

ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK

PPA:PAK 21124

PROJECT PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

ON THE

PRIMARY EDUCATION (GIRLS) SECTOR PROJECT

(Loan 977-PAK[SF])

IN

PAKISTAN

September 2000

CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS

Currency Unit – Pakistan Rupee/s (PRe/PRs)

	At Appraisal (August 1989)	At Project Completion (December 1997)	At Operations Evaluation (April 2000)
PRe1.00 =	\$0.0474	\$0.0285	\$0.0184
\$1.00 =	PRs21.103	PRs35.09	PRs54.19

ABBREVIATIONS

ADB	–	Asian Development Bank
CMS	–	community model school
DEO	–	district education officer
FCU	–	federal coordinating unit
FGD	–	focus group discussion
GCET	–	government college for elementary teachers
MOE	–	Ministry of Education
NWFP	–	Northwest Frontier Province
OEM	–	operations evaluation mission
PCR	–	project completion report
PED	–	provincial education department
PIU	–	project implementation unit
PPAR	–	project performance audit report
PTA	–	parents-teachers association
SAP	–	Social Action Program
SMC	–	school management committee

NOTES

- (i) The fiscal year (FY) of the Government ends on 30 June.
- (ii) The school year (SY) starts in April.
- (iii) In this report, "\$" refers to US dollars.

Operations Evaluation Office, PE-550

CONTENTS

	Page
BASIC DATA	ii
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	iii
MAP	v
I. BACKGROUND	1
A. Rationale	1
B. Formulation	1
C. Purpose and Outputs	1
D. Cost, Financing, and Executing Arrangements	2
E. Completion and Self-Evaluation	2
F. Operations Evaluation	3
II. PLANNING AND IMPLEMENTATION PERFORMANCE	3
A. Formulation and Design	3
B. Cost and Scheduling	4
C. Consultants' Performance, Procurement, and Construction	5
D. Organization and Management	6
III. ACHIEVEMENT OF PROJECT PURPOSE	7
A. Operational Performance	7
B. Performance of the Operating Entity	10
IV. ACHIEVEMENT OF OTHER DEVELOPMENT IMPACTS	10
A. Socioeconomic Impacts	10
B. Environmental Impacts	11
C. Impacts on Institutions and Policy	11
V. OVERALL ASSESSMENT	12
A. Relevance	12
B. Efficacy	12
C. Efficiency	12
D. Sustainability	13
E. Institutional Development and Other Impacts	13
F. Overall Project Rating	13
G. Assessment of ADB and Borrower Performance	14
VI. ISSUES, LESSONS, AND FOLLOW-UP ACTIONS	15
A. Key Issues for the Future	15
B. Lessons Identified	16
C. Follow-Up Actions	17
APPENDIXES	18

BASIC DATA
Primary Education (Girls) Sector Project (Loan 977-PAK [SF])

PROJECT PREPARATION/INSTITUTION BUILDING

TA No.	TA Project Name	Type	Person-Months	Amount	Approval Date
907-PAK	Primary Education (Girls) Project	PPTA	15.5	\$150,000	13 Oct 1987
907-PAK	Supplementary	PPTA		\$25,000	23 Aug 1988

KEY PROJECT DATA (\$ million)

	As per ADB Loan Documents	Actual
Total Project Cost	80.51	52.85
Foreign Exchange Cost	8.44	6.39
ADB Loan Amount: Utilization	64.20	42.61
ADB Loan Amount: Cancellation	0	21.59
Amount of Cofinancing	0	3.90 ^a

KEY DATES

	Expected	Actual
Fact-Finding		27 Jan-23 Feb 1989
Appraisal		22 Apr-4 May 1989
Loan Negotiations		28-30 Sep 1989
Board Approval		26 Oct 1989
Loan Agreement		11 Dec 1989
Loan Effectiveness	24 Jan 1990	14 May 1990
First Disbursement		30 Sep 1991
Project Completion	31 Dec 1994	30 Sep 1996
Loan Closing	31 Jul 1995	21 Mar 1997
Months (Effectiveness to Completion)	59	76

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATORS (%)

	Appraisal	PCR	PPAR
Financial Internal Rate of Return	nc	nc	nc
Economic Internal Rate of Return	nc	nc	nc

BORROWER

Islamic Republic of Pakistan

EXECUTING AGENCY

Ministry of Education

MISSION DATA

Type of Mission	No. of Missions	Person-Days
Fact-Finding	1	72
Appraisal	1	75
Follow-Up	1	3
Project Administration		
Inception	1	8
Review	5	39
Disbursement	1	2
Special Loan Administration	3	36
Project Completion	2	30
Operations Evaluation	1	34

ADB = Asian Development Bank, nc = not calculated, PAK = Pakistan, PCR = project completion report, PPAR = project performance audit report, PPTA = project preparatory technical assistance, TA = technical assistance.

^a The Norwegian Government provided a grant of \$4.5 million in November 1990 to finance the innovative activities component of the Project of which \$3.9 million equivalent was expended.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Enrolment Goals Stymied as Quality of Education Lags Behind

The Project was the first in primary education supported by the Asian Development Bank (ADB). At the time of appraisal, the literacy rate among women in Pakistan was 14 percent (5 percent in rural areas), one of the lowest in the world. Girls' participation rate¹ was only 33 percent (compared with about 70 percent for boys), and only half of the girls who started school finished class 5. The Government's National Education Policy (1979) targeted the attainment of universal primary education for girls by 1992. The objectives of the Project were to increase access to schooling for girls in rural areas, improve the quality of instruction, increase the retention rate of female students, and upgrade the management and supervision of the primary education system.

The project design was based on four concepts: (i) five-room community model schools (CMSs), one teacher per grade rather than single-room multigrade, single-teacher schools; (ii) a CMS acting as a miniresource center to the cluster of small schools around it; (iii) a learning coordinator at the district level to provide assistance to CMS and cluster school teachers to improve subject content and instructional methodology; and (iv) involvement of parents and the local community through the establishment of school management committees (SMCs) and parents-teachers associations (PTAs). The Project was the first phase of an envisaged series of projects in support of the Government's policy of promoting universal primary education, and established 832 CMSs in 20 percent of all union councils² in the country.

The actual cost of the Project at completion was \$52.85 million equivalent (66 percent of the original estimate). Of this amount, the Government of Pakistan financed \$6.34 million equivalent (12 percent) of the local currency cost, and ADB contributed \$42.61 million (80.6 percent). The Norwegian Government provided a grant amounting to \$3.9 million equivalent (7.4 percent) for the innovative activities component. Total loan cancellations amounted to \$21.59 million (34 percent of the loan amount). The loan was approved in October 1989 and the Project was completed in September 1996. A delay of 17 months in completing the Project was caused by difficulties in the organization of subproject (provincial) appraisal teams, the appointment of staff to the federal coordinating unit and the project implementation units, and the inadequate monitoring and information system.

While providing a number of well-provided model schools, disparities were generated in terms of facilities, learning materials, and human resources among schools and communities in the villages. The formulation and design of the Project would have been more relevant if they had been directed toward the improvement of smaller (2-3 room) schools or the many shelterless schools that comprised 40 percent of all schools at the time of appraisal. While accomplishing its target of increased access (35,000 new student places), the Project did not raise the quality of education significantly. In spite of enrolments increasing four-fold in project schools in the last 10 years, the schools are operating below capacity. This underutilization is due mainly to the high dropout rate (more than 50 percent) over the five-year schooling period, and the large number of school-aged girls who stay out of school (62 percent of girls 5-9 years do not go to school). Parents must be convinced that education is of sufficient quality because of the cost of education and the opportunity cost of children's work. Outcome indicators measuring quality remain poor: 20 percent of students repeat a grade level, the student-teacher

¹ Participation rate is defined as the percentage of 5-9 year old girls enrolled in primary school.

² A union council is a village with an average population of about 20,000.

ratio has worsened from 40:1 to 60:1, and class sizes have grown to as many as 55-80 students per teacher. The elimination of multigrade teaching, one of the objectives of the Project, has not been attained.

Considering the 20 percent underutilization of facilities financed under the Project and the higher construction cost per student place in comparison with other similar projects, the achievement of project purpose in relation to the use of inputs under the Project for the hardware component is considered inefficient. The use of project inputs for the software component was minimal. This highlights the need for a longer gestation period and continuing inputs over the long term. Internal and external efficiencies are low. The need for a comprehensive database and information system was not addressed. There is no monitoring system for educational improvement for the CMSs aside from the minimal supervision of the district educational office.

The Project benefited mainly lower income families, the large majority of whom gain their livelihood in farming—families that survive on around PRs30 (\$0.50) per person per day. The major contribution of the Project lies in its sociocultural impact, i.e., its contribution to the behavioral change of the mostly illiterate rural people so that girls' education is more readily accepted now. However, parents' involvement, community participation, and links between school and local community are still weak. The establishment of SMCs and PTAs is a significant improvement in strengthening the school-community relationship that will ensure quality and sustained improvement in the long term.

The quality of instruction has not improved much as evidenced by the poor education indicators in the project schools. Project design was too optimistic in its expectations of change in social attitudes and did not pay enough heed to the need for a much longer capacity-building and development period. It did not achieve its purpose with regard to: (i) establishing CMSs as the resource center of the cluster schools; (ii) establishing learning coordinators as catalysts for quality improvement; and (iii) elimination of multigrade teaching. The inclusion of a kindergarten class in the project design would have made a major impact on increasing enrolment. There are sustainability problems due to the perennial lack of budgetary allocations for operation and maintenance.

Sectorwide issues that are systemic in nature have constrained the performance of the Project. Systemic problems include the lack of teachers (caused mainly by the ban on government hiring), inadequate budgetary allocations for operation and maintenance, weak management, and the absence of an effective monitoring and information system. Nonetheless, the Project has laid a foundation for efforts to build on. The physical facilities, teachers, and administrators are in place. PTAs and SMCs have made a good, albeit a tentative start. Taking into account the less than satisfactory state of project outcomes since the Project was completed, the Project is rated less than successful.³ However, with the groundwork laid by the Project and the lessons identified from its design, implementation, and outcomes, it is expected that a follow-up project, already in operation, will be better positioned to produce the desired results.

³ ADB's Projects Division feels strongly that the Project should be rated successful for the following reasons: (i) the Project was highly relevant to Pakistan's needs and ADB's strategy; (ii) the Project achieved its main aim of increasing school access for girls; (iii) the lack of enrolment is attributable more to socioeconomic constraints than to poor educational quality; (iv) underutilization of facilities is temporary and will improve with better social mobilization efforts to recruit girls; (v) the improvements in classroom learning environments have greatly improved quality in the project schools; and (vi) the project achievements are sustainable in spite of current budgetary shortage.

I. BACKGROUND

A. Rationale

1. The Project⁴ was the first financed by the Asian Development Bank (ADB) in support of primary education. Prior to this, the emphases in the sector had been on technical education, vocational training, engineering, and science education. At the time of appraisal, the literacy rate among women in Pakistan was only 14 percent (5 percent in the rural areas), one of the lowest in the world. Low school attendance was a major reason for this, a consequence of the unavailability of primary schools for girls, particularly in rural areas. There were about 90,000 primary schools of which 24,000 were girls' schools (in Pakistan there are separate schools for boys and girls). Girls' participation rate⁵ at that time was only 33 percent (compared with about 70 percent for boys) and only half of the girls who started school finished class 5. The Government's National Education Policy (1979) targeted the attainment of universal primary education for girls by 1992, and for boys by 1986. The Project supported the Government's education program and complemented those of other aid agencies, particularly the World Bank, the United States Agency for International Development, and the United Nations Children's Fund.

