



Technical Assistance

TAR: STU 38645

Technical Assistance for Selected Evaluation Studies for 2005

May 2005

Operations Evaluation Department
Asian Development Bank

ABBREVIATIONS

ADB	–	Asian Development Bank
CAPE	–	country assistance program evaluation
CAR	–	Central Asian Republic
CSO	–	civil-society organization
CSP	–	country strategy and program
DEC	–	Development Effectiveness Committee
DMC	–	developing member country
ECG	–	Evaluation Cooperation Group
GPS	–	good-practice standards
MDB	–	multilateral development bank
NGO	–	nongovernment organization
OED	–	Operations Evaluation Department
SAPE	–	sector assistance program evaluation
TA	–	technical assistance

NOTE

In this report, “\$” refers to US dollars.

This report was prepared by E. P. Rodriguez, principal development effectiveness specialist;
and J. G. Tubadeza, senior evaluation officer.

I. INTRODUCTION

1. The Operations Evaluation Department (OED) of the Asian Development Bank (ADB) independently evaluates the development effectiveness of ADB's operations. The operations evaluation program includes (i) assessing the performance of completed projects, programs, and technical assistance (TA); (ii) reviewing and validating self-evaluation activities of operational departments; (iii) providing feedback for the design and review of new operations, strategies, and policies; (iv) monitoring and reporting on ADB's and executing agencies' responses to OED evaluation recommendations; (v) building evaluation capacity in developing member countries (DMCs); and (vi) harmonizing evaluation practices and sharing evaluation experience with other multilateral development banks (MDBs) through the Evaluation Cooperation Group (ECG).¹ In recent years, OED has increased the number of broad evaluations that assess impacts and lessons from groups of sector or country operations, or that address institutional development issues, themes, approaches, or policies. OED is increasingly disseminating its findings in printed form and on the Internet.

2. On 1 January 2004, OED's independence and effectiveness were enhanced when it started to report directly to ADB's Board of Directors through the Board's Development Effectiveness Committee (DEC).² OED independently selects completed projects, programs, and TAs for individual performance audit. In consultation with operational departments, topics for broad evaluation studies are selected on the basis of upcoming work on new policies, strategies, programs, and projects that would directly benefit from the evaluations. DEC provides overall guidance to OED. In 2004, DEC endorsed for the first time a 3-year rolling work program for OED, covering 2005–2007 (Appendix 1). The 2005 work program is fully specified; the 2006–2007 work programs are provisional and flexible enough to respond to changes in institutional evaluation priorities. The 2005 slice of the program was presented to the Board in the overall administrative budget of ADB for 2005³ as the basis for Board approval of OED's budget for 2005.

3. OED's 2005–2007 work program features (i) a continuing but declining number of evaluations of randomly selected individual operations; (ii) an increase in broad evaluations in the form of impact and special evaluation studies, country assistance program evaluations (CAPEs), sector assistance program evaluations (SAPEs), and evaluations of ADB policies and operational approaches; (iii) continued improvement of the evaluative content of the OED annual reports on portfolio management and evaluation results; (iv) preparation or revision of evaluation guidelines; and (v) a sequencing of evaluations so that those done in the earlier part of the 3-year period feed or link into evaluations planned for the later years.

4. OED's 2005 work program includes (i) 23 individual performance audits of completed ADB-assisted operations (20 in the public sector, 3 in the private sector) and 4 TA performance audits; (ii) 10 broad evaluation studies that will begin in 2005 and be completed in 2006; (iii) several other recurring outputs, including the two OED annual reports to the Board; (iv) evaluation of selected ongoing operations; and (v) updating of guidelines for evaluation of

¹ ADB chairs the ECG in 2005/06. Established in 1995, the ECG aimed to: (i) strengthen the use of evaluation for greater effectiveness and accountability of MDBs; (ii) share and help disseminate lessons from MDB evaluations; (iii) harmonize performance indicators, evaluation methodologies, and approaches; (iv) enhance evaluation professionalism within MDBs and collaborate with the heads of evaluation units of bilateral and multilateral development organizations; and (v) facilitate the involvement of borrowing member countries in evaluation and promote their evaluation capacity.

² ADB. 2003. *Enhancing the Independence and Effectiveness of the Operations Evaluation Department*. Manila.

³ ADB. 2004. *Budget of the Asian Development Bank for 2005*. Manila.

public sector operations, adoption of guidelines for private sector operations, and development of CAPE guidelines.

