



Technical Assistance Consultant's Report

Project Number: 381730102 (RETA 6236)
June 2005

Regional: Central Asian Countries Initiative for Land Management (Cofinanced by the Global Environment Facility and Global Mechanism)

Prepared by Heather Carlisle (Sociologist and Gender Specialist)

For The Asian Development Bank

This consultant's report does not necessarily reflect the views of ADB or the Government concerned, and ADB and the Government cannot be held liable for its contents. (For project preparatory technical assistance: All the views expressed herein may not be incorporated into the proposed project's design.)

Asian Development Bank

Analytical Framework for Gender, Poverty, and Participation in Sustainable Land Management

The purpose of this paper is to provide guidance to the domestic gender/sociology consultants as to the purpose of our analysis, and the overall context of our work in CACILM. Essentially this paper should clarify our role in the larger consultant team, and situate our specific outputs in the context of the overall PDF-B project outputs. Many (if not most) of the Domestic Consultants are new to CACILM, so this paper should serve as an introduction and reference to ensure that we are all starting from the same page, and working towards a unified result.

The goal of the Task Force and ADB, through establishment of the CACILM Partnership, is to combat land degradation and improve rural livelihoods in the CACs. This is consistent with GEF's OP15 program objective "to mitigate the causes and negative impacts of land degradation on the structure and functional integrity of ecosystems through sustainable land management practices as a contribution to improving people's livelihoods and economic well-being."

Thus it is clear that CACILM partners must consider livelihoods in the overall scheme of sustainable land management. The National Action Plans (NAPs) which were developed by the CACs under UNCCD, unfortunately contain only very cursory descriptions of the links between poverty and land degradation, and say even less about the particular impact on women. Therefore the domestic consultants will need to conduct a careful analysis of the linkages between land degradation and rural poverty in Central Asia, to fill the gaps in our current understanding. Such an analysis must inevitably consider the varying impacts of poverty on men and women, and the different roles of men and women as land managers.

The purpose of the poverty and gender analysis is to complement the analyses of the other consultant teams on policies and institutions and natural resource management. Collectively, the analyses provide information to the CACILM Working Groups on which to design an effective program of sustainable land management throughout the CACs.

One essential element of good program design is the participation of multiple stakeholders. Thus we will also need to extend our analysis to consider local stakeholders, and to design effective ways to ensure their inclusiveness in the design, implementation, and monitoring of projects coming under the CACILM framework.

This paper explains in greater detail the basis for further analysis:

Outline:

1. Goals of CACILM and some basic definitions
2. Needs for further analysis of links between Poverty, Gender, and Land Degradation
3. Developing a Participation Plan
4. Expected Outputs from Gender/Sociology Consultants
5. Next Steps

Annex 1: Key Background Documents for the Gender/Sociology Consultants

Annex 2: Terms of Reference of the G/S Consultants from the PDF-B.

Annex 3: Format for Expected Output #1 (Background Report)

Annex 4: Format for Expected Output #2 (Gender Plan)

Annex 5: Format for Expected Output #3 (Participation Plan)

1. Goals of CACILM and some basic definitions

The goal of CACILM is to combat land degradation and improve rural livelihoods in the CACs. GEF's definition of land degradation from OP15 is “. . .any form of deterioration of the natural potential of the land that affects ecosystem integrity either in terms of reducing its sustainable ecological productivity or in terms of its native biological richness and maintenance of resilience.” Land degradation can be seen as both a cause and consequence of rural poverty.

GEF further defines the main causes of land degradation as:

“. . . inappropriate land use, mainly unsuitable agricultural practices, overgrazing, and deforestation. These practices are most prevalent where in places where land, water, and other natural resources are under-priced. In addition, people who do not have land tenure security and/or water rights have little or no incentive to invest in sustainable land management. Instead, they tend to focus on meeting their short-term economic needs, to the detriment of the environment.”

The types of degradation currently in evidence in Central Asia include: erosion, salinization and water logging; deteriorating fertility of pasture land; decrease in fertility of the arable drylands of the steppes; decreased area and productivity of forests; on-site and off-site impacts of mining operations; exacerbated risks from landslides and flooding due to poor watershed management; reduced stability and functioning of desert, mountain, wetland, and riparian ecosystems; and inadequate and incorrect assessment and monitoring of land degradation.

The negative impacts of land degradation are both ecological and socio-economic. By reducing the productivity of the land, the capacity for rural people to sustain livelihoods on the land is decreased, causing a feedback loop of even more exploitative land-use practices and increasing degradation. Therefore, it is critical to address rural livelihoods and land management in a comprehensive manner, through a broad partnership such as CACILM.

