

Date: July 29

To: Special Project Facilitator  
Asian Development Bank  
6 ADB Avenue  
Mandaluyong City  
0401 Metro Manila, Philippines  
Tel: (63-2) 632-4825  
Fax: (63-2) 636-2490  
Email: [spf@adb.org](mailto:spf@adb.org)

*Dear Special Project Facilitator,*

*We, parents, teachers and workers of Roshtkala education department, whose names and addresses are attached, live in Roshtkala district of Gorno -Badakhshan Autonomous Oblast of republic of Tajikistan present this complaint to the Special Project Facilitator. Today we consider necessarily writing you on behalf of 9 000 people to look over these issues and respond to our losses.*

*We request to consider Saodat Saidnazarova, CSSC "Kalam" and Maya Eralieva, NGO Forum on ADB as our representatives and keep contact with them over further discussion on our complaint, because they have regular access to internet and phone, they know English language. Their contact details:*

*Saodat Saidnazarova  
CSSC "Kalam"  
Khorog, GBAO, Tajikistan  
tel: 992 35222 23 30  
fax: 992 35222 24 73  
e-mail: [saidsaodat75@rambler.ru](mailto:saidsaodat75@rambler.ru)*

*Sergey Vorsin,  
NGO "Tarakiet"  
Dushanbe, Tajikistan  
e-mail: [svorsin@gmail.com](mailto:svorsin@gmail.com)*

*Maya Eralieva  
Central Asia and Caucasus Program Coordinator  
NGO Forum on ADB  
85-A Masikap Extension  
Brgy. Central, Diliman  
Quezon City 1101 Philippines  
phone: +632 436 1858  
telefax: +632 921 4412  
mobile: +996 555 680523 (KG)  
e-mail: [maya@forum-adb.org](mailto:maya@forum-adb.org)  
web-site: [www.forum-adb.org](http://www.forum-adb.org)*

*1. We are, or are likely to be, directly affected materially and adversely by the ADB- assisted project Education Sector Reform Project in Tajikistan #37175-01, loan #2053.*

*2. The direct and material harm is, or will be, the result of an act or omission of ADB in the course of the formulation, processing or implementation of this project. The acts or omissions that we believe are the responsibility of ADB include the following:*

- Project information was not provided by the ADB RM and ADB project Coordinator over the project.*
- Our requests to investigate, why local people couldn't get any benefit from the project and even we have presented our monitoring results to ADB, RM staff never take any measures.*
- Local communities don't have full information about the project and they were not consulted about the project activities and their needs to achieve better outcome of given loan.*
- Project fails to fulfil main ADB's mission to eradicate poverty through improvement of education quality and improving participatory development of local communities, in the contrary, project means couldn't reach Roshtkala beneficiaries and most of the project expenses were shouldered from parents and school workers.*
- The quality of school rehabilitation and construction works are very low and doesn't comply to local standards*
- The quality of furniture purchased under the project is very low, while the cost is very expensive*
- Some of equipments supposed to be granted to Roshtkala Education Department are not given*
  - Printer HP 1320, two armchairs, one computer, one vehicle "Niva".*

3. Our rights and interests that have been directly affected materially and adversely by this project include the following:

*The Education Sector Reform Project funded by Asian Development Bank (ADB) was focusing on supporting the Government's reform priorities in primary (grades 1-4) and secondary education (grades 5-11). The project has three components: system efficiency and management; equitable access and completion and quality improvement.*

*The given project should emphasize system efficiency and management improvement required throughout the education system in order to make the education system more affordable and sustainable. It also should support policy and planning capacity and management efficiency (pedagogical renewal, financial management and management reorganization).*

*In the frame of the project, school # 39 of Shoshbuvad village, school # 35 of Sejd village, school #26 of Roshtkala village (central school), school #22 of Mirsaid Mirshakar village, school # 12 of Tusyon village, school #10 of Tavdem village of Roshtkala district of GBAO of Tajikistan were involved to the education sector reforming.*

*ADB allotted USD\$ 7 500 000 loan for implementation of education sector reform project in Tajikistan #37175-01, loan #2053. In addition to this amount for schools' rehabilitation was granted USD\$ 2 500 000 by Japan Fund for Poverty Reduction.*

*People of communities were happy that their schools will be reconstructed and their children will study in modern and in good conditions as it was their dream since they know that their old ages will be mostly depending on new generation and their success. But unfortunately schools built in between 1936-1957 years, after ADB intervention and allocating funds for reconstructions and repairments, schools didn't change own shape and appearance.*

*The condition of schools do not meet the requirements and standards after the reconstruction. The plastering of school's building is unqualified. It was made in winter in cold climate. For our conditions it is impossible to do plastering in winter that falling done in some months. The sockets are not good as well. Window glasses are not placed completely. The ceilings, floors and windows are full of holes. The blackboards are self-made and not set in the wall. The bookcases do not have glasses, the shelves are not put. They do not have the screws. We asked about the glasses of the bookcases and the engineers said that the glasses were broken during the transportation from Dushanbe to Roshtkala. The painting is unqualified also. The workers told that they were not paid fully. They also mentioned that they did not have any building tools even spades and they used their own tools and instruments for building works. The prices were very low in estimates and they did not comply the real prices.*

