ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK

PPA: INO 24332

PROJECT PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

ON THE

JUNIOR SECONDARY EDUCATION PROJECT
(Loan 1194-INO)

IN

INDONESIA

November 2002

CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS

Currency Unit – rupiah (Rp)

		At Appraisal (30 September 1992)	At Project Completion (1 October 1998)	At Operations Evaluation (30 June 2002)
Rp1.00	=	$0.000491	$0.0000926	$0.0001145
$1.00	=	Rp2,037	Rp10,837	Rp8,735

ABBREVIATIONS

ADB	–	Asian Development Bank
EMIS	–	education management information system
JSE	–	junior secondary education
MONE	–	Ministry of National Education
MORA	–	Ministry of Religious Affairs
MTs	–	Madrasah Tsanawiyah (JSE school with Islamic teachings)
OEM	–	Operations Evaluation Mission
PCR	–	project completion report
PIU	–	project implementation unit
PPAR	–	project performance audit report
SLB	–	Sekolah Luar Biasa (school for the physically and mentally handicapped)
SLTP	–	Sekolah Lanjutan Tingkat Pertama (general junior secondary school)

GLOSSARY

SLTP Kecil	Small JSE school specifically designed for remote areas
SLTP Terbuka	JSE school with distance learning and extension/remote classrooms for the poor and geographically disadvantaged

NOTES

(i) The fiscal year (FY) of the Government during project implementation ran from 1 April to 31 March. As of 2001, the FY runs from 1 January to 31 December.

(ii) In this report, "$" refers to US dollars.

Operations Evaluation Department, PE-609

CONTENTS

BASIC DATA iii

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY iv

I. BACKGROUND 1

A. Rationale 1
B. Formulation 1
C. Purpose and Outputs 1
D. Cost, Financing, and Executing Arrangements 2
E. Completion and Self-Evaluation 2
F. Operations Evaluation 3

II. PLANNING AND IMPLEMENTATION PERFORMANCE 3

A. Formulation and Design 3
B. Achievement of Outputs 4
C. Cost and Scheduling 5
D. Procurement and Construction 5
E. Organization and Management 5

III. ACHIEVEMENT OF PROJECT PURPOSE 7

A. Operational Performance 7
B. Performance of the Operating Entity 10
C. Sustainability 10

IV. ACHIEVEMENT OF OTHER DEVELOPMENT IMPACTS 11

A. Socioeconomic Impact 11
B. Environmental Impact 12
C. Impact on Institutions and Policy 12

V. OVERALL ASSESSMENT 12

A. Relevance 12
B. Efficacy 13
C. Efficiency 13
D. Sustainability 13
E. Institutional Development and Other Impacts 14
F. Overall Project Rating 14
G. Assessment of ADB and Borrower Performance 14

VI. ISSUES, LESSONS, AND FOLLOW-UP ACTIONS 14
A. Key Issues for the Future 14
B. Lessons Learned 15
C. Follow-Up Actions 16

APPENDIXES

1.	Report on the Survey	17
2.	Summary of Project Outputs and Inputs	21
3.	Staff Development	24
4.	Project Costs	26
5.	Donor-Funded Education Sector Projects in Indonesia Since 1990	27

BASIC DATA
Junior Secondary Education Project (Loan 1194-INO)

Project Preparation

TA No.	TA Name	Type	No. of Person-Months	Amount ($'000)	Approval Date
1458	Rationalization of Operation and Maintenance in Primary and Secondary Education	PPTA	21.5	350	28 Dec 1990
1527	Lower Secondary Education	PPTA	36.0	571	24 Jun 1991

Key Project Data ($ million)	As per ADB Loan Documents	Actual
Total Project Cost	174.9	168.2
Foreign Cost	53.1	52.8
Local Cost	121.8	115.4
ADB Loan Amount/Utilization	105.0	98.1
ADB Loan Amount/Cancellation	0.0	6.9

Key Dates	**Expected**	**Actual**
Fact Finding	Apr 92	22 Apr–15 May 1992
Appraisal	Jul 92	3–26 Aug 1992
Loan Negotiations	Oct 92	19–21 Oct 1992
Board Approval	Oct 92	19 Nov 1992
Loan Agreement		14 Dec 1992
Loan Effectiveness	14 Mar 1993	2 Feb 1993
First Disbursement		15 Jun 1993
Loan Closing	1 Oct 1998	5 Jun 2000
Project Completion	31 Mar 1998	31 Dec 1998
Months (effectiveness to completion)	60.5	71.0

Borrower Republic of Indonesia

Executing Agency Ministry of National Education

Type of Mission	**No. of Missions**	**No. of Person-Days**
Fact Finding	1	125
Appraisal	1	192
Project Administration		
Inception	1	3
Review	4	121
Project Completion	1	54
Operations Evaluation[a]	1	72

ADB = Asian Development Bank, PPTA = project preparatory technical assistance, TA = technical assistance.

[a] The Operations Evaluation Mission comprised Kus Hardjanti, mission leader and evaluation specialist; Robert Cannon, staff consultant, educational management and institutional expert; and F. Djawa, local research assistant, who visited the project sites from 23 May to 15 June 2002.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Education Act of 1989 provided the legal framework for Indonesia's education system. Within this framework, basic education included primary education (grades 1–6) and junior secondary education (JSE) (grades 7–9). The act stated that a strong foundation in basic education was essential to maintain quality in senior secondary and higher education, and thereby improve the country's human resources. The Government gave high priority to the provision of high-quality, universal basic education in its 5-Year Development Plan for 1989/90–1993/94, as well as in its Second 25-Year Development Plan that started in 1994/95.

The Junior Secondary Education Project (the Project), approved by the Asian Development Bank (ADB) in late 1992, was based on the findings of a comprehensive study of the issues, strategies, and options with regard to improving and expanding JSE. Its main objective was to improve the quality of and equity in the delivery of JSE in Indonesia and thereby help the Government achieve its goal of universal, high-quality basic education. The Project involved the Ministry of National Education (MONE) and the Ministry of Religious Affairs (MORA). It covered the entire country with particular emphasis on unserved and underserved rural areas as well as disadvantaged urban areas. The Operations Evaluation Mission (OEM), which visited Indonesia in May/June 2002, carried out a survey of the Project's impact on quality, management capacity, and access to JSE and held focus group discussions and interviews in eight provinces.

Targets set at appraisal for the four project components were mostly achieved or exceeded. The first component was educational improvements and access. Access to Sekolah Lanjutan Tingkat Pertama (SLTP) Terbuka (junior secondary schools with distance learning), which target the poor and geographically disadvantaged, increased dramatically from 20 base schools offering distance learning and 120 extension/remote classrooms in 1992 to 3,500 base schools and 18,700 extension/remote classrooms in 2002. The proportion of female students increased from 46% to 48% and of female teachers from 39% to 46%. JSE enrollment rose from 5.8 million to 7.6 million, and retention rates increased from 87% to 96%, while dropout rates fell from 7.2% to 4.4% and repeater rates decreased from 1.0% to 0.3%. The Project achieved or surpassed its targets in relation to staff development, school rehabilitation, textbook and learning material development, establishment of model schools under MORA, implementation of Curriculum 1994 in MONE and MORA, and national standardization of achievement testing. At 97%, the construction of new library rooms almost reached the target. All subcomponents of the second component, teacher training, achieved the targets except staff development in MORA (83% of its target). The third component was institutional development. The in-country development of staff and the provision of equipment either reached or exceeded the targets, while overseas staff development achieved 88% of the target. The fourth component supported project implementation. Targets for international and domestic staff development were exceeded while project monitoring and evaluation systems are being developed.

The National Examination Development Center has gained a good reputation for its educational testing. The Book Center, responsible for textbook development, is continuing to produce and supply textbooks using modern information and communications technologies. New strategies have been established for incorporating community participation and feedback into bottom-up book development. Teacher training resulted in significant staff development in MONE and MORA. The OEM's survey, group discussions, and interviews showed that teacher training was successful in contributing to the quality and implementation of Curriculum 1994. The overseas training for doctoral and masters degrees was completed on time and achieved highly satisfactory results. All candidates returned to their employers and continued working in the education sector. However, the Project's impact has been low in relation to academic supervision. Project monitoring and evaluation within MONE was constrained by the delay in

consultant support and the lack of focus of the international consultant. The component needed more resources to achieve satisfactory outputs, and the problems were in part a design issue. The establishment of a monitoring and evaluation system in MORA, capable of collecting both systemwide and project-specific data, was more successful.

