
**ADB RETA 6296:
Developing Pro-Poor Governance
Knowledge and Capability**

Midterm Report
July 2007

National Institute of Management, Karachi

I. Project overview

A. Background and rationale

The Citizen's Report Card (CRC) is a survey tool to gauge satisfaction of the users of public services and empowers citizens to demand for improvement in the same. The Continuous Improvement and Benchmarking (CIB) toolkit was developed by the Australian Continuous Improvement Group (ACIG) in Melbourne, Australia to enable the systematic identification of problems and their causes in the service delivery by the public servants and to facilitate the development of internal improvement and monitoring mechanisms. Both tools have frequently been used in a complementary fashion to facilitate change in practices and to make governments more responsive to the needs of the people they serve.

With this objective the Asian Development Bank in coordination with the National Institute of Management (NIM), Karachi (the then National Institute of Public Administration) initiated CIB pilot project in District Matiari and CRC Pilot project at Taluka Hala in Sindh in March 2007.

B. Objectives and scope

The primary objectives of the ADB RETA project were to:

- To strengthen knowledge and capability of developing member countries in the use of tools and techniques for improving performance and effective delivery of public services;
- To promote the utilization of the Citizen Report Card (CRC) methodology to conduct social audits of public services;
- To encourage use of Continuous Improvement and Benchmarking (CIB) techniques to ensure that capacity, resources, and people are managed to deliver effective, efficient, affordable, and equitable public services; and
- To eventually incorporate CRC and CIB into the National Institute of Management's training courses

District Matiari and Union Councils 1 and 2 in Taluka Hala were selected as sites for the pilot CIB and CRC projects. The projects are being undertaken in coordination with the District Government and Taluka Municipal Administration (TMA) in Matiari and Hala respectively. The CRC is focused on the education and water and sanitation sector in Hala, while the CIB concentrates on the education sector in Matiari.

C. Desired outputs and outcomes

As outlined above, the pilot projects were undertaken to promote the use of the CRC methodology and CIB techniques to improve service delivery at the local government level in Pakistan. The project was designed as a skills-transfer initiative with mentoring for NIM staff on the techniques being built into the initiative. A critical aspect of the project is feedback from NIM on the CRC and CIB which will be derived from learning during the implementation of the techniques in the field. This feedback will be provided to the ADB and will cover the usefulness and applicability of the CRC and CIB e-toolkits in the Pakistani context. General comments on strengths and weaknesses of the toolkit as a learning facilitation device would also be provided along with suggestions for improvement in the same.

The immediate outputs of the CRC will be a database of information on the current situation in the water and sanitation and education sectors in Union Councils 1 and 2 in Taluka Hala. The findings will be documented and presented to the TMA in a formal report. It is also hoped that the CRC will help the Taluka Administration to make more informed decisions with regard to service provision and improvement in the water and sanitation sectors. The findings of the CRC will also assist the local administration in Hala in making a strong case for increased funding and capacity deployment in the education sector since education is a district subject in Sindh.

The CIB is a more gradual process and as such, is likely to yield results with time as the process unfolds and trust and partnerships are developed. It is hoped that the CIB will assist in identifying and resolving issues in current processes in the education sector at the district level thus improving the overall quality of service sector. A key outcome would be the strengthening of relationships between the public, private and non-governmental sectors at the district level, which will hopefully generate beneficial results in terms of quality, coordination and sharing of resources, expertise and manpower.

D. Implementation plan

Annex 1 presents a detailed roadmap for the implementation of the CRC project.

Annexure II relates to the work plan for CIB Project.

II. Accomplishments

A. Overall statement on the progress of work in relation to the implementation plan

The implementation of the Project started in February 2007 with a three-day training program conducted by Asian Development Bank in collaboration with National Institute of Management Karachi for the NIM Project team and the representatives of Devolved Social Sector Program. The overall ADB RETA project is proceeding as per work plans prepared in consultation with the ADB. Although much greater progress has been made on the CRC component of the project; work on the CIB, too has been initiated. The groundwork for the formal launch of the CIB process has been completed and the partnerships critical to the success of the initiative have been identified. Fieldwork for the CRC began as scheduled in July 2007 and initial results are beginning to trickle in.

B. Progress of CRC mentoring/coaching/application

As briefly mentioned in the section above, the CRC component of the ADB RETA project is proceeding on track. All the key stages of the project, identified at the inception meeting in March 2007, have been delivered as scheduled and planned. Initial results are encouraging and it seems likely that the project will succeed in fostering local ownership of results and accountability in service delivery.

