

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE COMPLETION REPORT

Division: PRM

TA No., Country and Name			Amount Approved: \$465,000	
TA 4295-PAK : Capacity Building for Rural Development of the Federally Administered Tribal Areas			Revised Amount: \$485,733	
Executing Agency FATA Secretariat	Source of Funding TASF		Amount Undisbursed: \$131,880.28	Amount Utilized: \$353,852.72
TA Approval Date: 19 Dec 2003	TA Signing Date: 12 Apr 2004	Fielding of First Consultant(s): 2 Aug 2004	TA Completion Date Original: 30 Sep 2005 Actual: 31 Dec 2006	Account Closing Date Original: 30 Sep 2005 Actual: 25 July 2007
Description:				
<p>Development in the Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) falls significantly behind that of the adjoining settled districts of the North-West Frontier Province (NWFP) and the country as a whole, as reflected in the region's weak socioeconomic indicators. In 2003, the Government of Islamic Republic of Pakistan (GoP) requested the Asian Development Bank (ADB) to provide an advisory technical assistance (TA) for capacity building for rural development of the FATA to strengthen the planning and management capacity of key FATA development institutions, and FATA community-based organizations (CBO) to more effectively plan and implement rural development activities including the FATA Rural Development Project, proposed for ADB financing in 2004.</p>				
Expected Impact, Outcome and Outputs:				
<p>The TA was expected to enhance local government staff's and other stakeholders' capacity to conduct their new and expanded responsibilities related to basic services and poverty reduction in the FATA. It was expected that, upon TA completion, there would be improved planning and management effectiveness, and technical core competencies of targeted groups and institutions consistent with local rural development priorities. The TA had four expected specific outputs: (i) training needs assessment (TNA) for Secretariat officials, agency-level officials, CBO and community groups; (ii) training for Government officials (middle and senior managers) in competencies of strategic operational planning, budgeting, financial management, ICT (information, communication and technology) for effective planning, management and coordination, monitoring and evaluation, project design, and community development facilitation/participatory methodologies; (iii) training for community groups and CBOs in leadership management skill, participatory monitoring and evaluation, and effective group mobilization and organization; and (iv) Government staff trained in ADB policies and procedures.</p>				
Delivery of Inputs and Conduct of Activities				
<p>The TA was planned to be implemented over 18 months, commencing in April 2004 and ending in September 2005, with services of a consulting firm comprising a total of 6 person-months of international (institutional and local governance expertise) and 29 person-months of domestic experts (in project management; training; financial management; planning, monitoring, and evaluation; community development; and ICT). The Consultant was required to submit a brief inception report, quarterly progress reports, a draft final report and a final report. The formulation of the TA and the terms of reference (TOR) appeared adequate.</p>				
<p>The Consultant, engaged through quality- and cost-based selection method, was fielded in July 2004. The Inception Mission was conducted in August 2004. However, implementation encountered delays due to various reasons caused by both the Government and ADB. The project implementation was seriously hampered with the unstable situation of the FATA, frequent changes of ADB's project departments/officers, and lack of timely communications among the Consultant, the Executing Agency (EA), and ADB. The administration of the TA Project was delegated to PRM from June 2006, and the only TA reviewed mission was undertaken in July 2006. The TA completion date was extended twice for a cumulative period of 15 months. A major change in scope to include development of Composite Schedule of Rates (CSR) for FATA was approved on 11 September 2006 by ADB as requested by the Government.</p>				
<p>However, even with extensions of TA completion date, the training programs prepared by the Consultant and approved by the ADB still could not be fully delivered due to frequent changes and reforms in administration structure of FATA region (including the change of Governor NWFP, the transfer of two Secretaries of Governor Secretariat, the transfer of the Additional Secretary responsible for the TA, the creation of four new Secretaries in Governor Secretariat FATA, and the creation of a new autonomous organization – FATA Development Authority), unstable security situation in tribal agency areas concerned, difficulties to mobilizing trainers to meet rescheduled training program from the Consultant side, as well as weak commitment of the EA. All these events and changes in the priorities of FATA seriously impacted on the plans drawn out for training programs for capacity building as envisaged. Training programs for elected local councilors from FATA were completely dropped. The development of CSR was also dropped as NWFP offered to develop free of cost the CSR for FATA simultaneously with the NWFP's own CSR. The implementation of the TA was also adversely affected during its mid phase due to staff turnover within the ADB coupled with lack of demonstrated commitment and active participation on the part of the Government.</p>				