B. Formulation

2. In March 1987, the Government requested ADB to provide technical assistance for the development of a project to support primary education for girls in the rural areas. A sector study on education⁶ and an education sector report⁷ identified assistance to primary education (classes 1-5, ages 5-9 years), with the emphasis on girls in rural areas, as one of the priority areas for ADB's involvement in Pakistan. A project preparatory technical assistance⁸ was provided in 1987 and was carried out by international consultants from May to November 1988. The Project was appraised in April-May 1989 and the loan became effective on 14 May 1990. A project framework has been constructed for the purpose of this report and is shown in Appendix 1. A follow-up project became effective on 19 January 1998.⁹

C. Purpose and Outputs

3. The specific objectives of the Project were to (i) increase the participation rates of girls; (ii) improve the quality of instruction; (iii) increase the retention rate for girls; and (iv) upgrade the management and supervision of the primary education subsector. The purpose of the

⁴ Loan 977-PAK(SF): *Primary Education (Girls) Sector Project*, for SDR51.711 million (\$64.2 million), approved on 26 October 1989.

⁵ Participation rate is defined as the percentage of 5-9 year old girls enrolled in primary school.

⁶ *Pakistan: Sector Study on Education*, Asian Development Bank, April 1988.

⁷ *Education Sector Report*, Asian Development Bank, February 1989.

⁸ TA 907-PAK: *Primary Education (Girls)*, for \$150,000, approved on 13 October 1987, with supplementary funding for \$25,000, approved on 23 August 1988.

⁹ Loan 1454-PAK(SF): *Second Girls Primary School Sector Project*, for SDR31.178 million (\$45 million), approved on 15 August 1996.

Project was to make primary education more accessible to girls in rural areas, and increase the quality and efficiency of the primary education system for girls in Pakistan. This was to be achieved through the establishment of community model schools (CMSs) in selected rural areas covering 20 percent of all union councils¹⁰ in the country. The Project consisted of three parts: (i) an institutional development component that comprised teacher training and staff development, benefit monitoring and evaluation, provision of instructional materials and library books, sector research, and building maintenance; (ii) an infrastructure development component that comprised the construction of about 800 CMSs, and the provision of furniture and equipment; and (iii) an innovative activities component to overcome sociocultural constraints to the education of girls.

4. The bulk of project resources went to the first two components. The innovative activities component was intended to introduce a number of educational innovations on a pilot basis. These activities were to include (i) provision of transport for teachers and students; (ii) construction of teachers' hostels in strategic locations; (iii) recruitment of qualified women in their communities as teachers; (iv) establishment of incentive packages for students, teachers, headmistresses, and high-performing school management committees (SMCs); (v) establishment of teachers' resource centers; (vi) recruitment of outstanding primary school graduates as teaching assistants; and (vii) orientation of agencies connected with the project implementation procedures. In November 1990, the Government obtained a grant of \$4.5 million from the Government of Norway to finance the innovative activities component.

D. Cost, Financing, and Executing Arrangements

5. At the time of appraisal, the total project cost was estimated at \$80.51 million equivalent, with a foreign exchange component of \$8.44 million (about 10 percent of the total cost, including \$1.08 million inservice charges) and a local currency component of \$72.1 million equivalent (about 90 percent of the total cost). ADB provided a loan of \$64.2 million from its Special Funds resources (80 percent of the total project cost). The Government was to finance part of the local currency cost estimated at \$16.34 million equivalent. The grant from the Government of Norway reduced ADB's financing to \$59.7 million. Overall management of the Project was under the Ministry of Education (MOE), whose joint educational adviser on primary and nonformal education was appointed the director of the federal coordinating unit (FCU) on a part-time basis. FCU project and deputy project managers were appointed on a full-time basis. The directors of the four project implementing units (PIUs) were given full responsibility for implementing components at the provincial and district levels in their respective provinces. The management employed by MOE comprised multiple levels of steering and coordinating committees, i.e., girls primary education development steering committee, provincial coordinating committees, district coordinating committees, and SMCs.

E. Completion and Self-Evaluation

6. The project completion report (PCR) was circulated to the Government and MOE, and in ADB in June 1998. The report noted the significant delays at the outset of the Project due to late identification of schools to be assisted and sites for new schools caused in turn by the delay in appointing project staff in the four provinces and at the FCU in Islamabad. The PCR rated the

¹⁰ A union council is a village with an average population of about 20,000.

Project's infrastructure development component highly successful, noting that the CMS targets had been achieved and the quality of construction was above average. On the other hand, the institutional development component had mixed success. Targets were not met due to poor coordination of the inservice teacher training and the government colleges for elementary teachers (GCETs) for women. The Project's innovative activities component comprised pilot programs intended to improve the teaching-learning process and the social environment. Some of these activities worked well initially and were considered successful, but many, such as promotional campaigns, have not been sustained. The PCR concluded that the Project made a significant contribution to primary education for girls, and rated the Project generally successful.

F. Operations Evaluation

7. This project performance audit report (PPAR) presents an assessment of the Project's effectiveness in terms of achieving its objectives, generating benefits, and ensuring the sustainability of the operations. It discusses issues of current relevance to the sector, identifies lessons, and presents follow-up actions that need to be taken by the Government and/or ADB. The discussion and results are based on the findings of the Operations Evaluation Mission (OEM) which was fielded on 28 March-13 April 2000; a review of the appraisal report, PCR, and project files; and discussions with ADB staff and Government officials. The PPAR draws data from three sources: (i) survey questionnaires, (ii) focus group discussions (FGDs), and (iii) secondary statistical data from the concerned ministries and provincial education departments (PEDs). A survey of headmistresses, teachers, students, and school leavers was conducted in 86 CMSs and 88 nonproject schools in the four provinces (Appendix 2). To complement the quantitative survey, FGDs were held in the CMSs visited. Separate discussions were held with teachers, class 5 students, school leavers, parents, and union council members. The findings of the FGDs, interviews, and school visits were used as a crosscheck on the consistency and reliability of the survey data.

8. This evaluation will provide feedback through the midterm review to improve the implementation of the ongoing follow-up project (footnote 6). The follow-up project is the second phase of the overall plan to increase girls' enrolment and literacy rates, and targets another 25 percent of the 4,000 union councils in Pakistan. The views of the concerned ADB departments and offices are reflected in the report. Copies of the draft PPAR were provided to the Borrower and the Executing Agency for comments in June 2000. Although the request was subsequently followed up, no comments were received. It is, therefore, assumed that neither the Borrower nor the Executing Agency wishes to comment on the PPAR.

II. PLANNING AND IMPLEMENTATION PERFORMANCE

A. Formulation and Design

9. The project design was supportive of the Government's policy of universal primary education, especially promoting primary education for girls, as embodied in the Seventh Five-Year Development Plan (1988-1993) and the National Education Policy (1979). The design was based on four concepts: (i) five-room, one-teacher-per-grade model schools instead of single-room, multigrade, single-teacher schools; (ii) the CMS as a miniresource center for the cluster of small schools around it in the rural union council; (iii) a learning coordinator at the district level to

help CMS and cluster school teachers improve subject content and instructional methodology; and (iv) involvement of parents and the local community through the establishment of SMCs and parents-teachers associations (PTAs). While the CMS concept was considered appropriate at the time, it eventually created an unwelcome disparity in terms of facilities, learning materials, and human resources between the CMSs and other schools in the villages. It is to be noted that at the time of project formulation about 40 percent of the 90,000 primary schools were shelterless,¹¹ and in Punjab Province, only 20 percent of all schools had more than two separate classrooms to accommodate five grades.

10. The construction cost of \$279 per student place as appraised was about 10 percent higher than that of the World Bank's primary education projects in Pakistan, estimated at \$254 per student place. The furniture unit cost was 28 percent higher—\$19 per student place against the World Bank's \$15. Given the sector requirements, the design of the Project was more hardware oriented (64 percent of the base cost in the appraisal report was for civil works, furniture, and equipment).¹² The cost effectiveness of the infrastructure development component of the Project was undermined by the underutilization of the CMSs (paras. 22-24). In spite of the rigid site selection criteria agreed upon during appraisal, the significant number of CMSs with the less than expected 200-student enrolment points to difficulties in the selection of sites by the provincial appraisal teams. The World Bank considers the selection and approval of sites as one of the most intractable problems in school construction. Political interference in the process delayed construction programs by as much as two years.

11. Institutional and human resource development and innovative activities, were integral parts of the Project, addressing quality improvement aspects in the school and community environment. Only half of the targeted 16,000 female teachers to be trained through inservice refresher courses were actually trained. Where SMCs and PTAs have been established, they are making an impact on the learning achievements of the students and the overall school operation.

12. The complex project design required multilayered management and coordination involving MOE and PEDs, as well as various committees at the national, provincial, and district levels. Project implementation highlighted the difficulty of implementing an umbrella-type national project that spans individually implemented provincial components. According to the PCR (paras. 6, 12, 25), delays at the start of the Project, especially those associated with the organization of subproject appraisal teams and the appointment of staff to the FCU and PIUs, occurred because of the inexperience of MOE, PEDs, and ADB (as this was the first primary education project supported by ADB). On the other hand, one reason cited in the appraisal report for the Project's sector approach was the experience of MOE and PEDs in implementing such a project.

13. While more classrooms have been provided, there is a 20 percent underutilization of project school buildings. The Project was too ambitious in its goal of changing the sociocultural environment and did not pay enough attention to the need for a much longer capacity-building and development period. It did not achieve its purpose with regard to: (i) establishing CMSs as the resource center of the cluster schools, (ii) establishing learning coordinators as catalysts for quality improvement, and (iii) the elimination of multigrade teaching. The Project lacked a realistic policy framework, resources and logistic support, and leadership at the district level. Subsidiary objectives that were not met include the database and information system, and most

¹¹ In contrast, the World Bank provided \$513.5 million in four primary education projects between 1987 and 1995 to assist in improving facilities of the poorer (1-2 room) schools and shelterless schools. The projects provided more than 50,000 new classrooms, 6,000 new schools, and built roofs over more than 10,000 shelterless schools.

¹² Actual project expenditure for infrastructure development increased to 79 percent of total project cost.

of the innovative activities under the Project, i.e., provision of teachers' hostels, incentives and rewards for outstanding students and teachers, teachers' resource centers, and the transportation scheme. The inclusion of a kindergarten class in the project design could have made a major impact on the enrolment of girls, who would have been able to bring younger siblings to school instead of caring for them at home.

