



Trust Fund Program Completion Report

Project Number: RSC - C80525 (NET)
February 2009

Cooperation Fund in Support of the Formulation and Implementation of National Poverty Reduction Strategies

Asian Development Bank

CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS

Currency Unit – US\$

ABBREVIATIONS

ADB	Asian Development Bank
AZE	Azerbaijan
CAM	Cambodia
CFA	Channel Financing Agreement
CPS	Country Partnership Strategy
CSP	country strategy and program
CTL	Controller's Department
DFID	Department for International Development
DMC	developing member country
EA	Executing agency
EPRS	enhanced poverty reduction strategy
GMS	Greater Mekong Region
IA	Implementing agency
JFPR	Japan Fund for Poverty Reduction
LAO	Lao's Peoples Democratic Republic
MDG	Millennium Development Goal(s)
MFA	Ministry of Foreign Affairs
MLD	Maldives
MON	Mongolia
NPRS	National Poverty Reduction Strategy
NPRS-Fund	Cooperation Fund in Support of the Formulation and Implementation of National Poverty Reduction Strategies
OCO	Office of Cofinancing Operations
OED	Operations Evaluation Department
PAK	Pakistan
PDMC	Pacific developing member country
PRF	Poverty Reduction Cooperation Fund
PRS	poverty reduction strategy
PRSP	poverty reduction strategy paper
RETA	Regional technical assistance
RM	Resident Mission
RSDD	Regional and Sustainable Development Department
RSDD-PU	RSDD – Poverty Unit
RSGS	Poverty Reduction, Gender, and Social Development Division – Regional and Sustainable Development Department
SES	Special evaluation study
SPD	Strategy and Policy Department
SRI	Sri Lanka
TA	technical assistance
TASF	technical assistance special funds
UZB	Uzbekistan
VIE	Vietnam

NOTES

- (i) The fiscal year (FY) of the Asian Development Bank start on 1 January and ends on 31 December.
- (ii) In this report, "\$" refers to US dollars.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

This report has been prepared by Bert van Ommen, Poverty Reduction Consultant under the guidance of Sonomi Tanaka, Principal Social Development Specialist (Gender and Development) in the Poverty Reduction, Gender, and Social Development Division of the Regional and Sustainable Development Department. Zarah Zafra and Aldrin Roco provided publication support.

The views expressed in this paper are those of the author and do not necessarily reflect the views and policies of the Asian Development Bank or its Board of Governors of the governments they represent.

CONTENTS

	Page
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	ii
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. PROGRAM DESCRIPTION	1
III. ASSESSMENT OF DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION	4
A. RELEVANCE OF PROGRAM DESIGN	4
B. PROGRAM OUTPUTS	5
C. DISSEMINATION OF OUTPUTS	8
D. PROGRAM COSTS	8
E. DISBURSEMENTS	10
F. PROGRAM DURATION	11
G. IMPLEMENTATION ARRANGEMENTS.....	11
H. CONSULTANT RECRUITMENT AND PROCUREMENT	13
I. PERFORMANCE OF CONSULTANTS.....	13
J. ROLES PLAYED BY THE EXECUTING AGENCIES.....	13
K. ROLE PLAYED BY THE DONOR	13
L. ROLES PLAYED BY THE ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK.....	14
IV. ASSESSMENT OF PERFORMANCE	14
A. RELEVANCE	15
B. EFFECTIVENESS IN ACHIEVING OUTCOME	15
C. EFFICIENCY IN ACHIEVING OUTCOME AND OUTPUTS	15
D. PRELIMINARY ASSESSMENT OF SUSTAINABILITY.....	15
V. OVERALL ASSESSMENT AND RECOMMENDATIONS	16
A. OVERALL ASSESSMENT.....	16
B. LESSONS LEARNED	16
C. RECOMMENDATIONS	18
APPENDIXES	
1. NPRS Fund supported technical assistance projects	
2. NPRS Financed TAs: Review of the Design and Implementation.	
3. CTL Statement of Expenditure and Status of Grant Report as of 31 October 2008	
4. TA Performance Assessments	

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Trust Fund Program Completion Report (the Report) of the Cooperation Fund in Support of the Formulation and Implementation of National Poverty Reduction Strategies (NPRS Fund) reviews the overall relevance and adequacy of program designs, effectiveness and efficiency of implementation, and sustainability of the outcomes from a strategic perspective of ADB. The Report also brings out common lessons learned for future considerations. In compliance with the reporting requirements stipulated in the NPRS Fund Board Paper and the Channel Financing Agreement (CFA), the Report was prepared by the Regional and Sustainable Development Department (RSDD) of the Asian Development Bank (ADB) in collaboration with the Office of Cofinancing Operations (OCO) upon the financial closure of the NPRS Program on 31 October 2008.

This report serves to complement a special evaluation study conducted by ADB's Operations Evaluations Department (OED) on ADB's Poverty Reduction Technical Assistance Trust Funds, covering the NPRS Fund and the Poverty Reduction Cooperation Fund (PRF). The former covers a comprehensive assessment of the NPRS Fund, while the latter focuses on the four case study countries and the projects financed by the PRF. A financial audit report on the NPRS Fund has been prepared separately.

Background. With the adoption of the Poverty Reduction Strategy (PRS) in November 1999, poverty alleviation became ADB's overarching objective and all activities of ADB were geared to achieving this goal. In operational terms, ADB proactively assisted all its DMCs to conduct comprehensive poverty assessments. ADB's PRS also set new lending targets. In support of ADB's PRS the NPRS Fund was established on 22 November 2001 as a multidonor fund, with a commitment of 15.0 million Dutch guilders (as of 1 January 2002: €6.8 million, equivalent to about \$7.8 million, as of 31 October 2008) from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Netherlands.

Program Objectives and Scope. To increase the relevance of development interventions in favor of the poor the NPRS Fund was designed to support and contribute to the in-country processes of poverty reduction strategies formulation, prioritization, implementation, monitoring and reformulation in selected developing member countries (DMCs), and to strengthen ADB's role in this process. The Fund's support included (i) collaborative work with stakeholders in DMCs through temporary consultant support to contribute to the poverty reduction strategy process, (ii) support to participatory and consultative processes, (iii) training and capacity-building activities for DMCs, and (iv) research and analytical work.

Methodology. The Report assessed the performance and relevance of the program, based on the analyses conducted for each of the 19 NPRS Fund-supported TA projects. A desk study was conducted to assess the level of the individual contributions of each of the 19 TAs to achieving the overall NPRS objectives. The desk review covered TA documents, TA progress reports (TPRs) and TA completion reports (TCRs); TA consultants' reports; NPRS semi-annual progress updates and annual reports; and other relevant documents and reports.

Relevance of Program Design. The design of the program is considered highly relevant, for the reasons that it (i) matched well the demand of DMCs and ADB at the time of program formulation, (ii) had a realistic focus and scope in terms of NPRS development and implementation, and (iii) was flexible, allowing adjustments to address changing circumstances during implementation.

Program Costs. The total NPRS Fund contribution committed by the Netherlands was 15.0 million Dutch guilders, or €6.8 million. As of 31 October 2008, the value of the NPRS Fund was about \$8.0 million inclusive of investment and interest income amounting to \$0.2 million. Of this, ADB received \$6.6 million. Of the total contribution, \$6.9 million was committed (i.e., approved by ADB) for the 19 TAs. As of 31 October 2008, cumulative expenses were \$5.6 million or 81% of the total committed amount. Together with administrative costs and bank charges, the total program costs were \$5.9 million or 75% of the total Fund contribution, leaving the Fund with an uncommitted balance of about \$2.0 million.

Assessment of Performance. The performance of the NPRS Fund and the individual TAs and RETAs followed the parameters used by OED's SES, i.e., relevance, efficiency, effectiveness and sustainability. Upon assessing the individual TAs it can be concluded that the result of the present assessment is generally in line with the findings of OED's SES. The rating of key parameters are:

- Relevance - The NPRS Fund was overall rated as highly relevant. Sixteen TAs were rated highly relevant, 2 were rated relevant. The main criterion for the relevance rating is the consistency with and priorities of the government.
- Effectiveness - The NPRS Fund was rated as effective. While 13 of the 19 TAs were rated effective, 3 were rated as highly effective. The highly effective TAs contributed to a measurable reorientation of the participating DMC government agencies in their approach towards poverty reduction. Three other TAs were rated less effective mainly due to a low "buy-in" and expressions of other priorities by these governments.
- Efficiency - Reflecting the individual rating of the TAs, the NPRS Fund was overall rated as efficient. Of the 19 TAs, 7 TAs were rated highly efficient, 10 TAs were rated efficient. The remaining 2 TAs were assessed as less efficient, because of the poor use of available resources and poor performance of the consultant firm contributing to low cost-effectiveness.
- Sustainability - Given the nature of the NPRS Fund, with a major part of its activities geared towards capacity development, research and study, and assisting in developing and implementing pro-poor policies and strategies, achieving sustainability of these processes will become evident only in the longer term. Seven TAs have therefore been assessed as less likely sustainable, as a number of DMCs still have an insufficient number of capable civil servants. Capacity building interventions are in need of guided follow-up and require continued investments for capacity development with external assistance.

Overall Assessment. The program was highly relevant to the participating DMCs and ADB. The activities supported by the NPRS Fund clearly tabled poverty issues as a key element in the discussions of policy makers. They provided additional insights and contributed to the development of useful tools and instruments. With the introduction of ADB's enhanced PRS in 2004, the support coming from the NPRS Fund became even more relevant for ADB's agenda to fight poverty. The results from the 19 TAs provide evidence that the Fund contributed directly to influencing DMCs in improving their policies and strategies with increased focus and integration of pro-poor elements.

Lessons Learned. A number of lessons have been learned from individual TAs and from managing the NPRS Fund. Most of the lessons learned contained in this Report reconfirm those that came out of the OED's SES.

- **Adequate analysis, consultations and coordination.** Many of the 19 TAs have documented the importance of a careful design process. This included: adequate analysis of time and resource requirements to achieve envisaged outcomes; sufficient consultative process involving EAs, IAs and other major stakeholders on the planned outcomes and how these can be achieved; adequate assessment of capacity of the EA and IAs and possible political risks and integration of such assessments into the project design.
- **Ownership.** Ownership of TA projects by DMC partners and other stakeholders is a significant determinant of success. Outcomes, impact, and sustainability require strong ownership and must not be donor or consultant-driven.
- **Participation.** Participation with the major stakeholders as well as with other key players for maximum effects, impact and sustainability is essential.
- **Management and administration.** The trust fund management and administration experience of the NPRS-PRF Secretariat indicates that the focused scope and simple design of the Fund facilitated management; that joint management with the PRF worked well without having to merge the two funds; that the annual or semi-annual strategy meetings between ADB and donors, combined with the PRF, was considered useful by both sides; and that technical delegation by the donor to ADB of the selection of individual proposals made the planning of fund management smoother and more predictable.

Ways Forward.

- The need for a replacement fund after the NPRS Fund (and PRF), as recommended by OED, has been discussed by Management and the Development Effectiveness Committee (DEC). It was decided that a replacement fund would not be necessary given the existence of other available funding. But the need for sufficient grant funding for poverty reduction in middle-income countries was recognized by DEC.
- Strategy 2020 sets out a new strategic direction for ADB. In this context, the approach to poverty reduction will be through making economic growth more inclusive and providing financial and social protection systems to vulnerable groups. The NPRS Fund experience in ADB can be well utilized in this new context and there is a continuing need to build upon the knowledge and successes achieved through the NPRS Fund.

I. INTRODUCTION

1. The Trust Fund Program Completion Report (the Report) of the Cooperation Fund in Support of the Formulation and Implementation of National Poverty Reduction Strategies (NPRS Fund) reviews the overall relevance and adequacy of program designs, effectiveness and efficiency of implementation, and sustainability of the outcomes from a strategic perspective of ADB as an administrator of the Fund. The Report also brings out common lessons learned for future considerations. The Trust Fund Program Completion Report (the Report) of the Cooperation Fund in Support of the Formulation and Implementation of National Poverty Reduction Strategies (NPRS Fund) reviews the overall program's relevance and adequacy of program and project preparation, the effectiveness and efficiency of implementation, and the sustainability of the outcomes from a strategic perspective for ADB and as an administrator of the Fund. The Report will reflect these main criteria against the program's overall achievements of the NPRS Fund portfolio and fund management, and bring out the lessons learned and provide recommendations.

2. In compliance with the reporting requirements stipulated in the NPRS Fund Board Paper and the Channel Financing Arrangement (CFA)¹, the Report was prepared by the Regional and Sustainable Development Department (RSDD) of the Asian Development Bank (ADB) in collaboration with the Office of Cofinancing Operations (OCO) upon the financial closure of the NPRS Program on 31 October 2008². The Report draws on a desk review of a large number of existing reports and documents.

3. The Report serves to complement a special evaluation study (SES) conducted by ADB's Operations Evaluations Department (OED) on ADB's Poverty Reduction Technical Assistance Trust Funds, covering the NPRS Fund and the Poverty Reduction Cooperation Fund (PRF)³. The former covers a comprehensive assessment of the NPRS Fund, while the latter focuses on the four case study countries and the projects financed by the PRF. Financial audit report on the NPRS Fund has been prepared separately.

II. PROGRAM DESCRIPTION

4. **Background.** In November 1999, ADB's Board of Directors approved the Poverty Reduction Strategy (PRS)⁴. With the adoption of the PRS, poverty alleviation became ADB's overarching objective and all activities of ADB were geared to achieving this goal. In operational terms, ADB proactively assisted all its DMCs to conduct comprehensive poverty assessments. ADB's PRS also had set new lending target whereby 40% of its lending would go to targeted poverty reduction interventions. In support of ADB's PRS, the NPRS Fund was established on

¹ ADB. 2001. *Cooperation Fund in Support of the Formulation and Implementation of National Poverty Reduction Strategies*. Manila; and ADB 2001. *Channel Financing Arrangement between the Minister for Development Cooperation of the Netherlands and the Asian Development Bank in regard to a Contribution to the Cooperation Fund in Support of the Formulation and Implementation of National Poverty Reduction Strategies*. Manila.

² All Fund activities concluded on 31 January 2008. However final version of this report needed to wait for the financial closure of all the TAs in October 2008.

³ ADB Operations Evaluation Department. 2008. *Special Evaluation Study on the Asian Development Bank's Technical Assistance Trust Funds: Poverty Reduction Cooperation Fund and Cooperation Fund in Support of the Formulation and Implementation of National Poverty Reduction Strategies*. Manila. <http://www.adb.org/Documents/SES/REG/SST-REG-2008-18/SST-REG-2008-18.asp>. OED's SES drew its conclusions and recommendations based on selected case study countries and a limited number of TAs, of which some 75% selected from the PRF financed TAs.

⁴ ADB.1999. *Fighting Poverty in Asia and the Pacific: The Poverty Reduction Strategy*. Manila: ADB. November. <http://www.adb.org/poverty/poverty-reduction.asp>

22 November 2001 as a multidonor fund, with a commitment of Dutch guilders 15.0 million (as of 1 January 2002: €6.8 million, equivalent to approximately \$8.0 million as of 31 October 2008) from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Netherlands.

