



Technical Assistance Report

Project Number: 43338
Regional—Capacity Development Technical Assistance (R-CDTA)
September 2009

Capacity Development in Results-Based Monitoring and Evaluation for Countries under the Asian Development Bank's Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation Program (Financed by the People's Republic of China Regional Cooperation and Poverty Reduction Fund)

ABBREVIATIONS

| | | |
|---------|---|---|
| ADB | – | Asian Development Bank |
| AFDC | – | Asia-Pacific Finance and Development Center |
| CAREC | – | Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation |
| CoP | – | community of practice |
| CWRD | – | Central and West Asia Department |
| DMC | – | developing member country |
| ECD | – | evaluation capacity development |
| GMS | – | Greater Mekong Subregion |
| IED | – | Independent Evaluation Department |
| M&E | – | monitoring and evaluation |
| MDG | – | Millennium Development Goal |
| MfDR | – | managing for development results |
| PRC | – | People's Republic of China |
| RD | – | regional department |
| RM | – | resident mission |
| SHIPDET | – | Shanghai International Program for Development Evaluation Training |
| TA | – | technical assistance |

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE CLASSIFICATION

| | | |
|---------------------------------|---|---|
| Type | – | Regional—capacity development technical assistance (R-CDTA) |
| Targeting Classification | – | Targeted intervention (TI-M) |
| Sector | – | Multisector |
| Themes (subthemes) | – | Capacity development (institutional development, network, and partnership development) |
| Location impact | – | National (high), regional (high) |

NOTE

In this report, "\$" refers to US dollars.

| | |
|-------------------------|---|
| Director General | H. S. Rao, Independent Evaluation Department (IED) |
| Team leader | S. Hutaserani, Lead Professional (Development Evaluation), IED |
| Team members | C. J. Mongcopa, Assistant Knowledge Management Administrator, IED B. Q. Cafirma, Evaluation Assistant, IED |

In preparing any evaluation report, or by making any designation of or reference to a particular territory or geographic area in this document, the Independent Evaluation Department does not intend to make any judgments as to the legal or other status of any territory or area.

I. INTRODUCTION

1. Mainstreaming managing for development results (MfDR) was one of the five broad outcomes of the Asian Development Bank's (ADB) reform agenda, adopted on 25 August 2004, to enhance ADB's development effectiveness. MfDR is also one of the key principles of the Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness, which was endorsed by the global development community and representatives from over 100 countries on 3 March 2005. Based on its long-term strategic framework 2008–2020 (Strategy 2020),¹ ADB is committed to meeting all major requirements under the Paris Declaration by 2012. Given the results-based nature of MfDR, ADB's adoption of MfDR is expected to help it make aid more effective.

2. Since adopting MfDR, ADB has been promoting results-based management in its developing member countries (DMCs). The Strategy and Policy Department developed an MfDR action plan (revised in August 2006) aimed at improving (i) DMC capacity for MfDR, (ii) ADB's institutional effectiveness, and (iii) global partnerships. The first pillar focuses on integrating MfDR capacity development with regional department (RD) operations, particularly through country partnership strategies, and on strengthening DMC monitoring and evaluation (M&E) capacities. Strong country-led M&E systems are needed for DMCs to monitor progress and assess results of development efforts toward achieving their Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) and to integrate lessons of self-evaluation into their planning and budgeting.

3. The Independent Evaluation Department (IED) has been providing evaluation capacity development (ECD), through an ongoing regional technical assistance (TA),² to strengthen M&E capacities—both monitoring and self-evaluation—in some DMCs under the Greater Mekong Subregion (GMS) Program. The TA is supported by the People's Republic of China (PRC) Regional Cooperation and Poverty Reduction Fund. The fund also intends to cover ECD for DMCs under the Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation (CAREC) Program³ through this proposed regional TA, which was approved for inclusion in the fund by the regional cooperation community of practice (CoP) on 18 November 2008 and by the PRC Ministry of Finance on 17 December 2008.⁴ The TA's design and monitoring framework is in Appendix 1.

II. ISSUES

4. In some DMCs where M&E systems are well developed (e.g., Malaysia), the systems are considered a driver of success for the countries' socioeconomic progress. Unfortunately, good M&E systems are not prevalent in many DMCs due to lack of demand (e.g., lack of awareness, good governance, and/or political will) and/or supply (e.g., lack of sufficient M&E capacities in various government agencies). In line with commitments to the Paris Declaration and MDGs, the donor community has stepped up efforts to enhance DMC government awareness that good M&E systems are an essential element of MfDR to achieve development results. Although many DMCs have become aware of the importance of results-based M&E systems in the development process, transparency and political will are still lacking. Furthermore, many DMCs still need to

¹ ADB. 2008. *Strategy 2020: The Long-Term Strategic Framework of the Asian Development Bank 2008–2020*. Manila.

² ADB. 2007. *Technical Assistance for Capacity Development for Monitoring and Evaluation*. Manila (TA 6410-REG). Available: <http://www.adb.org/Evaluation/technical-assistance/ongoing-ta/prc-monitoring-evaluation.asp>

³ Initiated in 1997, the CAREC Program has been successful in advancing ADB's cooperation and integration work in the region. CAREC DMCs include Afghanistan, Azerbaijan, People's Republic of China (focusing on Xinjiang Uygur Autonomous Region), Kazakhstan, Kyrgyz Republic, Mongolia, Tajikistan, and Uzbekistan.

⁴ The TA first appeared in the business opportunities section of ADB's website on 24 August 2009.

progress their M&E systems by improving the M&E capacities of relevant government officials in key ministries responsible for planning, budgeting, and M&E activities.

