Contents

I. INTRODUCTION .......................................................................................................................... 3
   1. Objective of the Summary Poverty and Social Analysis Report .......................... 3
   2. PSA Methodology and Scope ......................................................................................... 3
   3. GVEDP Background and Scope ................................................................................. 4
   4. Program Beneficiaries .................................................................................................. 4

II. POVERTY AND LABOR ISSUES IN GUIZHOU ............................................................... 5

III. ETHNIC MINORITIES IN GUIZHOU TVET ........................................................................ 6
   1. Ethnic Minority Students ............................................................................................. 6
   2. Ethnic Minority Teachers ........................................................................................... 6
   3. Ethnic minorities related PRC laws and regulations .................................................. 6
   4. Promoting ethnic minority culture in TVET ............................................................... 7
   5. EM education progress and social life in TVET ......................................................... 8
   6. Affordability of TVET for EM students ..................................................................... 8
   7. EM related institutional capacity in TVET ................................................................. 8

IV. GENDER CONCERNS IN TVET ......................................................................................... 9

V. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS ................................................................... 10

I. INTRODUCTION

A. Objective of the Summary Poverty and Social Analysis Report

1. This report summarizes the key findings of the poverty and social analysis (PSA) report focusing on poverty, ethnic minority and gender issues to provide a background for the Program Systems Safeguards Assessment and Program Action Plan actions (PAP).\(^1\)

2. The report discusses the PSA methodology, the Program general context and scope, then analyses the issues of poverty, ethnicity and gender for Guizhou’s Vocational Education Development Program (GVEDP).

B. PSA Methodology and Scope

3. The PSA was conducted through primary and secondary data collection methods. Extensive consultations with all relevant stakeholders, focus group discussions and key informant interviews with project beneficiaries and desk review of relevant documents have been completed.

4. Consultation on social, poverty, ethnicity and gender issues took place through:

(i) a baseline questionnaire for GVEDP all 17 demonstration schools/colleges, to gather statistical data on students and teachers enrolment/recruitment, training courses, internships, scholarships and grants etc.

(ii) A desk review of relevant reports, government documents and research papers;

(iii) about 54 focus group discussions in 6 program schools (2 tertiary TVET colleges, 4 secondary TVET schools)\(^2\) - 9 focus group discussions in each school with 8-10 participants in each group, including female, poor and disabled, ethnic minorities, employed and unemployed graduates, teachers and administrators;

(iv) more than 60 key informant in-depth interviews focusing on key or complex issues, in each school/college having 3-5 interviews with school/college administration and management’s representatives, and another 10 interviews with GED representatives;

(v) a short questionnaire for students (sample size 288, about 45-50 students from each schools/colleges) to study their opinion and views about the TVET and ways of improvement.

5. In addition to the PSA, an employer survey of about 200 employers was conducted by “MyCOS” to identify skills demand in priority industries to provide useful information for the program’s curriculum development activities.\(^3\)

6. An indigenous peoples/ethnic minority safeguards diagnostic assessment\(^4\) was carried out. The assessment process included extensive documents’ review of relevant national and

---

\(^1\) Refer to the detailed PSA report for more in depth analysis.

\(^2\) The 6 schools/colleges were: (1) Secondary TVET schools: Guizhou Provincial Machine and Industry School; Guizhou Province Tourism School; Guizhou Province commercial school; Guizhou Province Water Resource and Hydro Power School. (2) Tertiary TVET colleges: Guizhou Province Transportation School; Guizhou Province Light Industry College.

\(^3\) Survey results still to be finalized.

\(^4\) The diagnostic assessment table is included in Annex 1.
provincial laws and policies, supplemented by meetings and interviews. Those interviewed included GED officials with TVET responsibilities, GED Division of Minority Nationalities Education, TVET program school staff, Guizhou Provincial Minority and Religious Affairs Bureau, Guizhou Women’s Federation, and individual ethnic minority (EM) students and teachers.

C. GVEDP Background and Scope

7. Within the 17 provincial demonstration TVET schools/colleges, the program mainly contributes to 8 schools, 7 of which are in Qingzhen TVET town, including: five secondary TVET schools:

(i) Guizhou School of Economics & Business;
(ii) Guizhou Province Commercial School;
(iii) Guizhou Province Water Resource and Hydro Power School;
(iv) Guizhou Provincial Machine and Industry School; and
(v) Guizhou Province Tourism School; and

Three tertiary TVET colleges:

(i) Guizhou Province Transportation School;
(ii) Guizhou Province Light Industry College (in Huaxi); and
(iii) Guizhou Agriculture & Livestock College.