The Project has been highly relevant to the Government's basic education strategy and in line with ADB's operational strategy for the country. The OEM assesses the Project as efficacious and efficient. The Government is committed to supporting JSE and is implementing a follow-on project. The 2002 state budget allocation for the education sector is the largest among all sectors. Buildings and equipment are being maintained through local funds; however, a mechanism to finance the renewal and replacement of textbooks and library books has to be developed. The OEM found that certain concepts central to the Project have a durability that is transcending the changed environment that has resulted from decentralization. These concepts include the role of institutions that enhance accessibility, in particular, the SLTP Terbuka and schools for the handicapped with special learning needs; the fundamental importance of continuing professional development of teachers and their managers; and the growing recognition of the value of collecting robust data for management information systems. Thus the Project's institutional development impact has been significant. A professional cadre of experienced staff is now able to lead and manage in the complex environment that currently characterizes Indonesian education. Communities are increasingly taking more active interest in their schools, and the material and social benefits of this interest are evident in those schools where community involvement is most developed.

The appraisal targets for the major project components have been achieved. Field observation of facilities and practices that persisted during the financial crisis and the subsequent economic, political, and social turmoil indicates sustainability of project activities. Consequently, the Project is rated successful.

The OEM observed examples of good management and innovative approaches in schools. A mechanism to document and disseminate good experiences for replication should be established. Disseminating practices that work by recognizing and consolidating successful schools and providing a positive learning opportunity and source of support for others can contribute to sustainability. Another key lesson is that a participatory approach toward developing strategies that includes school principals, teachers, managers, and communities is crucial for sustainability. Following project completion, the Government should pay special attention to assuring that ongoing project activities are included in annual budgets in order to strengthen sustainability.

ADB should examine concerns expressed at the district level about the sustainability of successful programs accessible to the poor, to the geographically disadvantaged, and to dropout students, such as the SLTP Terbuka, and about the career development of teachers, which could be affected by the decentralization, and should seek solutions under the ongoing project. This is to ensure that the Government continues to give priority to the equity of and accessibility to good quality education achieved by the SLTP Terbuka and that institutional capacity building focuses on regional administrations in support of the new arrangements for educational management.

The OEM recommends that the Government (i) disseminate examples of good practice in school management, learning, and teaching; (ii) monitor and support the work of school principals; (iii) provide models of good practice in developing and implementing maintenance schedules and resource management plans; and (iv) demonstrate leadership in securing greater community involvement in school work.

I. BACKGROUND

A. Rationale

1. By 1990 Indonesia had significantly enhanced its educational level compared with the situation in the late 1960s. It achieved large gains in literacy and labor force skills. Enrollment in primary schools became almost universal, and secondary enrollment continued to rise. The demand for skilled and professional human resources was increasing because of rapid economic growth. However, Indonesia was facing challenges in ensuring that the poor had access to basic education and that the labor force, which was growing rapidly, was being provided with the required skills. The Government therefore gave high priority to the provision of high-quality, universal basic education in its 5-Year Development Plan for 1989/90–1993/94 and its Second 25-Year Development Plan, which started in 1994/95. In terms of development effort, the Government focused on improving the quality and expanding the capacity of primary education (grades 1–6) and junior secondary education (JSE) (grades 7–9).

2. The secondary school system is divided into two levels: 3 years of JSE and 3 years of senior secondary education, grades 10–12. JSE is offered under the Ministry of National Education (MONE)[1] in general JSE schools (Sekolah Lanjutan Tingkat Pertama [SLTPs]), and under the Ministry of Religious Affairs (MORA) in JSE schools with Islamic teachings (Madrasah Tsanawiyah [MTs]) that offer the same curriculum as SLTPs with additional Islamic subjects. MTs students tended to be drawn from among the poor and the less privileged. The main issues at the JSE level related to equitable access, financing, teacher training, and management of quality improvement. The Government decided to address these issues by developing and increasing the number of SLTPs Terbuka (which provided education to financially and geographically disadvantaged students, including dropouts, and offered a curriculum equivalent to the general SLTPs combined with a distance learning system) and small JSE schools in remote areas (SLTPs Kecil), as well as by enhancing the quality and accessibility of schools for the handicapped (Sekolah Luar Biasa [SLB]).

B. Formulation

3. In 1991 the Government asked the Asian Development Bank (ADB) for assistance in developing the JSE subsector. In response, ADB approved a technical assistance grant for a study of the issues, strategies, and options related to improving and expanding JSE and for the preparation of a detailed project proposal.[2] The preparation took into account also the findings of an earlier TA study.[3] The proposed Project was appraised by ADB in August 1992 and approved in November 1992.

C. Purpose and Outputs

4. The Project's main objective was to improve the quality of and equity in the delivery of JSE throughout Indonesia, thus helping the Government achieve its goal of providing universal, high-quality basic education and expanding the pool of skilled human resources. Specifically, the Project's purpose was to (i) support the Government's program to provide universal basic

---

[1] Renamed the Ministry of Education and Culture in 1992.

[2] TA 1527-INO: *Lower Secondary Education*, for $571,000, approved on 24 June 1991. The project title was later changed to Junior Secondary Education for consistency with government terminology.

[3] TA 1458-INO: *Rationalization of Operation and Maintenance in Primary and Secondary Education*, for $350,000, approved on 28 December 1990.

education, (ii) implement Curriculum 1994,[4] (iii) improve academic supervision and student evaluation processes, and (iv) strengthen MONE and MORA to ensure sustainability of improvements achieved under the Project.

5. The Project had four components: (i) educational improvements and access (staff development, development of textbooks and learning materials, rehabilitation of schools, construction of classrooms and libraries, implementation of Curriculum 1994, and provision of equipment); (ii) teacher training; (iii) institutional development; and (iv) support for project implementation. The Project was to cover the entire country with particular emphasis on unserved and underserved rural areas, such as the eastern provinces, as well as disadvantaged urban areas in Sumatra and Java.

D. Cost, Financing, and Executing Arrangements

6. At appraisal, the total project cost was estimated at $174.9 million. On 19 November 1992, ADB approved a loan of $105 million to finance the entire foreign exchange cost of $53.1 million plus $51.9 million of the local currency cost of $121.8 million. The expected loan closing date was 1 October 1998.

7. MONE was the Executing Agency. As the Government's administrative and financial mechanisms for project implementation were separate for SLTPs and MTs, MORA participated as a cooperating agency to facilitate activities related to MTs. A project steering committee was established to provide policy guidance.

E. Completion and Self-Evaluation

8. The Project was completed in December 1998, 9 months later than expected at appraisal. The project completion report (PCR) was circulated to the Board in May 2001. The PCR found the Project successful in achieving its objectives of improving quality, increasing access, and enhancing management capacity in the JSE subsector; highly relevant to the Government's basic education development strategy at appraisal; and in line with ADB's strategy for the country. The PCR stated that the Project had increased the enrollment of young people in JSE, which was a prerequisite for entry into semiskilled work. It also increased opportunities for the poor, for geographically isolated children, and for those with special learning needs to participate in JSE and realize the social and financial benefits that it offered. Since evidence suggested that the quality of education was improving, as indicated by increased retention rates and performance in the national final examination in core subjects, the Project was assessed as efficacious.

9. The PCR noted that the Project was implemented in a cost-effective manner and that much of the expenditure was directed to schools, where benefits to students were high. However, inputs to library buildings and equipment were not properly utilized to achieve the expected enrichment of the education process. In addition, opportunities to consolidate packages of inputs to be procured for more competitive tendering were not always exploited. As a result, the Project was assessed as partly efficient. Given the Government's continued commitment to the sector and ADB's ongoing support to maintain and build on the Project's

[4] In 1989 a ministerial decree initiated a major curriculum reform exercise, which culminated in Curriculum 1994, a major reform of Curriculum 1984. Apart from the basic academic program, 20% of Curriculum 1994 consisted of local content, developed with the participation of local communities to reflect the needs of local culture, environment, enterprises, and industries and incorporate skills training relevant to local needs.

outputs, its sustainability was assessed as likely although textbooks and library books were nearing the end of their useful life with no clear mechanism for funding their replacement. Institutional development and other impacts were assessed as moderate. The Project improved MONE's management capacity and established a strong management capacity in MORA. Overall the PCR rated the Project as successful.

F. Operations Evaluation

10. This project performance audit report (PPAR) assesses the Project's relevance, efficacy, efficiency, sustainability, and institutional impacts. It also identifies lessons and follow-up actions for ADB's ongoing and future operations in the education sector. The PPAR presents the findings of the Operations Evaluation Mission (OEM) that visited Indonesia in May/June 2002 and whose activities included a survey, interviews, and focus group discussions carried out in eight provinces (Bali, Banten, East Java, East Kalimantan, Jakarta, South Sulawesi, West Java, and West Sumatra).[5] The report on the survey is provided in Appendix 1. The PPAR incorporates information gathered from discussions with officials in MONE, MORA, and relevant institutions and with consultants working in the education sector. Copies of the draft PPAR were provided to the Government, MONE, and concerned ADB staff for review and comments, which were taken into account when finalizing the PPAR.