5. **Objectives and Scope.** To increase the relevance of development interventions in favor of the poor, the NPRS Fund was designed to support and contribute to the in-country processes of poverty reduction strategies formulation, prioritization, implementation, monitoring and reformulation in selected developing member countries (DMCs), and to strengthen ADB's role in this process. The Fund's support included (i) collaborative work with stakeholders in DMCs through temporary consultant support to contribute to the poverty reduction strategy process, (ii) support to participatory and consultative processes, (iii) training and capacity-building activities to DMCs, and (iv) research and analytical work. In operational terms, the Fund aimed at:

- assisting the DMC governments to formulate the NPRSs, action plans, and the implementation mechanisms, and to establish monitoring and evaluation systems that would ensure the broad participation of DMCs civil societies and private sectors in every step of the process;
- assisting the DMC governments in the analytical processes underlying poverty assessment and national poverty strategy formulation and implementation: this may have included (a) establishing a conceptual framework for analysis; (b) analyzing public program and public policy impact on poverty, including a more detailed analysis of the public expenditure framework; and (c) assessing and rating DMC levels of governance;
- assisting in participatory processes to formulate systematic alternate strategies. This may have included stakeholders consultation processes, participatory poverty assessments, and consultative advocacy processes;
- assisting the DMC governments with the implementation of NPRSs through a better characterization and selection of relevant projects and programs supporting poverty reduction;
- assisting the DMC governments with coordination of external funding and division of labor based on their NPRSs; and
- strengthening the capacities of DMC staff and other stakeholders for participatory poverty analysis, strategic prioritizing, and sequencing of development investments, for example by building on the current ADB poverty reduction briefing and training programs.

6. **Outputs.** The expected key outputs were (i) formulated national poverty reduction strategies, (ii) substantial inputs for implementing the strategies, (iii) better understanding of poverty in DMCs, (iv) improved skills of DMC stakeholders, and (v) enhanced collaboration between ADB and the donors in formulating and implementing national poverty reduction strategies.

7. **Eligibility.** ADB staff members were eligible to apply. Proposals were evaluated based on (i) having a strong focus on supporting a national poverty reduction strategy; (ii) should show evidence of country ownership and the inclusiveness of the proposed approach; (iii) promoting sound collaboration with other donors; (iv) avoid supporting activities that would otherwise be financed by ADB (additionality factor); and (v) should support systemic poverty reduction at a country level. The Fund also gave emphasis that each proposal must have explicit links with ADB's country strategy and program and its annual updates. Only ADB staff members were eligible to submit proposals.

8. **Approval Procedure.** Since the establishment of the Poverty Reduction Cooperation Fund (PRF) financed by DFID in July 2002, the approval procedure of the NPRS Fund has been fully aligned with that of the PRF, following ADB's standard procedures for TAs. By early March 2005, the NPRS Fund had been fully committed for funding.

9. **Fund Management.** Management of the NPRS Fund has been lodged with the NPRS-PRF Secretariat in the Gender, Social Development and Civil Society Division (RSGS) of RSDD (formerly named as the Poverty Reduction and Social Development Division prior to the reorganization of RSDD on 1 July 2005 and recently renamed as the Poverty Reduction, Gender, and Social Development Division in December 2008). The Secretariat acted as ADB's internal clearinghouse for policy compliance and quality assurance for the NPRS Fund. OCO acted as the official channel of communications between the donors and ADB, particularly on the financial performance of the Fund.

10. **Coordination and Partnership.** As mentioned above, the NPRS Fund was administered and managed in close coordination with the PRF. The NPRS-PRF partnership was strengthened through joint semi-annual strategy meetings in Manila during which the work program and the status of project implementation were discussed. Only one annual strategy meeting was held in 2006 and one in 2007 as there were no more new project proposals to be discussed. The agenda of these strategy meetings, among others, include (i) progress and outputs of the portfolio; (ii) implementation issues and ways to accelerate disbursements; and (iii) dissemination and outreach, and communication.

11. The NPRS Fund also complemented and coordinated with the Japan Fund for Poverty Reduction (JFPR), another poverty reduction fund, and with other cofinancing mechanisms and other thematic/sector trust funds in ADB, such as the technical assistant special fund (TASF), the Cooperation Fund for the Water Sector, the Gender and Development Cooperation Fund, Governance Cooperation Fund, and few others. Periodic information sharing and discussion with other fund coordinators prevented overlaps and ensured complementarities across the activities.

12. **Monitoring and Reporting.** ADB, through OCO, furnished the Netherlands Government with annual reports and semi-annual progress updates, as per the NPRS Fund Board Paper (para. 2), all of which are posted on the website (<http://adb.org/nprs/>). Quarterly financial reports have also been submitted on the status of the grant and statement of expenditures prepared by the Controller's Department (CTL). The NPRS/PRF strategy meetings also offered an opportunity for ADB to make up-to-date progress reports to the donors. In addition to the standard monitoring system for individual TAs (e.g., TA performance reports during implementation and TA completion reports upon completion), the overall performance of the NPRS Fund has been monitored regularly by the regional departments and by RSDD.

13. **Evaluation.** As mentioned earlier, this program completion report provides an internal assessment of the overall performance of the Fund against the outputs. An independent mid-term review of the Fund was originally envisaged in early 2005 jointly with the PRF, but was postponed to wait for the independent special evaluation study (SES) by the Operations Evaluation Department (OED) in 2007. The SES of the NPRS and PRF funds⁵ started in September 2007 and the final report was released mid July 2008.

⁵ OED's Special Evaluation Study SST REG 2008-18: *Asian Development Bank's Poverty Reduction Technical Assistance Trust Funds: Poverty Reduction Cooperation Fund and Cooperation Fund in Support of the Formulation*

III. ASSESSMENT OF DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION

14. This Chapter assesses the adequacy of the overall program and projects design, preparation and implementation. A desk study was conducted of all 19 NPRS TAs, listed in Appendix 1, to assess the level of their individual contributions to achieving the overall NPRS outputs and objectives. The desk study included the review of the TA reports, available TA progress reports (TPRs) and TA completion reports (TCRs)⁶, TA consultants' reports, NPRS semi-annual progress updates and annual reports⁷. Also reviewed were summary notes of the semi-annual strategy meetings between the NPRS and PRF donors and ADB⁸, OED's SES, the final report of RETA 6270: Facilitating Knowledge Management for Pro-Poor Policies and Projects⁹ together with the NPRS Fund's Board Paper and Channel Fund Agreement¹⁰, and a small number of internal papers, such as back-to-office reports and peer review minutes.

A. Relevance of Program Design

15. Based on the desk review, the design of the program is considered highly relevant, for the reasons that (i) the Fund responded in a timely manner to the growing demand in DMCs for technical assistance related to NPRSs at the time of its establishment; (ii) the Fund had a realistic focus on NPRS and related policies rather than opening up to all poverty related activities, and (iii) during the implementation, the Fund flexibly adjusted itself to changing circumstances. Column I of Appendix 2 provides a detailed analysis of adequacy and relevance of the design of each of the 19 TAs.

16. **Demand Responsiveness.** In the 1990's the Asia and Pacific region experienced a fast growing economic development. Despite the high growth in the region, millions of people remained trapped in poverty. Poverty rate increased after the 1997 economic crisis. This has convinced countries of the need to refocus development efforts towards strategies intended to reduce poverty and inequality. These realities had set off the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and the World Bank to develop a framework for poverty reduction centered on Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs). PRSPs describe a country's macroeconomic, structural and social policies and programs to promote growth and reduce poverty, as well as associated external financial needs.

17. Against this background, ADB adopted the Poverty Reduction Strategy (PRS) in November 1999¹¹, through which poverty reduction became ADB's overarching goal. All activities of ADB were geared to achieving this goal. In implementing its PRS, ADB was committed to help the DMCs prepare their respective national poverty reduction strategies

and Implementation of National Poverty Reduction Strategies, July 2008. This report available in <http://www.adb.org/Documents/SES/REG/SST-REG-2008-18/SST-REG-2008-18.asp>, and the response from management in: <http://www.adb.org/Documents/Evaluation/Management-Response/SES/MR-SES-REG-Poverty-TAFund.pdf>. See also footnote 1.

⁶ Relevant links to individual TA reports can be found in <http://www.adb.org/NPRS/NPRS-projects-headings.asp>

⁷ Semi-Annual Updates can be found in <http://www.adb.org/nprs/reports.asp?tab=semi> and Annual Reports in <http://www.adb.org/nprs/reports.asp?tab=annual>

⁸ The minutes are available at <http://www.adb.org/nprs/reports.asp?tab=summary>

⁹ RETA 6270 Final Report is available upon request.

¹⁰ NPRS board paper can be viewed at <http://www.adb.org/documents/policies/nprs/default.asp>

¹¹ ADB's PRS is built on three pillars, namely (i) pro-poor, sustainable economic growth, (ii) inclusive social development, and (iii) good governance.

(NPRSs) in a participatory manner and in collaboration with other international organizations and bilateral donors. The NPRS became the basis of the poverty partnership agreements and ADB's country strategy and program (CSP)¹² for each DMC.

18. To increase the relevance of development interventions in favor of the poor, DMCs needed to align its public policies, public expenditure, and regulatory frameworks with the respective NPRS. This has resulted in the growing demand from DMCs for assistance in policy analysis and development, as well as monitoring of implementation with the key stakeholders' participation. The NPRS Fund responded in a timely manner to these demands.

19. **Realistic Focus on NPRSs.** The Fund focused on NPRS and related sector policies and strategies, rather than opening it up to any type of poverty reduction activities. Available documentation indicates that this focus was intentional, given the small size of the Fund. In retrospect, this realistic scope was one of the key factors that influenced the effectiveness of the overall program. The focused scope also allowed complementarity to the PRF which in turn focused on pilot programs.

20. **Flexibility in Adjusting to Changes.** During the implementation of the Fund, the millennium development goals (MDGs) were launched and ADB integrated these goals in their programs and projects. The MDGs provided tangible indicators for the DMCs to which they could measure their progress. With support from the NPRS Fund the DMCs developed, formulated and implemented the various forms of pro-poor strategies tailoring it around the MDGs.

21. In 2004 the PRS mid-term review was conducted which produced the enhanced poverty reduction strategy (EPRS)¹³. Complementing the three pillars of the PRS, the EPRS provides a comprehensive strategy to guide policy reform, investment projects, and capacity building in individual countries. Specifically (i) greater country focus, (ii) building stronger partnerships in developing and implementing NPRSs, (iii) emphasis on five themes: gender equality, environmental sustainability, private sector development, regional cooperation, and capacity development, and (iv) translation to integrate poverty in country strategies and results oriented programming. Consequently, at the operational levels the NPRS Fund became even more relevant and was better guided by the EPRS in its design and implementation of NPRS financed TAs.

B. Program Outputs

22. According to the NPRS Fund Board Paper, the overall outputs that the Fund had envisaged to deliver are:

- (i) Output 1: The formulation of country-owned, and widely supported, prioritized, and sequenced NPRS for selected countries;

¹² As of 1 January 2001, ADB has been placing much greater emphasis on the formulation of country operational strategies. This has taken the form of a country strategy and program (CSP) for each DMC. The CSP will ensure that activities earmarked for financing by ADB will be consistent with and will address the priority needs of the DMCs as identified in their NPRS and action plans. Since 2007, CSP has been renamed as a country partnership strategy (CPS).

¹³ Asian Development Bank. 2004. *Enhancing the Fight Against Poverty in Asia and the Pacific: The Poverty Reduction Strategy of the Asian Development Bank*. Manila: ADB. December.
http://www.adb.org/Documents/Policies/Poverty_Reduction/2004/default.asp

- (ii) Output 2: substantial inputs for the implementation of the NPRS for selected DMCs (these inputs will include (a) impact evaluation studies of previous policies, programs, and projects, and (b) selected sector development studies);
- (iii) Output 3: strengthened understanding of poverty, its nature and extent, causes and effects, and strategic implications in DMCs;
- (iv) Output 4: strengthened skills of DMC officials and other stakeholders needed for participating, prioritizing, and contributing to the process of poverty reduction strategy formulation and implementation; and
- (v) Output 5: enhanced collaboration between ADB and other donors in NPRS formulation and implementation.

23. The 19 TA projects together contributed to achieving a combination of the five expected outputs of the NPRS Fund. Column II of Appendix 2 provides a detailed analysis of the degree of achievements of each of the TA outputs.

Output 1 - NPRS formulation. Eight of the 19 TAs provided support in formulating NPRSs:

- AZE-4621 produced an evaluation of the previous NPRS (State Programme on Poverty Reduction and Economic Development 2003-2005) and assisted in drafting a new strategy starting 2006 for achieving the country's MDG targets. However, in the mid-course the government requested a change in scope to cover non-poverty related activities. This resulted in a premature closure of this TA;
- Through the assignment of poverty reduction specialists at ADB's resident missions (RMs) in Cambodia, Pakistan and Viet Nam, three TAs (CAM-3955, PAK-4277, and VIE-4252) helped strengthen the poverty focus of the national programs through a variety of activities, with successful results;
- UZB-3781 supported the draft of the very first living standard strategy (LSS). The results were rated as highly useful in terms of placing poverty reduction on the Government's agenda and in providing a basis for the development of an Interim PRSP;
- VIE-4644 supported the formulation of provincial poverty reduction and growth programs. The results of this output was successful, as both Hue and Quang Tri provinces developed better strategic and focused poverty reduction programs, in line with the national-level NPRS; and
- Pacific regional TAs 6057 and 6157 supported development, implementation and monitoring of Pacific DMCs poverty and hardship alleviation strategies. The overall results of these outputs were successful, although government agencies and statistics offices with less capacity required further support even after these TAs.

Output 2 - Support for Implementing NPRSs. Seven of the 19 TAs provided valuable inputs in the implementation of national poverty reduction strategies, namely:

- CAM-4037 and RETA-6006 successfully carried out consultation workshops and dissemination activities of the national poverty reduction strategy;
- The assignment of three national poverty reduction specialists at ADB's resident missions under CAM-3955, PAK-4277, and VIE-4252 has been successful in strengthening the capacity of various agencies and stakeholders in implementing and monitoring their respective NPRS and programs;

- LAO-4627 was to strengthen public expenditure management by integrating NPRS into budgetary priorities and implementation. The TA successfully completed the required outputs. Yet, the strength of the desired outcomes and impacts can only be felt over time during actual execution of the SEDP; and
- In addition to developing the provincial PRSPs VIE-4644 successfully achieved the strengthening of provincial staff's capacities to implement and monitor provincial poverty reduction and growth programs.

Output 3 - Strengthen the Understanding of Poverty. Four of the 19 TAs, namely PAK-4277, RETA-6242, RETA-6120, and RETA-6171 resulted in quality research and consultative process to improve ADB's and DMCs' understanding of poverty. However, all the other TAs also indirectly contributed to the enhanced understanding of poverty through a range of assessments. For example, in the Pacific, the participatory poverty assessments produced by NPRS TAs are still referred to as a major basis for policy dialogues.

