



Table A1: Evaluation Design Matrix

Evaluation Criteria	Areas of Evaluation	Major Indicators and Areas of Consideration	Sources of Information	Data Collection Methods
Relevance	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Were the Asian Development Bank's (ADB) strategies relevant in terms of evolving circumstances in India? 2. Did the transport sector strategy in the country strategies and programs (CSPs) change with these circumstances? 3. Did ADB's interventions support essential sector policy and institutional reforms? 4. Did ADB's strategies respond to the transport needs as perceived by the central and state governments, as well as by other development partners? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Economic reform milestones. • Macroeconomic assessment of policies and financial management related to the sector. • Changes in ADB's strategy. • Development trends and key indicators critical to the transport sector. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Economic sector reports • Country economic reports • CSP • Government reports • Thematic reports • Key stakeholders 	<p>Applicable to all areas for evaluation under Relevance</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Desk review of relevant documents. • Interviews with ADB staff. • Key informant interviews with government officials and key stakeholders. • Focus group discussions. <p>Key stakeholders include people impacted by the selected projects (Gujarat), researchers, consultants, nongovernment organizations, infrastructure financing banks, contractors, transport operators, and rail freight users.</p>

Evaluation Criteria	Areas of Evaluation	Major Indicators and Areas of Consideration	Sources of Information	Data Collection Methods
	5. Harmonization with other development partners	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Coordination of activities and strategies of other development partners Appropriate project/program designs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ADB reports including reports and recommendations of the President, CSPs, CSP Updates Development partners and government 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Discussions with development partners and government staff.
Likely Efficacy	What is the likelihood that ADB's project designs will achieve the intended outcomes, in light of the perceived effectiveness of the projects/programs?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Fulfillment of stated objectives for completed projects and subprojects. Feasibility of achievement of objectives, based on current progress. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ADB status reports, back-to-office reports, and other such reports Key stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Desk review of relevant documents Rapid technical assessment of select project sites (in Gujarat) Operation Evaluation Missions and field observations. Key informant interviews with government staff, observers, development partners, and other stakeholders.
Process efficiency	Were/Are ADB's operations in the transport sector efficient in terms of: (i) effectively working with the government in implementing the projects, and (ii) ensuring procurement processes have been carried out efficiently?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Economic analyses of completed projects. Timeliness and adequacy of counterpart funding. Cost effectiveness in generating outputs. Procurement and implementation issues. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Project completion reports and project performance audit reports Government agencies 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Desk review of relevant documents Operation Evaluation Missions and field observations

Evaluation Criteria	Areas of Evaluation	Major Indicators and Areas of Consideration	Sources of Information	Data Collection Methods
Sustainability	What is the likelihood that the planned outputs will sustain?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Institutional capacity in terms of adequate availability of funding and resources • Financial viability of operating entities • Government ownership and commitment to programs and projects. • Pricing (for rail subsector) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Data from the National Highway Authority of India, ADB, and development partners • Progress reports • Indian Railways reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Financial study aimed at assessing the pipeline of capital investment and operations and maintenance requirements for the national highways. • Discussions with the Indian Railways.

ADB = Asian Development Bank, CSP = country strategy and program.