonstrated the depth of need at community level and the shortfall of response available from the government. The underlying problem appears to stem from deep rooted structural problems, especially in the areas of policy and public sector organization.

15. In addition to the list included in Appendix 2, there are others who participated in the ensuing discussions, and discussions with community groups that occurred in a less structured environment. For example there have been extensive discussions with influential landowners, small farmers and fishers and with ordinary people who at best could be described as squatter/survivors. Many of the people met have no regular or reliable means of income.

16. Further meetings are scheduled and a network of TA stakeholder support is now being established. Team members have been at pains to ensure that a cross section of stakeholders are involved. What has become evident is that there is a high degree of fatigue and disinterest with communities when it comes to the proings of specialists. It is also evident that some of the civil society organizations are little more than agitators and political opportunists. However, there are some that have justifiable reasons for doubting the effectiveness of donor programs and these have resorted to, at times, vehement public criticism of donor attempts to alleviate the predicament of those at risk. Wherever possible we have sought to engage with these groups, notably the Pakistan Fisher-Folk Forum (PFF) and to a much lesser extent because their motives remain obscure, the Participatory Development Initiative (PDI).

III. WORK PLAN

A. Comments on Terms of Reference

General

17. Based on outcomes from a series of meetings it is apparent that the intent of the proposed Project, and its subsequent contribution to development in Sindh, will only succeed if the proposed initiatives are developed through a genuine process of consultation with key stakeholders. Clearly there have been innumerable studies of Sindh, its problems and likely solutions. Many of these problems can, directly or indirectly, be laid at the feet of problematic natural resource management capacity, notably affecting fresh water and the environment. In this respect, some initiatives that may eventuate as a result of this project could be seen as treating symptoms rather than causes, in that their impact is oblique or modest in the face of core issues.

18. There is a divergence between the TA paper and the situation on-ground in that the TA paper reads as though there is a functional but perhaps ailing institutional environment able to support the Project. However it is apparent that the institutions are far less functional than simply ailing and the expectations implicit in the TA paper are perhaps probably unattainable within a limited project timeline, especially with respect to the capacity to both implement and sustain a significant investment program.

19. The initial reviews indicate that the institutional arrangements for Agriculture, Forests and Fisheries are largely non-functional. CDA partially falls into the same area and its future is also uncertain, in part due to the ongoing process of devolution. The institutional malaise is amplified by diffident implementation of the devolution process and the inevitable uncertainty of provincial officials who, having heard of devolution, have not as yet seen a corresponding change in their role. In essence, and it is too early to be certain, it appears that devolution is proceeding on one level because it empowers provincial leaders, whilst at another level, that of the provincial government departments, little has changed.

20. As a consequence of the institutional malaise the institutional basis for introducing and strengthening an effective coastal zone management regime is highly unlikely. The initial reviews would indicate that coastal zone management interventions still need to develop some of the preconditions for a successful intervention including (i) an agreement on the nature and scope of the problems to be addressed and (ii) consensus over what the future or vision may be for the management of coastal zone management including the institutional arrangements and the range of underlying threats to be addressed. Once these conditions are established (iii) the building of human, institutional, informational, and financial capacity to implement coastal zone management will be necessary. Our initial assessments indicate that (i) and (ii) above have yet to be effectively dialogued and agreed which makes achieving consensus about specifying point (iii) difficult. The scope of the investment and its role in coastal zone management needs to be a core issue to be agreed at the tripartite meetings.

21. The other issue that is coming to light is the implications of the two sister programs; the ADB's Sindh Rural Development Project and the World Bank's Sindh Development Project, which CDA is the EA for. Both of these have similar ambitions to this TA and these are currently being reviewed, to sort through the respective tasks and ideally, at least on paper, look at allocating who does what. This may require some changes to this TA.

22. One main problem is the magnitude of the gulf between what the Project wishes to address and the capacity of the government departments to support any sort of durable implementation. Once this TA has identified the need for specific interventions a great many of them should have non-government implementing arrangements to better their chance of survival. This in itself will be a major issue, especially for departments who see investment programs as their life blood.

Specific

23. There are more specific areas of the ToR which need to be reviewed, in line with the above general concerns, as follows:

24. Policy and Institutions Specialist, Item (vi) "Review Government policy etc" covers a dynamic set of issues that are still far from settled. The ADB have an ongoing Project called the Decentralization Support Program which seeks to strengthen the role of subnational Government. Our contribution needs to recognize the work of the ADB's sister program and reflect the likely changes within the design of the investment program.

25. Whilst we can certainly address the ToR our effectiveness to influence implementation of whatever is recommended is slight, given that there is considerable confusion, and in some instances, especially amongst officials, resistance to the decentralization process. The ADB needs to review how these programs will interact and discuss any linkages with the respective government agencies.

26. Coastal Resource Management Specialist, Item (vii) "Design a management component" is a mammoth task given the comments above and the current status of many of the data sets and information required to do so. For example, there is almost no data for the fisheries sector that is less than 20 years old. We can design a coastal resource management framework and present the logic for recommending it; for it to be effective it needs to be accompanied by a substantial institutional and capacity building program able to bring a moribund Department of Fisheries back on line. At best it is a Department in name only at present. As such the proposed investment needs to incorporate a larger than expected institutional development program that once agreed could be financed using bilateral grant monies or alternatively the government could include it within the investment program.

27. Farming Systems Specialist. Like Fisheries, Agricultural institutions are evident more by their deficiencies than their contributions, and is similarly included within the ongoing dialogue and plans for devolution. Effectively extension services, and research and development programs, are moribund, in part due to inclination but also due to inadequate resources and the ongoing confusion over devolution and the lack of clarity for the responsibility for undertaking core functions. We can certainly address the TA ToR but realistically this will remain piecemeal strengthening and has the potential to be largely wasted. Ideally Agriculture needs a more detailed and thorough review with a supporting reform and strengthening program (taking account also of the ADB Sindh Agricultural Sector Programme II). Such a program would incidentally encompass most of the issues within the ToR.

28. Fisheries/Aquaculture Specialist. This is also a difficult case. The most recent data is more than 20 years old and even is of questionable pedigree. There is currently absolutely no way of calculating a Maximum Sustainable Yield (MSY) short of conducting an exhaustive stock assessment, which would likely take at least a couple of years detailed work. As a consequence any possible fishery investment has a significant risk of being environmentally damaging, and non-viable due to the lack of knowledge of the underlying resource base.

29. What we are finding is that the Department of Fisheries is in desperate need of reform. There are few if any real management tools or administrative systems in place. There is no licensing, no record of catch and effort data, and no (reliable) policing. Furthermore, this is compounded by the institutional arrangements for the offshore fishery which remains the responsibility of the Federal Department of Fisheries. We are attempting to deal with this issue but it is fraught with non-fishing sensitivities and non-technical objectives that will continue to dominate the decision making.

B. Scope of Project

30. Bearing in mind the previous section, it is proposed that we consider it necessary to recommend certain changes in the scope of the proposed project. The project needs to *more comprehensively address the matter of institutional capacity in order to make proposed project interventions more sustainable. For certain interventions, it is necessary to strengthen institutional capacity and arrangement needs prior to the provision of investment, while for others there is a need to implement the institutional reforms in parallel to the investment interventions.*

31. The TA paper seeks to address the introduction of ICZM and sustainable coastal livelihood development however this still needs to be clarified. The issue of ICZM requires significant dialogue on the institutional rights, roles, responsibilities and most important the relationships between these. Once these have been clarified there needs to be significant strengthening as part of the process of developing consensus on the need for ICZM and the future vision of how it will operate. The cross-sectoral and integrative nature of ICZM is a direct contradiction of how systems currently operate.

32. Likewise while we strongly support the notion of adopting sustainable livelihood improvement programs as an integral part of the proposed rationale for the investment program the ability to transform this into an implementable strategy through a set of competing sector interests is challenging. More importantly, the diagnostic stage of a livelihoods approach will probably identify constraints and vulnerabilities that lie far beyond the scope of the project. In this regard we refer to issues such as hydrology, fish catch, skills to compete for non-resource intensive employment, roads and essential infrastructure. The ability to maintain the integrity of a sustainable livelihoods program requires strong stakeholder involvement, however if the major constraints and vulnerabilities faced by communities remain outside the scope of the investment program, or likewise the capacity of institutions to implement programs, the livelihoods investment may be non-sustainable.