8. Most schools have completed campus construction and had a partial number of students move in; some schools are still under construction and expected to assign students by September 2015 at the earliest.

9. In present, anybody who wants to study in secondary TVET schools does not need an entrance examination if they meet the basic requirement of age and have a junior middle school diploma. So, in general there are no academic barriers preventing students from entering TVET sector at this level. However, due to 30 years’ implementation of birth control policies and the resulting decline of school-aged children, the total number of TVET students has dropped recently.

10. In 2013, there were 692,015 students in Guizhou’s TVET system of which 475,513 were in the secondary and 216,503 in tertiary TVET. Ethnic minority students comprise 37.6% of the total students. In 2013, more than 90% of secondary TVET enrolments came from Guizhou middle school graduates (over 95% in some schools). Students mainly come from rural areas, and poor or low-income families. The remaining student enrolments came from other provinces. These are children following their migrant worker parents.

11. Guizhou’s TVET development is below the national average, with high student/teacher ratios (up to an average of 36:1) and a shortage of more than 10,000 teachers.

D. Program Beneficiaries

12. Direct beneficiaries of the Program include approximately 117,700 students and 4,500 teachers at the 17 provincial demonstration schools in the program (2014 enrolment data) and other TVET teachers who will receive training. The program will indirectly benefit families of TVET graduates who are predominantly from rural areas, TVET management, industries who
will employ TVET graduates and ultimately indirectly benefit all students and teachers in Guizhou’s TVET system through dissemination of program results and strengthened capacity for TVET reform and modernization.

II. Poverty and Labor issues in Guizhou

13. Guizhou is a landlocked province in the south-western region of the PRC and is amongst the least developed, in terms of socioeconomic development. With reference to Rural Poverty Reduction Development Outline of China (2011–2020), there are 14 contiguous regions in China, which are designated as the target areas for poverty Reduction of the new stage. Guizhou is located in the Yunnan-Guangxi-Guizhou Karst regions and also the core area of this poverty reduction. With a total population of approximately 35 million permanent residents, the province has high level of poverty, especially in rural areas, concentrated mainly in the mountainous region of the western part of the province. Five million of its total population work as migrant workers in other provinces. Because of its geographic condition, with mountains and hills making up almost 93% of its total land area, public services lag far behind the national average. Guizhou has 9.23 million rural population below the national poverty line of CNY2,300 ($370) per year.\(^5\) Despite possessing a rapidly growing economy, the province is considered poor with the lowest per capita gross domestic product (GDP) in the country, low levels of industrialization and economic growth that is still largely reliant on agricultural and traditional services. However, the provincial government has ambitious plans to modernize and diversify the local economy, in order to close the gap in economic output relative to richer provinces.

14. With China’s increasing wealth divide, developing the TVET’s system is one of Guizhou’s vital poverty reduction strategies, as graduates can improve their families’ economic situation. This focus is reflected in the Government of China’s National Reform priorities and the Guizhou Provincial Government’s (GPG) planning priorities.\(^6\) By 2020, the Guizhou provincial government aims to increase secondary TVET students’ numbers to equal those in high school with the gross enrolment rate of secondary school education to reach 90% (78% in 2014).

15. Located in China’s southwest, many of Guizhou’s workers move southeast to the Pearl River Delta industrial zone or north to Yangtze River delta. However, with China’s rising labor costs, manufacturing industries from China’s east coast are moving to middle and western regions such as Guizhou. To benefit from the transfer of labor-intensive industry from China’s east to west, the Guizhou government is prioritizing strategies to become a strong industrial province, including with developing technical and vocational education and training (TVET) for a qualified labor force.

16. Currently, Guizhou is facing a severe shortage of highly skilled workers in priority sectors and emerging areas reflecting issues of TVET capacity and quality in responding to the economy’s changing human resource needs. With the focus on TVET to cultivate skilled talent for a qualified labor force and with over 80% of the students in the GVEDP schools from rural areas, the program has a strong pro-poor focus. Strengthening TVET to develop a technically competent graduate workforce is an important poverty reduction strategy for Guizhou.


