



Technical Assistance Consultant's Report

Project Number: TA 6400-REG
April 2008

Regional: Supporting Community-Driven Development in Developing Member Countries Study Tour on Community-Driven Development Bishkek, Kyrgyz Republic 23–30 April 2008

Prepared by Rural Development Fund and Asyl Undeland
Bishkek, Kyrgyz Republic

Edited by Sonomi Tanaka, ADB

For Asian Development Bank

This consultant's report does not necessarily reflect the views of ADB or the Government concerned, and ADB and the Government cannot be held liable for its contents. (for project preparatory technical assistance: All the views expressed herein may not be incorporated into the proposed project's design.)

Asian Development Bank

ABBREVIATIONS

ADB	–	Asian Development Bank
ARIS	–	Community Development and Investment Agency
CDI	–	Collaborative Development Initiative
CDD	–	community driven development
JFPR	–	Japan Fund for Poverty Reduction
LIC	–	local investment committees
MPG	–	micro project groups
PIU	–	Project Implementation Unit
VIC	–	village investment committees

CONTENTS

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION	1
A. Study Tour Participants	1
B. Study Tour Objectives	2
C. Major Topics of the Study Tour	2
D. Kyrgyz Republic Agencies and Organizations which were involved in the Exchange of Experiences	2
II. SUMMARY OF STUDY TOUR PROGRAM AND KEY DISCUSSIONS	5
A. Session I – Functional and Fiscal Decentralization in the Kyrgyz Republic	5
B. Major Conclusions of Session I	5
C. Session II – Village Investment Project, ARIS	6
D. Major Conclusions of Session II	7
E. Session III – Other CDD Initiatives and Approaches in the Kyrgyz Republic	8
F. Major Conclusions of Session III	9
G. Field Trips to Osh Oblast, Chui and Issyk Kul Regions	10
H. Brief Minutes of the Discussions during the Field Visit	11
III. KEY OBSERVATIONS AND RESPONSES BY THE MONGOLIAN DELGATION	15
APPENDIXES	
1. Study Tour Program of the Workshop	17
2. Key Learning by the Mongolian Delegation	27

I. INTRODUCTION

1. The Asian Development Bank organized an exchange study tour to the Kyrgyz Republic for the project team and other stakeholders from Mongolia involved in the Japan Fund for Poverty Reduction (JFPR): Community Driven Development for Urban Poor in Ger Area Project on 23–30 April 2008. This project is aimed at empowering local communities through their increased participation in the design, implementation, financial management, and monitoring of community demand driven infrastructure and income generating projects through the community driven development (CDD) approach. Since this is the first time when a CDD approach is applied in Mongolia, the project team expressed an interest to learn about experience of CDD in other countries.

2. ADB had selected Kyrgyz Republic for this study tour which has significant experience with initiatives based on CDD approaches implemented by various agencies and donor funded projects during last ten years. The one week exchange study tour aimed to give the Mongolian team exposure on how CDD mechanisms and methodologies work (or do not work) on the ground in institutional circumstances similar to Mongolia. This also provided an opportunity for Kyrgyz CDD practitioners to learn from the experience in Mongolia.

3. **Organizing parties.** The study tour was arranged by the ADB Resident Mission in Mongolia, funded by the ADB Regional Initiative on Supporting CDD in Developing Member Countries (TA 6400-REG). In the Kyrgyz Republic the Mongolian team is hosted by the Community Development and Investment Agency (ARIS) which is implementing a number of CDD based projects in the Kyrgyz Republic. Ms. Asyl Undeland served as a Resource Person for this study tour and logistics were handled by the Rural Development Fund (Kyrgyz NGO).

4. **Dates.** The study tour was supposed to start on 21 April but because of weather condition in Ulan Bator, participants arrived to Bishkek only on 23 April and left on 30 April.

A. Study Tour Participants

5. The study tour group consisted of the management and staff of the Project Implementation Unit (PIU) and Project Advisor of the Community Driven Development for Urban Poor in Ger Area Project (JFPR). There were also representative of the Mongolian NGO providing support to community/neighborhood initiatives in Mongolia and official from the city Erdenet, as well as two ADB staff from ADB Resident Mission in Mongolia and ADB Headquarters in Manila.

Table 1. List of the Study Tour Participants from Mongolia

No.	Name	Position
1	Ms. Amar Tsetsegmaa	Economist officer, ADB Mongolian Resident Mission
2	Ms. Dovchin Myagmar	ADB JFPR-9106 MON Project Coordinator
3	Ms. Nyamdeleg Dejid	ADB JFPR-9106 MON Project Accountant
4	Ms. Jinsbek Amonjol	ADB JFPR-9106 MON Project Local Mobilizer in Erdenet city
5	Mr. Gongor Batdorj	Community development specialist, Urban Development Resource Center NGO in UB
6	Mr. Daramjav Munkhbold	Local government officer in charge of bags and legal adviser of Bayan-Undur soum, in Erdenet city

7	Mr. Juergen Hartwig	German development agency (DED) Community Development Expert
8	Ms. Sonomi Tanaka	Senior Social Development Specialist, ADB, Manila

B. Study Tour Objectives

6. The major objectives of this study tour was to have exchange of information, knowledge, experience and lessons learnt on community driven development between CDD practitioners of the Kyrgyz Republic and Mongolia. This was to be achieved through sharing information on CDD approaches developed and used in various projects and investments, on institutional set up and arrangements for inclusion of communities into development of their localities, on implementation issues and lessons learnt.

7. Secondary objective was to have discussion between study group participants and their Kyrgyz colleagues on the design, implementation arrangements and issues of the Community Driven Development for Urban Poor in Ger Area Project (JFPR).

C. Major Topics of the Study Tour

8. Study tour was design for the participants to learn:

- (i) functional and fiscal decentralization reforms in the Kyrgyz Republic, their objectives, scope and results;
- (ii) current activities with elements of CDD in the Kyrgyz Republic, their designs and implementation issues, met with the representatives of these initiatives, visited their project sites and had discussions with local population;
- (iii) various institutional aspects and arrangements for community involvement in urban and rural areas, including strategic planning for development with involvement of community organizations, organization of Local Investment Committees (LIC), Village Investment Committees (VIC), micro project groups (MPG), budget hearings with involvement of community representatives, reporting to community, transparency measures and arrangements;
- (iv) capacity building activities for local self government bodies and community organizations;
- (v) social mobilization processes by stages and lessons learnt from various processes,
- (vi) innovative community micro projects, their technologies and implementation;
- (vii) procurement and financial management arrangements, issues, and lessons learnt at the local and central level within ARIS; and
- (viii) lessons learnt by Kyrgyz partners in developing and strengthening of Community Development and Investment Agency.

