

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE COMPLETION REPORT

TA No. Country and Name: TA4537-PAK: Implementing Public Safety Reforms in Four Districts of the Province of Punjab			Amount approved: US\$ 950 000	
			Revised amount: N/A	
Executing Agency Planning and Development Department, Government of the Punjab, Lahore		Source of Funding Poverty Reduction Co-operation Fund	Amount undisbursed: US\$ 261,900	Amount utilized: US\$ 688,100
Dates			TA Completion Date	
Approval 23 December 2004	Signing 23 June 2005	Fielding of consultants 15 November 2005	Original: 31 December 2007	Actual: 26 January 2008
			Account Closing Date	
			Original: 31 December 2007	Actual: 26 June 2008
<p>Description: The lack of adequate institutional checks and balances on the police have undermined social regulation and public safety in Pakistan, and made the poor more vulnerable. A number of surveys have reported respondents consistently rating police at the lowest. Realizing that police requires a structural change, a new Police Order, 2002 (PO 2002) was introduced nationwide. PO 2002 is the most thorough reform achieved since the 1861 Police Act. It provides for setting up (i) federal, provincial, and District Public Safety Commissions (DPSCs) to increase public oversight and police accountability; (ii) district criminal justice coordination committees (DCJCCs); and (iii) separation of watch and ward from investigation, and creation of an independent prosecution service. The responsibilities of the DPSCs include approving the police plan, setting performance standards, and holding the district police chief accountable for performance against the plan. The TA's goal was to improve access to justice and public safety through better policing.</p>				
<p>Expected Impact, Outcomes and Output: The TA's goal was to improve access to justice and public safety through better policing for poor and vulnerable people, especially women, children, and minorities in Punjab. The purpose was to support PO 2002 implementation in four pilot districts of Punjab province (namely Gujranwala, Gujrat, Faisalabad and Multan), and develop a safer and more secure environment based on respect for human rights and equitable access to justice through policing that is more responsive to the needs of the poor and vulnerable.</p> <p>The TA envisaged work in three main areas which covered five outputs as follows:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Effective Community-Based Policing (Component 1): This had two outputs. Output 1 supported functional specialization and training of police officers, development of improved performance management regime, raising awareness of the PO and designing better complaint handling procedures. Output 2 supported the participation of a range of stakeholders in improving the performance of police, as well as capacity building of female police. 2. Effective Public Oversight Bodies (Component 2): Output 3 supported establishment and capacity building of DPSCs in each pilot district, and capacity building of DCJCCs. Output 4 helped in the integration of functions between the police and other public safety institutions, including local government establishment. 3. Effective Policy Dialogue (Component 3): Output 5 under this component included research setting out baselines on the performance of police and other safety institutions; and mechanisms to depoliticize police to bring about a professional and non-partisan police in the province. 				
<p>Delivery of Inputs and Conduct of Activities: Counterpart staff and other support as envisaged in the TA paper were provided by the Government in a timely and satisfactory manner. Activities were conducted as per annual and individual work plans which were prepared in consultations with the EA/IAs. Implementation of the TA was closely coordinated with the Access to Justice Program's (AJP) provincial steering committee and was found to be satisfactory in aligning the activities. The inputs originally comprised of 270 person months of consulting services. However during the course of TA implementation it was realized that TA does not adequately cover all aspect of the required support and therefore a Consultant Hiring Plan, envisaging an additional support for 68 person months was prepared and implemented through a minor change in the TA scope which was approved on 3 May 2007.¹ Provisions were also made to provide computers and related equipment to IAs to support various reform activities initiated under the TA. All inputs were provided effectively and adequately by the consultants. The quality of consultants' inputs also met EA/IAs expectations. The performance of the ADB and the EA/IAs was satisfactory.</p>				
<p>Evaluation of Outputs and Achievement of Outcomes: All TA outputs were achieved to the satisfaction of the EA/IAs. Details on the outputs of the TA are summarized below:</p> <p>Output 1: This output required various activities for improving criminal investigations by police. Time bound plans for separation of the investigation function in the pilot districts were prepared and adopted by the respective district police. A manual of guidelines for conducting investigations in a scientific, professional and rights compliant manner was prepared for the Punjab Police, the first of its kind. Training needs analysis survey was conducted to make a realistic assessment of police training requirements at various levels. In order to raise professional standards, training plans were prepared for all pilot districts. More than 300 police officers were trained in various areas such as investigation procedures, rights and ethics, policing standards, community policing principles, police order and basic computer skills. This has greatly assisted in improving professional levels and quality of police services in pilot districts police. Improved monitoring and performance evaluation systems were prepared for the Punjab Police. Guidelines were also prepared for consultations on rights of poor and other vulnerable classes. The systems have provided improved internal accountability systems for Punjab police. Assistance was provided to the Home Department in formulation of a regime for the application of forensic science in criminal investigations. Assistance was also provided in establishment of a project office for the creation of the forensic agency at the provincial level.</p> <p>Output 2: This output aimed at the introduction of community policing principles in the pilot districts. A number of community policing projects were initiated in the pilot districts, such as neighbourhood and business watch programmes and other more innovative programmes like police station based alternate dispute resolution systems, police complaints and request for assistance handling, and women help desk initiatives. Community participation resulted in improving police perception and opened police to public scrutiny in target districts. The TA supported establishment of Community Police Liaison Committee, a PO institution to promote police community participation at Faisalabad. Four awareness workshops on community policing were also held in the pilot districts for the police officers, opinion leaders and general citizens.</p>				