Output 4 - Skills Development of DMC officials. Six of the 19 TAs contributed to build the capacity of selected DMC stakeholders through training, workshops, knowledge and skills transfer, introduction of methodologies, and development of framework and manuals in planning, implementing, assessing and monitoring programs and strategies. The six TAs are MON-4383, LAO-4627, SRI-4278, UZB-3781, VIE-4644, and RETA-6171. However, the level of result varies. Achievements for skills development in the MON-4383 TA have been rated highly successful, and for LAO-4627, UZB-3781 and RETA-6171 the achievements were rated as successful. For SRI-4278, the achievements were successful but limited to areas that were not affected by the 2005 tsunami and the armed conflict. Skills developed under TA-4644 were sufficient to start the implementation and monitoring processes, but there is a need for follow-up support.

Output 5 - Enhanced Collaboration and Partnerships. Nine of the 19 TAs provided opportunity for closer coordination and collaboration between ADB and the donors, namely:

- AZE-4621 applied close coordination with UNDP. TA scope of work was discussed with UNDP to avoid overlap in contributing to the MDG strategy;
- Three poverty reduction specialists through TAs CAM-3955, PAK-4277 and VIE-4252 coordinated and collaborated with other agencies and donors in terms of sharing information about assistance programs (e.g., World Bank, DFID, UNDP);
- LAO-4627 coordinated with external funding agencies (including World Bank) involved in the public expenditure management strengthening program;
- MON-4383 conducted a participatory poverty assessment in rural areas while the World Bank covered urban areas. The TA supported ADB-World Bank joint publication and dissemination;
- UZB-3781 worked closely with UNDP and the World Bank in supporting the government in formulating a poverty reduction strategy; and
- Pacific regional TAs 6047 and 6157 which were instrumental in establishing a multi-donor funded Pacific Poverty Program with extensive consultation with development partners (such as World Bank, Australian Agency for International Development, New Zealand Agency for International Development, among others) and regional institutions, adopting a coordinated regional approach to poverty analysis.

C. Dissemination of Outputs

24. To promote strategic impacts of each NPRS Fund-supported activity, all NPRS project officers at the time of proposal screening were encouraged to include sufficient budget for dissemination of TA results and lessons learned. In reality, however, some of the TAs (e.g., RETA-6176, 6242, 6171, SRI-4278) ran out of time. In addition, NPRS and PRF donors, ADB and stakeholders in the DMCs felt the need for (i) a systematic approach to capture, synthesize, enhance, and disseminate the knowledge and experience gathered through projects financed by these funds; and (ii) feedback loops to the operations in DMCs. In response to this perceived need, a regional knowledge management TA¹⁴ was developed and implemented to capture the knowledge generated of pro-poor policies and projects and to facilitate its management for structured and targeted dissemination of the results and lessons learned.

25. This regional knowledge management TA developed and disseminated in print and electronically some 64 short and 17 in-depth case studies, 6 thematic/topical synthesis papers, a number of feature articles, quarterly newsletters and other publications. The TA provided also support to NPRS and PRF financed TAs who were in need for additional technical and/or financial support for effective dissemination of their knowledge products to a broader community of practice, such as translation to local languages, conference participation, and in-country dissemination activities. Finally, the TA financed a regional Poverty Forum in October 2007 in Manila¹⁵, providing a platform to discuss and give emphasis on where the strategic direction in poverty reduction should go for the Asia and Pacific region.

D. Program Costs

26. The total NPRS Fund contribution committed by the Netherlands was 15 million Dutch guilders, or €6.8 million¹⁶. As of 31 October 2008, the value of the NPRS Fund was about \$8.0 million, inclusive of investment and interest income amounting \$0.2 million. Of this, ADB received \$6.6 million from the Netherlands. Of the total contribution, \$6.9 million was committed (i.e., approved by ADB) for 19 TAs. As of 31 October 2008, cumulative expenses added up to \$5.6 million or 81% of the total committed amount for the 19 TAs. Together with administrative costs and bank charges, the total program costs comes to \$5.9 million or 75% of the total Fund contribution, leaving the Fund with an uncommitted balance of about \$2.0 million (25% of total Fund contribution). The final Statement of Expenditure and Status of Grant reports, as of 31 October 2008, are attached in Appendix 3. There are two main sources of this uncommitted balance: undercommitment due to the difficulty in forecasting future foreign exchange volatility and underspending by some TAs for various reasons listed below.

27. **Undercommitment.** Table 1 summarizes the trend of the total amount in available in US dollar terms and uncommitted balance over the period of the Fund's existence (from November 2001 to June 2008). The 'total amount available in \$' column indicates the high volatility of the Euro-Dollar exchange rate, reflecting the difficulty to determine the target amount of overall commitments on the dollar basis. In fact, outstanding commitments exceeded unutilized balance in 2005 with the significant decline of the total amount available in dollar terms since

¹⁴ RETA 6270: *Facilitating Knowledge Management for Pro-Poor Policies and Projects* (\$980,000), approved on November 23, 2005, with financing from the PRF Fund.

¹⁵ Presentations on NPRS-PRF case studies at the Forum are available at:

<http://www.adb.org/Documents/Events/2007/Inclusive-Growth-Poverty-Reduction/papers.asp> (Session 6).

¹⁶ Local currencies of most EU-member states converted to Euro as of 1 January 2002. Dutch Guilders was then fixed at the exchange rate of €1 = 2.20371 Dutch Guilders.

2004. However, as more projects were approaching completion in 2006-2007, the undercommitment became apparent. At that time, unfortunately, it was too late to grant any new commitments to TAs in order to complete the program in time.

Table 1: Status of Grant Contribution - Committed: €6,806,703.24

End of Fiscal Year	Total Amount Available in \$ <i>/a</i>	Unutilized Balance <i>/b</i>	Outstanding Commitments <i>/c</i>	UNCOMMITTED BALANCE	Remarks
2002	6,743,287.71	6,705,335.65	1,203,147.75	5,502,187.90	From 2002 to 2004 the Fund commitment was inadvertently pegged at €6,783,221.37
2003	7,634,796.30	6,872,829.87	2,148,858.38	4,723,971.49	
2004	8,092,128.22	6,713,108.21	2,855,000.80	3,858,107.41	
2005	7,434,161.64	4,574,554.95	4,688,039.90	-(113,484.95)	Due to TAs approved but not yet effective within the year.
2006	7,805,323.36	3,686,497.09	3,022,930.23	663,566.86	
2007	8,110,345.29	2,789,434.00	1,607,331.50	1,182,102.50	
Oct-2008	7,974,955.87	2,032,527.87	-	2,032,527.87	.

/a Value in \$ of committed total of €6,806,703.24, plus exchange rate (+/-), and income on investments and interest

/b Available funds minus actual disbursements to projects, ADB admin costs and bank charges

/c Outstanding project commitments (including released advances) and unclaimed ADB admin costs

28. **Underspending.** Table 2 shows the approved amount for each TA versus the actual total costs made. In total, 19% of the total amount granted for 19 TAs was unutilized. The likely reasons for underutilization include the following, most of which were difficult to anticipate at the time of TA design stage.

- (i) Premature termination of some of the components and activities, due to change in priorities by the executing agency (e.g., AZE-4621, REG-6242);
- (ii) Late start-up or slow implementation forcing several projects to fast-track its implementation to comply with the Funds closing date, consequently urging to reduce some of its scope and activities (e.g., SRI-4278, VIE-4644);
- (iii) Low utilization of contingencies (average 5-10% of total cost estimate) that have been set aside as a buffer (e.g., LAO-4627);
- (iv) Lower than expected demand for a demand-driven umbrella TA (e.g., REG-6176); and
- (v) More disbursement being charged to the PRF than to the NPRS Fund when cofinanced by the PRF for its larger size (e.g., REG-6176, CAM-3955).

Table 2: Approved Amount vs. Actual Costs of 19 TAs

Country & TA No.	Short TA Title	Approved Amount	Actual Costs	Unutilized Expenses	% Unutilized	Reasons for Underruns (Unutilizing funds)
4621-AZE	Strategy Development	650,000	273,056.35	376,943.65	58.0%	DMC's change of priority caused premature closure
4037-CAM	Dissemination NPRS	80,000	33,190.74	46,809.26	58.5%	Far less was needed to achieve results.
3955-CAM	Poverty consultant at CARM	31,500	9,229.90	22,270.10	70.7%	Cofinanced with PRF, which covered the main costs.
4627-LAO	Public expend. for NGPES	700,000	624,672.85	75,327.15	10.8%	Unused contingencies
4591-MLD	Developing 7 th NDP	377,000	374,271.00	2,729.00	0.7%	
4383-MON	PPAM	300,000	277,383.34	22,616.66	7.5%	Contingency partly used
4277-PAK	Pov. Consultant at PRM	31,500	31,500	0	0.0%	Cofinanced with PRF.
4278-SRI	Poverty Assessment & information management	350,000	327,969.45	22,030.55	6.3%	Start-up delays
3781-UZB	Medium-term strategy development	570,000	566,377.22	3,622.78	0.6%	
4252-VIE	Pov. consultant at VRM	37,000	37,000	0	0.0%	Cofinanced with PRF.
4644-VIE	Strategies dev't in Thua Thien Hue & Quang Tri	900,000	674,749.42	225,250.58	25.0%	Start-up delays
6006-REG	Reg. NPRS Conference	50,000	31,952.20	18,047.80	36.1%	Needed less to achieve.
6047-REG	PARD - Developing NPRSs in PDMCs	500,000	470,648.40	29,351.60	5.9%	Contingency partly used
6157-REG	PARD - Poverty analysis	400,000	381,702.95	18,297.05	4.6%	Contingency partly used
6120-REG	Social Protection Index for poverty reduction	300,000	269,931.94	30,068.06	10.0%	Contingency unused
6171-REG	GMS-Pov. impact on REI	850,000	813,084.48	36,915.52	4.3%	-
6176-REG	Building capacity for participatory approaches for poverty reduction	300,000	52,849.48	247,150.52	82.4%	Low demand for services. Cofinanced with PRF, which covered the main costs.
6177-REG	CAR-Gender in NPRSs	350,000	315,913.83	34,086.17	9.7%	Contingency partly used
6242-REG	GMS-livelihood & NRM	150,000	28,732.65	121,267.35	80.8%	DMC's change of priority.
Total		6,927,000	5,594,216.20	1,332,783.80	19.2%	

Source: CTL Statement of expenditure as of 31 October 2008.

E. Disbursements

29. As clearly shown in Table 3, the actual annual disbursement amount from the NPRS Fund to the individual TAs over the past seven years (excluding administrative costs and bank charges) was generally substantially lower than was projected. The key reasons include: (i) constantly high project-by-project disbursement estimates made by the user divisions, which were used as the basis of the program-wide disbursement projection, (ii) unforeseen circumstance causing delays in start-up and implementation of a number of projects, such as security alerts in certain areas, elections related disruptions, delays in finding and contracting the right consultants, and (iii) time lapse between substantial advances taken for project financing in a given year that have been liquidated in the following fiscal year, contributed to the gap between projections and actual disbursements.

Table 3: Disbursements pattern of NPRS funds

Fiscal Year	Projected by start of the FY	Actual by end of the FY	Cumulative Disbursement
2001-2002	1.2 million	36,097	36,097
2003	1.0 million	689,323	725,420
2004	2.32 million	587,483	1,312,904
2005	1.3 million	1,409,439	2,722,343
2006	3.2 million	1,198,670	3,921,013
2007	2.17 million	1,144,326	5,065,339
31 Oct '08	0.90-\$1.23 million	447,546	5,594,216

Source: NPRS Annual reports and CTL's Financial Updates

F. Program Duration

30. The initial CFA¹⁷ between ADB and the Netherlands Government was for a period of three years, starting November 2001. The first amendment to the CFA extended the implementation period with a little over one year to 31 December 2005, while the second amendment to the CFA further extended the period for implementation with another two years and one month, until 31 January 2008, in order to allow full utilization of the committed Fund and to complete implementation of the approved TAs. Altogether, the program duration was six years and two months.

31. Admittedly, both ADB and donor had unrealistic expectations about the speed of the program implementation, given that this was the first experience for both sides to manage a trust fund of this nature. Especially, the process of financial closing has taken much longer than expected, mostly to allow time to receive all substantiating documents and confirmations from consultants on no further outstanding payments. In addition, TA implementation of many of the 19 TAs took longer than the originally envisaged duration, partially due to optimistic expectations and partially due to the lack of capacity in executing or implementing agencies. Given the NPRS's focus on building local capacity, in some TAs (e.g., 6171-REG) national research institutes were engaged. However, they tend to have less familiarity with ADB's accounting and reporting rules, requiring additional capacity building and time.

32. Nevertheless, compared with other TA funds that have been reviewed, the overrun in time needed for implementation of the NPRS-financed TAs stand at one of the lowest, with an average extension period at 11 months. The average planned implementation period for NPRS-supported TAs was 18.4 months, while the average actual implementation period came to 29.4 month, an average extension period of 11 months (60%)¹⁸.

G. Implementation Arrangements

33. **Procedures and guidelines.** As the OED's SES points out, the NPRS Fund (together with the PRF) has demonstrated a good example of how to minimize transaction costs by aligning closely with ADB's own TA procedures and guidelines. During the first year of the

¹⁷ A copy of the CFA is available at <http://www.adb.org/documents/policies/nprs/default.asp>

¹⁸ The SES on ADB's Japan Funds (2007) on the other hand found that the average overrun was 12 months. The recently concluded SES for Special Trust Funds (NPRS & PRF, June 2008) found the average overrun at 11.5 months, while the overrun for TASF-financed TAs the average overrun is 14.5 months.

NPRS-PRF implementation, donors were involved in screening each proposal. However, it was soon decided to replace this with ADB's internal quality assurance mechanism. The only additional layer added was the peer review meeting involving at least three ADB in-house peer reviewers who would discuss and decide on the eligibility of each proposal. This additional process, however, was considered useful in providing substantive inputs at the early enough stage. The NPRS-PRF specific guidelines were further developed, including: (i) administrative arrangements; (ii) role and review criteria for peer reviewers; (iii) reporting style and format for the donors; (iv) NPRS-PRF concept paper template; (v) procedures for communicating and disseminating generated knowledge.

34. **Fund coordination.** The NPRS Fund experience shows the importance of a dedicated ADB professional staff member as a fund coordinator. Prior to ADB's reorganization in 2002, the NPRS Fund was housed with the poverty unit under the Strategy and Policy Department¹⁹. After the reorganization, the poverty unit moved to the newly created RSDD's Poverty Reduction and Social Development Division (RSPR) where the NPRS and PRF were jointly managed by the Secretariat. The fund management was then transferred in 2005 to Poverty Reduction, Gender, and Social Development Division (RSGS). The same coordinator remained in the position from April 2002 to the time of fund closing, providing consistency and efficiency in fund management. The Office of Cofinancing Operations (OCO) continued to act as the official channel of communications regarding the Fund between the participating donors to the Fund and ADB, while the Controller's Department (CTL) provided quarterly reports on time.