D. Kyrgyz Republic Agencies and Organizations which were involved in the Exchange of Experiences

- (i) ARIS (Community Development and Investments Agency) for VIP and Small Towns Infrastructure and Capacity Building Project;
- (ii) Rural Development Fund;
- (iii) Ministry of Local Government Development;
- (iv) Kyrgyz State National University;

- (v) ADB Country Office;
- (vi) Urban Institute; and
- (vii) Communities, Local Investment Committees (LICs), Village Investment Committees (VICs), micro project groups, representatives of local self government bodies

II. SUMMARY OF STUDY TOUR PROGRAM AND KEY DISCUSSIONS

9. The study tour consisted of a three and a half day workshop in Bishkek and three days of fieldtrips to Chui, Issyk-Kul and Osh provinces. The study tour program included the expert reviews, presentations, roundtable discussions, meetings with municipal bodies and project staff, and guided study visits to micro projects with meetings of local population. The group members have acquainted themselves with Kyrgyzstan's experiences in community driven development in small urban and rural settlements, learnt about various projects and investment programs in that area, and exchanged opinions on current challenges and future reforms in both countries. See Appendix 1 with the program of the workshop, which is also linked to presentations made (mixture of Russian and English). Appendix 2 summarizes key learning by the Mongolian delegation and their plans for their project modification after the study tour.

10. Study tour started with the two and a half day workshop with involvement of various actors in CDD in Kyrgyzstan.

A. Session I – Functional and Fiscal Decentralization in the Kyrgyz Republic

11. This session focused on the functional and financial aspects of the decentralization reform in the Kyrgyz Republic and its current status. The objective of this session was to provide background with political and administrative context for the CDD in the Kyrgyz Republic at the various stages of the reform.

12. The session started with the presentation of Mr. Tolobek Omuraliev, who was a champion of decentralization reforms in the Kyrgyz Republic country while being a minister of the Local Self Government and Regional Development and has valuable insights on its processes, impacts, and lessons learnt in regards to the CDD. His presentation on the Process and Specifics of the Community Development in the Kyrgyz Republic Based on the Decentralization of the State Functions and Development of the Local Self Government is attached (Annex 2, Presentations) gave participants a brief information on policy and legal framework created for the CDD at the various stages of the reform.

13. Mr. Emil Abdykalykov, Economist from the Decentralization and Local Self Government Program, the Urban Institute (US organization funded by the USAID) made a presentation about fiscal decentralization in the Kyrgyz Republic, its result and impact on the CDD. This presentation was focused on the budgetary reform in Kyrgyzstan with the shift to two tier budget and its impact on CDD.

14. During this session participants also learnt about relationships and interactions between local government and community based organizations through involvement of population in strategic planning of the local territory, budgeting at the local level.

B. Major Conclusions of Session I

- (i) Kyrgyzstan had solid grounds for the functional and fiscal decentralization reforms with legal framework (Law on Local Self Government, Law on Community Based Organizations, Law on Economical and Financial Base of Local Self Government and etc.).

- (ii) Kyrgyz Government at the early stage was committed to decentralization and development of local community based initiatives, there were special government programs on social mobilization, on poverty alleviation through self help groups and etc.
- (iii) Functional decentralization legislation gives adequate decision making and management authority to local self government bodies and to community organizations.
- (iv) Fiscal decentralization supports development of localities and local initiatives based on community involvement.
- (v) Further development of community organization is happening through delegation to them management of municipal property.
- (vi) There are some gaps in legislation and weaknesses in implementation of this legislation in regards to municipal property.
- (vii) Kyrgyzstan has returned to three tier budget system but there are still strong elements of fiscal decentralization at the local level.
- (viii) Strategic planning should be a part of the community social mobilization and empowerment process to ensure sustainability of investments at the local level.
- (ix) Community empowerment should go jointly with empowerment of bodies of local self government.

C. Session II – Village Investment Project, ARIS

15. Second day was fully devoted to the review of the implementation arrangements of the Village Investment Project (funded by the WB and other cofinanciers) and implemented by the ARIS (all presentations are attached in Annex 1).

16. ARIS specialists informed study tour participants on the institutional and organizational structure of ARIS, its objectives and projects under implementation.

17. There were presentations made on social mobilization, inclusion and transparency arrangements in the framework of the Village Investment Project (VIP), on the process, key stages and elements of the community participatory needs assessment. There was information given on how ARIS and communities compile and use social and economic profile of the *aiyl kenesh* territory.

18. Participants learnt details about institutions created under the VIP, such as Local Investment Unions (LIUs) and Local Investment Committees (LICs),¹ Village Investment Unions (VIUs) and Village Investment Committees (VICs), micro project groups (MPGs), their role and functions at the local level, how they are involved in strategic planning, preparation and implementation of the micro projects.

19. Capacity building expert of ARIS briefed study tour participants on different capacity building programs implemented under the VIP, their results and lessons learnt.

¹ These are sometimes translated as Territorial Investment Unions (TIUs) and Territorial Investment Committees (TICs), respectively. In this paper, the English abbreviations of LIUs and LICs are applied for consistency with the official English documents produced by ARIS and the World Bank. It was explained that one LIU/LIC covers approximately 40,000 households, although a significant variation exists.

20. Special session was devoted to the planning, implementation and supervision of the micro projects under the VIP, overview of the process how micro projects go through various stages starting from planning stage till the last reporting stage. ARIS procurement and financial specialists explained on how communities manage their accounting and procurement of goods and services, how funds flow to the local levels, and what were major lessons learnt.

21. Participants also learnt about Management Information System (MIS) developed for the VIP, on the method of joint Monitoring and Evaluation used in the framework of this project, shared their opinions on the needs for M&E.

22. During this session participants also had an opportunity to have Question and Answers session with Gotz Schreiber. Mr. Schreiber used to be WB Task Team Leader responsible for the design and supervision of the VIP. Mr. Schreiber shared his insights on lessons learnt from the VIP which could be used for the design and implementation of the similar project in Mongolia.

D. Major Conclusions of the Session II

- (i) To have support to the CDD approaches in country there is a need to have commitment from the government. Project should look for champions in power structures to ensure this commitment.
- (ii) Organizational set up of ARIS, as well as local institutions such as LICs were made to maintain balance of power between representatives of various stakeholders. ARIS has a Supervisory board with one third of seats taken by the government, one third by the representatives of the local self government, and another third by the representatives of the civil society. LICs include deputies of the local elected councils, head of the local self government bodies, and representatives of communities (with majority of voices).
- (iii) LICs do not have to be sustainable institutions after the project life. In some areas they continue activities after the project, in another they stop functioning.
- (iv) One need to start with strong communities, to have a 'demonstrational site' so other communities could learn and get motivated. It is important to organize community visits to each other at the initial stage to foster exchange of experiences.
- (v) It important for the success of the project to stay few years in one community to ensure capacity building and empowerment of communities in addressing their own problems and needs.
- (vi) Do not get discouraged by the initially poor quality of work and mistakes made. This is why it is important for several micro projects to be conducted in the same community.
- (vii) Social mobilization takes time and should cover as many villagers as possible. To increase coverage and improve inclusion, method of delegation could be used.
- (viii) The amount of grant for community should not be too big to avoid elite capturing.
- (ix) You need good experts' help for technical matters such as civil works and accounting. Assessment of available capacity and services and training are essential.

- (x) It is better to calculate community contribution in relation to the amount of grant, rather than to the micro project cost.
- (xi) Community collects contribution from its members even higher than established rates. There is a need to have transparency on funds allocations and processes. Transparency is ensured through informational board and village meetings.