III. Ethnic Minorities in Guizhou TVET

A. Ethnic Minority Students

17. Guizhou has a large proportion of ethnic minorities (EM), making up about 35% of the total population. The major EM groups accounting for more than one million are Miao, Buyi, Tujia and Dong, with population of 3.99 million, 2.51 million, 1.44 million and 1.43 million respectively. A large proportion of EM people live in rural and mountainous areas characterized by a prevalence of household poverty. The overall educational and occupational prospects and attainment for EM students in rural areas are much the same as those of their poor Han neighbors. Because primary education in rural areas is poorer in quality than in urban areas, rural students fare less well on college-level examinations and are underrepresented in university admissions (despite preferential policies benefitting EM students). As a consequence, EM students rely more upon the less-competitive TVET school system (in which their enrolment rate is proportional to the EM share of the provincial population).

18. The PSA confirmed that the PRC has a supportive policy framework for ethnic minorities. With about 38% of TVET students and 30% of teachers from different EM groups, there are no apparent barriers to inclusion and participation of EM in TVET. TVET schools provide facilities that are EM-sensitive where relevant (e.g., special food provision, cultural activities). Whilst there are no EM-specific courses or majors, in the tourism sector aspects of local culture are adequately covered.

19. There is no difference between secondary and tertiary enrolment rate for ethnic minority students. The secondary TVET system has in Guizhou province 475513 students, of which ethnic minority students accounting for 37.8%; and the tertiary TVET system has 216503 students, of which ethnic minority students accounting for 37.2%. In 2014, the ethnic minority students enrolled in all 17 project schools accounts for 35.1% of total students. However, there are some variations in enrolment rate of ethnic minority students among those 17 schools. For example, in 2013, the highest enrolment rate was 69.5% for Guizhou Inner Trading School, and the lowest was 4.8% in Guizhou Economic School. In 2014, the highest enrolment rate (61%) still was for Guizhou Inner Trading School, with, and lowest (18%) for Trade and Economic school. However, there is already some increase in number of students entering Trade and Economic school.

B. Ethnic Minority Teachers

20. In total, the ethnic minority teachers in Guizhou TVET system account for about 25% which is a bit less than EM share in total number of population. There are no significant differences in EM teacher’s representation in secondary and tertiary TVET schools (secondary TVET -26.4% and tertiary TVET - 23.5%). The picture is almost the same in the GVEDP 17 schools (ethnic minority teachers account for 24.0%, not including three schools where ethnicity disaggregated data were not available).

C. Ethnic minorities related PRC laws and regulations

21. The desk analysis of PRC relevant laws and regulations shows that there are equal opportunities for EMs, including equitable access to education. The Guizhou education system tries to be inclusive and accessible for ethnic minorities through the bilingual teaching, with a focus on teaching facilities and supporting teacher’s training. According to relevant national laws
and regulations, in ethnic minority living areas, bilingual teaching should be used in preschool education and from grade one to grade three in primary school education for ethnic minority students. Because EM students generally are located in remote areas and often speak Mandarin Chinese as a second language, their educational attainment lags that of the Han majority. Both the PRC Compulsory Education Law and the Vocational Education Law contain specific provisions promoting improved educational attainment for EMs. The Compulsory Education Law and the PRC Teachers Law provide similar inducements for hiring of minority teachers. Though most laws and policies regarding EMs support officially established EM autonomous areas (at provincial, prefecture, or county level), some preferential policies also benefit EM individuals. Among these are a policy providing a supplement to university examination scores for EM applicants. At the national level, there are also several scholarship and subsidy programs intended to make higher education more affordable to rural students, though these are not targeted specifically at EM students. National policy dictates that tuition at TVET secondary schools is free, although accommodation and other charges can still apply.

22. Guizhou Province has regulations and policies that are compatible with, and intended to facilitate the implementation of, national laws and policies. Some Guizhou regulations include preferential policies for EM students in excess of what is required by national law. Guizhou policy, for example, provides for adding 10 points to university examination scores of some urban resident EM secondary school graduates, and 20 points to scores of rural EM students, levels which are above the national norm. Despite this preference, EM students are underrepresented in university admissions, making them relatively more reliant on the less competitive TVET school system.