33. Based upon the above, and the TA documents, and the initial meetings and work undertaken during the Inception Phase (including the ADB Inception Meeting), the following criteria for selection of projects, and ensuing indicative projects has evolved:

Selection Criteria

34. Attempts have been made to assess the viability of the likely interventions. The Project document incorporates elements of coastal zone management, livelihood improvement, gender issues, infrastructure and institutional strengthening. The sweep of potential projects is considerable but the Project should avoid attempting to tackle too much, preferring instead to identify underlying or core problems where sensible inputs may produce worthwhile outcomes. Almost certainly this will expose the Project to a degree of criticism in that it may be guilty of sidestepping a particular issue and as such the project selection process will need to be both rigorous and transparent. Only projects that can produce benefits which can be sustained and fit within the wider objective of sustainable livelihoods and resource management will be considered.

35. Some of the current fishery interventions, such as cage culture and shrimp farming are a response to seemingly immense difficulties in managing the capture fishery but enormous care must be taken in selecting the type of intervention. Large-scale shrimp aquaculture has for example failed largely due to poor operational management and a propensity by owners to chase short-term profits. On the other hand small scale aquaculture shows considerable potential, especially given its suitability in what are now largely degraded areas. These new endeavors may be valuable, but they are not an alternative to addressing the underlying issues in the capture fishery and as such are not justifiable. At best they may augment capture fishery interventions and every effort should be made to ensure proper management of the capture fishery.

36. Clearly agriculture production lies at the heart of improving incomes for the rural poor in Sindh. The major constraints that the sector faces are the inadequacy of water, and the inadequacy of transport infrastructure and in particular roads. There needs to be a clear agreement over the scope of the proposed investment program to address these issues or not.

37. New crops and more productive practices clearly help but if farmers are unable to get their produce to market or can only get it to market at an unacceptably low price because buyers or transport owners control delivery to customers then improvements in farm practice and production are effectively marginalized and the investment will prove to be non-viable.

38. The Project calls for infrastructure development but some of the examples given, such as coldstores and jetties, are themselves examples of market failures that have their origins in policy failure and mismanagement. Coldstores may appear inadequate but the community is sufficiently industrious to ensure private sector investment in such infrastructure were the policy environment sufficiently supportive.

39. Parallel to this issue is the matter of fisheries management. Too many fishers or too little fish or a mix of both plus the illicit dealings of those able to apply clandestine influence in the sector effectively condemn poor fishers to a treadmill of low returns and indebtedness. These are not issues that can be quickly resolved but they are issues that can be resolved by taking control of the fisheries management process plus ensuring that fishers have a degree of tenure. The middlemen financiers may well be the demons they are portrayed to be but they are also a classic symptom of a fishery that is badly managed.

40. In looking at the question of sustainability in its widest sense it is necessary to also look at other issues. In addressing the plight of rural poor the provision of micro credit is often cited as a solution to the insidious problem of bonded or indebted labor. But the solution is not always so simple in that the problems often stem from insufficient production or more accurately, insufficient access to markets. This can result from any number of causes such as, poor roads, poor soil, inept farming or fishing practices, a lack of water or too much water and salinity. The provision of credit is productive but only when other matters are favorably aligned.

41. The point of the above examples is to demonstrate that whilst each issue may in its own right warrant a project-based intervention, it is the underlying impediments to development and environmental wellbeing that this Project wishes to tackle. With this in mind the Project selection process has been moving towards identifying a few carefully thought through interventions that have potential to leave a lasting or at least long-term benefit and are receptive towards subsequent interventions and enhancements.

42. In this regard one of the more productive interventions would appear to be institutional strengthening within selected government departments, for example agriculture, fisheries and forests. These are line departments that exercise extensive influence over rural development in Sindh and supporting them with initiatives that assist in the delivery of services would have a major impact on economic development in the districts. Such reform could be aligned with the recent devolution process to ensure better delivery of services to Thatta and Badin.

43. The role of CDA needs to be further evaluated. Despite the temptation to expand its mandate by making it more authoritative as a development agency this would likely only eventuate at the expense of line agencies, possibly provoking an uncalled for confrontation or at the very least creating disharmony. One option currently being considered is to strengthen CDA but as a project management unit within the Planning and Development Department. The unfortunate and almost inevitable experience when planning is separated from implementation is that the planning agency can blame the implementing agency and the implementing agency can blame the planning agency. And whilst it is not always feasible to place planning within a line agency it is certainly advisable to ensure that the planners and the implementers have a conduit that enables full cooperation. This could be a role for CDA.

44. CDA could ensure cooperation during the planning stage and provide project oversight, monitoring and evaluation during implementation stage. CDA could also be instrumental in deciding on the mode of implementation, especially whether implementation should be a public, private or civil society initiative. Implicit with this would be the need for a comprehensive and integrated land use management plan, where land use issues could be identified and monitored.

45. The environmental degradation occurring along the vulnerable coastline is seriously alarming. The uncertainty of water flows in the lower Indus is not an issue that this Project can tackle but it certainly can support the efforts of those committed to ameliorating the current position. Involvement in managing the coastal zone process is an area where the ADB and members of the Project team have considerable experience. Therefore in looking at possible interventions the Project team would urge a composite mangrove and saline tolerant tree and fodder crop planting program.

46. The one other area where the Project team feels it can make a worthwhile contribution is in enterprise development. For example at a recent village meeting the school, through an NGO, maintained a computer awareness program. This seemed futile especially in a rural backwater where animal husbandry, horticulture, carpentry or small engine maintenance would have seemed more relevant for providing income earning opportunities. There are both public and civil society organizations providing such enterprise training but they are under-funded and their coverage is marginal.

Indicative Projects

47. At this stage no specific or core projects have been identified although some potential projects emerge as having a key role in the areas of ensuring sustainability and meeting needs. These include institutional strengthening or capacity building within key agencies such as CDA and the Department of Fisheries, specific environmental interventions such as an extension to the mangrove planting program and one or two specific community or district based programs intended to improve infrastructure and community wellbeing. The latter would include gender and livelihood initiatives.

48. There has already been some preliminary discussion on the scope of activities that could be incorporated within the above mentioned main headings and these include the following:

- Mangrove reforestation and rehabilitation
- Small-scale power generation (solar and wind)
- Provision of fresh water (irrigation and desalination)
- Infrastructure (jetties, roads, fish landing facilities)
- Livestock and crop support
- Livelihood enhancement (pen fish culture, shrimp culture, feed mills)
- Enterprise training (interfaced with parallel education programs)
- IEC capacity (farmer, fisher and peoples radio)

49. It should be noted however that these are indicative only and are identified largely to prompt discussion that may further help the project selection process.

50. The mix of projects effectively covers short and medium to longer term interventions. Some of the former will be especially helpful in attracting the community's interest and participation in the wider program. What will guide the selection of projects however is their ability to be sustained long after the consulting program has concluded.

51. The addressing of the institutional structures and capacities which are necessary to sustain the bulk of anticipated project initiatives is something which could be addressed by either of, or a combination of, an additional pre-loan project TA and/or selected front loaded TA inputs within the loan project itself.

Possible Projects

52. Before embarking on a design program it would be helpful to have some guidance on projects that, at least at this stage, fall within the scope of the proposed investment. A discussion on these would help ensure that the various specialists make the best possible use of their time during the design phase. We propose that this be one of the major issues for the series of inception meetings and also for the tripartite meeting

so that all parties have the same expectations.

Capacity Building of CDA

53. The key agency in meeting the intended output of the Project is CDA. Clearly they play a valuable and decisive role in Sindh's development program and the stated purpose of this Project is to help CDA prepare the Sindh Coastal and Inland Community Development Project (SCICDP). In this regard, the capacity of CDA to accomplish the objectives set for it becomes a key assumption for the success of the project. Not only must CDA acquire the skills to apply identified developments but there must be the political and institutional will that enables CDA to operate. Weakness in this area jeopardizes the entire project.

54. CDA is a policy driven agency rather than an implementing agency. It's needs, political will, includes intellectual capacity and appropriate equipment, namely items such as computers, printers, vehicles, almost certainly geographical information systems (GIS) capacity, plus provision for specific training.

55. It would also be helpful if, within the suggested capacity building initiative, there was provision for the preparation of what, in generic terms, amounts to a land use management plan. Effectively such a plan would identify the scope and purpose of CDA's work and establish processes for identifying, developing and subsequently implementing appropriate initiatives. Such a document is a planning tool that identifies land use, ecology, community demographics, natural resources, archeological or sites of great value and other matters that CDA deals with on a daily basis.

56. Equally as important, the capacity building plan should identify where current development projects are occurring. Despite intense efforts by members of this project it has proved almost impossible to track the scope and geographical spread of existing programs. Consolidating awareness of development initiatives within CDA would go a long way to coordinating such initiatives. A geographical information system (GIS) potentially offers CDA a powerful, integrated, planning, monitoring and evaluation tool, not just for CDA but its sister agencies. The ADB has had recent experience with such a document and system when it funded the updating of Sri Lanka's Coastal Zone Management Plan in 2003 and 2004.