35. **Reporting.** User divisions were responsible for updating their TA progress through ADB-wide standards systems of TA performance reports (TPRs) which need to be updated quarterly and TA completion reports (TCRs). The idea was for the NPRS-PRF Secretariat to simply compile them for its six-monthly reports to donors without requiring project officers' additional workload. However, the NPRS-PRF Secretariat had to regularly remind the responsible project officers to update TPRs more regularly, causing delays in preparing semi-annual and annual consolidated reports for donors. Some project officers never responded to the Secretariat's requests for progress updates, making the fund management difficult. Quarterly financial reports were prepared by CTL and together with the consolidated progress reports, prepared by the NPRS-PRF Secretariat, submitted to donor through OCO.

36. **Work programs.** The Board Paper stipulated that work would be carried out on the basis of detailed annual work programs. New proposals submitted during the year needed consultation with donors for inclusion in the program. It was foreseen that the donors would meet once a year to discuss the progress made and the work program for the next year. In reality, this exercise was considered by user departments too high a transaction cost for a small trust fund of this nature. With the approval of the PRF Fund in July 2002, two donors agreed that the coordination, design and approval processes and monitoring be treated similarly and in parallel. A more efficient and effective approval process for NPRS and PRF Funds supported TAs was introduced, virtually following ADB's TA approval process, with the additional dimension that the donors need to endorse the concept proposals.

¹⁹ The Focal Point, an ADB professional staff from the Poverty Unit, was also responsible to coordinate the Japan Fund for Poverty Reduction (JFPR), established in May 2000, and for contributing to the conceptualization and establishment of the Poverty Reduction Cooperation Fund (PRF), established in July 2002.

H. Consultant Recruitment and Procurement

37. The recruitment and procurement of consultants and goods required for each of the 19 TAs were entirely aligned with ADB's Guidelines for the Procurement of Goods and Services and the Guidelines on the Use of Consultants. The respective user divisions were directly responsible for the selection and recruitment of consultants. As the Fund promoted greater involvement of civil society and research/academic institutions, emphasis was initially placed on recruiting national consultants and the use of the direct selection clause for contracting locally-based civil society organizations and research/academic institutions. In few instances the start-up of TA implementation was delayed due to delays in the recruitment process. As OED's SES points out, RMs normally have limited capacity in managing multiple contracts with individuals and organizations with little experience with ADB contracts, hence this type of arrangements did not work well with them (PRF examples listed in the SES).

I. Performance of Consultants

38. Overall, the consultants (including civil society groups and research/academic institutions) delivered their services in a satisfactory manner. At the beginning, NPRS-PRF donors and Secretariat encouraged the recruitment of national consultants for capacity building purposes. However, as implementation progressed it became more apparent that a balanced combination of national and international consultants, as well as national and international civil society organizations, was delivering better quality of outputs. There still remained significant capacity gaps between national and international consultants and civil society organizations. For instance, it was reported that the performance of consultants were less than satisfactory in RETA6157 where the international consultant/team leader resigned, leaving behind a team of national consultants to complete the assignments. Poor contract administration and national consultants considered weak by the EA was noted for UZB 3781. On the other hand, a good practice in the knowledge transfer from international consultants to national consultants or research institutes were found in RETA 6171 and 6047.

39. Given the small size of many of the NPRS TAs, only four out of 19 TAs opted for a consulting firm contract. The available data does not show any difference in performance between the TAs relying on individual consultants and those on a consulting firm.

J. Roles Played by the Executing Agencies

40. The roles fulfilled by the nine EAs of country-specific TAs were considered generally satisfactory, except for AZE-4621, where the EA's interest for this TA was diverted to other priorities than poverty reduction. For the eight other TAs, EA ownership and participation were generally reported. However, as the capacity of the EAs differed from TA to TA, the performance of their role varied. The majority of activities with and for the EAs were primarily capacity building of EA staff members. Three of the nine EAs were ADB's RMs in three TAs (CAM3955, PAK4277 & VIE4252) due to the nature and design of the support. The RMs performed very well in spite their limited capacities. The remaining seven regional and subregional TAs were all executed by the respective ADB user divisions in close collaboration with the participating DMCs and often with RMs.

K. Roles Played by Donor

41. While the NPRS Fund was envisaged as a multidonor fund, the Netherlands Government through the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MFA) remained a single donor. It has taken

its role very seriously, as the initially proposed annual consultation meetings between ADB and the donor was doubled with the conduct of semi-annual strategy meetings. In addition, frequent communication was maintained with the Dutch representatives at ADB's Board of Directors and the focal person at MFA in The Hague. MFA also maintained close collaboration with DFID, the single donor of the PRF throughout the program implementation. Collaboration between the donor representatives and ADB's NPRS-PRF Secretariat was well performed, assisted by strategy meetings and regular report submissions. Donor has been responsive to the requests and inquiries from ADB.

L. Roles Played by ADB

42. As mentioned earlier, ADB performed various roles in the management, implementation, administration and monitoring of the NPRS Fund. This can be summarized in four major areas:

Role	Rate(*)	Remarks:
1. Policy and Strategy Support from Management	Satisfactory	The PRS and later the EPRS provided the overall framework for implementing the Fund. The necessary guidance and creation of the necessary instruments to efficiently and effectively implement the Fund was sufficient made available by management.
2. Overall Coordination, Administration & Monitoring (NPRS-PRF Secretariat, with OCO and CTL)	Highly satisfactory	The NPRS-PRF Secretariat played a major role in guarding the strategic poverty focus in all NPRS related activities. At the same time the Secretariat provided hands-on assistance in coordinating, administering, monitoring and reporting.
3. Implementation, Administration & Monitoring of individual TAs and the role as EA	Satisfactory	Individual TAs were generally efficiently managed and implemented from the respective divisions and RMs, within an acceptable period.
4. Operations support from division/department	Satisfactory	The users divisions and departments provided strategic and adequate support to the implementation of the Fund, however staff felt that insufficient incentives were offered to encourage efficient and effective implementation of the TAs.

(*) Rating criteria are based on ADB's PAI6.09 - TA Performance Report (TPR) format and guidelines

IV. ASSESSMENT OF PERFORMANCE

43. This Chapter summarizes the performance of the NPRS Fund and the individual TAs and RETAs, following OED's key parameters²⁰, i.e., relevance efficiency, effectiveness and sustainability. Appendix 4 shows a detailed analysis of the performance of each of the TAs measured against the key parameters. The analysis were derived from a review of the TA completion reports (TCR) of nine TAs, and from available TA progress reports (TPR), few of the TA semi-annual progress updates, from the NPRS semi-annual progress updates and NPRS annual reports. Not surprisingly, the result of this assessment is generally in line with the findings of OED's SES, which was positive. For this Report, more updated information from some of the TAs was available than the OED's SES.

²⁰ OED's Guidelines for Preparing Performance Evaluation Reports for Public Sector Operations, (January 2006).

A. Relevance²¹

44. The NPRS Fund is rated as highly relevant overall. Sixteen TAs are rated highly relevant, while two are relevant (AZE-4621 and SRI-4278). RETA 6242 was given the rate partly relevant, as the governments of both DMCs showed lesser priority for indigenous people's issues.

B. Effectiveness²² in Achieving Outcome

45. The envisaged overall outcomes of the NPRS Fund Program were (i) the enhanced in-country NPRS process in DMCs and (ii) the enhanced role of ADB in this process. On the first outcome, the NPRS Fund overall is rated effective. Thirteen of the 19 TAs are rated effective, while three are rated as highly effective (MON-4383, PAK-4277 and Pacific RETA-6157). The main impact for these highly effective TAs was the measurable reorientation of the participating DMC government agencies in their approach towards poverty and hardship reduction. Three other TAs are rated less effective (AZE-4621, RETA-6242 and SRI-4278) mainly due to a low "buy-in" and expressions of other priorities by these governments.

46. The Fund was also effective in enhancing the role of ADB in the in-country NPRS process. In all the 22 countries the Fund has provided support, ADB is considered one of the major players in supporting the NPRS process by the government and other partners.

C. Efficiency²³ in Achieving Outcome and Outputs

47. In reflecting to the individual rating of the TAs, the overall NPRS Fund program is rated efficient. From the 19 TAs, seven TAs are rated highly efficient, and 10 TAs efficient. The remaining two TAs have less efficient rates, because of the less efficient use of the available resources (REG 6176), and poor performance of the consultant firm (UZB 3781) contributing to low cost-effectiveness.

D. Preliminary Assessment of Sustainability²⁴

48. Based on the self assessments made in TCRs and other documents available, this Report considers that four TAs are rated most likely to sustain as these TAs produced mainly study and research based outcomes which the DMCs can adopt and use without the need for external funding. Seven TAs are likely to sustain the outcome of the TAs, mainly because these DMCs have already sufficient in-house capacities on which they can build and further develop. Seven TAs are rated less likely to sustain, given the still limited capacity of those trained in the NPRS-financed TAs. AZE 4621 was the only TA that was rated unlikely to sustain, as the TA activities were closed prematurely

49. A major lesson in assuring sustainability of such projects can be drawn from, for example MON-4383 and the regional TAs in the Pacific Region (RETA-6047 and 6157) wherein

²¹ Relevance is the consistency of a project's impact and outcome with the government's development strategy, ADB's lending strategy for the country, and ADB's strategic objectives at the time of approval and evaluation, and the adequacy of the design.

²² Effectiveness is defined as the extent to which the outcome, as specified in the design and monitoring framework, either as agreed at approval or as subsequently modified, has been achieved.

²³ Efficiency is defined as the extent to which resources have been economically converted to results, using the economic internal rate of return, or cost-effectiveness, of the investment or other indicators as a measure and the resilience to risk of the net benefit flows over time.

²⁴ Sustainability considers the likelihood that human, institutional, financial and other resources are sufficient to maintain the outcome over its economic life.

a high degree of ownership and commitment from the DMC governments and major stakeholders was evident.

50. Sustainability of the enhanced ADB's role in the NPRS process in DMCs is likely. Increasingly, DMCs, especially middle income countries, have taken their own initiatives in the NPRS process with much less external assistance. Therefore, the opportunities for ADB to remain directly engaged in updating poverty reduction strategy development will be more limited in these countries than in the past. However, as ADB's new long-term strategic framework of Strategy 2020 maintains poverty reduction in the region as ADB's overarching goal, ADB will remain engaged in important policy dialogue on poverty reduction at large.

V. OVERALL ASSESSMENT AND WAYS FORWARD

A. Overall Assessment

51. Consolidating the results of various assessments above, the overall outcomes of the NPRS Fund have been highly positive for ADB and the participating DMCs. The NPRS Fund has clearly placed the poverty issues on the table of policy makers and provided additional insights and contributed to the development of useful tools and instruments. With the introduction of ADB's enhanced PRS in 2004 the support coming from the NPRS Fund became even more relevant for ADB's agenda to fight poverty. The results from the 19 TAs provide evidence that it contributed directly to the purpose of influencing DMCs in improving their policies and strategies with increased focus and integration of pro-poor elements.

B. Lessons Learned

52. A number of lessons have emerged from the 19 NPRS-financed TAs, which are summarized in four key areas, patterned after OED's SES, i.e. (i) adequate analysis, consultations and coordination, (ii) ownership, (iii) participation, and (iv) management and administration.

- **Adequate analysis, consultations and coordination.** Many of the 19 TAs have documented the importance of a careful design process. This includes: adequate analysis of time and resource requirements to achieve envisaged outcomes; sufficient consultative process involving EAs, IAs and other major stakeholders on the planned outcomes and how these can be achieved; adequate assessment of capacity of the EA and IAs and possible political risks and integration of such assessment into the project design. For example:
 - RETA-6177 (Central Asia) could have achieved greater impact if more attention was given during the design of the TA, particularly careful assessment of time requirement and resource allocation;
 - RETA-6176 was demand driven for possible support and the TA design should have a more focused set of participatory approaches and techniques that are appropriate for a wide range of sectors and country specific situations. In the end the TA support was ad hoc making it more difficult to identify consultants with the appropriate skills;

- UZB-3781 had some unrealistic expectations of ADB's own capacity. TA design should have taken into account of ADB's experience in implementing similar PRSP-related activities in other countries;
 - MLD-4591 has learned that care should be taken when one TA is split into more than one implementing agencies, as this may give rise to complications including a free-rider problem;
 - LAO-4627 has learned that a TA should remain flexible with Government's requirement during implementation without losing sight of the purpose. The pace of project implementation should take into consideration the institutional environment of the Government.
 - Generally, most TAs had unrealistic expectations of the speed of implementation, which should be considered carefully in designing TAs.
- **Ownership.** Ownership of TA projects by country partners and other stakeholders is a significant determinant of success. Outcomes, impact, and sustainability require strong ownership and must not be donor-driven. Following are examples related to ownership:
 - MON-4383 contributed to a better understanding of poverty in Mongolia and contributed to improve the link between poverty diagnosis and policy making. It helped to re-orient the approach of the Government's anti-poverty program by putting more emphasis on the roles played by communities and at the local levels. The EA had a high degree of ownership of the TA and the participatory poverty assessment and monitoring. PAM;
 - In PARD RETA-6047 and 6157, EA staff members were part of the team that planned and conducted participatory poverty assessment. This provided a very good learning opportunity for staff as well as ensuring ownership of the results after study completion.
- **Participation.** Participation with the major stakeholders as well as with other key players for maximum effects, impact and sustainability is essential. Given that the NPRS Fund has had a specific emphasis on participatory process for NPRS formulation and implementation, many TAs financed by the Fund documented lessons related to participatory process:
 - CAM-3955 and VIE-4252 supported participatory NPRS formulation process through the resident mission poverty specialists. Since such processes have been primarily driven by donors, these TAs note that sustaining participatory processes in the Government requires longer term investments;
 - In Central Asia RETA-6177 participation of the local focal points in the TA activities contributed to increased capacity at local level;
 - In PARD RETA-6047 the results of the qualitative participatory poverty assessments provided a highly effective complement to the more quantitative analyses of poverty and hardship and the assessments of government policies and strategies;
 - CAM-4037 demonstrates that public discussions and civil participation on NPRS contributed to an increased awareness of the national strategy among the communities, although care should be made so that the process would not be overtaken by electoral debates.

- **Management and administration.** The trust fund management and administration experience of the NPRS-PRF Secretariat indicates that the focused scope and simple design of the Fund made the management easy; that the joint management with the PRF worked well without having to merge the two funds; that the annual or semi-annual strategy meetings between ADB and donor, combined with the PRF, has been felt most useful both by both sides; and that technical delegation by donor to ADB of the selection of individual proposals has made the planning of fund management smoother and more predictable. OED's SES also provide the following:
 - According to project officers and some directors, NPRS TA projects are straightforward in design, implementation, management and supervision, compared with some other trust funds managed by ADB. Since the NPRS (and PRF) procedures follow the normal ADB procedures for TAs, which are familiar to all staff;
 - The full delegation of design and management to ADB by donor is considered a major positive factor;
 - When preparing new TAs, ADB must provide clearer, user-friendly operational guidance to executing and implementing agencies. Clear work plans defining proposed fund use, together with documented discussions on ADB's liquidation requirements, are necessary as these requirements often vary from those of other international partners of the EAs. Also greater flexibility is required to ensure that project implementation is not hindered by conditions beyond the control of project management. When new staff and other implementing partners are appointed, they need to be familiarized with the procedures.