II. ISSUES

5. The 10 broad evaluation studies in the 2005 OED work program (Appendix 1) will consist of the following:

- (i) **One impact evaluation study.** Impact evaluation studies assess the results of a group of activities in a sector, or compare the results of similar activities in different DMCs. They emphasize the broad institutional and development outcomes of ADB-assisted activities and combine impact evaluations of ADB operations and of ADB policies.
- (ii) **Two special evaluation studies.** Such studies are undertaken on a wide range of topics, frequently operational approaches or strategic concerns of ADB.
- (iii) **Three policy and procedure evaluations.** These evaluations reassess ADB policies and modalities in implementing the long-term strategic framework and reform agenda.
- (iv) **Two CAPEs.** CAPEs assess the full range of ADB activities within a DMC over a decade or more. They address issues relating to, and make recommendations on, the focus of ADB activities in a DMC, including the sector mix and use of assistance modalities. CAPEs assess current country strategies and programs (CSPs) and are used as input to formulate new CSPs. Given the country focus of ADB operations, country-level evaluations play a large role in evaluation.
- (v) **Two SAPEs.** SAPEs assess the relevance, effectiveness, and sustainability of ADB's assistance to a sector's development and financing, as well as the impact of such aid on economic development and poverty reduction in a DMC.

6. The 10 broad evaluation studies are complex, requiring consulting and other external services and materials. These inputs are financed through regional TA. This resource allocation is included in the Technical Assistance Special Fund envelope in the President's operational resource parameters for 2005. In the context of these parameters, the external services and materials for 3 of the 10 studies could be covered through funds available from a previous regional TA approved for the same purpose.⁴ This proposed TA is required to fund the external services and materials for the remaining seven new studies as well as dissemination enhancement and ECG-related activities. These outputs are described in the next section, which presents the TA proposal.

7. The broad evaluation studies will require a longer time and a larger budget than evaluations of individual operations because they are significantly more complex.⁵ For the same reason, the seven studies are expected to be completed in 2006 rather than 2005, and require more OED staff time to accomplish.

⁴ ADB. 2004. *Proposed Technical Assistance for Selected Evaluation Studies for 2004*. Manila (TA 6169-REG, for \$1,400,000).

⁵ A broad evaluation requires on average three times more resources than an evaluation of an individual operation.

III. THE PROPOSED TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

A. Impact and Outcome

8. A design and monitoring framework for the TA is in Appendix 2.⁶ The goal of this TA is to help improve the development effectiveness of ADB operations and policies based on lessons and recommendations resulting from a sound evaluation of relevance, efficacy, efficiency, sustainability, and impacts. The purpose of the TA is to generate useful and practical lessons and recommendations that will support the formulation of new CSPs, sector strategies, policies, and projects. Performance targets and indicators are defined in the attached framework.

B. Methodology and Key Activities

9. The TA's nine outputs and their respective scopes, approaches, and activities will be as follows.

10. **Impact Evaluation Study on the Road Sector in Indonesia.** Road transport is dominant in Indonesia, carrying 92% of total freight transport and 84% of passenger movements. ADB's road sector strategy recognizes the need to balance service to resource-rich and resource-poor provinces, to decentralize administration to local governments, and to finance road projects through innovative private and public partnerships. ADB lending has focused on (i) improving the quality of the road network and (ii) strengthening the capacity of central and regional government agencies. The CSP for Indonesia⁷ covers 2003–2005, so a new CSP is planned in 2006. An ongoing CAPE and the study will provide critical inputs to the new CSP. The study will be designed to measure the development impact of ADB's activities to date in the road sector and to make recommendations for road projects under the new CSP.

11. **Special Evaluation Study on Approaches to Local Institutional Capacity Development in Water Resource and Rural Infrastructure Projects.** Most of these projects have capacity development components. However, the impact of capacity development on project sustainability in these sectors has not been assessed in-depth. Capacity development comprises activities that aim to improve the capabilities of DMC agencies to plan and design, implement, and operate and maintain projects and programs. The study will focus on capacity to operate and maintain projects and programs as it is directly related to project sustainability. The study will further focus on local technical and financial capacity, which is key for successful and sustainable project performance. The evaluation results will be used in the ADB-wide review that has been initiated on approaches to supporting capacity development in DMCs in general.

