

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE COMPLETION REPORT¹

Division: PAHQ

TA No., Country and Name			Amount Approved: \$250,000									
TA 3501-TIM: Environmental Assessment Capacity Improvement			Revised Amount:									
Executing Agency: UNTAET		Source of Funding: TASF	Amount Undisbursed: \$14,422	Amount Utilized: \$235,578								
TA Approval Date: 15 September 2000	TA Signing Date: 27 January 2001	Fielding of First Consultants: 06 April 2001	<table style="width: 100%; border: none;"> <tr> <td colspan="2" style="padding: 5px;">TA Completion Date</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">Original: 30 Sept 2001</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Actual: 30 June 2003</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2" style="padding: 5px;">Account Closing Date Actual:</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">Original: 30 September 2001</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">13 January 2004</td> </tr> </table>		TA Completion Date		Original: 30 Sept 2001	Actual: 30 June 2003	Account Closing Date Actual:		Original: 30 September 2001	13 January 2004
TA Completion Date												
Original: 30 Sept 2001	Actual: 30 June 2003											
Account Closing Date Actual:												
Original: 30 September 2001	13 January 2004											
<p>Description</p> <p>Following the independence of Timor-Leste in 1999, all institutional capacity for environmental management was lost. As a result, staff had little or no training in the area of environmental planning and management. Building national government capacity for environmental management was particularly important given the number of large-scale post-reconstruction activities that took place following independence, which required environmental monitoring. Timor-Leste inherited a series of Indonesian environmental management laws, regulations and standards. However, enforcement and implementation of these environmental management laws by the Environmental Management Unit of the United Nations Transitional Administration in East Timor (UNTAET) was weak, as a result of limited technical capacity. In addition, following independence, very little environmental data existed to allow for informed environmental planning and policy-making, since much of this information was either destroyed or was located in Jakarta, Indonesia.</p> <p>The technical assistance (TA) aimed to strengthen capacity for environmental and natural resources management in Timor-Leste. The main objectives of the TA were to: (i) implement appropriate environmental and natural resource management techniques in the assessment and execution of development projects in Timor-Leste, and (ii) prepare an environmental profile for the country. Specific goals included: (i) building basic awareness of appropriate environmental and natural resource management techniques, capacity and skills to implement the environmental impact assessment process; (ii) identify critical environmental issues in Timor-Leste; (iii) review the existing environmental policies and legislation, and recommend appropriate modifications; (iv) initiate development of a suitable environmental management institution; and (v) facilitate implementation of environmental impact assessment and monitoring procedures.</p> <p>Expected Impact, Outcome and Outputs</p> <p>The goal (impact) of the TA was to develop environmental and natural resources management capacity. Its purposes (outcome) were to (i) establish professional capacity to undertake and monitor environmental sustainability, and (ii) carry out an assessment of Timor-Leste's most pressing environmental issues. The outputs were: (i) training and capacity development of at least six Timor-Leste's staff in professional preparation and monitoring of EIAs; (ii) recommend, as appropriate, environmental and natural resources laws, legislation, and regulations; (iii) preparation of an institutional plan for environmental management in Timor-Leste; and (iv) preparation of an environmental profile for Timor-Leste.</p> <p>Delivery of Inputs and Conduct of Activities</p> <p>The TA was administered by UNTAET as the executing agency (EA). The TA, including terms of reference, was relevant and well-formulated. The design and monitoring framework was also well-designed. An international consulting company was engaged to implement the TA. The team consisted of an environmental management and human resources development specialist, and environmental specialist, with total inputs of 6 person-months on an intermittent basis, over a period of 12 months. The consultants commenced work in April 2001 and completed this in April 2002. The consultants' overall performance was satisfactory.</p>												

¹ In preparing any country program or strategy, financing any project, or by making any designation of, or reference to, a particular territory or geographic area in this document, the Asian Development Bank does not intend to make any judgments as to the legal or other status of any territory or area.

The consultants fully adhered to ADB norms and practices, and exhibited a good level of technical knowledge, innovation, and flexibility. Originally, it was envisioned that under the TA, six Environmental Protection Unit (EPU) staff would participate in an international training course for up to 6 months each. However, given the available budget and time constraint of staff, the consultants determined that this activity outlined under the TA would not be feasible. There was a significant delay in the completion of this TA since during this period, the responsibility for administration of the country was transitioning from UNTAET to the Government of Timor-Leste, which required the restructuring of government departments and development of government policies and procedures, and other legislative changes. As a result, completion of TA activities, particularly the review of institutional plans for environmental management, and the review of environmental legislation and regulations, were delayed. EA performance was deemed to be satisfactory as inputs provided by the EA met expectations. ADB performance can be assessed as satisfactory as ADB missions were effective in ensuring pending matters were acted upon by the EA despite on-going government restructuring activities.

Evaluation of Outputs and Achievement of Outcome

The TA assisted the EPU (now the National Directorate of Environmental Services [NDES] under the Ministry for Economy and Development) in carrying out their functions by building the understanding of government officials of their role in protecting the quality of the environment, particularly in carrying out environmental impact assessments (EIA). The TA also provided important input into the design of new institutional arrangements for the NDES in a post-UNTAET national government. The government was satisfied with the achieved outputs. Major achievements under the TA include: (i) *Capacity Building*. Through observer study tours in neighboring countries and on-the-job training, local EPU staff gained essential skills necessary for carrying out their duties more effectively, particularly in conducting EIAs; (ii) *Review of environmental legislation and regulations*. The review of existing policy and development of recommendations assisted the government in determining what pieces of legislation and regulations were needed in order to replace Indonesian laws on environmental protection. This output subsequently led to the development of a new draft EIA legislation in Timor-Leste; (iii) *Institutional plan for environmental management*. Activities carried out under this TA helped inform the design of new institutional arrangements which saw the EPU being transformed into the National Directorate of Environmental Services under the Ministry of Economy and Development; and (iv) *Environmental Profile*. Despite large data gaps which existed in Timor-Leste, the environmental profile compiled under the TA assisted in building a preliminary information base for supporting environmental decision-making in Timor-Leste. However, ongoing challenges remain, as a result of human and financial resource constraints within the NDES, where environmental management capacity, although improved as a result of the TA, has remained weak since the independence.

Overall Assessment and Rating

Partly successful. This TA was successfully designed and achieved its intended impact in terms of strengthening environmental and natural resources management capacity within government, conducting an environmental legislative and regulatory review and providing recommendations for improvement, outlining optimal institutional arrangements for effective environmental management, and developing an environmental profile for Timor-Leste. However, delays and the insufficient budget allocation to allow government officials to participate in international training courses reduced the overall effectiveness of the TA.

Major Lessons

Two lessons can be drawn from the TA. The effectiveness of the training was maximized by conducting in-service training of government officials working within the EPU based on capacity building needs assessment. This ensured that training material was tailored to the specific needs of officials. In terms of time, cost and relevance, such capacity building arrangements may be more appropriate than extended overseas training courses. Also, given limited English skills within the government in Timor-Leste, including EPU, government officials learned the most when training was delivered in Bahasa Indonesia, rather than in English.

Recommendations and Follow-up Actions

It is recommended that continuous assistance and support for building capacity for environmental management be provided since skill levels within the National Directorate of Environmental Services remain relatively weak.