II. PLANNING AND IMPLEMENTATION PERFORMANCE

A. Formulation and Design

11. The Project was designed to provide equitable access to JSE, enhance the quality of student learning, and develop teaching and management capacity. Concurrently, the Project was intended to help the Government implement Curriculum 1994. It was the first ADB loan to Indonesia's education sector and the first loan that recognized the role of MORA. By providing assistance to MTs the intent was to offer the same quality improvements to a larger segment of the population, particularly the financially and/or geographically disadvantaged. The approach applied to achieve project objectives was relevant and appropriate. The project design recognized that significant quality improvements in education called for a multifaceted rather than single-issue approach. Thus the three key issues addressed were student access to JSE, curriculum implementation (including teaching, learning, and learning resources), and education management. These issues were reflected in the major project components: (i) improving the quality of education and access; (ii) supporting teacher training; and (iii) enhancing institutional development. The monitoring and evaluation expectations were not met, which was partly a design issue and partly a performance issue related to the consultants.

12. The OEM considers the design and subsequent implementation of the Project relevant to the Government's objectives in basic education and to ADB's operational strategy for Indonesia at that time. This strategy included assistance in meeting basic needs and developing human resources across various sectors because this encapsulated the major development issues confronting the country.

---

[5] The OEM followed a simplified tracer study approach combined with a modified version of the methodology used for the *Special Study of the Effectiveness and Impact of Training in Education Projects in Indonesia* by ADB in 1997 (SST 97023-INO). The OEM visited project sites and conducted in-depth focus group discussions during which questionnaires were administered and then collected upon completion. In addition, the OEM traced recipients of the training and staff development component in their new working environment and assessed the impact of the Project's capacity building interventions.

B. Achievement of Outputs

13. Overall, outputs of the four main components were satisfactorily delivered and were of the expected quality (Appendix 2).

1. Educational Improvements and Access

14. Access to JSE by the poor and geographically disadvantaged by means of SLTPs Terbuka increased tremendously from 20 base schools with distance learning in 1992 to 3,500 in 2002. In addition to these base schools, the education system now also has 18,700 extension/remote classrooms as compared to 120 at project start-up. The proportion of female students and female teachers increased from 46% to 48% and from 39% to 46%, respectively; JSE enrollment and the retention rate rose from 5.8 million to 7.6 million and from 87% to 96%, respectively; and dropout and repeater rates fell from 7.2% to 4.4% and from 1.0% to 0.3%, respectively.[6] Staff development, school rehabilitation, textbook and learning material development, and domestic consulting services exceeded the targets set at appraisal. Establishing model schools under MORA, implementing Curriculum 1994 in MONE and MORA, and standardizing achievement testing nationally achieved the targets. Construction of new library rooms (97%) and international consulting services (89%) almost reached the targets. The SLTP Terbuka system now accounts for more than 6% of JSE enrollment. However, many libraries are not properly utilized.

2. Teacher Training

15. The targets for upgrading of teachers' qualifications and professional skills were achieved. For MONE, about 14,000 teachers were provided with in-country training, of which almost 5,000 were upgraded from high school qualification to a 3-year postsecondary diploma and 8,000 were upgraded through 1 year of additional training. Teacher training covering all subjects was contracted to the teacher training institutions, and more than 80% of trainees achieved the upgraded qualification. For MORA, almost 2,000 master teachers were trained who in turn trained over 5,000 teachers in general subjects in public and private MTs.

3. Institutional Development

16. Under the Project 16 persons in MONE and 3 in MORA completed master's degrees and 3 completed doctoral degrees in the United States. Shorter international courses and study visits to Australia were provided for 113 persons under MONE, while 3 persons under MORA benefited from master of educational planning courses in Indonesia. All those trained returned to their respective institutions. Appendix 3 provides detailed information on staff development.

4. Support for Project Implementation and Management

17. The consequences for this component of the delay in engaging consultants were significant. Monitoring and evaluation within MONE were constrained by the delay in consultant support and the lack of focus on the part of the international consultant, as well as by the poor education management information system (EMIS) available at project start-up. The

[6] MONE. 1994. *Indonesia Statistics in Brief 1992/93*. Jakarta; and MONE. 2002. *Indonesia Statistics in Brief 2000/01*. Jakarta.

development of the EMIS has been continued under two follow-on projects.[7] For MORA, the development of an EMIS and the capacity to collect systemwide and project-specific data was carried out satisfactorily.

C. Cost and Scheduling

18. The actual project cost amounted to $168.2 million, 3.8% less than the appraisal estimate of $174.9 million (Appendix 4). The reduction was attributed to the substantial devaluation of the rupiah following the financial crisis of late 1997 and 1998.

19. By the time of loan closing on 5 June 2000, $98.1 million was disbursed and the balance of $6.9 million was cancelled. As envisaged, ADB financed the entire foreign exchange cost of $52.8 million and $45.3 million of the local currency cost. While savings were realized in several categories (civil works, project implementation support, and monitoring and evaluation), significant overruns were noted in others (overseas fellowships, international academic consulting, and local training). These variations did not significantly affect the achievement of project outcomes.

20. Project completion was delayed by 9 months. The initial delay in the deployment of consultants by 1 year did not significantly affect the overall implementation of the Project. The loan was closed 17 months after project completion to allow reimbursement of the outstanding advance in the Project's imprest account.

D. Procurement and Construction

21. Except for the delay in engaging consultants, the project inputs were satisfactory. Firms managing overseas fellowships and provincial procurement performed well. Civil works comprised rehabilitation of schools and construction of classrooms and new library rooms. As the civil works were minor, the contracts were awarded on the basis of local competitive bidding, as agreed by the Government and ADB. There were no significant technical problems related to procurement and construction that would have prevented the Project from attaining planned capacity. Although volume packaging of procurement was preferred, procurement packages were mostly awarded separately to avoid implementation delays.

22. The construction of classrooms and libraries was generally well executed. OEM inspection showed that these are in reasonable condition. Maintenance of school facilities and equipment varies and should be improved in some schools. Its cost need not be high if maintenance is conducted regularly and in a planned way.

E. Organization and Management

23. The performance of MONE as the Executing Agency and MORA as the cooperating agency for MTs was satisfactory. The project steering committee that provided policy guidance was chaired by the director general of the Directorate General of Primary and Secondary Education, with the director of the Directorate of Islamic Schools Development as deputy chair, and included representatives from the National Development Planning Agency, Ministry of Finance, and MONE. Separate central and provincial project implementation units (PIUs) in

[7] Loan 1359-INO: *Private Junior Secondary Education Project*, for $49 million approved on 18 July 1995; and Loans 1573/1574(SF)-INO: *Second Junior Secondary Education Project*, for $160 million and $15 million, respectively, approved on 6 November 1997.

MONE and MORA, each with a project manager, were established to monitor implementation and disbursement. Project coordination committees were established at the central and provincial levels to coordinate the MONE and MORA portions of the Project. Experience gained during the Project and the institutional strengthening of MONE and MORA have been beneficial in the ongoing implementation of Loans 1573/1574(SF)-INO (footnote 7) and Loan 1519-INO,[8] and the management of schools in general.

24. The OEM concurs with the PCR's judgment that covenants were generally fulfilled in a timely manner to support project outcomes. The PCR raised the issue of noncompliance with a covenant on teacher incentives. These subsequently received differential treatment at the local level, where some salary incentives have been paid, including assistance for transportation. This outcome reflects, in part, the significant structural changes in educational management accompanying decentralization and the emergence of different policies and approaches at the district level. In addition, it is planned in the 2003 draft state budget that the Government will raise teachers' average salaries by 10% and increase their incentives by up to 50% according to their functional responsibilities.

25. Consultants generally performed well and the envisaged know-how transfer took place. The PCR noted problems with monitoring and evaluation because of the consultants' failure to establish indicators and systems in a timely manner. The PCR further noted that identifying indicators at appraisal could have ameliorated this problem. The timing is crucial. By the time a project commences it is already too late to establish valid baseline data.

26. The PCR noted that the major constraint to quality improvement and school development was the institutional budget, and recommended that initiatives to recover costs and generate income should be examined and introduced. The OEM observed examples of innovative approaches, such as the development of skills and entrepreneurship in SLTPs Terbuka and SLBs in cooperation with other government institutions related to agriculture and industry and with the private sector, as well as income generation activities in model MTs. However, no systematic process is in place to document and disseminate such experiences for replication.

27. The significant changes in Indonesia's macroeconomic and social environment and in school governance have had a profound effect on MONE's capability. Although this remains strong at MONE's central level, capacity at the local level raises concerns. For example, many schools are reporting problems ranging from bureaucratic issues, such as who is responsible for career development of teachers and funding for SLTPs Terbuka, to annual budgets in the context of the new decentralized environment. Although decentralization has made the situation of SLTPs Terbuka precarious because many districts lack the funds to manage them adequately, major development work for SLTPs Terbuka is continuing under Loans 1573/1574(SF)-INO (footnote 7). Parliament's recent move to increase the education share of local budgets from 10% to a mandatory 20% may help address the lack of funds. Special attention should be given by the Government to ensuring that ongoing project activities are included in annual budgets to strengthen sustainability after project completion. The financial management of schools after project completion needs detailed assessment with a broad range of stakeholders to develop measures that will ensure a reliable funding source.

