

TAR: PAK 38573

Proposed Technical Assistance
to the Islamic Republic of Pakistan
for Support to Implementation of
Gender Reform Action Plans
(Cofinanced by the Poverty
Reduction Cooperation Fund and
the Government of Canada)

May 2005

CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS

(as of 25 May 2005)

Currency Unit	–	Pakistan rupee/s (PRe/PRs)
PRe 1.00	=	\$0.0168
\$1.00	=	PRs59.48

ABBREVIATIONS

ADB	–	Asian Development Bank
ADTA	–	advisory technical assistance
AJP	–	Access to Justice Program
APR	–	annual performance review
CIDA	–	Canadian International Development Agency
DSP	–	Decentralization Support Program
EA	–	executing agency
GGRP	–	gender and governance resource pool
GRAP	–	gender reform action plan
GU	–	Governance Unit
IA	–	implementing agency
MoF	–	Ministry of Finance
MoWD	–	Ministry of Women Development
NGO	–	nongovernment organization
PME	–	performance monitoring and evaluation
PMU	–	program management unit
PRCF	–	Poverty Reduction Cooperation Fund
PRM	–	Pakistan Resident Mission
PRSP	–	poverty reduction strategy paper
PSO	–	program support office
TA	–	technical assistance
TA1	–	Local Government Performance Enhancement
TA2	–	Gender and Governance Mainstreaming
TASF	–	Technical Assistance Special Fund

NOTE

In this report, "\$" refers to US dollars.

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE CLASSIFICATION

Targeting Classification	–	General intervention
Sector	–	Multisector
Subsector	–	Governance
Theme	–	Gender and development
Subtheme	–	Inclusive social and gender development

This report was prepared by D. Porter, I. Shahjehan, R. Ahmad, and P. Robertson.

I. INTRODUCTION

1. The principal commitments of the Asian Development Bank (ADB) to gender and governance reforms in Pakistan are articulated through two major programs: the Decentralization Support Program (DSP)¹ and the Access to Justice Program (AJP).² Although these programs provide a high-level framework for policy dialogue with the Government on gender and governance issues, the dialogue has been sporadic, because both programs have awaited a firm government commitment to a package of legislative, political, administrative, and fiscal reforms. These commitments are contained in gender reform action plans (GRAPs), prepared with ADB assistance,³ which were approved by the cabinets of the federal government and the provincial governments of Balochistan, Punjab and Sindh. The significance of GRAPs for ADB is also reflected in policy commitments under resource management programs in Balochistan and Punjab, and devolved social services programs in Punjab and Sindh. ADB and its cofinancing partners have thus made an unprecedented effort to mainstream both corporate and government policy on gender through innovative and high-profile assistance.

2. The proposed advisory technical assistance⁴ (TA) will help federal and provincial governments implement the reforms and supporting actions highlighted in the GRAPs, and for which governments have already made budgetary commitments. More specifically, the proposed TA will be critical to the effectiveness of the two TA loans integral to the DSP: the Local Government Performance Enhancement (Loan 1937-PAK, known as TA1); and the Gender and Governance Mainstreaming (Loan 1938-PAK, known as TA2); and to the TA loan supporting the AJP.⁵ This will include helping the Government integrate its poverty reduction strategy and medium-term fiscal management frameworks with the recently approved GRAPs at federal and provincial levels, and integrating this with policy-based operations for public resource management and devolved social services at province and local government levels.

3. The proposed TA was designed by the Pakistan Resident Mission (PRM) during the conclusive phase of preparation of the GRAPs, the country program exercise (April–May 2004), and annual performance reviews (APRs) of DSP and AJP. The priorities, activities, and approaches reflected in this proposed TA were defined in consultation with the Government and civil society stakeholders. Appendix 1 gives the proposed TA framework.

II. ISSUES

4. **Gender and Governance Reform for Poverty Reduction.** Federal and provincial governments have reaffirmed their commitment to gender reforms through the poverty reduction strategy papers (PRSP). The reservation of 33% of the seats in local government for women has enabled many women to enter local politics. Women members constitute about 21% of federal and provincial assemblies. But despite these commitments, the status of women in Pakistan remains appalling. In the absence of gender-disaggregated data, gender poverty

¹ ADB. 2002. *Report and Recommendation of the President to the Board of Directors on Proposed Loans to the Islamic Republic of Pakistan for the Decentralization Support Program*. Manila (Loans 1935/36/37/38-PAK, for \$300 million, approved 21 November 2002).

² ADB. 2001. *Report and Recommendation of the President to the Board of Directors on Proposed Loans and Technical Assistance Grant to the Islamic Republic of Pakistan for the Access to Justice Program*. Manila (Loans 1897/98/99-PAK, for \$350 million, approved 20 December 2001).