Roads

57. There has been mention of a coastal highway. Roads tend to be hugely expensive undertakings but when sensibly planned and implemented can greatly improve economic and social outcomes. At this stage, any thoughts on roads are limited to smaller access roads at the district level, especially access to approximately 17 major creeks and waterways, however some guidance on this matter would be appreciated. If a road construction program emerges as a likely output, the program will align its activities with the ADB's Road Sector Development Program.

58. What the Project will seek to avoid is tackling too many issues. In this respect the design will provide for a concise selection of doable programs that as much as possible both use and supplement existing delivery mechanisms. If needed there may well be provision for some capacity building to strengthen the means of delivery but wherever possible the design will seek to avoid reinventing the wheel or instigating parallel programs.

Industrial and small-scale fishing

59. Coastal fisheries offer considerable potential but, and it is a subjective judgment, the majority of small scale fishers appear to be struggling to meet direct costs and in many instances have been reduced to fishing at a subsistence level. These are classic indicators of too many fishers chasing too few fish and the solution is not more or better technology but fewer fishers. Two matters arise. The first is that there are no current data on the status of fish stocks, nor for that matter fish catches whilst the second is that to avoid an economic and resource collapse in the fishery, a decisive new management system is required. This will include practices that extend to the role of larger, industrial fishing vessels that should, but allegedly don't always, fish in deeper offshore water.

60. These large vessels, if they do fish inside provincial waters (inside twelve miles), devastate the seabed environment with their massive fishing gear and pose a threat to the economic and physical wellbeing of small fishers. It is accepted that one moderately successful industrial trawler of say 40 meters length, can replace the activities of thirty or more smaller, local vessels. This argument is often used to argue for "efficiencies of scale" by urging that smaller and more numerous vessels be replaced with fewer but larger vessels. However once the net social, environmental and economic impacts of one large vessel are measured against that of thirty or more smaller vessels, the balance may well favor the interests of the small.

61. Yet another key assumption affecting the objectives set for the Project arises. If the biological and economic productivity of the fishery cannot be restored, especially given the parallel transformations that have been occurring in the coastal process (seawater intrusion and coastal erosion), then the livelihood of some of the vulnerable in the coastal zone (the fishers) are at grave risk. There are solutions but realistically they are neither simple nor politically risk free.

Institutions and individuals

62. Normally the implementation of projects, post the design phase, is undertaken with the help of individual specialists. It would be helpful if we could design for the possible inclusion of organizations as well as individual consultants. More specifically some of the fisheries issues could benefit with input from, for example, World Fish (previously ICLARM) based in Penang and other issues from input from organizations such as The Environment and GIS Project for Water Sector Planning (EGIS).

C. Proposed Work Plan

Approach and Methodology

63. CDA has a good track record but the need for its services are compelling and the resources available only modest. Clearly the province is in the grip of enormous development pressures and even the Government must at times feel that its capacity to manage these events is under threat. Nevertheless, the Project must work within the reality of what is possible and in this regard the abiding consideration must be to identify initiatives that meet the poverty alleviation and environmental objectives set for the Project and ensure that these remain sustainable and viable long after the Project concludes. In essence, this may well mean identifying public and private partnerships where the government, civil society and the community link to achieve sought after outcomes. The abiding concern is to have initiatives that directly or indirectly improve the livelihood prospects of the target communities and in their own small way contribute towards reversing the rate of social, environmental and economic decline occurring most notably in the rural areas of the region.

64. Fortunately, CDA remains highly motivated but lacks direction, resources and more worthwhile tasks. Initial discussions with its sister agencies indicate that they too are equally committed but like CDA suffer with resource constraints. There is also a well established network of civil society organizations and the relevant communities are familiar and supportive. Key to future development in Sindh is finding an appropriate role for CDA.

Approach

65. The Project design will be critical. Some of the underlying difficulties are triggered by external events over which Sindh Province and this Project have little immediate influence. Almost certainly this means narrowing the selection process and concentrating on projects that contribute to the objectives and are achievable. At the pre-inception meeting one of the Steering Committee members sought to describe the approach by saying that the Project may not teach embroidery but it may be instrumental in strengthening the provision of micro credit so that embroidery and similar small scale, but immensely valuable programs, achieve viability. Wherever possible the Project will seek to graft its contribution onto existing activities thereby strengthening them.

66. Initial thoughts are to develop a three-pronged approach whereby proposed responses can be broadly categorized and for more specific projects to then be developed under each of the three categories.

1. The first approach would cover institutional and policy interventions intended to steadily strengthen the capacity of the various agencies to apply their mandates. A key aspect of this initiative would be to develop policy and management interventions that are “doable”, both in the context of the public sector environment, and at the community level. At this stage a possible project would be capacity building for CDA, an issue discussed later.
2. The second approach would center on practical interventions that quickly and tangibly improve both livelihoods and the social environment of vulnerable communities. Some of these interventions are intended to counter failings that in many well meaning Projects squander vital community support by taking too long to come to fruition, or worse, concentrate on issues that are important but oblique to what the target community sees as relevant. Such sentiments can swiftly frustrate the communities’ sense of ownership and willingness to participate, thereby jeopardizing an otherwise well intentioned Project.
3. The third approach entails strengthening the response to underlying environmental and social imbalances, including specific gender related livelihood issues, the provision of credit, salinity and coastal degradation and the possible introduction of an awareness raising program that provides information, education and communication (IEC) to target beneficiaries such as women, fishers and farmers.

67. Fortunately, there is a well established practice of public - private partnerships in Pakistan, so there is a precedent for the institutional and line linkages likely to be proposed by this Project. Under such arrangements, each and every intervention will be examined to determine the most appropriate means of ensuring its delivery and

sustainability. Fortunately again there is also an established mechanism for managing the various relationships between stakeholders. In the context of this Project, CDA acts as the coordinating agency and is effectively the interface between stakeholder groups including communities and the Sindh Government.

68. Provided it is acceptable to the EA and to CDA, it is suggested that in designing for any significant interventions, there be an arrangement whereby the implementing agency is supported by a small, specific, advisory committee of representative stakeholders. This may be a sub-committee formed of steering committee members or co-opted advisers, able to meet at relatively short notice and without the disruption of calling a full steering committee meeting. For Projects that occur in the field it will also be essential to include the District Coordination Officer within the organizational structure. Although early in the Project design it is quite clear that to work, the design must provide for meaningful stakeholder participation and for the target beneficiaries to see benefits and sense ownership of the process.

Methodology

69. The first part of the TA has rightly been referred to as the diagnostic or discovery phase, where the needs of the target beneficiaries are identified together with the constraints that may well impede the delivery of possible outputs. During this phase, the specialists will work closely with key stakeholders including the target beneficiaries and whenever possible they will make use of current reputable studies. One of the key outputs from the first phase should be a shortlist of potential projects together with sensible assessments of their likely cost, implementation times and difficulties. The second phase will concentrate on placing the suggested projects into the right institutional framework. This will entail assessing financial and economic rates of return, community impact, risk management strategies and reviewing economic and environmental impacts. Additionally, it will entail identifying appropriate administrative processes able to ensure acceptable levels of oversight and governance.

70. In this respect the current TA is aimed at identifying, assessing and packaging a series of proposed interventions that meet the Government's development guidelines and satisfy the ADB's criteria for project lending.

71. The intention would be to also include some practical initiatives that demonstrate the Government's "commitment" to the plight of target communities in Sindh. For example these initiatives would include tangibles such as jetties, landing sites, roads, water and power schemes, mangrove reforestation and enhancement of oil palm plantings and production.

72. It is clear that the proposed Project is unable to cover every likely intervention, a situation that raises the inevitability that some sensible and worthy interventions will be discarded or at least deferred. This is where the Steering Committee can provide guidance on priorities. Nor does the proposed Project want to compete for or duplicate interventions. In this respect it is complementary to current similar programs and will carefully assess who is doing what and how best the proposed Project can complement or collaborate with existing arrangements.

73. What the Project will seek to avoid is tackling too many issues. In this respect the design will provide for a concise selection of doable programs that as much as possible

both use and supplement existing delivery mechanisms. If needed there may well be provision for some capacity building to strengthen the means of delivery but wherever possible the design will seek to avoid reinventing the wheel or instigating parallel programs.

Personnel Schedule

74. The revised work plan and personnel schedule (see Appendix 4) identifies the dates of subsequent consulting inputs. The great majority of these will occur within the period September to November.