12. **Special Evaluation Study on Involvement of Civil-Society Organizations (CSOs) in ADB's Social Infrastructure Operations.** Integrating the experience, knowledge, and expertise of CSOs into ADB operations helps ensure that development interventions effectively serve people's priorities and needs. In its operations ADB interacts increasingly with international, regional, and national CSOs, including nongovernment organizations (NGOs), trade unions, indigenous peoples' movements, foundations, and faith-based organizations. ADB interacts with CSOs that actively collaborate in operations as well as with policy advocacy groups. ADB's policy, established in 1987 and broadened in 1998, mandates that ADB increase its cooperation with CSOs. A range of modalities for partnerships between ADB and CSOs has evolved, and new modalities for participation continue to be explored, particularly in the social

⁶ The regional TA first appeared in *ADB Business Opportunities* (Internet version) on 19 December 2004.

⁷ ADB. 2002. *Country Strategy and Program (2003–2005): Indonesia*. Manila.

infrastructure sector. The study aims to (i) assess the scope of CSO involvement in ADB social infrastructure operations, (ii) compare the effectiveness and assess the key success factors and limitations of such CSO involvement, and (iii) identify key lessons for optimizing the impact of CSO involvement.

13. Evaluation of the Effectiveness and Efficiency of TA Operations. In 2003, the Board discussed the R-paper that reviewed the management and effectiveness of TA operations⁸ and approved some changes to the current policy. Key issues were identified and, subsequently, an action plan was formulated and its implementation monitored during 2003–2004. More recently, an ADB-wide task force on TA reform has been set up to review the TA management structure and recommend options to allocate TA resources more strategically. After this initiative, OED will carry out an independent evaluation to answer two basic questions: (i) How effective and efficient have TA interventions been over time? (ii) What conditions are necessary to make them efficient and effective? The study will compare poverty reduction impacts under ADB-financed projects with and without related TA, and will link issues, lessons, and recommendations to ADB's broad knowledge products and services program.

14. Evaluation of the Effectiveness of ADB's Partnering Approaches. ADB's formal partnership policies include cofinancing, cooperation arrangement with international organizations and bilateral sources,⁹ promotion of cooperation with NGOs, and the Japan Fund for Poverty Reduction. Essential to the CSP process is effective partnership with each DMC. Global demand for much greater partnership among all stakeholders in development and poverty reduction has accelerated.¹⁰ In 2004, in dialogue with other MDBs, ADB launched the reform agenda, a major goal of which is to enhance the partnership framework with middle-income countries and countries that use ordinary capital resources. An independent evaluation of the effectiveness of ADB's partnering approaches to date would be timely. The study will assess which partnership agreements and approaches have added more to ADB operations than others, and recommend directions for further partnering.

15. Evaluation of ADB's Urban Sector Strategy and Operations. Cities in Asia are growing rapidly. The pressure on urban and municipal infrastructure is increasing and many cities are suffering from poverty, overcrowding, and environmental problems. In 2004, the Regional and Sustainable Development Department decided to review ADB's urban sector strategy of 1999, and to update it to address important developments that it does not adequately reflect, such as ADB's adopting the Millennium Development Goals and joining the Cities Alliance in 2002. To support the review, OED has agreed to independently evaluate the effectiveness of implementation of the strategy. OED's evaluation will assess ADB urban sector profiles, road maps, and projects in four countries (the People's Republic of China, India, Philippines, and Thailand), as well as special institutional initiatives such as the Cities Alliance.¹¹

16. Sector Assistance Program Evaluation on the Transport Sector in the Central Asian Republics (CARs). Efficient, reliable, and safe transport is a condition for economic

⁸ ADB. 2002. *Review of the Management and Effectiveness of Technical Operations of the Asian Development Bank*. Manila.

⁹ Under preparation at this writing.

¹⁰ The Second High-Level Forum on Joint Progress toward Enhanced Aid Effectiveness held in Paris in March 2005 took stock of progress in implementing the Rome Declaration on Harmonization.

