

## LESSONS FROM SELF-EVALUATION (SELECTED INTERVENTIONS, 1969–2010)

Year	Project	Lesson
<b>Finding 1: Projects need to spend more time on project preparation, detailed design and procurement, capacity development, and analytical work</b>		
1969	Samoa Faleolo Airport and Road	International procurement procedures should be simplified for small isolated countries
1971	Samoa Beef Cattle Pilot Project	Project preparation was inadequate
1972	Samoa Telecommunications Project	Initial strengthening of capacity was relevant given installation of sophisticated technology
1973	Tonga Telecommunications Project	Risk of high international bid prices in isolated countries should be assessed at appraisal
1977	Tonga Small Industries Center	Preparatory feasibility study and TA for initial implementation were important factors in project success
1985	Samoa Multi-Project Loan	Good project preparation should include a thorough assessment of institutional capacity
1985	Vanuatu Multi-Project Loan	Given limited capacity, ADB should have rigorously prepared and appraised subprojects
1988	Tonga Fourth Multi-Project	ADB should provide additional guidance and supervision throughout the project's life
1990	Tonga Fisheries Development	Prior to the project, ADB should have helped the government to develop appropriate policies
1991	Samoa Power Sector	Adequate resources need to be provided for project preparation
1993	FSM Fisheries Development Project	A thorough analysis of the public policy setting should have preceded project design and implementation
1994	Cook Islands Education Project	At appraisal, ADB accurately assessed limited capacity and provided ADTA to strengthen institutional capacity
1994	Tonga Transport Infrastructure	Staff with deep knowledge of Tonga's transport infrastructure led the review mission and supervisory work
1999	Vanuatu Cyclone Emergency Rehabilitation	Appraisal missions need adequate resourcing to reduce potential delays in loan effectiveness
2001	Cook Islands Waste Water Management	A strong PMU and active Ministry of Works involvement were key to project success
2001	RMI Fiscal and Financial Management	The improved design of the program is attributed to a more consultative and participatory process
2003	RMI Outer Island Transport Infrastructure	More engineering resources, detailed designs, and bid documents should be part of the PPTA
2010	Samoa Economic Recovery Support Loan	Greater consultation would improve policy analysis, impact assessment, and implementation
<b>Finding 2: Inadequate attention to capacity and organizational weaknesses are the main causes of implementation failures</b>		
1973	Samoa First Power Project	ADB's monitoring arrangements, loan administration, and supervision were not sufficient
1977	Samoa Coconut Oil Mill	The use of local staff was an operational constraint because suitable local staff were not readily available
1977	Samoa Agricultural Development	The EA was stretched beyond limits and did not receive appropriate institutional strengthening
1979	Tonga Multi-Project Loan	Constraints on local expertise in Tonga demand closer ADB attention and assistance