75. The key changes from the schedule as per the head contract, with the rationale for the changes, are as follows:

- International Natural Resources Economist: At the request of the ADB the original candidate, Mr Ray Greer, was changed and Mr Geoff Bastin was approved. The first input has been brought forward from November 2005 to October 2005 to provide for an early review of economic analysis.
- International Rural Sociologist/Community Development Specialist: The first input was shortened from five weeks to three weeks and it is proposed (see paragraph 76) that the remaining provision for this consultant be allocated elsewhere.
- International Coastal Environment Specialist: The original candidate, Mr Peter McNamee, was not available and was replaced by Ms Rebecca D'Cruz with the agreement of the ADB. The original one input has been changed to two field inputs and two weeks of home office input to better meet the requirements of the entire duration of the TA.
- International Enterprise Development Specialist: The original one input has been changed to two earlier inputs to work more closely with other specialists during the earlier phase of the TA.
- International Farming Systems/Crop Development Specialist: The original candidate, Mr David Moles, was not available and was replaced by Dr Ian Hancock with the agreement of the ADB. The second input has been brought forward to enable the consultant to work more closely with the other specialists during the earlier phase of the TA.
- Domestic Rural Sociologist/Community Development Specialist: The original candidate, Syed Abbas Haider Zaidi, was not available and was replaced by Shaheen Khan with the verbal approval of the ADB. Consequently the mobilization was slightly delayed.
- Domestic Farming Systems/Crop Development Specialist: The original candidate, Mohammad Ilyas, was not available and was replaced by Samiullah Agha with the agreement of the ADB.
- Domestic Financial Management Specialist: The original candidate, Nohman Ishtaq, was not available and was replaced by Suqlain Haider with the agreement of the ADB.

76. One of the important areas identified for enhancing livelihoods relates to skills development. In essence this means augmenting existing education programs, even at

the lowest level, with basic training in practical skills. This may well involve basic training in carpentry, sewing, animal husbandry and engineering. To develop the program and some of the proposed other community based programs (roads etc), requires a comprehensive grasp of local community issues, specific skills outside the expertise of the foreign community development specialist. It would be of considerable help if his role could be replaced by a community development specialist more familiar with the actual communities likely to be affected by the program. It is proposed that any savings from this change could be used to supplement further inputs from consultants later in the TA.

77. The oil palm issues need to be dealt with in that despite the success at growing oil palm and the apparent livelihood benefits that would obviously flow were the program to prove a commercial success, little in the way of economic studies have been undertaken. Both crop specialists have recommended that oil palm be treated as a low priority after examining soil types, rainfall and temperatures.

78. The proposed revised personnel schedule now better reflects the needs of the TA, however it will be important to retain a level of flexibility whereby, with ADB approval, a further review of the dates of inputs will be possible. The main concern is that key inputs such as those of the economists and community specialists may also need to cover the latter part of the Project so as to ensure that identified projects comply with the ADB's requirements on social, environmental and economic standards.

D. Issues

Technical Issues

Scope of Project

79. As detailed in earlier sections, the key issue to address is the scope of the project, with particular reference to the institutional capacity needs to ensure sustainability of other interventions.

Achievable Outcomes

80. One of the more important considerations is to ensure that what is identified is doable. Whilst a proposed intervention may make sense, it may need peripheral support to ensure that it is sustainable. For example proposing a new crop as part of a wider livelihood improvement program may well make sense but it may also need roads, irrigation, extension workers and market support to convert it into a practical opportunity. Some environmental interventions, desperately needed though they may be, might well need legislative support and a more vigorous compliance capacity to ensure that in future the underlying causes as well as the effects can be dealt with.

Sustainability

81. Another issue that will need to be assessed is whether some of the interventions are sustainable in the longer term. For example some small farms or plots may simply be unable to reach sufficient levels of production to be viable in any form other than that of subsistence. The same may apply within the fishery.

Water Availability

82. Water availability is obviously a many faceted issue that colors nearly all aspects of this Project. There is little use designing interventions that may well find themselves stranded through lack of water. In this respect it would be helpful if specialists have access to pragmatic assessments of likely water availability in future.

83. The above infer that certain assumptions will be necessary in assessing the Project's sustainability but there are two absolutely critical assumptions. They are (i) whether CDA will have the authority to influence and steer many of the needed changes through and (ii) whether the land and water issues that underpin the majority of proposed developments can satisfactorily be resolved. The absence of an authoritative CDA or the absence of suitable land tracts or sufficient sweet water would almost certainly call into question the underlying logic for the Project.

Administrative Issues

84. Additional TA budget per se will not make the situation fully satisfactory; however, it will be mitigated by the following additional budgets to be provided through utilization of the TA Contingency. This situation was envisaged during the process of contract negotiations, and it was agreed that, should the expected government support not be available, the TA Contingency could be used.

Office and Support Facilities

85. In the absence of the provision of office accommodation and facilities by the government, or funds to cover this, the TA has proposed, and ADB has agreed, that funds be made available from the TA Contingency to cover this and give the TA team the ability to be able to house the team in one place for the remainder of the TA when there are such requirements. This is now allowing the TA team to work more cohesively, procure the office equipment and finally establish a more solid working base.

Vehicles

86. In the absence of suitable 4-wheel drive vehicles for hire, the TA team has identified Toyota Corollas which could be used for field trips. An additional budget of USD 5,200, over and above the USD 9,800 already provided under the TA budget, has been proposed in the contract variation for ADB agreement.

APPENDIX 1 TERMS OF REFERENCE

A. Introduction

The consultant team will assist the provincial government of Sindh (GOS) in preparing the proposed Sindh Coastal and Inland Community Development Project (SCICDP) to reduce poverty and institutionalize the sustainable management of coastal zone resources in Badin and Thatta districts, and coastal areas of Karachi. The technical assistance (TA) will be implemented in two phases: (diagnostic and design phases): phase 1 will last for 3 months and phase 2 for 4 months. The TA activities will be carried out through a coordinated consultative process involving all the relevant stakeholders at the federal, province, district, and community levels.

During the diagnostic phase, the consultant team will review relevant documents, studies, surveys, data, past and ongoing projects to identify issues and lessons learned and prepare analytical papers to assess the current status and development constraints; examine development options to remove constraints; and identify opportunities for further development. During the design phase, the consultant team will prepare (i) prefeasibility and feasibility reports of proposed project interventions; (ii) a gender development plan; (iii) a resettlement plan, if required; (iv) detailed economic and financial analyses of proposed interventions; (v) detailed project costs tables (COSTAB format); (vi) project performance management system based on sound baseline data; (vii) estimates of recurrent costs to be financed by the Government budget; and (viii) draft contract packages and bidding documents. All analyses and reports will follow the relevant Asian Development Bank (ADB) guidelines and policies.

B. Terms of Reference for Consultants

The international and domestic specialists will work in tandem, coordinating and synchronizing their activities and inputs and prepare coherent analyses and reports. The team leader will be responsible for the quality of the final output and for preparing the requisite TA reports. Eight international and 12 domestic experts will be engaged for 20 and 41 person months respectively, as described below.

1. Policy and Institutions Specialist – Team Leader (international, 7 person-months)

The team leader/specialist will (i) prepare a thorough and comprehensive feasibility report/preliminary project design detailing the rationale, scope, and cost of the proposed project, including indicative priority investments, implementation arrangements (including mechanisms for coordination and transfer of financial resources within the project), the project framework, the economic viability of indicative subprojects, the financial sustainability of the project, relevant policy issues, risks and assurances; (ii) prepare a detailed work plan and implement it for the duration of the TA; (iii) coordinate the work of the consultant team; (iv) review relevant projects of ADB, other external sources, and the Government to distill policy and intervention priorities relevant and important for designing the investment project, with particular reference to effective implementation of integrated coastal area development projects; (v) design and conduct stakeholder workshops; (vi) review Government policy and institutional arrangements for coastal zone management and make recommendations for improvement; recommend operational and contractual arrangements among the participating groups, review the mechanisms of public funds flow, and design a financial arrangement in accordance with policy on regional development and decentralization for the project; (vii) design a

capacity-building program; (viii) prepare a project framework, design a project performance management system, consolidate and prepare various TA reports; and (ix) assume overall responsibility for guiding the TA activities and producing the final report and all intermediate products of the TA.