³ ADB. 2002. *Technical Assistance to the Islamic Republic of Pakistan for the Gender Reform Program*. Manila (ADB approved TA3832-PAK, for \$600,000, on 1 February 2002).

⁴ The proposed advisory technical assistance (ADTA) is in the 2005 Country Program. It first appeared in *ADB Business Opportunities* on 12 October 2004.

⁵ The Board approved TA Loan 1899-PAK (\$25.5 million) on 20 December 2001 (footnote 2).

remains largely hidden, but it is increasingly evident that poverty is feminized; women bear a disproportionately high share of the burden of poverty. Global comparators give some indication of gender poverty in Pakistan.⁶

5. Statistics, however, do little to convey the experience of women in Pakistan. Oppressive laws imperil their legal status. Violence against women remains an everyday experience across class, region, and rural-urban divides. Women continue to be murdered in the name of male “honor.” Domestic violence is thought to take place in about 80% of the country’s households, and custodial gang rapes by the police are so frequent that 70% of women entering police stations report they are subjected to sexual and physical violence. Child sexual abuse, kidnapping, prostitution and trafficking, and bonded and hazardous child labor are commonplace. This occurs not just because of inadequate legal provisions, but mainly because implementation of the law by federal, provincial, and local state agencies tends to take the path of least resistance, and favors the powerful over the weak.⁷

6. **Administrative and Political Power.** The exclusion of women from political and administrative governance structures is strongly linked to high poverty incidence. Despite women’s participation in political processes, women are seldom appointed to decision-making positions and their representation in political parties is low. There are significant gender disparities in public sector employment; only 5.4% of all civil servants are women. In the federal government, there are no women in grade 22, and women hold only 1% of grade 21 posts and 2.5% of grade 20 posts.⁸ No woman serves at the Supreme Court, and only two women are high court judges. Only 6% of judges in the subordinate judiciary are women.

7. **Fiscal and Budgetary Issues.** The male bias in state institutions translates into under-investment in social and economic entitlements and public policies for women, and reinforces the higher incidence of poverty and powerlessness among women. Women’s new political representation in local government politics is a major achievement, but female political representatives lack access to means of political participation—political skills, financial resources, education, training, and information—due to structural and cultural barriers, and male domination of political parties and the bureaucracy.

8. **ADB’s Gender and Development Focus.** ADB fully supports the PRSP process, devolution, and positive programs for gender equality. Before the approval of GRAPs, national policy was ad hoc and poorly articulated, with limited administrative and budgetary commitments, and did not provide an effective focus for ADB’s assistance. To date, ADB’s affirmative actions on gender have largely been limited to crosscutting actions in investment projects⁹, policy advocacy,¹⁰ and policy dialogue under DSP and AJP. The recent high-level

⁶ The Gender-Related Development Index 2003 of the United Nations Development Programme ranks Pakistan as number 120 of 175 countries. On the Gender Empowerment Measurement 2003, Pakistan ranks 58 of 175 countries. Female literacy is only 28.8%; literacy for men is 58.2%. Pakistan is one of the few countries where the male: female ratio is reversed. There are 108 men for every 100 women. Female infant mortality and morbidity rates are higher than for male children.

⁷ Zia, S. and F. Bari. 1999. *Women’s Political Participation in Pakistan*. Islamabad; Government of Pakistan. 1997. *Report of the Inquiry Commission on Women*. Islamabad; Society for the Protection of the Child. 1998. *The State of Pakistan’s Children*. Islamabad; and Society for the Protection of the Child. 1999. *The State of Pakistan’s Children*. Islamabad.

⁸ National Commission on the Status of Women. 2003. *Inquiry Report on Status of Women Employment in Public Sector Organizations*. Islamabad.

⁹ Examples are rural development and agriculture development projects such as the Malakand Rural Development Project, the North West Frontier Province Barani Area Development Project, and the Sindh Rural Development Project.

approval of GRAPs provides a unique opportunity to advance and provide a focus for ADB's support for gender policy reform in five key domains: (i) women's representation in local government, (ii) reform of institutional structures, (iii) women in public sector employment, (iv) procedural and fiscal reforms, and (v) a range of complementary reforms. Appendix 3 gives a brief profile of GRAPs.

9. **Technical Assistance Design Principles.** The proposed TA is designed on the following principles: (i) to build upon the constituencies of support generated by TA 3832-PAK: Gender Reform Program; (ii) to ensure that GRAPs are implemented in a flexible and politically and technically sustainable manner; (iii) to minimize administrative and management costs associated with implementation of the proposed TA; and, (iv) to create incentives for existing policy makers, staff, and consultants engaged under these operations to fully articulate GRAPs, concerns in mainstream operations.