23. In addition to above mentioned regulations, Guizhou Province launched a special program aimed at the promotion of TVET development in ethnic minority areas, which envisage higher subsidies and better career development opportunities for teachers to encourage them working in these schools. According to that program, there should be one TVET school for every three to four counties. Currently the focus is on developing the Qingzhen TVET town and subsidies for TVET students (not specifically EM).

D. Promoting ethnic minority culture in TVET

24. As a province with high ethnic minorities, EM culture is a very important resource for Guizhou Province. It is one of the key elements in local social and economic development, especially in the area of tourism development. The Guizhou Provincial vocational education development plan also recognizes the importance of promoting majors/courses and human resource development related to ethnic minority. However, the plan is still to be implemented.

25. Since 1980s, Guizhou Province had been implementing several activities to promote ethnic and folk culture into school’s education. Several policies, such as “Regulations of Guizhou Province on the Protection of Ethnic and Folk Culture”, “Implementation Opinions on Promoting Ethnic and Folk Culture Education in all kinds of Schools” were adopted to support these initiatives. According to these policies and regulations which cover primary up to tertiary education, ethnic and folk culture (including ethnic and folk dancing, music, sports, language and other kinds of intangible cultural heritages) have become a part of schools’ extracurricular activities, including secondary TVET. However, it is not clear how widely this has been adopted by most schools.

---

7 This provision applies to students from Guiyang, Zhunyi, and Anshun cities only.
8 From RMB8,000 to RMB12,000 per student
26. According to the interviews in 6 schools, there are no EM related special majors and courses in their school except for Guizhou Tourism School, where ethnic and folk culture and skills, such as music, dancing, cooking and dressing, ethnic and folk sports, architectural, handicrafts and so on are incorporated.

E. **EM education progress and social life in TVET**

27. In general, there are no major differences for students’ daily life and management between ethnic minorities and Han students. Students’ training and internship are not affected by ethnicity. However, in some cases ethnic minority culture and habits are taken into account by the schools and industries.

28. The PSA confirmed that TVET schools provide facilities that are EM-sensitive when relevant (e.g., special food provision, cultural activities). For example, the schools or colleges, with a large number of Hui students, create special conditions for them by opening a canteen providing a halal food or a window in the canteen. If the number of Hui students is not big, then the schools may provide only cooking facilities for them. The schools and colleges will instruct also the industries about the Hui students’ habits when arranging training and internship.

F. **Affordability of TVET for EM students**

29. In Guizhou, educational prospects and attainment are determined much more by rural-urban status than by ethnic identity. However, EM people are currently under-represented amongst the urban population. The primary education afforded rural students is generally poorer in quality than in urban areas, and a small proportion of EM students also have language limitations as an additional obstacle to overcome. In Guizhou, about 36% of the population is EM, with enrolment of EM students generally ranging from 30–40% in TVET secondary and tertiary schools.

30. Ethnic minority students are not eligible for subsidies unless they are poor. There are no preferential policies enacted specifically to benefit EM students within the TVET system. However, Guizhou policy provides that most TVET secondary school students from rural areas are not charged for living expenses, as well as receiving (with some exceptions) free tuition. Rural students attending tertiary-level TVET schools may seek financial assistance in the form of grants, scholarships, subsidies and work-study arrangements, though these are not specifically allocated to EM students. Some TVET tertiary schools also subsidize living costs for at least some poor rural students.

G. **EM related institutional capacity in TVET**

31. The EM diagnostic assessment found that the various schools within the TVET system manage program aspects affecting EM students in varying ways, with little involvement of GED. While GED has begun to solicit “demand side” information from industry about potential skills gaps, the system appears to lack any systematic means to assess “supply side” views of performance from students or teachers. The TVET system also lacks any explicit focus on EM students’ enrolment, performance and graduation. At present, there is no system in place, for example, to consult with EM students regarding their TVET preferences or concerns, or to obtain their ex-post assessment of the quality and relevance of their educational experience. The TVET system as a whole appears to have problems with poor coordination and information management. Each TVET school collects data regarding student enrolment and performance,
that is both gender and EM disaggregated, however the level of information system sophistication can vary from school to school, especially amongst secondary schools. Meanwhile the GED, including its Minority Nationalities Education Division does not make systematic use of ethnic-disaggregated school-level data. Data and information management should be strengthened so that reliable and consistent information regarding EM student enrolment, educational attainment and graduation is obtained by TVET schools and assessed at the TVET system level.