¹¹ To enable the evaluation to start and to be in tandem with the review by RSDD, a small-scale TA for \$150,000 was approved on 21 April 2005 (ADB. 2005. *Small-Scale Technical Assistance for Special Evaluation Study on Urban Sector Strategy and Operations*. Manila [R-08/2005]). The balance required to complete the evaluation will be funded through the proposed TA.

growth of the CARs and for subregional cooperation. Roads and rail dominate the transport sector, but most networks are badly deteriorating as a result of poor construction and the lack of maintenance, and reflect outdated traffic volume assumptions, especially on cross-border traffic. The governments in Central Asia propose to improve the major highways, but financing remains a major obstacle. Budget constraints are severe and private entities are reluctant to invest. The policy environment, particularly for cross-border traffic, must be improved. ADB has helped rehabilitate transport through lending and TA. ADB has been asked to cofinance the rehabilitation of the highway linking Almaty in Kazakhstan with Bishkek in the Kyrgyz Republic, which could be a possible model for action. The SAPE will (i) assess the impact of ADB's country and subregional assistance on the sector's development and on poverty reduction; (ii) identify lessons, especially for project preparation; and (iii) recommend key strategies for ADB's country and subregional programs.

17. **ECG Support Work.** This consists of (i) ADB's term as the ECG chair, (ii) a public sector benchmarking study, and (iii) development of good-practice standards (GPS). The ECG promotes harmonization by developing GPS and undertaking benchmarking studies. This work is cofinanced by participating MDBs. In addition to such costs, the TA will finance some costs associated with ADB's chairing of the ECG in 2005/06.

18. **Enhancing Dissemination of Lessons from OED Evaluations.** The primary output envisioned is the development of a user-friendly evaluation site from which the database on lessons learned from OED evaluations can be readily accessed and searched by staff members and the public.

C. Cost and Financing of Inputs

19. The TA is estimated to cost \$1.25 million (Appendix 3). It will be financed by ADB on a grant basis from its TA funding program.

D. Implementation Arrangements

20. OED will implement the TA and prepare an evaluation report as the output of each selected evaluation study. OED staff members will undertake the studies with the assistance of international and domestic consultants, who will be recruited individually. Altogether, about 37 person-months of international and about 65 person-months of domestic consulting inputs will be required. The individual areas of expertise, duration of engagement of consultants, and outline terms of reference are in Appendix 4. In keeping with OED's practice, a position paper for each study outlining the detailed approach, methodology, and terms of reference will be prepared before engaging consultants and commencing the studies. Consultants will be engaged according to ADB's *Guidelines on the Use of Consultants* and other arrangements satisfactory to ADB on the engagement of domestic consultants. Operational departments and DMC governments will be consulted at all stages of formulation and implementation and involved in discussion of results. The TA will commence in June 2005 and be completed by the end of 2006. Implementation arrangements will be flexible enough to allow changes in the scope should OED's work program need to be changed.

IV. THE PRESIDENT'S RECOMMENDATION

21. The President recommends that the Board approve the provision of technical assistance not exceeding the equivalent of \$1,250,000 on a grant basis for Selected Evaluation Studies for 2005.

EVALUATION WORK PROGRAM, 2005–2007

Table A1.1: 2005 Work Program

Category	Number
I. Project/Program/TA Performance Audit Reports^a	26
A. Public Sector Operations	23
i. Projects (covering 14 countries)	17
a. Agriculture and Natural Resources	4
b. Education, Health, and Population	3
c. Energy	3
d. Transport and Communications	5
e. Urban Development and Housing	1
f. Water Supply and Sanitation	1
ii. Programs (covering 3 countries)	3
a. Finance	2
b. Multisector	1
iii. Technical Assistance	3
a. Capacity Development	2
b. Environmental Management	1
B. Private Sector Operations	3
II. Evaluation Studies	10
A. Impact Evaluations	1
1. Road Sector in Indonesia ^b	
B. Special Evaluations	2
1. Approaches to Capacity Development at Local Level ^b	
2. Involvement of Civil Society Organizations in Operations ^b	
C. Policy and Procedure Evaluations	3
1. Effectiveness of TA Operations ^b	
2. Effectiveness of ADB's Partnering Approaches ^b	
3. Urban Sector Strategy and Operations of ADB ^c	
D. Country Assistance Program Evaluations	2
1. Lao People's Democratic Republic ^d	
2. Uzbekistan ^d	
E. Sector Assistance Program Evaluations	2
1. Agriculture Sector in Lao People's Democratic Republic ^d	
2. Transport Sector in the Central Asian Republics ^b	
F. Other	
1. Evaluation of selected ongoing operations ^a	
III. Evaluation Guidelines^a	2
A. Preparation of Guidelines for Performance Audits of Private Sector Operations	
B. Revision of Guidelines for Public Sector Project/Program Performance Audit Reports	
IV. Annual Evaluation Reports^a	2
A. Annual Review of Evaluation Activities in 2004 (Theme Chapter: Power Sector)	
B. Annual Report on Loan and TA Portfolio Performance in 2004	

ADB = Asian Development Bank, TA = technical assistance.