III. THE PROPOSED TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

A. Impact and Outcome

10. The objective of the proposed TA is to strengthen implementation and integration of gender policy commitments in poverty reduction and governance reform programs and projects. The proposed TA will have two outputs, each having two components. Output 1, integration of the GRAPs into devolution, judicial, and provincial reform programs for public resource management, has two components (i) supporting implementing agencies (IAs) for GRAP implementation, and (ii) supporting demand mobilization and implementation of GRAPs through special-purpose, targeted activities of limited duration. Output 2, effective policy dialogue on gender reforms informed by analysis of governance programs, performance monitoring, and evaluation of results, has two components (i) ensuring that governance reform programs' performance monitoring and evaluation (PME) systems are appropriately engendered, and (ii) facilitating policy dialogue through conferences and workshops of stakeholders on GRAPs issues. The approach will include engaging long-term domestic consultants.

B. Key Components

1. Gender Reform Program Management (Component 1)

11. A key responsibility of the DSP program support offices (PSOs) and AJP program management units (PMUs), both federal and provincial, is to support intergovernmental linkages and overall coherence in implementing devolution and associated gender and social development reforms. The proposed TA will provide one gender governance specialist in each province and one at the federal level, and one gender justice specialist, to assist in GRAPs implementation through DSP and AJP. These specialists will support PSO and PMU staff in implementation of GRAPs for devolution and local government reforms; for access to justice; for intergovernmental fiscal restructuring; for local government budgeting, revenue, and expenditure management; and for the procurement and management of TA (loan and grant financed). The DSP PSOs will carry the main administrative responsibility for implementation of TA2. An additional contract management specialist will be engaged by the proposed TA to augment DSP PSO capacity with a special focus on TA2 implementation.

2. GRAP Demand Mobilization and Implementation Support (Component 2)

¹⁰ ADB has chaired the Inter-Agency Gender and Development Group twice in the past 3 years. Major efforts of advocacy on gender equality included dialogue with the Government to engender the PRSP.

12. GRAPs entail commitments by governments to implement a range of administrative, fiscal, and political reforms. Federal and provincial governments may not prioritize or sequence actions in the GRAPs in the same way. Continued commitment to reforms among stakeholders, visibility of reforms, and wider capacity development require technical support to several IAs and civil society groups to amplify and sustain demand for reforms. GRAP IAs will require special assistance to refine and implement activities drawing upon existing government budget, loan, and grant resources. It is important to simultaneously provide support to proponents of GRAP reforms within civil society—professional associations, nongovernment organizations (NGOs), and activists—so they may effectively interact with governments to support, monitor, and contribute to public awareness of the commitments made through GRAPs and related policy commitments. The TA includes a gender and governance resource pool (GGRP) to provide a quick-response and flexible financing facility for this purpose. Funds will be provided for (i) selected activities under GRAPs; (ii) activities complementing the strategic objectives of GRAPs; and (iii) technical support to key GRAPs IAs. Proposals for investment from the GGRP may be initiated by government agencies (federal, provincial, and local), civil society organisations and academic institutions. Appendix 4 outlines the framework, investment menu, and processing guidelines for GGRP utilization. The objects and purposes of the GGRP will be widely advertised with a special governance arrangement detailed and notified by the Executing Agency (EA). Two grant and contract management specialists will be engaged to assist PRM to manage the GGRP, with support from an independent auditor.

3. Performance Monitoring and Evaluation (Component 3)

13. The Government is committed to maintaining a performance monitoring and evaluation (PME) system for governance reforms to serve three purposes (i) demonstrate accountable use of public resources available to IAs through the normal budget process and special-purpose, externally supported capacity-building projects; (ii) ensure that budget and technical resources, well-tailored to IA requirements, are allocated to priority activities supporting devolution, and that incentives are created for their effective use; and (iii) progressively evaluate and inform policy makers of the impact of reforms on access, equity, and sustainability of services. The proposed TA will provide one long-term policy research and evaluation specialist to document compliance with GRAPs investment commitments and outputs in AJP, DSP, and ADB public resource management and devolved social services programs.

4. Policy Dialogue and Public Communications (Component 4)

14. The TA will provide Government, civil society, and Pakistan's aid partners with strategic information, based on well-researched lessons from experience, to regularly review, and where necessary, modify the legal, policy, and organizational arrangements for the GRAPs. Policy and program lessons from a range of nationwide and province-specific gender reform projects and initiatives will be researched and publicized through electronic and print media, professional conferences, and wider public exchanges. One gender communications specialist will work with key IAs on the basis of quarterly work plans agreed upon in DSP and AJP planning process.

C. Cost and Financing

15. The TA is estimated to cost \$5.6 million equivalent, comprising all local currency with no foreign exchange cost component. The TA will be financed on a grant basis under (i) ADB's TA funding program (\$100,000), (ii) ADB's Poverty Reduction Cooperation Fund (\$800,000), and (iii) cofinancing from the Government of Canada, Canadian International Development Agency (\$3,665,000).¹¹ ADB will administer all funds from the cofinanciers. The Government will

¹¹ Using an exchange rate of Canadian dollars 1.22783 to US dollars 1.00.

contribute \$1,115,000 equivalent in local currency for office accommodation and counterpart staff support. Appendix 2 summarizes the cost estimates.

