



FOR REVIEW PURPOSES ONLY

**DOCUMENTATION OF THE
VIET NAM CONSULTATION WORKSHOP**

DRAFT

For inquiries: Ms. Vanessa V. Manuel, Regional and Sustainable Development Department
Tel. no. (632) 632-6957, fax no. (632) 6362193, e-mail: governance_review@adb.org

Though we have attempted to provide an accurate account, the attached document is preliminary and may contain errors or omissions. Please contact us with any corrections. Thank you.



Documentation of the Viet Nam Consultation Workshop on the Review of the Implementation of ADB's Governance and Anticorruption Policies

Hanoi, 11 November 2004

NOTE: *This document is primarily intended for participants of the workshop. Though others are welcome to consider the contents, the information will be less clear to people who did not attend the live event.*

The Asian Development Bank in collaboration with the Ministry of Home Affairs organized a consultation workshop with a group of government and civil society participants in Viet Nam. In plenary and small groups, participants identified major issues in governance and anticorruption, assessed ADB's progress, and recommended action to strengthen ADB's work. This document presents trends, issues, assessments, and actions relevant to ADB's work in governance and anticorruption. The Agenda for the workshop follows in an appendix.

The **purpose** of the workshop was for ADB to listen to diverse stakeholders as they collectively:

- Considered what ADB has achieved, not achieved, and lessons learned in Viet Nam in governance & anticorruption;
- Described issues in governance and anticorruption in Viet Nam and the region that will affect ADB's future work; and,
- Recommended appropriate roles and priority actions for ADB in governance and anticorruption in Viet Nam.

I. Regional/Country Trends in Governance and Anticorruption

Participants listed current issues and trends that were important governance and anticorruption work in their country and in Asia.

- Fighting corruption
- Publicizing the mechanisms of finance, construction and project assets in order to minimize corruption, loss and wastefulness
- Building a State based on the rule-of-law
- Establishing grassroots democracy
- Building public ethics
- Bridging the gap between rich and poor
- Enhancing mechanisms to monitor and examine legal documents
- Enhancing capacity of civil servants
- Dealing with difficulties and challenges emerging in the implementation of public administration reform
- Building strategies for preventing and fighting corruption
- Encouraging the participation of citizens in governance and anticorruption processes

II. **ADB's Performance: Participants' Report Card**

This session asked participants to consider ADB's governance and anticorruption performance versus its key result areas as committed in key policies using a Report Card.

Result area 1: Ensure Country Leadership

- ADB, on the one hand, has done so well in this field, and still ensured the active commitment of Vietnam on the other.
- In anticorruption, ADB recently approved a small technical project to support the Government Inspectorate (GI) of Vietnam in fighting corruption. The support of ADB is very scientific and is highly appreciated by the GI.
- In field of public administration reform, ADB is currently providing a program loan to support the implementation of the Government's Public Administration Reform Master Program. The first phase of the loan focuses on the implementation of (i) training and retraining to improve the quality of public officials, and (ii) modernization of the administrative system, including computerization and e-government initiatives. The loan is supported by three attached technical assistance projects: (i) institutional and capacity-building support to Ministry of Home Affairs (MOHA) for the training and retraining of public officials, (ii) policy coordination support to OOG in assisting the Government with national-level policy coordination and decision-making process reforms, and (iii) support to OOG in the implementation of administrative modernization, including computerization and e-government initiatives.

Result area 2: Take a Long-Term Approach

- Up till now, there has been no long-term program on anti-corruption—it is absent.
- ADB will help the Government Inspectorate to carry out the Asia-Pacific Anti-corruption Plan.

Result area 3: Optimize impact through a systematic focused approach

- We do not have sufficient international benchmarks for comparing the effectiveness of ADB's support. ADB has not given examples of activities in other countries in the region so participants can compare the effectiveness of ADB's support in Viet Nam with that in other countries.
- ADB has obtained its goals. Its activities, however, have not been done systematically and consistently.
- ADB support projects have been scattered and not very focused on its priorities. The effectiveness, therefore, has not been high.
- ADB should consider carefully the real conditions of its targeted places and regions.

Result area 6: Enhance Strategic Alliances

- ADB has played a role in preventing and fighting corruption in Viet Nam.
- Viet Nam Resident Mission has been doing well in partnership. ADB and OECD initiated the Asia-Pacific Anti-corruption Action Plan. This plan has been approved by many countries in the region. Vietnam became the 23rd participating member after approving this plan in July, 2004.

Result area 7: Empower Poor People

- Many provinces and cities, especially the remote and far - reaching ones, still do not know much about ADB-funded projects. We would like to increase public awareness.