B. Cost and Scheduling

14. The actual cost of the Project at completion was \$52.85 million equivalent, 66 percent of the original estimate. The Government financed \$6.34 million equivalent (12 percent) of the local currency cost, ADB contributed \$42.61 million (80.6 percent), and the Norwegian Government provided a grant amounting to \$3.9 million (7.4 percent). Loan utilization amounted to only 71 percent of the total loan amount, due mainly to the fluctuation of exchange rates (the appreciation of special drawing rights against the dollar, and the depreciation of the Pakistan rupee against the dollar). Total loan cancellations amounted to \$21.59 million, 34 percent of the loan amount. Another reason for the loan savings was that most expenditures were much lower than the appraisal estimates (for example, only 28 percent of the estimated cost was expended for institutional development). The loan became effective on 14 May 1990. The Project was implemented over six years rather than the planned five years (implementation was extended from 60 to 76.5 months). The planned completion in December 1994 was extended once and the Project was completed on 30 September 1996, 21 months behind the original schedule.

C. Consultants' Performance, Procurement, and Construction

15. While the Government and ADB staff agreed that the consultants performed well, the decision to forego the hiring of consultants for baseline data collection, monitoring and evaluation, midterm review, and learning module development had adverse effects on project implementation and performance. Only 43 person-months of the planned 68 person-months of consulting services were used (63 percent) to reduce costs and in the belief that the PIUs could monitor and evaluate project activities.

16. The Project provided 832 schools with a standard package (at an average cost of around PRs1.5 million per package at project completion) comprising five classrooms, a multipurpose staff room, a headmistress' office, a boundary wall, and a separate building block for toilets, as well as teaching kits and furniture. The schools were selected by a subproject appraisal team in each province according to set criteria, including population, availability of trained teachers, location of other schools, availability of land (for new schools), and access to roads, electricity, and water supply. Some initial delays were caused by land-related problems in about 10 percent of the 175 new CMSs, such as problems of land acquisition, political interference, poor topography, and cost sharing responsibilities between the community and the provincial government. Civil works contracts were awarded on the basis of local competitive bidding. The buildings were completed as designed and the quality of construction was generally satisfactory.¹³ The performance of the majority of the contractors was satisfactory.

¹³ Three schools visited by the OEM are exceptions, i.e., CMS Bhattai Abad in District Malir, Sindh, where the boundary wall is not high enough; CMS Hashim Khaskheli in the same district where the building has not been completed; CMS Attokey Awan, District Lahore, where the toilet block has tilted because of a foundation defect and earth sinking. In future projects, it would be useful to extend the warranty period of civil works to about 24 months.

17. Originally scheduled for completion by the end of 1994, civil works were completed only in mid-1996, close to the mandated project completion date (40 CMSs were not completed even by the later date). The appraisal process of the subprojects took longer than estimated, and delayed implementation by nearly 1.5 years due to (i) the late appointment of staff to the FCU and PIUs, (ii) the sheer number of schools to be appraised, (iii) the requirement that each school have at least 990 square meters (10,980 square feet) of land (although this was later reduced to 540 square meters (6,000 square feet); and (iv) a shortage of teachers. The delay in the appraisal of the subprojects in turn delayed other project activities, including land acquisition and teacher training.

18. The standard equipment package (teaching kit) for each school comprised multipurpose apparatus, models, charts, and materials for science, mathematics, and social studies amounting to some 25 different items per kit. The National Education Equipment Center developed the model kit and procurement was conducted through the local direct purchase method. Library and reference books, teachers guides and other instructional materials, furniture, equipment, and vehicles were purchased according to ADB's *Guidelines on Procurement*. School furniture, mainly wooden desks, tables, and sheetmetal storage cabinets, was initially purchased locally at the district level. However, the quality left much to be desired. Subsequently, procurement was transferred to the provincial level.

D. Organization and Management

19. It took 16 months for the FCU and PIUs to become operational because of difficulties engaging full-time project managers and other qualified personnel. The frequent transfer of FCU and PIU directors and managers to other posts other than the Project's contributed to loss of implementation momentum and institutional memory. Also, it was not uncommon for a project director to be appointed as director of two or more projects at the same time. The lack of local resources resulted in the demise of the district coordinating committees soon after they were organized. However, while they lasted, they were instrumental in identifying schools to be upgraded and sites for new CMSs. Implementation of each project component involved coordination among multiple entities at the central and provincial levels, such as the curriculum wing and the multidonor support unit of the Social Action Program (SAP)¹⁴ at the federal level; and the textbook boards, the communications and works departments, finance departments, and GCETs at the provincial level. This resulted in problems in the sequencing and synchronization of various project activities and strained interoffice relations.

20. The extent of ADB supervision was inadequate. Ten review missions comprising 85 person-days were fielded during the Project (average of 1.6 missions per year). However, the 8.5 person-days average per review mission is inadequate to cover four provinces. Of the 10 review missions, 6 missions provided 5 person-days or less of mission work. Furthermore, two special loan administration missions included the review of 3 to 4 other loans in addition to the Project. Two major supervising omissions that affected the implementation of the Project were (i) the one-year delay in fielding the inception mission, which if mounted earlier could have accelerated the start-up of the Project; and (ii) the cancellation of the midterm review, which was replaced by two review missions fielded in the last 15 months to accelerate completion of project activities. ADB review missions tended to concentrate on monitoring input delivery, physical

¹⁴ The SAP is intended to make greater resources available to the primary education, primary health, nutrition, population planning, and rural water supply and sanitation sectors.

targets, and loan disbursements rather than an assessment of operational impact, and monitoring and evaluation. It would have been more useful if the emphasis had been on (i) ensuring the sustainable achievement of project objectives, and (ii) helping the FCU and PIUs resolve implementation difficulties and improve administrative processes, especially the identification and appointment of staff, development of a monitoring system, filling out and submission of withdrawal applications, management of imprest accounts, and supervision of civil works.

21. The Government, MOE, and the provincial implementing agencies complied with the majority of the loan covenants. However, noncompliance with the recommendations of a review of the Borrower's financing policies and delayed compliance with the following covenants (Loan Agreement, Schedule 5) adversely affected the smooth implementation of the Project: (i) provision of a suitable number of technical and administrative personnel on a full-time basis for the effective operation of the FCU and PIUs; (ii) establishment of the Girls Primary Education Development Steering Committee, provincial coordinating committees, and district coordinating committees; (iii) organization and staffing of provincial appraisal teams; (iv) preparation of an institutional development program in each province; (v) creation and filling of headmistresses' and teachers' posts; (vi) securing and retaining the services of qualified teachers and other staff in project schools; and (vii) collection of data to establish baseline indicators. A benefit monitoring and evaluation system, required under the Loan Agreement, was not established.

III. ACHIEVEMENT OF PROJECT PURPOSE

A. Operational Performance

1. Institutional Development Component

22. **Enrolments.** Total enrolment in the project schools surveyed increased more than four times in the 10-year period from the start of the Project in 1990 (Appendix 3, Table A3.1). In comparison, the rate of increase in enrolment in girls' primary schools in Pakistan was less dramatic, but still doubled from 3.7 to about 7.1 million (Appendix 3, Table A3.2). While the average enrolment in project schools increased from 113 to 163 students¹⁵ between 1996 and 2000, it is still short of the 200 students per school envisaged at appraisal (40 students per class x 5 classes).¹⁶ A profile of primary school students is shown in Appendix 4. The average enrolment of 163 students per school includes boys and kindergarten children. The average enrolment for girls is only 148 per school, including kindergarten classes. In project schools in Punjab, enrolment in kindergarten comprises 34 percent of total primary school enrolment.

23. The full impact of establishing model schools in rural areas, each with one teacher per class and each class with an ideal 40 students, was not attained because of the lack of enrolment (as well as lack of teachers, para. 26). Perhaps, in time, a higher enrolment of girls might justify the project investment. But for now, project schools are not fully utilized. Perhaps it is not possible to reconcile the project concept of providing primary education access to girls in Pakistan's rural areas with the 40-student, one-teacher-per-class concept due to the small catchment area of the villages. The aim of making the CMSs as resource centers for the small cluster schools around them was not achieved mainly because of the lack of teachers and the large number of schools that learning coordinators have to cover.

¹⁵ Includes kindergarten classes, which were not taken into account in the design of the Project.

¹⁶ Cluster schools (nonproject)—with 2-3 classrooms—have a slightly higher average of 172 students per school, while the national average for girls' schools is 161 and that for boys' is 85.

24. The underutilization of schools is due mainly to the high dropout rate (more than 50 percent) over the five-year schooling period, and the large number of school-aged girls who stay out of school (65 percent of girls 5-9 years do not go to school). The survey shows that enrolments in project schools are increasing at twice the rate (an average 15 percent per annum) compared with those in nonproject schools (an average 7 percent per annum). The promotional campaign in project schools has contributed to a change in parental attitude. Parents must be convinced of the quality of education because of the cost of education and the opportunity cost of children's work mainly at home or in the fields. Another survey finding is the acceptance of coeducation in primary schools. Today, boys make up almost 10 percent of enrolment in girls' CMSs (project schools)—mainly in kindergarten and the lower grades. In 1990, boys comprised only 4 percent of enrolment. There were no boys in girls' schools in Sindh until 1996, and in Northwest Frontier Province (NWFP) and Balochistan until 1990. In nonproject schools, boys comprise only 3 percent of enrolment today.

25. **Instructional Materials and Library Books.** Instructional materials comprised teachers guides (one per subject per grade in mathematics, Urdu, science, and social studies), learning modules (developed under the World Bank primary education projects), library books and supplementary reading materials, and teaching kits (containing simple science instruments, such as bar magnets, magnifying glasses, spring balances, geometrical models, charts, and posters). A set of these materials was provided to each CMS, as well as to 67 GCETs. These instructional materials and teaching kits proved to be effective in shifting teaching methods away from traditional rote memorization and group recitation to more hands-on activities and a "learning-by-doing" approach. However, there are no workbooks for students' exercises, and around 23 percent of all project schools surveyed (45 percent in Sindh) no longer have teaching kits (Appendix 5). More than a third of all project schools surveyed do not have textbooks in stock. The Project would have been more effective if it included the provision of textbooks to students from families that cannot afford to buy books. Project schools have more libraries (81 percent) than nonproject schools (45 percent). Also, 47 percent of project schools have more than 200 books in their libraries compared with 13 percent of nonproject schools (Appendix 6).

26. **Teachers.** Twenty-six percent of all project schools were short of teachers (7 percent have only 1 teacher, and 19 percent have 2-3 teachers). The Government's ban on hiring new staff (since 1990) is restricting the recruitment of primary school teachers in many project areas. A third of all project and nonproject schools surveyed have less than 4 teachers (Appendix 7). There are instances still of single-teacher schools (one teacher for all 6 grades) in Punjab and Sindh. There is a lack of teachers in the villages where the schools are located, and teachers from outside the villages have difficulty in coming to work. The lack of incentives for teachers to be posted in schools in rural areas remains a problem. There were reports of irregular attendance of teachers, mostly those who have to travel long distances to school. Many teachers were trained for 2-4 weeks in subject content and instructional methodology under the Project — hardly long enough to effect change. The OEM's observation of teachers on the job showed the need for further training in both subject content and instructional methodology. A general profile of the teachers is shown in Appendix 8.