5. ADB and other donors have been assisting DMCs in improving both the demand and supply sides of their M&E capacities and systems as part of MfDR efforts. Demand for ADB's TA operations for this purpose has been increasing. In February 2007, the Strategy and Policy Department established an internet-based CoP on MfDR (<http://cop-mfdr.adb.org>) as a platform for DMC public officials, organizations, and practitioners to share M&E knowledge and lessons in a timely, practical, and sustainable manner. This CoP has around 80 core members from 14 countries. In addition, the Central Operations Services Office has been providing training⁵ on project design and monitoring frameworks for better project performance management systems. Similarly, much of the training provided by RDs has also focused on the monitoring side of project M&E capacities related to data collection, statistical analysis, poverty assessment, and fiduciary arrangements.

6. The Central and West Asia Department (CWRD) has been providing training through many TA operations for its DMCs—especially those under the CAREC Program—to improve their M&E capacities for MfDR (e.g., in project monitoring related to data collection, statistical analysis, poverty and governance assessment, in accordance with the CAREC strategy).⁶ CWRD is shifting the focus of its M&E training to the evaluation side, including impact evaluation.

7. The changing development context of the Asia and Pacific region, together with the advent of learning organizations and knowledge-based economies, has fed stocktaking exercises⁷ in IED, which suggest emphasizing ECD⁸ as one of IED's strategies. Underpinned by Strategy 2020, which stresses good governance and capacity development as drivers of change to stimulate growth and broader development assistance, ECD can help sharpen MfDR at the organizational level in ADB and its DMCs. In this regard, IED has started to provide ECD within the context of development evaluation,⁹ through a regional TA (footnote 2), to help improve M&E capacities—not only monitoring, but also self-evaluation, including impact evaluation—in some GMS DMCs. The proposed regional TA for some CAREC DMCs aims to do the same as that for GMS DMCs, by helping strengthen national M&E systems, including self-evaluation capacities, of selected CAREC DMCs in line with their MfDR agenda. This will complement earlier results-based M&E training assistance provided by other departments and facilitate the MfDR mandate of ADB.

⁵ ADB. 2005. *Technical Assistance for Results-Focused Project Design and Management*. Manila (TA 6256-REG); and ADB. 2007. *Technical Assistance for Results-Focused Project Design and Management II*. Manila (TA 6394-REG).

⁶ ADB. 2004. *Regional Cooperation Strategy and Program for CAREC Member Countries*. Manila. Available: <http://www.adb.org/CAREC/default.asp>

⁷ See ADB. 2007. *Learning Lessons in ADB: Strategic Framework, 2007–2009*. Manila; and ADB. 2007. *Independent Evaluation at the Asian Development Bank*. Manila.

⁸ The importance of ECD is also reflected in a stronger demand for related knowledge products and services such as those offered by the International Program for Development Evaluation Training (www.ipdet.org) and the growth of evaluation associations.

⁹ Development evaluation is the systematic and objective assessment of an ongoing or completed development project, program, or policy and its design, implementation, and results to determine the relevance and fulfillment of objectives, development efficiency, effectiveness, impact, and sustainability (see Lundgren, H. and M. Kennedy, 2009. Supporting Partner Country Ownership and Capacity Development in Evaluation. In *Country-Led Monitoring and Evaluation Systems: Better Evidence, Better Policies, Better Development Results*, edited by Marco Segone. Geneva: United Nations Children's Fund).

III. THE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

A. Impact and Outcome

8. The impact of this regional TA will be institutionalized results-based M&E systems to support MfDR in selected CAREC DMCs. The outcome will be improved capacity and awareness in results-based M&E, including self-evaluation, of relevant officials from key ministries responsible for planning, budgeting, and M&E in selected CAREC DMCs.

B. Methodology and Key Activities

9. The TA covers 3 years and four CAREC DMCs (i.e., Kazakhstan, Kyrgyz Republic, Tajikistan, and Uzbekistan).¹⁰ However, in years 1 and 2, if any of these DMCs does not demonstrate sufficient demand for participating in the TA, it can be replaced by another CAREC DMC in subsequent year(s). The TA has seven outputs.

10. **Output 1: ECD Provided by the Shanghai International Program for Development Evaluation Training (SHIPDET).**¹¹ This is the major output of the TA, which will be delivered to about 20 TA participants selected from the four CAREC DMCs¹² (about five participants per DMC per year) in October each year for 3 years—2009, 2010, and 2011.

11. **Output 2: Analyses of Surveys on Client Satisfaction with SHIPDET and Intended Use of the Knowledge Gained.** A questionnaire will be prepared, translated into Russian, and distributed to the TA participants at the end of SHIPDET every year for 3 years to gauge their satisfaction with SHIPDET and how they intend to use the knowledge gained to improve their DMCs' M&E systems. An analysis of the surveys will then be prepared every year for 3 years to be (i) sent to SHIPDET organizers for course improvements, and (ii) used as input for the TA midterm and completion reports.

12. **Output 3: Regional Conference as an Add-On to SHIPDET.** To maximize the learning experiences of all participants at SHIPDET and to enhance partnerships between IED and other evaluation organizations, IED will organize a 1-day regional conference on development evaluation in year 1 of the TA (and organize more in different topics in years 2 and 3, depending on demand), in collaboration with the Asia-Pacific Finance and Development Center (AFDC).¹³

13. **Output 4: Publications of Various Learning Materials.** To widely disseminate the knowledge shared at the conference and SHIPDET, IED will publish (i) conference papers, and

¹⁰The criteria for selecting these CAREC DMCs are (i) since CWRD anticipates providing impact evaluation training to relevant officials in Kazakhstan and Kyrgyz Republic, the Shanghai International Program for Development Evaluation Training (SHIPDET) is a good background for the subsequent impact evaluation training; (ii) since Tajikistan has a relatively developed environment for M&E, this implies that the Government has sufficient demand for strengthening M&E; and (iii) since ADB, under its 2007 harmonization action plan, seeks to strengthen Uzbekistan's M&E capacities for poverty reduction, the SHIPDET course complements ADB's commitment.

¹¹ SHIPDET, started in early 2007, is cofinanced by ADB, Asia-Pacific Finance and Development Center (AFDC), PRC's Ministry of Finance, and World Bank. It is committed to promoting ECD for MfDR for developing countries in Asia and the Pacific, by providing M&E-related training courses and network building. Two SHIPDET courses are held annually in Shanghai: the spring course (around April) targets PRC government officials, while the fall course (around October) targets other developing country government officials and evaluation practitioners in the region. It also serves as a platform for knowledge sharing, networking, and support for MfDR practitioners.