H. Gender concerns in TVET

32. In general there is a broad gender balance in the overall students’ numbers (female students representation is about 43% (2013), and 50% (2014) respectively, at the 17 TVET schools and/or colleges). There are no substantial differences in female students’ enrolment in secondary and tertiary TVET schools/colleges. However, there are some obvious gender differences in selection of schools and majors. Female students are under-represented in engineering technology related schools and/or majors but well represented in the finance, economics, commercial, forestry, and domestic trade schools of Guizhou. Guizhou School of Finance has the highest percentage of female students at 72.5% while the lowest percentage of female students is Guizhou Province Water Resource and Hydro Power at 17.8%.

33. Another issue is the unequal employment opportunity for women depending on the industry sphere. Some employers hesitate to recruit women for certain traditionally ‘male’ dominated fields such as cooking, engineering, and manufacturing. This situation leads to gender differences in enrolment, employment, and internship availability. However, according to employer survey results, in terms of average recruitment size, there is no significant difference between male and female hires. On average, salaries for female employees are on par with salaries for male employees. The gender gap in salary raises is larger for more educated employees (i.e. vocational college graduates) than less educated ones (i.e., secondary vocational school graduates).

34. According to the same survey, 56% of employers do not have preferences for hiring male or female graduates, 24% prefer males, and 20% prefer females. Based on this overall statistic, gender equality seems not to be a significant issue in the recruitment of vocational graduates. Of the 24% of employers prefer hiring males, 92% argue that male graduates are more qualified (with better academic performance or better work-related skills/knowledge), and 83% attribute their preferences to specific requirements of the job (i.e. physical labor).

35. Female teachers are also well represented in the TVET. However, there are some variations among different schools. For instance, Guizhou School of tourism has the most female teachers with the percentage of 68.4%; while Guizhou school of agricultural electronics has only 20%. In the Guizhou Vocational School of Industry Technology with lower percentage of female students (25%), the percentage of female teachers is relatively higher (57.1%).

36. Despite female teachers’ proportional representation in TVET, there is under representation in management level jobs in the TVET institutions (less than 30% in the six program schools surveyed). The training for the teachers to move into management/administration and professional development is often intensive and requires extended time away from home. As a result, female teachers typically take longer to earn higher ranks and are far less likely to have senior management or leadership positions.
IV. Conclusions and Recommendations

37. Guizhou is a landlocked province in the southwestern region of the PRC and is amongst the least developed, in terms of socioeconomic development. With a total population of approximately 35 million permanent residents, the province has high levels of poverty, especially in rural areas, concentrated mainly in the mountainous region of the western part of the province. Guizhou has 9.23 million rural population below the national poverty line of CNY2,300 ($370) per year. Despite possessing a rapidly growing economy, the province is considered poor with the lowest per capita gross domestic product (GDP) in the country, low levels of industrialization and economic growth that is still largely reliant on agricultural and traditional services. However, the provincial government has ambitious plans to modernize and diversify the local economy, in order to close the gap in economic output relative to richer provinces.

38. Guizhou province has introduced a number of measures aiming to promote socio-economic development and poverty reduction in the development planning and policy, such as "Poverty Reduction Program for the Development of Guizhou Province". Promotion of vocational education is one of the important measures for poverty reduction. This focus is reflected in the Government of China’s national reform priorities and the Guizhou Provincial Government’s (GPG) planning priorities.

39. Guizhou has a large proportion of ethnic minorities (EM), making up about 35% of the total population. The major EM groups accounting for more than one million are Miao, Buyi, Tujia, and Dong. A large proportion of EM people live in rural and mountainous areas characterized by a prevalence of household poverty. The overall educational and occupational prospects and attainment for EM students in rural areas are much the same as those of their poor nonminority neighbors. Because primary education in rural areas is poorer in quality than in urban areas, rural students fare less well on college-level examinations and are underrepresented in university admissions (despite preferential policies benefitting EM students). As a consequence, EM students rely more upon the less-competitive TVET school system (in which their enrolment rate is proportional to the EM share of the provincial population).