D. Implementation Arrangements

16. The proposed TA will be implemented for 36 months from May 2005 to May 2008 and will be administered by ADB PRM. The Ministry of Finance (MoF) will be the EA for this proposed TA under the existing DSP implementation arrangements, with the following responsibilities (i) approve annual work plans and budgets; (ii) assist in ADB short-listing of consultants for subprojects of less than \$500,000; (iii) approve progress and annual reports; and (iv) approve annual performance review (APR) outcomes. The MoF is also the EA for DSP TA loans. Reports on progress of the proposed TA will be provided to the DSP national program steering committee.

17. The proposed TA will require 621 person-months of domestic consulting services. ADB will engage all consultants in accordance with its *Guidelines on the Use of Consultants* and other arrangements satisfactory to ADB. The indicative consultants' recruitment plan in Appendix 4 details three different arrangements for recruiting consultants: (i) ADB engaging, on an individual basis, two domestic consultants and an independent auditor (87 person-months); (ii) eight long-term domestic consultants (270 person-months) provided in a package by a consultant firm; and (iii) provided in a package by four consultant firms and eight domestic consultants (264 person-months) engaged through GGRP-funded subprojects to implement initiatives under components 2, 3, and 4 of the proposed TA. Appendix 4 gives the outline terms of reference for consultants in points (i) and (ii). ADB will be responsible for the outputs and deliverables of all individual consultants and consultants contracted under the GRRP through the DSP advisory technical assistance team leader appointed under TA4207-PAK: Support to Decentralization II. All consultants will be subject to annual performance assessment.

18. Under the GGRP, consultants will be selected (point [iii] para. 17) under ADB *Guidelines on the Use of Consultants* and other arrangements satisfactory to ADB. An estimated total of six packages in each of years 1 and 2 with an annual projection of two packages implemented by domestic consultant firms and three by individual consultants. The GGRP packages will not exceed \$500,000. Because of the innovative and complex nature and scope of the packages, it is proposed to use a quality-based selection method for selecting consultant firms. In year 2 the direct selection method may also be considered as appropriate if the firms or individuals perform well in year 1. The performance of all GGRP-financed subprojects will be subject to quarterly review, and annual review through the AJP and DSP APRs, which will include both program and financial management reviews. The consultants engaged to implement GGRP-financed subprojects will be subject to audit conducted by independent auditors appointed by ADB.

IV. THE PRESIDENT'S RECOMMENDATION AND DECISION

19. The President recommends that the Board approve ADB administering a portion of technical assistance not exceeding the equivalent of \$3,665,000 to the Government of Pakistan for Support to Implementation of Gender Reform Action Plans, to be financed on a grant basis by the Government of Canada. If the Board approves ADB administering the technical assistance, the President, acting under the authority delegated by the Board, will approve (i) ADB administering a portion of the technical assistance not exceeding the equivalent of \$800,000 to be financed on a grant basis by the Poverty Reduction Cooperation Fund, and (ii) ADB providing the balance not exceeding the equivalent of \$100,000 on a grant basis, for Support to Implementation of Gender Reform Action Plans, and hereby reports this action to the Board.

DESIGN AND MONITORING FRAMEWORK

Design Summary	Performance Targets / Indicators	Data Sources / Reporting Mechanisms	Assumptions and Risks
<p>Impact Gender policy commitments in poverty reduction and governance reform programs and projects implemented</p>	<p>TA and capital resources match the GRAP priorities</p> <p>Annual increase in govt. budget allocations to GRAP and complementary activities</p>	<p>APR analysis of governance program work plans and technical assistance effectiveness</p> <p>APR analysis of govt. budget and expenditure records</p>	<p>Risks</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Resources are not provided in a sufficient, timely, or predictable fashion Aid partners eschew govt.'s requests for coordinated support
<p>Outcome GRAPs are integrated in ADB-supported governance reform programs</p>	<p>Annually increasing allocation of ADB-supported governance reform program resources to GRAP and complementary activities</p>	<p>Annual work plan approvals in program steering committee records</p>	<p>Assumption</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Govt. resources for GRAPs are provided in a sufficient, timely, and predictable fashion <p>Risk</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Aid partners eschew Government's requests for coordinated support
<p>Outputs</p> <p>1. GRAPs integrated into devolution, judicial, and provincial public resource management reform programs</p> <p>2. Effective policy dialogue on gender reforms informed by analysis of governance program's performance monitoring and evaluation results</p>	<p>Annual work plans, budgets (including resources for GGRP), and reports approved</p> <p>Implementing Agency-designed activities supported through at least two subprojects and least four individual consultants contracted per year</p> <p>At least three research reports and policy papers disseminated to GRAP stakeholders annually</p> <p>Governance reform program reports incorporate gender analysis based on PME information</p> <p>At least three publications disseminated to GRAP policy makers and stakeholders annually</p> <p>At least two fora conducted in every province on experiences from GRAP implementation in years 2 and 3</p>	<p>APR analysis of governance programs work plans and TA effectiveness</p> <p>Analysis of TA consultants' annual personnel performance assessment</p> <p>APR analysis of governance programs workplans and TA effectiveness</p> <p>ADB annual gender audit</p> <p>APR analysis of governance programs workplans and TA effectiveness</p> <p>APR analysis of governance programs workplans and TA effectiveness</p>	<p>Risks</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Govt. fails to attract and retain appropriately qualified staff Implementing agencies cannot identify sufficient areas of support <p>Risks</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The value of PME as a policy development and communication tool is not accepted and resources provided are limited Opportunities for policy dialogue through the APR approach are not availed by stakeholders