Year	Project	Lesson
1979	Samoa Second Power Project	There were difficulties in recruiting and retaining qualified technical and managerial staff
1980	Cook Islands Multi-Project Loan	Timely deployment of manpower, equipment and materials proved too difficult for implementing agencies
1982	Cook Islands Development Bank	TA for institutional building was recommended in the post-evaluation report
1983	Vanuatu Agriculture Extension and Training	Broad-based institution building TA should have preceded this project
1984	Kiribati Shipyard	Project design should take into account the limited and only slowly improving technical and managerial capabilities of Pacific countries
1985	Vanuatu Multi-Project Loan	ADB did little to augment the government's limited capability and resources
1986	Kiribati Power	Limiting the number of missions in the early stages of the project meant ADB was not able to provide assistance to this EA's first loan
1987	Cook Islands Second Multi-Project Loan	Capacity building in project implementation arrangements is needed over the entire implementation period
1987	Vanuatu Santo Port	TA should have been attached to strengthen implementing agency's ability to comply with covenants
1988	Tonga Fourth Multi-Project	Promotes efficient use of ADB resources, but places significant administrative burden on government
1990	Cook Islands Outer Islands Telecommunications	EA staff should have been trained in ADB procurement procedures before loan approval
1991	Samoa Power Sector	Procurement and implementation capacity were weak but not identified in the RRP
1991	RMI Fisheries Development Project	It is clear that policy and reform should have preceded any investment in fisheries
1991	Tonga Power Development	Early inception mission should be mandatory, especially for Pacific countries with limited knowledge of ADB procedures
1993	FSM Fisheries Development Project	Skill capabilities of the various departments were overestimated at appraisal
1993	RMI Emergency Typhoon Rehabilitation Assistance	Emergency loans should be simple and avoid complicated procedures
1993	RMI Basic Education Development	Capacity needs to be assessed during appraisal; longer implementation periods should be considered
1993	RMI Majuro Water Supply	Implementation took longer than anticipated due to weak capability; a heavy TA component was needed to offset this
1994	RMI Health and Population Project	Project design made an overoptimistic assessment of what might realistically be achieved
1994	Cook Islands Pearl Industry Development Project	Very weak capacity of the IA, and lack of support from the island council
1996	Vanuatu Urban Infrastructure	Limited institutional capacity meant this project was too complex and diverse
1995	Tonga Outer Island Agricultural Development	Significant capacity constraints need ongoing support for change to encourage ministry restructuring
1997	RMI Public Sector Reform Program	There was little consultation during loan design or implementation
1998	Vanuatu Comprehensive Reform Program	The Program underestimated the severe capacity constraints
1998	Kiribati Public Health	Organizational change requires time; support must continue to maintain progress and fully embed organizational changes

Year	Project	Lesson
1999	RMI Ebeve health and infrastructure	Minimal problems encountered because stakeholder consultations were carried out during project preparation
1999	Vanuatu Cyclone Emergency Rehabilitation	Pacific island countries often have limited capacities to meet ADB's loan processing requirements
2000	RMI Skills Training and Vocational Education	Managerial, administrative, and technical capacity of institutions should be considered from the start
2001	FSM Private Sector Development Program	Capacity assessment and skills development were needed to enhance implementation and reduce delays
2003	RMI Outer Island Transport Infrastructure	One aspect of a small and remote economy is the very limited capacity for undertaking construction work
2004	Tuvalu Maritime Training	A realistic and comprehensive assessment of capacity should have been conducted during project preparation
2009	Tonga Economic Support Program	Policy actions needed to match capacity
<b>Finding 3: Socioeconomic and policy analysis needs to be informed by policy dialogue, wide consultation, participation, and understanding of local culture</b>		
1980	Samoa Forestry Development	Project design would have benefited from cultural analysis of land tenure aspects and participation of matais (leaders)
1981	Tonga Second Multi-Project Loan	Rigorous scrutiny of projects, their technical feasibility and economic and financial viability are critically important
1983	Vanuatu Agricultural Extension and Training	New initiatives should be adapted to the local sociocultural environment and be piloted first
1985	Samoa Multi-Project Loan	The views of potential beneficiaries should be incorporated into project design
1985	Vanuatu Multi-Project Loan	For the siting of wharves and landing stages, careful consultation with communities is needed
1987	Cook Islands Second Multi-Project Loan	Overly optimistic crop yields needed to take in account cultural attitudes towards crop husbandry practices
1990	Tonga Fisheries Development	Using the knowledge of managers and directors would have created a sense of ownership
1991	RMI Fisheries Development Project	Long-standing macroeconomic and sector policy deficiencies in RMI fisheries remained unresolved during the project
1993	FSM Fisheries Development Project	A design and appraisal weakness was the complete lack of attention to analyzing the policy-enabling environment
1994	Cook Islands Pearl Industry Development	More attention should have been paid to the important component of community organization
1994	RMI Health and Population	Executing agency participation in formulating strategies is needed to ensure sustained support for project objectives
1995	Tonga Outer Island Agricultural Development	The expectations of the private sector far exceeded their ability to deliver
1995	RMI Majuro Water Supply and Sanitation	A major problem was the lack of adequate consultation with the local community and the utility
1996	FSM Water Supply and Sanitation	A public education program to improve community understanding of benefits should have been developed
1997	RMI Public Sector Reform Program	Overoptimistic assumptions of private sector ability to replace government as the engine of economic growth
1998	Kiribati Public Health	Cultural impacts on outcomes; local custom and traditional practice dictated a less-than-effective higher-cost approach
1998	Nauru Fiscal and Financial Reform Program	Reforms should be implemented, and monitored in as participatory and transparent manner as possible