40. The PRC has a supportive policy framework for ethnic minorities. With about 38% of TVET students and 30% of teachers from different EM groups, there are no policy barriers to inclusion and participation of EM in TVET (TVET schools provide facilities that are EM-sensitive where relevant (e.g., special food provision, cultural activities)). However, for EM’s, especially from remote poor rural areas there may be other social and economic barriers including language, education quality, cost of living, better employment opportunities.

41. Though EM students are proportionally represented in the TVET system, EM student enrolment rates vary substantially from school to school. Also, EM teacher and staff employment is somewhat lower than the EM share in the general population. The significance of these variations should be further assessed.

42. The TVET system as a whole appears burdened by poor coordination and information management. Each TVET school collects data regarding student enrolment and performance, that is both gender and EM disaggregated, however the level of information system sophistication can vary from school to school, especially amongst secondary schools. Measures to promote improved information management and improved consultation with EM students (and teachers) should be taken to inform GED and school leadership. GED Minority
43. There is a broad gender balance in the overall students’ numbers (female students representation is about 43% (2013), and 50% (2014) respectively, at the 17 TVET schools and/or colleges). There are no substantial differences in female students’ enrolment in secondary and tertiary TVET schools/colleges. However, there are some obvious gender differences in selection of schools and majors. Female students are under-represented in engineering technology related schools and/or majors but well represented in the finance, economics, commercial, forestry, and domestic trade schools of Guizhou.

44. Situation is similar with female teachers. They are also well represented in the TVET. However, there are some variations among different schools. In addition, female teachers are underrepresented in management level jobs. Therefore, it is important to set gender targets for teachers training and management training to promote women’s participation in TVET.
### Annex 1