Activities with Milestones	Inputs
<p>1.1 Support implementing agencies to implement GRAPs (annually)</p> <p>1.2 Support governance reform program annual work planning and budgeting process to ensure GRAP inclusion (annually)</p> <p>1.3 GGRP provides special purpose, targeted activities of limited duration to support GRAP implementation in accordance with GGRP guidelines (annually)</p> <p>2.1 Governance reform programs' PME systems are appropriately engendered (by May 2006)</p> <p>2.2 Prepare publications of policy issues incorporating results from PME in accordance with communications strategy targets (annually)</p> <p>2.3 Facilitate policy dialogue, including conferences and workshops of stakeholders on GRAP issues (annually)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ADB: \$4.565 million: 11 advisory technical assistants including independent auditor (387 domestic person-months) <p>GGRP: \$3.23 million, including four subproject and eight individual domestic consultant contract packages (264 domestic person-months)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Govt.: \$1.115 million: Govt. staff and operational support, including staff and operational costs from 10 implementing agencies.

ADB = Asian Development Bank, APR = annual performance review, DSP = Decentralization Support Program, GGRP = gender governance resource pool, gov't. = government, GRAP = gender reform action plan, PME = performance monitoring and evaluation, TA = technical assistance.

COST ESTIMATES AND FINANCING PLAN
(\$'000)

Item	Foreign Exchange	Local Currency	Total Cost
A. Asian Development Bank (ADB), Poverty Reduction Cooperation Fund, and Government of Canada Financing^a			
1. Consultants			
a. Remuneration and Per Diem (domestic ^b)	0.0	585.0	585.0
b. International and Local Travel	0.0	150.0	150.0
2. Gender and Governance Resource Pool ^c	0.0	3,230.0	3,230.0
3. Workshops, Communications, and Documentation	0.0	300.0	300.0
4. Contingencies	0.0	300.0	300.0
Subtotal (A)	0.0	4,565.0	4,565.0
B. Government of Pakistan Financing			
1. Office Accommodation and Transport	0.0	500.0	500.0
2. Remuneration and Per Diem of Counterpart Staff ^d	0.0	615.0	615.0
3. Others	0.0	0.0	0.0
Subtotal (B)	0.0	1,115.0	1,115.0
Total	0.0	5,680.0	5,680.0

^a ADB will finance \$100,000 from ADB's technical assistance funding program. Cofinancing will be from the Poverty Reduction Cooperation Fund (\$800,000) and the Government of Canada (\$3,665,000), and administered by ADB.

^b Long-term domestic consultants (87 person-months) and consultants (270 person-months) provided in a package by a consultant firm, employed by ADB.

^c Local currency includes domestic consultants (264 person-months) plus gender and governance resource pool subproject contracts with domestic firms.

^d Includes staff from 10 implementing agencies.

Source: ADB estimates.

A PROFILE OF GENDER REFORM ACTION PLANS

A. Introduction

1. One national and four provincial gender reform action plans (GRAPs) were prepared by the Ministry of Women Development and provincial women development departments in a consultative and review process of 14 months, under the Asian Development Bank (ADB) technical assistance project TA3832-PAK: Gender Reform Program.

2. GRAPs include gender-based policy, administrative, political, and fiscal reforms at the federal, provincial, and district levels to enable the Government to implement its national and international commitments on gender equality. The federal cabinet and the Punjab, Sindh, and Balochistan cabinets have approved their respective GRAPs.

B. Process and Methodology for Development of Gender Reform Action Plans

3. Gender review of the political and administrative systems of Pakistan was the first step in a process that culminated with the national GRAP. This process began with identification and scoping of gender issues and the identification of gender gaps through situation assessment and analysis. This was followed by processing of learning and synthesis of ideas; and consultation workshops, meetings, and presentations to key ministries. Comments and suggestions from this process were incorporated. A second draft was then prepared and shared with key ministries.