C. Ways Forward

53. **Replacement Fund.** The OED's SES concluded in July 2008 that the NPRS Fund has made a significant contribution to policy and strategy development for poverty reduction in the region and that the closure of the NPRS Fund (together with the PRF) would leave a gap for replication and up-scaling of ADB's assistance to poverty reduction initiatives in the region. The SES therefore recommended that there should be an assessment to determine whether a replacement fund would be needed. ADB Management responded in September 2008 that such an assessment would not be necessary, given that much of ADB's poverty reduction work has been mainstreamed and that there are now a range of other TA trust funds and the Asian Development Fund available for ADB. The Development Effectiveness Committee (DEC) meeting on 4 November 2008 supported Management's view on this but suggested that grant trust funds should be availed for poverty reduction in Group C countries. This Report welcomes the DEC recommendation, given that there is still a financing gap of TA grants in middle-income countries while ADF targets poverty reduction efforts in fragile states and lower-income countries in the region.

54. **ADB's Strategic Shift.** In March 2008, ADB adopted a new long-term strategic framework of Strategy 2020 as its overall operational guide. While poverty reduction still remains as ADB's overarching goal, ADB has shifted its operational focus more towards inclusive growth, environmental management, and regional economic integration, away from targeted poverty reduction interventions. Private sector development will be another growing area of ADB operations. Given this context, continuous efforts are required for ADB in improving its capacity in providing guidance to DMCs on how to make economic growth process and public services more inclusive to those who are likely to be excluded. Poverty reduction through

public-private partnerships is another new area that requires further work. At the same time, financial and social protection systems should be developed further to protect the vulnerable from unexpected shocks, which is particularly important under the deepening impacts of the current economic and financial crisis. If any new financing facility is to be considered for future, these may be the key areas. The NPRS Fund, together with the PRF, has provided a volume of experience for ADB to learn how to address these issues. There is a continuing need to build upon the knowledge and successes achieved through the NPRS Fund.

TA PROJECTS FINANCED BY THE NPRS FUND

Region	DMC	TA No.	Project Title	NPRS Contribution	Project Description (Objectives, Outputs)
CWRD	AZE	4621	Participatory Strategy Development and Implementation for Achieving the MDGs	650,000	The TA was built on the practices and institutional structures established during the State Programme on Poverty Reduction and Economic Development (SPPRED) 2003-2005 process. It will assist the Government in integrating the achievement of the MDGs into its development planning and implementation processes. The main outcome of this TA is the enhanced planning and monitoring capacity of the Ministry of Economic Development to achieve these goals. Outputs: (i) Evaluation study of SPPRED 2003-2005; (ii) Capacity building of MOED staff, particularly the SPPRED Secretariat, for MDG Strategy Development and Monitoring.
CWRD	Sub-Reg	6177	Mainstreaming Gender into Poverty Reduction Strategies in Central Asia Region. (Participating DMCs: Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyz Republic, Tajikistan)	350,000	Capacity building assistance to develop or update gender strategies in 4 CAR countries that would influence or be part of the respective NPRSs and relevant policies/strategies/plans, based on detailed country-level gender and poverty analysis and stakeholder discussions.
CWRD	UZB	3781	Comprehensive Medium-Term Strategy for Improving the Living Standards of the People of Uzbekistan	570,000	Capacity building support to prepare a medium-term poverty reduction strategy with key stakeholder participation. The project will assist statistical data collection on living standards as well as provide training to policy makers on pro-poor growth strategies and social policy. The key output will be the medium-term strategy.
EARD	MON	4383	Participatory Poverty Assessment and Monitoring (PPAM)	300,000	This TA shall strengthen the poverty monitoring and evaluation system in Mongolia by (i) enhancing the Government's capacity to develop effectively targeted poverty reduction program and (ii) strengthening institutional capacity in the area of qualitative and quantitative poverty assessment.
PARD	Sub-Reg	6047	National Poverty Reduction Strategies in Pacific Developing Member Countries	500,000	To carry out participatory poverty assessment in 4 countries (Federated States of Micronesia, Fiji, Tonga, and Tuvalu) applying the methodologies previously developed in another RETA.
PARD	Sub-Reg	6157	Strengthening Poverty Analysis and Strategies in the Pacific	400,000	Arrange of capacity building initiatives in selected Pacific DMCs, including (a) data collection, analysis, and dissemination (b) participatory policy development, and (c) monitoring of poverty impacts of policies and programs.
REG	Inter-Reg	6006	Regional Conference on National Poverty Reduction Strategies	50,000	Support to the Regional Conference on PRSP formulation and progress review, co-organized by IMF, UNDP, and WB.
REG	Inter-Reg	6120	Developing a Social Protection Index for Committed Poverty Reduction	300,000	Develop social protection index to enable monitoring of policies and programs implementation related to the sector.

Region	DMC	TA No.	Project Title	NPRS Contribution	Project Description (Objectives, Outputs)
REG	Inter-Reg	6176	Building Capacity for Participatory Approaches to Poverty Reduction in ADB Operation	300,000	Capacity building on participatory pro-poor policy/strategy development and project planning and M&E. Teams comprising ADB-Consultant-Government-NGOs will be assisted.
SARD	MLD	4591	Development of a Results-Oriented 7th National Development Plan	377,000	This TA will assist the Government of Maldives to adopt and successfully implement a results-oriented national development strategy aimed at economic growth and poverty reduction.
SARD	SRI	4278	Poverty Assessment and Information Management	350,000	Help improve poverty data collection methodologies and analysis to make them consistent across the country.
SERD	CAM (PAK + VIE)	3955 (4277 + 4252)	Engagement of a Poverty Consultant at the Cambodia Resident Mission (Extension)	31,500	Capacity building support to the country through a RM poverty consultant. The assistance will cover policy, sector, and project levels as well as policy dialogue with the government, civil society, private sector, and development partners.
CWRD	PAK (CAM + VIE)	4277 (3955 + 4252)	Supporting of Poverty Reduction Initiatives in Pakistan	31,500	Capacity building support to the country through a RM poverty consultant. The TA will especially focus on monitoring the implementation of PRSP and provincial-level plans as well as reviewing and helping develop new programs on poverty reduction. This would help PRM serve as a knowledge node on poverty in the country.
SERD	VIE (CAM + PAK)	4252 (3955 + 4277)	Support to Poverty Reduction Activities in Viet Nam	37,000	Capacity building support to the country through a RM poverty consultant. The TA will especially focus on monitoring the implementation of the Poverty Partnership Agreement, and accelerate various sector/thematic work to identify future poverty projects, as well as to strengthen coordination and consultation with key stakeholders.
SERD	CAM	4037	Dissemination of the National Poverty Reduction Strategy	80,000	Support to widely disseminate NPRS of Cambodia to local level and civil society.
SERD	LAO/VIE	6242	Developing New Policy Paradigms for Sustainable Livelihood Protection and Natural Resource Management among Ethnic Minorities of GMS: A Study of Policies and their Impacts, Strategies for Change.	150,000	The TA will develop a subregional natural resource management strategy for the upland areas of the GMS.
SERD	LAO	4627	Public Expenditure Planning for National Growth and Poverty Eradication Strategy (NGPES)	700,000	Contribute to improved quality of fiscal planning and capacity within the relevant MOF departments and government's agencies involved in the fiscal planning process which shall contribute to improving allocation efficiency of public resources according to the Government's development and poverty reduction policy objectives, approaching the international good practice standards in public financial management.
SERD	Sub-Reg	6171	Reviewing Poverty Impact of Regional Economic Integration in the GMS	850,000	This TA's overall objective is to determine how to manage increased connectivity between the GMS countries through infrastructure and communications development to ensure significant improvement in the economic and social status of the poor. The immediate objective is to

Region	DMC	TA No.	Project Title	NPRS Contribution	Project Description (Objectives, Outputs)
					assess the distribution of benefits and costs of cross-border interactions among different groups.
SERD	VIE	4644	Support to Hue and Quang Tri Provinces for Formulating Sustainable Poverty Reduction and Growth Programs	900,000	This TA will help the Thua Thien Hué and Quang Tri provinces in Viet Nam to strengthen their capacity to formulate and implement provincial poverty reduction and growth programs. These programs need to be developed in a way to integrate the Comprehensive Poverty Reduction and Growth Strategy and the government's Socioeconomic Development Plan (SEDP). The lessons learned and results of the TA will feed into the annual CSP update for Viet Nam.
19			Total:	\$6,927,000	

NPRS Financed TAs: Review of the Design and Implementation

Region	DMC	TA No.	Project Title	(I)	(II)	(III)
				TA Development & Implementation by Divisions/Departments: Adequacy of (i) Preparation; (ii) Implementation; (iii) Performance; (iv) Monitoring and Support from the User Division/Department	Actual TA (i) Achievements and (ii) Sustainability of benefits (rate: 0-3, 0=none, 3=highly)	Major Lessons
CWRD	AZE	4621	Participatory Strategy Development and Implementation for Achieving the MDGs	The overall preparations, design and monitoring of the TA was adequate and satisfactory, although the TA implementation had a slow start for bureaucratic reasons of the EA. Maximum support was provided from AZRM and the user department (CWRD).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Achievements (1): <i>Component 1</i> - evaluation of the SPPRED 2003-2005 <i>Component 2</i> - draft MDG strategy have been completed, together with sub-components on developing and providing training in preparation of implementing the MDG strategy. However, the DMC government delayed commenting on the SPPRED evaluation report and has not approved the MDG Strategy. Instead the DMC Government requested for a major change of scope to divert the remaining TA funds for other, and for ADB non-relevant activities. The TA was then advised to close. ii. Sustainability (0): Given the current changes within the AZE government sustainability of the achieved outputs is most unlikely. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Only Component 1 has been completed and the remaining activities has been cancelled and project implementation considered closed; ii. The TA encountered delays at the start of its implementation due to slow action from the Government; iii. The SPPRED 2003-2005 evaluation and a draft strategy report was submitted to the Government for their review and approval to continue with the remaining components under this TA. However, no response came from the EA. Instead it submitted a new proposal to support the "Baku Consensus 2007". Unable to reach an agreement with the executing agency, ADB decided to cancel the remaining component.
CWRD	Sub-Reg	6177	Mainstreaming Gender into Poverty	Project design was inadequate. Not sufficient time was taken to appraise the actual need in time	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Achievements (3) - All planned TA outputs have been achieved - 4 country reports and one regional 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. The high involvement of the national focus points was one of the key factors

Region	DMC	TA No.	Project Title	(I)	(II)	(III)
				TA Development & Implementation by Divisions/Departments: Adequacy of (i) Preparation; (ii) Implementation; (iii) Performance; (iv) Monitoring and Support from the User Division/Department	Actual TA (i) Achievements and (ii) Sustainability of benefits (rate: 0-3, 0=none, 3=highly)	Major Lessons
			Reduction Strategies in Central Asia Region. (Participating DMCs: Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyz Republic, Tajikistan)	<p>and resources for implementation. The time frame of 9 months was grossly underestimated as it turned out that a total of 24 months was needed for implementation. Main time-consuming factors were (i) recruitment of consultants took more time, (ii) additional time was needed to go through the participatory processes of involving the stakeholders and for them to review the drafts, and (iii) translation work in the local languages needed more time than was initially allocated for in the design.</p> <p>After the necessary adjustments were made, implementation went smooth and according to plan, with excellent performance of the consultants and excellent support by the gender point persons and cooperation from the EAs in each of the participating DMCs and from ADB's user division.</p>	<p>synthesis with relevant recommendations were produced;</p> <p>ii. Sustainability (2) - In Kazakhstan the TA failed to achieve the expected quality which didn't lead to substantial contribution to policy work. While the other 3 countries were serious to consider the recommendations and incorporate gender in their NPRS and related policies.</p>	<p>ensuring smooth implementation;</p> <p>ii. Participation of the local focal points in the TA activities contributed to increased capacity at local level;</p> <p>iii. Greater impact could have been achieved if more attention was given during the design phase of the project, particularly careful assessment of time and resources allocation.</p>
CWRD	UZB	3781	Comprehensive Medium-Term Strategy for Improving the Living Standards of the People of	The TA was designed in 2001, but only by early 2003 actual implementation could start after the Government got the results of two important studies (prepared by WB and UNDP) that provided the	i. Achievements (2) - Most of the TA outputs were achieved, except for (i) improvements of state statistics and (ii) the development of a web site that is supposed to serve as a repository of data, documents and	i. With this TA, ADB initiated the process of developing and implementing a PRSP, and WB and UNDP are continuing this. As this is a long process good

Region	DMC	TA No.	Project Title	(I)	(II)	(III)
				TA Development & Implementation by Divisions/Departments: Adequacy of (i) Preparation; (ii) Implementation; (iii) Performance; (iv) Monitoring and Support from the User Division/Department	Actual TA (i) Achievements and (ii) Sustainability of benefits (rate: 0-3, 0=none, 3=highly)	Major Lessons
			Uzbekistan	basis for this TA. After it started implementation and monitoring went smooth.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ii. other relevant information. Sustainability (2) - Capacity of Government staff have been built during the TA and is continued to be strengthened by other donors. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ii. coordination needed to be done by the Government. This was not well done causing delays and fell short of providing optimal assistance as needed; iii. TA design should have taken due account of ADB's experience in implementing similar PRSP-related activities in other countries. This could have contributed to a more realistic design and implementation of such TA; iii. Weak administrative capacity of the consultants required excessive supervision from URM staff.
EARD	MON	4383	Participatory Poverty Assessment and Monitoring (PPAM)	<p>Project appraisal and design was done on close collaboration with the DMC, World Bank and ADB, resulting in clear agreements and formulation. Implementation and monitoring went according to plan and full support was provided by all stakeholders.</p> <p>Timeframe for implementation was extended with some 9 months at the request of the EA to hold the book launching and photo exhibit in the 2nd half of 2006.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Achievements (3) - The TA not only completed the expected outputs, but also achieved highly successfully its purpose, drawing recognition from the Government, donor agencies, civil society and the academe, among others. ii. Sustainability (3) - Given the high degree of recognition by the major stakeholders, the outcome and results of the PPAM is being used as valuable reference material in policies and strategies development, and is a solid basis 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. The TA contributed to a better understanding of poverty in MON and contributed to improve the link between poverty diagnosis and policy making. It helped to re-orient the approach of the Government's anti-poverty program by putting more emphasis on the important role that household and community-level assets can play;

