

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE COMPLETION REPORT

Division: ECTC/ECRD

TA No. and Name TA 3530-KAZ: Improvement of Road Sector Efficiency			Amount Approved: \$750,000	
			Revised Amount: -	
Executing Agency: Ministry of Transport and Communication	Source of Funding: JSF		TA Amount Undisbursed \$68,087	TA Amount Utilized \$681,913
Approval	Signing	Fielding of Consultants	Completion Date	
			Original	Actual
31 Oct 2000	01 Feb 2001	24 March 2003	30 June 2002	28 April 2004
			Closing Date	
			Original	Actual
			30 June 2002	31 December 2004
Description				
<p>The technical assistance (TA) supports the loan to the Governments of Kazakhstan (GOK) for the Almaty-Bishkek Regional Road Rehabilitation Project (the Project). In conjunction with a similar advisory TA for the Kyrgyz Republic (TA3531-KGZ)¹, the two TAs will help in implementing measures to improve efficiency and safety on the Almaty-Bishkek road. The TA will also assist in increasing bilateral trade through improved cross-border transportation.</p> <p>Based on past studies in regional cooperation, capacity development and road safety, the TA will assist the Government of Kazakhstan (GOK) in implementing (i) the Cross-Border Agreement (CBA) signed by both governments on 15 November 1999; (ii) Road Sector Policy Statement (RSPS) that was adopted by GOK on 31 March 1996, (iii) continuation of institutional reforms agreed with GOK, and (iv) actions to improve road safety.</p>				
Objectives and Scope				
<p>The TA aimed at developing an efficient and safe road transport system facilitating improved border crossing that could be replicated in other Central Asian Republics to foster subregional cooperation and economic growth. Planned to be implemented in three phases, the TA include: (i) assistance to implement the CBA, including formulating long-term strategies for expanded use of CBA at the borders; (ii) improving management of road safety, including coordination with the Project supervisory consultants to ensure that maintenance contracts include adequate provisions relating to environmental, social mitigation, and road safety considerations; and (iii) streamline the ministerial and departmental responsibilities, assign roles based on redefined functions, and help implement the RSPS in Kazakhstan.</p>				
Evaluation of Inputs				
<p>Road is the predominant means of in-country transport and provides subregional linkages for the landlocked Kazakhstan. The TA addresses the cross-border transport facilitation, institutional and road safety aspects that are critical for safe and sustainable operations of the Project road as well as the country's road network. Hence the TA is relevant and adequately formulated. The terms of reference (TOR) for the TA largely reflect the work to be undertaken by the consultant in order to meet the TA objectives. However, few deliverables in the TOR were linked to actions under the Project over which the consultant had no control. With this background, the consultant met the requirements of the TA and their performance was considered satisfactory. The total TA cost remained within the approved amount. Commencement of the TA was delayed due to delays in ratification of CBA by the two governments which was a condition for loan effectiveness.</p> <p>The TA involved 22 person-months of international and 18.5 person-months of domestic consultants. Only the domestic consultant's input was increased by 0.5 person-months compared to the initially envisaged input. ADB undertook four review missions, one at inception, second at midterm review, third a review mission and the fourth was the final review that involved tripartite meeting.</p> <p>The Government's executing agency, the Ministry of Transport and Communications (MOTC) remained actively involved in the TA and participated in consultant's work, coordinating input of other agencies, holding project steering committee meetings, and assisting in arranging stakeholder consultation workshops and seminars. MOTC undertook detailed review of the draft report and provided useful guidance and suggestions.</p>				

¹ A separate TA Completion Report is prepared for TA3531-KGZ.

Evaluation of Outputs

For CBA and road safety (parts 1 and 2 of the TA), the consultant completed a four-volume report and an executive summary. The four volumes covered (i) main report summarizing the findings, (ii) cross border agreement - legal and institutional issues, (iii) road safety, and (cross border systems analysis. Under advisory support to MOTC on institutional strengthening (part 3 of the TA), the consultant submitted a two volume report. The quality of the reports prepared by the consultant was adequate and covered all aspects of the terms of reference.

In view of certain deliverables that were not achievable within the TA time frame, the consultant's output was focused on achieving the TOR objectives rather than actual deliverables. For example, the TOR required the consultant to draft a road safety act. Instead, the consultant undertook a detailed analysis of all aspects of road safety in the country and developed a comprehensive roadmap to be implemented in five stages.

Significant stakeholder consultation was undertaken for CBA implementation, road safety and institutional strengthening. The consultant also conducted road safety training seminar and translated the ADB publication *Road Safety Guidelines for the Asian and Pacific Region* into Russian for wider dissemination.

Overall Assessment and Rating

The TA addresses major issues in the road sector, supplements the ongoing ADB loan and other road development activities in the country, and provides a framework supported by plan for CBA implementation and facilitating cross border transportation, improving and institutionalizing road safety, and clarifying role of various road agencies and recommending organizational reforms. As the TA objectives were largely achieved, it is considered generally successful.

Major Lessons Learned

The TOR should be carefully drafted to ensure that the deliverables are achievable. In view of over two years delay in commencement of the TA, the TOR should have been reviewed and updated.

The functioning of the Project Steering Committee (PSC) responsible for overseeing implementation of the Project and TAs could have been made more effective to ensure incorporation and implementation of the TA findings and recommendations under the Project.

Recommendations and Follow-Up Actions

The TA was helpful in analyzing the current status of road safety institutions and preparing a road map for implementation in five stages. Similarly, the TA identified the various elements needed to effectively implement the CBA signed between the Governments of Kazakhstan and Kyrgyz Republic. There is a need to follow up on these actions. The EA should be encouraged to monitor and report progress on implementation of the TA findings and recommendations.

Prepared by Hasan Masood Designation Senior Transport Specialist