As a whole, the performance of both ADB and the EA is rated as “less than satisfactory”. The Consultant produced and submitted the Inception Report, Progress Reports, Draft Final Report and Final Report in accordance with the TOR of the Contract. The performance of the consultants was rated “satisfactory”, as reasons hampering their deliverables were beyond their control.

Evaluation of Outputs and Achievement of Outcome

This capacity building TA was mainly to deliver training to targeted groups. A TNA was undertaken in early 2005, after a lapse of more than a year from the TA approval and signing. A quality comprehensive TNA report was prepared in consultation with key stakeholders including staff of the Governor’s FATA Secretariat, Agencies, Line Departments and Community Groups. The information gathered during the TNA formed the basis for developing and designing training programs and a training plan for the capacity building.

The training plan included five training themes: (i) Planning and Monitoring, (ii) Budgeting and Financial Management, (iii) ICT, (iv) Community Participation and Gender, and (v) ADB Policies and Procedures. There are four levels of training identified: (i) Governor Secretariat based FATA Management & Directorates, Deputy Secretary/Directors, Financial and Accounts Staff, and ICT Staff, (ii) Line Agency level based Heads of Departments, Field Staff, Finance and Accounts Staff, (iii) Planning and Finance Cell Planning and Monitoring Staff, and Finance and Accounts Staff, and (iv) Elected Councilors, CBOs/NGOs based in the three project Tribal Agencies. The training plan covered 17 training modules for 528 participants.

Out of the 17 training modules designed, 6 training modules including Planning and Monitoring, Budgeting and Finance, Financial Management, ICT basic, ICT advance, and Gender and Community Participation, were delivered to 115 participants. For rest of the training modules, training materials were prepared and approved by the EA and ADB but the training programs could not be delivered before the revised TA completion date, due to various reasons mentioned above. Based on CWRD management’s decision, no further extension of TA completion date was granted; it was recommended to the EA that the remaining training programs could be delivered through other funds available. The trainees’ feedback for the 6 completed training programs showed 93% “average” and “good”.

The Inception Report, two Progress Reports, Draft Final Report, and Final Report were submitted on a timely manner, with acceptable quality. In general, the quality of the Consultant’s outputs was average.

Overall Assessment and Rating

Compared with the performance indicators/targets set in the TA logical framework, preparation and development of TNA fully achieved the target; while the number of trainees for community and CBOs exceeded the target, the number of trainees on budgeting, financial management and ICT was below the target; and targets for other training areas/themes required/identified were not achieved. Since only partial TA outputs were achieved, the overall rating of the TA is rated “Partly successful”. It is still too early to assess the level of planning and management effectiveness and technical core competencies of targeted groups at this stage.

Major Lessons

- A comprehensive work plan should be prepared and consensus should be achieved from all stake holders in early stage of the Project. This is especially true if the Project is of extended length and no person is available for the full length of the Project.
- Provision of continuity of leadership within the ADB for the projects is crucial to strengthen ADB’s demands on the Government in this respect.
- Duration of training should be commensurate with the topics to be covered and the background readiness of the participants. Last minutes changes in the training duration with no changes in the training contents should be avoided as it creates an impression that real intent is not capacity building but to finish a job.
- Frequent changes and reforms in administration structure of FATA region are unpredictable.
- Frequent changes of ADB project officers should be avoided or minimized.

Recommendations and Follow-Up Actions

Follow-up the delivery of remaining training modules developed under the TA to be financed by other funds available. The ongoing FATA Rural Development (loan-funded) Project could be a possible tool for such monitoring.

Prepared by: _____ Risa Zhijia Teng _____ Designation: _____ PAU Head _____