

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE COMPLETION REPORT¹

Division: PNRM

TA 4272 TIM: Capacity Building to Strengthen Public Sector Management and Governance Skills (Phase 2)			Amount Approved: \$550,000															
			Revised Amount: NA															
Executing Agency: National Directorate of District Administration	Source of Funding: TASF		TA Amount Undisbursed \$28,469.98	TA Amount Utilized \$521,530.02														
<table style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="text-align: center; padding: 5px;">Date</td> <td colspan="2"></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">Approval 18 Dec 2003</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Signing 11 Feb 2004</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Fielding of Consultants 15 January 2006</td> </tr> </table>			Date			Approval 18 Dec 2003	Signing 11 Feb 2004	Fielding of Consultants 15 January 2006	<table style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td colspan="2" style="padding: 5px;">TA Completion Date</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">Original 30 Nov 2005</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Actual 31 Aug 2008</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2" style="padding: 5px;">TA Closing Date</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">Original: 30 Nov 2005</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Actual: 30 Sep 2008</td> </tr> </table>		TA Completion Date		Original 30 Nov 2005	Actual 31 Aug 2008	TA Closing Date		Original: 30 Nov 2005	Actual: 30 Sep 2008
Date																		
Approval 18 Dec 2003	Signing 11 Feb 2004	Fielding of Consultants 15 January 2006																
TA Completion Date																		
Original 30 Nov 2005	Actual 31 Aug 2008																	
TA Closing Date																		
Original: 30 Nov 2005	Actual: 30 Sep 2008																	
<p>Description</p> <p>The Asian Development Bank (ADB) started strengthening local-level public administration in Timor-Leste in 2002, even before the restoration of independence (TA 3839-TIM: <u>Capacity Building to Develop Public Sector Management and Governance Skills</u> was approved by ADB on 05 March 2002). Whilst most external support was channeled into central agencies, ADB support had focused on district-level skills to plan and deliver public services. TA 3839-TIM was regarded as successful and the Government of Timor-Leste requested a follow-on TA, which was processed in time to ensure the technical assistance continued uninterrupted. TA 4272-TIM, the Phase 2 project, would continue to develop the competencies of district officers, as well as work with sub-district officers and village leaders. The new TA would continue to strengthen the training institutions in Timor-Leste, particularly the <i>Instituto Nacional da Administracao Publica</i> (INAP) or the National Institute of Public Administration of the Ministério da Administração Estatal (MAE) or the Ministry of State Administration as the lead government agency responsible for the professional training and career development of civil servants at the national and local levels. The Phase 2 project would help mainstream the use of mobile assistance teams and would help institutionalize continuous and needs-based in-service training for local authorities.</p> <p>Expected Impact, Outcome and Outputs</p> <p>The expected impact of the TA was to have an efficient and responsive local public administrative system in Timor-Leste. The intended outcome was to enhance the operational and functional skills of local authorities in service delivery. The TA would help do the following: (i) train local authorities in problem-solving, working with others, quantitative techniques, managing information, leadership and management, project development, and local development administration; (ii) train local trainers in training development and management; (iii) provide institutional support mechanisms for continuous, needs-based, and decentralized delivery of training to local authorities; and (iv) improve, indigenize, and disseminate learning products for local authorities. The design, scope and terms of reference (TOR) of the consulting services were appropriate to achieve the desired outputs, outcome and impact.</p> <p>Delivery of Inputs and Conduct of Activities</p> <p>The TOR provided for three international consultants rendering services for a total of 30.23 person months (or 907 person-days). Consultant mobilization was delayed by two years because the Phase I TA ran beyond its closing date. The performance of the consultants was satisfactory as measured by the quality and timeliness of their reports, feedback from trainees and counterparts, and the performance evaluation reports. The TA purpose, overall design, TORs, and implementation arrangements were generally appropriate. MAE-INAP took the lead role in the implementation of training interventions, with TA consultants providing key backup support and mentoring and coaching. Participation was key in engendering project ownership and effectiveness of inputs. Local knowledge and expertise guided the planning, organizing, implementation, and monitoring and evaluation of TA activities. Coordination and collaboration with other donors were actively pursued during planning and implementation as well as in reporting progress and performance of the TA. This led to complementation of activities and efficient utilization of TA resources.</p> <p>The conduct and delivery of cluster-and-district-based training programs by the mobile training teams had several advantages. First, it provided opportunities for trainees to receive training on schedules most convenient to them and without taking them away from their work for long periods. For example, a five-day training course could be taken over a five-week period (e.g., one day in a week) close to their workplaces as compared to five straight days in a distant location. Second, it was more cost-effective, i.e., doing and achieving more with less money. Third, it built the skills and confidence of trainers in the field. Fourth, it expanded the pool of trainers other than in INAP and it strengthened the institutional capacity to deliver continuous and demand-driven quality training programs. Finally, field-based training provided a more facilitative and self-paced learning environment.</p>																		

¹ In preparing any country program or strategy, financing any project, or by making any designation of or reference to a particular territory or geographic area in this document, the Asian Development Bank does not intend to make any judgments as to the legal or other status of any territory or area.

