A. Description of the Monitoring and Evaluation System

1. Technical and vocational education and training (TVET) schools and colleges are subject to routine administrative and management supervision, functional education supervision, and additional supervision if they are model demonstration facilities (to ensure they meet the higher standards expected of such demonstration facilities). The results-based lending (RBL) program currently comprises 17 demonstration TVET institutions (providing secondary education) and colleges (providing higher and tertiary education). Some of these have the status of a national demonstration school and/or college; the remainders are provincial demonstration institutions. While they have much in common, the national demonstration facilities are subject to monitoring and evaluation (M&E) under a national system established by the Ministry of Education (MOE) to ensure they justify retaining the status of a national demonstration facility. The provincial demonstration facilities are subject to an M&E system established by the Guizhou Education Department (GED) to ensure they meet required standards.

2. In the People’s Republic of China (PRC), TVET schools and colleges may be provincial, municipal, or county facilities with administrative and functional education supervision undertaken by the relevant provincial, municipal, or county government. All the Guizhou Vocational Education Development Program (GVEDP) schools and colleges are provincial facilities under the jurisdiction of Guizhou Provincial Government (GPG). However administrative supervision arrangements vary depending on which sector the college resides. Hence, all 17 schools and/or colleges are under the functional supervision of GED for their education standards and performance. However, the sector focus means that only 4 of the schools and/or colleges are under the administrative supervision of GED. The other 13 schools and/or colleges are under the administrative supervision (including budgetary control, disciplinary and governance supervision, human resource management, and planning) of other GPG departments (e.g., the Guizhou Provincial Finance Department supervises the Guizhou Financial School). GED’s role in these cases is restricted to supervising education-related standards and performance, and key education projects utilizing funds allocated by MOE.

3. Supervision arrangements for secondary schools are somewhat different from those for tertiary colleges. Tertiary TVET colleges have five M&E requirements, while secondary TVET schools have two. The M&E requirements for tertiary colleges are (i) national demonstration vocational college and school projects conduct M&E; (ii) Guizhou provincial demonstration vocational college and schools projects conduct M&E; (iii) national vocational colleges have a system to evaluate talent cultivation (how well the college is training students for appropriate vocations according to criteria described in para. 8); (iv) the GPG is speeding up the development and performance evaluation for GED-managed vocational colleges; and (v) the quality of provincial and institutional talent cultivation is assessed annually by a reporting system.\(^1\)

4. The M&E requirements for secondary vocational schools are (i) national demonstration vocational schools projects conduct M&E; and (ii) the Guizhou provincial demonstration vocational school projects conduct M&E. Verification is conducted in the same way as for the tertiary system, although the criteria used differ somewhat (paras. 6–7).

---

1 Reporting on the cultivation of institutional talent is based on the TVET school or college, while the provincial reporting is province-wide, traditionally focusing on tertiary colleges. However, from this year, MOE requires such reporting to cover secondary schools as well.
5. The current M&E system generates information on several key indicators required for mandatory reporting to MOE on (i) comprehensive school performance, and (ii) financial information for relevant audit purposes. The M&E system also provides (i) information to MOE and GED on project outcomes, and fund use efficiency and effectiveness; and (ii) project progress reports for government, development partners, and stakeholder review. In addition, the system is required to report on additional indicators related to vocational colleges and schools. However, no comprehensive annual statistical bulletin on TVET performance is currently published.

6. **National demonstration vocational college and school projects.** These projects aim to build TVET capacity through a network of national demonstration colleges and schools; and are jointly funded by the national and provincial governments, project schools, and industrial partners. MOE selected the demonstration colleges and schools from nominations made by provincial education departments such as GED; it will allocate additional funds to them to build capacity. After 2 years of M&E implementation for vocational schools and 3 years for vocational colleges, an evaluation is conducted to decide whether or not the demonstration status is justified. The M&E comprises (i) M&E data collection, a national management information system (MIS) covering overall infrastructure and TVET quality support standards, as well as the specific project-funded outcomes; and (ii) an inspection visit and performance review. Organized by GED, an inspection team evaluates the project school performance through reading reports and support documents, meeting with managers and teachers to discuss school management processes, equipment and facilities, competency-based curriculum (CBC) design, learning resource development, information and communication technology, professional development, mechanisms for cooperation between school and enterprises, assessment, short courses for vocational training, international business, technical services, and partnerships with TVET in underdeveloped areas. MOE then arranges a review of the inspection team reports and support documents from the school and/or college by an expert national panel. Follow-up site visits are arranged if anything needs to be confirmed after the MOE review.

7. **Guizhou provincial demonstration vocational college and school projects.** The Guizhou provincial demonstration vocational college project aims to build TVET capacity with funding from both GED and project schools, as well as from cooperative enterprises. The M&E for this project is conducted through a group of inspectors involving site visits and desk review. The inspection team conducts the evaluation of the project school outcome through reading reports, reviewing support materials, meeting with the project managers and teachers to discuss local government support, leadership and management, teacher development, delivery and assessment, teaching quality monitoring and evaluation, CBC design, learning resource development, equipment and facilities, short vocational training courses, technical services, leading activities in the TVET subsector in Guizhou, and third party evaluation. GED arranges the review of final reports and support documents as well as site visits.