2. Needs for further analysis of links between Poverty, Gender, and Land Degradation

The PDF-B points out that one of the weaknesses of the UNCCD NAPs is “technical responses carried out by individual agencies that do not reflect the social and institutional dimensions of the rural communities living on degraded lands.” While the NAPs do contain some information about the impact of land degradation on livelihoods (in the form of macro-level socio-economic data), the information can be characterized as purely descriptive and quite general. The NAPs provide a wealth of scientific and technical information, but in order to ensure that CACILM reflects and addresses the concerns of those most vulnerable to land degradation, we must conduct an in-depth analysis of the links between land degradation, poverty, and gender.

Gender analysis allows for the formulation of questions about women and men's roles and relations with regard to their access to and control over natural resources, such as land.

Understanding men's and women's relationships to the environment plays an important role in the development of interventions that are better targeted to meet both men's and women's needs and constraints.

A gender analysis under CACILM should include the following (among others):

- The collection of reliable socio-economic gender-disaggregated data on land management activities
- Review of land tenure systems with regard to gendered disparity of access to, and control over land
- Consideration of gender roles and how they can be translated into concrete actions for land management
- Identification of gendered divisions of labor within communities and households
- Review of the cultural, socio-economic, and gender-based barriers that influence (positively or negatively) the participation of women in land management activities
- Existence of gender-balanced community institutions
- Collection of positive examples of successful women land managers

The gender analysis lays the foundation for the design of effective land management projects which incorporate gender concerns and increase the participation of women. Projects must also build awareness and support among men in the community.

Good practices: Inclusion of women in land management projects

- Involve local women and men in the design of land management projects to promote their ability to assume greater control over local resources
- Raise awareness and provide education among women and men to bring about attitudinal change towards land management, and to increase the acceptance rate of any newly-introduced methodology
- Ensure land tenure rights for women, and provide awareness raising to women about their rights to land, and support services to assist them in asserting this right
- Increase women farmer's access to agricultural support services (extension services, inputs, credit, transport and access to markets, etc.)
- Provide women with management and organizational skills to help them participate in decision-making processes
- Provide gender training to all project beneficiaries (both men and women), project staff and partner agencies involved in project activities
- Select the best time for women to participate without taking them away from family or household duties

The PDF-B document specifies that the monitoring and evaluation of CACILM should include progress in achieving results on gender conditions linked with land degradation. Gender-sensitive indicators are indicators disaggregated by gender, age, and socio-economic background.¹ They are designed to demonstrate change in relations between women and men in a given society over a period of time. The indicators are a tool to assess the progress of a

¹ Source: FAO Sustainable Development Dimensions. <http://www.fao.org/sd/>. Many similar sources of information are available from the consultant.

particular development intervention towards achieving gender equality. Gender-disaggregated data demonstrate whether both rural women and men are included in the project at all levels.

Good practices: Examples of Gender-sensitive indicators

Quantitative:

- Participation of all stakeholders in project identification and design meetings (attendance and level of participation/contribution by sex, age, and socio-economic background).
- Degree of rural women and men's inputs into project activities, in terms of labor, tools, money, etc.
- Benefits (e.g. increased employment, crop yields, etc.) going to women and men, by socio-economic background and age.

Qualitative:

- Level of participation as perceived by stakeholders through the different stages of the project cycle (by sex, age, and socio-economic background).
- Degree of participation of an adequate number of women in important decision making (adequacy to be mutually agreed by all stakeholders) - to be measured through stakeholder responses and by qualitative analysis of the impact of different decisions.

3. Developing a Participation Plan

The PDF-B mentions several times the need to ensure stakeholder participation, both in the design of the CACILM partnership and in the implementation of projects on the ground.

GEF's OP#15 contains a clause on Public Participation, stating:

“Public participation is one of the key principles of project development and implementation adopted by the GEF Council in 1996. Mechanisms will be established during the development of a sustainable land management project, including those on capacity-building, to ensure effective stakeholder participation in the design, implementation, monitoring, and evaluation phases.”

Although the expected analysis and TORs of the gender/sociology consultants focus chiefly on gender and poverty aspects, best practices indicate that participation of all marginalized groups, is critical to the success of land management programs. Therefore, we will also pay special attention to developing a participation plan for other marginalized groups, such as ethnic minorities. We therefore need to do a stakeholder analysis of the marginalized groups for each type of land use. We can then propose, based on best practices, some methods of ensuring and increasing the quality of their participation.

Stakeholder analysis of land users in different types of land use systems should be conducted by the domestic consultants. From this analysis, a participation plan can be designed to include the relevant stakeholders (described in Annex 5).