27. **Internal and External Efficiencies.** The efficiency of the teaching-learning process inside the classroom (internal efficiency) and the performance of the students after they leave these schools, in institutions of higher learning and on the job market (external efficiency), are important indicators of the project outcome. In spite of the gains of recent years, the quality of girls' primary education needs improvement. FGDs with teachers revealed that while they cover 80-100 percent of the subject content prescribed by the curriculum, only 50-70 percent is

absorbed by the students. However, interviews with teachers show that they view today's students as better in quality (80-95 percent fair and strong ratings), compared with students of 10 years ago (70-80 percent weak and fair ratings). The survey of project schools showed a student-teacher ratio ranging from 23 to 35 students per teacher, much lower than the norm of 40, due mainly to the high dropout rate. On the other hand, there are large classes (55-80 students) where there is a lack of teachers. The highest dropout rate (40 percent) occurred between classes 1 and 2; this translated into smaller classes in the upper grades. Of the students interviewed, 20 percent had repeated a grade. Teachers rated the students "fairly prepared" to "prepared" when asked to rate current class 5 students on their preparedness for (i) class 6, (ii) the world of work, and (iii) day-to-day living. A more detailed discussion of internal and external efficiencies is shown in Appendix 9.

28. **Supervision.** Supervision is minimal in many schools. District education officers (DEO) seldom visit the schools because they have a heavy workload, with each DEO supervising an average 370 schools per district. The concept of learning coordinators providing assistance to CMS and cluster school teachers to improve the delivery of subject content and instructional methodology/pedagogy is not working because of the other duties assigned to the coordinators and the sheer number of schools to be supervised. Distances from the district office to the schools, availability of transportation, and the short school hours (9 a.m. to 1:30 p.m.) are the main constraints for school visits. During the FGDs, teachers reported that they consider the impact of CMS on the cluster schools to be minimal.

2. Infrastructure Development Component

29. **School Facilities.** The target of establishing 800 CMSs has been exceeded with 832 CMSs established. A total of 175 new schools were built. The Project has substantially improved the facilities and the classroom environment of CMSs established or converted under the Project. Except in a few cases (para. 16), the CMSs visited by the OEM were generally well built, with the mandated five classrooms, boundary wall, and toilet blocks. However, schools lack sufficient funds for basic maintenance of facilities. School desks and blackboards were found to be sufficient in 97 percent of the project schools surveyed (Appendix 5). Except for the schools visited in Punjab, electrical and water supply is a problem (Appendix 10). In schools where there is no supply, water is brought in buckets, or students and teachers go to nearby homes for their toilet needs. Except for Punjab, playground equipment (swings and slides) has mostly broken down due to corrosion and heavy use. Appendix 11 shows the level of satisfaction of 1,272 class 5 students with school facilities.

30. Underutilization of school facilities was observed in some CMSs. For example, CMS Bhattai Abad, District Malir, Sindh Province, has three teachers and 94 students using only two of the available five classrooms. CMS Ghajji Kandar Khel in NWFP had only 82 students where 250 chairs were provided, leaving a pile of unused furniture. The OEM observed a sharp contrast between the good facilities of CMS and the poor conditions in the nonproject schools nearby, where students sit on the floor, or have classes in the yard or corridors.

3. Innovative Activities Component

31. The grant from the Norwegian Government financed the following: (i) construction of 10 community halls in Balochistan, 8 teachers hostels in Punjab, and toilet blocks for cluster schools; (ii) provision of furniture, sewing machines, playground equipment, and cooking utensils for the community halls; (iii) supply of instructional materials, free textbooks to those who cannot afford them, school bags, and teaching kits; (iv) media promotional campaign, and research studies, i.e., textbook study, assessment of internal efficiency, attrition rate of teachers in rural Balochistan, and an evaluation of preservice and inservice training programs of teachers; (v) provision of tubewells and water pumps in 450 schools in the Islamabad capital territory; and (vi) community mobilization in 69 CMSs in Balochistan.

32. Except for Punjab, CMSs were provided a number of sewing machines under the Project's innovative activities component. These were to be used for sewing classes, during which students would also stitch their own uniforms, reducing the family's school-related expenses. Many sewing machines were observed to be in their original packing and kept inside cabinets. Reasons for their not being used are that (i) most teachers do not know how to operate these machines, (ii) teachers deem it not part of their duties to teach sewing, (iii) teachers are already overloaded, and (iv) there are no funds to hire teachers for sewing. While the concept of providing hostels for teachers in remote areas in Punjab was appropriate (8 were built under the innovative activities component), teachers refused to live in them as security was not provided. These hostels were never used, two remain unfinished, and some are being converted to schools. A parallel can be drawn with the World Bank's Primary Education Project that built 5 blocks of hostels at the GCET in Lahore. After seven years, these hostels remain unused. On the other hand, multipurpose rooms that were provided in the premises of the CMS in Balochistan for the needs of the community were useful. These point to the need for beneficiary participation in the design of the Project.

33. The links between school and local community are weak, especially in schools where the headmistress and teachers come from outside the village. Most of the CMSs visited do not hold regular meetings with parents. Some parents are reluctant to be involved in the school because they are illiterate or are afraid they may be asked for financial contributions. Others believe that education is entirely the responsibility of the Government and the school. The establishment of PTAs (nongovernment organizations/community associations in Sindh) is a significant improvement in strengthening the school-community relationship and one that will ensure quality and sustained improvement in the long term. As the PTAs are still in the early stage of establishment, there are many areas for further improvement.

B. Performance of the Operating Entity

34. Nationwide, the Government's underfinancing of education, noted during project appraisal (1989), has not improved significantly. As provided in the Government five-year plans, education expenditure as a percentage of gross national product was 2.15 percent in FY2000, up from 2.13 percent in FY1991. The share of primary education in the national education development budget increased from 26.8 percent in FY1991 to 57.4 percent in FY1999. The share of the recurring budget increased from 45.4 to 55.7 percent during the same period. In real terms, the recurrent budget per student has increased by 29 percent in the last 10 years (Appendix 12). The Government's budgetary allocations are not adequate to meet the needs of this sector. The Government's ban on hiring new staff (since 1990) is restricting the increase of primary school teachers in many project areas. The insufficient number of teachers, a key constraint identified during appraisal, has not yet been addressed sufficiently. Also, schools lack sufficient funds for basic operation and maintenance of facilities and other expenses such as

hiring a security guard or a teacher for sewing class. School personnel and district officials, do not have the authority or the funds to act promptly to make needed repairs. The inability to repair fixtures and facilities in a timely manner leads to higher expenses in the long term.

35. In spite of the Government's commitment to basic education as a key element of poverty reduction, the continuing budgetary constraint threatens the long-term sustainability of the capital assets created and the human resources developed under the Project. This constraint has led to the ban on the recruitment of new staff, which in turn, adversely affects the quality of education. Funds are provided mainly for recurrent costs such as salaries, and little remains for the repair of buildings or the replacement of equipment and furniture. The Government is largely dependent on foreign assistance to renew capital assets.

36. Despite the less than ideal utilization rate of CMSs, their continued and sustained use is assured. But the Government and ADB should ensure that the poorer members of the community are given the opportunity and the means to send their girls to school. Since girls now have easy access to primary schools in almost every village, it seems that the biggest constraint to girls' schooling is no longer the cultural bias against girls' education, but the financial constraints of most rural families. Although there is no school fee for primary education, it is estimated that about 30-50 percent of rural households do not send their girls to school because they cannot afford school uniforms (PRs200 to PRs400 per set) and textbooks (PRs33 to PRs107 for each grade). Parents would be more likely to send their daughters to school if school uniforms and textbooks were more affordable.

IV. ACHIEVEMENT OF OTHER DEVELOPMENT IMPACTS

A. Socioeconomic Impacts

37. The major contribution of the Project lies in its sociocultural impact, i.e., its contribution to changing attitudes among the mostly illiterate rural people so that girls' education is more readily accepted now. Some families not only accept, but in fact pursue educational opportunities for girls. While the concept of the CMS as a resource center for nearby schools, and the learning coordinator as the focal point of professional improvement for teachers, did not work, it has laid the foundation for subsequent projects to build on.

38. **The Beneficiaries: Predominantly Poor Families.** A survey of more than 1,000 class 5 students, both in project and nonproject schools, shows that 90 percent have monthly family incomes not exceeding PRs5,000. The poorest are in Balochistan where all the students surveyed have monthly family incomes of not more than PRs1,500. In a family of six, families survive on about PRs30 (\$0.50) per person per day (Appendix 13). There is a change in the rural population's attitude to girls' education. Despite the high illiteracy rate among parents, they are now more willing to send their girls to primary school provided that (i) it is a girls' school with a boundary wall for security; (ii) the school is close (within about 1 kilometer) to their homes; and (iii) the family can afford the school-related expenses, i.e., uniforms, shoes, and books. Survey results show that enrolments in project schools increased four-fold from 1990 to 2000.

39. **Access and Equity.** As the girls' participation rate in primary education is increasing at a rapid pace, parents' and teachers' aspirations have now shifted to the need for middle schools (classes 6-8) and high schools (classes 9-10) in their communities. Many school-aged girls who

have completed class 5 do not continue schooling either because there are no schools for girls in the community, or because the nearest school is too far away for security-conscious parents. A number of CMSs are being upgraded to middle school status under the ADB-supported Middle School Project.¹⁷

B. Environmental Impacts

40. The impact of the Project on the environment, while indirect, was generally positive. The opportunity to raise the awareness of the students, their parents, and other community members has significant long-term implications for the environment. The curriculum gives substantial importance to environmental education, with textbooks, charts, and other instructional materials dealing with ecosystems, the conservation of natural resources, and personal and community hygiene. The training program for teachers likewise gives ample importance to environmental education to enable them to adequately handle these topics in the curriculum. This is quite relevant in an era of increasing environmental pollution and its adverse effects on human health and economic activity. No significant adverse environmental impacts were identified during the project implementation.

C. Impacts on Institutions and Policy

41. Since 1990, the Government's ban on hiring new staff has adversely affected all projects that aimed to improve the quality of education. During the preparation of the Second Project, ADB conducted an extended policy dialogue with the Government, in cooperation with the World Bank and other external aid agencies involved in SAP leading to the lifting of the ban. Furthermore, to avoid frequent teacher transfers, high rates of absence by teachers, and political interference, the Government has agreed not to allow transfers in the first two years of employment (Report and Recommendation of the President, Loan 1454 [footnote 6], para. 37). The involvement of parents and the local community through the establishment of SMCs and PTAs is expected to substantially improve the quality of education. The Project has taken the first steps to establishing SMCs in primary schools. The follow-up project has put in place a framework in which parents, NGOs, and community-based organizations have a role in determining the quality of education provided to students, in community mobilization, and in the training of DEOs, headmistresses, and members of SMCs.

V. OVERALL ASSESSMENT

A. Relevance

42. The Project's objectives were consistent with the Government's development strategy, ADB's lending strategy for Pakistan, and ADB's strategic objectives both at the time of loan approval and this evaluation. The Project addressed a key constraint to Pakistan's development, lack of female access to schools and directly addressed several of ADB's strategic goals including gender in development, human development, and poverty reduction.

¹⁷ Loan 1278-PAK(SF): *Middle School Project*, for \$78.01 million, approved on 2 December 1993.

However, the project design was too ambitious, and did not achieve its purpose with regard to: (i) establishing CMSs as the resource center of the cluster schools; (ii) establishing learning coordinators as catalysts for quality improvement; and (iii) elimination of multigrade teaching, all of which were necessary for the Project to make an impact on qualitative improvements.¹⁸ While providing a number of well-provided model schools, disparities were generated in terms of facilities, learning materials, and human resources among schools. The formulation and design of the Project would have been more relevant if the Project had been directed to improving smaller schools with 2-3 rooms, or the many shelterless schools. The inclusion of kindergarten class in the project design could have made a major impact on increased access for girls who have to care for younger siblings. For the younger children, it would have helped to inculcate the learning habit at an early age.