¹² As described in footnote 11, SHIPDET is not restricted to participants from the four CAREC DMCs, but is also opened to relevant government officials from other developing countries and to evaluation practitioners.

¹³ AFDC, a regional knowledge platform, was established in Shanghai in 2004 under the Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation Program to promote regional cooperation and sustainable development. It hosts SHIPDET.

(ii) translated Russian versions of the summary of conference papers and summary of SHIPDET course materials for distribution to a wide audience. These will subsequently be available on the IED and other related websites.¹⁴ These activities will be done in year 1 of the TA (and done again in years 2 and 3 if regional conferences will be organized then).

14. **Output 5: Follow-On ECD.** An international consultant, engaged for about 10 days, will provide a 2–3-day follow-on M&E training course (with 2-day course preparation) after year 3 of SHIPDET to some former participants reselected by the four CAREC DMCs (up to five per DMC, totaling up to 20 for the four DMCs combined), with a venue to be selected in one of these DMCs, to take place around mid-2012, which is about 8 months after year 3 of SHIPDET. The course will focus on (i) how to compose self-evaluation completion reports (including how to do real-time and impact evaluations) using sample case studies; and (ii) discussions with the TA participants on the state of their DMCs' M&E systems and capacities as well as actual use of the knowledge gained from SHIPDET to improve their M&E systems, including how the findings and lessons from self-evaluation are incorporated into the planning and budgeting preparation.

15. **Output 6: Analysis of Knowledge Use and State of M&E Systems and Capacities.** Continued from activity (ii) of output 5, the consultant will spend the remaining 5–6 days (i) holding focus group discussions with other relevant key government officials (who were not former TA participants) in the DMC where follow-on training will take place (which will be used as a sample detailed country case)¹⁵ for fact finding and observation of the M&E system, capacity, and extent of improvement; (ii) based on information from various TA outputs and activities, preparing a brief analysis of the state of M&E system and capacity and the extent of actual use of the knowledge gained from SHIPDET to improve the M&E system for each of the four CAREC DMCs;¹⁶ and (iii) drawing appropriate recommendations for further M&E improvement for each of these DMCs, which will be used as input for the TA completion report.

16. **Output 7: M&E Knowledge-Sharing Networks Used and/or Partnerships Initiated.** SHIPDET will not only provide M&E-related training, but will also introduce the TA participants to (i) M&E knowledge-sharing networks (e.g., M&E CoP and MfDR CoP) in which they can participate to sustain knowledge gained, and (ii) various evaluation agencies and associations with which they can subsequently plan or initiate partnerships.

C. Cost and Financing

17. The total cost of the TA is estimated at \$500,000 equivalent. The TA will be financed on a grant basis by the People's Republic of China Regional Cooperation and Poverty Reduction Fund, and administered by ADB. Detailed cost estimates are in Appendix 2.

D. Implementation Arrangements

18. The TA will be implemented over 3 years (from September 2009 to August 2012). The Executing Agency is ADB, with IED as the focal point, supported by other stakeholders (i.e.,

¹⁴ The M&E CoP collaboration platform (www.linkingtoresults.org), housed within the MfDR CoP website (<http://cop-mfdr.adb.org>), aims to boost knowledge sharing and learning for M&E in the Asia and Pacific region. The platform was developed under an ongoing TA (footnote 2). Its initial members are ministry officials from Cambodia, Lao People's Democratic Republic, and Viet Nam.

¹⁵ If enough funds remain in the TA during the follow-on training, the consultant should also be sent to the remaining three CAREC DMCs (for about 2 days per DMC) to conduct fact finding and observations.

¹⁶ However, for the sample detailed country case where the follow-on training will be held, the information will be more solid and in-depth since the consultant will be able to conduct fact finding through focus group discussions with other relevant government officials who were not former TA participants, and to make his or her own observations.

CWRD, resident missions [RMs] of the four selected CAREC DMCs, and AFDC), who will help IED implement the TA as per the schedule in Appendix 3. IED will request that CWRD ask each of the four RMs to contact its usual government focal point to select about five officials per DMC per year (totaling about 20 officials per year from the four DMCs combined) as TA participants to attend SHIPDET in years 1–3 of the TA. The SHIPDET schedule for 2009 is 10–20 October. The officials to be selected should be different people each year, and they should come from key ministries responsible for planning, budgeting, and M&E activities.

19. Of the five officials to be selected per DMC per year, at least two should be high-level policy makers¹⁷ to try to increase awareness in terms of policy making, and the remaining officials should be mid-level officials to try to implement policies effectively. The four RMs will provide logistical support to the TA participants in their respective DMCs (e.g., processing visas, buying round-trip economy-class tickets, and providing advance per diem for the stay in Shanghai). The budget for these purposes will be transmitted by the Controller's Office to the four RMs once advance requests based on estimated expenditures for the activities for up to 6 months are received. Disbursements under the TA will be done in accordance with ADB's *Technical Assistance Disbursement Handbook* (2008, as amended from time to time). The TA has no procurement of equipment.

20. As mentioned in paras. 14 and 15, an international consultant will be hired after year 3 of SHIPDET participation for about 10 continuous days (in mid-2012) to (i) prepare and provide 2–3-day follow-on ECD in one of the four DMCs chosen as the venue; (ii) prepare a brief analysis of the state of M&E systems and capacities in the four DMCs, together with the extent of actual use of the knowledge gained from SHIPDET to improve the DMCs' M&E systems; and (iii) prepare a TA completion report. The consultant terms of reference is in Appendix 4. A national consultant, based in Manila for about 5 weeks intermittently over the 3-year course of the TA (1 week in year 1, and 2 weeks each in years 2 and 3), will be hired to (i) provide logistical support at various stages; (ii) prepare analyses of the client satisfaction surveys and intended use of the SHIPDET course in years 1–3 of the TA, and a TA midterm report in year 2; and (iii) finalize a TA completion report prepared by the international consultant in year 3. The consultant terms of reference is in Appendix 4.