There is a wealth of information about the benefits of stakeholder participation in improving the successful outcomes of land management projects worldwide. When stakeholders are involved,

projects can be tailored to their specific needs and are more likely to successfully address priorities. The following is a synthesis of some of the key best practices:

Good Practices: Stakeholder Participation²

- Include the people being served by the projects (beneficiaries) in the design and planning of the projects (for example, defining priorities and identifying projects to address local needs). Ultimately, as capacity is increased, the beneficiaries will increasingly take ownership of the project.
- Include local institutional stakeholders, such as local government agencies, elected officials, and NGOs in the process
- Promote and strengthen partnerships between local institutional and community stakeholders throughout the project cycle.
- Institutionalize participatory processes rather than using them as “one-off” strategies
- Measure and monitor the level of participation as an integral part of project monitoring and evaluation (ideally conducted by the stakeholders themselves).
- Accept that participatory process require a greater investment of time, as well as skills in facilitation, negotiation, and conflict resolution.

4. Expected Outputs from Gender/Sociology Consultants

According to the Terms of Reference as stated in the PDF-B (see Annex 2), there are a number written pieces and other outputs (such as assessments, plans, and other contributions to team documents) which are expected from the Gender/Sociology consultants at the conclusion of the PDF-B. These outputs can be grouped together as follows (suggested):

1. Background Paper on Social, Poverty, and Gender issues associated with Land Degradation in Central Asia
2. National Gender Plan (as part of the National Programme Framework)
3. Participation Plan for the inclusion of marginalized stakeholders in CACILM Projects

In addition to these written outputs (the suggested formats of which are described in Annexes 3,4, and 5), the consultants will contribute to the preparation of project concept papers summarizing the initial round of likely investments by providing input on social, poverty, and gender issues.

5. Next Steps:

It is assumed that regular and frequent e-mail contact will be maintained between the International and Domestic Consultants throughout the preparation of CACILM project outputs. However, the International Consultant on Gender/Sociology is contracted for only a short period, which will require that the Team Leader and other members of the International Consultant Team will need to provide substantive feedback to the Domestic Consultants on the work conducted. Options for managing this process will be discussed at the Domestic Consultants meeting 21-22 June.

² Main Source: “Rural Development Mobilizing the People” Asian Development Bank, synthesized with consultant’s professional experiences.

The meeting in Almaty will also provide opportunity to further discuss the concepts in this paper, the timeline, and some tools to assist in the preparation of the gender, and stakeholder analysis.

Annex 1: Key Background Documents for Gender/Sociologist Consultants

1. PDF-B Proposal to GEF (December 2004): This document outlines the goals, objectives and outputs of CACILM, the PDF-B design activities, the organizational chart of the consultant team and task force, and the Terms of References for the consultants.
2. CACILM Inception Report (June 2005): This report summarizes progress to date in CACILM, including the results of the national workshops, the multi-country workshop, and the task force meeting. It also outlines remaining activities of the PDF-B.
3. International Best Practices paper (May 2005): This paper looks at international best practices in land management, to provide a benchmark for projects to be designed in the CACs under CACILM.
4. UNCCD National Action Plans (NAPs) for each CAC, prepared under the UNCCD.
5. Country Environmental Assessments (CEAs), prepared by ADB for each CAC.
6. ADB Gender Assessments
7. Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs)
8. Global Environmental Facility (GEF) Operation Paper #15
9. RETA 5941 “Issues and approaches to combat desertification” papers

The aforementioned documents are to be provided by International Consultant and can also be found online via the Yahoo Briefcase:

Website address: <briefcase.yahoo.com>

Login: cacilm

Passwd: adbgroup

File Structure:

1. Drafts & Working Docs: This is for drafts we are reviewing, working documents, etc. -- basically anything unfinished that needs to be shared. When the versions are finalized, they can be moved into one of the following folders:
2. ADB Documents: such as the PDF-B document.
3. GEF Background Documents
4. Global Mechanism Background Documents
5. Country-Specific: There is one folder per country for NAPs, protocols of Country-level workshops, meetings, reports, studies, etc. There is also one folder for multi-country docs, such as the multi-country workshops.
6. General Background: Reports, studies, etc. that apply generally to the region or projects.