8. **National vocational college talent cultivation evaluation system.** This system is based on a national MIS. It measures the performance of TVET education in every tertiary TVET college every 5 years. GED organizes the evaluation process as entrusted by MOE. GED invites specialists for the evaluation team from both within and outside of Guizhou (at least one-third should be from outside Guizhou). The evaluation covers leadership and management, teacher development, curriculum design, practical training support, teaching and student development, curriculum design, learning resource development, information and communication technology, professional development, mechanisms for cooperation between school and enterprises, assessment, short courses for vocational training, international business, technical services, and partnerships with TVET in underdeveloped areas. MOE then arranges a review of the inspection team reports and support documents from the school and/or college by an expert national panel. Follow-up site visits are arranged if anything needs to be confirmed after the MOE review.

---

management, and social influence. In the process of the evaluation, the specialists listen to verbal reports on the overall school operation and curriculum development; conduct a desk review; and interview the managers, teachers, and students, as well as industry and community representatives. A pass or not pass verdict is given after the evaluation, and a follow-up visit is paid by the evaluation specialist team (the same or different specialists could be invited) half a year later to check whether or not progress has been made in implementing the agreed improvement action.

9. **Acceleration of provincial evaluation of development and performance** GED requires an annual performance evaluation with the goal of accelerating the development for GED-managed vocational colleges (TVET and others). The colleges prepare an annual report and performance review in terms of infrastructure improvement, recruitment and employment improvement, majors taught, skills competition awards, dual certifications, vocational training outputs, teacher development (including master teacher development and recruitment of highly qualified teachers), national and international communication and exchanges, and sports and health support for both students and staff. Every year, GED organizes several groups of inspectors to evaluate these colleges through listening to verbal reports; conducting questionnaire surveys of staff, students, and students’ parents; reviewing relevant documents; and conducting site visits to inspect facilities and equipment, as well as school operation. The inspection team will provide a specific qualitative mark, based on set evaluation indicators and standards, and will provide formal feedback to the college.

10. **Other monitoring programs.** These include (i) M&E data collection and report submission required by various GED divisions and local education authorities, as well as schools’ administrative supervision agencies; (ii) school visits by GED divisions and other government agencies; (iii) an annual reporting system of the quality of provincial and institutional talent cultivation for vocational colleges; and (iv) a graduate survey to provide front-line data to support the quality of school operations.

11. The M&E arrangements applicable to the GVEDP schools and colleges are summarized in the table.

### Monitoring and Evaluation Arrangements for GVEDP Schools and Colleges

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description of M&amp;E System</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Relevant To</th>
<th>GED</th>
<th>Non-GED</th>
<th>GED</th>
<th>Non-GED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>National demonstration vocational college projects&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>Not specified</td>
<td>MOE</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provincial demonstration vocational college projects&lt;sup&gt;b&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>Not specified</td>
<td>GED</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National vocational college talent cultivation&lt;sup&gt;c&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>Every 5 years</td>
<td>MOE</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provincial acceleration of development and performance evaluation for GED-managed vocational colleges</td>
<td>Annual</td>
<td>GED</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annual reporting system for quality of provincial and institutional talent cultivation</td>
<td>Annual</td>
<td>GED</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National demonstration vocational school projects&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>Not specified</td>
<td>MOE</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provincial demonstration vocational school projects&lt;sup&gt;b&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>Not specified</td>
<td>GED</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

GED = Guizhou Education Department, M&E = monitoring and evaluation, MOE = Ministry of Education.

Note: Schools and colleges are granted either provincial or national status or both at the same time.

<sup>a</sup> Applies only to colleges applying for and/or already granted national demonstration status.

<sup>b</sup> Applies only to colleges applying for granted provincial demonstration status.

<sup>c</sup> Guizhou’s reviews do not meet the MOE specified requirement.

Source: Guizhou Education Department.
B. Assessment of the Monitoring and Evaluation System

12. The current M&E system exhibits several weaknesses, which are partly caused by the complex and fragmented institutional arrangements for TVET within the GPG and GED. One general weakness is that the M&E system is mostly reliant on the M&E of individual schools rather than of the whole TVET system and of cross-cutting issues that affect either all or multiple schools. Issues include the need to (i) adjust overall provincial TVET capacity, quality, and the balance of majors taught to meet changes in demographics, and student and employer demand; (ii) assess how well TVET serves individual sectors; and (iii) assess the inclusiveness of TVET.