2. Natural Resources Economists (international, 2.5 person-months; domestic, 3 person-months)

The specialists will (i) review relevant socioeconomic development plans for the project area; (ii) recommend improved coastal zone livelihood enterprises and resource management interventions; (iii) conduct economic evaluation of proposed interventions based on *ADB's Guidelines for Economic Analysis of Projects*; (iv) conduct economic evaluation of existing and alternative livelihood opportunities in the coastal areas, taking into consideration any relevant transboundary impacts; (v) analyze market-based instruments in combination with regulatory measures; (vi) recommend economic initiatives in compliance with natural resources and environmental protection guidelines; (vii) prepare an economic analysis and estimate the total investment cost of each intervention, subproject, and the whole project in COSTAB format; (viii) assess the service delivery costs of indicative rural and coastal enterprises and costs of market access for their outputs; and (ix) prepare a report of detailed project costs, and financial and economic analyses.

3. Coastal Resources Management Specialists (international, 2 person-months; domestic, 3 person-months)

The specialists will (i) review policies, programs, and institutional arrangements for coastal fisheries and related marine habitat conservation and management; (ii) using available coastal resources and environmental information in the country, prepare a resources and environmental profile for each proposed site; (iii) identify the major causes and factors affecting the resources and habitats, and recommend a range of solutions for causes of negative factors and propose appropriate management measures for protecting coastal fisheries resources; (iv) review resource assessment, integrated coastal zone management (ICZM), and the environmental management program, and assess their effectiveness and corresponding impacts; (v) prepare site selection criteria and technical guidelines considering such factors as environmental and resource conditions building on earlier initiatives in this regard, local initiatives, socioeconomic conditions, institutional receptivity and preparedness and compatibility with local development plans; (vi) prepare the terms of reference, procedures, and guidelines for study activities to be used in implementing the ICZM project such as resource assessments, and evaluate their relevance and applicability to the project; (vii) design a management component for coastal fisheries resources that will include a method for preparing coastal fisheries resource plans and zoning systems; (viii) assess the effectiveness of the management of established marine protected areas; and (ix) assess the extent of mismanagement of marine resources and the lack of enforcement of environmental laws and its risk to the project, and identify feasible mitigating efforts.

4. Coastal Fisheries Infrastructure Specialists (international, 2 person-months; domestic, 4 person-months)

The specialists will (i) work closely with the coastal resources management specialists to collect, compile, and review fisheries resources data, fisheries information (fishing efforts), and technical information at the proposed sites of small-scale fisheries infrastructure and landing facilities; (ii) assess the technical viability of those activities; (iii) prepare detailed technical criteria for selecting sites for fisheries infrastructure and

landing facilities, considering technical viability, availability of fish resources, optimum use of infrastructure facilities, environmental conservation and improvement, and support to small-scale coastal fishing communities; (iv) assist the natural resource economists in determining the assumptions for analyzing the economic and financial viability of selected fisheries infrastructure and landing facilities and estimating the total investment costs for the small-scale fisheries infrastructure improvement activities; and (v) assist the institutional specialist in preparing the implementation arrangements for coastal fisheries infrastructure development and recommend improvements on the implementation arrangements to include the participation of the private sector and coastal communities.

5. Rural Sociologist/Community Development Specialists (international, 2 person-months; domestic, 4 person-months)

The specialists will (i) prepare socioeconomic and gender-specific profiles for the selected communes – identify issues and propose measures to solve them, paying specific attention to problems associated with out-migration – in accordance with relevant ADB guidelines and publications, including the *Handbook on Poverty and Social Analysis*, *Handbook on resettlement*, and *Handbook for Incorporation of Social Dimensions in Projects*; (ii) conduct community-level surveys to obtain feedback for improving the productivity of existing livelihood activities, or creating alternative livelihood for potential beneficiaries; (iii) conduct poverty analysis in core subproject areas as per the guidelines in (i) above; (iv) recommend poverty intervention approaches, ensuring equitable and active participation of women in project activities; (v) for core subprojects, undertake social analysis as per the guidelines in (i) and ADB's *Policy on Involuntary Resettlement*. If the project is likely to involve significant resettlement, prepare at least one subproject with resettlement issues as a core subproject; (vi) undertake a similar analysis as per the guidelines in (i) and ADB's policy on indigenous peoples and, if applicable, prepare an indigenous people's development framework/plan; (vii) prepare a resettlement framework as per ADB's *Policy on Involuntary Resettlement* and *Handbook on Resettlement*. Involve stakeholders including the executing and implementing agencies; and (viii) assist in community capacity-building and awareness-raising plans.

6. Gender and Development Specialist (domestic, 3 person-months)

The specialist will (i) work closely with the rural sociologist/community development specialists, other team members, and the team leader to maximize participation by women in the project activities; (ii) conduct a gender analysis and recommend ways to reduce negative impacts that may arise due to the proposed project; suggest approaches to improve women's participation in training and other capacity-building initiatives, as well as ways to initiate their access to information, credit and savings, extension and other services under the proposed project; (iii) assess poverty levels among women and children, including access to health, formal and nonformal education, production assistance and credit; and (iv) prepare a gender strategy and plan based on (ii) and (iii) above.

7. Coastal Environmental Specialists (international, 1.5 person-months; domestic, 4 person-months)

The specialists will (i) review environmental data of coastal zones in participating districts, the transboundary effects across the districts, and the value of ecological sites; (ii) analyze coastal zone resource use patterns in the proposed project area; identify resource use conflicts, gaps, and overlaps, and incompatibility of uses; (iii) review the

regulatory framework for the use of coastal resources and environmental protection, and identify the need for improvements, if any; (iv) indicate the likely environmental impact of the proposed activities on poverty reduction in the project area, taking into account transboundary impacts; (v) following ADB guidelines, prepare a full environmental impact assessment (EIA) and a summary EIA² for the proposed project interventions; (vi) prepare environmental monitoring and management plans (including mitigation and monitoring cost estimates) for implementing the proposed project, including the criteria/guidelines to be followed as part of the selection criteria for each project component; (vii) develop environmental measures to be included in the detailed design, tender documents, and construction contracts for infrastructure projects; and (viii) delineate environmental criteria and guidelines to be followed as part of the selection criteria for each project component, taking into consideration the Government's national and provincial conservation strategies.

8. Rural Infrastructure Specialist (domestic, 3 person-months)

The specialist will (i) assess the current infrastructure conditions in selected communes and determine the need for further development of the proposed project interventions; (ii) examine the need for development activities/construct of infrastructure – i.e., rural water supply and sewage, electrification and/or alternative options, gravel access roads, culverts, and bridges – by analyzing their environmental, social, economic impacts, preliminary costs, and utility in selected communities; (iii) assist other team members to work out investment plans; (iv) provide strategic guidance and participatory criteria for project selection, emphasizing employment generation aspects of projects, economic impact and broad benefit distribution; (v) assess the potential for infrastructure to support rural and community incomes and livelihoods, including rural roads and trails (and associated culverts and bridges), drinking water supply schemes (including wells and diversion structures), and other facilities as appropriate, providing detailed designs, costs, selection criteria, and community-managed operation and maintenance requirements. With the economist, evaluate the feasibility of the indicative subprojects; and; (vi) identify attendant requirements for training and capacity building for government and beneficiaries.

9. Enterprise Development Specialists (international, 1.5 person-months, domestic, 3 person-months)

The specialists will (i) assess the existing status and variety of businesses and their impact on the coastal zone resources; (ii) propose new opportunities to develop small to medium-scale enterprises in the coastal communities by analyzing their financial viability, prospects of marketing (and its associated constraints) in the selected communities; (iii) work closely with other specialists on the team to assess the impact of existing and proposed businesses on the coastal zone environment and biodiversity; (iv) assess the current situation of micro/rural finance activities, taking into consideration relevant policy regulations, and identify problems and opportunities; and; (v) propose improved or alternative activities to extend micro/rural finance to qualified poor households.

10. Farming Systems/Crop Development Specialists (international, 1.5 person-months, domestic, 3 person-months)

² ADB environmental policy and guidelines require circulation of the summary EIA for 120 days (4 months) for public comments prior to approval of the loan.

The specialists will (i) assess the existing farming systems and livelihood activities and recommend ways and means to improve productivity in the coastal areas; (ii) review existing agricultural research and extension structures and effectiveness in the project area, and develop recommendations for improving outreach capabilities, making use of existing structures and improved community-based extension capabilities; (iii) prepare a project area profile, including location, physical features, climate, soils, and water resources, reviewing crop production environments and their suitability for different crops; (iv) detail farming systems in the project area, with particular attention to high-value crops, including cropping patterns and practices, input and output markets, yields and postharvest handling, markets and other services, income and employment from on-farm sources; identify constraints to increased productivity, including technologies, extension techniques, and adoption by small farmers; (v) review research capabilities and requirements for improved agriculture – including saline agriculture – in the project area, and possible demand based linkages between research and extension; (vi) propose supplementary or, where necessary, alternative livelihood opportunities (e.g., crop diversification) and; (vii) working closely with other members of the TA team, assess the technical and economic appropriateness of proposals for the project area.