^a To be financed under administrative budget.

^b To be financed under the proposed regional TA.

^c \$150,000 to be financed under a small-scale TA to enable the work to start on time, the balance to be financed under the proposed regional TA.

^d Covered under a previous regional TA.

Source: Director General, Operations Evaluation Department (OED), memo to the Chairperson of the Development Effectiveness Committee on "Outline Work Program for Evaluation Reports 2005–2007 and Additions to the Work Program 2005," 1 September 2004.

Table A1.2: 2006 Work Program (Provisional)

Category	Number
I. Project/Program/TA Performance Audit Reports	24
A. Private Sector Operations	3
B. Public Sector Operations (Projects/Programs/TA)	21
II. Evaluation Studies	To be determined
A. Impact Evaluations	2
1. Accessibility and Poverty Reduction	
2. Sustainability of Policy Reforms	
B. Special Evaluations	3
1. Evaluability of Country- and Project-level Operations	
2. Funding of Basic Social Services	
3. Private Sector Operations	
C. Policy and Procedure Evaluations	2
1. Agriculture Sector Operations	
2. Sector Development Programs	
D. Country Assistance Program Evaluations	4
1. Kazakhstan	
2. Kyrgyz Republic	
3. Pakistan	
4. Tajikistan	
E. Sector Assistance Program Evaluations	To be determined
F. Other	
1. Project Monitoring and Management	
III. Evaluation Guidelines	1
Preparation of Guidelines for Country Assistance Program Evaluations	
IV. Annual Evaluation Reports	2
A. Annual Report on Loan and TA Portfolio Performance in 2004	
B. Annual Review of Evaluation Activities in 2004 (Theme Chapter: Power Sector)	

TA = technical assistance.

Source: Director General, Operations Evaluation Department (OED), memo to the Chairperson of the Development Effectiveness Committee on "Outline Work Program for Evaluation Reports 2005–2007 and Additions to the Work Program 2005," 1 September 2004.

Table A1.3: 2007 Work Program (Provisional)

Category	Number
I. Project/Program/TA Performance Audit Reports	22
A. Public Sector Operations (Projects/Programs/TA)	19
B. Private Sector Operations	3
II. Evaluation Studies	To be determined
A. Impact Evaluations	1
1. Environment Policy and Projects	
B. Special Evaluations	3
1. Pacific Strategy	
2. Regional Cooperation and Regional Public Goods	
3. State-owned Enterprise Operations	
C. Policy and Procedure Evaluations	2
1. Governance and Anticorruption Measures	
2. Managing for Development Results	
D. Country Assistance Program Evaluations	To be determined
To be determined	
E. Sector Assistance Program Evaluations	To be determined
To be determined	
F. Other	To be determined
To be determined	
III. Evaluation Guidelines	1
Preparation of Guidelines for TA Performance Audit Reports	
IV. Annual Evaluation Reports	2
A. Annual Review of Evaluation Activities in 2006 (Theme Chapter: Participation)	
B. Annual Report on Loan and TA Portfolio Performance in 2006	

TA = technical assistance.

Source: Director General, Operations Evaluation Department (OED), memo to the Chairperson of the Development Effectiveness Committee on "Outline Work Program for Evaluation Reports 2005–2007 and Additions to the Work Program 2005," 1 September 2004.