B. Efficacy

43. The Project accomplished its target of increasing educational opportunities by providing 35,000 new student places, but the quality of education has not improved significantly. In spite of enrolments increasing four-fold in project schools in the last 10 years, the schools are operating below capacity. The erosion of the expected gains of the Project is highlighted by the underutilization of facilities. In time, demand for girls' primary education will increase, but for now, project schools are not fully utilized. Appropriate adjustments could have been made on the basis of a midterm review, but such a review was not conducted. The appraisal report aimed at an increase in student participation, optimum enrolment, a lower dropout rate, and an economic student-teacher ratio. Outcome indicators measuring quality remain poor: 20 percent of students have repeated a grade, the student-teacher ratio has worsened from 40:1 to 60:1, and class sizes have grown to as many as 55-80 students per teacher. The ideal class size of 40 students was not attained because of the small population of the villages and the reluctance of parents to send their daughters to school. Other purposes that were not met include the database and information system, and most of the innovative activities that would have contributed to qualitative improvements. The elimination of multigrade teaching, one of the objectives of the Project, has not been attained.

C. Efficiency

44. Considering the underutilization of space financed under the Project and the higher construction cost per student place compared with other similar projects, the use of physical facilities, furniture, teaching kits, and instructional materials was inefficient. More than 20 percent of project schools no longer have teaching kits, 30 percent do not have textbooks, 26 percent lack teachers, 20 percent do not have water supply, and 60 percent do not have electricity. Project inputs were also targeted to improve the efficiency of the school system. However, the use of project inputs for the software component was minimal. A longer gestation period and continuing inputs are needed. Internal and external efficiencies are low. While there are large class sizes in schools where there are not enough teachers, the student-teacher ratio is much lower than the norm due to the high dropout rate. High dropout rates are the result of the lack of attention to students' needs in the classroom that in turn is due to the overloaded teacher. The survey showed that 7 percent of CMSs have only 1 teacher and 19 percent have 2-3 teachers, despite the fact that the survey covered the more accessible schools.

¹⁸ ADB's Projects Division argues that the Project was primarily an education access project, which has been largely met, and that quality enhancements were corollary and included in order to attract and retain students.

D. Sustainability

45. Sectorwide issues that are systemic in nature have constrained the performance of the Project. Systemic problems persist, such as lack of teachers (caused mainly by the ban in government hiring), inadequate budgetary allocations for operation and maintenance, weak management, and the absence of an effective monitoring and information system. While the amount of recurrent budget per student has increased in the last 10 years, budgetary allocations are not adequate for the needs of the sector. Development budgets for renewing capital assets have declined in real terms. There have been no further major inputs after project completion.

E. Institutional Development and Other Impacts

46. The concept of the CMS and learning coordinators as the prime source of quality improvement was an idea ahead of its time in the context of the socioeconomic and cultural setting of rural Pakistan. It did not work. Neither did most of the innovative activities envisaged to be pilot-tested under the Project, e.g., teachers' hostels; incentives and rewards for outstanding students, teachers, and headmistresses; teachers' resource centers; and the transport scheme. The need for a comprehensive database and information system cannot be overemphasized. There is no system to monitor the achievements of the CMSs aside from the supervision of the district educational office, which is at best, minimal. On the other hand, community participation has been enhanced by the establishment and operationalization of SMCs and PTAs. Subsequent policy dialogue with the Government in relation to SAP and during the preparation of the second project has led to the lifting of the ban on hiring teachers, and elicited government support to avoid frequent teacher transfers, high rates of absence, and political interference. Overall, investment in basic education is one of the most effective ways to break the cycle of poverty. There is a strong reciprocal relationship between poverty and education. Education contributes to improved incomes and thereby to reduction in poverty. Education and income are the antidote to the twin problems of illiteracy and poverty.

F. Overall Project Rating

47. While the Project has improved the access to primary education of girls in the project areas, there is a major shortcoming in the improvement of education quality, as shown by the poor education indicators in the project schools. While more classrooms have been provided, there is a 20 percent underutilization of project school facilities. The project design was too optimistic in its expectations of sociocultural change and did not pay enough heed to the need for a much longer capacity building and developmental period. Thus, it did not achieve its purpose with regard to the design concepts, as well as educational quality improvement. Secondary aims that were not achieved include the database and information system, and most of the innovative activities under the Project, i.e., provision of teachers hostels, incentives and rewards for outstanding students and teachers, teacher resource centers, and the transport scheme. The inclusion of a kindergarten class in the project design would have helped to raise enrolment rates. There are sustainability problems due to the perennial lack of budgetary allocations for operation and maintenance.

48. Nonetheless, the Project has laid a foundation for efforts to build on. The physical facilities and the teachers and administrators are in place. PTAs and SMCs have made a good, albeit a tentative, start. Taking into account the less than satisfactory state of project outcomes since the Project was completed, the Project is rated less than successful.¹⁹ However, with the groundwork laid by the Project and the lessons identified from its design, implementation, and outcomes, the follow-up project will be better positioned to produce the desired results.

Assessment of Overall Project Performance

Criteria	Assessment	Rating (0-3)	Weight (%)	Weighted Rating
1. Relevance	S	2	20	0.40
2. Efficacy	LTS	1	25	0.25
3. Efficiency	LTS	1	20	0.20
4. Sustainability	LTS	1	20	0.20
5. Institutional Development	S	2	15	0.30
Overall Rating			100	1.35

Rating: 3=highly satisfactory, 2=satisfactory, 1=less than satisfactory, 0=unsatisfactory.

Overall Rating: HS = highly successful (>2.5), S = successful (1.6 ≤ S ≤ 2.5),
LTS = less than successful (0.6 ≤ LTS < 1.6), U = unsuccessful (< 0.6).

G. Assessment of ADB and Borrower Performance

49. **ADB Performance.** The implementing agencies would have accomplished more had ADB allotted more time for review missions (para. 20). It is not possible to properly review a project being implemented at the district level in the four provinces of Pakistan in only five days or less. Furthermore, ADB review missions tended to concentrate on monitoring physical targets and the loan disbursement schedule, while failing to assess operational impact and insist on monitoring and evaluation. It would also have been more useful if the emphasis of the review missions had been on the relationship between developments and the sustainable achievement of project objectives, and on helping the PIUs resolve implementation difficulties and improve administrative processes, especially procurement and financial accounting. The delay in the inception mission and the decision against a midterm review had adverse effects on project implementation. On the other hand, ADB staff did well within the limitations and constraints of the lack of resources provided for the review missions attested to by the relatively early completion of the Project. ADB's performance is rated less than satisfactory.

¹⁹ ADB's Projects Division feels strongly that the Project should be rated successful for the following reasons: (i) the Project was highly relevant to Pakistan's needs and ADB's strategy; (ii) the Project achieved its main aim of increasing school access for girls; (iii) the lack of enrolment is attributable more to socioeconomic constraints than to poor educational quality; (iv) underutilization of facilities is temporary and will improve with better social mobilization efforts to recruit girls; (v) the improvements in classroom learning environments have greatly improved quality in the project schools; and (vi) the project achievements are sustainable in spite of current budgetary shortage.

50. **Borrower Performance.** The most significant flaw in the Borrower's performance was the more than 1.5 years of delay in the appointment of staff to the FCU and PIUs, which in turn delayed other project activities. There was also a delay in establishing the federal and provincial steering committees and the district coordinating committees. The frequent change of key staff during project implementation had an adverse effect on continuity and smooth and timely project implementation. The lack of appreciation for the envisaged monitoring system led the PIUs to forego the hiring of monitoring and training experts. Another major flaw was the inability of the PEDs to create and fill adequate teaching posts for the newly established CMSs due to the ban on hiring of new staff. The Borrower's performance is rated less than satisfactory.

VI. ISSUES, LESSONS, AND FOLLOW-UP ACTIONS

A. Key Issues for the Future

51. **Teaching-Learning Environment.** The quality of education has not improved much. The teaching-learning environment needs to be improved to effect real quality improvement in the learning achievement of the students. Improvements should include smaller class sizes; elimination of multigrade teaching; improved presentation of topics in textbooks; supplementary instructional materials; and provision of basic services, especially water. Textbooks and other instructional materials should be revised to make them more relevant to students in rural areas. There is a need to reduce the disparity between project and nonproject schools within the clusters. The most obvious difference lies in the physical facilities, but differences in the quality of teachers and the availability of textbooks and instructional materials also need to be addressed. The coming of age of the concept of the learning coordinator would partly address this.

52. **Inclusion of the Kindergarten Class.** Provision for kindergarten was not included in the Project. Neither is this part of the follow-up project. However, it is now a part of the primary school system in Pakistan, even if not officially recognized by the Government as such. It has also been a contributing factor to the increase in the enrolment of girls as it enables younger siblings to go with their older sisters who otherwise would be forced to stay home and care for them. However, the inclusion of the kindergarten class in the primary school system requires additional resources.

53. **Disparity Among Cluster Schools.** The CMS was designed to be a resource center in support of the cluster of small schools in its catchment area in terms of learning materials, facilities, and human resources. There is a need to also provide assistance to the poorest of the cluster schools in the vicinity of the CMSs to reduce the disparity between project and nonproject schools.

54. **Teachers: Numbers and Quality.** The lack of teachers is a continuing problem. In spite of the provision of enough classrooms in many CMSs, smaller class sizes and the elimination of multigrade teaching is not possible because of the lack of teachers. The PCR reported that in Sindh, 220 teachers who were appointed around June 1997 to teach in project schools had not received their salaries. Assurance was given by Sindh PED officials to OEM that steps have been taken to pay these teachers. A preference for hiring teachers from the community rather than from outside the village would enable teachers to spend more time with the students and forge closer links with local communities. It is, however, hard to find qualified teachers in the

villages. Teacher training programs need to be enhanced. Real quality improvement will come with the broad knowledge base required of teachers, application of student-centered activity-based teaching strategies, and matching physical facilities with instructional materials. The provincial institutes of teacher education and the GCETs need to be further supported.

55. **Leadership.** Leadership is the key to a school's character and effectiveness. DEOs, headmistresses, and learning coordinators need to be trained in effective school management, and the monitoring and assessment of teachers' performance. The role of SMCs and PTAs is equally important.

56. **Monitoring and Evaluation.** There were shortcomings in the establishment of the project benefit monitoring and evaluation system. The educational management information system which was to have been established under the Project needs to be set up taking into account management information systems that are being developed under SAP and other projects. The system would provide monitoring and evaluation of the primary school system at the district, provincial, and central levels as originally envisaged in the Project. Monitoring and evaluation need to focus on outputs (quantity and quality of students) instead of inputs (classrooms, furniture, teachers, and teaching materials).

57. **Uniforms.** The uniform is the single biggest school-related expenditure, and the inability of the family to afford it is often the cause of children not attending school. This is particularly true for girls. In some schools, uniforms are compulsory. The World Bank had proposed abolishing uniforms in rural areas in its Sindh Primary Education Program in 1990.