E. Session III – Other CDD Initiatives and Approaches in the Kyrgyz Republic

23. This session was focused on other initiatives with CDD approaches used in the Kyrgyz Republic and in Mongolia, and discussion of some differences in them. Speakers presented various approaches in social mobilization where they entry into communities through community leaders, economically and socially active people, neighborhood leaders and joint interest groups. There are differences in these approaches which are explained by the scope of the initiative, its objectives and tasks. For income generating micro projects it makes sense to mobilize people into interest groups (i.e. livestock herders, honey bee producers), for educational initiative, community is also mobilized around joint interest.

24. Ms. Sulpieva from UNDP, Decentralization program informed participants about project which has laid foundation for decentralization reform and development of CBOs – neighborhood committees. She shared lessons learnt on small micro projects with infrastructure when ownership status is not clear and which affected maintenance.

25. Mr. Shamkeev from RDC Elet informed study group participants about DFID project on Sustainable Livelihood of Livestock Communities and approach it used to mobilize working groups – which were either informal community leaders or interest groups – for grants and micro credits.

26. Ms. Aida Gareeva from CAMP Ala Too, informed about their approach to mobilization around management of natural resources, i.e., pastures. Through interactive game using ALS (self learning method) CAMP raises awareness in communities and empowers them in strategic thinking in terms of management of common resources.

27. During this session, participants also learnt about infrastructure projects within ARIS and innovative technologies in small infrastructure. Mr. Satybekov, Coordinator of the Small Towns and Capacity Building Project implemented by ARIS shared lessons learnt with the Small Grants Window within this project. Mr. Abdivasiev shared his experience with introduction of innovations into small infrastructure projects within KfW project in rural areas.

28. Mr. Colin Spurway from Mercy Corpse (USAID funded organization) shared his experience that it is important to allocate adequate time for social mobilization. If done in rush, social mobilization would not bring long lasting results. He also emphasized the need to have motivated and energetic mobilization specialists.

29. Social mobilization of poor requires different methods and approaches. UNDP Poverty Alleviation Program specialist gave overview of their approach to mobilization of self help groups for micro credit purposes.

F. Major Conclusions of Session III

- (i) Process, intensiveness, coverage, width and depth of the social mobilization depend on the objectives of the initiative.
- (ii) Community's interest does not last long. It is important to innovate
- (iii) Social mobilization requires adequate time and resources.
- (iv) CDD is useful for
- (v) Bigger and technically complicated infrastructure is better to be renovated not through CDD but with people's involvement into planning and implementation.
- (vi) Social mobilization of poor and vulnerable people requires even more effort and time.
- (vii) There are innovations in making insulation of small public facilities and information about them requires awareness program.

G. Field Trips to Osh Oblast,² Chui and Issyk Kul Regions

30. Geographically Kyrgyzstan is divided into two parts – South and North. These two parts are separated from each other by high mountain ranges and differ by population composition and density, type of economy, culture and lifestyles. Therefore, RDF wanted to demonstrate the CDD micro-projects implemented both in the South and North of Kyrgyzstan.

31. On 25 April, the visiting group, accompanied by the RDF's director Ms. Zina Alieva, flew from Bishek to the second biggest city and the ancient town of Osh located in the south-western part of the country in Fergana Valley.

32. On 26 April, the group made six site visits to the CDD micro-projects located in Nookat, Aravan and Kara-Suu districts. According to the field trip itinerary, the group started with micro-projects implemented by the Mercy Corps International under its Collaborative Development Initiative (CDI) Program. Mr. Colin Spurway, Chief of Party for Mercy Corps International, has personally participated in workshop in Bishkek and briefed the workshop participants about the

The center of Osh holds Suleiman Mountain ("Throne of King Solomon"). It is a unique natural and historical place with petroglyphs dating back 5,000-6,000 years and traces of a Bronze Age settlement. According to legend, the mountain appeared only after King Solomon rested here. For Central Asian Muslims this mountain is the third most sacred place after Mecca and Medina. At the summit there is an ancient mosque built by Bobur (the founder of Great Moguls dynasty) in 1510.

The south-western [Fergana Valley](#) is [subtropical](#) and extremely hot in summer, with temperatures reaching 40°C (104°F.) The northern foothills are [temperate](#) and the Tian Shan mountain plateaus vary from dry [continental](#) to [polar climate](#), depending on elevation. In the coldest areas temperatures are sub-zero for around 40 days in winter, and even some desert areas experience constant snowfall in this period.

CDI program implemented in southern Kyrgyzstan by his agency. The program aims to enable citizens and leaders in southern Kyrgyzstan to effectively address and peacefully manage conflict and tensions through a focus on community driven local economic development. CDI facilitates development and work of Local Economic Development Councils (comprised of local leaders elected by a cluster village), community and market

² *Oblast* – an administrative territorial unit in Kyrgyz Republic. Each oblast comprises a number of *raions*(districts). Rural municipalities (*aiyl ökmötü*), consisting of two up to twelve small settlements, have their own elected [mayors](#) and [councils](#).

committees, initiative groups, entrepreneurs and government develop projects that have broad impact on cluster businesses and households. Also these groups are engaged in developing the market for value-added services and new technologies supported through cluster activities. By the end of 2006, the Local Economic Development project formed seven clusters of 46 communities, formed and trained their LEDCs, helped to develop strategic plans and launched 21 cluster economic development sub-projects.

33. The Mercy Corps staff proposed to meet with a LEDC's members and visit two subprojects in Nookat district.

34. Early in the morning the group met with the Mercy Corps International staff in Osh: Mr. Saidullo Bektemirov, Ms Asel Jumataeva and Ms Rakiya. Jointly with them the group departed to Eski-Nookat – Nookat district center – to meet with the “Nookat” Local Economic Development Council members, representing Eski-Nookat, Kara-Tash, Kyrgyz-Ata and Chachma-Sai rural communities. The Council chairperson briefed the visitors on history and activities of their Council and answered the visitors' questions.

35. After meeting with the Council Members, the group visited a Mercy Corps micro-project – the cattle artificial insemination unit in Eski-Nookat. Nookat raion is both field farming and livestock raising area. For the last decade the quality of livestock has drastically degraded. Therefore, the “Nookat” Local Economic Development Council recommended launching a project that will address this urgent need. The cattle AI unit has started its work in 2006. Currently it serves nine rural communities in Osh and Batken oblasts. Total cost of the micro-project was about US\$80,000. USAID provided 59% of total amount of the project, local self-governance bodies – 10%, and local communities' contribution comprised 31%. Rural residents pay for AI of their cattle as they realize the benefit of it.

36. The next site was a barber's shop. The micro-project was also approved by the “Nookat” LEDC. It is located in a very busy point – at the local bazaar and has a lot of customers. The owner of the barber's shop has high hopes to repay the provided credit on time.

37. Then, the group members visited Aravan raion and got acquainted themselves with two micro-projects implemented within the ARIS's Village Investment Project: greenhouse in Chertik village and *Duldul At* Historical and Cultural Site. Mr. Bekbolot Aitiev – coordinator of the ARIS Southern Office accompanied the group and commented on ARIS activities in southern oblasts.