**Comparative Analysis of ADB Indigenous Peoples Policy Principles and GVEDP Implementation Framework**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ADB Safeguard Policy Principle</th>
<th>Corresponding Legal Provisions</th>
<th>GVEDP Procedure and Practice</th>
<th>Recommended Gap-filling Measures</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(1) Screen early on to determine (i) whether Indigenous Peoples are present in, or have collective attachment to, the project area; and (ii) whether project impacts on Indigenous Peoples are likely.</td>
<td>PRC laws provide no formal requirement for early screening for Indigenous Peoples (or for the 55 officially recognized “Minority Nationalities” in China.) The concept of “collective attachment” is partly reflected in official designation of minority autonomous areas (region, prefecture or county).</td>
<td>Within GVEDP, early screening is most as most of the physical areas in use for the program were determined prior to the beginning of program preparation. Though impacts on ethnic minority students (and teachers) are expected to be positive, program data management requirements will monitor participation of ethnic minority students and teachers in TVET demonstration schools.</td>
<td>No measures relating to early screening are necessary for the GVEDP.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) Undertake a culturally appropriate and gender-sensitive social impact assessment or use similar methods to assess potential project impacts, both positive and adverse, on Indigenous Peoples. Give full consideration to options the affected Indigenous Peoples prefer in relation to the provision of project benefits and the design of mitigation measures. Identify social and economic benefits for affected Indigenous Peoples that are culturally appropriate and gender and intergenerationally inclusive and develop measures to avoid, minimize, and/or mitigate adverse impacts on Indigenous Peoples.</td>
<td>Social impact assessment guidelines have been in place in China since the 1990s. But there are no specific social impact assessment requirements relating to cultural appropriateness or gender sensitivity, or for specific positive or negative impacts affecting Indigenous Peoples. Social impact assessment guidance is intended as advisory; there are no specific requirements that findings or conclusions relating to adverse impacts, and specifically relating to adverse impacts on ethnic minorities, result in development of measures for avoidance, minimization or mitigation.</td>
<td>For the GVEDP, a Poverty and Social Analysis has been conducted by ADB, from which a summary IP diagnostic assessment has been prepared. As there is little likelihood of adverse physical impacts being imposed upon minority communities, the focus of the assessment process was on (i) determining the equitability of ethnic minority access to TVET demonstration schools, (ii) the cultural appropriateness of the TVET demonstration schools, and (iii) effectiveness of TVET management in monitoring system performance as it relates to ethnic minority students and teachers.</td>
<td>No measures relating to social impact assessment are necessary for the GVEDP.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3) Undertake meaningful consultations with affected Indigenous Peoples communities and concerned Indigenous Peoples organizations to solicit their participation (i) in designing, implementing, and No requirements for formal consultation with ethnic minority communities. No requirements to provide capacity development measures for potentially affected ethnic minority communities.</td>
<td>For the GVEDP, ethnic minority students (and teachers) have been consulted during program preparation. With regard to (i), no adverse impacts are anticipated.</td>
<td>For the GVEDP, the TVET system will establish specific ethnic minority targets for teacher training (30%) and management training (20%). Also, TVET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADB Safeguard Policy Principle</td>
<td>Corresponding Legal Provisions</td>
<td>GVEDP Procedure and Practice</td>
<td>Recommended Gap-filling Measures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>monitoring measures to avoid adverse impacts or, when avoidance is not possible, to minimize, mitigate, or compensate for such effects; and (ii) in tailoring project benefits for affected Indigenous Peoples communities in a culturally appropriate manner. To enhance Indigenous Peoples' active participation, projects affecting them will provide for culturally appropriate and gender inclusive capacity development. Establish a culturally appropriate and gender inclusive grievance mechanism to receive and facilitate resolution of the Indigenous Peoples' concerns.</td>
<td>No specific requirements to establish grievance mechanisms to facilitate resolution of ethnic minority concerns.</td>
<td>With regard to (ii), the objective of the GVEDP promotes expansion of capacity, in the form of improving employment prospects for ethnic minority students (among other students) through improvements to the TVET school system. At present, the TVET system has not established specific targets for ethnic minorities in teacher training or management training. With regard to (iii), each of the 17 TVET schools included in the GVEDP has an on-campus “suggestion box” system available to students (or teachers) with complaints. Information about system effectiveness appears to be weak.</td>
<td>data management and analysis will be strengthened with regard to gender and ethnic minority performance. The GVEDP will include measures to strengthen information about the availability and procedures of the school complaints resolution process.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(4) Ascertain the consent of affected Indigenous Peoples communities to the following project activities: (i) commercial development of the cultural resources and knowledge of Indigenous Peoples; (ii) physical displacement from traditional or customary lands; and (iii) commercial development of natural resources within customary lands under use that would impact the livelihoods or the cultural, ceremonial, or spiritual uses that define the identity and community of Indigenous Peoples. For the purposes of policy application, the consent of affected Indigenous Peoples communities refers to a collective expression by the affected Indigenous Peoples communities, through individuals and/or their recognized representatives, of broad community support for such project activities. Broad community support may exist even if some | There are no legal requirements to obtain consent of affected ethnic minority communities for project activities that would involve commercial development of their cultural resources or knowledge, that would include physical displacement from traditional or customary lands, or that would include commercial development of natural resources within customary lands under use that would impact the livelihoods or the cultural, ceremonial, or spiritual uses that define the identity and community of ethnic minorities. | This is not relevant in the GVEDP context. Improvements to the TVET school system do not involve commercial development of ethnic minority cultural resources or knowledge, physical displacement of ethnic minority communities from traditional or customary lands, or commercial development of natural resources within customary lands that would impact the livelihoods or the cultural, ceremonial, or spiritual uses that define the identity and community of ethnic minorities. | No measures relating to IP consent are necessary for the GVEDP. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ADB Safeguard Policy Principle</th>