[8] Loan 1519-INO: *Development of Madrasah Aliyahs*, for $85 million, approved on 25 March 1997. Madrasah Aliyahs are equivalent to senior secondary schools.

III. ACHIEVEMENT OF PROJECT PURPOSE

A. Operational Performance

1. Educational Improvements and Access

28. The Project rehabilitated schools; built classrooms; constructed new libraries; and provided staff development, equipment, and consulting services. MONE also needed support to implement Curriculum 1994 at both the national and local levels. The Project helped develop the curriculum; produce teaching and learning materials, such as guides and textbooks; and develop tests. Evidence of the satisfactory provision of these educational resources is visible in the schools and is supported by case studies in nine provinces.[9] The Government complied with the loan covenant that called for finalizing and implementing the curriculum in a timely fashion.

29. School facilities were improved and equipment was provided. Outputs were satisfactorily delivered and the quality of achievements helped attain the overall purposes of the Project. The OEM observed that school materials were in regular use in more than half of the schools visited. In other schools many books were still in new or near new condition, which gave the impression that they were underutilized.

30. Substantial training was provided to 2,267 supervisors, and 24,000 teachers' manuals and guidelines pertaining to the 20 local content elements of Curriculum 1994 were developed and distributed. The outcome of this work has been varied. Survey respondents evaluated it as having some impact or as likely sustainable, which was the least satisfactory rating compared with other project components. The training attempted to reorient the attitudes of many supervisors who were deeply imbued with the previous administrative focus rather than the teaching-learning focus envisaged at appraisal. Local attention to the selection, management, and continuing professional development of supervisors should be explicitly required in future work in the sector to redress this and to ensure that educational facilities are used effectively and that teachers receive continuing support for their professional work. All professional development activities should be tightly linked with organizational development and management systems and plans.

31. Targets for enhancing educational testing for JSE were achieved. The Project provided 1,699 person-months of achievement test training. In addition, some notable achievements in testing consolidated earlier support to MONE, such as that provided under the 1989 World Bank Second Secondary Education and Management Project. The National Examination Development Center has established a good reputation for its professional activities in educational testing, and those personnel who received higher degree training have remained with the center. The OEM observed that the center's physical facilities were of a high standard and well maintained. The center is viewed as a center of excellence in Indonesia for objective test item development and test item banking.[10] Moreover, there is evidence of sustainable outcomes through its work on devising new scholastic tests, garnering support for nonobjective test formats, and developing new software to assist its programs. There is also evidence of sustainable outcomes in some districts where schools with teachers trained in testing are providing professional development support to other schools. The continuation of development

[9] ADB. 2001. *BME Final Report, First Junior Secondary Education Project*. Manila.
[10] Computerized collection of test items according to academic subject matter, which can be selected to develop standardized tests.

assistance for this center over an extended period is an important factor contributing to sustainable educational change in Indonesia and should be considered in future operations.[11]

32. The Project provided support for the development, production, and distribution of textbooks and learning materials. Survey respondents evaluated the impact of these materials highly positively. The Book Center responsible for this work is continuing to develop strategies for producing and supplying texts using modern information and communications technologies. It is considering a proposal for bottom-up book development at the provincial level and for community participation and feedback. Examples of good quality textbooks with local content will be available for public inspection on the center's Web site, which is being developed. A contextual learning program has also been developed under Loans 1573/1574(SF)-INO (footnote 7), which will eventually be implemented nationwide. Textbooks will be adapted to local conditions at the provincial level using the bottom-up approach to book development.

33. To increase access to JSE, the Project put strategies in place to supplement the coverage of general SLTPs. Accordingly, it provided assistance to develop SLTPs Terbuka for students who face difficulties accessing regular schools because of financial and/or geographical disadvantages, SLBs for students with physical or intellectual impairments, MTs for children whose parents favor an education incorporating additional religious subjects, and SLTPs Kecil for students in remote areas. Girls' access to education was a cross-cutting strategy in all schools.

34. Based on the survey, interviews, group discussions, field observations, and review of documents, it is the OEM's view that the assistance provided under the educational improvement and access component exceeded, met, or almost met its targets. The Project has improved access and has helped the Government meet its goal of equity in delivering JSE. The assessment also suggests that much that has been achieved is sustainable and is relevant to the changed economic and social environment. SLTPs Terbuka are creating new opportunities for poor and geographically disadvantaged students to participate in education via distance learning. Even though they have higher dropout and noncompletion rates because of the types of students they target, many of whom must also work, some students have won academic awards and have shown academic achievements comparable to those of students attending general SLTPs. Beneficiaries rated the accessibility achievements of SLTPs Terbuka highly. Field observations revealed that access to education for girls in situations, where travel to regular schools was difficult, significantly improved (e.g., in Banjar district in Bali 67% to 90% of the students in SLTPs Terbuka remote classes are girls). These schools have also created an opportunity for community participation in supporting the educational services available and have attracted volunteer teachers, particularly in skills training.

35. Overall JSE indicators show that between 1992/93 and 2000/01 the number of schools increased from 18,600 to 20,700, enrollment from 5.8 million to 7.6 million, the number of female students from 2.5 million to 3.7 million, and the number of female teachers from about 150,000 to over 200,000.

36. At appraisal, 54 model schools were planned under MORA and this target was achieved. MTs model schools demonstrate sustainable benefits, and the evidence indicates that their innovations in educational leadership and in income generation through school shops provide examples to other MTs. This success demonstrates the positive impact of restructuring in the MORA school system. Between 1998 and 2000 repetition rates decreased by 60% and dropout

[11] ADB. 1997. *Special Study of the Effectiveness and Impact of Training in Education Projects in Indonesia*. Manila.

rates by 50%. The inclusion of MTs in the Project was a policy decision that has been broadly appreciated by the beneficiaries, because it enhances the accessibility of JSE and recognizes the important contribution MTs can offer to general education in Indonesia. SLBs have been strengthened, and the initiative and dedication of staff in these schools reflect both their commitment and the benefits of training provided by the Project. The SLTP Kecil concept is based on small JSE schools located in remote areas and staffed with at least three qualified and motivated multidisciplinary teachers. The Project expanded the SLTP Terbuka program, but no additional SLTPs Kecil were built as their feasibility at that time was considered doubtful. However, the SLTP Kecil concept is supported by Loans 1573/1574(SF)-INO (footnote 7) in remote areas in Gorontalo; south and north Kalimantan; and central, southeast, and north Sulawesi. Currently the SLTP Kecil concept is widely accepted as a viable solution for schooling in remote areas.

2. Teacher Training

37. Teacher training is essential for enhancing the quality of education. The Government viewed it as central to the implementation of Curriculum 1994. This component provided substantial resources for staff development in both MONE and MORA, particularly for upgrading teachers. MONE submitted a master plan for teacher training for ADB approval that included equitable nomination and selection criteria. The staff development targets were either met or exceeded.

38. The PCR cited evidence that project schools were able to demonstrate improved academic performance on subjects that had received attention during the training. The OEM's survey, in-depth group discussions, and field observations indicated that teacher training was successful in contributing to the quality of the curriculum and its implementation. Both teachers and administrators strongly believe in the idea of continuing professional development and regard it now as an essential and normal aspect of their professional career rather than as an add-on or a reward for service.

39. Teachers' professional needs and motivation in relation to training will require constant attention to ensure that skills are maintained and further developed. In addition, as teachers and principals move from one location to another, their skills may need to be replaced through further professional development in their original schools. As teachers report that they continue to engage in additional outside employment to supplement their low salaries, the full benefit of their training is not always realized in their schools. Because of time restrictions that follow from this employment practice, innovative activities in schools are inhibited. Nevertheless, there is a compensating balance in the system: government teachers' second jobs are often in private educational institutions (nonprofit and for-profit schools) that are thus indirect beneficiaries of the training.

3. Institutional Development

40. Institutional development of MONE and MORA aimed at enabling them to plan, implement, and manage their JSE development programs. The focus was on management systems, management access to information and communications, and educational finance. The objectives of institutional development were generally achieved. The consultants performed well, particularly in MORA, where they assisted with internal restructuring beyond expectations.

41. All doctoral and master's degree candidates from MONE and MORA completed their education in the United States on time, achieved highly satisfactory results, and returned to their

employing institutions. This program of staff development made an important contribution to institutional strengthening as planned. With the introduction of regional governance arrangements following the passage of Law 22/1999, MONE's centralized capacity has been affected, as in 2001 some 1.5 million teachers and administrative staff were transferred from the national Government to regional governments. MONE retains authority for (i) determining national planning and development policy, (ii) setting guidelines for minimum service standards, (iii) accrediting institutions and professionals, and (iv) providing guidance to and supervising regional autonomy. Future support for institutional strengthening will need to focus on regional administrations in support of these new arrangements for educational management. While many of MONE's responsibilities have been transferred to districts, this is not the case for MORA, which remains centralized.

