

TA COMPLETION REPORT

Division: SASS

TA NO./NAME: TA No. 2547-PAK: Nonformal Education for Rural Women Project				TA AMOUNT APPROVED: \$600,000	
				REVISED AMOUNT: N.A.	
EXECUTING AGENCY: Ministry of Education, Islamabad			FUND SOURCE: JSF	TA AMOUNT UNDISBURSED: \$78,450.02	TA AMOUNT UTILIZED: \$521,549.98
REPORT DATE: 30 Sep 2000	APPROVAL DATE: 23 Mar 1996	SIGNING DATE: 23 Mar 1996	CONSULTANT FIELDING DATE: Sep 1996	CLOSING: ORIGINAL: 31 Oct 1996 ACTUAL: Dec 2000	
<p>TA DESCRIPTION</p> <p>Pakistan's social indicators remain among the poorest in the world. Its literacy rate is only 37 percent—49 percent for males and 24 percent for females. Over 90 percent of rural women cannot read or write. The Government has initiated major policy reforms for expansion of basic education through the Social Action Program and other education projects as well as operationalizing their commitment by signing the <i>World Declaration of Education for All</i>. Nonformal Education (NFE) is an important component of the formal school system. In 1996, ADB provided the Government of Pakistan a project preparatory technical assistance to assist the Government in exploring innovative approaches to NFE for rural women aged 15 to 25.</p> <p>TA OBJECTIVES AND SCOPE</p> <p>Pakistan's plan to improve and expand NFE to reach rural women is in line with ADB's strategy in the country. To support the Government's plan, the objective of the TA was to undertake an in-depth analysis of the NFE sector and prepare an NFE project for rural women to assist the Government in socioeconomic development of rural women aged 15 to 25 years old. The TA consisted of four components: (i) in-depth review of ongoing NFE programs; (ii) evaluation of NFE delivery system including teaching strategies, learning materials, and effective use of appropriate communication and instructional technologies; (iii) examination of institutional capacity; and (iv) comprehensive assessment of financing and resource mobilization for NFE.</p> <p>TA INPUTS EVALUATION</p> <p>The TA terms of reference, which were timely and relevant, to the existing situation in NFE in Pakistan, were further strengthened during its implementation to ensure strong beneficiary participation the feasibility study. The feasibility study was conducted in three phases. The first phase focused on an in-depth analysis of the NFE sector. The second phase focused on identification of issues and constraints faced by NFE programs in terms of policy, quality, access, and funding. The third phase focused on the formulation of the Project. The TA promoted productive inter-relationships among stakeholders, including nongovernment organizations (NGOs), and introduced a beneficiary participatory approach in designing a Nonformal Education for Rural Women Project, incorporating pertinent social concerns.</p> <p>The team of consultants consisted of six international (13.5 person-months) and six domestic experts (13 person-months). The Government established a Project Implementation Unit headed by a Project Manager and provided counterpart staff. The TA was implemented from September 1996 to July 1997. About 3,500 of target beneficiaries and 1,300 other stakeholders were interviewed in selected</p>					

Prepared by: Motilal Sharma

Designation: Principal Education Specialist

districts in Punjab, Sindh, Balochistan and NWFP during the study. The consultants conducted workshops with NGOs and beneficiaries, and focus group discussions to ensure adequate participation by all stakeholders. In 1998, the NFE model developed during the feasibility study was tested in one village each: (i) Balochistan; and (ii) Punjab. The consultants were again fielded in 2000 to update the socioeconomic profiles of beneficiaries before further processing of the Project. Due to additional work requirements and pilot testing of the proposed project design TA was kept open until July 2000. The recommendations made by the consultants were endorsed by the participating agencies in the Government and ADB. The consultants' work was satisfactory.

TA OUTPUTS EVALUATION

The consultants completed field studies covering more than 20 selected districts in four provinces. The consultants produced more than 19 technical reports covering NFE curriculum design, management aspects and linkages of project implementation, case studies, financial and economic analysis and cost-benefit returns of the Project, NFE training needs assessment, sample manuals of instruction and learning techniques, and assessment techniques of NFE effectiveness. In addition, the TA assisted the Government in developing policy frameworks for NFE, NGO accreditation and participation, and building of incentives for private sector and community-based organization (CBO) involvement in NFE. This comprehensive work provided the basis for the development of the project proposal for nonformal education for rural women aged 15 to 25 in Punjab. The TA reports were delivered on time and its outputs were highly appreciated by the Government. The outputs of the feasibility study are considered to be successful.

TA OVERALL ASSESSMENT/RATING

In spite of initial problems in setting up of the project office, the feasibility study was conducted successfully with full support of the Federal Ministry of Education, Department of Social Welfare, Women Development and Baitul Mul (Punjab), District Women's Development Councils, NGOs, and NGO Industrial Homes. It provided a framework for the coordination of NFE activities at the grassroots level. The TA played a catalytic role in bringing together stakeholders in NFE to share information, experience, and recognize each other's role and the need to improve the quality of NFE including livelihood skills as well as mobilization of resources through community involvement and social marketing. Therefore the TA is rated successful.

MAJOR LESSONS LEARNED

ADB's intensive supervision helped the consultants to start their work in complete understanding of the TA objectives, and in establishing good relations with the Government and participating institutions. The Team Leader and local consultants were fielded first to undertake field studies and beneficiary interviews and data gathering. This provided a good starting point for the international consultants and a sense of project ownership by the local consultants. The consulting firm was cooperative in facilitating effective communications with the local experts, Government and ADB, and maintained its commitments to the TA. The stakeholder workshops and focus group discussions served to generate commitment for and ownership for the proposed Project among stakeholders.

FOLLOW-UP ACTION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the findings of the PPTA, ADB conducted Fact-finding and Appraisal Missions in 2001. However, the Government of Punjab indicated it was not ready to continue with the Project due to budgetary constraints. While the proposed project for nonformal education for women did not materialize, ADB should continue to conduct policy dialogue with the government emphasizing the importance of promoting women's literacy. ADB should indicate its willingness to consider financing of a women's literacy project when conditions permit. ADB should consider providing ADTA to improve the capacity of the sector institutions to address issues of adult women's nonformal education

