

E. PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT OF ADB COUNTRY ASSISTANCE PROGRAMS COMPLETED IN 2017

1. Every year, the Independent Evaluation Department undertakes various studies that cover the assessment of country partnership strategies, projects and programs as well as reports that are thematic or corporate in nature. This supplementary document summarizes the evaluations of country assistance programs and partnership strategies completed in 2017.

A. Country Assistance Program Evaluation

2. [India](#). The country assistance program evaluation for India covered the country partnership strategy (CPS) period 2007–2015. ADB support over this period amounted to \$22 billion and aimed to contribute to inclusive and environmentally sustainable growth and regional cooperation and integration (RCI). The CPS also focused on knowledge and capacity development, gender equality, and catalyzing infrastructure investment and public–private partnerships (PPPs). The CPS was rated successful overall. ADB support promoted the geographic dimension of inclusive economic growth (IEG) through its focus on basic infrastructure development and access, rural roads and electrification, lagging states, and urban development in cities with slum areas. Its contribution to environmentally sustainable growth (ESG) was achieved through the successful implementation of interventions that promoted energy and water use efficiency, enhanced renewable energy capacity and climate change initiatives in urban transport. The impact on the RCI agenda, while limited, has laid the foundations for further strengthening. Infrastructure support has contributed to gender development as it has enabled access by women and girls to education, health and economic opportunities. Support for private sector development has increased private sector investments in infrastructure development. ADB support has contributed to the strengthening of public–private partnership (PPP) policies, regulation, and capacity. Knowledge work has been less than expected. ADB needs to improve its identification and monitoring of client needs and to use a more systematic approach if its capacity development efforts are to support innovative practices.

3. The evaluation recommended that, at the strategic level, in the next CPS ADB needs a clear approach to supporting the IEG and ESG agenda, stronger support for climate change adaptation, a scaling up of RCI operations in line with the South Asia Subregional Economic Cooperation’s initiatives, and a sharper focus on innovative global practices. At the operational level, the evaluation suggested that ADB needs to address bottlenecks during program implementation; strengthen support for gender equality, including monitoring and replication of good practices; and address constraints on PPPs as well as enhancing the quality at entry of nonsovereign operations. Management agreed to all IED recommendations. The ADB country program was rated relevant, effective, less than efficient, likely sustainable and its development impact was rated satisfactory.

B. Country Partnership Strategy Final Review Validation

4. [Afghanistan](#). The validation of the CPS final review covered ADB operations from 2009 to mid-2015. ADB’s \$2.2 billion support, mostly in the form of grants and technical assistance, was used in the agriculture and natural resources, energy, finance, governance and transport sectors. In transport, ADB support was able to contribute to reductions in vehicle operating costs, travel time, passenger transport fares, and freight rates. The cross-border railway link to Uzbekistan provided an alternative route for trade and humanitarian relief. Support for the energy sector has increased access to electricity, ensured system efficiency and strengthened the capacity of the country’s electric company. Despite these outcomes, sustainability remains a concern given the country’s security issues and the institutional and policy environment. The evaluation’s recommendations focused on providing adequate measures for security based on site conditions and location, capacity development support, and sector support for the agriculture and natural resources sector to achieve inclusive and sustainable growth. Overall, the validation found the program less than successful on the borderline. It was rated relevant, effective, less than efficient, less than sustainable, and had a less than satisfactory development impact.

5. [Kazakhstan](#). The validation covered ADB's operations from 2012 to 2016. ADB's \$3.34 billion support was aimed at helping the country to accelerate economic diversification and increase its competitiveness for sustainable and inclusive growth through sector interventions in transport, finance and public sector management. While the transport program was relevant to improving regional connectivity and international trade, it has failed to contribute to these outcomes as road projects were only partially completed. Similarly, the support to small and medium-scale enterprises has not been achieved given the constraints in the project design and challenges posed by the country's economic conditions. However, the countercyclical support funds helped address the budget deficit and maintain critical expenditures during the crisis in 2014–2015. Evaluation made the following recommendations for the next CPS: "(i) ensure a realistic operations program and a development results framework using practical performance indicators for accountability; (ii) broaden the scope and scale of the operations program to increase ADB's impact; (iii) engage more proactively in public sector management with a sector strategy; and (iv) increase support for private sector development, private sector operations, and public-private partnerships." The program was assessed successful on the borderline. It was rated relevant, less than effective, efficient, and likely sustainable. Development impacts were less than satisfactory.