DESIGN AND MONITORING FRAMEWORK

Design Summary	Performance Targets/Indicators	Data Sources/Reporting Mechanisms	Assumptions and Risks
<p>Impact</p> <p>Improved development effectiveness of the Asian Development Bank (ADB) operations and policies based on lessons and recommendations resulting from a sound evaluation of relevance, efficacy, efficiency, sustainability, and impacts</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Continued positive trend in project performance ratings • Improved project quality at entry • Demonstrated use of recommendations in Operations Evaluation Department (OED) evaluations • Improved quality of country strategy and program papers (CSPs) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Project completion report and project performance audit report ratings • Periodic assessment of the quality of project frameworks • Report on the follow-up of OED recommendations in the annual review of evaluation activities • Proposed CSP quality assessment process 	
<p>Outcome</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lessons and recommendations that are useful and practical to support the formulation of CSPs, sector strategies, policies, and projects 	<p>The operational side of ADB endorses the lessons and recommendations in OED reports.</p> <p>The Development Effectiveness Committee (DEC) endorses, and Management adopts, the reports' recommendations.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • CSPs, strategy and policy papers, reports and recommendations of the President • Minutes of DEC meetings • Management responses to OED reports 	<p>Assumptions</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ADB accepts and acts on evaluation findings. • Dissemination of conclusions and recommendations is effective. • Recommendations are specific, actionable, and monitorable. <p>Risk</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Operations departments or Evaluation Cooperation Group (ECG) members consider recommendations unrealistic or impractical.
<p>Outputs</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Impact evaluation study on the road sector in Indonesia • Special evaluation study on local approaches to capacity development in water resources and rural infrastructure projects • Special evaluation study on involvement of civil-society organizations in ADB's social infrastructure 	<p>Reports approved for circulation</p>	<p>Position papers, and inception and progress reports</p>	<p>Assumptions</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recommendations are valid. • The quality of consultant outputs and OED reports is sufficient. • The agencies involved cooperate sufficiently.

Design Summary	Performance Targets/Indicators	Data Sources/Reporting Mechanisms	Assumptions and Risks
<p>operations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Evaluation of the effectiveness of technical assistance operations • Evaluation of the effectiveness of ADB's partnering approaches • Evaluation of the urban sector strategy and operations of ADB • Sector assistance program evaluation on the transport sector in the Central Asian Republics • ADB contribution to the ECG, including a benchmarking survey for public sector investment and good-practice standards for country assistance program evaluation papers • Enhanced dissemination of lessons from OED evaluations, primarily through a user-friendly database 	<p>More hits on evaluation pages in the ADB website; more requests for information</p>	<p>Office of External Relations reports</p>	
<p>Activities with Milestones</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Progress, draft and final reports, consultants' reports, back-to-office reports, missions, desk reviews, peer reviews, interdepartmental reviews, surveys, workshops, consultations with governments and other stakeholders, all according to deadlines agreed on in position papers 			<p>Inputs</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$1.25 million in ADB financing to cover the costs of (i) consulting services comprising international consultants for 40 person-months, intermittently, and domestic consultants for 75 person-months, intermittently; and (ii) surveys and workshops • ADB staff input budgeted at 50 person-months of professional staff time

COST ESTIMATES
(\$)

Item	Cost
Asian Development Bank Financing^a	
1. Consultants	
a. Remuneration and Per Diem	
i. International Consultants	748,000
ii. Domestic Consultants	134,000
b. International and Local Travel	154,000
c. Reports and Communications	5,000
2. Seminars/Workshops ^b	25,000
3. Surveys	60,000
4. Miscellaneous Administration and Support Costs	12,000
5. Contingencies (10% of total base cost)	112,000
Total	1,250,000

^a Financed by the Asian Development Bank (ADB) technical assistance (TA) funding program.

^b Seminars and workshops are not TA outputs but are held either to acquire inputs for draft reports or to disseminate results.

Source: ADB estimates.

OUTLINE TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR CONSULTANTS

A. Impact Evaluation Study on the Road Sector in Indonesia

1. International Consultants

1. Two international consultants will be recruited for a total of 4.0 person-months: (i) an international road sector financial specialist for 2.5 person-months to provide technical inputs in evaluating the overall strategy, design, efficacy, efficiency, and sustainability of Asian Development Bank (ADB) assistance, taking into account the sector's financial performance as well as issues such as effectiveness of performance bonds; and (ii) an international road engineering and operation specialist for 1.5 person-months to evaluate the technical and operational aspects of ADB assistance to the sector and to identify key bottlenecks and engineering challenges facing the sector, including environment issues, that might or might not have been adequately addressed by ADB operations. Specific recommendations for future road projects will be formulated.

2. Domestic Consultants

2. To provide a vital local perspective to the evaluation, two domestic consultants will be recruited for a total of 10 person-months. The domestic road sector specialist, who will be well versed in local institutions and road sector issues, will be engaged for 3 person-months to provide critical support to international consultants, particularly for institutional aspects of the evaluation, and ensure that recommendations are valid, feasible, and practical. A domestic socioeconomic impact specialist will be engaged for 7 person-months to assess socioeconomic impacts of ADB assistance in the road sector. Under the supervision of an Operations Evaluation Department (OED) mission leader, the socioeconomic impact specialist will survey key customers and stakeholders, including but not confined to industrial, commercial, and residential users and project-affected families.

