

TA COMPLETION REPORT

Division : ECAE

TA NO./NAME: TA 3350-KAZ: Strengthening Environmental Management				TA AMOUNT APPROVED: \$700,000	
				REVISED AMOUNT: --	
EXECUTING AGENCY: Ministry of Natural Resources and Environmental Protection (MENR)		FUND SOURCE: Government of Finland		TA AMOUNT UNDISBURSED: \$234,527.05 ¹	TA AMOUNT UTILIZED: \$465,472.95 ¹
REPORT DATE: 8 January 2002	APPROVAL DATE: 20 December 1999	SIGNING DATE: 17 January 2000	CONSULTANT FIELDING DATE: 19 August 2000	CLOSING : ORIGINAL: March 2001 ACTUAL: 31 December 2001	
<p><u>TA DESCRIPTION</u> (Background/Rationale)</p> <p>Kazakhstan faces major environmental problems as a result of past policies that failed to account for the cost of land, water, and air degradation, and did not discourage the overuse of natural resources. To address the most urgent environmental concerns, the Government prepared in 1998 the National Environmental Action Plan (NEAP), and for its implementation a national environmental strategy.</p> <p>The strategy contains a set of proposals, including those to (i) introduce environmental clauses into the legislation, (ii) optimize use of natural resources, (iii) increase recycling of materials, and (iv) strengthen environmental education. Such activities are needed for implementation of the investments recommended in the NEAP, but cannot be effectively implemented until capacity building takes place at the institutions of MENR and related agencies, and policies are reformed.</p> <p><u>TA OBJECTIVES AND SCOPE</u></p> <p>The objective of the TA was to support the implementation of a national environmental strategy, and thereby improve environmental quality in Kazakhstan.</p> <p>The TA paper suggested that about 100 trainees would be selected for the training program, which would provide short courses (of three weeks each, or equivalent shorter periods) in the following topics: (i) environmental legislation and regulations, (ii) environmental economics, (iii) environmental monitoring and inspection, and (iv) clean production. The training was to be based on practical case studies, and comprehensive manuals were to be provided. Workshops would be held after each training period, to evaluate the achievements and possible applications.</p> <p>About 20 well performing trainees were to be selected for a training-of-trainers program that would cover the same four items of environmental strategy implementation. The trainees were to include members of the Parliament, staff of MENR, the environment committee of the oblasts (provinces), staff of other line ministries responsible for the implementation of the national environmental strategy, and representatives of financial and private sector agencies and NGOs. Priority criteria for the selection of trainees were to include their professional and personal capacity to benefit from the training, and commitment to the environmental strategy.</p> <p><u>TA INPUTS EVALUATION</u></p> <p>The TA covered four strategic sectors of environmental capacity building, and was therefore quite ambitious. The available resources were to cover the sectors at the strategy level, and it was considered possible. Overall the design of the TA appeared appropriate. However, the study tours to the neighboring Central Asian Republics were replaced with the one to some selected countries in Europe considering the relatively high skills of the trainees.</p> <p>Methodologies employed appeared appropriate. In the field, an important refinement was introduced by the Consultants—each strategy area was addressed in a particular target oblast. That way the provincial capital cities became focal development centers. Sharing the strategy development and training responsibilities with the provincial environmental agencies resulted in liquidation of their resources for the TA, and strengthened commitment of the local specialists. This approach also revealed the key difficulty in earlier efforts to implement additional environmental strategies. The central government's guidance was often easily ignored in the provinces, for different reasons such as impracticality or lack of financing.</p>					

¹ Amount is not final as there are still claims to be submitted by the Consultant. The overall TA amount utilization is estimated at \$628,000.

The international and domestic consultants efficiently conducted their services in compliance with the contract and work program, establishing a good relationship with the counterpart agencies. The quality of their work was excellent, and the reports were submitted on time. All key materials were translated to Russian, while English was maintained as the official language of the TA. The Government expressed the view that the work was of very high standard, and fully complied with the TOR. The Consultant team was congratulated for a high level of professional commitment, by the Committee for Environmental Protection at MNREP. ADB concurs with the Government's view of the Consultants' performance. The Government offered all expected contributions, including excellent counterparting by high level, hardworking professionals with good teamwork.

Both ADB and the EA performed satisfactorily in terms of providing timely guidance and coordinating among related agencies, industries and NGOs.

TA OUTPUTS EVALUATION

About 100 persons, including central and local government officials, representatives from industries, and NGO staff, were trained. By assigning project participants to various case studies, the maximum amount of exposure and opportunity was provided to apply new techniques and approaches to environmental management, while at the same time allowing them to pursue their individual discipline interest. Free interaction was encouraged among the participants. The value of the capacity building was in developing a sustained capability of the participants to better manage the environmental, under a widened mandate, beyond the staff of MNREP to other involved agencies. Such agencies include the National Hydrometric Organization, the Sanitary Epidemiological Organization, the Ministry of Agriculture, etc. Manuals and case reports were prepared, and attached to the final report as appendixes.

Examples of particularly significant outputs are (i) guidelines for implementation of carbon permit trading, (ii) outline structure of legislation, (iii) procedures developing unified monitoring in a risk-based approach, and (iv) database of reports, background materials, training manual, and case studies. The Government is considering implementing the carbon trading system, and MNREP has now been able to develop the system of unified monitoring. Environmental legislation is under preparation, and the materials of the TA report provide an excellent further justification for the waste management legislation. An action plan for the key activities of MNREP was also drafted.

TA OVERALL ASSESSMENT/RATING

All the objectives of the TA were substantially met, and the TA was implemented in accordance with the agreed schedule and budget. The government plans to implement further the TA recommended activities. Accordingly, the TA is considered successful.

MAJOR LESSONS LEARNED

The use of provincial cities as focal development centers proved to be an effective approach to enhance the effectiveness of the TA project and the commitment of the local specialists.

Major difficulty during the implementation was the weather in wintertime. While Almaty is the commercial capital of the country, and while the geographically more remote Astana is the capital city of the Government, MNREP is located in Kokshetau, often temporarily hard to reach under heavy snowing. Creating the case study focuses in different provinces (carbon permit game for Atyrau, cleaner production in Paulopar, unified monitoring system in Usti-Kamenogorsk) appeared to be a most efficient way to make an impact with limited resources in a big country.

FOLLOW-UP ACTION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

After a full review of the 2000-2001 tasks of the MNREP, and the progress with which their tasks have been completed, it has been possible to develop an Action Plan for the focus areas in which the TA provided support to MNREP. Follow-up of that plan, and the sustainability of the improved institutional capacity of MNREP is recommended. A second phase of strengthening the capacities is needed to support the strategy implementation. It may be noted that the schedule of the environmental strategy reaches up to the year 2030. The environmental development of Kazakhstan is a huge work.