38. The greenhouse for growing vegetables and green staff is an income generating micro-project. The micro-project was approved by the Village Investment Committee and started in June 2007. The visiting group could meet with the leader and the members of the micro-project group and look at the greenhouse and plants. The total cost of the micro-project was about \$2,500. ARIS provided about \$1,000, the rest was covered by the micro-group members. For example, the group leader gave its household plot for constructing the greenhouse; other group members contributed cash and labor. The micro-group members expect to have a good crop and revenue. Every member of the micro-project group would have his/her share of revenue according to their contribution. They will pay in-kind the money provided by ARIS by supplying local two schools and a kindergarten with fresh vegetable produce.

39. The next site was *Duldul At* (Heavenly Horses) Historical and Cultural Site in Aravan village – an ARIS social infrastructure grant project. In the history of the [Han Dynasty](#), the region of Ferghana is presented as the country of the [Dayuan](#). Dayuan was renowned for its Heavenly Horses which the Chinese tried to obtain with little success until they waged war against them in [104 BC](#). Near the village Aravan one can find a cozy place near water canal and a group of rocky mountains with petroglyphic drawings of the “heavenly horses. From bygone times this place “has been a holy site and attraction both to local residents and foreigners. Until recently it was a wild place and people made their way through bushes and stones. Local community members applied to the local Village Investment Committee to accommodate this holy place: make a fence, walking paths, built a small bridge over the canal, make an information board, etc. Now this place is easily accessible and turned into a site frequently visited by local residents and residents of neighboring countries. A modest fee taken by a site attendant is spent for looking after the place.

40. The last site visited in Osh oblast was Nariman village in Kara-Su raion. The visiting group saw Gas Supply Micro-Project and met with its members. The population of the village (especially women) has faced problems with cooking and heating their houses due to expensiveness of firewood/coal and continuous shortage of electric supply. The village investment committee approved construction of natural gas pipeline for the villagers. There were favorable conditions for the implementation of the project as the main gas pipeline from Uzbekistan passes through the village territory. The community members imputed both labor and cash. It was necessary to lay 27 km-long gas route made of metal pipes of varying diameters. Also, it was necessary to install one gas distribution unit as well as install gas meters. The tender was conducted to procure necessary materials and equipment, and the community managed to complete all essential works within the projected budget. As a result, heating and cooking have become less painstaking process as it used to be. This has improved the living standards, reduced household expenditures for electricity, and improved the environmental and sanitary conditions of the village, as well as saved time of women and children. After the completion of the first extension, the facility was handed over to OshGas operating company. The villagers now pay regular user fees for use of gas. Soon the community will build the second pipeline extension and in that manner will cover the whole village.

41. In Chui region group visited Novopokrovka village in Logvinenko aiyl okmotu where it met with MPG representatives, VIC and LIC members, head of the local government. Participants visited day care renovated with the help of ARIS, had discussions with the beneficiaries. Logvinenko aiyl okmotu works with ARIS for four years. At the general village meeting, people identified 21 major problems and 12 of them were selected for funding and implementation. The main problems were: water supply system, toilets in school, dare care maintenance. All these 12 infrastructures are still functioning, and considered sustainable. Accountant and treasury of VIC work without salary, because they decided to contribute more to the cost of micro project. People are very active and they are willing to work not only with ARIS, but also with other organizations because they are sure that they have a good potential to work and realize projects.

42. Within day care, MPG built a resource center for school children and villagers. Villagers pay money for services (education and computer services), but for representatives of aiyl okmotu services are free of charge because it supported center with facilities and communications. This informational center is income generating project and one of the

finished project among income generating micro projects, because before in priority first were social projects.

43. Villagers don't work with cash, all money is transferred from ARIS to LIC's account, then to VIC's account and finally distributed to MPGs. VIC is registered as a legal entity, has its own account.

44. Procurement and financial accounting is conducted by MPG members.

45. In Issyk Kul oblast study tour participants visited Toruaigyr *aiyl okmotu* and Sary oi *aiyl okmotu*. VICs of Sary Oi *aiyl okmotu* (3 villages) has been working with ARIS for four years. During that time 25 micro projects were implemented. First priority was heating system in secondary school. Besides there were micro projects on establishment of resource center (computer equipment), seven income generating projects (wood workshops). Members of MPG pass all trainings and lessons.

46. Delegates got acquaintance with social projects like school rehabilitation, improving of heating system in school, sport facilities, day care renovations and others.

47. MPG can have a reserve (5-10%), but most of all it depends on a micro projects' cost. After 50% of finished work, experts conduct a monitoring.

48. First year of work was really difficult because communities didn't have skills and experience with accounting, procurement and reporting. Many tranches for transfer of funds also caused problems in construction. Another problem related to high inflation and rise of cost for construction materials.

49. Study tour participants visited income generating projects: informational center in Kara-Oi, renovation of local club building (for museum, for assembly hall), barbershop, sewing shop and met with MPG members.

H. Brief Minutes of the Discussions during the Field Visit

- (i) Sustainability of micro projects. Sustainability depends on group members, on community itself. Their efforts, skills and the most important their willingness and desire can guarantee sustainability of projects. ARIS succeed in winning peoples' trust. That was a crucial element of success.
- (ii) Status of ownership of the asset. Discussion about difference between private, state and municipal property in KG. Difficulties in registration of municipal property, difference in registration of municipal, private and state property. Difference in definitions of municipal, private and state property. Discussion mainly was about municipal property, who is responsible for its maintenance.
- (iii) Few years cycle of the CDD activities in the same village. Repeated investments into micro projects in one village, what happens with projects after completion (4 years), does the investment continue, if it's not an income generating project. It depends on community itself; community can find other sources of investments. After 4 years or partnership with ARIS, people become educated, motivated and their potential grows, they can easily write projects, win and implement them. They have a vision of ways to make their life better.

- (iv) Community contribution. In VIP communities contribute 25% in labor and 3,75% in cash. Sometimes communities contribute more than this. It depends on the project, on its importance for the community and capacity of the specific community. Usually, its not difficult for community to make contribution. On the contrary, villagers understand that if they contribute more in labor and in cash, the implementation could be more effective and faster.
- (v) Management of the MIS in ARIS. Only operator of the MIS has full access to it. It keeps information about grants, amount, cost.
- (vi) Microprojects. VICs and MPGs organize tenders and responsible for procurement, average amount depends on projects' cost. (Also it has relation to population of the aiyl okmotu). If the size of Micro project increases, then ARIS can review revised budget, which should include all information about expenses and justification for increase.
- (vii) Elite capturing. Micro projects can be captured by local government officials, management of LICs and other elite. Projects can be easily captured and people can be forced to do what they don't need. Certain people (for example, aiyl okmotu members) can make own decision in realization of some projects and can implement own decision. And the most dangerous, they can use it for political purpose. ARIS has safeguards on each level in ARIS itself, that's why it is an opportunity to control projects and money. Whole structure was done to make money reach lowest levels (LIC and VIC). Besides, joint monitoring and evaluation can assist in controlling the money. People have an opportunity to decide in their own priorities, they can vote, discuss, solve, argue and agree. Also ARIS does not allow buying of agricultural machines, because it could be easily end up in the hands of few individuals.
- (viii) Relationships between local government and ARIS. Aiyl Okmotus help ARIS and communities to implement projects in a partnership. Each Aiyl okmotu has its own strategic plan which is approved by local council. Head of aiyl okmotu as well as few deputies of the council are members of LICs. It is very difficult and time-consuming to develop strategic vision and plan at local level.
- (ix) Distribution of resources. Distribution depends on AK population (but not on village population). ARIS gives money to LIC, LIC distributes money to VICs depending on amount or cost of projects, but not on population of village.