21. Given the short-term nature of the international consultant and the intermittent nature of the national consultant, both will be engaged as individual consultants by ADB in accordance with ADB's *Guidelines on the Use of Consultants* (2007, as amended from time to time).

IV. THE PRESIDENT'S DECISION

22. The President, acting under the authority delegated by the Board, has approved ADB administering technical assistance not exceeding the equivalent of \$500,000 to be financed on a grant basis by the People's Republic of China Regional Cooperation and Poverty Reduction Fund for Capacity Development in Results-Based Monitoring and Evaluation for Countries under the Asian Development Bank's Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation Program, and hereby reports this action to the Board.

¹⁷ Since high-level policy makers are generally not available to attend a long training course like SHIPDET, AFDC and IED have recently explored an opportunity for organizing a shorter course, for about 2–3 days, as an add-on to SHIPDET, to increase awareness of high-level policy makers of the importance of results-based M&E systems and the need to institutionalize them in DMCs' planning and budgeting preparations. If such an opportunity materializes, then the five TA participants from each of the four DMCs in years 2 and 3 of the TA will be divided into two groups: (i) 2–3 high-level policy makers will be attending the proposed shorter training course, and (ii) the remaining 2–3 mid-level officials will be attending the regular SHIPDET course. The budget saved may be used to hire a resource speaker to deliver the proposed shorter training course. The TA cost estimates will then be adjusted accordingly.

DESIGN AND MONITORING FRAMEWORK

| Design Summary | Performance Targets and/or Indicators | Data Sources and/or Reporting Mechanisms | Assumptions and Risks |
|---|--|---|---|
| <p>Impact Institutionalized results-based M&E systems to support MfDR in the four CAREC DMCs (by mid-2012)</p> | <p>M&E systems (including self-evaluation findings and lessons) used to design national and sector policies and programs (in at least three of the four CAREC DMCs by mid-2012)</p> <p>M&E systems (including self-evaluation findings and lessons) used to support national and sector planning (in at least three of the four CAREC DMCs by mid-2012)</p> <p>M&E systems (including self-evaluation findings and lessons) used to support national and sector performance-based budgeting (in at least three of the four CAREC DMCs by mid-2012)</p> | <p>Government reports related to M&E project and program portfolio performance and completion</p> <p>Government documents on national and sector development policies and plans</p> <p>Related research publications from various sources</p> | <p>Assumptions Governments are aware that institutionalization of country-led M&E systems is a necessary condition for successful MfDR.</p> <p>Necessary policy, regulatory, and organizational arrangements are adapted or reformed to institutionalize results-based M&E systems.</p> <p>Risks Lack of sustainable demand or political will to make policy, regulatory, and organizational reforms for institutionalizing results-based M&E systems</p> <p>Fragmented governments with poor overall capacities as well as insufficient funding and staffing</p> |
| <p>Outcome Improved capacity and awareness in results-based M&E (including self-evaluation and its important links to planning and budgeting processes) of relevant officials from key ministries responsible for planning, budgeting, and M&E activities in the four CAREC DMCs (by mid-2012)</p> | <p>Results-based M&E units created and functional at the national level (in the four CAREC DMCs by mid-2012)</p> <p>Results-based M&E units created and functional at the local or sector level (in at least two of the four CAREC DMCs by mid-2012)</p> <p>At least 50% of the trainees who attended SHIPDET engaged full-time in M&E functions (in the four CAREC DMCs by mid-2012)</p> | <p>TA DMF</p> <p>TA analyses of surveys on client satisfaction and intended use of the knowledge gained from SHIPDET</p> <p>TA midterm report</p> <p>TA analysis of the actual use of the knowledge gained from SHIPDET</p> <p>TA completion report</p> | <p>Assumptions Governments in the four CAREC DMCs are aware of the need to create results-based M&E units at the national, local, and sector levels and to upgrade M&E-related capacities of their staff members to help strengthen self-evaluation capacity and facilitate MfDR.</p> <p>Governments are aware that self-evaluation capacity (and not only</p> |

| Design Summary | Performance Targets and/or Indicators | Data Sources and/or Reporting Mechanisms | Assumptions and Risks |
|----------------|--|--|---|
| | <p>At least 50% of full-time staff members working at the national results-based M&E units provided with M&E-related training (in the four CAREC DMCs by mid-2012)</p> <p>At least 50% of line ministries' externally-funded projects assisted by the national results-based M&E units by helping monitor project progress, e.g., by providing M&E-related guidance and assisting in data collection or statistical analysis (in the four CAREC DMCs by mid-2012)</p> <p>At least 25% of line ministries' externally-funded projects assisted by the national results-based M&E units by helping prepare EA PCRs, e.g., by providing guidance, suggestions, or training on self-evaluation (in at least three of the four CAREC DMCs by mid-2012)</p> <p>At least 25% of line ministries' externally-funded projects assisted by the national results-based M&E units by helping prepare ADB PCRs, e.g., by providing assistance in data gathering or compilation (in at least three of the four CAREC DMCs by mid-2012)</p> | | <p>monitoring capacity) is an important part of results-based M&E systems.</p> <p>Governments are aware of the need for national results-based M&E units to provide support to line ministries for project monitoring and EA PCRs, as well as to ADB project staff members for ADB PCRs.</p> <p>Governments have clear visions about the purpose of the TA and how it is to be achieved.</p> <p>Risks Lack of sustainable demands and political will to create country-led results-based M&E units and to strengthen their roles in supporting line ministries and EAs in project monitoring and self-evaluation</p> <p>Fragmented governments with poor overall capacities as well as insufficient funding and staffing</p> <p>Lack of critical mass of well-trained staff members in the national or local results-based M&E units</p> <p>TA training participants underestimate the importance of ownership of developing national M&E capacities</p> |