4. Draft GRAPs were reviewed and cleared for cabinet submission by the provincial and national steering committees comprising parliamentarians from major political parties, federal and provincial cabinet members, representatives of key federal ministries and provincial governments, selected nongovernment organizations (NGOs), and donor agencies.

C. Scope of Gender Reform Action Plans

5. The GRAPs propose reforms at the federal, provincial, and district level across all sectors focused on the executive arm of government. These reforms focus on women's empowerment, and aim to enhance the participation of women across the gender and governance sphere: from political participation, where citizens' wishes are expressed through political mandates and legislation, to government actions, where those wishes are implemented through public sector institutions, policies, and budgets.

6. GRAPs include the following reforms:

- (i) Key Reforms
 - (a) Institutional reforms;
 - (b) Reforms in policies, budgeting, and public expenditure mechanisms;
 - (c) Reforms to increase and improve women's employment in public sector organizations;
 - (d) Reforms to improve women's political participation; and
 - (e) Related capacity-building interventions
- (ii) Supporting Reforms
 - (a) Legislative support actions,
 - (b) Poverty reduction support actions, and
 - (c) Projects and programs

7. GRAPs also include estimated costs and a financing plan, an implementation plan, and a monitoring system.

8. Separate reform proposals have been developed for the four provincial governments and for the federal government.

D. Estimated Cost and Financing

9. The total estimated cost of all five GRAPs over 4 years is about \$41 million, to be financed through various bilateral, multilateral, and government sources. Details follow.

Table A3: Estimated Cost of GRAPs
(\$ million)

Item	Recurrent Cost	Non-Recurrent Cost	Total
National GRAP	2.57	8.19	10.76
Punjab GRAP	3.06	2.43	5.49
Sindh GRAP	3.05	1.66	4.72
NWFP GRAP	6.49	4.17	10.66
Balochistan GRAP	5.33	3.58	8.91
Total	20.50	20.03	40.54

GRAP = gender reform action plan, NWFP = North West Frontier Province.
Sources: National, Punjab, Sindh, NWFP and Balochistan GRAPs.

E. Implementation Arrangements

10. GRAPs will be implemented over 4 years, with support from the Decentralization Support Program. The Ministry of Women Development is the national focal ministry for implementation of the national GRAP, while the provincial women development departments will implement their respective GRAPs.

OUTLINE TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR CONSULTANTS

A. Consultants Engaged by the Asian Development Bank

1. **Grants and Contract Management Specialist** (two positions, 72 person-months). Location: Pakistan Resident Mission (PRM) Governance Unit. The consultants will

- (i) help PRM establish and maintain periodic procurement plans for contracting and supervising technical support and equipment financed under technical assistance (TA), including the gender and governance resource pool (GGRP);
- (ii) ensure that systems and procedures follow the Asian Development Bank's (ADB) guidelines for consultant selection and procurement;
- (iii) maintain accurate records of all contracts, certifications, and payments;
- (iv) ensure that TA consultants and counterpart agencies are adequately briefed on required standards of transparency and accountability;
- (v) undertake internal audit of consultant selection procedures being practiced by the support offices and management units of the Decentralisation Support Program (DSP) and Access to Justice Program (AJP);
- (vi) help prepare and deliver orientation and training to potential service delivery agencies, including the private sector, consultants, and nongovernment organizations (NGOs);
- (vii) coordinate with technical advisers of AJP and DSP to ensure complementarity of support;
- (viii) help prepare adequate and timely reports on the efficiency and effectiveness of ADB TA grant resources; and
- (ix) prepare time-bound and monitorable work plans and periodic reports—monthly and quarterly—as required by the head of the PRM Governance Unit.

2. **Auditor** (one position, 15 person-months periodically over 5 years). Location: PRM Governance Unit (GU). The consultant will

- (i) audit all expenditures from the funds that ADB provides and ascertain whether the moneys shown in the accounts of consultants as having been disbursed were legally available for, and applicable to, the services or purposes for which they were applied or charged, and whether the expenditures conform to the authorities that govern them;
- (ii) on the basis of such audits, certify the accounts, compiled and prepared for each financial year, showing the expenditures under the respective heads, and provide opinions on all accounts kept by the consultants under the agreement with ADB;
- (iii) ensure application of ADB's disbursement procedures, and other such procedures envisaged in contract agreements for consulting services;
- (iv) prepare a time-bound plan for audit of payments, advances, and reimbursements made to consultants;
- (v) review, by applying audit checks in the light of ADB's procedures for payment to consultants as per contract agreements: (a) the monthly/periodic claims of consultants, and itemized statements, accompanied by receipted invoices, vouchers, and other supporting materials, of the amounts paid to and/or payable to the consultant for such months/periods; (b) separate monthly statements that consultants submit in amounts payable in foreign and in local currency; (c) records of all payments to consultants; and (d) bank statements and cash flow statements;
- (vi) provide technical assistance (TA) to ADB in creating internal controls for efficient and effective resource management; and
- (vii) submit certified accounts to ADB, along with notes, comments, or recommendations that may be considered necessary.