III. KEY OBSERVATIONS AND RESPONSES BY THE MONGOLIAN DELEGATION

50. Three presentations were made by the Mongolian participants (which are spread across in different sections of the Program) to share their community participation experience thus far in urban/peri-urban ger area context.

51. Ms. Dovchin Myagmar, JFPR-9106 Program Coordinator, presented on the experienced gained through a previous JFPR-9015 project on Improvement of Living Environment in Ger Areas. The project included housing finance, community-based group formation and training, and project management. In addition to the provision of small housing loans, the project successfully established savings groups for the poor ger area households. The high level demand for micro housing loans was demonstrated, which attracted commercial banks offer special loans using the land as collateral. This has also created the basis for community based organizations, which are being utilized in JFPR-9106 and other projects.

52. Mr. Gongor Batdorj presented on the ongoing community mobilization process facilitated by Urban Development Resource Center (NGO in Ulaanbaatar). He emphasized the importance of repeated meetings and visits to community members in following up income generation and environmental improvement activities.

53. Mr. Jurgen Hartwig, DED Community Development Expert for JFPR-9106, made a presentation on the key design features of the new CDD JFPR in ger areas. The project has three components: capacity building and community mobilization; implementation of subprojects; and project management. Eligible subprojects include; technical and housing infrastructure, social infrastructure, environmental management, and income generation.

54. The delegation raised important questions, such as how to change the mentality of local government officials, whether accounting and procurement procedures should be more decentralized for the JFPR (currently to be conducted by PIU), and how to avoid elite capture.

55. In response, the Kyrgyz participants highlighted:

- (i) Transparency at every level (e.g., in choosing contractors and prioritizing micro projects) is key to avoid elite capture. Community information board, village meetings, and focus group meetings are essential.
- (ii) To gain support by local government officials, involve them. However, avoid their becoming Chairs of LICs. They should be involved as members of LICs but decisions need to be made by all the LIC members and avoid the monopoly of chairs.
- (iii) Trust building with citizens through the first round of introductory meetings is essential. During this time, it is important to demonstrate that the project office will not implement the project but they are only facilitators.
- (iv) Social assessment is crucial in understanding community dynamics and profiles, which should be documented in the community log book.

56. The Mongolian delegation's key learning is summarized in Appendix 2. After the study tour, they are now considering the modification of the project design, such as

- (i) more emphasis and longer time on community mobilization, training and formation of subproject groups to ensure the message that the PIU is only to facilitate the project, not to implement;
- (ii) establishment of focus groups in each community to ensure voices of subgroups (women, elderly, youth, professionals) are reflected and avoid elite capture; and
- (iii) seek assistance for establishment of MIS at PIU.

STUDY TOUR ON COMMUNITY DRIVEN DEVELOPMENT FROM MONGOLIA

**Kyrgyz Republic
23-30 April 2008**

Wednesday, 23rd April 2008	
9:13 - 10:00	<p>Arrival to Manas airport (flight from Urumqi)</p> <p>Arrival to the hotel Urmat Ordo Address: Isanova Street 85/ intersection with Kievskaya Street</p> <p>Responsible persons: Mr. Azamat Omorbekov, RDF Ms. Elmira Akmatova, RDF</p>
10:30 – 12:30	Rest
12:30 -14:00	Lunch in the hotel
14:00	Pick up from hotel to the ARIS Northern Regional Office conference facilities (Lineynaya/Razzakova)
14:15 – 14:30	Orientation (in the ARIS Northern Regional office) Asyl Undeland
14:30 – 14:45	<p>Opening of the Workshop</p> <p>Mr. Lan Wu, Country Director, Kyrgyz Resident Mission, ADB</p> <p>Mr. Asylbek Chekirov, Deputy Executive Director, ARIS</p> <p>Ms. Dovchin Myagmar, JFPR Project Director</p> <p>Ms. Sonomi Tanaka, Senior Social Development Specialist, Regional and Sustainable Development Department, ADB</p>
14:45 - 15:00	<p>Introduction and expectations</p> <p>Moderator: Kuluipa Akmatova, RDF</p>
15:00-15:50	<p>Session I: Decentralization, Local Government and CDD context in the Kyrgyz Republic</p> <p>Venue: ARIS Northern Regional Office, Lineyanaia/Razzakova Streets Moderator: Ms. Asyl Undeland</p> <p>Theme A: Fiscal and Functional Decentralization</p> <p>This session will discuss the functional and financial aspects of the decentralization reform in the Kyrgyz Republic and its current status. The objective of this session is to understand better political and administrative context for the CDD in the Kyrgyz Republic at the various stages.</p> <p>Participants will learn about policy and legal framework created for CDD at the</p>

	<p>initial stage. Its important to understand a scope and issues of fiscal decentralization, and its impact on CDD and projects with CDD approach. This session will be led by Mr. Omuraliev, who started and promoted decentralization reforms in this country and has valuable insights on its impact, and lessons learnt from it in regards to the CDD.</p> <p>Mr. Abdykalykov from the Urban Institute (US organization funded by the USAID) will talk about fiscal decentralization in the context of CDD. The Urban Institute has been involved in decentralization process for more than seven years.</p> <p>Speakers: a) Mr. Tolobek Omuraliev, ex minister of the Ministry of the Local Self Government b) Mr. Emil Abdykalykov, Economist, Urban Institute</p>
15:50- 16:00	Coffee Break
16:00 – 16:30	<p>Theme B: Participation of citizenry in decision making process</p> <p>This session will review relationships and interactions between local government and population. At this session delegation will learn about methods of involvement of citizenry in decision making processes at the local level. Invited speakers will inform about initiatives on strategic planning and budgeting at the local level, used participatory approaches and methods.</p>
16:30-17:00	<p>Discussion: During this discussion participants from both sides will exchange experiences, lessons learnt.</p> <p>Speakers: a) Mr. Asylbek Chekirov, Deputy Executive Director, ARIS b) Mr. Murat Suiunbaev, Professor, Kyrgyz National University</p>
17:00	Transfer to the hotel
Thursday, 24th April 2008	
8:00- 8:45	Breakfast
8:45	Pick up from the hotel
9:00 -10:00	<p>Session II: Village Investment Project (VIP), funded by the World Bank Venue: ARIS Northern Regional Office, Lineynaia/Razzakova Streets Moderator: Mr. Nurbek Imakeev, VIP Coordinator, ARIS</p> <p>Opening of the Session II by the management of the Community Investment and Development Agency (ARIS), review of the organizational structure of ARIS and brief general overview of projects implemented by ARIS;</p> <p>Theme A: Social mobilization, inclusion and transparency arrangements During this session ARIS specialists will inform about the objectives, tasks and the process of social mobilization in the framework of the Village Investment Project (VIP), on the process and key stages and elements of the community participatory needs assessment. There will be also information given on how ARIS and communities compile and use social and economic profile of the aiyl kenesh territory.</p>