| Design Summary | Performance Targets and/or Indicators | Data Sources and/or Reporting Mechanisms | Assumptions and Risks |
|--|---|---|---|
| <p>Outputs ECD provided by SHIPDET to high- and mid-level officials from key ministries, responsible for planning, budgeting, and M&E activities, in the four CAREC DMCs (in October 2009, 2010, and 2011)</p> <p>Analyses of the surveys on client satisfaction with SHIPDET and intended use of the knowledge gained prepared for 3 years of the TA (by March 2010, 2011, and 2012)</p> <p>Regional conference conducted as an add-on to SHIPDET (in October 2009)</p> <p>Publications and dissemination of various learning materials produced in year 1 of the TA (by mid-2010)</p> | <p>Five high- and mid-level government officials per DMC per year, totaling 20 officials from the four CAREC DMCs per year, trained in M&E at SHIPDET (in October each year for 3 years— 2009, 2010, and 2011)</p> <p>Questionnaire for surveys on client satisfaction with SHIPDET and intended use of the knowledge gained prepared, translated into Russian, and distributed to TA participants at the end of SHIPDET (in October 2009, 2010, and 2011)</p> <p>Survey results used by a national consultant in preparing survey analyses for 3 years (by March 2010, 2011, and 2012)</p> <p>A 1-day regional conference on development evaluation organized at SHIPDET by IED, in collaboration with AFDC (in year 1 of the TA, and to be organized again in years 2 and 3, depending on demand)</p> <p>Summary of SHIPDET course materials and summary of conference papers translated into Russian for distribution to the TA participants during year 1 of SHIPDET (October 2009)</p> <p>The Russian versions of the summary of SHIPDET course materials and summary of conference papers published and disseminated by IED in year 1 of the TA (by mid-2010)</p> | <p>TA DMF</p> <p>TA analyses of surveys on client satisfaction and intended use of the knowledge gained from SHIPDET</p> <p>TA midterm report</p> <p>TA analysis of the actual use of the knowledge gained from SHIPDET</p> <p>TA completion report</p> | <p>Assumptions IED is ready to organize the conference.</p> <p>CWRD assists in requesting RMs in the CAREC DMCs to contact their respective governments to select high- and mid-level officials from key ministries (responsible for planning, budgeting, and M&E activities) as TA training participants.</p> <p>High- and mid-level ministry officials are available as TA participants.</p> <p>RMs in the CAREC DMCs assist in making travel arrangements for TA participants, interpreters, and translators.</p> <p>IED, SHIPDET's resource persons and organizers, TA participants, interpreters, and translators perform their tasks well.</p> <p>Risks Lack of government demand to send a sufficient number of ministry officials as TA participants</p> <p>Delay in government selection processes</p> |

| Design Summary | Performance Targets and/or Indicators | Data Sources and/or Reporting Mechanisms | Assumptions and Risks |
|---|--|--|-----------------------|
| <p>A 2–3-day follow-on ECD provided after year 3 of SHIPDET participation (in mid-2012)</p> | <p>All conference papers published in English and disseminated by IED in year 1 of the TA (by mid-2010)</p> <p>A few-day follow-on ECD course prepared by an international consultant, focusing on (i) how to compose self-evaluation completion reports (including how to do real-time and impact evaluations) using sample case studies, and (ii) discussions with the TA participants on the state of M&E systems and capacities in their DMCs as well as actual use of the knowledge gained from SHIPDET to improve their DMCs' M&E systems—both the monitoring side and the self-evaluation side—including how the findings and lessons from self-evaluation were integrated into the planning and budgeting preparation (in mid-2012 or within 8 months after year 3 of SHIPDET participation in October 2011)</p> <p>Up to five high- and mid-level government officials who used to attend SHIPDET reselected by each of the four CAREC DMCs (totaling up to 20 combined) as the participants to attend the follow-on ECD course provided by the international consultant in a DMC to be selected as the training venue (in mid-2012)</p> <p>The follow-on ECD course delivered by the international consultant to the above group of participants (in mid-2012)</p> | | |

| Design Summary | Performance Targets and/or Indicators | Data Sources and/or Reporting Mechanisms | Assumptions and Risks |
|--|---|---|------------------------------|
| <p>Analysis of how the knowledge gained from SHIPDET has actually been used, with brief analysis of the state of the M&E systems and capacities, prepared for the four CAREC DMCs after year 3 of SHIPDET participation (in mid-2012)</p> <p>M&E knowledge-sharing networks used and/or partnerships initiated (by mid-2012)</p> | <p>Observations and focus group discussions held by the international consultant with other relevant key government officials (who were not former SHIPDET participants) in the DMC selected as the follow-on training venue (which will be used as a sample detailed country case) to find out more on the state of the DMC M&E system and capacity as well as the extent of actual use of the knowledge gained from SHIPDET to improve the M&E system (in mid-2012)</p> <p>The data obtained above and from other sources used by the international consultant to prepare an analysis of actual use of the knowledge gained from SHIPDET to improve the M&E systems in the four CAREC DMCs, together with the state of their M&E systems and capacities, which will be used as input for the TA completion report (in mid-2012)</p> <p>M&E knowledge-sharing networks (e.g., M&E CoP and MfDR CoP) used by TA participants (in years 2–3 of the TA by mid-2012)</p> <p>Partnerships planned or initiated by the TA participants with other evaluation agencies or associations (in years 2–3 of the TA by mid-2012)</p> | | |

| Activities with Milestones | Inputs |
|---|---|
| <p>Selecting participants from the four CAREC DMCs to attend SHIPDET (see details in Appendix 3)</p> <p>Providing and attending SHIPDET, regional conference, and follow-on training workshop</p> <p>Analyzing client satisfaction surveys</p> <p>Translating summaries of conference papers and SHIPDET course materials into Russian</p> <p>Publishing and disseminating conference papers and the translated Russian versions of the summaries of conference papers and SHIPDET course materials</p> <p>Participating in M&E knowledge-sharing networks and developing partnerships</p> <p>Conducting observations and focus group discussions</p> <p>Analyzing how the knowledge gained from SHIPDET has been used to improve the M&E systems, together with the state of M&E systems and capacities, in the four CAREC DMCs</p> <p>Preparing midterm and final reports</p> | <p>\$500,000 financed by the PRC Regional Cooperation and Poverty Reduction Fund to cover the costs of (i) consulting services from international consultant (about 10 days continuous in year 3), and national consultant (about 5 weeks intermittently over 3 years); (ii) attendance in SHIPDET training; (iii) surveys, reports, translations, and publications; and (iv) regional conference and follow-on training workshop</p> |