11. Fisheries/Aquaculture Specialist (domestic, 4 person-months)

The specialist will (i) assess the current situation of fisheries in the project area and identify issues and problems (i.e., technology, tools, breeds, etc.); (ii) review relevant data and reports and assess the maximum sustainable yields (MSY) viz. the current catch, and propose new initiatives to improve MSY, i.e., setting up of “exclusion zones” to be monitored and enforced by local communities in light of fisheries laws; (iii) assess the technical, environmental, and financial feasibility of offshore fishing; (iv) assess the technical, environmental, and financial feasibility of small-scale and commercial aquaculture; (v) working in tandem with other members of the team, propose improved and/or alternative livelihood activities, backed by sound analysis; (vi) and prepare a report to summarize the findings.

12. Coastal Institutions and Policy Specialist (domestic, 4 person-months)

The specialist will (i) assist the team leader in preparing a detailed work program and implementation schedule for the TA; (ii) coordinate the efforts of the consultant team in assessing poverty reduction in the proposed subproject sites; (iii) conduct stakeholder workshops by reviewing government policy and institutional arrangements on coastal resources management, and design a capacity-building program; and (iv) assist the team leader to prepare all necessary reports for the TA.

13. Financial Management Specialist (domestic, 3 person-months)

The specialist will (i) review financial and budgeting procedures for development and nondevelopment budgets of the government's line departments and district administrations, auditing requirements, disbursement, accounting, and cash flow management practices, etc. based on ADB's guidelines for assessing financial management; (ii) identify project-specific institutional weaknesses and propose project interventions to address such constraints; (iii) prepare criteria for financial evaluation of proposed interventions; (iv) conduct financial evaluation of livelihood opportunities; and (v) conduct financial analysis, prepare project cost estimates, and contribute to the preparation of detailed project costs and financial analysis. The financial management assessment and financial analysis should be undertaken in accordance with *Guidelines for the Financial Governance and Management of Investment Projects Financed by ADB*.

APPENDIX 2
SCHEDULE OF PEOPLE MET AND MEETINGS/CONSULTATIONS HELD

Date	Name	Title	Relation to project	Issues
1 August	Opel	DG, CDAGS	Director General	
1 August	Hj. Abida Memon	Director	Director, environment and gender issues	
1 August	Muhammad Ashraf Sahto	Assistant Director Administration		
1 August	Shaharyar Kazi	Assistant Director Engineering		
1 August	Zamir Hussain Ujjan	Assistant Director Agriculture		
1 August	Ghulam Sarwar Khero	Additional Chief Secretary. Development	Government of Sindh	
1 August	Hon. Syed Shoaib Ahmed Bukhari	Minister, Planning and Development Department	Government of Sindh	
1 August	Shamin Akhtar Qasmi	Chief Manager	Allied Bank	
2 August	Waheed Ahmed	Director Fisheries	Head of fisheries department	
3 August	Stella Jafri	Head, Organizational Development	IUCN	
3 August	Abdul Latif Rao	Country Representative	IUCN	
3 August	Senyo Kufe	Security Adviser	UN	
4 August	Ghulam Rasool Kalwar	Government appointed consultant to CDA	CDA	
6 August	Nazar Hussan	Secretary Agriculture	Provincial Government of Sindh	
13 August	Ray Greer	Staff consultant ADB	Pakistan Country Assistance program	

13 August	Syed Husaini Jagirdar	Development Economist	ADB's Country Assistance program	
15 August	Steering Committee		Refer attached schedule of names	
15 August	Jamal Shoro	Advocate	FFF	Structure and constituents
15 August	Dr. Ejaz Ahmad	Deputy Director General	WWF	
15 August	Shamsul Haq Memon	Secretary to Government of Sindh	Environment and Alternative Energy Department	
18 August	Waheed Ahmed	Director Fisheries	Director Fisheries	Possible projects and issues
20 August	Ilyas Qureshi	Crop specialist		Range of possible crop options
22 August	Idris Rajpud 5869987	Irrigation	Retd DG of Irrigation	Current state of irrigation in Sindh
22 August	Sikander Brohi 03012177538	Sociologist		Key community issues
23 August	Shamsul Haq Memon	Secretary to Government Sindh	Environment and Alternative Energy	What's possible within the current system
23 August	Mohammad Izhar Khan 021-5842169	Chief Engineer RBOD	Irrigation and Power Department	LBOD and RBOD background
23 August	Nazar Hussan, Secretary of Agriculture			Institutional reform matters and seed plant privatization.
24 August	Fazal Nizamani	Project Director	ADB SRDP	Areas of respective interest
24 August	Aqueel Karim Dhedhi	Chairman	AKD Securities Ltd	Oil palm investment
24 August	Mohammad Yaseen Dhedhi	Advisor	AKD Farms	Oil palm investment
25 August	Mohammad Ali Shah	Chairman	Fisher Folk Forum	Introductory meeting
25 August	Khalid Mohtadullah	Senior advisor	Global water partnership	Institutional and policy issues as source of water problems
25 August	Hafeez Tunio Jamal Shoro	Economists	Fisher Folk Forum	Role of middlemen

26 August	Dr. Keerio	DG	Agriculture Research	Suitable crops, salinity and seed problems
27 August	Waheed Ahmed	DG	Department of Fisheries	Links with IUCN, WWF, FFF. Also pen culture
29 August	Ali Jat	Rehri village	Fisher	Community involvement in mngt
30 August	Akbar Kalhora	Land owner	Farmer	What is possible in and around Keti Bandar
5 Sept	Thatta DCO	Provincial Government		Introductory meeting (40 people)
6 Sept	Badin			Introductory meeting (30 people)
6 Sept	Akbar Khalora	Jhangesar village	Land owner	Meeting with 35 fishers
10 Sept	M Muslim Abbasi	Chief Minister's Investment Cell	Chairman	Impediments to investment in Thatta and Badin
14 Sept	Anwarul Islam	Director Operations	Karachi Fisheries Harbor Authority	Middlemen, ice and post harvest issues.
15 Sept	Hakim Din Junio	Additional Secretary Development	Department Planning and Development	Devolution issues
16 Sept	Nadeem Hussain Bukhari	Program Officer	UNDP	Implementation capacity issues
17 Sept	Mohammad Rashid	Additional Secretary	Provincial Government Transition cell	Devolution implementation
17 Sept	Mohammad Moazzam Khan	Marine Fisheries Department	Government of Pakistan	Institutional and policy issues
17 Sept	Alla Bus Khalora	Head of Agriculture	Planning and Development	Institutional capacity issues
20 Sept	Anwar Ul Islam	Director	Karachi Fisheries Harbor Authority	Organization of fishing arrangements.
22 Sept	Dr. Akash Ansari	President	Badin Rural Development Society	Agriculture and gender issues
24 Sept	Najamuddin Vistro	Conservator of Forests	Aforestation Circle	Suitable trees
24 Sept	Nazar Hussain	Secretary of Agriculture	GoS	Institutional arrangements

24 Sept	Dr. Noor	Adviser to Secretary Agriculture	GoS	Institutional arrangements
24 Sept	Dr. Khalora	Chief Agriculture	Dept of P&D	Institutional arrangements
29 Sept	Various		Tripartite meeting	Review Inception Report and future direction of Project
30 Sept	Chief Secretary, ACS Agriculture, Secretary Finance			Future direction of Project
3 Oct	Fatima Naqvi, Iftakhar Khalid	Analyst, Deputy country director	OXFAM	Nature of their interventions in Thatta and Badin
3 Oct	Tekola Dejene, Ambreen Malik	Lead operations officer, Analyst	World Bank	Cooperation in Thatta and Badin
4 Oct	Shandana Khan	CEO	RSPN	Cooperation and involvement
4 Oct	Dr, Rashid Bajwa	CEO	NRSP	Cooperation

APPENDIX 3
PROJECT STEERING COMMITTEE – MINUTES OF FIRST MEETING
15 AUGUST 2005

COASTAL DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY
GOVERNMENT OF SINDH

MINUTES OF THE PRE-INCEPTION REPORT MEETING FOR ADB TA NO. 4525
NAMELY “SINDH COASTAL AND INLAND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT
PROJECT” HELD ON 15TH AUGUST, 2005, AT 11:00 AM IN CDA HEADQUARTERS.

A **Pre-Inception Report** meeting regarding ADB TA No. 4525 namely **“Sindh Coastal and Inland Community Development Project”** was held on 15th August, 2005, at 11: 00 AM under the Convenorship of Director General, CDA, at the Headquarters of Coastal Development Authority located on the first floor of PIDC-House, Karachi.