10:00-10:45	<p>Theme B: Institutions at the Regional and Local Levels This session will discuss institutions created under the VIP. Participants will learn about Territorial Public Unions, their role and functions at the local level, how they are involved in strategic planning and implementation of the micro projects.</p> <p>Mongolian delegation will talk about ADB's completed JFPR on Improving Living Environment for Urban Ger Areas in Mongolia, will share experience and lessons learnt with Kyrgyz counterparts.</p> <p>Speakers: a) Mr. Erlan Karypbai uulu, Capacity Building Specialist, ARIS b) Ms. D. Myagmar, JFPR Project Director</p>
10:30- 10:45	<p>Coffee Break</p>
10:45-12:00	<p>Theme C: Capacity Building Program Participants will learn about different capacity building programs implemented under the VIP, their results and lessons learnt.</p> <p>Theme D: Planning, Implementation and Supervision of the Microprojects under the VIP Speaker will give general overview of the process how micro projects go through various stages starting from planning stage till the last reporting stage.</p> <p>Speakers: a) Mr. Erlan Karypbai uulu, Capacity Building Specialist, ARIS b) Mr. Kanybek Bekiev, ARIS Coordinator on microprojects</p>
12:00 -13:30	<p>Lunch</p>
14:00-15:30	<p>Theme F: Financial Management and Procurement in ARIS This session will deal with issues related to financial management at the national and local levels, lessons learnt</p> <p>Participants will also learn about procurement issues in ARIS</p> <p>Speakers: a) Ms. Dinara Duishenkul kyzy, Financial Manager of ARIS b) Ms. Asel Mambetkulova, Procurement Specialist, ARIS c) Mr. Arstan Mukhtarov, Procurement Specialist, ARIS</p> <p>Theme G: Monitoring and Evaluation During this session ARIS specialist will make presentation on the method of joint Monitoring and Evaluation used in the framework of the VIP, will share his views about the needs for M&E, and how they are met under the VIP, including MIS.</p> <p>Speaker: a) Mr. Medet Sultanbaev, ARIS Specialist on M&E</p>
15:30 – 15:45	<p>Coffee break</p>

15:45 – 16:45	<p>Theme F: Involvement of other parties (NGOs, local self government bodies, businesses) in ARIS and community efforts in mobilization of resources. Sustainability of efforts.</p> <p>During this session ARIS specialists will share their experience and lessons learnt in partnership of communities with other organizations. ARIS will show demonstrational film.</p> <p>Speakers: a) Mr. Erlan Karypbai uulu, Capacity Building Specialist, ARIS b) Mr. Ilyas Isakov, Assistant to the Executive Director on Public Relations</p>
16:45 – 17:30	<p>Discussions: This time can be used for Questions and Answers, for clarification of some issues and for sharing Mongolian experience with ARIS colleagues</p>
17:30	Transfer to the hotel
Friday, 25th April 2008	
8:00- 8:45	Breakfast
8:45	Pick up at the hotel
9:00-10:30	<p>Session III: Other CDD Initiatives and approaches in the Kyrgyzstan Venue: ARIS Northern Regional Office, Lineyanaia/Razzakova Streets Moderator: Ms. Asyl Undeland</p> <p>Theme A: Different approaches to social mobilization This session will give general overview of various approaches in CDD used in the Kyrgyz Republic and in Mongolia, some differences between them. Speakers will present approaches based on mobilization of community leaders' groups, active people and interest groups.</p>
10:30-11:00	<p>Speakers: a) Mr. Baktybek Shamkeev, Director, RDC Elet b) Ms. Damira Sulpieva, UNDP Decentralization Program c) Mr. Ulan Kasymov, Director, Central Asian Mountain Partnership d) Mr. Gongor Batdorj, Community Development Specialist, Urban Development Recourse Center NGO in Ulan Bator e) Ms. Aida Gareeva, CAMP Ala Too f) Mr. Colin Spurway, Mercy Corps</p>
11:00- 11:40	<p>Discussions: Participants will ask questions, there can be discussion on advantages and disadvantages of different approaches to social mobilization, micro projects formulation and investments</p>
11:40 -12:00	<p>Theme B: CDD in Infrastructure, ARIS This session will address the possibility of using CDD in infrastructure projects in urban areas. Another aspect will be devoted to the innovative technologies used in small infrastructure projects.</p> <p>Speakers: a) Mr. Askar Satybekov, Coordinator of Small Towns and Capacity Building Project, ARIS b) Mr. Mirkamil Abdivasiev, ARIS, Coordinator KfW of the Village Investment</p>

	<p>Project</p> <p>Discussions: Participants may ask questions, clarify some issues and share experiences.</p>
12:00-13:00	Lunch
13:00-14:30	<p>Theme C: CDD in Irrigation, Drinking Water and Sanitation</p> <p>This session will review institutional issues in establishment and strengthening of water users' associations.</p> <p>Speakers: a) Ms. Anara Choitonbaeva, Institutional Expert, ADB and WB Rural Water and Sanitation Projects</p>
	<p>Theme D: CDD in Social Sector and Poverty Reduction</p> <p>Social mobilization of poor requires different methods and approaches. In this session participants will learn about specifics of poor people mobilization.</p> <p>It would be also interesting to learn about experience of Village Investment Fund set up under Community based early childhood development project and lessons learnt from this experience.</p> <p>Speakers: a) Nurbek Imakeev, Coordinator, ADB and VIP Projects, ARIS b) Nuria Choibaeva, Programme Manager, UNDP Poverty Reduction Programme c) Mr. Mansurov Maksat Eshenbaevich, Community Based Early Childhood Development Project (CBECDP), ADB</p> <p>Discussions: This is a sessions for Q&As, for sharing experiences</p>
14:30- 15:00	
15:00-16:00	Transfer to the airport Manas
	Flight to Osh
17:00	<i>Arrival to the Guesthouse Jukov</i>
Saturday, 26th April 2008	