Taluka Hala was selected as the project site for the CRC in consultation with the ADB and the TMA Hala. The *taluka* was chosen after an in-depth analysis using the Critical 9 provided in the CRC Toolkit (see Annex III).

Sectors to pilot the CRC in, that is water and sanitation and education, were decided in consultation with the ADB and the TMA Hala in March 2007, after training of NIM and TMA Hala staff by the ADB in CRC techniques. Detailed discussions were undertaken with Makhdoom Habibullah, the *nazim* of Hala and the rest of the TMA team. A detailed action-plan, based on discussions with different partners, was chalked out. Contacts with the TMA were developed, formalised and then utilized to foster a stronger understanding of the project area by the NIM team. Initial contacts with NGOs and CBOs operating in Hala were also established. Background information on Hala including geographical divisions, population details, coverage and level of public services etc. was collected through the partners at the local level and other secondary sources of data. Information on the users of the services, access to and availability of the services, departmental manpower, and complaint handling mechanisms was also collected through 'focus group discussions' with the staff of TMA, Hala; service providers in the water, sanitation and education sectors,

relevant NGOs (SHEDS, HANDS, PAIMAN) and CBOs (Al-Mehran and Sindh Rural Development Society).

17 potential surveyors were identified in consultation with the local NGOs and CBOs. The total number of surveyors hired for the project is eight. This includes 6 male surveyors and 2 female surveyors. All of them belong to Hala, are familiar with local language and culture and have extensive experience in survey work. Three-day training for the surveyors was carried out from the 12th -14th June 2007 by the NIM project team.

A questionnaire for the survey was developed using the information gathered from the field and with inputs from relevant experts, including the PAC and local NGOs. This questionnaire was also used during the training of the surveyors. Feedback from the surveyors, who had a great deal of knowledge about local conditions, was also incorporated. This version of the questionnaire was translated into Sindhi and printed for the pilot exercise.

A sampling plan was developed using maps provided by the TMA and other information gained from different sources. Details about population in different *muhallas (streets)* in Union Council 1 and 2 were used to finalise the sampling plan. Since the total population of both Union Councils combined is approximately 50, 000 persons it was decided that overall 600 households would be surveyed. The sample sizes for the two Union Councils are different because households have been selected according to the populations within different localities in these regions and efforts have been made to include both poor and rich and slum and non-slum areas.

The pilot survey exercise was carried out from 11th to 13th July, 2007. The first day was spent in going through the questionnaire with the surveyors to iron out any last minute confusion. The next two days were spent in the field piloting the questionnaire in both Union Council 1 and 2. The NIM team accompanied the surveyors to various households to ensure that the language, flow and applicability of the questionnaire were satisfactory.

Following the pilot exercise, amendments were made to the questionnaire. The final version was translated, composed and printed. Fieldwork commenced on July 27, 2007.

C. Preparations for CIB mentoring/coaching/application

Initial preparation for the CIB project has been undertaken including sustained dialogue with the district government in Matiari to finalise the sector to focus on for the project, that is, the education sector. The district was chosen after determining that the pre-conditions for the successful implementation of the CIB technique existed in the municipality and there was sound political commitment to see the project through. The district government staff, including the District Coordinating Officer (DCO), Mr. Usman Chachar, participated in the

initial training provided by the ADB on the CRC and CIB techniques. They have continued to show strong interest in the process and in opportunities to learn more about the same.

The NIM team visited Matiari on April 28, 2007 and finalised the way forward with the district government staff. A brief meeting with the District Nazim was also organized. The team brainstormed with the district government officers in an intense session to define and understand the education sector in Matiari. Relevant documentation on the education sector was also collected during the visit. Processes within this particular service area that needed attention and improvement were identified and prioritized after detailed analysis of service delivery and standards within the local context.

Groundwork on project team formulation and identification of key actors within the district government and other concerned shareholders has also been undertaken. Local stakeholders such as HANDS and SHEDS have been instrumental in the provision of required background information on the sector.