2. The list of the participants is attached.

S.NO	DESCRIPTION	ACTION BY
01.	Initiating, in the name of Allah, the most Beneficent , the Director General, Coastal Development Authority, Sindh, Mr. Munawar Opel, informed the participants that the Provincial Assembly of Sindh created the Coastal Development Authority through the Coastal Development Authority Act, 1994, so notified on November 29, 1994 (Sindh Act No. XXVIII of 1994), for the purposes of development, improvement and beautification of the coastal areas of Thatta and Badin Districts. Thus, the Coastal Development Authority can initiate any development activity/project under the sun for the upliftment of the designated coastal areas of Thatta & Badin Districts.	
02.	The Director General, CDA, apprised the forum that Coastal Development Authority has been assigned 22 Development Projects, 13 ongoing and 09 new, worth Rs. 660 Million . The Asian Development Bank (ADB) Technical Assistance (TA) namely “SINDH COASTAL AND INLAND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT PROJECT” (SCICDP) , is one of the 22 Projects, reflected in ADP 2005-06 Budget Book under “CDA Sector”.	
03.	The DG, CDA, briefed the meeting regarding the Project of ADB TA that Coastal Development Authority is the Executing Agency and Planning & Development Department is the Sponsoring Agency of the TA. Further, he clarified that the above said TA is an integrated approach which shall cover all aspects and various segments of economy, the total cost of which is Rs: 48.689 Million in which ADB grant is Rs: 38.881 Million and Sindh Government. share is Rs: 9.808 Million . The Project is focusing on eight Talukas of Thatta District namely Thatta, Mirpur Sakro, Ghorabari, Kati Bandar, Kharo Chhan, Shah Bandar, Jati and Sujawal; two Talukas of Badin District - Badin and Golarchi; and coastal areas of Karachi District.	

S.NO	DESCRIPTION	ACTION BY
04.	<p>Furthermore, the Convenor of the meeting, informed the participants that the implementation period of the study is from July, 2005 to March, 2006. The purpose of study is to upgrade the living standard of the coastal communities through exploring and exploiting the natural resources which are till date, either unexploited or not properly and scientifically exploited, for which the ABD has already earmarked \$ 50.00 Million in their Lending Programme for the year 2006.</p> <p>The Director General, CDA, also informed the forum that Consultants in 17 different fields shall work for 61 Man Months (20 International + 41 Local Consultants), who will physically undertake the field visits exclusively of the designated coastal areas of three Districts - Karachi, Thatta and Badin, to have meetings with government functionaries, local coastal communities and NGOs in order to collect primary data in a scientific manner, thus an authenticated document will be prepared which will pinpoint, helping thus in initiating any development programme/schemes in any field of economy. Further, he informed the meeting that the said TA will be implemented in two phases: a) the diagnostic; and b) design phase. The phase one will focus on key constraints to improve coastal livelihood, natural resources management, and priority problems requiring public intervention. This phase will be for three months. The second phase will focus on preparing the feasibility study and will be completed within four months, with a one month break between both the phases.</p>	
05.	<p>Regarding implementation of the TA, the Convenor of the meeting informed the participants that arrival of Foreign as well as Local Consultants has been started for which as per decision of the PDWP, a Project Management Office (PMO) is to be established in CDA with a counterpart staff of CDA. For this, the capacity of CDA will be enhanced and strengthened with mobility, machinery, equipments, etc. He further informed that the Steering Committee has been constituted for oversee the TA performance at various stages, which is headed by ACS (Dev.), P&DD, with the Secretaries of the Administrative Departments of Finance & Cooperation, Forest & Wildlife, Irrigation & Power, Agriculture, Culture & Tourism, Local Government & PHED; Works & Services; Environment and Alternate Energy; Livestock & Fisheries, as its members. The DG, CDA, shall act as Secretary to the Steering Committee. The DCOs of Thatta, Badin & Karachi, and the representatives of the IUCN, WWF and Pakistan Fisher Folk Forum are also the members of the Committee.</p>	Coastal Development Authority.

S.NO	DESCRIPTION	ACTION BY
06.	The Director General, CDA, informed the meeting that Mr. Simon, the Team Leader of the TA is present in the meeting who will introduce himself as well as brief the profile of the ADB TA.	
07.	Mr. Simon introducing himself expressed that the Asian Development Bank (ADB) has wide experience in Development Projects throughout the region. He further informed the meeting that a work plan for field surveys is under preparation in which a number of development oriented Projects will be identified and reviewed in intensive way. These projects were intended to improve livelihoods for the communities by providing infrastructure and improving environmental management. Such projects may drinking water supply and metalled road network and construction of Jetties, power and improve the marketing mechanism for agricultural commodities, including fish from the remote coastal areas, which at present are facing problems due to lack of facilities, thus ultimately their socio-economic conditions will be uplifted.	Mr. Simon Tiller, Team Leader of ADB TA.
08.	The Director General, CDA, informed the forum that this meeting is specially convened to collect the vital and authenticated information relevant to development/upliftment of designated coastal areas of Thatta, Badin and Karachi. Further, he added that the ideas so received from the stakeholders will be of paramount importance and are welcomed for incorporating in the study under discussion. The DG, CDA requested the DCO Badin and representative of DCO Thatta for submission of detailed report development oriented Projects for practically implementation in the field.	Coastal Development Authority/DCO Thatta/DCO Badin.
09.	<p>The DCO Badin informed the participants that the Vision Plan for District Badin has been prepared in which all the socio-economic sectors are covered, a copy of the same stood furnished to CDA, he remarked. Furthermore, he apprised that short term, medium term and long term intervention programmes have also been reflected in the District Vision Plan.</p> <p>The DCO Badin informed the meeting that the District Vision Plan prepared by Badin District Government is first ever in Sindh and third in Pakistan. He expressed that we have compiled complete data on damages caused by natural disasters experienced during last decade and same will be provided to the Consultants during their field visits to Badin coastal areas, expected to be undertaken during the last of week of August, 2005. The DCO Badin, suggested that priority should be given to communication sector, in this regard it is suggested that a provision for construction of fresh metalled road network plus rehabilitation of existing metalled roads should be kept in the ADB programme for development of coastal areas of Thatta, Badin and Karachi. The forum and the DG, CDA, in particular lauded the efforts of DCO Badin in pursuing socio-economic steps being or to be adopted in his District.</p>	

S.NO	DESCRIPTION	ACTION BY
10.	The representative of the DCO Thatta, informed the meeting that a detailed report regarding development oriented realistic Projects for designated coastal areas of Thatta is under preparation and would be furnished to CDA within 15 days positively for further necessary action.	DCO Thatta.
11.	The Secretary, Environment & Alternative Energy, Mr. Shamisul Haq Memon, informed the participants that in the past a lot of studies have been undertaken by various Government and Non-Government Organizations in the various segments of economy such as environment, mangroves, fisheries, agriculture, livestock, infrastructure, etc. He suggested that these various studies should be compiled by the Consultants as same can be proved useful/helpful for preparing the TA under discussion. Furthermore, Mr. Memon suggested that Focus of the TA should be on Diagnostic Phase in which high priority and low priority areas may be identified.	ADB Consultants.
12.	The representative of WWF, Dr. Ejaz informed the meeting that his Organization is specially working on rehabilitation and plantation of Mangroves in order to improve the eco-system of the area as well as Mangroves plantation as these block sea intrusion to inward during high tide seasons. Mangroves assist in resisting cyclones to a great extent to save the lives as well as economic activities in the coastal areas of Sindh. Besides, WWF have other development programmes directly related to the upliftment of the coastal communities such as we have open small schools and local teachers are appointed to carry on the education activities, he stressed.	WWF.
13.	The representative of the IUCN, Mr. Tahir Qureshi informed the forum that his Organization has prepared a Report on the Environment aspects of the Badin and Thatta Districts, a copy of the same will be furnished to CDA, he committed . Mr. Qureshi exposed that three Coastal Districts of Sindh have different socio-economic profile such as Thatta District is facing sea intrusion, Badin is facing acute shortage of sweet water for drinking and agricultural purposes due to reason of non-perennial irrigation command area and the Karachi coastal areas are full with pollution from domestic and industrial wastage which is being dumped on the sea shore.	IUCN.
14.	The representative from Pakistan Fisher Folk Forum suggested that such strategy be adopted through which livelihood of the coastal communities of Sindh should be protected/conserved. Further, he added that the current problem of the coastal communities is drinking water, for which he expressed that the root cause is low/no flow of fresh water from down stream Kotri Barrage, which has disturbed the eco-system of the whole coastal belt of Sindh. Any material or study shall be welcomed from PFF.	PFF