<p>8:00-16:30</p> <p>Field visit to Osh region</p>	<p>Visit to the microproject of Mercy Corps, USAID CPI, Nookat rayon</p> <p>Visit to ARIS income generating micro project on Vegetables' Greenhouse in village Chertik, Aravanskii aiyl okmotu, Aravan rayon</p> <p>Visit to ARIS micro projects Renovations of the Dul Dul At Cultural Center, Aravan village, Allia aiyl kenesh, Aravan rayon</p> <p>Visit to the ARIS microproject on Gas pipe Construction in village Nariman, Karasuu rayon</p> <p>7:15 – 7:45 Breakfast 8:00 Ready for departure 8:00 – 9:00 Trip to Nookat, travel distance: 40 km 9:00 – 10:30 Meetings and visits in Nookat 10:30– 11:30 Trip to Aravan rayon, travel distance: 18 km (60 km) 11:30 – 13:00 Meetings in Chertik village, Aravan village 13:00 – 14:00 Lunch in Aravan rayon 14.00 – 14.45 Trip to Karasuu rayon, travel distance: 35 km 14.45 – 15.45 Meetings in Nariman village, Karasuu rayon 16:00 – 16.30 Transfer to the airport, travel distance: 25 km</p>
<p>16.00</p> <p>18:40</p> <p>19:30</p>	<p>Transfer to the Airport Osh Return to Bishkek</p> <p><i>Arrival to the hotel Urmat Ordo</i></p> <p>Coordinators: Ms. Zina Alieva, RDF Mr. Bekbolot Aytiev, Southern Regional representative, ARIS Mr. Saidullo Bektemirov, Mercy Corps Ms. Altynai Davletalieva, RDF</p>
<p>Sunday, 27th April 2008</p>	
<p>9:00</p>	<p>Breakfast</p>
<p>9:45</p>	<p>Pick up from the hotel</p>
<p>10:00 -12 :30</p>	<p>Session IV: Implications of Kyrgyz experience for Mongolia, JFPR Project design Venue: ARIS Northern Regional Office, Lineyanaia/Razzakova Streets Moderator: Ms. Asyl Undeland</p> <p>Mr. Juergen Hartwig will make presentation on JFPR approaches and there will be a working session with ARIS key specialists for brainstorming ideas on Kyrgyz approaches relevant to Mongolian project.</p>
<p>12:30 – 13:30</p>	<p>Lunch</p>
<p>13:30- 15:30</p>	<p>Continuation of the working sessions</p>
<p>Monday, 28th April 2008</p>	
<p>Field Visit to Issyk Kul region</p>	<p>Route: Bishkek – Balykchi – Bulan Sogotu (Issyk Kul)</p> <p>This tour will illustrate information given during Session II on ARIS activities.</p> <p>By bus, starting from Bishkek on April 23, traveling first about 80 kilometers to village Novopokrovka (Logvinenskii aiyl okmotu, Issyk Ata rayon, Chui oblast).</p>

	<p>The group will visit the Day Care No.5, Resource Center and Children's Playground renovated by the communities under the VIP.</p> <p>Group will also meet community representatives there and have discussions with them.</p> <p>Then group will go to Toruaigyr rayon, Issyk Kul oblast where they will have a meeting with the Territorial Investment Committee (TIC) members in the resource center.</p> <p>Next stop will be in Chongsaroi village of Issyk Kul oblast to meet with TIC there.</p> <p>Group will also visit micro projects on Replacement of the Heating System in the school and renovation of the Day care No 3 facilities under the Small Towns Infrastructure and Capacity Building Project (STICBP).</p> <p>Arrival to the Hotel Aurora in Bulan Sogotu village.</p> <p>Coordinators: 1) Mr. Tanat Osmonkulov, Social Mobilization Expert of the Northern Regional Branch, ARIS 2) Mr. Amanbek Asanovich Sadybaev, Mayor's office, tel: 4-36-94 (off), 0543 866 403 and 0772 295 392 mobile</p> <p>Corresponder: Mrs. Altynai Davletalieva, RDF Tour Vehicle: mini bus</p> <p>6:00 – 7:00 Breakfast 7:30 – 8:00 Ready for departure 8:00 – 9:00 Trip to Novopokrovsk, travel distance: 30 km 9:00 – 10:00 Meetings and visits in Novopokrovsk; 10:00 – 12:00 Trip to Balykchy, travel distance: 140 km 12:00 – 13:00 Lunch in Balykchy 13:00 – 14:00 Leaving for Toruaigyr, travel distance: about 25 km 14:00 – 15:00 Meetings in Toruaigyr 15:00 – 15:30 Travel to Chongsaroi, travel distance: 30 km 15:30 – 17:00 Meetings in Chongsaroi 17:00 – Departure to Bulan Sogotu, travel distance: 25 kilometers 18:00 – Arrival to the hotel, dinner</p> <p><i>Overnight in Aurora Resort in Bulan Sogotu</i></p>
Evening	Rest in the Hotel (possibilities: swimming, walking, massage)
Tuesday, 29th April 2008	
Field visit to Issyk Kul region	<p>Group will go to village Baktuu-Dolonotu</p> <p>On the way back to Bishkek, group will stop in Karaoy at the Eastern Regional Office of ARIS, meet with its staff, discuss its functions and tasks. In Karaoy group will see two micro projects on renovation of club and sport facilities, will have discussions with the TIC representatives there.</p> <p>7:00 – 8:00 Breakfast 8:30 Ready for departure 8:30 – 9:00 Trip to Baktuu-Dolonotu, travel distance: 10 km 9:00 – 10:00 Meetings and visits in Baktuu-Dolonotu</p>

	10:00 – 10:20 Trip to Karaoy, travel distance: 25 km 10:20 – 12:00 Meetings in Karaoy 12:00 – 12:30 Trip to Aurora Resort in Bulan Sogotu 13:00 – 14:00 Lunch in Aurora Resort 15:00 Leaving for Bishkek, travel distance: about 250 km
Evening	Return to Bishkek, rest
Wednesday, 30th April 2008	
8:00	<i>Transfer from the hotel to the Airport Manas</i>
10:50	<i>Departure to Urumqi, China</i>

CONTACT INFORMATION

List of the Study Tour Participants from Mongolia

No.	Name	Position
1	Ms. Sonomi Tanaka	Senior Social Development Specialist, ADB
2	Ms. Amar Tsetsegmaa	Economist officer, ADB Mongolian Resident Mission
3	Ms. Dovchin Myagmar	ADB JFPR-9106 MON Project Coordinator
4	Ms. Nyamdeleg Dejid	ADB JFPR-9106 MON Project Accountant
5	Ms. Jinsbek Amonjol	ADB JFPR-9106 MON Project Local Mobilizer in Erdenet city
6	Mr. Gongor Batdorj	Community development specialist, Urban Development Resource Center NGO in UB
7	Mr. Daramjav Munkhbold	Local government officer in charge of bags and legal adviser of Bayan-Undur soum, in Erdenet city
8	Mr. Juergen Hartwig	German development agency (DED) Community Development Expert

List of Participants of the Workshop

	Name	Position	Tel	E-mail
1	Mr. Tolobek Esengulovich Omurlaiev	Ex Minister of Regional Development		t.omuraliev@mail.ru
2	Mr. Murat Suiunbaev	Professor Kyrgyz National University	908757 0 (772) 213557	muratms@rambler.ru
3	Mr. Emil Abdykalykov	Economist, Urban Institute (USAID)	62 46 20, 62 46 18	eabdykalykov@ui.kg
4	Mr. Asylbek Chekirov	Deputy Executive Director, ARIS	626964	achekirov@aris.kg
5	Ms. Damira Sulpieva	DGP Program Coordinator, UNDP Decentralization Program	62 73 11, 62 74 11	ds@dgov.undp.kg
6	Ms. Nuria Choibaeva	UNDP Program Manager, Poverty Reduction Program, UNDP	66 38 85, 66 05 20 66 04 18.	nc@prp.undp.kg
7	Mr. Ulan Kasymov	Director, NGO CAMP	54 05 73 90 97 03	ulan@camp.elcat.kg

