

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE COMPLETION REPORT

Division: Capacity Development and Governance

TA No., Country and Name TA 6296-REG: Developing Pro-Poor Governance Capability and Knowledge			Amount Approved: \$875,000					
			Revised Amount: N/A					
Executing Agency: Asian Development Bank	Source of Funding: Poverty Reduction Cooperation Fund		TA Amount Undisbursed \$86,464.04	TA Amount Utilized \$788,535.96				
TA Approval Date: December 2005	TA Signing Date: N.A.	Fielding of First Consultant(s): 1 March 2006	TA Completion Date <table style="width: 100%; border: none;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Original</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Actual</td> </tr> <tr> <td>30 November 2007</td> <td>15 January 2008</td> </tr> </table>		Original	Actual	30 November 2007	15 January 2008
Original	Actual							
30 November 2007	15 January 2008							
			Account Closing Date <table style="width: 100%; border: none;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Original:</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Actual:</td> </tr> <tr> <td>30 Nov 2007</td> <td>21 November 2008</td> </tr> </table>		Original:	Actual:	30 Nov 2007	21 November 2008
Original:	Actual:							
30 Nov 2007	21 November 2008							
Description The regional technical assistance (RETA) was in response to the need of developing member countries (DMCs) for acquiring knowledge and capability to mitigate risks of corruption and to improve the performance of public services. It consisted of three components: (a) design and conduct of a corruption prevention training program; (b) mentoring and coaching on application of the citizen report card (CRC) methodology and continuous improvement and benchmarking (CIB) techniques in improving the delivery of public services; and (c) upgrading of the CRC and CIB Learning Tool Kits. The first component provided assistance to the Malaysia Anti-Corruption Academy (MACA) in the design, development, and conduct of pilot training programs on corruption prevention. In the second component, mentoring and coaching on CRC and CIB were carried out with educational and training institutes in selected DMCs. It also involved partnering with and training of civil servants at subnational governments in selected DMCs on the application of CRC and CIB tools. The third component involved the production of upgraded versions of the CRC and CIB Learning Tool Kits based on field experiences and using the feedback from the public service agencies, citizens' groups, and educational and training institutes.								
Expected Impact, Outcome and Outputs The expected impact of the RETA was to strengthen DMC knowledge and capacity in using practical tools to prevent corruption and improve the performance of delivery of public services. The intended outcome is the development of institutional capacities to (i) provide training and support to DMCs in the design and implementation of anti-corruption programs; (ii) promote the utilization of CRC methodology to conduct social audits of public services; and (iii) promote the utilization of CIB techniques to ensure that organizational resources are managed to deliver effective, efficient, affordable, and equitable public services. The desired outputs of the RETA comprised (i) training course design on developing a corruption prevention program; (ii) conduct of a training course on developing corruption prevention program for 30 DMC officials; (iii) MACA sustainability plan for the delivery of training courses on corruption prevention to DMCs; (iv) training of four educational/training institutes on the use of CRC methodology and CIB techniques; (v) two small projects on CRC and two small projects on CIB; (vi) incorporation of CRC and CIB in the teaching and training curricula of four educational/training institutes which had been mentored and coached on CRC and CIB application; and (vii) updated versions of CRC and CIB Learning Tool Kits. Achievement of the outputs, outcome and impact were supported by the design, scope and terms of reference (TOR) of the consulting services.								
Delivery of Inputs and Conduct of Activities The TOR provided for 3 international consultants intermittently for a total of 28.3 person months and one national consultant for 20 person months. The performance of the consultants was satisfactory as measured by the quality and timeliness of their reports, course participants' feedback, and the PERs. The project purpose, overall design, TORs, and implementation arrangements were generally appropriate. The project was formulated and implemented in close consultation with key stakeholders and experts in the region. The design and conduct of the training course on corruption prevention programs as well as the development of instructional materials involved the active participation of highly experienced anti-corruption experts, and trainers from Hong Kong, Malaysia, Singapore, Philippines, and United Kingdom. The course design and instructional materials were pilot-tested prior to the final run by MACA in Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia and selected training institutes in Bangladesh, India, and the Philippines.								
The project also worked effectively with regional professional networks such as the Network of Asia Pacific Schools and Institutes of Public Administration and Governance (NAPSIPAG), the Eastern Regional Organization for Public Administration (EROPA), and the ADB-OECD Anti-Corruption Initiative in achieving the desired project outcomes. The strong interest that the project generated among different DMC institutes necessitated minor adjustments in implementation modalities, thus enabling the project to do more with a wider reach of beneficiaries. The quality of inputs, particularly the consultants and resource persons, were outstanding. Participants to the training courses and mentoring and coaching programs provided strongly supportive and complimentary feedback on the design and conduct of the course. The RETA inputs provided a cost effective means to contribute to addressing the DMC needs in learning practical tools and techniques to improve transparency, accountability, responsiveness, and efficiency in the delivery of public services.								
Evaluation of Outputs and Achievement of Outcome Outputs were efficiently and satisfactorily delivered within budget and without major changes to the scope of the TA. The RETA exceeded targets in terms of more DMCs as beneficiaries and more anti-corruption training programs. Major outputs included:								
Anti-corruption training (total of seven training programs covering 166 participants from 19 DMCs): (i) Workshop on training course design and development in MACA, 18–20 December 2006; (ii) Two training course designs on developing an anti-corruption program (two-week program for middle-level officials and one-week program senior executives); (iii) Pilot training								