Region	DMC	TA No.	Project Title	(I)	(II)	(III)
				TA Development & Implementation by Divisions/Departments: Adequacy of (i) Preparation; (ii) Implementation; (iii) Performance; (iv) Monitoring and Support from the User Division/Department	Actual TA (i) Achievements and (ii) Sustainability of benefits (rate: 0-3, 0=none, 3=highly)	Major Lessons
					for continued research and studies.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ii. The EA had a high degree of ownership of the TA and the PPAM; iii. Harmonizing technical assistance among donors contributed to enhance the impact of the TA on long term capacity building.
PARD	Sub-Reg	6047	National Poverty Reduction Strategies in Pacific Developing Member Countries	As part of the overall process to increase the impact of nation development interventions in the PDMCs, this TA is part of a series of TAs that helps to direct the future of pro-poor policies and strategies of PDMCs. More specifically, this TA continued the work of another TA (6002-REG): Consultation workshops for the preparation of PRSs in selected PDMCs. Preparations, implementation and monitoring was therefore adequately developed and executed.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Achievements (3) - The outputs of this TA, together with the other related TAs (RETAs 6002, 5097 and TA3667) contributed to the production and publications of poverty/hardship assessments, strategies for equitable growth and hardship alleviation, and people's priorities. ii. Sustainability (3) - As this is part of a longer term process of developing and implementing NPRSs in the Pacific Region, the achieved outputs and results will be used as the basis for further studies and development of the relevant policies and strategies. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. The results of the qualitative participatory poverty assessments provided a highly effective complement to the more quantitative analyses of poverty and hardship and the assessments of government policies and strategies; ii. EA key staff in the planning and actual conduct of participatory assessment provided a very good learning opportunity for staff as well as ensuring ownership of the results after study completion.
PARD	Sub-Reg	6157	Strengthening Poverty Analysis and Strategies in the Pacific	Building on earlier RETAs (i.e. 6022 and 6047) this RETA, co-financed with the PRF, initiated a range of capacity building initiatives were developed in pro-poor strategy development for selected PDMCs. The overall TA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Achievements (2) - Most of the TA outputs have been achieved, recipient countries have improved their capacity. ii. Sustainability (1) - Although their capacities have been improved, further donor support is required 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. This TA is a follow up of earlier RETAs 6022 and 6047. Relevant capacities have been built. However, particularly the countries with small national statistical offices are still in

Region	DMC	TA No.	Project Title	(I)	(II)	(III)
				TA Development & Implementation by Divisions/Departments: Adequacy of (i) Preparation; (ii) Implementation; (iii) Performance; (iv) Monitoring and Support from the User Division/Department	Actual TA (i) Achievements and (ii) Sustainability of benefits (rate: 0-3, 0=none, 3=highly)	Major Lessons
				development and implementation was adequate as part of a longer-term strategy to strengthen the Pacific region in mitigating hardship and poverty.	when the tasks will be undertaken again on a 5-year cycle. Particularly those countries with very small national statistical offices.	need for donor support to maintain the capacity to monitor and report on standard poverty indicators.
REG	Inter-Reg	6006	Regional Conference on National Poverty Reduction Strategies	Small SSTA to co-sponsor an east Asian regional conference on the formulation of NPRSs, together with IMF, WB and UNDP, with participation from a number of DMCs. This conference was well prepared and conducted in Hanoi, Viet Nam.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Achievements (3) and ii. Sustainability (3) - The conference primarily initiated the process of PRSP formulation and review. A second conference was organized in 2003 in Phnom Penh as follow-up to this conference. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. The conference concluded that since the majority of the poor live in rural areas, more emphasis and investments should be directed to the rural areas.
REG	Inter-Reg	6120	Developing a Social Protection Index for Committed Poverty Reduction	The concept was adequate and feasible, and the TOR were practical. The ILO provided significant contributions and the consultants' performance was excellent. The participating DMCs provided also considerable support.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Achievements (3) - The TA resulted in the creation of a robust SPI development methodology. ii. Sustainability (3) - A follow-on TA (financed by PRF) was implemented to cover the other DMC and the SPI was endorsed by the participating DMCs during a conference to utilize, update and maintain the SPI in their respective countries. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Need for careful analysis and interpretation of the SPI index. Hence, the need for country and consolidated multi-country reports; ii. Countries' awareness of their own efforts and their need for and the benefits of social protection are low; iii. The methodology has its limitations as data are frequently incomplete or of poor quality, which needs to be taken into consideration when interpreting the results; iv. Planned project implementation should take into account at least 6

Region	DMC	TA No.	Project Title	(I)	(II)	(III)
				TA Development & Implementation by Divisions/Departments: Adequacy of (i) Preparation; (ii) Implementation; (iii) Performance; (iv) Monitoring and Support from the User Division/Department	Actual TA (i) Achievements and (ii) Sustainability of benefits (rate: 0-3, 0=none, 3=highly)	Major Lessons
						months of editing and publication.
REG	Inter-Reg	6176	Building Capacity for Participatory Approaches to Poverty Reduction in ADB Operation	The TA was developed by RSDD to provide support to ADB financed projects mainly during its design phase (PPTA) to integrate and built capacities in participatory approaches to enhance the impact on poverty reduction. Extensive consultations were held with the regional departments (users) and the design was developed very flexible as it is demand driven. This approach proved to be very useful for ADB's project staff. However, this demand-driven nature made project management of consultants quite difficult. In addition, unforeseen circumstances caused about one year delay in implementation and consequently less activities were undertaken. Consultants' performance was marginal.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Achievements (2) - partly successful. Assistance were provided to a number of PPTAs, however delays and some set backs reduced the rate of success. For instance, due to the change of the entire PPTA team in MON, and changes of government staff the TA investments also left with this team and personnel. ii. Sustainability (1) - The training, workshops and individual project consultations were successful and as a result these have been incorporated in the relevant project designs and implementation approaches. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Capacity development support like this TA should target both newly approved and ongoing projects to minimize the risk of investing projects that may not be approved later; ii. To make aware of the availability and create demand for this type of TA support a good communication strategy is crucial; iii. The TA design should have a more focused set of participatory approaches and techniques that are appropriate for a wide range of sectors and country specific situations. In the end the TA support was ad hoc making it more difficult to identify consultants with the appropriate skills.
SARD	MLD	4591	Development of a Results-Oriented 7th National Development Plan	The TA was conceptualized with the DMC government and UNDP. Preparations, implementation and monitoring were done efficiently and adequately by all concerned.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Achievements (2) - All outputs were produced as planned, except for conducting the proposed regional workshops. The government requested to delay the implementation of these 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. A main lesson from this TA was that to the extent possible (and assuming sufficient staff time is available), staff resources (rather than TA funding)

Region	DMC	TA No.	Project Title	(I)	(II)	(III)
				TA Development & Implementation by Divisions/Departments: Adequacy of (i) Preparation; (ii) Implementation; (iii) Performance; (iv) Monitoring and Support from the User Division/Department	Actual TA (i) Achievements and (ii) Sustainability of benefits (rate: 0-3, 0=none, 3=highly)	Major Lessons
					<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ii. workshops to a later date; Sustainability (1) - Although the major expected outputs have been achieved, the government suffers from a budgetary deficit which prevented the continuation of implementing the 7th National Development Plan. This has been identified as a risk, yet it is beyond the control of the TA. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ii. should be used for such a task; A further lesson learnt was that the responsibility for TA outputs and deliverables, if divided between more than one development partners, may give rise to complications including a free-rider problem.
SARD	SRI	4278	Poverty Assessment and Information Management	Building on work already done, this TA aimed to improve instruments and methodologies and to strengthen the capacity of the relevant state and other agencies. The design was thus adequately developed closely with the Government. Implementation suffered delays due to the 2004 tsunami and the armed conflict in the North and East of the country.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Achievements (2) - The most important goals have been achieved, though some activities have not been implemented in all or only in part, due to delay caused by the 2004 tsunami and the armed conflict in the North and East of the country. ii. Sustainability (1) - Some degree of sustainability can be assumed for those activities that have been achieved. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Damage assessment and processing of damage caused by the 2004 tsunami required additional staff. Consequently implementation of this TA (together with a number of other TAs and projects) have been delayed; ii. After a period of relative peace, the armed conflict in the North and East of the country flared up making it difficult to undertake necessary research in these areas.
SERD	CAM (PAK + VIE)	3955 (4277 + 4252)	Engagement of a Poverty Consultant at the Cambodia Resident Mission (Extension)	The inputs of poverty reduction specialists at the three RMs were co-financed with the DFID-financed PRF. Preparations of each TA were done in close consultation by the respective	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Achievements (2) - All expected outputs have been achieved within the provided timeframe. ii. Sustainability (1) - Capacities of Government staff have been developed and the NSDP 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. The main task of the TA consultant was primarily to support CARM and the Government in developing, implementing and monitoring poverty

Region	DMC	TA No.	Project Title	(I)	(II)	(III)
				TA Development & Implementation by Divisions/Departments: Adequacy of (i) Preparation; (ii) Implementation; (iii) Performance; (iv) Monitoring and Support from the User Division/Department	Actual TA (i) Achievements and (ii) Sustainability of benefits (rate: 0-3, 0=none, 3=highly)	Major Lessons
				RMs and Governments. The TAs are to strengthen the capacity of the Government in the monitoring and implementation of the PRSPs to achieve their MDGs, and assist in establishing knowledge centers on poverty reduction at the RMs. Each poverty reduction specialist in the participating DMC had their specific assignment.	formulated, it is expected that the Government owns up these products and implements the NSDP.	reduction activities to achieve the MDGs; ii. Sustaining participatory processes in the Government requires longer term investments.
CWRD	PAK (CAM + VIE)	4277 (3955 + 4252)	Supporting of Poverty Reduction Initiatives in Pakistan	<p>Cambodia: The poverty reduction specialist at CARM participated on behalf of ADB in the technical working group on planning and poverty reduction of the Ministry of Planning.</p> <p>Pakistan: The poverty reduction specialist of PRM was appointed primarily to assist in monitoring the implementation of the national and provincial poverty reduction plans.</p> <p>Vietnam: The key assignment for the poverty reduction specialist in VRM is to strengthen the local capacity to contribute to the country's poverty reduction goals, by introducing participatory assessment and planning methodologies to the Government.</p>	<p>i. Achievements (3) - A change of scope with additional TASF financing contributed to a high quality of outputs.</p> <p>ii. Sustainability (3) - The reports produced had significant ownership by the Government, disseminated on the MOF's website and were extensively used by the Government and development agencies.</p>	<p>i. The involvement of the TA consultant in the PRSP development and monitoring process improved ADB consultations on poverty issues by the Government;</p> <p>ii. Stronger donor coordination in the PRSP Secretariat helped avoiding duplications;</p> <p>iii. Donor dependency should gradually reduce through systematic capacity development of Government staff.</p>
SERD	VIE (CAM + PAK)	4252 (3955 + 4277)	Support to Poverty Reduction Activities in Viet Nam	<p>Vietnam: The key assignment for the poverty reduction specialist in VRM is to strengthen the local capacity to contribute to the country's poverty reduction goals, by introducing participatory assessment and planning methodologies to the Government.</p>	<p>i. Achievements (2) - All expected outputs have been achieved within the provided timeframe.</p> <p>ii. Sustainability (1) - Although capacities of Government staff have been developed through training and seminars, it is not evident that the relevant Government agencies owned up these products.</p>	<p>i. The main task of the TA consultant was primarily to support VRM and the Government in poverty reduction activities. There was no other strategic purpose for the TA consultant's input except to provide additional human resource;</p> <p>ii. Sustaining participatory</p>

Region	DMC	TA No.	Project Title	(I)	(II)	(III)
				TA Development & Implementation by Divisions/Departments: Adequacy of (i) Preparation; (ii) Implementation; (iii) Performance; (iv) Monitoring and Support from the User Division/Department	Actual TA (i) Achievements and (ii) Sustainability of benefits (rate: 0-3, 0=none, 3=highly)	Major Lessons
						processes in the Government requires longer term investments.
SERD	CAM	4037	Dissemination of the National Poverty Reduction Strategy	The TA, being part of a larger, longer-term effort to operationalize the SEDP-II/NPRS. The dissemination of the NPRS provided better understanding by the public. Preparations were done in a coordinated manner with the Government and other donors. However, the overall implementation had successes as well as few poor performances. Monitoring and support from CARM was adequate.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Achievements (2) - All expected outputs have been achieved, though with a delay of a couple of months due to national elections. ii. Sustainability (2) - The dissemination process has made the public and particularly civil society to continue to be more involved in the development and implementation of Government policies. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Popularizing NPRS and eliciting significant insights from the public at various levels was not an easy task; ii. Public discussions contributed to an increasing awareness, but it also fed into electoral debates (TA implementation coincided with the 2003 elections); iii. The local level forums proved a useful vehicle for enabling the people to speak the realities and for the Government to listen.
SERD	LAO/VIE	6242	Developing New Policy Paradigms for Sustainable Livelihood Protection and Natural Resource Management among Ethnic Minorities of GMS: A Study of Policies and their Impacts, Strategies for Change.	The SSTA design and implementation was partly adequate for its intended purpose. The SEAE (in that time MAKE) prepared the concept paper and was the EA for this SSTA. Initially the participating DMCs agreed with the study but changed its policies when it comes to recommendations for policy reforms.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Achievements (1) - Only the desk study inventorizing of what is available and current related to livelihoods status of ethnics minorities, was completed. Identifying gaps and formulation of recommendations for policy reforms was dropped at the request from the participating DMCs. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Desk review and analysis of existing frameworks, policies, etc. resulted in a comprehensive report; ii. The participating DMCs shifted their priorities, consequently no further cooperation was provided by these DMCs for field study, identifying policy gaps and recommending policy reform.