ADB = Asian Development Bank, AFDC = Asia-Pacific Finance and Development Center, CAREC = Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation, CoP = community of practice, CWRD = Central and West Asia Department, DMC = developing member country, DMF = design and monitoring framework, EA = executing agency, ECD = evaluation capacity development, IED = Independent Evaluation Department, M&E = monitoring and evaluation, MfDR = managing for development results, PCR = project or program completion report, PRC = People's Republic of China, RM = resident mission, SHIPDET = Shanghai International Program for Development Evaluation Training, TA = technical assistance.

Source: Prepared by TA staff.

COST ESTIMATES^a
(\$)

| Item | Year | | | Total Cost |
|---|----------------|----------------|----------------|----------------|
| | 1 | 2 | 3 | |
| A. Consultants | | | | |
| 1. International ^b | | | | |
| a. Remuneration and Per Diem | 0 | 0 | 10,550 | 10,550 |
| b. Roundtrip Airfare | 0 | 0 | 6,000 | 6,000 |
| c. Miscellaneous Expenses (e.g., visa fees) | 0 | 0 | 200 | 200 |
| d. Reports and Communications | 0 | 0 | 500 | 500 |
| e. Contingencies | 0 | 0 | 1,700 | 1,700 |
| Subtotal (A1) | 0 | 0 | 18,950 | 18,950 |
| 2. National ^c | | | | |
| a. Remuneration | 625 | 1,250 | 1,250 | 3,125 |
| b. Miscellaneous Administration and Support Costs | 500 | 500 | 500 | 1,500 |
| c. Contingencies | 70 | 120 | 120 | 310 |
| Subtotal (A2) | 1,195 | 1,870 | 1,870 | 4,935 |
| Subtotal (A) | 1,195 | 1,870 | 20,820 | 23,885 |
| B. Training, Seminars, and Conferences | | | | |
| 1. SHIPDET Training and Conference in Shanghai ^d | | | | |
| a. TA Participants | | | | |
| i. Roundtrip Airfare | 50,000 | 50,000 | 50,000 | 150,000 |
| ii. Miscellaneous Expenses (e.g., visa fees) | 3,000 | 3,000 | 3,000 | 9,000 |
| iii. DSAs and Accommodations | 61,100 | 61,100 | 61,100 | 183,300 |
| iv. Study Tour | 1,000 | 1,000 | 1,000 | 3,000 |
| Subtotal (B1a) | 115,100 | 115,100 | 115,100 | 345,300 |
| b. Interpreters and Translators | | | | |
| i. Remuneration ^e | 6,480 | 6,480 | 6,480 | 19,440 |
| ii. Roundtrip Airfare | 5,000 | 5,000 | 5,000 | 15,000 |
| iii. Miscellaneous Expenses (e.g., visa fees) | 300 | 300 | 300 | 900 |
| iv. DSAs and Accommodations | 6,110 | 6,110 | 6,110 | 18,330 |
| Subtotal (B1b) | 17,890 | 17,890 | 17,890 | 53,670 |
| Subtotal (B1) | 132,990 | 132,990 | 132,990 | 398,970 |
| 2. Follow-On Training in a CAREC Country ^f | | | | |
| a. TA Participants | | | | |
| i. Roundtrip Airfare ^g | 0 | 0 | 9,000 | 9,000 |
| ii. DSAs and Accommodations ^g | 0 | 0 | 9,750 | 9,750 |
| iii. Miscellaneous Allowances ^h | 0 | 0 | 1,000 | 1,000 |
| iv. Ground Transport Allowances ⁱ | 0 | 0 | 250 | 250 |
| Subtotal (B2a) | 0 | 0 | 20,000 | 20,000 |
| b. Interpreters and Translators | | | | |
| i. Remuneration ^e | 0 | 0 | 1,080 | 1,080 |
| ii. Miscellaneous Allowances | 0 | 0 | 200 | 200 |
| iii. Ground Transport Allowances | 0 | 0 | 60 | 60 |
| Subtotal (B2b) | 0 | 0 | 1,340 | 1,340 |
| Subtotal (B2) | 0 | 0 | 21,340 | 21,340 |

| Item | Year | | | Total Cost |
|---|----------------|----------------|----------------|----------------|
| | 1 | 2 | 3 | |
| 3. Publications of Conference Papers and Selected Course Materials (English and Russian Versions) | 1,500 | 1,500 | 1,500 | 4,500 |
| 4. Miscellaneous Administration and Other Support Costs | 0 | 0 | 9,600 | 9,600 |
| Subtotal (B) | 134,490 | 134,490 | 165,430 | 434,410 |
| C. Contingencies | 13,000 | 13,000 | 15,705 | 41,705 |
| Total (A+B+C) | 148,685 | 149,360 | 201,955 | 500,000 |

CAREC = Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation, DSA = daily subsistence allowance, SHIPDET = Shanghai International Program for Development Evaluation Training, TA = technical assistance.

^a Financed by the People's Republic of China Regional Cooperation and Poverty Reduction Fund.

^b About 10 days in year

^c Spread over 3 years: 1 week in year 1, 2 weeks in year 2, and 2 weeks in year 3.

^d The Asia-Pacific Finance and Development Center has agreed to waive tuition fees for TA participants.