B. Consultants to be Engaged by a Consultant Firm

1. **Gender Governance Specialist** (five positions, 180 person-months). Location: DSP national program support office (NPSO) and four provincial program support offices (PPSOs). The consultants will

- (i) review government and donor initiatives to support gender-related devolution and access to justice reforms, and liaise with implementing agencies (IAs) to ensure that TA-financed activities are effectively monitored and evaluated;
- (ii) help IAs of gender reform action plan (GRAP) stakeholders and DSP/AJP identify appropriate activities for GRAPs to incorporate into annual work plans and budgets of governance reform programs;
- (iii) assist IAs and GRAP stakeholders in design and review of technical investment proposals for TA loan funds and GGRP resources;
- (iv) maintain regular liaison with all stakeholders (government, civil society organisations, NGOs, and donors) associated with GRAPs' implementation processes, and provide support as directed by the DSP project director;
- (v) coordinate with technical advisers of DSP and AJP to ensure complementarity of support;
- (vi) help the monitoring and evaluation specialists and IAs monitor and evaluate GRAP implementation and effectiveness;
- (vii) help design and implement annual performance review (APR) processes, evaluating their quality, preparing reports for the national program steering committee (NPSC), and disseminating the results;
- (viii) prepare time-bound and monitorable work plans and periodic reports—monthly and quarterly—as required by the DSP program director through the DSP advisory technical assistance (ADTA) team leader; and
- (ix) perform any other duties that the DSP program director or team leader may assign.

2. **Policy Research and Evaluation Specialist** (one position, 36 person-months). Location: DSP NPSO. The consultant will

- (i) review all relevant documentation on devolution and gender reforms in Pakistan and associated aid-financed support programs, and identify key areas for policy research;
- (ii) review ADB governance programs' systems for performance monitoring and evaluation (PME), and make recommendations to ensure that they have appropriate indicators and means of verification;
- (iii) conduct periodic gender audits of ADB-assisted, governance-related operations of federal, provincial, and district governments;
- (iv) assist in dialogues on policy through fora that enable GRAP stakeholders to analyze policy implications of implementation experience;
- (v) produce occasional policy papers and case studies for dissemination through publications, workshops, and seminars;
- (vi) support the gender communications specialist in conducting fora and documentation;
- (vii) assist with APR processes, evaluating their quality, preparing reports for the NPSC, and disseminating the results;
- (viii) coordinate with technical advisers of DSP and AJP to ensure complementarity of support;
- (ix) prepare time-bound and monitorable work plans and periodic reports—monthly and quarterly—as required by the DSP program director through the DSP ADTA team leader; and
- (x) perform any other duties the DSP program director or team leader may assign.

- 3. Gender Communications Specialist** (one position, 36 person-months). Location: DSP NPSO. The consultant will
- (i) review documentation arising from government and aid agency initiatives in support of GRAPs; liaise with IAs to help them ensure that TA-financed activities are designed to exploit every opportunity to research, document, and disseminate policy and operational lessons from the implementation experience;
 - (ii) support the DSP PSO in designing, planning, and implementing policy dialogues and communications strategies;
 - (iii) design, plan, and conduct public conferences, workshops, and media campaigns to promote gender reforms;
 - (iv) help IAs and GRAP stakeholders design and review investment proposals and technical investment proposals for TA loan funds and GGRP resources;
 - (v) support the policy research and evaluation specialist in preparation of papers, reports, and case studies;
 - (vi) facilitate effective communication of PME results to all stakeholders;
 - (vii) help design and implement APR processes, evaluating their quality, preparing reports for the NPSC, and disseminating results;
 - (viii) coordinate with technical advisers of DSP and AJP to ensure complementarity of support;
 - (ix) prepare time-bound and monitorable work plans and periodic reports—monthly and quarterly—as required by the DSP program director through the DSP ADTA team leader; and
 - (x) perform any other duties that the DSP program director or DSP ADTA team leader may assign.
- 4. Gender Justice Specialist** (one position, 18 person-months). Location: Law and Justice Commission. The consultant will
- (i) review documentation of AJP and prepare a list of gender- and justice-related interventions, implementation methodologies, and work plans;
 - (ii) review the status of women's employment in the judiciary, the legal profession, and the police, and prepare recommendations (for legislation, or regulations for affirmative opportunities programs, etc.) to create an enabling environment, including employment conditions to increase the number of women in these professions;
 - (iii) help the Ministry of Law, Justice and Human Rights, and the Law and Justice Commission, review key legislation affecting women, and propose changes;
 - (iv) review operations of courts, and recommend ways to create more positive environments for women litigants;
 - (v) help IAs and GRAP stakeholders design and review investment proposals and technical investment proposals for TA loan funds and GGRP resources;
 - (vi) help conduct APR processes, evaluating their quality and preparing reports for the AJP PD, and disseminating the results;
 - (vii) coordinate with technical advisers of DSP and AJP to ensure complementarity of support;
 - (viii) prepare time-bound and monitorable work plans and periodic reports—monthly and quarterly—as required by the DSP program director through the DSP ADTA team leader; and
 - (ix) perform other duties that the DSP program director or DSP ADTA team leader assigns.