Annex 2: Terms of Reference for the Gender/Sociology Consultants (from the PDF-B)

International: An expert (2 person-months) on social aspects of land and water resources management as well as associated gender concerns in development program design, with qualifications in anthropology, sociology or related disciplines, at least 10 years experience, and preferably with substantial experience in Central Asia and/or in other transition economies, will participate in the consultant team to assist with preparation of NPFs and development of the CACILM program framework. The consultant will be primarily responsible for reviewing existing government policies, institutional arrangements at the national and sub-national levels, and the implications for sustainable land management, food security, poverty and gender aspects and making recommendations for appropriate adjustments to create improved conditions for the poor and women. S/he will report to the Team Leader while maintaining close interactions with the five domestic social scientist/gender specialists assigned to each of the national consultant teams.

Within the overall approach described in the PDF-B TOR, the specific responsibilities of the Sociologist/Gender Specialist will be to:

- (i) work with the domestic social scientist/gender specialist consultants, other consultant team members and CCD Working Group members to analyze social, cultural, poverty and gender dimensions of land degradation problems in each country as critical input to NPFs and background to and context for the CACILM program framework;
- (ii) in close consultation with the team leader and other consultant team members, design a participatory approach and tools for interaction with stakeholders including structured and informal interactions ensuring inclusion of women and gender disaggregated data collection;
- (iii) assist with the assessment of existing governmental and other institutional arrangements for land and water management to identify appropriate areas for reform that will contribute to improved conditions for the poor and women;
- (iv) working with other consultant team members, lead the assessment of connections between the incidence of poverty and land degradation as well as a review of the extent to which these relationships are reflected in national and sectoral development plans, and recommend improved approaches in both the NPFs and CACILM program framework;
- (v) work with other consultant team members to ensure wide stakeholder involvement throughout the design process, and take the lead in organizing visits to characteristic sites of land degradation and both structured and informal interactions with target beneficiary groups to enrich the on-the-ground context for both the NPFs and CACILM program framework;

- (vi) develop a statistical and analytical baseline of social and gender conditions linked to land degradation as well as specific measures common to all participating countries for monitoring progress in achieving results at both national and project levels;
- (vii) prepare a gender plan as part of the NPFs and CACILM program framework, including measures for evaluating results, a strategy for promoting executing agency involvement and ownership, and identification of resource requirements; and
- (viii) contribute to the preparation of project concept papers summarizing the initial round of likely investments (to create enabling policy/legal/institutional conditions and/or to support on the ground projects) by providing input on social, poverty, and gender issues.

A domestic expert (one consultant in each country for 7 person-months each) on socio-economic aspects of land and water resources management as well as associated gender concerns in development program design, with appropriate tertiary qualification, and preferably with ADB or other donor program design experience, will participate in the consultant team to assist with preparation of the NPF for his/her country. Under the supervision of the Domestic Team Leader/Natural Resources Specialist and working closely with the international Social Scientist/Gender Specialist and Natural Resource Economist, the consultant will be responsible for assisting with the review of existing government policies affecting land management as well as associated institutional arrangements at the national and sub-national levels, and the implications for sustainable land management, food security, poverty and gender aspects and making recommendations for appropriate adjustments to create improved conditions for the poor and women. S/he will report to the Deputy Team Leader while responding to the needs of and maintaining close interactions with the international Sociologist/Gender Specialist.

Within the overall approach described in the PDF-B TOR, the specific responsibilities of the domestic Social Scientist/Gender Specialist will be to:

- (i) assist with the analysis of socio-economic, cultural, poverty, and gender dimensions of land degradation problems in each country as critical input to NPFs and background to and context for the CACILM program framework;
- (ii) assist the international Sociologist/Gender Specialist design a participatory approach and tools for interaction with stakeholders including structured and informal interactions ensuring inclusion of women and gender disaggregated data collection;
- (iii) assist with the assessment of existing governmental and other institutional arrangements for land and water management to identify appropriate areas for reform that will contribute to improved for the poor and women;

- (iv) working with the international Sociologist /Gender Specialist, conduct an assessment of connections between the incidence of poverty and land degradation as well as a review of the extent to which these relationships are reflected in national and sectoral development plans, and recommend improved approaches in the NPF;
- (v) work with other consultant team members to ensure wide stakeholder involvement throughout the design process, and take primary responsibility organizing for organizing visits to characteristic sites of land degradation and both structured and informal interactions with target beneficiary groups to enrich the on-the-ground context for both the NPFs and CACILM program framework;
- (vi) assist in the development of a statistical and analytical baseline of social and gender conditions linked to land degradation as well as specific measures common to all participating countries for monitoring progress in achieving results at both national and project levels;
- (vii) assist with preparation of a national gender plan as part of the NPF, including measures for evaluating results, a strategy for promoting executing agency involvement and ownership, and identification of resource requirements; and
- (viii) contribute to the preparation of project concept papers summarizing the initial round of likely investments by providing input on social, poverty, and gender issues.