B. Special Evaluation Study on Approaches to Local Institutional Capacity Development in Water Resource and Rural Infrastructure Projects

1. International Consultants

3. Two international consultants will be recruited for a total of 5 person-months to (i) review the design and implementation of capacity development components of selected ADB-financed projects (loans and technical assistance [TA] operations) in the water resource and rural infrastructure sectors, and assess the extent to which these components contributed to the sustainability of the projects, particularly their operation and maintenance; (ii) identify and assess issues related to implementation of capacity development components or approaches in ADB's lending and TA operations in the water and rural infrastructure sectors, focusing on local technical and financial capacity; (iii) identify lessons learned; (iv) develop case studies as part of the evaluation approach; (v) identify options to overcome constraints on the approaches considered most effective; and (vi) recommend ways to improve capacity development approaches and implementation in future ADB operations.

2. Domestic Consultants

4. Domestic consultants will be engaged for 12 person-months to undertake the following in the selected developing member countries (DMCs): (i) collect, analyze, and interpret data in-country; (ii) identify and synthesize key design and implementation issues of selected projects; (iii) qualitatively assess specific issues in-depth by interviewing key informants and

stakeholders, primarily local project management staff; (iv) synthesize contextual conditions of relevance to the assessed issues and identify key avenues, shortcomings, and constraints that have influenced implementation of the capacity development programs; (v) help prepare the country case studies; and (vi) validate the recommendations developed by the international consultants.

C. Special Evaluation Study on Involvement of Civil-Society Organizations in ADB's Social Infrastructure Operations

1. International Consultants

5. Two international consultants—an expert in social infrastructure and another in partnering with civil-society organizations (CSOs), including nongovernment organizations (NGOs)—will be recruited for a total of 4 person-months, intermittently. The consultants will help (i) assess the scope of CSO involvement in ADB social infrastructure operations, (ii) assess the comparative effectiveness and the key success factors and limitations of such CSO involvement, (iii) develop case studies that could be used to guide ADB staff, (iv) derive lessons learned, (v) recommend ways to optimize the impact of CSO involvement in future ADB operations, and (vi) recommend ways to improve staff competence in partnering with CSOs in the context of ADB operations and with the goal of increasing development impact. ADB's participation guidelines will be taken into account.

2. Domestic Consultants

6. Five domestic consultants, one for each DMC representing each subregion, will be recruited for a total of 18 person-months, intermittently. The consultants will help the international consultants (i) identify the diversity and differences of CSO involvement in the countries selected for study; (ii) obtain information, views, and suggestions directly from beneficiaries; (iii) document strengths and weaknesses in CSO involvement in specific ADB operations in the social infrastructure sector; (iv) document the processes underlying CSO involvement in the various cases; (v) validate perceived key success factors and limitations in the field; (vi) develop the country-specific contexts in the case studies; and (vii) validate the recommendations.

D. Evaluation of the Effectiveness and Efficiency of TA Operations

1. International Consultants

7. Two international consultants will be engaged for a total of 10 person-months to help (i) develop a practical framework for the evaluation that will yield a diagnostic analysis and support recommendations that will be actionable and monitorable for ADB; (ii) formulate an approach for comparing poverty reduction impacts under ADB-financed projects with and without related TA, which is credible and acceptable to ADB staff and to DMCs; (iii) apply the latter diagnostic framework and comparative approach in a representative set of case studies of TA; (iv) synthesize findings and lessons from the case studies that are linked to, or directly affected by, how TA is managed and how TA resources are allocated in ADB; (v) recommend practical and acceptable ways for ADB to improve the effectiveness and efficiency of its TA, including changes required in the TA policy, their relative priorities, and recommended sequencing; and (vi) recommend a "TA-readiness filter" similar to the existing project-readiness criteria for loans, reflecting conditions for effective and efficient TA and ensuring that the TA design has systematically considered lessons from previous TA interventions. The 2002 Board

paper, *Review of the Management and Effectiveness of Technical Operations of the Asian Development Bank*,¹ will provide base reference points.

2. Domestic Consultants

8. Five domestic consultants will be recruited for a total of 12 person-months to help (i) apply the diagnostic framework and comparative approach in selected case studies of TA; (ii) categorize and synthesize findings, focusing on strengths and weaknesses encountered in the case studies and “what worked and did not work;” (iii) conduct interviews and fieldwork; (iv) write up the case studies; and (v) validate lessons and recommendations against related recent reviews of ADB’s TA operations.