Region	DMC	TA No.	Project Title	(I)	(II)	(III)
				TA Development & Implementation by Divisions/Departments: Adequacy of (i) Preparation; (ii) Implementation; (iii) Performance; (iv) Monitoring and Support from the User Division/Department	Actual TA (i) Achievements and (ii) Sustainability of benefits (rate: 0-3, 0=none, 3=highly)	Major Lessons
SERD	LAO	4627	Public Expenditure Planning for National Growth and Poverty Eradication Strategy (NGPES)	The TA was to strengthen public expenditure management by integrating NPRS into budgetary priorities and implementation. The design, development and implementation of the TA was adequate and in close collaboration with various government agencies and other stakeholders. Performances of the consultants were outstanding. The TA was implemented within the planned timeframe, with an extension of 3 months at the request from the Government to allow more training activities.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Achievements (3) - The TA successfully completed the required outputs. Yet, the strength of the desired outcomes and impacts can only be felt over time during actual execution of the SEDP. ii. (ii) Sustainability (2) - The achievements of this TA justified continued support which resulted in a follow-up TA to further strengthen this process. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. A major lesson learned is to be flexible with Government's requirement during implementation without losing sight of the purpose; ii. The pace of project implementation should take into consideration the institutional environment of the Government. Basic skills development should therefore ideally precede implementation of projects; iii. In the absence of an experienced national fiscal management specialist, a full-time international consultant should have been on site; iv. In all, the implementation process was slow and will most likely remain slow and must be taken into consideration when implementing future projects.
SERD	Sub-Reg	6171	Reviewing Poverty Impact of Regional Economic Integration in the GMS	The TA aims to provide a more comprehensive information base about cross-border livelihood interactions and poverty in the GMS by reviewing the poverty impact of Regional Economic	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Achievements (3) - All planned TA outputs have been achieved within the planned timeframe, but was extended to six months to allow to conduct the final regional workshop and to disseminate the 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. The REI has a mixed outcome: There have been clear benefits for the poor, e.g. labor, informal trade, access to better services. But there are also great

Region	DMC	TA No.	Project Title	(I)	(II)	(III)
				TA Development & Implementation by Divisions/Departments: Adequacy of (i) Preparation; (ii) Implementation; (iii) Performance; (iv) Monitoring and Support from the User Division/Department	Actual TA (i) Achievements and (ii) Sustainability of benefits (rate: 0-3, 0=none, 3=highly)	Major Lessons
				Integration (REI). It was prepared in close collaboration with the GMS governments and relevant divisions in ADB. ADB's SERD was the EA wherein local research institutions in THA, CAM, LAO and VIE have been contracted to implement country specific research. The overall TA development and implementation was adequate and well managed.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ii. RETA findings. (ii) Sustainability (2) - There is no follow-up activity planned with ADB support, however the RETA findings will feed into the 2008 GMS Strategy and in other national policy and strategy papers. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ii. costs attached to this, such as exploitation, trafficking and increased violence; Poverty reduction is directly influenced by informal interactions rather than by formal integration; iii. Most benefits of REI require efforts and are managed, while the negative impacts emerge naturally.
SERD	VIE	4644	Support to Hue and Quang Tri Provinces for Formulating Sustainable Poverty Reduction and Growth Programs	This TA aims to help the Thua Thien Hué and Quang Tri provinces to strengthen their capacity to formulate and implement provincial poverty reduction and growth programs. Preparations were adequate and in close coordination with the Government. Implementation was initially delayed, but started to pick up in early 2007 and was able to complete most of the planned activities, though with reduced quantities to fast-track the process.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Achievements (2) - All key activities were completed in time in both provinces. In quantitative terms, the numbers of people being trained needed to be reduced to fast-track implementation in order to be able to accomplish the key activities before closing of the Fund. ii. (ii) Sustainability (2) – The methodology used in TA was institutionalized into Decision No.555 on Results-based Implementation Monitoring and Evaluation Framework. Therefore, the skills and methodologies acquired through TA is likely to be carried forward by provincial officials in planning and implementation process of SEDP. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. The lessons learned and the results of the TA will feed into the annual CSP update. [The final TA report is not yet available, and therefore no further information is known]

ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK
ADMINISTRATOR FOR
TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE GRANT FUND
COOPERATION FUND FOR NATIONAL POVERTY REDUCTION STRATEGIES (GOVERNMENT OF
NETHERLANDS)

STATUS OF GRANT (CONTRIBUTION)
as of 31 October 2008
(Amounts in US dollar)

TOTAL CONTRIBUTION COMMITTED (Euro 6,806,703.24)		6,357,813.43 ^{1/}
Gain (Loss) arising from change in value of currency		<u>1,400,910.67</u>
Amount received	6,621,691.94	
Receivable from Government of Netherlands	<u>1,137,032.16^{2/}</u>	7,758,724.10
Add: Income from investment	70,960.70	
Interest income	147,062.31	
Gain (loss) on foreign exchange transactions	<u>(1,791.24)</u>	<u>216,231.77</u>
TOTAL AMOUNT AVAILABLE		7,974,955.87
Amounts utilized for:		
Project expenditures (Statement 2)	(5,594,216.20)	
Administration cost	(345,710.80)	
Financial expense - bank charges	<u>(2,501.00)</u>	<u>(5,942,428.00)</u>
UNUTILIZED BALANCE		2,032,527.87 ^{3/}

^{1/} Represents the sum of utilized and unutilized contributions expressed in US\$ equivalents.

^{2/} Undrawn contributions in local currency are translated at the applicable exchange rate as of 31 October 2008.

^{3/} Represented by:

Cash in bank		961,526.85
Interfund Receivable		18.00
Undrawn contribution (EUR 880,396.04)		1,137,032.16
Accrued expenses		<u>(66,049.14)</u>
		<u><u>2,032,527.87</u></u>

ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK
Statement of TA Expenditures – Cooperation Fund for the National Poverty Reduction Strategies
(Government of Netherlands)
As of 31 October 2008

(Expressed in US dollars)

TA Title	TA No./ Type	Date of Approval	TA Amount	Amount Received	Project Expenditures ²⁷			Outstanding Commitments	Expected TA Completion Date	Completed TAs Unutilized Commitment (Savings)	Financial Completion Date
					Cumulative up to 31/12/07	Transactions 01/01- 30/10/08	Cumulative Up to 30/10/08				
			(A)	(B)	(C)	(D)	(E) = (C) + (D)	(F) = (A) – (E)	(G)	(H) = (A) – (E)	(I)
<u>Azerbaijan</u>											
Participatory Strategy Development & Implementation for Achieving the MDG	4621/AO	21Jul05	650,000		303,601.35	(30,545.00)	273,056.35			376,943.65	Apr-08
<u>Cambodia</u>											
Dissemination of the National Poverty Reduction Strategy	4037/AO	16Dec02	80,000		33,190.74	-	33,190.74			46,809.26	May-05
Engagement of a Poverty Consultant at the Cambodia Resident Mission	3955/AO	30Oct02	31,500.00		9,229.90	-	9,229.90			22,270.10	Jul-07
Total Cambodia			111,500.00		42,420.64	-	42,420.64			69,079.36	
<u>Lao's People Democratic Republic</u>											
Public Expenditure Planning for National Growth & Poverty Eradication Strategy	4627/AO	02Aug05	700,000.00		601,037.85	23,635.00	624,672.85			75,327.15	Apr-08
<u>Maldives</u>											
Developing a Results-Oriented 7 th National Development Plan	4591/AO	25May05	377,000.00		374,271.00	-	374,271.00			2,729.00	May-06
<u>Mongolia</u>											
Participatory Poverty Assessment and Monitoring	4383/AO	31Aug04	300,000.00		277,383.34	-	277,383.34			22,616.66	Apr-07
<u>Pakistan</u>											
Support for Poverty Reduction Initiatives in Pakistan	4277/AO	18Dec03	31,500.00		31,500.00	-	31,500.00			-	Oct-07
<u>Sri Lanka</u>											
Poverty Assessment and Information Management	4278/AO	18Dec03	350,000.00		227,191.12	100,778.33	327,969.45			22,030.55	Sep-08
<u>Uzbekistan</u>											
Comprehensive Midterm Strategy for Improving the Living Standard of UZB	3781/AO	28Nov01	570,000.00		566,377.22	-	566,377.22			3,622.78	Sep-07
<u>Vietnam</u>											
Support to Poverty Reduction Activities in Vietnam	4252/AO	12Dec03	37,000.00		37,000.00	-	37,000.00			-	Apr-07

ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK
Statement of TA Expenditures – Cooperation Fund for the National Poverty Reductions Strategies
(Government of Netherlands)
As of 31 October 2008

(Expressed in US Dollars)

TA Title	TA No./ Type	Date of Approval	TA Amount ¹⁷	Amount Received	Project Expenditures ²⁷			Outstanding Commitments	Expected TA Completion Date	Completed TAs	
					Cumulative up to 31/12/07	Transactions 01/01-30/10/08	Cumulative Up to 30/10/08			Unutilized Commitment (Savings)	Financial Completion Date
			(A)	(B)	(C)	(D)	(E) = (C) + (D)	(F) = (A) – (E)	(G)	(H) = (A) – (E)	(I)
Support to Thua Thien Hue & Quang Tri Provinces for Formulating Sustainable Poverty Reduction and Growth Programs	4644/AO	07Sep05	900,000.00		466,739.78	208,009.64	674,749.42			225,250.58	Jul-08
Total Vietnam			<u>937,000.00</u>		<u>503,739.78</u>	<u>208,009.64</u>	<u>711,749.42</u>			<u>225,250.58</u>	
Regional											
Regional Conference on National Poverty Reduction Strategies	6006/RG	21Nov01	50,000.00		31,952.20	-	31,952.20			18,047.80	Jul-02
National Poverty Reduction Strategies in Pacific DMCs	6047/RG	06Sep02	500,000.00		470,648.40	-	470,648.40			29,351.60	Aug-06
Strengthening Poverty Analysis and Strategies in the Pacific	6157/RG	18Dec03	400,000.00		191,768.66	189,934.29	381,702.95			18,297.05	May-08
Social Protection Index for Committed Poverty Reduction	6120/RG	27Aug03	300,000.00		269,931.94	-	269,931.94			30,068.06	Sep-06
Reviewing the Poverty Impact of Regional Economic Integration in the GMS	6171/RG	06May04	850,000.00		775,215.19	37,869.29	813,084.48			36,915.52	Oct-08
Building Capacity for Participatory Approaches to Poverty Reduction	6176/RG	14Jul04	300,000.00		53,654.15	(804.67)	52,849.48			247,150.52	Mar-08
Mainstreaming Gender into Poverty Reductions Strategies in Four CARs	6177/RG	14Jul04	350,000.00		315,913.83	-	315,913.83			34,086.17	Jan-07
Developing New Policy Paradigms for Sustainable Livelihoods Protection and Natural Resources Management	6242/RG	17May05	150,000.00		28,732.65	-	28,732.65			121,267.35	Jul-07
Total Regional			<u>2,900,000.00</u>	EUR 5,926,307.20	<u>2,137,817.02</u>	<u>226,998.91</u>	<u>2,364,815.93</u>			<u>535,184.07</u>	
Total Approved and Effective TA			<u>6,927,000.00</u>	US\$ 6,621,691.94 ³⁷	<u>5,065,339.32</u>	<u>528,876.88</u>	<u>5,594,216.20</u>			<u>1,332,783.80</u>	

¹⁷US\$ equivalent of TA Grant at time of TA approval.

²⁷Actual disbursements.

³⁷Represents the actual US\$ equivalent of contributions received.

NPRS Financed TAs: TA Performance Assessment

PROJECTS FINANCED BY NPRS				TA PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT				
				Note: The analysis were derived from a review of the TA completion reports (TCR) of nine TAs, and from available TA progress reports (TPR), from the TA semi-annual progress updates, from the NPRS semi-annual progress updates and NPRS annual report.				
Region	DMC	TA No.	Project Title	(IV) Relevance (value: 0-3)	(V) Effectiveness (value: 0-3)	(VI) Efficiency (value: 0-3)	(VII) Sustainability (value: 0-3)	(VIII) Suggestions and Recommendations
CWRD	AZE	4621	Participatory Strategy Development and Implementation for Achieving the MDGs	(2) - Though in principle highly relevant for the country, the results and outcome of the activities based on the original design was apparently ignored by the EA.	(1) - The EA developed during project implementation a different idea of what poverty reduction and economic development should be. Hence, the effectiveness of the project's results and outcome came to naught.	((2) - The resources that were made available were efficiently used for the originally designed project purposes.	(0) - The EA changed its course from its initial focus on poverty reduction to economic development.	i. The Government does not see any value adding in continuing with this TA and requested ADB to utilize the remaining TA funds (without completing the TA) to finance the Baku Consensus Project (a joint program between the Government and UNDP) instead. However, the requested major change of scope did not conform to the NPRS criteria. Consequently, the TA was then advised to close. [Analysis based on TA Paper, TA's Jan-Jun06 Semiannual Update, NPRS 2006/2007 Semiannual Updates, 2006/2007 annual reports, and documented e-mail exchanges]
CWRD	Sub-Reg	6177	Mainstreaming Gender into Poverty Reduction Strategies in Central Asia Region. (Participating DMCs: Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyz Republic, Tajikistan)	(3) - This TA is considered as highly relevant: To comply with ADB's Gender Policy and to strengthen the poor gender situation in these DMCs.	(2) - A higher level of effectiveness and quality could have been achieved if more care was given during the design of the project, (see earlier explanation).	(2) - Although the allocated human and financial resources were adequate, the initially allocated timeframe was inadequate and substantial more time was needed to achieve a	(2) - In three of the four participating DMCs sustainability is most likely guaranteed as these DMCs showed commitment to continue this process of gender integration in	i. Absence of reliable and relevant gender related baseline information was a key obstacle to carrying out the TA; ii. The effectiveness to reduce gender inequalities and to mainstream gender un national development strategies depends on strengthening the database. [Analysis based on TA completion report (TCR)]

PROJECTS FINANCED BY NPRS				TA PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT				
				<p>Note: The analysis were derived from a review of the TA completion reports (TCR) of nine TAs, and from available TA progress reports (TPR), from the TA semi-annual progress updates, from the NPRS semi-annual progress updates and NPRS annual report.</p>				
Region	DMC	TA No.	Project Title	(IV) Relevance (value: 0-3)	(V) Effectiveness (value: 0-3)	(VI) Efficiency (value: 0-3)	(VII) Sustainability (value: 0-3)	(VIII) Suggestions and Recommendations
						qualitatively acceptable level of results and sustainable outcome.	their policies, strategies and implementation .	
CWRD	UZB	3781	Comprehensive Medium-Term Strategy for Improving the Living Standards of the People of Uzbekistan	(3) - The TA has been highly useful in terms of placing poverty reduction on the Government's agenda and providing a basis for development of a PRSP with donor support.	(2) - Prior to the TA there was no government staff assigned to work on PRSP, but the TA triggered the establishment of relevant committees and working groups that continued working on the PRSP.	(1) - The consultant firm's administration was poor causing serious constraints in coordinating activities between the stakeholders and implementation . The implementation arrangements were also unnecessary complex adding to the constraints.	(2) - The process initiated by ADB is continuing with the support from WB and UNDP.	<p>i. The extent of consultations with the Government and other stakeholders was inadequate, implementation arrangements complex and not clear. It is recommended that a longer timeframe should be considered for TAs of similar nature in preparation, design and implementation.</p> <p>[Analysis based on TA completion report (TCR)]</p>
EARD	MON	4383	Participatory Poverty Assessment and Monitoring (PPAM)	(3) - The high degree of relevance was confirmed by all stakeholders which is evident in their contributions, ownership and future commitments.	(3) - Highly effective: a main result was the re-orientation of the Government in its approach towards poverty reduction and	(3) - The allocated resources adequate and even allowed to extend with a few additional person months towards consultants inputs increasing the	(3) - As mentioned earlier, the PPAM is used as valuable reference material for developing relevant policies and strategies, and	<p>i. NSO is recommended to continue to build on the systems and techniques that were developed through the TA to further develop PPAM indicators for monitoring relevant programs;</p> <p>ii. NSO should also strengthen its involvement in policy-oriented evaluations.</p>