Road Map for CRC at Hala

Task	Start date	Completion date
Confirmation of Pilot Projects	3/15/07	3/20/07
Collection of secondary data	3/21/07	4/18/07
Draft FGD questions	4/19/07	4/19/07
1 st trip to the site: FGD	4/20/07	4/20/07
Questionnaire Finalized	4/21/07	5/14/07
Translation of questionnaire	5/21/07	6/6/07
Training of Survey team	6/12/07	6/14/07
Pilot Exercises	7/11/07	7/14/07
Finalization of Questionnaire	7/15/07	7/19/07
Printing of questionnaires	7/20/07	7/24/07
Fieldwork	7/27/07	8/17/07
Data Entry and Analysis	8/20/07	8/30/07
Report Completion	8/31/07	9/15/07
Report Presentation	9/20/07	
Feedback to ADB	9/28/07	

Roadmap for CIB Project at Matiari

CIB Tasks	Inclusive Dates	
	Start	Finish
1. Organize		
Confirm commitment to the Project	01-Apr-07	02-Apr-07
Form a CIB Project Team to manage the CIB project	02-Apr-07	01-Jun-07
Train CIB Project Team and Coordinators at NIM	28-Aug-07	29-Aug-07
Set up communications with Partners		
2. Analyze		
Form teams		
Agree project team charters		
Train project teams		
Define processes		
Define the service		
Map the service processes	28-Aug-07	29-Aug-07
Measure processes		
Define performance measures	28-Aug-07	29-Aug-07
Collect data	30-Aug-07	06-Sep-07
Report performance measures	08-Sep-07	08-Sep-07
3. Benchmark		
Establish partners		
Identify like organizations	28-Aug-07	29-Aug-07
Identify 'best practice' organizations	28-Aug-07	29-Aug-07
Plan benchmarking scope	28-Aug-07	29-Aug-07
Contact partners	10-Sep-07	25-Sep-07
Agree benchmarking goals	10-Sep-07	25-Sep-07
Agree rules	10-Sep-07	25-Sep-07
Exchange information, visits	10-Sep-07	25-Sep-07
Analyze differences		
Compare performance	26-Sep-07	07-Oct-07
Compare processes	26-Sep-07	07-Oct-07
Compare practices	26-Sep-07	07-Oct-07
Identify best practice		
Investigate others' processes, performance, and practices	26-Sep-07	07-Oct-07
Agree innovations	26-Sep-07	07-Oct-07
4. Innovate		
Establish causes		
Investigate potential root causes	28-Aug-07	08-Sep-07
Rank causes	28-Aug-07	08-Sep-07
Confirm causes	28-Aug-07	08-Sep-07
Develop solutions		
Analyze root causes of service problems	08-Oct-07	13-Oct-07
Determine solutions - service improvements	08-Oct-07	13-Oct-07

Plan implementation of new solutions	08-Oct-07	13-Oct-07
Present to management	17-Oct-07	17-Oct-07
5. Implement		
Establish tasks	17-Oct-07	17-Oct-07
Commit to a timetable	17-Oct-07	17-Oct-07
Plan resources	17-Oct-07	17-Oct-07
Make someone accountable	17-Oct-07	17-Oct-07
Execute plan	18-Oct-07	08-Nov-07

Rapid Assessment Scorecard (The Critical 9)

1. Political Setting:

The people of Hala have been involved in national as well as local politics since 1940s. Presently Makhdoom Habibullah is the Taluka Nazim elected through local elections on non-party basis but their ties with one of the two major political parties of Pakistan, are pretty obvious.

2. Decentralization:

The Taluka Administration has full jurisdiction for carrying out development activities in two of the three selected service sectors – Water Supply and Sanitation. The third sector that is education is a district subject.

3. General Security

Hala is a fairly peaceful place. Crime rate is low and there are only occasional reports of crimes such as theft, robbery or targeted violence.

4. Freedom of Speech

As stated earlier, political activity in Hala can be traced back to time before partition. The residents actively voice their concerns through NGOS and CSOs.

5. Presence of CSOs

The following CSOs are working in the selected sectors:

- a. Mehran Rural Development and Welfare Society
- b. Sindh Samaji Bahbood Association
- c. Hala Samaji Tanzeem,
- d. United Memon Jamiat,
- e. Halai Social Welfare Association ,
- f. Pak Khursheed Welfare,

6. Professional NGO Activity

The following NGOs are working in the selected sectors

- a. HANDS
- b. SHEDS
- c. PAIMAN

7. Quality of Media

No local newspapers. However regional media has representatives at Hala. Media is by and large non-partisan.

8. Leadership Orientation of Service Providers

The CRC Project at Hala was initially proposed by the Taluka Nazim and Taluka administration. It shows their commitment to good governance.

9. Interest of Higher levels of Government in Local Initiatives

They are aware and supportive of the progressive reforms.