Result area 8: Ensure stakeholder participation

- We appreciate ADB's policies which ensure active participation of parties concerned in formulating projects with the link of Hunger Alleviation and Poverty Reduction (HAPR) among agencies.
- The HAPR projects have always been formulated in a synchronized way with the participation of donors, (including ADB), ministries and branches concerned, provinces and cities, to decide project priorities.

Result area 9: Introduce transparent procedures

- The E-Government Projects are being implemented.
- The Government of Vietnam has coordinated with ADB to increase policy transparency and publication in the Government Gazette. Participants hope ADB will make further efforts in this area.
- Participants also asked ADB to set up more computerization projects enabling all citizens to access the E-Government system.

Result area 11: Accountability through decentralization

- ADB has focused on decentralization in many provinces.
- The feasibility of ADB projects has not completely been ensured.
- Localities and agencies at local level have only known a little (or even nothing) about ADB-supported projects.
- Participants demanded to participate from the very beginning of projects, from formulating stage to the implementing stage.
- Projects should be distributed more appropriately to match with the decentralization of Vietnam.

Result area 12: Strengthen ADB's capacity

- Viet Nam Resident Mission staff members have given good advice.
- ADB Consultants in Manila as well as Vietnam have been recognized to be very good through a series of working sessions with the Government Inspectorate.

III. Recommended Actions for Governance & Anticorruption

Participants were asked what ADB needs to do to achieve its commitments under the policies. In particular, what should be ADB's role and priority actions?

1- ADB's Priorities

a- Advantages of ADB

- ADB has geographical advantages. As a regional institution, ADB can understand the culture and policies of Asian countries in general and of Vietnam in particular.
- ADB Consultants and experts are very good. They also have extensive experiences in Governance and fighting corruption.
- ADB has great financial strength.

- b- ADB's role:
 - ADB has provided technical support and experience for Vietnam.
 - c- Priorities:
 - Providing support to enhance legal capacity
 - Implementing E-government projects
- 2- Governance Analysis, Indicators and Harmonizing with other donors.
- Enhancing capacity of project management must go in parallel with enhancing capacity of State management.
 - Institutionalizing management measures and bringing them to life
 - Providing support for Vietnam to enhance institutional capacity. ADB's good and experienced consultants will help Vietnam make laws.
 - Harmonizing projects of other donors to avoid overlapping and duplication.
- 3- Country Strategy and Program Formulation
- ADB should establish a legal support program as a mechanism in governance and fighting corruption.
 - ADB should continuously provide technical support and carry out programs on human resource training.
 - There is a need to establish a mechanism to supervise, assess and practice law in fields of Governance and Anti- corruption
 - ADB should focus on analyzing governance at all levels and branches.
 - It is necessary for ADB to support Vietnam to efficiently and effectively practice grassroots democracy.
 - ADB should further promote measures to minimize risks in governance and anti-corruption process.
- 4- ADB's Programs and Projects
- ADB should prioritize the analysis of governance, mechanisms and corruption in each branch. Special attention should be paid to the feasibility of each project.
 - Promoting technical supports for developing countries.
 - ADB should help developing countries attract other donors.
 - Attention should be paid to supervise and assess project feasibility.
 - In projects related to public finance in general, and in ADB's activities, in particular, concrete assessment should be made in public expenditure.

We encourage participants to comment or give feedback on this report through e-mail at governance_review@adb.org. Thank you.

APPENDIX



VIET NAM COUNTRY CONSULTATION WORKSHOPS Governance & Anticorruption Policies Implementation Review PURPOSE & AGENDA

Purpose :

The purpose of the workshop is to gather diverse stakeholders to collectively:

- Discuss issues arising from the findings of the desk review on governance and anticorruption;
- Describe regional trends in governance and anticorruption that influence poverty reduction and will affect future work; and,
- Identify action points for ADB's Medium Term Action Plan (2005-09) on Governance and Anticorruption to reduce poverty.

Agenda:

8:30 AM	Arrival / Registration / Welcome
9:00 AM	Expectations/Introductions/Overview/Ground Rules
9:40 AM	Regional/Country Trends in Governance & Anticorruption to Reduce Poverty
10:15 AM	Implementing the Policies in Viet Nam - Highlights
10:45 AM	Governance & Anticorruption Desk-Based Review: Background and Issues
11:15 AM	ADB's Contribution to [country] Achievements and Performance (small groups)
12:15 NN	LUNCH
1:30 PM	Report Back: ADB's Contribution and Performance
2:15 PM	Priority Actions by ADB for Governance & Anticorruption Work (small groups)
3:15 PM	Report Back: Recommended Priority Actions and Results for the Medium-Term Action Plan for Governance and Anticorruption (2005-2009) (plenary)
4:00 PM	Implications & Next Steps
4:30 PM	Close