PROJECTS FINANCED BY NPRS				TA PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT				
				<p>Note: The analysis were derived from a review of the TA completion reports (TCR) of nine TAs, and from available TA progress reports (TPR), from the TA semi-annual progress updates, from the NPRS semi-annual progress updates and NPRS annual report.</p>				
Region	DMC	TA No.	Project Title	(IV) Relevance (value: 0-3)	(V) Effectiveness (value: 0-3)	(VI) Efficiency (value: 0-3)	(VII) Sustainability (value: 0-3)	(VIII) Suggestions and Recommendations
					the sustainability of the outcome appears to be guaranteed.	quality of the products.	it is solid basis on which further studies and research is being built.	[Analysis based on TA completion report (TCR)]
PARD	Sub-Reg	6047	National Poverty Reduction Strategies in Pacific Developing Member Countries	(3) - As part of a regional package of ADB's support in developing and implementing NPRSs in the PDMCs this TA was very relevant.	(2) - The process of focusing on the concepts of poverty and hardship in the Pacific region is a long process; hence immediate great effectiveness cannot be expected.	(2) - Although investments in the Pacific Region are costly given its geographical nature, the available resources have been efficiently utilized to achieve the desired results.	(3) - As the outcome of this TA is part of larger program and strategy sustainability is most likely.	i. The latter TA has established a multi-donor funded Pacific Poverty Program that is being executed by the Secretariat of the Pacific Community that will essentially continue, expand, and improve on the work of regional TAs 6047 and 6002. [Analysis based on TA completion report (TCR)]
PARD	Sub-Reg	6157	Strengthening Poverty Analysis and Strategies in the Pacific	(3) - This RETA was part of a regional package of ADB's support in developing and implementing NPRSs in the PDMCs.	(3) - The intended goals have been achieved, capacities have been built and PDMCs are capable to carry on the tasks at this level.	(3) - The allocated resources were adequate and efficiently utilized.	(1) - The capacities that have been developed will be sustained, but it also need to be developed further and thus donor support is still required.	i. Further donor support is required when these tasks is undertaken again on a 5-year cycle. Also the countries with small national statistical offices are still in need for donor support to maintain the capacity to monitor and report on standard poverty indicators. [Analysis based on TA progress report, NPRS 2006/2007 Semiannual Updates, and 2006/2007 annual reports]
REG	Inter-Reg	6006	Regional Conference on National Poverty Reduction Strategies	(3) - The conference was conducted at the initial stages of	(2) - Several of the agreed outputs were taken up and implemented.	(3) - ADB's contribution was well utilized.	(2) - follow up discussions were held and incorporated in actual plans.	[Analysis based on TA Paper, NPRS 2006/2007 Semiannual Updates, and 2006/2007 annual reports]

PROJECTS FINANCED BY NPRS				TA PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT				
				Note: The analysis were derived from a review of the TA completion reports (TCR) of nine TAs, and from available TA progress reports (TPR), from the TA semi-annual progress updates, from the NPRS semi-annual progress updates and NPRS annual report.				
Region	DMC	TA No.	Project Title	(IV) Relevance (value: 0-3)	(V) Effectiveness (value: 0-3)	(VI) Efficiency (value: 0-3)	(VII) Sustainability (value: 0-3)	(VIII) Suggestions and Recommendations
				formulating NPRSs.				
REG	Inter-Reg	6120	Developing a Social Protection Index for Committed Poverty Reduction	(3) - A SPI is highly relevant in order to seriously reduce poverty in the region.	(2) - Effectiveness of using the SPI depends also on the country's priorities, policies and the political climate.	(3) - The available resources were well utilized, with excellent support from the user division and NPRS Secretariat, and external stakeholders (i.e. ILO, DMCs)	(3) - A follow-on TA was implemented (with PRF financing) to cover all other DMCs. The majority of the DMCs have adopted and maintain the SPI for their respective country.	i. The follow-up TA was completed early 2008. Further efforts should be made to help DMCs to improve and maintain their data base. ADB should intensify dialogue with DMCs on social protection and be prepared to support DMCs in their efforts in social protection. [Analysis based on TA completion report (TCR)]
REG	Inter-Reg	6176	Building Capacity for Participatory Approaches to Poverty Reduction in ADB Operation	(3) - supporting projects, policies and strategies to develop with a clear pro-poor focus is the overall goal of this input.	(2) - Some of the inputs to specific PPTAs and in developing the CPSs (IND, PAK) were highly effective, while other inputs were less effective due to changes of personnel among others.	(1) - Less than 50% of the available resources were utilized. Therefore, for a demand driven approach more efforts should have been made to announce the availability of such support.	(1) - Capacities of Government and project staff have been developed and the gained capacities have been used as input in further project development.	i. Lessons learned from this TA have been integrated into the related initiatives such as in RETA6400: Community-driven development knowledge management and in CPS training. [Analysis based on TA completion report (TCR)]
SARD	MLD	4591	Development of a Results-Oriented 7th National Development Plan	(3) - The TA was relevant for its intended purpose for the government, but actually it was more relevant for ADB's lending	(2) - The committed outputs have all been delivered, however the government's contribution suffered of a serious	(2) - The project was implemented within the planned timeframe without delays. The allocated resources	(1) - The budgetary deficit of the Government is of serious concern for an efficient and effective continuation of	i. ADB should follow-up with policy dialogue and advice on the implementation of the 7th NDP and on the preparation of the mid-term and final monitoring reports; ii. It is also recommended that ADB's follow-up be provided in the form of staff dialogue with

PROJECTS FINANCED BY NPRS				TA PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT				
				<p>Note: The analysis were derived from a review of the TA completion reports (TCR) of nine TAs, and from available TA progress reports (TPR), from the TA semi-annual progress updates, from the NPRS semi-annual progress updates and NPRS annual report.</p>				
Region	DMC	TA No.	Project Title	(IV) Relevance (value: 0-3)	(V) Effectiveness (value: 0-3)	(VI) Efficiency (value: 0-3)	(VII) Sustainability (value: 0-3)	(VIII) Suggestions and Recommendations
				strategy.	budgetary deficit and thus the quality of the outcome has suffered.	(funds and consultants) were efficiently utilized and properly managed.	the implementation of the NDP.	the Government. [Analysis based on TA completion report (TCR)]
SARD	SRI	4278	Poverty Assessment and Information Management	(2) - Though highly relevant for the country, implementation of the required activities took lower priority as all efforts were focused on relief and rehabilitation work of the tsunami hit areas.	(1) - Due to delays caused by the tsunami and intensified armed conflict the effectiveness of this TA has suffered.	(2) - The provided resources were slowly utilized and not optimally managed by SRM.	(1) - Outputs from the TA has been used as input for the Government's development strategy. A poverty database system was developed and is assumed to be sustained by the Government.	No specific suggestions or recommendations were shared at this stage as the actual results of this TA still need to be reported. [Analysis based on TA Paper, NPRS 2006/2007 Semiannual Updates, and 2006/2007 annual reports]
SERD	CAM	3955	Engagement of a Poverty Consultant at the Cambodia Resident Mission (Extension)	(3) - Developing the capacities of Government staff in bottom-up planning processes is very relevant for poverty reduction.	(2) - The committed outputs have all been delivered, however with a low sense of ownership by the Government for the overall outcome.	(3) - The provided resources and consultants inputs were efficiently used with close supervision from the RM.	(1) - Capacities of Government staff have been developed and it is assumed that the gained capacities will be used and sustained.	i. To maintain the momentum of providing hands-on assistance to the Government it is recommended to assign a RM staff to be the poverty reduction focal point. [Analysis based on TA Paper, NPRS 2006/2007 Semiannual Updates, 2006/2007 annual reports, TA progress report and short case study]
CWRD	PAK	4277	Supporting of Poverty Reduction Initiatives in Pakistan	(3) - The outputs were extensively used by the	(3) - With the added funding and change of scope of support	(3) - With the added funding and change of scope of support	(2) - The support in developing capacities and the significant	i. The momentum developed under the TA needs to be strengthened and consolidated by addressing various remaining challenges,

PROJECTS FINANCED BY NPRS				TA PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT				
				<p>Note: The analysis were derived from a review of the TA completion reports (TCR) of nine TAs, and from available TA progress reports (TPR), from the TA semi-annual progress updates, from the NPRS semi-annual progress updates and NPRS annual report.</p>				
Region	DMC	TA No.	Project Title	(IV) Relevance (value: 0-3)	(V) Effectiveness (value: 0-3)	(VI) Efficiency (value: 0-3)	(VII) Sustainability (value: 0-3)	(VIII) Suggestions and Recommendations
				Government and other development agencies.	effectiveness increased.	effectiveness increased.	ownership by the Government guaranteed sustainability of the overall outcome.	including addressing data gaps and bringing consistency in various public sector data sources. In this regard, ADB and other development agencies. [Analysis based on TA completion report (TCR)]
SERD	VIE	4252	Support to Poverty Reduction Activities in Viet Nam	(3) - Developing the capacities of Government staff in bottom-up planning processes is very relevant for poverty reduction.	(2) - The committed outputs have all been delivered, however with a low sense of ownership by the Government for the overall outcome.	(3) - The provided resources and consultants inputs were efficiently used with close supervision from the RM.	(1) - Capacities of Government staff have been developed and it is assumed that the gained capacities will be used and sustained.	i. To maintain the momentum of providing hands-on assistance to the Government it is recommended to assign a RM staff to be the poverty reduction focal point. [Analysis based on TA Paper, NPRS 2006/2007 Semiannual Updates, 2006/2007 annual reports, TA progress report and short case study]
SERD	CAM	4037	Dissemination of the National Poverty Reduction Strategy	(3) - Disseminating public awareness of the Government's policies and programs is highly relevant.	(2) - Overall effective, though there were instances where the dissemination efforts were less effective.	(2) - Resources were overall efficiently used, but to some extent some of the consultants inputs were less efficient.	(3) - General public and civil society have acquired the right to be informed and involved with the Government's SEDP-II/NPRS. The demand of this right will most likely continue.	i. Despite difficulties and limitations, the TA's public information support initiatives served as an important example of what can be achieved in developing and implementing NPRS's elsewhere. [Analysis based on TA Paper, NPRS 2006/2007 Semiannual Updates, 2006/2007 annual reports, TA progress report]
SERD	LAO/ VIE	6242	Developing New Policy Paradigms for Sustainable	(1) - For ADB such study is of great	(1) - Due to other priorities from the DMCs,	(2) - The resources provided to the	(1) - Given the low priority for indigenous	i. The developed reports and initial study results should be kept as input for future studies

PROJECTS FINANCED BY NPRS				TA PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT				
				<p>Note: The analysis were derived from a review of the TA completion reports (TCR) of nine TAs, and from available TA progress reports (TPR), from the TA semi-annual progress updates, from the NPRS semi-annual progress updates and NPRS annual report.</p>				
Region	DMC	TA No.	Project Title	(IV) Relevance (value: 0-3)	(V) Effectiveness (value: 0-3)	(VI) Efficiency (value: 0-3)	(VII) Sustainability (value: 0-3)	(VIII) Suggestions and Recommendations
			Livelihood Protection and Natural Resource Management among Ethnic Minorities of GMS: A Study of Policies and their Impacts, Strategies for Change.	relevance. However, the participating DMCs had other priorities, showing less priority for indigenous peoples' issues.	effectiveness for this input is low.	user division were well utilized.	peoples issues by the participating DMCs sustainability is currently very low.	<p>in this field;</p> <p>ii. Stronger advocacy need to be integrated in future projects negotiations and development and for further sector work.</p> <p>[Analysis based on TA progress report, NPRS 2006/2007 Semiannual Updates, 2006/2007 annual reports, TA progress report]</p>
SERD	LAO	4627	Public Expenditure Planning for National Growth and Poverty Eradication Strategy (NGPES)	(3) - The TA was highly successful in providing the methodological foundations aimed at strengthening LAO PDR's budget management processes.	(2) - The planned outputs have had its positive results, but this TA is limited to what it was intended to provide and could offer and continued support is still needed to sustain and maintain the overall system of efficient budget management.	(2) - Within the current institutional environment of the Government, the available resources and consultants inputs were efficiently utilized. Sufficient funds were available to honor an extension of 3 months giving added value to the TA outputs.	(2) - With the positive results booked under this TA, the developed skills and methodology will continue. Nevertheless, a follow-up TA was approved to continue and further strengthen this process to guarantee sustaining these processes.	<p>i. The design of the follow-up TA will emphasize training and capacity development in planning and budgeting at provincial and district levels to ensure sustainability of the planning and budgeting reforms;</p> <p>[Analysis based on TA completion report (TCR)]</p>
SERD	Sub-Reg	6171	Reviewing Poverty Impact of Regional Economic Integration in the GMS	(3) - The study was welcomed by the GMS countries and revealed highly relevant findings.	(2) - A major value added in this study are the data shown in the informal sector that contribute to REI.	(2) - The various country-based research institutions provided valuable materials that in turn were	(2) - No specific follow-up activity is immediately required as the results of the RETA will feed into the 2008 GMS Strategy	<p>i. The results show that the equity and distribution effects of formal integration need careful policy attention;</p> <p>ii. Unmanaged REI carries several negative implications, especially for the poor, such as human trafficking, exploitation, violence, and negative</p>

PROJECTS FINANCED BY NPRS				TA PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT				
				<p>Note: The analysis were derived from a review of the TA completion reports (TCR) of nine TAs, and from available TA progress reports (TPR), from the TA semi-annual progress updates, from the NPRS semi-annual progress updates and NPRS annual report.</p>				
Region	DMC	TA No.	Project Title	(IV) Relevance (value: 0-3)	(V) Effectiveness (value: 0-3)	(VI) Efficiency (value: 0-3)	(VII) Sustainability (value: 0-3)	(VIII) Suggestions and Recommendations
						efficiently processed by the international consultants. The available resources were well utilized for this study.	and in other national policy and strategy papers.	influence. [Analysis based on TA Paper, NPRS 2006/2007 Semiannual Updates, and 2006/2007 annual reports]
SERD	VIE	4644	Support to Hue and Quang Tri Provinces for Formulating Sustainable Poverty Reduction and Growth Programs	(3) - In a traditionally centralized planning and management system, it is very relevant to built needed capacities at the provincial levels.	(2) - The effectiveness will show up in the CSP updates, based on the quality of the gained skills, together with the value of the studies and assessments.	(1) - The TA was approved end 2005, but only by early 2007 actual implementation started. Although the planned outputs have been achieved, yet not all available resources were utilized to its maximum potentials.	(2) - The methodology used in TA was institutionalized into Decision No.555 on Results-based Implementation Monitoring and Evaluation Framework. Therefore, the skills and methodologies acquired through TA is likely to be carried forward by provincial officials in planning and implementation process of SEDP.	i. To find consultants, particularly national consultants, with the appropriate skills proved to be difficult, hence the delay at the start. It is suggested to coordinate closely with the Government regarding the proposed period of project implementation. [The final TA report is not yet available, and therefore no further information is known. Analysis based on TA Paper, NPRS 2006/2007 Semiannual Updates, and 2006/2007 annual reports]