Evaluation of Outputs and Achievement of Outcome

Desired outputs were efficiently and satisfactorily delivered within budget and without major changes to the scope of the TA despite the social and political disturbances in the country. Output targets were exceeded.

A total of 158 training courses were delivered across six competency areas (identified previously in TA3839-TIM) for 91 district officials, 195 sub-district officers, and 442 traditional village leaders – of which, 112 training courses were conducted by the mobile training teams and INAP in the districts and 49 were conducted by INAP in Dili.

All training modules (except the module on managing information, which was taken on by another donor) were enhanced, published, and disseminated. To the extent possible, the modules contained local examples and cases. Refinements in the training modules developed under the previous TA took into account the inputs and feedback of INAP trainers and mobile training team members as well as the updated inventory of desired competencies. Three training models not included in the original TA design were added: (1) local government resource management; (2) community development; and (3) effective management of training. Like the previous ones, each of these modules consisted of reference materials and trainer's guides, which were written in English and Indonesian languages. The training modules developed with TA support are being utilized by INAP in its training programs for different groups of participants. Other development partners have also used the modules in their training programs.

INAP trainers and the mobile training team members were given reinforcement training on effective management of training. Under the TA, they planned, organized and managed cluster-and-district-based training programs themselves; and in the process they strengthened their skills in various aspects of training management including fund administration. All training programs were monitored and evaluated using standardized and uniform assessment instruments. As part of training equipment support, INAP received seven computers, two LCD projectors, and one server. The system of accreditation of training service providers was not pursued since INAP believed that there were very limited options in the Country and that INAP was not yet ready to implement such a system.

A computerized personnel database system was also developed and installed at INAP. The system stores and keeps track of basic information on training programs attended by district and sub-district personnel – which is very useful in programming training resources and for making decisions related to human resource development.

Course evaluation results indicated that the participants were satisfied with the content and methodology as well as the management and administration of the training programs. A tracer study was undertaken and most respondents reported that they had found the courses practical and useful. The tracer study confirmed that the training programs contributed to the improvement in proficiency levels of the participants in the six competency areas that they had been trained on, and that they had been able to apply at work what they had learned. TA reporting requirements were adequately met.

Overall Assessment and Rating

The TA is rated as highly successful. The operational and functional skills of local authorities were enhanced. The quality of outputs was high and outputs targets were exceeded. Feedback from participants, counterparts and development partners was strongly positive, and the tracer study confirmed that trainees were applying newly acquired competencies in the field, despite limited funding from the central government.

Major Lessons

The success of the TA is largely attributable to the following: (1) the TA built on the experiences and notable gains of an earlier ADB TA; (2) emphasis on careful analysis and methodical planning of activities; (3) partnership with and active participation of MAE-INAP and mobile training teams; (4) ownership of the activities by MAE-INAP and mobile training teams; (5) recognition of the fact that capacity development is a long and continuing process – which should not, and cannot be fast-tracked; (6) effective collaboration and coordination with other donors; (7) adherence to quality standards of training; (8) low key and professional approach of TA consultants; (9) obtaining the best value-for-money; and (10) effective management and supervision of the TA. These lessons are relevant to both stable and post-conflict situations.

Recommendations and Follow-Up Actions

The lack of capacity in the government remains a key development challenge. Public offices are undersourced and most of them have few technically capable staff. In addition to being the key government agency responsible for civil service education and training, INAP has been recently given an expanded mandate to offer degree programs in public administration in collaboration with the National University of Timor *Lorosa'e* and the Ministry of Education. Within this context and in view of the effectiveness of ADB assistance to MAE-INAP, the Government has requested ADB for further assistance on capacity building. There is a strong rationale for a follow-on TA to further enhance professional competencies of civil servants, particularly at the sub-national units of government, as well as to continue the capacity building of INAP to meet the increasing demands for its services.