4. Support for Project Implementation and Management

42. To ensure effective project implementation and to strengthen PIUs at both the national and provincial levels, the Project provided support for supervision, monitoring and evaluation, and training. The PCR cited concerns that monitoring and evaluation expectations were not fully met and noted problems with the poor EMIS available at project start-up. The OEM attributes the difficulties to a mismatch between the complexities of the project, the extensive duties and responsibilities of the monitoring and evaluation consultant, and the limited 6 person-months duration of the consultants' appointment. Given the importance of monitoring and evaluation to project management and outcomes, more resources were needed to achieve the expected outputs.

B. Performance of the Operating Entity

43. MONE performed well during project implementation. Since then the Government's decentralization policy has had a profound impact on MONE, as many of its responsibilities have been transferred to district administrations. The education system is currently operating in an atmosphere of uncertainty in relation to the division of administrative responsibilities between the central Government, provincial governments, and district governments. Some of the latter lack the staff capabilities to develop and manage schools, and in some cases even to maintain them at current levels. Accordingly, school principals and educational administrators are concerned that such district governments may not have the capacity to operate and maintain project facilities adequately. The provincial MONE and MORA PIUs have developed implementation capacity to support follow-on projects and as resources for decentralization.

C. Sustainability

44. In the 2002 state budget the Government has given top priority to the education sector (education, culture, youth, and sports) and, at 24.5%, earmarked the largest allocation for it.[12] The allocation in the 2003 draft state budget is equally high. The main purpose is to intensify the 9-year program of compulsory basic education, one of the objectives of Curriculum 1994, which has been supported by the Project, as well as by ADB's most recent operation in the sector.[13] As mentioned in para. 24, the Government plans to raise teachers' average salaries by 10% and increase their incentives up to 50% according to their functional responsibilities. The Government is committed to supporting JSE. While buildings and equipment are being

[12] Republic of Indonesia. 2002. *Indonesia 2002, An Official Handbook*. Jakarta: National Information Agency.
[13] Loan 1863-INO(SF): *Decentralized Basic Education Project,* for $100 million, approved on 29 November 2000.

maintained through local funds, a mechanism for financing the updating and replacement of textbooks and library books has to be developed.

45. The OEM found that certain concepts, such as SLTPs Terbuka and SLBs, the role of continuing professional development of teachers and their managers, and the growing recognition of the value of collecting robust data for the EMIS have a durability that is transcending the changed environment. Nevertheless, budgetary support for the EMIS is still lacking. In addition, the need for academic supervision and strong educational leadership at the provincial and regional levels seems to be less well appreciated. To overcome this situation the Government has distributed academic supervision manuals to all supervisors and provided training on how to use them. Also, library resources and textbooks are often not used properly. Many libraries do not have catalogues,[14] and many JSE teachers do not know how to incorporate the use of libraries into their teaching. These are issues that can be addressed locally by closer supervision from principals and academic supervisors and through better school management. The lack of a regular funding source can lead to neglect or to a piecemeal approach and to further deterioration of assets. Some schools use imaginative management strategies in difficult situations, for example, entering into cooperative arrangements with other educational institutions, implementing community assistance programs, and training students in useful maintenance skills.

46. Both MONE and MORA now have an enhanced professional cadre of experienced staff able to lead and manage in the complex environment created by the decentralization process. However, decentralization is likely to dissipate MONE's improved management capacity if the transfer of human resources away from the center is not well planned and does not allow a period of transition to build capacity at the district level. Despite this, communities are clearly taking a more active interest in their schools, and the material and social benefits of this interest are evident in those schools where community involvement is most developed. The Government is implementing school-based management, empowering communities to be involved in decisionmaking as it relates to their schools, and providing block grants for textbooks. The Government's increasing attention to community participation in schools and Parliament's recent move to increase the education share from 10% to a mandatory 20% of local budgets are positive indicators of sustainability.

IV. ACHIEVEMENT OF OTHER DEVELOPMENT IMPACTS

A. Socioeconomic Impact

47. By training over 115,000 people; upgrading school buildings and libraries across the country; and strengthening central management, educational testing, and book production facilities, the Project has helped improve and expand human and physical resources for JSE in Indonesia and has strengthened the base for future educational and administrative developments. Overall JSE indicators demonstrate both qualitative and quantitative improvements. The OEM's survey shows substantial impacts of the Project on improving quality of education; upgrading teachers and MTs; increasing accessibility to JSE, particularly for girls, through SLTPs Terbuka and SLBs; and developing national achievement tests in science, mathematics, Bahasa Indonesia, and English.

48. Through their work for other educational institutions and for community organizations, teachers and administrators have made additional, if unquantifiable, contributions to society.

[14] ADB. 2001. *BME Final Report, First JSE Project.* Manila.

The domestic consultants have learned from their professional and academic contributions and, through this work, are enhanced educational resources. Most important, more than 7 million JSE students enrolled at project completion were the beneficiaries of project activities in varying degrees. The Project continues to have a beneficial impact on society, and its benefits have been distributed across regions and different social groups, including isolated children and children with physical and mental impairments. Gender equity issues have been adequately addressed and mainstreamed, as evidenced by the increased number of female JSE students and female teachers.

B. Environmental Impact

49. The Project did not pose any environmental problems as the rehabilitation of schools and construction of library rooms were small scale and dispersed. Generally these developments were well planned and executed. The development of an integrated environmental studies program to address environmental concerns in teacher training, book content, curriculum development, and fellowship training was planned at appraisal, and specific provisions for lessons in environmental education in science and social studies were to be made. The OEM could not find evidence in earlier reports that this issue had been addressed. Field observations indicated that environmental issues were integrated within the local content of Curriculum 1994, highlighting issues related to the local environment.

C. Impact on Institutions and Policy

50. The enabling environment for further quality improvements has been enhanced as a result of the Project. This environment has been strengthened in terms of human resource capacities in schools and administrative offices and of important support functions, such as the book and testing centers. MONE and MORA have improved their EMIS, which are supporting educational administration, as well as their activities in ongoing projects (footnotes 7, 8, and 13). MONE's PIU is now managing the implementation of Loans 1573/1574 (SF)-INO, and the experience of MORA's PIU in managing the Project has helped the implementation of Loan 1519-INO. The institutional development impact was highly satisfactory, particularly in MORA, where the Project built the management and planning capacity of the Directorate of Islamic Schools Development to implement general education within MTs.

V. OVERALL ASSESSMENT

A. Relevance

51. The Project's goal, purposes, and outputs were consistent with the Government's development strategy for universal basic education by helping improve the quality of and equity of access to JSE. The Project was also in line with ADB's operational strategy for Indonesia at the time of appraisal and at evaluation. The approach applied to achieving the project objectives was appropriate at the time of appraisal. The Project design recognized that significant quality improvements in education called for a multifaceted rather than single-issue approach. In the era of decentralized management and greater emphasis on school-based management and active community participation, the centralized approach has become less relevant. This was taken into account during project implementation and by the follow-on projects. The Project is assessed as highly relevant.

B. Efficacy

52. The OEM agrees with the PCR's view that the Project was efficacious. Field evidence indicates that the Project has made positive and lasting contributions, such as increasing equitable access to JSE through SLTPs Terbuka, which target the poor and geographically disadvantaged; implementing Curriculum 1994 in MONE and MORA; enhancing planning and management capacity and teachers' skills; and upgrading the quality of the national examination and textbook development centers. Some shortcomings still need to be addressed, such as developing the EMIS and improving academic supervision.

53. The survey that reviewed the Project's impact on quality, management capacity, and access to JSE confirmed an overall positive impact, with the strongest impact on upgrading learning materials and teachers' skills, followed by upgrading SLTPs Terbuka. The Project achieved its objectives in each of the four components: educational improvements and access, teacher training, institutional development, and support for project implementation and management. As activities for the four components were mutually reinforcing, the project design contributed significantly to both efficacy and efficiency. Appraisal targets were generally achieved or exceeded. The impact of the financial crisis that occurred near the end of implementation was well managed.

C. Efficiency

54. The Project is assessed as efficient. It was managed in a cost-effective way, and much of the expenditure was directed toward equipment, books, and learning materials for schools and teacher development, all areas of potentially the greatest benefit to students. Internal efficiency is demonstrated by the improvement in dropout and repetition rates from 7.2% to 4.4% and 1.0% to 0.3%, respectively. External efficiency is difficult to assess, as accurate data on the transition from JSE to employment are unavailable. The turbulent social and economic environment that has prevailed since the financial crisis has complicated the analysis of these factors. Nevertheless, between 1992/93 and 2000/01 continuation to senior secondary education increased from about 820,000 to over 1,000,000 students.