¹ Pakistan Resident Mission memorandum dated 2 May, 2007

Output 3: This output aimed at ensuring effective working of the public oversight bodies as provided in the PO in the pilot districts. Rules of procedure for DPSCs were prepared by the TA which have been promulgated by Government. The rules are now being followed throughout the province. Local and provincial policing plans were prepared for the district police of the pilot districts and the Punjab Police. In addition procedures were also prepared for effective consultations on preparation of policing plans by the district police and their approval by the DPSCs. This has assisted in the introduction of policing by objectives, incorporation of local priorities in police working and monitoring police performance against these objectives and priorities.

Output 4: This output aimed at functional integration of PO and LGO institutions in as much as public safety function is concerned. Instructions on the role of Zila Nazims (heads of municipalities) vis-à-vis police oversight were prepared for the Government. Work was undertaken for the development of an integrated district information system on crime and police services. For this purpose computer applications were prepared for digital crime mapping, police vehicles tracking system and police human resource management. The information system has resulted in increased transparency and efficiency in the delivery of public safety services.

Output 5: This output aimed at contributing to policy dialogue on national and provincial police reforms. An access to information policy for the Punjab Police was prepared which has been adopted by them. This policy is likely to promote increased public scrutiny of police work. Websites for the Punjab Police and four pilot district police were prepared to facilitate citizens in accessing primary information on police and accessing their services. Concerned police officers were also trained in the administration of these websites. A website was also prepared for the EA for the similar purposes. The websites have led to increased sharing of information with the public and thereby increased public scrutiny of performance of these agencies. The TA contributed to increasing awareness on issues in the justice sector by publishing bi-monthly newsletters which were shared with the EA/IAs, Government and other stakeholders. Similarly various research works were also undertaken by the TA. These included a survey on citizens' crime perception (first survey of its kind in Pakistan), survey on public perception on police and various reports on historical trends in prevalence, registration and investigation of crime. These reports were shared with the concerned stakeholders and are likely to form basis for informed decision making on public safety issues. Improved procedures for handling of complaints were prepared for Punjab Police. The procedures are likely to help in depoliticization of police and strengthening internal accountability systems. Computer applications for management of official libraries and monitoring of development schemes were prepared. These applications are likely to help EA/IAs in better management of their office records and project preparation and monitoring procedures.

Overall Assessment and Rating: The TA has contributed towards the implementation and operationalization of PO in as far as the development of processes and procedures are concerned. It has developed required procedural manuals, software, rules of business to lay the groundwork for the conduct of scientific investigations and improved public oversight of police. It has piloted many initiatives that demonstrate the need for fully operationalizing PO in rest of the country. The long-term sustainability will however require continued support and commitment of the government to pursue the reforms. The TA could have done a better job in putting in place a system to better monitor and evaluate the impact of the initiatives being supported and ensuring their institutionalization. While the assistance provided by the TA has resulted in two legislations, the Punjab Forensic Science Agency Act, 2007 and the Punjab District Public Safety and Police Complaint Commission, Conduct of Business Rules, 2007, institutionalizing many of the outputs will still require IAs ownership. The overall TA rating is successful however since it provided with much needed operationalization framework and demonstration effect for various components of the PO.

Major Lessons: Major lessons learned during the implementation of this TA are as under:

1. Design and implementation of justice sector reforms is difficult and time consuming. Therefore concerted and sustained efforts are required on continual basis for furthering and consolidating the reform initiated under this TA. Various modules and plans prepared will need more time for adoption and institutionalization.
2. While the inputs and outputs were well received, there are challenges faced in terms of their adoption and institutionalization. EA/IAs need to maintain their commitment beyond receiving outputs and training to ensure meaningful impact.
3. There is a severe resource constraint at the field level and therefore, it is difficult to meet the expectations of the counterparts which are more for the tangibles and less for technical assistance. Future TAs should maintain a balance in this regard, and should leverage Government's budgetary resource allocation for such tangibles.
4. At the district level continuous changes of District Police Officers negatively impacts TA progress. This is a common problem afflicting the civil service in Pakistan as well. In future, EA/IA should be asked to provide continuity to ensure better implementation of the reform process.

Recommendations and Follow-up Action: Prior to the completion of the TA, the Government of the Punjab requested the ADB to continue its support and also geographically extend the scope of the project to two more districts, Lahore and Chakwal, and to thematically broaden the scope by including additional activities under existing five outputs; and add three more outputs with complete new set of activities. In view of this request and earlier success achieved by the TA, a follow up TA4922 has been initiated to assist in sustaining and monitoring the implementation of on going reforms. The success of follow-up will be based on continued ownership of the Punjab government and relevant institutional and legal mechanism in place. In line with ADB's emerging strategy, second generational efforts in this area can be anchored on Government efficiency reforms that are now being supported by ADB, with specific focus on institutionalizing the work done under this TA.

Prepared by	Saad Paracha	Designation	Gender Development & Governance Officer, Pakistan Resident Mission
-------------	--------------	-------------	--