on anti-corruption conducted by MACA in Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia on 11–22 June 2007 for 27 Malaysian public officials; (iv) Two-week anti-corruption training program conducted by MACA in Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia on 27 August–7 September 2007 for 25 mid-level officials from 15 DMCs; (v) One-week anti-corruption training program conducted by MACA in Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia on 10–14 September for 21 senior executives from 8 DMCs; (vi) Two-week anti-corruption training program conducted by the Institute of Public Enterprises (IPE) in collaboration with NAPSIPAG in Hyderabad, India on 18-22 June 2007 for 17 Indian public officials; (vii) One-week anti-corruption training program conducted by the National College of Public Administration and Governance (NCPAG) of the University of the Philippines (UP) in collaboration with NAPSIPAG in Diliman, Quezon City, Philippines on 9–13 July 2007 for 22 Filipino public officials; (viii) Two-week anti-corruption training program conducted by the Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre (BPATC) in collaboration with NAPSIPAG in Bangladesh on 16–27 September for 28 Bangladesh civil servants; and (ix) Two-week anti-corruption training program conducted by the University of Dhaka in collaboration with NAPSIPAG in Dhaka, Bangladesh on 19–31 October 2007 for 26 public officials. MACA and UP-NCPAG are now using the training modules developed under the RETA.

Promotion of CRC and CIB toolkits: (i) Launch of the project and CRC and CIB Learning Tool Kits on 16 July 2006 at the ADB Headquarters, which was attended by 120 policymakers, service managers, academics, and representatives of different development agencies in the Philippines; (ii) Project website (<http://www.adb.org/Projects/e-toolkit/anti-corrupt.asp>) to access relevant project information and the CRC and CIB Learning Tool Kits; (iii) Special session on CRC and CIB at the Centre for the Study of Law and Governance, Jawaharlal Nehru University, November 2006; (iv) Special session on CRC and CIB at the Third International Managing for Development Results Roundtable held in Hanoi in February 2007; (v) Conduct of sessions on CRC and CIB during the NAPSIPAG annual conferences held in December 2006 in Sydney, Australia and in December 2007 in Manila, Philippines; (vi) CRC-CIB mentoring and coaching of 12 faculty and staff in UP-NCPAG (Quezon City, Philippines), six instructors and staff in National Institute of Management (NIM) (Karachi, Pakistan), 10 staff in South Asia Partnership – Pakistan (Pakistan), and 15 faculty and staff in Center for Population and Policy Studies (CPPS), Gadjah Mada University (Indonesia), and 25 civil servants and staff in the Office of the Ombudsman (Islamabad, Pakistan); (vii) CRC-CIB pilots to diagnose and recommend measures to improve (i) delivery of medical supplies at a public hospital in District Mianwali (Punjab, Pakistan); (ii) educational services in Districts of Matiari (Sindh, Pakistan), (iii) case resolution at the Office of the Ombudsman (Pakistan); (iv) waste management in Yogyakarta (Indonesia); (v) health services, issuance of business licenses, and issuance of building permits in Quezon City (Philippines); (vi) solid waste collection in Makati City (Philippines); and (vii) water services in Naawan Municipality (Philippines); (viii) Incorporation of the CRC and CIB in the training curricula of NIM, CPPS, and UP-NCPAG; and Upgraded versions of CRC and CIB Learning Tool Kits. Service delivery initiatives have been launched by selected government agencies in Indonesia, Pakistan, and Philippines.

The TOR was met and exceeded through provision of additional outputs. The TA is considered to have been effective in achieving the desired outputs with quality reports/training provided on time. Reporting requirements were met. In evaluating outputs the performance of the ADB has been ranked as highly satisfactory. The RETA enhanced the capacities of participating educational and training institutes and service providers; the result of which is long term benefits to their countries through improved services. In the Philippines, CIB is currently being adapted in the judiciary with the assistance of UP-NCPAG and sponsorship of the Rule of Law Effectiveness (ROLE) project funded by the United States Agency for International Development (USAID). ROLE-USAID also financed an anti-corruption training program conducted by UP-NCPAG. Subsequently, the Millennium Challenge Account in the Philippines will finance a series of regional anti-corruption training courses in 2008 to be delivered by UP-NCPAG in collaboration with the Office of the Ombudsman. The Philippine Anti-Graft Commission has engaged UP-NCPAG to adapt CIB in 16 executive agencies in 2008.

Overall Assessment and Rating

The TA is rated as highly successful, reflecting the delivery of outputs within the planned schedule, surpassing targets, the strongly positive feedback, and the indications that the training and toolkits provided have contributed to positive changes in behavior and attitude of participants and beneficiaries.

Major Lessons

The success of the RETA is attributable to many factors: (i) emphasis on careful analysis and meticulous planning of activities; (ii) consultation with, and participation of, target beneficiaries; (iii) partnership and collaboration with reputable educational and training institutes in the region; (iv) flexibility in the implementation of the project; and (v) effective management and supervision. Insofar as CRC and CIB center on bringing about reforms and innovations, their effective application invariably face change-resisting behavior and skepticism. There are always responsible leaders and staff who are willful and committed in bringing about the desired changes. The key is to work with them and enhance their capacities. Capacity development is also a continuing process—which cannot, be fast-tracked. By partnering with educational and training institutions, sustainability of gains and long-term benefits are ensured.

Recommendations and Follow-Up Actions

The RETA has generated strong interest and uptake from many institutes and individuals in DMCs. The upgraded CRC and CIB Learning Tool Kits should be disseminated not only to more educational and training institutions in the region, but also to service organizations. A support system should likewise be established either within NAPSIPAG and/ or through ADB's loan TA operations to promote the utilization of CRC and CIB as well as to further enhance capacities on their application. The RETA did not have sufficient time to observe and evaluate the outcomes of most CRC and CIB pilots. The gestation periods and high transaction costs of such sub-projects should be considered in the design of similar projects in the future. Support to practical training on planning and implementation of corruption prevention measures should likewise be considered by ADB's operational departments.