S.NO	DESCRIPTION	ACTION BY
15.	The Chief (Agri.), P&D Department, Mr. A.B. Kalhoro informed the meeting that another package of \$ 13.500 Million , similar in nature with that of ADB package has also been given by World Bank for the development of designated coastal areas of Thatta & Badin Districts. Further he informed the forum that in this regard a PC-II has already been drafted by CDA and it will be put up before PDWP for approval very shortly.	
16.	The DG, CDA, requested the representative of the Forest Department to make the CDA aware of the outcome of the Rs. 3.00 Million “Statistical data collection of coastal belt of Sindh” sponsored by CDA and share the same with CDA on most urgent and top priority basis so that results become beneficial for the SCICDP, especially before the wrap up meeting scheduled before ACS (Dev.), P&DD Sindh, on 24 th August, 2005, at 11: 00 AM in his Department’s Committee Room.	Forest & Wildlife Department.
17.	<p>The meeting concluded with the following points expressed by Mr. Simon Tiller, the Team Leader of the TA:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i) Mr. Simon was of the determination that concerted efforts will be taken to identify the burning issues of the coastal communities and the solution thereof. ii) \$ 50.00 Million is a large amount and ADB's intention is to assist CDA to improve the environmental, institutions and infrastructure in the target areas of Karachi, Thatta and Badin Districts. Mr. Simon said it would also be important to identify projects for the community that was quick so they knew that something new was being done for their betterment. iii) The CDA has a vital role on policy and institutional levels, but is facing capacity constraints, therefore the capacity building of CDA with people, skills and equipment is compulsory to enable it for infiltrating its influence more effectively in the designated coastal areas of Sindh. <p>He informed the forum that the ADB Mission will be in Sindh within a couple of days, who will meet with government functionaries, local communities as well as NGOs. Hopefully, the Mission would be receptive whatever the Projects are proposed for improvement and development of coastal areas of Sindh.</p>	

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to and from the Chair.

COASTAL DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY
GOVERNMENT OF SINDH

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS OF ADB TA MEETING HELD ON 15TH AUGUST, 2005.

S.No.	NAME	DESIGNATION	DEPARTMENT/ORGANIZATION
1.	Mr. Munawar Opel	Director General	CDA
2.	Mr. Shamisul Haq Memon	Secretary	Environment & Alternative Energy
3.	Mr. Mumtaz Ali Shah	DCO, Badin	District Government Badin.
4.	Mr. Simon Tiller	Team Leader of ADB TA	ADB
5.	Mr. A.B Kalhoro	Chief (Agri)	P&D
6.	Mr. Zulfiqar Ali Shalwani	DS	Finance
7.	Mr. Anwar Arain	DS	Forest & Wildlife
8.	Mr. Shafiq-ur-Rehman	EDO, Thatta	Works & Services
9.	Mr. Riaz Ahmed Junejo	Director (M&EC)	LG & PHE
10.	Mr. Waheed Ahmed	Director Fisheries	Livestock & Fisheries
11.	Mr. Siraj-u-ddin Khand	Director Livestock	Livestock & Fisheries
12.	Mr. Darya Khan Baloch	XEN,	Works & Services
13.	Mr. Qurban Ali	PC	S.W
14.	Mr. Tahir Qureshi	Prog. Director	IUCN
15.	Dr. Ejaz Ahmed	DDG	WWF
16.	Mr. Jamal M. Shoro	Prog. Manager	PFFF
17.	Mr. Zamir Hussain Ujjan	AD (A&P)	CDA
18.	Mr. Shaharyar A.Kazi	AD (Engineering)	CDA
19.	Mr. Ashraf Sahito	AD (Administration)	CDA

CDA/ADB/02/2005/

To,

20th August, 2005

**The Secretary to
Government of Sindh,
Karachi.**

1. Finance & Cooperation Department;
2. Forest & Wildlife Department ;
3. Irrigation & Power Department;
4. Agriculture Department;
5. Culture and Tourism Department ;
6. Local Government & PHED;
7. Works & Services Department ;
8. Environment and Alternate Energy Department;
9. Livestock & Fisheries Department ;
10. The District Coordination Officer, Karachi;
11. The District Coordination Officer, Thatta;
12. The District Coordination Officer, Badin;
13. A representative of WWF;
14. A representative of Pakistan Fisher Folk Forum;
15. A representative of IUCN;
16. The Chief (Agri.), P&DD.

SUB: MINUTES OF THE PRE-INCEPTION REPORT MEETING FOR ADB TA NO. 4525 NAMEDLY "SINDH COASTAL AND INLAND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT PROJECT" (SCICDP).

I am directed to enclose herewith the **Minutes of the Pre-Inception Report Meeting for ADB TA** reflected under above subject held on 15th August, 2005, at 11:00 AM under the Convenorship of the Director General , CDA, at CDA's Headquarters, located on the first floor of PIDC House, M.T. Khan Road Karachi, for your kind perusal and necessary action.

This is also to inform you of the wrap up meeting to be held on 24th August, 2005, under the chairmanship of the ACS (Dev.), P&DD, wherein your input, ideas, suggestions, etc, shall be looked forward. It is hoped that you shall attend **personally** as matter is one of opportunities. Regards.

Encl: (As above)

(ZAMIR HUSSAIN UJJAN)
ASSISTANT DIRECTOR (A&P)

c.c.to:

- The Additional Chief Secretary (Dev.) P&D Department, Government of Sindh, for kind information.
- Mr. Simon Tiller, Team Leader & Economist of the ADB TA.

APPENDIX 4 REVISED WORK PLAN AND PERSONNEL SCHEDULE

Work Program	Phase I												Phase II												RESPONSIBILITY									
	August			September			October			November			December			January			February			March			Primary	Secondary								
Week	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24	25	26	27	28	29	30	31	32		
Phase 1. Inception, review and background studies, and project design concept																																		
Establish the project office; hold initial discussions with SCDA; secure and confirm counterparts, compile reports and documents																									TL	DTL								
Prepare detailed TA work program, including plans for workshops and fieldwork (RRAs, surveys, etc.)																									TL	DTL, RSCD, DRSCD								
Review background data, hold agency meetings, meet with representative stakeholders to identify key issues, and opportunities																									TL	DTL, Dom Cons								
Define the CZ and the scope of investment plan through an initial threat assesment, and log frame goal statement																										DTL								
Prepare Inception Report, including detailed TA work program																									TL	DTL								
Inception Tripartite Meeting to discuss Inception Report																									TL	DTL								
Initial workshop involving the Consultant's Team & counterparts from SCDA and other agencies																									TL	All Dom								
Complete an institutional review																									TL	DTL, DNRE, DFM								
Stakeholder identification and rapid scoping, detailed social survey and livelihood analysis for selected communities																									DRSCD	DNRE, RSCD								
Reveiw current development plans and priorities, identify underlying incentives and compliance framework of current CZ																									TL	All Dom								
Design and complete a CZ resource inventory, and threat analysis to prioritise opportunities and develop options for interventions																									DCRM	All Dom								
Review current agriculture and land use in the coastal zone, identify threats and weaknesses, and prioritise potential opportunities																									DFSCD	FM, DNRE, DCRM								
Undertake a fisheries and aquaculture sector review, identify SWOT, current programs, and prioritise opportunities																									DFA	DCFI								
Review infrastructure, assess future needs and compare with existing Government infrastructure plans, identify priorities																									DCFI	DFA, DNRE								
Hold stakeholder meetings, focus groups and workshops to review assessment papers and confirm priorities, and identify gaps																									TL	All Dom								
Prepare Midterm Report																									TL	All Dom								
Second Tripartite Meeting to review Midterm Report & confirm scope of project components																									TI	DTL								
Phase 2. Project design, planning and feasibility analyses																																		
Confirm priorities with stakeholders and detail project design features, including proposed project components																									TL	All cons								
Provincial level stakeholders' workshop to discuss & validate project design																									DTL	All Int and Dom								
Undertake social (including resettlement if required) & environmental analyses, and assess costs & benefits of proposed project																									RSCD/CEM	DRSCD, DNRE, DFM								
Undertake financial and economic analyses of proposed project																									NRE	DNRE, FM								
Detail implementation arrangements, including institutional strengthening & capacity building requirements																									DTL	NRE, TI, DNRE								
Prepare Draft Final Feasibility Report																									TL	All Int and Dom								
Final Tripartite Meeting to review the Draft Final Feasibility Report																									TI	DTL								
Prepare Final Report																									TI	DTI, DCRM, DNRE								

LEGEND: ✂ Workshops ◇ Report ● Tripartite meetings