B. Lessons Identified

58. **Need for a Flexible Assistance Package.** Most schools have common needs. But they also have specific needs that differ from one school to another. Some schools need more classrooms, others need furniture. Many have toilets, but do not have a regular water supply. Other schools have fans, but no electricity. These examples suggest the need for a flexible, rather than a standard or uniform assistance package to maximize the potential impact of inputs that are already in place. This approach might be more complex administratively, but it could also be more cost-effective.

59. **Mass Training of Teachers Necessary, But Not Sufficient.** As a quick-fix remedy, the mass training of headmistresses and teachers is necessary to achieve a critical mass of agents of change in the classroom. But the momentum generated must be sustained, or backsliding to old attitudes, habits, and practices will invariably follow. Experience from the Project suggests that mass training should be followed by an institutionalized professional development program. The establishment of the provincial institutes of teacher education and the continuing work of the GCETs are important in this respect. However, these institutions need continuing support.

60. **Longer Warranty Period for Civil Works.** Vigilance is necessary to ensure that contractors comply with agreed-upon specifications. Some construction defects were not evident until one or two years later. To ensure better quality, the warranty period should be long enough to safeguard against extended defects. At the same time, additional safeguards should be put in place to counter any new opportunities for corruption. The Executing Agency would need to monitor the soundness of completed civil works beyond project implementation and ensure that contractors address defects during the warranty period.

61. **Parental Involvement.** Children assisted by parents at home in their academic studies perform better in school than those who are not assisted. Most parents do not assist their children at home because they have little or no education and are not knowledgeable in the subject matter. However, parents can provide support by encouraging their children to study and do their assignments and allowing them the time to do so. The important point is for parents to emphasize the value of education to their children. Teachers should reach out to parents during PTA meetings to advocate parental involvement at home. This would also change the perception of many parents that PTA meetings are mostly about money matters. The PTA should include parents from poor families and should be allowed to make independent decisions. Information and educational campaigns focusing on parents' rights and responsibilities in supervising and supporting school activities should be pilot-tested in the ongoing second project.

62. **Linking Projects with Adult Literacy, Livelihood, and Other Poverty Reduction Projects.** Research findings in ADB projects show (i) the important role that the functional literacy of the parents plays in ensuring that 6-10 year old girls enroll and stay in school, (ii) the influence of poverty on dropout rates, and (iii) the influence of family income on learning achievement in basic education. What these findings suggest is that the impact of similar future projects will be maximized if they are linked with other projects related to adult literacy, livelihood, and poverty reduction in specific geographic areas, especially rural areas.

63. **Long-Term Commitment in a Short-Term Environment.** Taking into account the long program cycle needed for sustained development of the subsector, a series of overlapping projects with consistent core objectives are needed to make an impact, over ten years or more, on key subsector indicators while strengthening Government capacity to manage the subsector. While the Project has laid the foundation to make primary education more accessible to girls in rural areas, and the second project aims to further improve educational quality, it is not too soon to start work on a third project to ensure that it overlaps with the ongoing second project. Inputs from this PPAR would be timely both for the midterm review of the second project, planned for the fourth quarter of 2000, and the project preparatory activities for a third project. Beneficiary and stakeholder participation needs to be integrated into project preparation and implementation planning at the earliest in order to engender a sense of ownership of the project.

C. Follow-Up Actions

64. The following corrective measures should be considered by ADB's Agriculture and Social Sectors Department (West) at the time of the midterm review of the Second Girls Primary School Sector Project (footnote 6):

- (i) In schools found to be in dire need, expand the project scope to include the needs of kindergarten classes, i.e., classrooms, furniture, teachers, and instructional materials.
- (ii) As required, finance the completion of unfinished civil works and the repair of damaged facilities, and provide desks.
- (iii) Introduce relevant activities planned but not implemented under the first Project, notably the provision of free school uniforms and textbooks to the poorest families in the community.

APPENDIXES

Number	Title	Page	Cited on (page, para.)
1	Project Framework	19	1,2
2	Operations Evaluation Mission Survey	21	3,7
3	Enrolments in Schools Covered Under the Survey	22	7,22
4	Students Profile	24	7,22
5	Availability of Facilities and Instructional Materials in Project Schools	25	8,25
6	Libraries and Library Books	26	8,25
7	Number of Teachers Per School	27	8,26
8	Teachers Profile	28	8,26
9	Internal and External Efficiencies	30	8,27
10	Availability of Water and Electricity in Schools	35	9,29
11	Level of Students' Satisfaction with Facilities	36	9,29
12	Annual Recurrent Budgetary Allocation for Primary Education	37	10,34
13	Monthly Income of Parents of Class 5 Students	38	11,38

PROJECT FRAMEWORK^a

Design Summary	Performance Indicators/Targets	Project Monitoring Mechanisms	Risks and Assumptions
<p>Goals</p> <p>Increased educational opportunities for girls in villages</p> <p>Improved literacy through primary education for rural girls</p>	<p>Greater enrolment in project than nonproject schools</p> <p>Increased retention rate</p>	<p>Asian Development Bank (ADB) documents</p> <p>Surveys</p> <p>Schools records</p>	
<p>Purposes and Objectives</p> <p>Increased participation rate of girls in primary education</p> <p>Improved quality of instruction</p>	<p>Achievement of Government's target of 100 percent participation by 1992</p> <p>Increased supply of adequately trained female teachers</p> <p>Better teacher training facilities and research activities</p> <p>Improved student/teacher ratio</p> <p>Improved textbook/student ratio</p> <p>Smaller class sizes</p> <p>Reduced dropout rate</p> <p>Higher retention rate</p> <p>Higher transition rate</p>	<p>Primary data from survey of community model schools (CMSs) and nonproject schools</p> <p>Secondary research on published statistics and related studies</p>	<p>Conservative social attitudes</p> <p>Inadequate physical facilities</p> <p>Insufficient rural female teachers</p>
<p>Outputs</p> <p>Development of multipronged enrolment demand generation program</p>	<p>Higher enrolment in project than nonproject schools</p>	<p>Survey results and ADB missions</p>	<p>Girls only schools</p> <p>Security-conscious parents</p> <p>Proximity of school to students' homes</p> <p>Affordability of school-related expenses</p>

Design Summary	Performance Indicators/Targets	Project Monitoring Mechanisms	Risks and Assumptions
----------------	--------------------------------	-------------------------------	-----------------------

^a This framework was developed for this report to present the project scope and achievements. No framework was developed at the time of appraisal.

Establishment of CMSs in selected rural areas	Establishment of 800 CMSs, provision of furniture and equipment	Project implementation progress reports	Availability of funds for basic maintenance of school facilities Optimum use of other machines
Increased supply of qualified rural female teachers and more inservice training for teachers	Number of rural-based qualified females sponsored Number of preservice training conducted	Project implementation progress reports	Government policy on hiring teachers Incentives for teachers
Provision of instructional materials and hardware facilities	Adequate supply of desks, chairs, blackboards, curriculum materials, equipment, audiovisual paraphernalia, and other support facilities	Project implementation progress reports	Timely and appropriate international competitive bidding and award of contracts Timely and appropriate local procurement
Improved training of learning coordinators	Completion of training and increased visits by learning coordinators to schools	Project implementation progress reports	
Provision of staff and fellowships for project monitoring and evaluation	196 person-months of overseas training for staff 156 person-months of local training	Project implementation progress reports	Correct selection and placement of fellows
Inputs Consultants \$486,050 Fellowships \$384,000 Civil Works \$44.0 million Equipment, Furniture, and Vehicles \$4.3 million Curricular Materials \$1.0 million Sector Evaluation and Research \$0.6 million			

OPERATIONS EVALUATION MISSION SURVEY

Table A2.1: Sample Distribution of Project Schools

Item	Punjab	Sindh	NWFP	Balochistan	Pakistan
Project CMSs	468	168	127	69	832
(% of total)	56	20	15	8	100
Sample Distribution:					
1. Project Schools	41	20	15	10	86
2. Teachers/Head Mistresses	117	50	48	17	232
3. Students	303	138	123	98	662
4. School Leavers	134	107	51	63	355
Total	595	315	237	188	1,335

CMS = community model school, NWFP = Northwest Frontier Province.

Source: Operations Evaluation Mission survey, March 2000.

Table A2.2: Sample Distribution of Nonproject Schools

Item	Punjab	Sindh	NWFP	Balochistan	Pakistan
1. Nonproject Schools	41	20	17	10	88
2. Teachers/Head Mistresses	124	70	33	11	238
3. Students	301	147	113	49	610
4. School Leavers	153	76	51	11	291
Total	619	313	214	81	1,227

NWFP = Northwest Frontier Province.

Source: Operations Evaluation Mission survey, March 2000.

ENROLMENTS^a IN SCHOOLS COVERED UNDER THE SURVEY

Table A3.1: Enrolments

Year	Project Schools				Nonproject Schools			
	Girls	Boys	Total	% Increase	Girls	Boys	Total	% Increase
Punjab								
1990	1,141	153	1,294		4,547	0	4,547	
1996	4,467	140	4,607	256.0	6,130	25	6,155	35.0
2000	6,797	690	7,487	62.0	8,238	358	8,596	40.0
Sindh								
1990	1,105	0	1,105		1,640	0	1,640	
1996	1,660	0	1,660	50.0	2,012	0	2,012	22.0
2000	1,843	68	1,911	15.0	2,351	23	2,374	18.0
NWFP								
1990	601	0	601		1,637	0	1,637	
1996	1,602	78	1,680	179.0	2,926	2	2,928	79.0
2000	2,297	282	2,579	53.0	2,662	35	2,697	(8.0)
Balochistan								
1990	455	0	455		50	0	50	
1996	1,468	268	1,736	281.0	448	0	448	796.0
2000	1,745	306	2,051	18.0	1,422	42	1,464	226.0
Pakistan								
1990	3,302	153	3,455		7,874	0	7,874	
1996	9,197	486	9,683	180.0	11,516	27	11,543	47.0
2000	12,682	1,346	14,028	45.0	14,673	458	15,131	31.0

NWFP = Northwest Frontier Province.

^a In 86 project schools and 88 nonproject schools surveyed.

Source: Operations Evaluation Mission survey, March 2000.

Table A3.2: Primary Education Statistics
(Classes 1-5, 1990/91-1998/99)

School Year	No. of Schools ('000)		Enrolment ('000)		Teachers ('000)		Student/Teacher Ratio	
	Total	Girls	Total	Girls	Total	Girls	Total	Girls
1990/91	114.1	31.1	10,837	3,675	277.8	92.7	39	40
1995/96	143.1	43.4	14,527	5,702	331.0	109.3	44	52
1996/97	149.7	42.0	15,395	6,156	322.9	111.8	48	55
1997/98	156.5	43.3	16,319	6,648	342.8	114.4	48	58
1998/99	163.7	44.6	17,298	7,180	374.5	117.0	46	61

Source: Pakistan Economic Survey, 1998-1999.