<th>Corresponding Legal Provisions</th>
<th>GVEDP Procedure and Practice</th>
<th>Recommended Gap-filling Measures</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>individuals or groups object to the project activities.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(5) Avoid, to the maximum extent possible, any restricted access to and physical displacement from protected areas and natural resources. Where avoidance is not possible, ensure that the affected Indigenous Peoples communities participate in the design, implementation, and monitoring and evaluation of management arrangements for such areas and natural resources and that their benefits are equitably shared.</td>
<td>PRC laws do not specifically require avoidance, to the maximum extent possible, of restrictions on ethnic minorities’ access to, and physical displacement of ethnic minority communities from, protected areas and natural resources. There are no specific legal provisions ensuring that affected ethnic minority communities can participate in the design, implementation, and monitoring and evaluation of management arrangements for such protected areas and natural resources. And there are no specific provisions ensuring that affected ethnic minority share equitably in benefits derived from such projects.</td>
<td>Issues relating to displacement from, or restricted access to, protected areas and natural resources are not relevant in the GVEDP. While some ethnic minority households have been displaced as a result of prior TVET school site acquisition in Huaxi, ADB’s due diligence review established that they had been residing in ethnically heterogeneous communities and have been resettled in an appropriate manner.</td>
<td>No measures relating to restricted access to, or physical displacement from protected areas and natural resources are necessary for the GVEDP.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(6) Prepare an Indigenous Peoples Plan (IPP) that is based on the social impact assessment with the assistance of qualified and experienced experts and that draw on indigenous knowledge and participation by the affected Indigenous Peoples communities. The IPP includes a framework for continued consultation with the affected Indigenous Peoples communities during project implementation; specifies measures to ensure that Indigenous Peoples receive culturally appropriate benefits; identifies measures to avoid, minimize, mitigate, or compensate for any adverse project impacts; and includes culturally appropriate grievance procedures, monitoring and evaluation arrangements, and a budget and time-bound actions for implementing the planned</td>
<td>There is no requirement to prepare an IPP, or a corresponding plan focusing specifically on relevant ethnic minorities within the program area.</td>
<td>For the GVEDP, program design measures are in place to provide culturally appropriate access to TVET education, and for continuing (informal) consultation with ethnic minority students (and teachers) during the course of the program. No separate budgets are necessary as measures are part of program design.</td>
<td>Specific measures incorporated into the GVEDP Program Action Plan, or other actions to be undertaken with CDTA support, include: (i) measures to strengthen data management as relevant to equitable access of, and benefits of TVET participation for, ethnic minority students and teachers, (ii) analysis and reporting on variable ethnic minority student enrollment in the TVET demonstration schools, and (iii) devising a training plan with specified targets for ethnic minority participation in teacher and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADB Safeguard Policy Principle</td>
<td>Corresponding Legal Provisions</td>
<td>GVEDP Procedure and Practice</td>
<td>Recommended Gap-filling Measures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>measures.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>management training opportunities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(7) Disclose a draft IPP, including documentation of the consultation process and the results of the social impact assessment in a timely manner, before project appraisal, in an accessible place and in a form and language(s) understandable to affected indigenous peoples communities and other stakeholders. The final IPP and its updates will also be disclosed to the affected Indigenous Peoples communities and other stakeholders.</td>
<td>Not required under PRC laws as there is no requirement to prepare a plan.</td>
<td>As the GVEDP will be processed by ADB as a Results-Based Lending operation, a Program Safeguards System Assessment summarizing issues and actions regarding ethnic minorities in the program will be disclosed by ADB prior to formal appraisal. The IP diagnostic assessment (and broader Poverty and Social Analysis) are also to be made available to the public.</td>
<td>Under RBL requirements, ADB to disclose relevant information for the GVEDP.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(8) Prepare an action plan for legal recognition of customary rights to lands and territories or ancestral domains when the project involves (i) activities that are contingent on establishing legally recognized rights to lands and territories that Indigenous Peoples have traditionally owned or customarily used or occupied, or (ii) involuntary acquisition of such lands.</td>
<td>China has no constitutional or legal provisions for establishing legal recognition of customary rights to lands and territories or ancestral domains of Indigenous Peoples. Legal provisions are in place for establishment of minority nationality areas (regions, prefectures or counties), though these have been rarely used in recent decades and are not associated with a project preparation process.</td>
<td>Not relevant in the GVEDP context.</td>
<td>No measures relating to preparation of an action plan for legal recognition are necessary for the GVEDP.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(9) Monitor implementation of the IPP using qualified and experienced experts; adopt a participatory monitoring approach, wherever possible; and assess whether the IPP’s objective and desired outcome have been achieved, taking into account the baseline conditions and the results of IPP monitoring. Disclose monitoring reports.</td>
<td>As PRC laws have no requirements for preparation of project-related plans focusing on relevant ethnic minorities, there are no requirements relating to monitoring or evaluation of same, or for disclosure of monitoring reports.</td>
<td>Though no specific ethnic minorities plan will be prepared for the GVEDP, arrangements are necessary for monitoring their equitable access to program benefits, and for evaluating program performance with regard to ethnic minority students (and teachers).</td>
<td>Measures to strengthen TVET system performance monitoring and analysis are included in program design. Ethnically disaggregated school-level performance data will be obtained annually and analyzed relating to enrollment, dropout, graduation and employment rates. Annual summary reports are also required.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>