E. Evaluation of the Effectiveness of ADB’s Partnering Approaches

1. International Consultants

9. International consultants will be recruited for 5 person-months. They will have experience in working under partnership agreements or arrangements at international, regional, and country levels. The consultants will need to be knowledgeable in policy frameworks of other multilateral financial institutions as well as national governments in so far as official partnering processes and practices are utilized. The consultants will help (i) assess structural similarities and differences in ADB’s policies on cofinancing, cooperation arrangements with international organizations and bilateral sources, promotion of cooperation with NGOs, and the Japan Fund for Poverty Reduction, and the country strategy and program process; (ii) identify and document other partnering processes and practices that have evolved for ADB, including any arrangements that are not covered by a formal policy but are used in implementing operational, financial, or administrative programs; (iii) develop a framework for assessing advantages and disadvantages of formal and informal partnering approaches of ADB, and apply that framework in overall assessment of existing partnerships; (iv) develop and apply a method for gauging the value added to ADB products and services by various partnering approaches; and (v) make recommendations on areas considered to be of high priority, including efficiency in internal ADB procedures. The consultants will take into consideration the work being done by the innovation and efficiency initiative’s financial products team.

2. Domestic Consultants

10. Domestic consultants with a background in development of policy frameworks as well as process analysis will be recruited for a total of 4 person-months to help (i) apply the analytical framework described above to existing ADB partnerships, (ii) develop indicators of value addition, (iii) document case studies for the overall report, and (iv) provide country background and conduct literature reviews. The consultants will be based in the Philippines and work at ADB headquarters.

¹ ADB. 2002. *Review of the Management and Effectiveness of Technical Operations of the Asian Development Bank*. Manila.

F. Evaluation of the Urban Sector Strategy and Operations of ADB

1. International Consultants

11. Three international consultants with extensive experience and expertise in urban planning, preferably who are professors in academic institutions and have published extensively on the subject, will be recruited for a total of 4 person-months, intermittently. Extensive experience in Asia and intimate knowledge of advanced urban planning systems is required. The consultants will focus on (i) assessment of the contribution to ADB's urban sector strategy and operations of such special institutional initiatives as the Cities Alliance and Water for Asian Cities, (ii) assessment of alignment and synergy of the existing urban sector strategy with ADB's adoption of poverty reduction as its overarching goal and with achievement of the Millennium Development Goals, (iii) changes recommended in the strategy that would require consideration by Management or the Board of Directors, and (iv) assessment of capacity in ADB to effectively implement a revised urban sector strategy.

2. Domestic Consultants

12. Six domestic consultants from the case-study countries will be engaged for a total of 16 person-months to do field work and research at ADB headquarters. The consultants should have experience with questionnaire surveys and quantitative analysis of project documentation, and, preferably, understand ADB procedures well. The main task will be to collect and analyze information from internal ADB reports on urban sector operations. The consultants will work under the guidance of the study team leader and the international consultants.

G. Sector Assistance Program Evaluation on the Transport Sector in the Central Asian Republics

1. International Consultants

13. Three international consultants will be recruited for a total of 6 person-months, intermittently: (i) two international transport sector financial, and policy specialists, with knowledge of and experience in individual Central Asian republics (CARs) and the subregion as a whole, to help evaluate the strategy, design, efficacy, efficiency, and sustainability of ADB transport sector assistance in individual CARs and in the emerging cross-border transport environment, taking into account the sector's history, present conditions, and policy framework; and (ii) an international transport technical and engineering specialist, with knowledge of and experience in individual CARs and the subregion as a whole, to evaluate the operation and maintenance of ADB assistance to the sector, and to identify key weaknesses of past ADB operations and priorities for future ADB transport sector assistance. The consultants shall give equal priority to national transport programs and inter-country initiatives, and formulate recommendations for both.

2. Domestic Consultants

14. To provide the sufficient national and subregional perspectives to the evaluation, three domestic consultants from three different CARs will be recruited for a total of 7 person-months. They should be well versed in their countries' national transport systems and institutions, and the issues facing the transport sectors. They will be expected to work together on identifying and documenting issues common to the CARs or of a subregional nature. They will provide critical support to international consultants, particularly for institutional aspects of the evaluation, and ensure that recommendations are feasible and practical. They may also facilitate interaction and communication of the international consultants with interviewees in the CARs.