Year	Project	Lesson
1998	Vanuatu Comprehensive Reform Program	Wide consultation built understanding, allowing stakeholders to reassess goals and make adjustments
1999	Tuvalu Island Development Program	Every resident had a stake in implementation and their understanding of the program was important
2000	Samoa Education Sector Project	Well-designed community-based social marketing is useful to support education and behavioral changes
2000	FSM Basic Social Services	Consultations during design and preparation would help to identify the most appropriate activities and arrangements
2000	RMI Skills Training and Vocational Education	Outreach programs are not efficient since economy of scale in service delivery is difficult to achieve
2001	FSM Private Sector Development Program	Dialogue with policy makers and legislators may have helped maintain the impetus for change
2001	RMI Fiscal and Financial Management	The improved design of the program can be attributed to a more consultative and participatory process
2002	Tonga Economic and Public Sector Reform Program	Careful country analysis and diagnosis are essential to identify and prioritize ADB interventions
2003	RMI Outer Island Transport Infrastructure	ADB could have anticipated difficulties and acted sooner to limit its and RMI's exposure
<b>Finding 4: Adequate monitoring and supervision is important for project success</b>		
1971	Samoa Beef Cattle Pilot Project	Frequent review missions by ADB staff would have quickly identified problem areas
1973	Samoa First Power Project	ADB monitoring arrangements, loan administration and supervision were not sufficient
1977	Samoa WSTEC Agricultural Development Project	One mission per annum appears to have been inadequate
1980	Cook Islands Multi-Project Loan	More frequent missions may have shortened the overall period of project implementation
1985	Vanuatu Multi-Project Loan	Construction supervision of subprojects was not sufficient
1988	Tonga Fourth Multi-Project	More diligence and responsiveness during project preparation and early implementation would have avoided delays
1991	Samoa Power Sector	ADB review missions did not appear to have the required expertise to conduct a policy dialogue on EPC's financial performance
1991	RMI Fisheries Development Project	ADB soon lost touch with critical aspects; importance of monitoring cannot be overemphasized
1993	RMI Emergency Typhoon Rehabilitation	With more review missions, misunderstandings could have been easily avoided
1993	RMI Basic Education Development Project	ADB should monitor education projects closely and missions should include an education sector specialist
1994	RMI Health and Population Project	ADB's performance was considered partly satisfactory due to perfunctory project supervision
1996	FSM Water Supply and Sanitation	ADB should undertake regular technical and financial review of projects throughout
2000	FSM Basic Social Services	Closer communication between local stakeholders and ADB is critical through consultations and review missions
<b>Finding 5: More attention to project design saves time and cost over-runs</b>		
1969	Samoa Faleolo Airport and Road Project	To minimize cost over-runs and delays, loans should be based on detailed design not preliminary designs
1972	Samoa Telecommunications Project	Ran overtime by 1 year. Opportunities to identify organizational weaknesses and remedial measures were missed
1991	Samoa Power Sector	Bid documents prepared during project preparation reduce

Year	Project	Lesson
1991	Tonga Power Development	implementation delays and cost increases and are good practice Limited skills of EA staff, and very difficult logistical situations combine to increase the costs for potential contractors
1993	RMI Basic Education Development Project	Long lead times and lack of qualified local contractors must be considered in civil works design
1993	RMI Majuro Water Supply	Low administrative capability means projects take longer to implement. Heavy TA component needed to offset this

ADB = Asian Development Bank, ADTA = advisory technical assistance, EA = executing agency, EPC = Electric Power Corporation, FSM = Federated States of Micronesia, IA = implementing agency, PIC = Pacific island country, PMU = project management unit, PPTA = project preparatory technical assistance, RMI = Republic of the Marshall Islands, RRP = report and recommendation of the President, TA = technical assistance.

Source: Asian Development Bank Independent Evaluation Department.