^e Payment for verbal simultaneous interpretation and translation during training, seminars, workshops, and conferences is set at \$250 (plus \$20 premium) equivalent, regardless of working hours and time needed for travel. Provision of services is defined as full-time work while on mission, and when interpreter or translator has free time between meetings, he or she is expected to do written translations as well, which would not be counted as separate service.

^f The follow-on training will be held in one of the four CAREC countries (to be chosen later as the venue), with about five participants each from the four countries (totaling about 20 participants).

^g Roundtrip airfares, DSAs, and accommodations are provided only to participants from non-venue countries, excluding the venue country.

^h Miscellaneous allowances are provided to all participants.

ⁱ Ground transport allowances are provided only to participants from the venue country.

Note: SHIPDET runs from 10 to 20 October 2009 in year 1.

Source: Estimated by TA staff.

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE IMPLEMENTATION SCHEDULE

| Technical Assistance Activities | August 2009 | | | | September 2009 | | | | October 2009 | | | |
|---|-------------|----|-----|----|----------------|----|-----|----|--------------|----|-----|----|
| | I | II | III | IV | I | II | III | IV | I | II | III | IV |
| 1. Organize a regional conference on development evaluation as an add-on to SHIPDET. 1.1 IED, in collaboration with AFDC, organizes a regional conference on the first day of SHIPDET (10 October 2009). 1.2 IED publishes conference papers and summaries of translated conference papers and translated course materials (by mid-2010). | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2. Identify about 20 government officials from the four selected CAREC DMCs (about five per DMC) as the TA participants to attend SHIPDET in Shanghai during 10–20 October 2009. 2.1 IED requests that CWRD ask RMs in the four chosen CAREC DMCs to contact their respective governments to select relevant high- and mid-level officials from key ministries responsible for planning, budgeting, and M&E activities (about five per DMC, totaling about 20 officials from the four DMCs combined) as the TA participants to be trained at SHIPDET. 2.2 CWRD sends the above requests to the country directors of the four RMs. 2.3 Each RM contacts its usual government focal point to select about five high- and mid-level officials as the TA participants to attend SHIPDET in Shanghai during 10–20 October 2009 and to arrive in Shanghai on 9 October 2009. <i>(Note: If some DMCs do not allow their government officials to be away for so long, a 7-day participation, from 10 to 16 October 2009, is adequate.)</i> 2.4 Each government selects about five high- and mid-level officials from key ministries as the TA participants. 2.5 Each government sends a list of the selected officials (indicating their positions and the number of days that they can attend SHIPDET) to the RM. 2.6 Each RM sends the list of the TA participants to CWRD and IED for finalization. 2.7 IED sends the lists of the selected officials from the four CAREC DMCs to the SHIPDET organizer. | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 3. Identify two interpreters and translators to attend SHIPDET for instantaneous interpretation of the SHIPDET course to the TA participants, and to translate the following required documents into Russian: (i) questionnaire of client surveys (which will be translated back into English after being filled out by the TA participants), (ii) summary of conference papers, and (iii) summary of selected course materials. 3.1 IED identifies two interpreters and translators, in consultation with CWRD. | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 4. Liaise with CTL to transmit the required amount from the TA budget to the four RMs to assist in travel arrangements for the TA participants and interpreters and translators to attend SHIPDET (see activity 5 below). 4.1 IED contacts CTL to transmit the required amount from the TA budget to the four RMs to assist in travel arrangements of the TA participants and interpreters and translators. 4.2 CTL transmits the required amount from the TA budget to the four RMs once advance requests based on estimated expenditures for the activities for up to 6 months are received, in accordance with ADB's <i>Technical Assistance Disbursement Handbook</i> . ^a | | | | | | | | | | | | |

| Technical Assistance Activities | August 2009 | | | | September 2009 | | | | October 2009 | | | |
|--|-------------|----|-----|----|----------------|----|-----|----|--------------|----|-----|----|
| | I | II | III | IV | I | II | III | IV | I | II | III | IV |
| 5. Provide travel arrangements to the TA participants and interpreters and translators to attend SHIPDET. | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 5.1 The four RMs assist the TA participants and interpreters and translators in their respective DMCs in, among others, (i) processing visas to PRC; (ii) buying roundtrip economy-class tickets; and (iii) providing advance per diem for staying in Shanghai, in accordance with the budget breakdown in Appendix 2. (Notes: The two interpreters and translators may come only from one DMC, so travel arrangements for them will be relevant only to the RM from which they come. In addition, the remunerations for the interpreters and translators will be paid directly to them by the TA after they have completed their services.) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 6. Arrive in Shanghai on 9 October 2009 to attend SHIPDET from 10 to 20 October 2009. | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 6.1 The TA participants and two interpreters and translators arrive in Shanghai on 9 October 2009 to attend SHIPDET from 10 to 20 October 2009. | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 7. Fill out the questionnaire on client satisfaction surveys. | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 7.1 The TA participants fill out the questionnaire on client satisfaction surveys, which also indicates their plans on how to use the M&E-related knowledge gained from SHIPDET to improve national M&E systems, including self-evaluation practices, in their DMCs. | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 8. Analyze results of client satisfaction surveys. | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 8.1 The national consultant based in Manila analyzes the results of the client surveys (around March 2010). | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 8.2 The national consultant also conducts other tasks as specified in Appendix 4. | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 9. Repeat steps 2–8 in years 2 and 3 of the TA. | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 9.1 IED repeats steps 2–8 above in years 2 and 3 of the TA (exact time frame to be determined). | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 10. Provide Follow-on training in year 3 of the TA. | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 10.1 The international consultant provides a few-day follow-on M&E training in one of the four CAREC DMCs in year 3 of the TA, focusing on (i) how to compose self-evaluation completion reports (including how to do real-time and impact evaluations), and (ii) sharing experiences on the state of DMC M&E systems and capacities as well as on actual use of the knowledge gained from SHIPDET to improve DMC M&E systems (around mid-2012). | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 11. Analyze how the knowledge gained from SHIPDET has been used to improve DMC M&E systems. | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 11.1 The international consultant analyzes the state of M&E systems and capacities in the four CAREC DMCs, and how the knowledge gained from SHIPDET has been used to improve the DMCs' M&E systems (around mid-2012). | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 11.2 The international consultant also conducts other tasks as specified in Appendix 4. | | | | | | | | | | | | |

ADB = Asian Development Bank, AFDC = Asia-Pacific Finance and Development Center, CAREC = Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation, CTL = Controller's Department, CWRD = Central and West Asia Department, DMC = developing member country, IED = Independent Evaluation Department, M&E = monitoring and evaluation, PRC = People's Republic of China, RM = resident mission, SHIPDET = Shanghai International Program for Development Evaluation Training, TA = technical assistance.