55. During its field trips the OEM noted that with some exceptions, libraries and equipment were properly utilized. Some schools expressed the need for expansion and almost all schools needed updating of textbooks. The cancellation of $6.9 million in unutilized loan proceeds was attributable to the substantial devaluation of the rupiah following the financial crisis in 1997 and 1998. The PCR noted that opportunities to consolidate procurement packages for more competitive bidding were not always exploited, but a review of documents and the OEM's assessment showed that procurement was mostly carried out separately to avoid implementation delays.

D. Sustainability

56. The Government has given high priority to the education sector, and has earmarked the largest sectoral allocations for education in both the 2002 state budget and the 2003 draft state budget. The Government is committed to supporting JSE and is currently implementing follow-on projects. The role of institutions that enhance accessibility, in particular SLTPs Terbuka and SLBs; the recognition of the value of continuing professional development for teachers and their managers; and the growing recognition of the value of collecting robust data for the EMIS are all durable. The impact of decentralization is likely to dissipate the improved management capacity in MONE if the transfer of human resources away from the center is not well planned and does

not allow for a period of transition to build capacity at the district level. However, the increasing community participation in schools, the increasing share of education in local budgets, and the support for the ongoing follow-on projects are strengthening sustainability. Consequently, the OEM assesses the sustainability of the Project as likely.

E. Institutional Development and Other Impacts

57. The Project has established computer-based monitoring and evaluation systems in both MONE and MORA, which is proving useful for the continuing administration of JSE and for follow-on projects. It has also developed an enabling environment for education by improving the management capacity of MONE and MORA at both the central and provincial levels. Schools and education sector agencies have been developed, and agencies such as the book and testing centers have been strengthened as an outcome of the Project. Overall the Project's institutional development impact has been significant.

F. Overall Project Rating

58. The Project aimed to improve the educational quality of and access to junior secondary schools. It has achieved the appraisal targets for the major components. Field observations of facilities and practices that persisted during the financial crisis and subsequent economic, political, and social turmoil provide substantial evidence of the sustainability of the Project's activities. The Project is, therefore, rated as successful.

G. Assessment of ADB and Borrower Performance

59. ADB performed well in identifying, preparing, and supervising the Project. The issue of donor coordination raised during the midterm review, which was related to the World Bank's assistance for secondary education projects that included significant coverage of JSE, has been addressed (see the list of projects in Appendix 5). ADB is now leading the Working Group on Education of the Consultative Group on Indonesia.[15] The frequency of review missions was satisfactory, although the spacing between reviews could have been better balanced during the earlier years. The duration of the missions may have been too brief given the Project's scale, geographical range, and complexity. The stable composition of review missions partly addressed this issue. Overall, ADB's performance was satisfactory. The Borrower's performance was also satisfactory. MONE and MORA showed a high degree of ownership during implementation. After project completion, MONE has coped with the complexities of changed government policies resulting from decentralization.

VI. ISSUES, LESSONS, AND FOLLOW-UP ACTIONS

A. Key Issues for the Future

60. The SLTP Terbuka system has contributed substantially to the accessibility to JSE, especially for poor and geographically disadvantaged students. There has been strong support for the system on the part of teachers, students, parents, and communities that was crucial in sustaining it throughout the difficult situation experienced during the financial crisis. This achievement might be dissipated in the new era of decentralization if the system is not provided with continued sufficient human and financial resources. The recent increase in the share of the

[15] The Consultative Group on Indonesia, chaired by the World Bank, was inaugurated in July 1992. It consists of representatives of 18 donor countries and 22 international donor agencies, including ADB.

education budget from 10% to a mandatory 20% of local budgets may help alleviate this situation.

61. Decentralized education in the new era of regional autonomy involves strengthening capacity for school-based management. It also seeks active participation by the community in school management and focuses attention on the transparent selection, development, and accountability of supervisors. Communities can also contribute by ensuring that educational facilities are used effectively and that teachers receive continuing support for their professional work from supervisors. More attention should be given to encouraging community interest in and ownership of the management of schools and classroom teaching. School staff should be assisted to clarify their professional needs and articulate their views on improved school practices. The field observations and discussions clearly indicated that when all stakeholders are involved in developing strategies, the probability of achieving sustainable outcomes increases. This sustainability is being supported by the ongoing Loan 1863-INO (footnote 13), which is helping develop districts' capacity to manage decentralized basic education and includes establishing school boards and promoting community participation in school management.

62. Educational management, particularly academic supervision, is still weak. The Project provided inputs to support improvements in academic supervision, but the evidence indicates that the impact was not at the level envisaged at appraisal. Training for school supervisors that moves away from one-shot, individualized training toward more carefully integrated professional development is a desirable strategy to follow in the future. Professional development activities of all kinds should be tightly linked with organizational development, management systems, and plans. This would recognize that successful development depends on integrating professional development with policies, needs analyses, and action planning; preparing supervisors at all levels to assist and support trained staff; and accompanying this with evaluation for feedback and further development and change. This principle applies equally to other training and upgrading, including teacher upgrading programs.

B. Lessons Learned

63. The Indonesian education system is achieving a high level of competence and maturity in an increasing number of schools and administrative and support agencies. There is much to learn from local experience in reaching this level rather than seeking solutions and ideas from abroad or from international consultants who will rarely have the necessary insights into local social contexts. The OEM observed some examples of good management and innovative approaches in schools, but notes that no systematic process is in place to document and disseminate learning from these experiences and to replicate them. The dissemination of successful practices can contribute to sustainability by recognizing and consolidating successful schools and providing a positive learning opportunity and source of support for others.

64. Better quality monitoring and evaluation processes need to be incorporated into projects during their preparation or, at the latest, during appraisal. In this regard, three factors are important for the quality of such processes. First, sufficient staff resources must be allocated to allow more attention to be given to the use of data for educational and developmental purposes. Second, having monitoring and evaluation begin at project start-up is too late for establishing systems and methods to collect essential baseline data and to monitor early project activity properly. Third, the focus of monitoring and evaluation for management is usually well executed. The learning focus that demands the collection and use of data for feedback and maintenance of what is working well needs more attention. To inform future development, the impact of

positive contributions should be analyzed and understood. Thus future monitoring and evaluation processes should record not only what was achieved, but also how it was done, and should capture not only inputs and outputs, but also impacts and their sustainability.

C. Follow-Up Actions

1. For ADB

65. Concerns expressed at the district level about the sustainability of successful programs accessible to poor and dropout students, such as SLTPs Terbuka, and about the career development of teachers, which could be affected by Law 22/1999 on decentralization, should be reviewed and solutions sought under the ongoing Loan 1863-INO (footnote 13) by December 2003. This is to ensure that equity in and accessibility to good quality education achieved by the SLTP Terbuka system supported by the Project continues to be a priority and that institutional capacity building be focused on regional administrations to support the new arrangements for educational management.

2. For the Government

66. Educational leadership in academic supervision focused on teaching and learning as envisaged at appraisal is pivotal to ensuring the quality of JSE. Professional development should be integrated with policies, needs analyses, and evaluation for feedback and further development. The work that supervisors are doing can be substantially improved, particularly with respect to (i) disseminating examples of good practice in school management, learning, and teaching; (ii) monitoring and supporting the work of school principals; (iii) providing models of good practice in developing and implementing maintenance schedules and resource management plans; and (iv) demonstrating leadership in securing greater community involvement in the work of schools. These activities should be accomplished by December 2004.

REPORT ON THE SURVEY

A. Background

1. The survey was conducted on 28 May–7 June 2002. Table A1.1 shows the schools and institutions surveyed and the number of respondents, all of whom are beneficiaries of the Project.

Table A1.1: Schools and Institutions Surveyed

Province	Schools, Institutions, and Valid Responses	Total Responses
DKI Jakarta	SLB Jakarta Selatan (7), SLTP 30 (5), Department of National Education (2)	14
West Java	SLTP Karawang (5), SLTP Jasinga (3), SLTP Megamendung (14), SLTP2 Ciputat (9)	31
Banten	SLTP Pangkal (12)	12
East Java	SLTP 30 Surabaya (4), SLTP2 Malang (7), SLBP Lawang, Malang (3)	14
West Sumatra	SLB Paykumbuh (8), SLTP Baso (2)	10
South Sulawesi	SLTP1 Makassar (9), SLTP2 S'minaska (8), SLBC Josef (2)	19
Bali	SLTP Ubud (2), SLB Singaraja (2), SLTP1 Banjar (2), SLTP3 Banjar (6)	12
East Kalimantan	SLTP8 Samarinda (6), SLBP Samarinda (5)	11
Total Provinces: 8	**Total institutions in survey: 22**	**123**

DKI = Daerah Khusus Ibukota (Capital City Special Region), SLB = Sekolal Luar Biasa (school for the physically and mentally handicapped), SLTP = Sekolah Lanjutan Tingkat Pertama (general junior secondary school).
Note: Figures in parentheses are the number of respondents.