	Name	Position	Tel	E-mail
			90 97 94 54 23 46	
8	Ms. Aida Gareeva	NGO CAMP	54 05 73 90 97 03 90 97 94 54 23 46	aida@camp.elcat.kg
9	Mr. Baktybek Shamkeev	Director, NGO RDC ELET	62 00 71	slips@elcat.kg shamkeyev@elcat.kg
10	Ms. Anara Choitonbaeva	Institutional Expert, Rural Water and Sanitation Project	62 02 98	ach@elcat.kg
11	Mr. Mansurov Maksat Eshenbaevich,	Community Based Early Childhood Development Project, ADB	90 0072	m_mansurov@infotel.kg
12	Mr. Nurbek Imakeev	Coordinator, VIP, ADB, ARIS	625354	nimakeev@aris.kg
13	Mr. Erlan Karypbai Uulu	Senior Officer, Capacity Building Project ARIS	624959	mobilization@aris.kg
14	Mr. Askar Satybekov	Coordinator, Small Cities Infrastructure and Capacity Building Project, ARIS	62 53 49	asatybekov@aris.kg
15	Mr. Mirkamil Abdivasiev	Coordinator, KfW, ARIS	627862	kfw@aris.kg
16	Mr. Medet Sultanbaev	Monitoring and Evaluation Specialist, ARIS	625083	monitoring@aris.kg
17	Mr. Tanat Osmonkulov	Social Mobilization Specialist, ARIS	627869	north_mobilization@aris.kg
18	Mr. Kanybek Bekiev	Coordinator on Microprojects, ARIS	624959	
19	Mr. Ilias Isakov	Public Relations Officer, ARIS	625083	press@aris.kg
20	Ms. Dinara Duyshenkul Kyzy	Financial Manager, ARIS	624560	finance@aris.kg
21	Ms. Asel Mambetkulova	Procurement Specialist, ARIS	626974	amambetkulova@aris.kg
22	Mr. Arstan Muktarov	Procurement Specialist, ARIS	627677	amuktarov@aris.kg
23	Mr. Bekbolot Aytiev	Southern Regional Representative, ARIS	0(3222) 29147 0(772) 321031	baytiev@aris.kg
24	Mr. Amanbek Sadybaev		0(3944) 29147 0(772) 320131	
25	Mr. Colin Spurway	Chief of Party, Mercy Corps Collaborative Development Initiative	0(3222) 72054/6 0(555) 205215 0(772) 005215	cspurway@kg.mercycorps.org
26	Mr. Saidullo Bektemirov	Mercy Corps	0(3222) 72054 0(3222) 72056 0(777) 339447	
27	Ms. Asel Jumataeva	Mercy Corps	0(773) 902876 0(555) 782876	

List of Organizers**RDF****Office:** Manaschy Sagynbai 152, apt. #2, Bishkek

Tel: (+996-312) 667 341

Fax: (+996-312) 661 337

rdf_research@yahoo.com

Ms Zina Alieva

Mobile: 0 (775) 586 025

Ms. Asyl Undeland

Mobile 0 (775) 586 801

Ms. Kuluipa Akmatova

Mobile: 0 (772) 110506

Mr Azamat Omorbekov

Mobile: 0 (543) 915 551

Ms Elmira Akmatova

Mobile: 0 (772) 738 659

Mr. Victor, driver

Mobile: 0 (555) 157195

Ms. Altynai Davletalieva

Mobile: 0 (777) 10

**Note on Key Learning by the Mongolia Delegation
CDD Exchange Visit to Kyrgyz Republic, 23-29 April 2008**

Key Learning

Component A: Capacity Building and Community Mobilization

- main objective of CDD approach is to motivate people to identify their problems and needs and help them to solve these problems by themselves
- communities are formed and build up through the process of mobilization, training, empowerment and micro projects implementation
- cooperation of community groups with Local Investment Committees (LICs) and Local Governments has lead to increased participation of the civil society in decision making on the local level and increased accountability of administrations
- it is important give each interested community member a chance to participate in meetings, seminars and trainings
- project's success depends upon success of community mobilization
- community meetings are main tools for mobilization
- trainings are main tools for capacity building, offer as many trainings as needed
- it is important to take sufficient time for community mobilization and trainings
- it is necessary to employ consultant engineers from the beginning in order to guarantee adequate quality of community contribution
- capacity building of local communities and administrations and establishment of mechanisms of empowerment and participation is more important for sustainability than the long term existence of a specific MP group
- VIP has established highly elaborated and sophisticated procurement, accounting and monitoring procedures
- Active support from local government is vital for empowering community and allowing communities to have sufficient power to make decision related to their own livelihood

Component B: Implementation of micro-projects

- MP sustainability can only be reached if local communities are empowered to decide about the use of funds, to set priorities for investment decisions and to implement MPs according to their needs
- allocate grant funds to communities according to population size
- give each community member a chance to participate in MP implementation
- it appears better to have more MPs, each smaller in size, than only one big MP that will use all resources
- it is important that MPs are in line with local development strategies
- it is possible to implement larger projects through accessing other funds or through enlargement of community contribution
- often the community contribution in VIP MPs was higher than the minimum required amount of 25%, showing the high motivation of local communities
- income generating MP groups should return benefits to their communities according to allocated grant funds

- civil society deputies in the Local Investment Committee (LIC) need to have at least 1+ vote to ensure community empowerment
- it is necessary to pay the LIC accountant compensation for his/her work
- in order to prevent fraud, a LIC member cannot be a member of a MP group
- in order to guarantee transparency, disseminate MP related information, financing and disbursement decisions and community contributions on boards that can be easily accessed by all community members

Component C: Project Management and Coordination

- main responsibility of the Project Implementation Unit (PIU) and local project staff is to provide advisory, facilitation, moderation, and support for MP groups and Local Governments
- it is necessary to lobby the project on all administrative levels due to prevailing biases
- pay attention to conflict management
- establish a Monitoring and Information System (MIS) for all project components and disbursements
- conduct socioeconomic assessments and prepare profile of each community/district (Bag) and insert data into the MIS
- be aware of LIC and Local Government capture
- stay flexible and learn from failures and achievements

Resulting Design Changes for JFPR 9106-MON

It is necessary to rework the draft Operational Manual in order to:

- enable community groups to gain ownership on investment decisions and define priority needs
- take more time for community mobilization, trainings and formation of MP groups at local level and if possible engage additional community mobilizers on a voluntary base
- establish focus groups (consisting of e.g., women, elderly, youths or professionals) on voluntary basis on the sub-bag level in order to guarantee social inclusiveness
- require from income generation projects to return benefits to the community
- include representatives of civil society in the Project's Steering Committee
- clarify the legal status of the LIC and community groups
- conduct socioeconomic assessments and community profiles
- it will be important to have advisory support for PIU on establishing of the MIS

Conclusion

- the study tour was highly important for all participants in order to gain a fundamental understanding of the CDD approach
- the advice and discussions with ARIS and RDF staff and community groups was important to build capacity among participants