STUDENTS PROFILE

Table A4.1: Age Distribution and Transport Arrangements of Class 5 Students

No. of Years	Project Schools		Nonproject Schools		Pakistan	
	No. of Students	%	No. of Students	%	No. of Students	%
Age Distribution of Class 5 Students						
Up to 10 years	225	34.0	219	35.9	444	34.9
11-12	327	49.4	277	45.4	604	47.5
13-14	103	15.6	103	16.9	206	16.2
15-16	7	1.1	10	1.6	17	1.3
Above 16	0	0.0	1	0.2	1	0.1
Total	662	100.0	610	100.0	1,272	100.0
Distance from Home to School						
Up to 1 km	519	79.5	527	86.4	1,046	82.8
>1 but <2 km	81	12.4	59	9.7	140	11.1
>2 but <3 km	34	5.2	11	1.8	45	3.6
>3 km	19	2.9	13	2.1	32	2.5
Total	653	100.0	610	100.0	1,263	100.0
Means of Going to School						
Walking	644	97.3	594	97.4	1,238	97.3
Transport	18	2.7	16	2.6	34	2.7
Total	662	100.0	610	100.0	1,272	100.0

Source: Operations Evaluation Mission survey, March 2000.

Table A4.2: Number of Siblings of Class 5 Students

Age Range (years)	All Project Provinces	%	Balochistan	%
1-2	65	5.1	0	0.0
3-4	265	20.8	6	4.1
5-6	432	34.0	31	21.1
7-10	461	36.2	90	61.2
Above 10	49	3.9	20	13.6
Total	1,272	100.0	147	100.0

Source: Operations Evaluation Mission survey, March 2000.

**AVAILABILITY OF FACILITIES AND INSTRUCTIONAL MATERIALS
IN PROJECT SCHOOLS**

Facilities and Instructional Materials	Punjab		Sindh		NWFP		Balochistan		Pakistan	
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
Teaching Kits	30	73	11	55	15	100	10	100	66	77
Library Books	37	90	13	65	15	100	10	100	75	87
Textbooks	29	71	10	50	7	47	9	90	55	64
Desks and Blackboards	38	93	20	100	15	100	10	100	83	97
Number of Schools Surveyed	41		20		15		10		86	

N = number of schools where materials are available, NWFP = Northwest Frontier Province.

Source: Operations Evaluation Mission survey, March 2000.

LIBRARIES AND LIBRARY BOOKS

Table A6.1: Libraries

Library in School	Punjab				Sindh				NWFP				Balochistan				Pakistan			
	PS	%	NPS	%	PS	%	NPS	%	PS	%	NPS	%	PS	%	NPS	%	PS	%	NPS	%
With	33	82.5	19	46.3	11	55.0	10	50.0	15	100.0	11	64.7	10	100.0	0	0.0	69	81.2	40	45.5
Without	7	17.5	22	53.7	9	45.0	10	50.0	0	0.0	6	35.3	0	0.0	10	100.0	16	18.8	48	54.5
Total	40	100.0	41	100.0	20	100.0	20	100.0	15	100.0	17	100.0	10	100.0	10	100.0	85	100.0	88	100.0

NPS = nonproject school, NWFP = Northwest Frontier Province, PS = project school.

Source: Operations Evaluation Mission survey, March 2000.

Table A6.2: Number of Books in Libraries

No. of Books	Punjab				Sindh				NWFP				Balochistan				Pakistan			
	PS	%	NPS	%	PS	%	NPS	%	PS	%	NPS	%	PS	%	NPS	%	PS	%	NPS	%
Below 50	1	3.0	7	36.8	1	9.0	6	60.0	2	14.3	4	40.0	3	30.0	0	0.0	7	10.3	17	43.6
51-100	1	3.0	4	21.1	6	54.6	1	10.0	2	14.3	4	40.0	4	40.0	0	0.0	13	19.1	9	23.1
101-200	6	18.2	3	15.8	4	36.4	3	30.0	4	28.6	2	20.0	2	20.0	0	0.0	16	23.5	8	20.5
201-300	0	0.0	1	5.3	0	0.0	0	0.0	3	21.4	0	0.0	1	10.0	0	0.0	4	5.9	1	2.6
301-500	11	33.3	3	15.8	0	0.0	0	0.0	2	14.3	0	0.0	0	0.0	0	0.0	13	19.1	3	7.7
>500	14	42.4	1	5.3	0	0.0	0	0.0	1	7.1	0	0.0	0	0.0	0	0.0	15	22.1	1	2.6
Total	33	100.0	19	100.0	11	100.0	10	100.0	14	100.0	10	100.0	10	100.0	0	0.0	68	100.0	39	100.0

NPS = nonproject school, NWFP = Northwest Frontier Province, PS = project school.

Source: Operations Evaluation Mission survey, March 2000.

NUMBER OF TEACHERS PER SCHOOL

No. of Teachers Per School	Project Schools		Nonproject Schools		All Schools	
	No. of Schools	%	No. of Schools	%	No. of Schools	%
1	6	7.1	4	4.5	10	5.8
2-3	16	18.8	31	35.2	47	27.2
4-5	22	25.9	13	14.8	35	20.2
6-10	37	43.5	23	26.1	60	34.7
11-15	3	3.5	9	10.2	12	6.9
>15	1	1.2	8	9.1	9	5.2
Total	85	100.0	88	100.0	173	100.0

Source: Operations Evaluation Mission survey, March 2000.

TEACHERS PROFILE

Table A8.1: Academic Qualifications of Teachers

Item	Project Schools		Nonproject Schools		All Schools	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
Class 8	2	0.9	2	0.8	4	0.9
Matriculation	95	40.9	104	43.7	199	42.3
FA/FSc	64	27.6	52	21.8	116	24.7
Bachelor of Arts	49	21.1	43	18.1	92	19.6
Bachelor of Science	1	0.4	1	0.4	2	0.4
Master of Arts	21	9.1	36	15.1	57	12.1
Total	232	100.0	238	100.0	470	100.0

FA/FSc = Fellow of Arts/Fellow of Science.

Source: Operations Evaluation Mission survey, March 2000.

Table A8.2: Teaching Experience

No. of Years	Project Schools		Nonproject Schools		All Schools	
	No. of Teachers	%	No. of Teachers	%	No. of Teachers	%
<1	4	1.7	6	2.5	10	2.1
2-5	46	19.8	31	13.0	77	16.4
6-10	78	33.6	89	37.4	167	35.5
11-15	55	23.7	62	26.1	117	24.9
16-20	26	11.2	23	9.7	49	10.4
>21	23	9.9	27	11.3	50	10.6
Total	232	100.0	238	100.0	470	100.0

Source: Operations Evaluation Mission survey, March 2000.

Table A8.3: Age of Teachers

Age	Project School Teachers		Nonproject School Teachers		All Teachers	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
<20	0	0.0	1	0.4	1	0.2
21-25	31	13.4	28	11.8	59	12.6
26-30	70	30.2	69	29.0	139	29.6
31-35	55	23.7	71	29.8	126	26.8
36-40	42	18.1	29	12.2	71	15.1
41-50	29	12.5	34	14.3	63	13.4
>50	5	2.2	6	2.5	11	2.3
Total	232	100.0	238	100.0	470	100.0

Source: Operations Evaluation Mission survey, March 2000.

INTERNAL AND EXTERNAL EFFICIENCIES

A. Internal Efficiency

1. In spite of the gains in recent years, the quality of girls' primary education needs further improvement. Focus groups discussions with teachers revealed that while they cover 80-100 percent of the subject content prescribed by the curriculum, only 50-70 percent is absorbed by the students. The survey examined the rate of absenteeism of class 5 students who were interviewed. Seventy percent of the students had been absent 1 to 6 days in the past schoolyear (Table A9.1). Illness was the most frequently cited reason in Punjab, Sindh, and Northwest Frontier Province (NWFP). In Balochistan, the main cause of absenteeism was rain.

Table A9.1: Rate of School Absences of Class 5 Students

No. of Days per Month	Punjab		Sindh		NWFP		Balochistan		Pakistan	
	Students	%	Students	%	Students	%	Students	%	Students	%
1	120	19.9	64	22.5	37	15.7	0	0.0	221	17.4
2	231	38.2	94	33.0	82	34.7	15	10.2	422	33.2
3	86	14.2	43	15.1	38	16.1	12	8.2	179	14.1
4	26	4.3	12	4.2	14	5.9	5	3.4	57	4.5
5	0	0.0	0	0.0	0	0.0	4	2.7	4	0.3
6	0	0.0	0	0.0	0	0.0	11	7.5	11	0.9
Total Students Absent (Numbers)	463	76.6	213	74.7	171	72.5	47	32.0	894	70.3
Students With No Absence	141	23.3	72	25.3	65	27.5	100	68.0	378	29.7
Total Number of Students Surveyed	604	100.0	285	100.0	236	100.0	147	100.0	1,272	100.3

NWFP = Northwest Frontier Province.

Source: Operations Evaluation Mission survey, March 2000.

Table A9.2: Reasons for Absence

Reason	Punjab		Sindh		NWFP		Balochistan		Pakistan	
	Students	%	Students	%	Students	%	Students	%	Students	%
Illness	360	77.8	115	54.0	128	74.9	11	23.4	603	71.2
Help Parents	85	18.4	70	32.9	30	17.5	7	14.9	185	21.8
Rain	17	3.7	5	2.3	7	4.1	17	36.2	29	3.4
School Too Far	0	0.0	3	1.4	0	0.0	5	10.6	3	0.4
No Money	0	0.0	1	0.5	0	0.0	5	10.6	1	0.1
Others	1	0.2	19	8.9	6	3.5	2	4.3	26	3.1
Total	463	100.0	213	100.0	171	100.0	47	100.0	847	100.0

NWFP = Northwest Frontier Province.

Source: Operations Evaluation Mission survey, March 2000.

2. Interviews with teachers show that they view today's students as better in quality (80-95 percent fair and strong ratings), compared with students of 10 years ago (70-80 percent weak and fair ratings) (Table A9.3).

Table A9.3: Quality of Students as Viewed by Teachers
(Percent)

Response	Punjab		Sindh		NWFP		Balochistan	
	1990	Today	1990	Today	1990	Today	1990	Today
Very Weak	2	0	8	2	4	0	38	0
Weak	34	3	40	16	21	4	24	0
Fair	49	43	30	65	63	58	38	44
Strong	14	51	18	16	12	34	0	52
Very Strong	1	3	4	1	0	4	0	4
Total	100	100						

NWFP = Northwest Frontier Province.

Source: Operations Evaluation Mission survey, March 2000.

3. **Participation Rate.** The overall participation rate of girls in primary education was estimated at 62 percent in 1998/99.¹ In spite of this, girls still lag behind boys whose participation rate increased from 64 percent to 92 percent during the same period. The percentage of girls in total enrolment increased from 34 percent in 1990/91 to 42 percent in 1998/99.² However, the net enrolment rate remains low at about 38 percent. There are significant regional variations, especially in remote rural areas where poverty is widespread. In areas close to urban centers where parents have jobs, most girls finish class 5 and continue on to middle and high school. In the poor rural areas where parents are mainly farmers, many girls do not go to school at all because their parents cannot buy them a uniform (and shoes in Balochistan) and textbooks. Low school attendance is a major reason for the low literacy rate, especially in the rural areas, a consequence of pervasive poverty among the rural population and the lack of primary schools for girls. Only half of the girls who start schooling finish class 5. Of the 217 out-of-school children interviewed, 55 percent wanted to rejoin school.