Annex 3: Format for Background Paper on Social, Poverty, and Gender issues associated with Land Degradation in Central Asia

The Terms of Reference as stated in the PDF-B call for:

- assessment of the connections between the incidence of poverty and land degradation as well as a review of the extent to which these relationships are reflected in national and sectoral development plans. The result of the assessment will be to recommend improved approaches in the NPF.
- assistance with the analyses of socio-economic, cultural, poverty, and gender dimensions of land degradation in each country as critical input to the NPFs and background to and context for the CACILM framework.
- assistance with the assessment of existing governmental and other institutional arrangements for land and water management to identify appropriate areas for reform that will contribute to improvements for the poor and women.
- assistance in the development of a statistical and analytical baseline of social and gender conditions linked to land degradation as well as specific measures common to all participating countries for monitoring progress in achieving results at both national and project levels.

Each domestic consultant will conduct this analysis for his/her respective country. These four elements can be formatted into one background paper, with the following suggested structure:

- I. Introduction and Overview
- II. Description of the social dimensions (socio-economic, gender, poverty, indigenous group roles) of varying types of land –use systems (for example; irrigated agriculture, mountain ecosystems, forested areas, dryland agriculture, pastures). What is the role of women in relation to men in each system, and how are they affected differently by land degradation and poverty? Include quantitative information as well as qualitative. Provide relevant case-study examples as illustrations.
- III. Review of property rights for women, both in terms of legislation and in practice. Describe the level of knowledge of women about their rights, and the ability of women to assert those rights, the types of support available to women in this process.
- IV. Review of relevant national and sectoral development plans, with an assessment of the ways in which land and natural resource management are addressed in relation to poverty alleviation and sustainable development. For example, how does the NAP address issues of poverty and gender? How does the PRSP address land degradation?
- V. Review of Gender policies in each country in the context of land management and sustainable development.
- VI. Conclusions and recommendations for the development of the Gender Plan under the NPFs.

Annex 4: Format for National Gender Plan (as part of the National Programme Framework)

According to the Terms of Reference in the PDF-B, this gender plan should include:

- measures for evaluating results, a strategy for promoting executing agency involvement and ownership, and identification of resource requirements.
- a participatory approach and tools for interaction with stakeholders including structured and informal interactions ensuring the inclusion of women and gender disaggregated data collection.

Also, taking into consideration some published criticism of the lack of attention to gender in previous GEF projects, we may also wish to include the following elements in the CACILM gender plans:

- guidelines/checklist to assess whether gender is being adequately addressed in all projects under CACILM. Each project proposal would undergo a brief review of a basic set of gender-specific criteria.
- Elaboration of a set of best practices for addressing gender in land management projects.

The development of the Gender Plan and the format will need to be discussed further as part of the NPF development process.

Annex 5: Format for Participation Plan for the inclusion of marginalized groups in CACILM Projects

According to the Terms of Reference in the PDF-B, this participation plan should include the design for a participatory approach and tools for the interaction with stakeholders including structured and informal interactions ensuring the inclusion of women and gender disaggregated data collection.

The inclusion of women is specifically addressed as part of the Gender Plan (Annex 4). However, women are not the only marginalized group which is often overlooked in the design and implementation of projects. It is therefore suggested that in order to ensure the full participation of all relevant stakeholders from marginalized groups, a broader participation plan should be designed.

A key component of this Participation Plan will be an analysis of the local stakeholders (land users, land managers, local government, etc.). Each consultant should conduct a stakeholder analysis for the types of land-use systems prevalent in his/her respective country (for example; irrigated agriculture, mountain ecosystems, forested areas, dryland agriculture, pastures). Some tools for conducting stakeholder analyses will be provided by the International Consultant.

Based on the outcome of the stakeholder analysis, an appropriate stakeholder participation plan can be designed. Given that the degrees and types of participation will vary depending on the type of project being implemented, it is envisaged that the stakeholder participation plan will be designed as a series of guidelines, including a participation matrix tool, to be included in each project under CACILM. A sample Participation Matrix Tool will be provided by the International Consultant.

[One final note on the use of the term “Stakeholder Participation” in CACILM. This term appears several times throughout the PDF-B document. Often times it refers to the need to include CACILM partners and other stakeholders (such as NGOs and Users-groups) in the PDF-B design phase (meaning the design of the CACILM partnership and the development of the NPFs). Other times, Stakeholder Participation refers to the inclusion of stakeholders during the design, implementation, and monitoring of sustainable land management *projects* coming under the CACILM framework.]