

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE COMPLETION REPORT

Division: ECSS

TA No. and Name: TA 3452-KGZ: Institutional Strengthening for Community-Based Infrastructure Services			Amount Approved: \$650,000	
			Revised Amount: -	
Executing Agency: Ministry of Agriculture and Water Resources	Source of Funding: JSF		TA Amount Undisbursed \$81,932 ¹	TA Amount Utilized \$568,068 ¹
Date			Completion Date	
Approval 8 Jun 2000	Signing 13 July 2000	Fielding of Consultants 30 Oct 2000	Original 31 April 1999	Actual 31 May 2003
			Closing Date	
			Original 31 Oct 2001	Actual²
<p>Description</p> <p>The technical assistance (TA) was processed in conjunction with the Community-Based Infrastructure Services Sector Project.³ The TA was designed to support the loan project by (i) improving management systems for basic infrastructure services development, and (ii) preparing a model for community drinking water users' unions (CDWUUs). The TA was intended to (i) prepare and implement institutional strengthening programs for local governments and community-based organizations; and (ii) assist CDWUUs, vodokanals (urban water supply and sanitation agencies), and village local governments to improve their organizational structures and capacities, including strengthening their systems for planning, budgeting, operation and maintenance, and billing and collection.</p> <p>Objectives and Scope</p> <p>The main objective of the TA was to strengthen the sector institutions and create appropriate management systems for the smooth implementation of the loan project. The TA was intended to develop good implementation practices using the ten core subprojects (two urban and eight rural) studied under the project preparatory TA.⁴ It was designed to (i) develop systems for involving the community, including strengthening the role of women in identifying needs for basic infrastructure services and planning the level of services to be provided, and (ii) propose a model for the management of water supply systems by the CDWUUs. The TA was intended to help strengthen the capacity at both the central and provincial government levels to manage the Project. This included developing and undertaking (i) training for project procurement, and (ii) training for the project performance monitoring system. The TA design, objectives and scope were considered relevant to the sector's needs.</p> <p>Evaluation of Inputs</p> <p>The Executing Agency of the TA was the Ministry of Agriculture and Water Resources (MAWR). The TA provided for 20 person-months of international and 52 person-months of domestic consultants in (i) project management, (ii) finance, (iii) community participation, (iv) design engineering and procurement, (v) training development, (vi) community development, (vii) training in water supply systems, (viii) training in sanitation systems, and (ix) social sector development. The level and quality of the inputs provided by the consultants was considered fully satisfactory.</p> <p>The TA was conducted in close collaboration with the ADB staff concerned. ADB provided inputs throughout the TA period including review missions, support from headquarters and the resident mission, and related reports, manuals, and handbooks. Participating government institutions; project implementation teams (project management unit and project implementation units); district, municipal and village administrations; vodokanals; and CDWUUs worked closely with the TA consultants and participated in the training workshops. All activities were coordinated with the MAWR, the Department of Rural Water Supply, the project implementation teams, and the Kyrgyz Union of Housing and Communal Services (the central vodokanal administration). The performance of both MAWR and ADB is considered satisfactory.</p> <p>Evaluation of Outputs</p> <p>Throughout the TA, monthly progress reports were submitted regularly to ADB and MAWR. An Inception report, interim report, draft final report, and final report were prepared and submitted. The final report included recommendations on (i) project implementation, (ii) design and procurement, (iii) financial management, (iv) community participation,</p>				

¹ These figures are not final, as settlement of final claims from consultants is pending.

² The account has not been closed, pending settlement of final claims.

³ ADB. 2000. *Community-Based Infrastructure Services Sector Project*. Loan 1742-KGZ (SF). Manila.

⁴ ADB. 1998. *Technical Assistance for the Kyrgyz Republic for Community-Based Infrastructure Services Sector Project*. Manila.

(v) training facilitation, and (vi) hygiene and sanitation education program. The findings and recommendations of the consultants were of a professionally satisfactory standard. All reports were well written and translated into Russian. Outputs of the TA were assessed by MAWR and were considered to be useful to all concerned. The reports were relevant and accessible to users, in particular since they were translated into Russian so that they could be distributed and understood easily.

A total of 13 training workshops (with a total participation of 544 persons) were conducted, comprising (i) two for community leaders (173 persons); (ii) one for NGO trainers (25 persons); (iii) three for CDWUU Board members (160 persons); (iv) one for community participation in vodokanals (17 persons); (v) two for procurement practices for government and project officials (59 persons); (vi) two for preparation of tender documents for the Project (27 persons); and (vii) two for project procurement procedures for national contractors (83 persons). The training activities undertaken included (i) establishing procedures for the design work to be undertaken under the loan project, (ii) providing case studies as working samples to assist in training community leaders and project implementation unit members, (iii) establishing preliminary bills of quantities for works and materials to assist in preparing cost estimates for core subprojects, (iv) testing realistic cost-recovery models, and (v) producing bills of quantities for use in the preparation of standard contract documents. On-the-job training was provided for the design engineers. Methodologies for financial analysis, project budgeting and accounting and financial management were prepared. A project performance monitoring system was developed and a computer-based project financial management system was designed.

Under the TA, priority was given to the creation of CDWUUs in the core eight rural subproject areas. Assistance was also provided in 42 other locations, and a total of 50 CDWUUs were established with support from the TA. The main activities involved developing model training programs. The TA also provided training for staff of the project implementation teams; the central, regional, district, and village levels of government; design institutes; and contractors. This training covered (i) design standards and procurement, (ii) improved water supply and sewerage system management, (iii) design criteria for system extension, and (iv) international accounting practices and tariff setting. The TA promoted the proposed hygiene and sanitation education program during the training sessions held for the CDWUU Board Members and NGO facilitators. The TA also provided assistance to the hygiene and sanitation coordinators regarding their roles and responsibilities in the first 50 CDWUUs. The management systems were used successfully, the hygiene and sanitation education program is being implemented, and the training programs and management systems were found to be practical and user friendly.

Overall Assessment and Rating

The TA fully accomplished its objective to strengthen the sector institutions and create sustainable management systems to support the smooth implementation of the loan project. The TA is rated as successful.

Major Lessons Learned

During subproject preparation, the MAWR and other agencies concerned need to work with and further assist the communities towards a better understanding of project principles, and proposals for overall sector reforms. In a number of cases it proved difficult for the expected beneficiaries to understand fully why they were required to make financial contributions to the subproject. This is a key concern for all water supply projects, especially in Central Asia. There was no history or tradition of paying for water under the former Soviet Union hence there is a need to alter attitudes. Adequate emphasis needs to be given to this during subproject preparation. Many communities encountered difficulties in raising the required 5% of subproject cost in cash, and providing a further 15% in kind. This led to implementation delays in the loan project. Insufficient community contributions create a risk of low quality of construction and lack of resources to sustain water supply systems.

Recommendations and Follow-Up Actions

There is a need to continue with the capacity-building program for CDWUUs under the loan project. To assist with further information dissemination regarding project principle and concepts relating to the establishment and operations of the CDWUUs, a project handbook is being published under the TA. The handbook will be distributed to each village participating in the Project, and will include (i) the CDWUU charter, and procedures for registration; (ii) project participation and financing requirements; (iii) summary data from core subprojects, including key data on the cost of the subproject, village contributions required in cash and in kind, tariff estimates for commissioned water supply systems; (iv) major Government decrees, including the ownership status of the new water supply systems by CDWUU, and tax regulations for CDWUUs; and (v) contact details of persons responsible for project implementation at the regional and central level.