4. **Transition Rate.** A number of dropouts and pass-outs (those who have completed class 5) were interviewed as part of the survey. The main reasons for quitting school are summarized in Table A9.4. The majority (62 percent) cited the completion of class 5 as an end to their educational aspiration. Ten percent cited their parents' objection to their continuing to go to school. This points to the need for counseling and promotional campaigns to encourage children to stay in school. Another 10 percent cited financial constraints. In Balochistan, the main constraint to continued schooling is the absence of middle or high schools (39 percent).

¹ In South Asia, gross primary enrolment rate in 1995 was 82 percent for girls and 94 percent for boys.

² Pakistan Economic Survey, 1998/99.

Table A9.4: Reasons for Quitting School

Reason	All Provinces Except Balochistan		Balochistan	
	No.	%	No.	%
	Class 5 as an end in itself	352	62.5	32
Parents did not like me to continue	61	10.8	8	10.8
Financial constraints	60	10.7	2	2.7
I did not like to continue	34	6.0	0	0.0
Need to help at home or with work	15	2.7	2	2.7
I could not cope with studies	14	2.5	0	0.0
Teachers' attitudes were not good	12	2.1	0	0.0
School was too far	8	1.4	1	1.4
No accessible middle/high school	7	1.2	29	39.2
Total	563	100.0	74	100.0

Source: Operations Evaluation Mission survey, March 2000.

5. Interviews with class 5 students show that 90 percent of all students intend to continue to class 6 (Tables A9.5 and A9.6). Those in Punjab, Sindh, and NWFP who did not intend to continue cited social reasons, such as early marriage, that worked against schooling. In Balochistan, the main reason was loss of interest among students.

Table A9.5: Intention to Continue Schooling

Response	Project Schools		Nonproject Schools		All Schools	
	No. of Students	%	No. of Students	%	No. of Students	%
Yes	603	91.1	537	88.0	1,140	89.6
No	59	8.9	73	12.0	132	10.4
Total	662	100.0	610	100.0	1,272	100.0

Source: Operations Evaluation Mission survey, March 2000.

Table A9.6: Reasons for Discontinuing Schooling

Reason	All Provinces Except Balochistan		Balochistan	
	No.	%	No.	%
	Social Setup	76	61.8	3
Financial Constraint	26	21.1	0	0.0
No Interest	8	6.5	5	55.6
Religious Education	6	4.9	1	11.1
Help Parents	3	2.4	0	0.0
No Accessible School	4	3.3	0	0.0
Total	123	100.0	9	100.0

Source: Operations Evaluation Mission survey, March 2000.

6. **Retention Rate.** Twenty percent of students interviewed had repeated a grade (slightly lower than the rate in nonproject schools). Balochistan has the highest rate at 40 percent, and Sindh the lowest at 7 percent (Table A9.7).

Table A9.7: Retention Rate

Item	Project Schools		Nonproject Schools		All Schools	
	No. of Students	%	No. of Students	%	No. of Students	%
Repeated a Grade	122	18.4	132	21.6	254	20.0
Did Not Repeat a Grade	540	81.6	478	78.4	1,018	80.0
Total	662	100.0	610	100.0	1,272	100.0

Source: Operations Evaluation Mission survey, March 2000.

7. **Class Size.** Officially, the average class size in government primary schools is set at 40 students. This figure, however, does not capture the whole range of field conditions. The class size is high in schools where there is a lack of teachers or classrooms (as many as 55-80 students per teacher). Multigrade teaching is the result of these constraints. This is obviously the logical consequence of the growth of enrollment outpacing the investments in additional classrooms. Thus, teachers cannot apply the instructional methodology they are trained in because of the high number of students per classroom and the need to cover a comprehensive curriculum. The teachers feel that a class size of 40-45 would be ideal.

8. **Student/Teacher Ratio.** The student/teacher ratio is high in schools where there is a lack of teachers (up to 65 students per teacher when the norm is 40). Nationally, the student/teacher ratio increased from 40:1 in 1990 to 61:1 in 1999. The student/teacher ratio is lower in community model schools (CMSs) than in the cluster schools. For example, CMS Kalu Khel in NWFP has a ratio of 16:1 (64 students and 4 teachers). In sharp contrast, the ratios in the three schools in the cluster nearby were 47, 56, and 76 students per teacher.

B. External Efficiency

9. Teachers were asked to rate current class 5 students on their preparedness for (i) class 6, (ii) the world of work, and (iii) day-to-day living. The teachers rated the students "fairly prepared" to "prepared" (Table A9.8-A9.10).

Table A9.8: Preparedness for Class 6

Response	Punjab		Sindh		NWFP		Balochistan	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
Ill Prepared	0	0.00	3	2.50	1	1.30	0	0.00
Unprepared	3	1.26	1	0.83	1	1.30	0	0.00
Fairly Prepared	113	47.28	56	46.67	53	68.83	13	46.43
Prepared	102	42.68	46	38.33	18	23.38	12	42.86
Very Well Prepared	21	8.79	14	11.67	4	5.19	3	10.71
Total	239	100.00	120	100.00	77	100.00	28	100.00

NWFP = Northwest Frontier Province.

Source: Operations Evaluation Mission survey, March 2000.

Table A9.9: Preparedness for Work

Response	Punjab		Sindh		NWFP		Balochistan	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
Ill Prepared	2	0.84	1	0.83	1	1.30	0	0.00
Unprepared	0	0.00	6	5.00	2	2.60	0	0.00
Fairly Prepared	115	48.12	46	38.33	53	68.83	9	32.14
Prepared	106	44.35	54	45.00	17	22.08	10	35.71
Very Well Prepared	16	6.69	13	10.83	4	5.19	9	32.14
Total	239	100.00	120	100.00	77	100.00	28	100.00

NWFP = Northwest Frontier Province.

Source: Operations Evaluation Mission survey, March 2000.

Table A9.10: Preparedness for Day-to-Day Living

Response	Punjab		Sindh		NWFP		Balochistan	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
Ill Prepared	0	0.00	3	2.50	0	0.00	0	0.00
Unprepared	2	0.84	12	10.00	2	2.60	0	0.00
Fairly Prepared	125	52.30	37	30.83	58	75.32	8	28.57
Prepared	101	42.26	55	45.83	13	16.88	12	42.86
Very Well Prepared	11	4.60	13	10.83	4	5.19	8	28.57
Total	239	100.00	120	100.00	77	100.00	28	100.00

NWFP = Northwest Frontier Province.

Source: Operations Evaluation Mission survey, March 2000.

AVAILABILITY OF WATER AND ELECTRICITY IN SCHOOLS

Table A10.1: Availability of Water

Water	Punjab				Sindh				NWFP				Balochistan			
	PS	%	NPS	%	PS	%	NPS	%	PS	%	NPS	%	PS	%	NPS	%
Available in School	35	87.5	34	85.0	12	60.0	16	80.0	12	80.0	11	68.8	7	70.0	2	20.0
Not Available in School but Available Outside	5	12.5	5	12.5	8	40.0	3	15.0	3	20.0	5	31.2	3	30.0	8	80.0
Not Available at All	0	0.0	1	2.5	0	0.0	1	5.0	0	0.0	0	0.0	0	0.0	0	0.0
Total	40	100.0	40	100.0	20	100.0	20	100.0	15	100.0	16	100.0	10	100.0	10	100.0

NPS = nonproject school, NWFP = Northwest Frontier Province, PS = project school.

Source: Operations Evaluation Mission survey, March 2000.

Table A10.2: Availability of Electricity

Electricity	Punjab				Sindh				NWFP				Balochistan			
	PS	%	NPS	%	PS	%	NPS	%	PS	%	NPS	%	PS	%	NPS	%
Available in School	14	35.0	15	37.5	7	35.0	12	60.0	10	66.7	9	56.3	3	30.0	1	10.0
Not Available in School but Available Outside	26	65.0	25	62.5	11	55.0	8	40.0	5	33.3	7	43.7	7	70.0	9	90.0
Not Available at All	0	0.0	0	0.0	2	10.0	0	0.0	0	0.0	0	0.0	0	0.0	0	0.0
Total	40	100.0	40	100.0	20	100.0	20	100.0	15	100.0	16	100.0	10	100.0	10	100.0

NPS = nonproject school, NWFP = Northwest Frontier Province, PS = project school.

Source: Operations Evaluation Mission survey, March 2000.

LEVEL OF STUDENTS' SATISFACTION WITH FACILITIES

Response	Punjab		Sindh		NWFP		Balochistan	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
A. Classroom								
Yes	488	80.79	204	71.58	196	83.05	60	40.82
No	116	19.21	81	28.42	40	16.95	87	59.18
Total	604	100.00	285	100.00	236	100.00	147	100.00
B. Multipurpose Room								
Yes	279	47.86	66	26.72	101	46.33	92	62.59
No	304	52.14	181	73.28	117	53.67	55	37.41
Total	583	100.00	247	100.00	218	100.00	147	100.00
C. Playground Equipment								
Yes	358	60.17	97	34.77	153	65.95	115	78.23
No	237	39.83	182	65.23	79	34.05	32	21.77
Total	595	100.00	279	100.00	232	100.00	147	100.00
D. Toilet and Sanitary Facilities								
Yes	393	66.39	164	57.75	137	59.57	94	63.95
No	199	33.61	120	42.25	93	40.43	53	36.05
Total	592	100.00	284	100.00	230	100.00	147	100.00
E. Boundary Wall								
Yes	500	84.32	257	90.49	227	96.60	29	19.73
No	93	15.68	27	9.51	8	3.40	118	80.27
Total	593	100.00	284	100.00	235	100.00	147	100.00
F. Water								
Yes	468	78.79	157	55.48	186	79.83	35	23.81
No	126	21.21	126	44.52	47	20.17	112	76.19
Total	594	100.00	283	100.00	233	100.00	147	100.00
G. Electricity								
Yes	229	38.55	113	40.50	140	59.32	20	13.61
No	365	61.45	166	59.50	96	40.68	127	86.39
Total	594	100.00	279	100.00	236	100.00	147	100.00
H. Drainage System								
Yes	317	55.32	77	28.84	133	61.29	5	27.78
No	256	44.68	190	71.16	84	38.71	13	72.22
Total	573	100.00	267	100.00	217	100.00	18	100.00

NWFP = Northwest Frontier Province.

Source: Operations Evaluation Mission survey, March 2000.

ANNUAL RECURRENT BUDGETARY ALLOCATION FOR PRIMARY EDUCATION

Year	Enrolment	Recurrent Budget (PRs million)		Unit Recurrent Budget (\$)	
		Current	Equivalent 1998 Prices	Current	Equivalent 1998 Prices
1990/91	10,837,000	8,181	16,238	754.91	1,498
1995/96	14,527,000	21,165	25,038	1,456.94	1,724
1998/99	17,298,000	34,703	33,350	2,006.19	1,928

Source: International Finance Statistics Yearbook, 1999 (1995=100).

MONTHLY INCOME OF PARENTS OF CLASS 5 STUDENTS

Income Per Month (PRs)	All Students		Balochistan Only	
	No.	%	No.	%
Up to 1,500	272	26.8	147	100.0
1,501 - 2,000	105	10.3	0	0.0
2,001 - 3,000	312	30.7	0	0.0
3,001 - 5,000	234	23.1	0	0.0
Above 5,000	92	9.1	0	0.0
Total	1,015	100.0	147	100.0

Source: Operations Evaluation Mission survey, March 2000.