Table A4.1: Indicative Consultant Recruitment Plan

Item	Type of Package	Budget ^a (\$ million)	Total Person- Months	Selection Method	Type of Technical Proposal
1	Two domestic advisory technical assistants and an independent auditor	0.628	87	Individual selection	
	Subtotal	0.628	87		
3	Gender and Governance Resource Pool (GGRP) Subprojects (estimates)				
Year 1	Two packages (average \$278,750 per package; no package higher than \$500,000). Packages for special purpose studies, internships, training of governance reform program staff, public awareness, and legal litigation to promote the profile of the Government's gender commitments, and to provide seed money to trigger larger, sustained budgetary commitments by the Government	0.557	112	Quality based selection (QBS)	Biodata Technical Proposal (BTP)
	Four domestic technical specialists (average \$25,000 per contract) for manuals, training materials, publications, documentation, formulation of rules and regulations, and legislative drafting	0.100	20	Individual selection	
	One firm to provide eight domestic long-term specialists	0.450	90	QBS	BTP
Year 2	Two packages (average \$278,750 per package; no package higher than \$500,000). Packages for special purpose studies, internships, training of governance reform program staff, public awareness, and legal litigation to promote the profile of the Government's gender commitments, and to provide seed money to trigger larger, sustained budgetary commitments by the Government	0.557	112	QBS or direct selection may be considered as appropriate if one or more firms performs well in year 1	BTP
	Four domestic technical specialists (average \$25,000 per contract) for manuals, training materials, publications, documentation, formulation of rules and regulations, and legislative drafting	0.100	20	Individual or direct selection may be considered as appropriate if an individual performs well in year 1	
	One firm to provide eight domestic long-term specialists	0.450	90	QBS or direct selection may be considered as appropriate if the firm performs well in year 1	BTP
Year 3	One firm to provide eight domestic long-term specialists	0.450	90	QBS or direct selection may be considered as appropriate if the firm performs well in year 2	BTP
	TA closing, evaluation, and audit				
	GGRP Estimated Subprojects Subtotal	2.664	534		
	Consultant Plan Total	3.292	621		

^a No annual escalation is provided for.
Source: ADB estimates.

Table A4.2: Gender And Governance Resource Pool Guidelines for Utilization

Item	
Objective	To provide funding for special purpose, targeted activities of limited duration to support implementation of the gender reform action plan (GRAP)
Eligible Institutions	GRAP stakeholders, including government agencies (federal, provincial, and local), civil society organisations, and tertiary academic institutions
Objects of Expenditure	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) Activities consistent with the five reform areas of GRAPs: (a) institutional reforms, (b) reforms in policies and budgeting and public expenditure mechanisms, (c) reforms to increase and improve women's public employment, (d) sector organizations, (e) reforms to improve women's political participation, and (f) related capacity-building interventions; (ii) Activities complementing the strategic objectives of GRAPs, but explicitly not part of GRAPs (e.g., special purpose studies, internships, training of staff for governance reform programs, public awareness, and legal litigation to promote the profile of the Government's gender commitments, and to provide seed money to trigger larger, sustained budgetary commitments by the Government; and (iii) Technical support to key GRAP implementing agencies.
Finances	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) Subprojects as high as \$500,000, with an average cost estimated at \$330,000 (ii) Individual consultants selected for an estimated average of 20 person-months/year
Management	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) The gender and governance resource pool (GGRP) will be managed by the Pakistan Resident Mission (PRM) Governance Unit (GU); (ii) Subprojects following the technical investment proposal format will be approved by the Executing Agency; (iii) Subprojects will be implemented by consultants selected following the Asian Development Bank's <i>Guidelines on the Use of Consultants</i>; (iv) GU will approve consultant financial and narrative reports, based on certification by advisory technical assistants; (v) PRM will disburse payments to consultants in accordance with contract arrangements and PRM procedures; (vi) An independent auditor will conduct an annual audit of consultants' project accounts; and (vii) GGRP funded activities will be subject to the Access to Justice and Decentralization Support Programs annual performance review (APR) process.
Reporting	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) PRM quarterly progress and financial reports to the Executing Agency; (ii) Consultants' reports in accordance with contract agreements; and (iii) Annual report (available for the APR).

Source: Asian Development Bank estimates.