2. In addition, the Operations Evaluation Mission visited four Madrasah Tsanawiyah (MTs), two in West Sumatra (Padang and Bukittinggi), one in Bali (Amlapura), and one in West Java (Leuwiliang). Observations, discussions, and interviews were conducted in all four MTs, and questionnaires were provided to and answered by respondents in Amlapura. The first three MTs were generally very good to excellent schools, while the last one (Leuwiliang) was poor. The Project helped the MTs adopt Curriculum 1994 and general junior secondary education (JSE)

subjects. With the inclusion of these 4 MTs the Operations Evaluation Mission visited a total of 26 institutions.

B. Discussion

3. A draft questionnaire in English was translated into Bahasa Indonesia and reviewed with bilingual colleagues for both content and structure. A preliminary version of the final questionnaire was trailed and the feedback from respondents was taken into consideration in producing the final questionnaire.

4. Questionnaires were administered to teachers, school and educational institution administrators, principals, and training recipients. All were beneficiaries of or in some way connected with the Project, and were therefore in a position to express an informed opinion.

5. The questionnaire explored respondents' opinions about the following components of the Project:

(i) quality improvements in the curriculum, learning materials, and libraries (three questions);
(ii) teacher upgrading (one question);
(iii) accessibility of JSE (five questions);
(iv) overall sustainability of project benefits (three questions);
(v) educational testing (two questions); and
(vi) academic supervision and management capacity issues (four questions).

6. The scales used in the survey were

(i) most likely = 3, likely = 2; less likely = 1; not likely = 0 (for questions 10 to 12); and
(ii) big impact = 3; some impact = 2; little impact = 1; no impact = 0 (all others).

7. In addition, respondents had the opportunity to make written comments about quality, accessibility, and management issues.

C. Responses

8. Table A1.2 shows the respondents' responses to the questionnaire based on six component groupings. The component groupings are listed according to rank.

Table A1.2: Responses to Questionnaires

Summary of Questions	Number of Valid Responses	Results
Quality improvements in curriculum, learning materials, libraries		
1. Production of learning materials (textbooks, teachers' guides)	125	Mode: 3, mean: 2.67, standard deviation: 0.58, mode label: big impact
2. Improvement of school libraries	118	Mode: 3, mean: 2.43, standard deviation: 0.76, mode label: big impact
3. Implementation of Curriculum 1994 in the core subject areas of science, mathematics, Bahasa Indonesia, and English	126	Mode: 3, mean: 2.42, standard deviation: 0.66, mode label: big impact
Teacher upgrading		
4. Upgrading of teachers' skills	127	Mode: 3, mean: 2.62, standard deviation: 0.52, mode label: big impact
Accessibility of JSE		
5. Upgrading of facilities in SLTP Terbuka	99	Mode: 3, mean: 2.62, standard deviation: 0.60, mode label: big impact
6. Upgrading of facilities in SLB	58	Mode: 3, mean: 2.48, standard deviation: 0.77, mode label: big impact
7. Upgrading of facilities in SLTP Kecil	52	Mode: 2, mean: 2.27, standard deviation: 0.72, mode label: some impact
8. Improved access to JSE for girls	91	Mode: 3, mean: 2.41, standard deviation: 0.67, mode label: big impact
9. Upgrading of facilities in MTs	52	Mode: 2, mean: 2.25, standard deviation: 0.79, mode label: some impact
Global assessments of the sustainability of JSE benefits		
10. Overall, what is your assessment of the likelihood of the sustainability of the quality improvements in JSE from this Project?	118	Mode: 3, mean: 2.56, standard deviation: 0.52, mode label: most likely
11. Overall, what is your assessment of the likelihood of the sustainability of the accessibility improvements in JSE from this Project?	106	Mode: 3, mean: 2.54, standard deviation: 0.50, mode label: most likely
12. Overall, what is your assessment of the likelihood of the sustainability of the management capacity improvements in JSE from this Project?	107	Mode: 3, mean: 2.54, standard deviation: 0.52, mode label: most likely
Educational testing		
13. Development of national achievement tests in science, mathematics, Bahasa Indonesia, and English	113	Mode: 3, mean: 2.39, standard deviation: 0.65, mode label: big impact
14. Improving student evaluation in the core subject areas of science, mathematics, Bahasa Indonesia, and English	121	Mode: 2, mean: 2.31, standard deviation: 0.56, mode label: some impact
Academic supervision and management capacity issues		
15. Quality of administrative communication between schools and education offices at local, provincial, and national levels	112	Mode: 2, mean: 2.45, standard deviation: 0.57, mode label: some impact
16. Reorientation of academic supervision toward improving teacher competencies	121	Mode: 2, mean: 2.26, standard deviation: 0.52, mode label: some impact
17. Reorientation of academic supervision toward improving student learning performance	121	Mode: 2, mean: 2.26z, standard deviation: 0.69, mode label: some impact
18. Reorientation of academic supervision away from a focus on rules, standards, and procedures	106	Mode: 2, mean: 2.16, standard deviation: 0.65, mode label: some impact

JSE = junior secondary education, MTs = Madrasah Tsanawiyah, SLB = Sekolah Luar Biasa (school for the physically and mentally handicapped), SLTP = Sekolah Lanjutan Tingkat Pertama (general junior secondary schools).

D. Discussion

9. The number of respondents in this survey is a tiny fraction of the Project's beneficiaries and they represent only a small proportion of all the institutions and provinces that received assistance. For this reason the survey's results can only be considered as illustrative and not as offering conclusive evidence. By confirming other information the survey's results play a useful role in increasing the reliability of other data gathered, for example, by means of reports, field observations, and interviews, and used to help assess the Project's outputs, impact, and sustainability.

10. Accordingly the survey results have been incorporated in the main body of the Project Performance Audit Report. By way of general conclusions the data suggest that the Project has had a variable impact on educational quality, accessibility, and management capacity. The greatest impacts have been from the learning materials produced and teacher upgrading. There has been an impact on accessibility, particularly through the SLTP Terbuka. The Project's inputs into academic supervision may have yielded the least impact in comparison with the Project's other components.

SUMMARY OF PROJECT OUTPUTS AND INPUTS

	Outputs			Inputs		
Project Component	**Appraisal**	**OEM/PCR**	**Degree of Achievement (%)**	**Appraisal**	**OEM/PCR**	**Degree of Achievement (%)**
Educational Improvements and Access						
Consulting services (person-months)						
International				105	93	89
Domestic				216	225	104
Staff development (person-months) (domestic)	1,468	2,878	196			
Civil works						
Libraries	1,300	1,265	97			
School rehabilitation	54	1,021	1,890			
Furniture						
Libraries				1,300	1,265	97
SLTP/SLTPT				54	54	100
MTs				54	54	100
Textbooks and learning materials	11,382,160	11,700,000	103			
Equipment for						
SLTP				600	600	100
MTs				54	54	100
SLB				28	28	100
DTP				3	3	100
Vehicles						
Buses				30	30	100
Motorbikes				54	54	100
Enrollment, retention, and equitable access						
Enrollment	5.8 million	7.6 million				
Retention	87	96				
Equitable access to JSE						
SLTPT	20 base schools with 120 extensions	3,500 base schools with 18,700 extensions				
Female students	46	48				
Female teachers	39	46				

Project Component	Outputs			Inputs		
	Appraisal	OEM/PCR	Degree of Achievement (%)	Appraisal	OEM/PCR	Degree of Achievement (%)
Quality improvement, particularly in general subjects	Improve quality of teaching	Examination results improving, notably in mathematics and English				
MTs model schools under MORA	54	54	100			
Curriculum 1994	Implement Curriculum 1994 in MONE and MORA	Curriculum 1994 operational in both MONE and MORA				
Achievement testing	Standardize achievement testing nationally	Standardization of testing achieved, system receiving support.				
Teacher Training						
Consulting services (person-months)						
International				72	75	104
Domestic				24	33	138
Staff development (person-months)						
MONE	309	366	118			
MORA	9,498	7,903	83			
Teacher training						
Teachers	19,693	21,355	108			
Librarians	2,046	5,935	290			
Retraining of teachers for new curriculum	8,000	8,000	100			
Institutional Development						
Consulting services (person-months)						
International				96	102	106
Domestic				180	180	100
Staff development (person-months)						
International	1,588	1,400	88			
Domestic	1,000	1,186	119			
Equipment						
MORA (EMIS)				4	4	100
Planning and management	Improve planning and management	Substantially achieved, but with limited success in financial planning				

Project Component	Outputs			Inputs		
	Appraisal	OEM/PCR	Degree of Achievement (%)	Appraisal	OEM/PCR	Degree of Achievement (%)
Communication and liaison between central, provincial, and district levels	Better communication and liaison at all levels	Achieved, project provided many opportunities to liaise and cooperate.				
EMIS	EMIS in MONE and MORA.	Partially achieved, MORA developed satisfactory EMIS late in the Project and EMIS for MONE is being designed.				
Project Implementation						
Consulting services (person-months)						
International				32	6	19
Domestic				84	84	100
Staff development (person-months)						
International	6	9	150			
Domestic	35	36	103			
Vehicles						
Vehicles for PIUs				2	2	100
Implementation and project management	Implement activities as scheduled	Timely implementation achieved, no extension in implementation was required				
BME	Develop BME for project	Not achieved, systems are being developed.				