13. Although individual schools included in the GVEDP typically have good local information systems, related data and results do not routinely feed through to a comprehensive TVET MIS within GED. Instead schools make many ad hoc returns to different GED divisions. For example, the GPG has a preferential policy in favor of ethnic minorities so that they can better access TVET, but GED does not have any disaggregated data to enable ethnic minority access to TVET or to measure ethnic minority performance once inside TVET, to determine if the current preferential policy is adequate and effective. Specific observations regarding the design and effectiveness of individual existing M&E arrangements are discussed in paras. 14–17).

14. Provincial demonstration school project. The concept of national demonstration schools was first announced in 2008. The Guizhou provincial demonstration vocational school project started before the national project, so the rationale and the main activities are somewhat different from what MOE expects of a demonstration facility. The provincial demonstration vocational schools focus more on infrastructure improvement than on capacity building, while the national system places more focus on CBC, teacher development, and industry partnerships. In addition, an MIS is not yet established to monitor the continued performance of demonstration schools.

15. National demonstration school project. Although this project considers the overall capacity and performance of candidate schools, it focuses on capacity building based on 3–5 key majors in each school. The strategy is to strengthen the resources, teacher and industry involvement in some key majors as pioneers, with the other majors learning and improving with their experience. In 2014, MOE initiated comprehensive M&E for vocational schools, and three provinces (Chongqing, Guangdong, and Henan) are being piloted. More pilots will be implemented in 2015, but Guizhou has not yet applied to join the pilot program forgoing an early opportunity to assess and improve quality assurance, efficiency, and effectiveness of TVET schools in Guizhou.

16. National vocational college evaluation system for talent cultivation. MOE requires vocational colleges nationwide to accept the evaluation of talent cultivation every 5 years. It was formally started in 2000, and vocational colleges in many provinces have been evaluated twice since then. However, in Guizhou, the vocational colleges have just participated in the first round evaluation; none been involved in the second round, which started after 2008, even though they submit data through the MIS centrally established by MOE. Therefore, this system needs to be reactivated in Guizhou, and consideration given to extending it to secondary schools.

17. Transparency in reporting of school and college performance. MOE actively encourages the transparent reporting of school and college performance reports, and encourages schools and colleges to produce such reports for the benefit of their various stakeholders. Some tertiary colleges in Guizhou already do this, but few, if any, secondary schools do so. GED should stipulate that all provincial and national demonstration schools
prepare such reports annually commencing in 2016 (i.e., reporting on the academic year 2015/16).

C. Managing Risks and Improving Capacity

18. **Fragmentation of monitoring and evaluation activities.** GED does not have adequate institutional capacity to develop and maintain the various M&E systems. In addition, the M&E of the vocational education system is fragmented, with TVET and other GED divisions independently doing their own M&E. Attempts should be made to rationalize the M&E systems used. In particular, GED should review and refine the M&E arrangements for provincial demonstration projects for schools and colleges with a view to better aligning these projects with the equivalent national project.

19. **Analysis of information and preparation of supporting documentation.** GED has access to data for disbursement-linked indicators and results framework reporting, however some of this data requires substantial checking, analysis, and interpretation. GED’s capacity for such reporting is limited and utilized primarily for reporting to MOE and responding to other GPG and national government enquiries. The results-based lending actions of the Asian Development Bank (ADB)-funded program, supported by ADB capacity development technical assistance will strengthen GED’s M&E systems to provide effective TVET results reporting.³ This will include full disaggregation and analysis of gender and ethnic minority data, covering enrollment, majors selected, dropout rates, and average graduation marks (analyzed by major), to allow comprehensive follow-up on any anomalies in ethnic minority or gender access within the TVET system. It will also provide on-the-job capacity building for assessing results that require some analytical interpretation.

20. **Application for MOE’s pilot vocational schools’ diagnosis and improvement monitoring and evaluation program.** MOE’s M&E system for vocational schools, namely the diagnosis and improvement M&E program, covers leadership and management, resources (funding, teachers, equipment, facilities, and information and communication technology), CBC and subject resources, teaching and student management, quality assurance, career and psychological guidance, recruitment and employment, skills competitions, vocational training and technical services, achievements, and awards. To support the diagnosis and improve the M&E program, a national MIS is centrally established, and would be very beneficial for any schools in Guizhou involved in this initiative.

21. **Establishment of a vocational school and college management information system.** Currently, some of the vocational colleges in Guizhou have used the national MIS, but vocational schools have not. GED should establish a comprehensive TVET MIS to monitor the status of RBL program schools (covering the program results framework) and all the other TVET schools and colleges in Guizhou. This would be appropriate to optimally assess impact.

22. **Employer TVET satisfaction surveys.** During program preparation, an employer survey was conducted to ascertain employer views, such as on the quality of TVET graduates, the adequacy of industry (employer)—TVET cooperation mechanisms, and the relevance of skills acquired during TVET. This survey helped to determine the baseline TVET quality performance measure with performance measured separately for the secondary and tertiary TVET. Such surveys could be conducted at an optimal interval of 5 years. GED has organized the next survey for program completion reporting purposes.

---

³ Attached Technical Assistance (accessible from the list of linked documents in Appendix 2 of the Report and Recommendation of the President).