6. [Mongolia](#). The validation covered ADB's operations in 2012–2016. The \$730 million in ADB support aimed to contribute to inclusive and sustainable growth and it focused on private sector development, governance and capacity development, gender equity and mainstreaming, and knowledge sharing. ADB was mostly engaged in transport and public sector management but also supported operations in other sectors, including finance, water and other urban infrastructure services, agriculture, natural resources and rural development, education, health, and industry and trade. While the CPS was assessed relevant, it has failed to meet most of its targeted outcomes. Frequent changes in government and the economic downturn, among others, have affected the overall performance of Mongolia's portfolio. Despite a less than successful overall performance, ADB supported interventions that mitigated the impact of economic cycles, strengthened private sector development, made progress in delivering gender equality results in social and urban projects, and promoted regional cooperation through the Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation (CAREC) program. Evaluation recommended that ADB should promote economic diversification by improving agribusiness through small and medium-sized enterprises, address project implementation delays, improve its value addition by embedding innovative knowledge solutions in financing, and support the government to prioritize expenditure in infrastructure, health and social protection. The country program was assessed less than successful on the borderline with ratings of relevant, less than effective, efficient, less than likely sustainable and less than satisfactory development impacts.

7. [Philippines](#). The validation covered ADB's operations in 2011–2016. ADB's \$4.7 billion program aimed to support the achievement of a high, inclusive, and sustainable growth with interventions focused on public sector management, education, infrastructure, and finance. ADB support contributed to strengthening public–private partnerships (PPPs) through the creation of a PPP center and enhancement of the PPP legal framework. It scaled up the conditional cash transfer program, while improving the national household targeting system. In the aftermath of typhoon Yolanda, ADB supported recovery and rehabilitation activities across 39 provinces that benefited about 3.3 million households. Although the ADB education program is in its initial stages, the prospects are good for improving the quality of teaching outcomes and the employability of graduates, given such innovations as a voucher system, curriculum change, and strengthened local government units (LGU) public employment service offices. Evaluation noted that weak local governance and design issues, among others, meant that the achievement of CPS outcomes was limited. It made the following recommendations for the next CPS: at the strategic level, ADB needs to scale up its work in Mindanao, support LGUs to enhance their financing capabilities, and link nonsovereign lending more tightly to CPS objectives. At the operational level, ADB needs to integrate education sector work more effectively into social protection support and to consider establishing a local presence in Mindanao. The validation assessed the country program as successful on

the borderline with the following ratings: relevant, efficient, less than effective, likely sustainable and less than satisfactory development impact.

8. [Turkmenistan](#). The validation covered ADB's operations in 2002–2016. ADB support to Turkmenistan has been modest: 15 technical assistance projects and one loan amounting to \$136 million. ADB operations were mostly used to improve regional integration and connectivity by providing support in energy and transport sectors. Technical assistance for the Turkmenistan–Afghanistan–Pakistan–India (TAPI) natural gas pipeline has helped reduce political risks and has served as a catalyst for private investments. It has also facilitated the government's initiatives for power exports to regional markets through the Turkmenistan–Uzbekistan–Tajikistan–Afghanistan–Pakistan (TUTAP) and planned Turkmenistan–Afghanistan–Pakistan (TAP) programs. In transport, ADB support helped improve regional connectivity by supporting the construction of a railway line that links Turkmenistan to the Republic of Iran and Kazakhstan. Evaluation recommendations included the need to (i) provide more knowledge-intensive support activities for the country's economic diversification priorities since these are less dependent on official development assistance, (ii) strengthen human capital through private sector development, and (iii) build a framework in the CPS to identify risks clearly along with the appropriate strategies to manage them. The country program was rated: successful on the borderline, with relevant, effective, less than efficient and likely sustainable. Development impacts were less than satisfactory.