BME = benefit monitoring and evaluation; EMIS = education management information system; JSE = junior secondary education; MONE = Ministry of National Education; MORA = Ministry of Religious Affairs; MTs = Madrasah Tsanawiyah; OEM = Operations Evaluation Mission; PCR = project completion report; PIU = project implementation unit; SLTP = Sekolah Lanjutan Tingkat Pertama (general junior secondary schools); SLTPT = SLTP Terbuka.

STAFF DEVELOPMENT

Table A3.1: Ministry of National Education

	Appraisal		PCR/OEM	
Field of Study	**Participants**	**Person-Months**	**Participants**	**Person-Months**
A. Overseas				
Doctorate for EC Staff	1	48	1	48
Master's Degree for EC Staff	3	90	2	60
Master's Degree for Dikmenum	10	300	8	240
Doctorate for Dikmenum	3	90	2	60
Master's Degree for SLB	8	192	6	144
Academic Supervision	40	40	19	19
Education Management	30	90	30	90
School Administration	16	480	16	480
SLB Principals Comparative Study	30	21	15	15
SLB Training	30	90	30	90
Project Management	3	6	3	9
Subtotal	**174**	**1,447**	**132**	**1,255**
B. In-Country				
In-Service Upgrading for SLTP staff	15	45	45	45
Achievement Test Training	696	696	1,699	1,699
Academic Supervision	1,454	727	2,267	1,134
Librarian Training	1,300	1,300	4,840	4,840
Retraining	8,000	96,000	8,000	96,000
Teacher Upgrading D1 to D3	4,872	175,392	6,094	219,384
Teacher Upgrading D3 to D1	812	9,744	812	9,744
In-Service Upgrading for SLTP Terb	1,620	810		535
In-Service Upgrading for SLB	273	410	967	11,604
SLB Teacher Upgrading	273	3,276	961	1,442
School Administration	1,861	1,861	2,913	2,913
Master Teacher	20,000	20,000	20,000	20,000
Kandep Staff	900	900	900	900
Project Management, PIUs	3	6	3	6
Project Management, Sub-PIUs	60	30	60	30
Educational Administration			20,078	20,078
Orientation Program			37,148	Varied
Subtotal	**42,139**	**311,197**	**106,787**	**390,354**
Total	**42,313**	**312,644**	**106,919**	**391,609**

Dikmenum = Directorate of General and Secondary Education, D1 = 1-year postsecondary diploma, D3 = 3-year postecondary diploma, EC = Examination Center, Kandep = district education officers, OEM = Operations Evaluation Mission, PIU = project implementation unit, PCR = project completion report, SI = basic undergraduate degree, SLB = Sekolah Luar Biasa (school for children with special learning needs), SLTP = Sekolah Lanjutan Tingkat Pertama Terbuka, junior secondary school with distance learning.

Source: Project completion report.

Table A3.2: Ministry of Religious Affairs

	Appraisal		PCR/OEM	
Field of Study	**Participants**	**Person-Months**	**Participants**	**Person-Months**
A. Overseas				
Master's Degree in Education Administration	1	42	2	48
Master's Degree in Curriculum Development	2	60	1	48
Teacher Training Administration	12	36	24	36
Management Information System	3	6	2	6
Comparative Study	6	3	8	16
Subtotal	**24**	**147**	**37**	**154**
B. In-Country				
Master Teacher Training	270	3,240	1,944	1,944
In-Service Teacher Training	3,550	5,325	5,411	5,411
Training for Librarians	746	933	1,095	548
Management Information System Operators	4	12	12	12
Master's Degree in Educational Planning	2	48	3	72
Curriculum Development	2	48	2	48
Management Information System Operations	4	12	54	54
Subtotal	**4,578**	**9,618**	**8,521**	**8,089**
Total	**4,602**	**9,765**	**8,558**	**8,243**

OEM = Operations Evaluation Mission, PCR = project completion report.

Source: Project completion report.

PROJECT COSTS
($'000)

Item	Appraisal			OEM/PCR		
	Foreign Exchange	Local Currency	Total	Foreign Exchange	Local Currency	Total
A. Civil Works	**7,422**	**13,377**	**20,799**	**5,903**	**8,610**	**14,513**
1. Rehabilitation	171	1,088	1,259	120	2,228	2,348
2. New Rooms	7,251	12,289	19,540	5,783	6,382	12,165
B. Furniture and Equipment	**20,158**	**24,781**	**44,939**	**19,310**	**24,751**	**44,061**
1. Furniture	893	4,038	4,931	401	681	1,082
2. Academic Equipment	9,349	2,640	11,989	9,624	2,406	12,030
3. Other Equipment	3,733	1,806	5,539	2,288	5,337	7,625
4. Books and Learning Materials	6,183	16,297	22,480	6,997	16,327	23,324
C. Staff Development	**2,683**	**55,100**	**57,783**	**4,115**	**58,953**	**63,068**
1. Overseas Fellowship	2,683	337	3,020	4,115	457	4,572
2. Local Training	0	54,635	54,635	0	58,391	58,391
3. Seminars and Surveys	0	128	128	0	105	105
D. Consulting Services and Activities	**5,491**	**5,258**	**10,749**	**6,145**	**1,239**	**7,384**
1. Supervision of Delivery and Installation of Equipment	0	807	807	0	117	117
2. Academic Consultants						
a. International	2,978	374	3,352	5,901	656	6,557
b. Domestic	0	2,540	2,540	0	188	188
3. Project Implementation Consultants	786	99	885	201	22	223
4. BME Consultant	112	178	290	43	59	102
5. Other Consultants						
a. International	1,615	203	1,818	0	0	0
b. Domestic	0	1,057	1,057	0	197	197
E. Project Implementation and Recurrent Costs	**217**	**10,590**	**10,807**	**151**	**21,846**	**21,997**
1. Project Implementing Units and Subunits						
a. Training	42	91	133	60	112	172
b. Capital Costs	138	153	291	91	91	182
2. Monitoring and Evaluation Midterm Review and Workshop	37	34	71	0	0	0
3. Recurrent Cost						
a. PIU-related	0	4,885	4,885	0	10,366	10,366
b. O&M of Project Facilities	0	5,427	5,427	0	11,277	11,277
F. Taxes and Duties	**0**	**12,680**	**12,680**	**0**	**0**	**0**
G. Interest and Charges	**17,169**	**0**	**17,169**	**17,169**	**0**	**17,169**
Total	**53,140**	**121,786**	**174,926**	**52,793**	**115,399**	**168,192**

BME = benefit monitoring and evaluation, O&M = operation and maintenance, OEM = Operations Evaluation Mission, PCR = project completion report, PIU = project implementation unit.

Source: Project completion report.

DONOR-FUNDED EDUCATION SECTOR PROJECTS IN INDONESIA SINCE 1990

Project	Start	End	Funding Source
Second Secondary Education and Management Project	1990	1997	World Bank
Community Participation in Planning and Management of Educational Resources	1991	1995	UNDP/UNESCO
Primary Education Quality Improvement Project	1992	1999	World Bank
Primary School Teacher Development Project	1992	1999	World Bank
Junior Secondary Education Project	1993	1998	ADB
Science Education Quality Improvement Project	1994	2002	Germany
Managing the Delivery of Local Content Curriculum	1995	1997	UNDP
Private Junior Secondary Education Project	1995	2001	ADB
Book and Reading Development Project	1995	2001	World Bank
Secondary School Teacher Development Project	1996	2001	World Bank
Central Indonesia Junior Secondary Education Project	1996	2002	World Bank
Sumatra Junior Secondary Education Project	1996	2002	World Bank
Eastern Indonesia Junior Secondary Education Project	1996	2002	World Bank
Community Participation for Strategic Education Planning for School Improvement	1997	—	JICA
Basic Education Project	1997	2002	ADB
Curriculum Capacity Project	1997	2000	United Kingdom
Second Junior Secondary Education Project	1997	2003	ADB
West Java Basic Education Project	1998	2003	World Bank
Development Planning Assistance Project (policy studies)	1998	2001	CIDA
Sumatra Basic Education Project	1999	2004	World Bank
Sulsel and Eastern Indonesia Basic Education Project	1999	2004	World Bank
Regional Educational Development and Improvement Project	1999	2001	JICA
Creating Learning Communities for Children	1999	2001	UNESCO/UNICEF
Decentralized Social Services Delivery	2000	2002	ADB

— = not available; ADB = Asian Development Bank; CIDA = Canadian International Development Agency; JICA = Japan International Cooperation Agency; UNDP = United Nations Development Programme; UNESCO = United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization; UNICEF = United Nations Children's Fund.