^aADB. 2008. *Technical Assistance Disbursement Handbook*. Manila.

Source: Prepared by TA staff.

TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR CONSULTANTS

1. The technical assistance (TA) for Capacity Development in Results-Based Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) for Countries under the Asian Development Bank's (ADB) Central Asian Regional Economic Cooperation (CAREC) Program will be implemented over a 3-year period, from September 2009 to August 2012. It will engage one international consultant (for about 10 continuous days in year 3 of the TA) and one national consultant based in Manila (for about 5 weeks intermittently over the 3-year period of the TA). Given the short-term nature of the former and intermittent nature of the latter, both consultants will be engaged as individual consultants by ADB in accordance with the *Guidelines on the Use of Consultants* (2007, as amended from time to time).

A. International Consultant (Development Evaluation Specialist)

2. An international consultant will be hired for about 10 continuous days (excluding travel days) in year 3 of the TA—around June 2012, or within 8 months after the third year of sending participants to attend the Shanghai International Program for Development Evaluation Training (SHIPDET) in October 2011. The consultant's major tasks include (i) preparing and providing a few-day follow-on M&E-related training course, focusing on self-evaluation, to some TA participants who have earlier attended SHIPDET; (ii) preparing an analysis of the extent of actual use of the knowledge gained from SHIPDET to improve the M&E systems in each of the four CAREC developing member countries (DMCs) included in the TA (i.e., Kazakhstan, Kyrgyz Republic, Tajikistan, and Uzbekistan), based on discussions with the training participants, other stakeholders, and other sources of information (e.g., analyses of client surveys prepared by the national consultant); and (iii) using this analysis to prepare a TA completion report. The international consultant will have (i) a graduate degree in economics or a related field; (ii) experience in completing several evaluation studies; (iii) work experience in one or more of the four CAREC DMCs; (iv) extensive experience as a trainer on M&E-related topics, particularly in development evaluation; (v) proficiency in various computer programs (e.g., Microsoft Word, Excel, and PowerPoint); and (vi) his or her own laptop computer.

3. The terms of reference for the international consultant include

- (i) spending 2 days in his or her home country preparing a few-day follow-on M&E training course, focusing on (a) how to compose self-evaluation completion reports (including how to do real-time and impact evaluations) using sample case studies, and (b) discussions with TA participants on the state of their DMCs' M&E systems and capacities as well as on actual use of the knowledge gained from SHIPDET to improve the M&E systems;
- (ii) providing a 2–3-day follow-on M&E training course in one of the four CAREC DMCs to be selected later;
- (iii) spending 2 days doing observations and holding focus group discussions with other relevant key government officials (who were not former SHIPDET participants) in the DMC selected as the follow-on training venue (which will be used as a sample detailed country case) to find out more on (a) the state of the DMC M&E system and capacity, and (b) the extent of actual use of the knowledge gained from SHIPDET to improve the M&E system;
- (iv) spending the remaining days on
 - (a) based on relevant information from various sources (e.g., the above discussions, analyses of 3 years of client satisfaction with SHIPDET surveys prepared by the national consultant, TA midterm report prepared by the national consultant, and other sources), preparing 8–10 pages of

- analysis of the use of the knowledge gained from SHIPDET to improve M&E systems, together with the state of the M&E systems and capacities, in all four CAREC DMCs (using ADB format); and
- (b) based on the above analysis, preparing a few-page TA completion report (using the TA completion report format); and
 - (v) liaising with TA stakeholders as required, including ADB's Independent Evaluation Department in Manila; Asia-Pacific Finance and Development Center, which is the SHIPDET organizer in Shanghai; ADB's resident missions in the four CAREC DMCs; and the national consultant based in Manila.

B. National Consultant Based in Manila (Evaluation Specialist)

4. A national consultant based in Manila will be hired for about 5 weeks intermittently during the 3-year period of the TA (1 week in year 1, and 2 weeks each in years 2 and 3). In year 1, the consultant will conduct an analysis of client surveys in March 2010. In year 2, he or she will conduct an analysis of client surveys and complete a TA midterm report in March 2011. In year 3, he or she will conduct an analysis of client surveys in March 2012 (to be used as an input by the international consultant to prepare an analysis of actual use of the knowledge gained from SHIPDET and a TA completion report), and finalize the TA completion report prepared by the international consultant in July or August 2012. The consultant's major tasks include (i) preparing analyses of the results of 3 years of client surveys of the SHIPDET courses and a TA midterm report, and (ii) finalizing the TA completion report prepared by the international consultant. The consultant will have (i) a graduate degree in economics or a related field; (ii) experience in conducting evaluation studies; and (iii) proficiency in various computer programs (e.g., Microsoft Word, Excel, and PowerPoint).

5. The terms of reference for the national consultant include
- (i) preparing a few-page analysis (using ADB format) of the results of client satisfaction surveys from the SHIPDET courses in each of the 3 years of the TA;
 - (ii) based on the analyses above and other sources of information, preparing a few-page TA midterm report (using ADB format) in year 2 of the TA;
 - (iii) finalizing the TA completion report prepared by the international consultant (using the TA completion report format) in year 3 of the TA;
 - (iv) liaising with TA stakeholders as required, including Asia-Pacific Finance and Development Center, Independent Evaluation Department, resident missions, and the international consultant; and
 - (v) providing logistic support at various stages as required.