*The windows are large and the glasses are one-sided. Floors, ceilings and windows are full of holes. The trenches of the frames do not correspond for the glasses of windows. All old frames, doors and windows were sold, but nobody knows where is the sum of them. The new set doors are from China and with low quality. They are already cracked. Door boxes are the old one. The roof does not correspond to the standard. The awning of the roof is short and rain and snow are melting straightly to the walls. The installation of electricity also is not correct and some classrooms don't have light.*

*The condition in schools remains unsatisfactory and during the winter period the quality of schools repairing became worse, because of the cold weather, snowing and raining. The roof of the buildings was not enough stable to stand for it. The roof of schools were not totally made new, they were only repaired partly. The snow and rain passed through the roofs. The walls and floors are already damaged, but even one year did not pass after the general reconstruction of schools.*

*During the conversation with engineers, it was found that finances allocated by ADB were not enough for this work. The schools administration told that the engineers transferred wood from Dushanbe city and it should be dried and then to make a floor, but they did not dried it and started to work with it. In the results in the floor appeared holes and they covered the holes with maskin tape then painted it with very low quality paints and now the floors are looking very old made up. Usually they used the old wood of schools and painted the surface a little. For unloading of ground the engineers used schoolboys and distracted them from the lesson.*

*The engineers also took the building materials of local people as wood, stones and ground without paying them for it or rented the houses of local people and did not pay for logging and food.*

*The school's administration mentioned that the main door- exit door of school we wanted to be made of wood, but the engineers made it plastic door, because it is cheaper. Now it is all broken. The teachers complained that because of low standards of repairing they can't stick placards and posters to the wall with nails during the lessons and that's why they use for sticking only scotch. Scotch is not strong to hold the placards and they are falling down often.*

*The population of the district is not satisfied with the school conditions and they asked the ways how to complain to the head office of ADB. They mentioned that if they got money through their schools or communities it would be better to work with rather than to do it through project coordinator and other involved people.*

*It is harmful for the health of teachers and schoolboys to study in the classrooms with the conditions described. The Directors of schools even do not know about the project information and have never seen the project expected results and budget among schools.*

*The parents and teachers themselves were involved in school repairing process. The parents and school administration mentioned that nobody to complain to about their problems. We are, Parents and teachers were involved to the process of repairing as well. Every year we collect money for a partial repairing of the schools. Even this year after the general repairing we collected money again (5 somoni=1, 45\$ for every child-schoolboy, when parents earn maximum 40-60\$ per month).*

*The heads of the schools expressed that they had hopeless situation when the winter was coming. They were forced to organize a work with the parents of the schoolchildren. During a month the parents worked even at night. The hands of the schools directors and the parents were full of callosities and cracks.*

*The project activities do not comply with project implementation area's climate conditions. Building works were required to finish in a certain time according to the project, but nobody took into consideration that it is impossible to fulfill repairing or reconstruction works in a severe cold weather in winter and the information of the project was not available for public. ADB representatives never conducted public consultations and asked the consent of people of communities. Nether people nor school administration seen the project or any information on the project and have never seen the budget of the project. Everything was confidential.*

*Both the government and the ADB executed this project with lower standard both physical (construction of infrastructure such as school building) and institutional (e.g. confusing syllabus). There is no transparency of the execution of the project. On the ADB web-site which is for public, one wouldn't find any documents on that project except one report and recommendation to the President of ADB (RRP). All requests from the local NGOs regarding information were rejected or not responded. Experts believe that education as an institution in Tajikistan is in real danger now and the culturisation and socialisation through these curriculums will retard the growth of a nation backward. As reasons for the project failure civil society organisations name: 1) A major chunk of the project finance went to training of teachers, school directors and government officials. After the training many teachers and directors left the job due to low salary structure. 2) The repairing work of the schools is very poor and during the harsh winter it is difficult for students to join the school classes. The money siphoned from the ministry to the lower contractor is supposed to be riddled with corruptions. 3) The text books which are introduced under this project are alien to students. Students failed to understand the topics. 4) Lack of transparency and accountability at both ADB and Tajik Government.*

*It is very upset to know that in the Aide Memoir dated by ADB Mission October 5-15, 2006, it says that the reports coming from education specialists are usually comically written. In this regard, what ADB doing to improve the situation?*

*Lack of access to information, weak supervision on project implementation from ADB, poor control of the funds, project delay and low management led to such poor and unsatisfactorily implementation.*

*4. We seek the following outcome and remedies through the help of the Special Project Facilitator: Simple given steps were absent during the project implementation:*

- research on the needs and demands of the people in project site was not conducted accordingly and led to the expenses, while priority parts were left,
- lack of supervision and audit of financial means;
- conduction of monitoring of the project after certain time pass and then provide money for continuation of the works;
- There is urgent need to conduct audit of fulfilled works and investigation of abovementioned activities.

5. We have previously made a good faith effort via Saodat Saidnazarova to address our problems with the ADB operations Department concerned in the following manner: we wrote several times to Mr. Wolfgang Kubitzki and local representative of ADB Mr. A. Qalandarov, but our letters were left without any answer. Saodat sent letters to Mr. Wolfgang Kubitzki three times in 19 Dec, 2007, in march 2008, in June 2008 and 3 times for A. Qalandarov. Once he sent me the Aid memories and further never answered. Last year during ADB consultation with NGOs over Tajik CSJS in June 2009, Saodat has visited ADB RM office again and did presentation about the education project problems and our concerns. We have requested ADB staff to come and visit project site to see the projects results on the ground by their own eyes, but nobody took any step to solve any of our concerns.

[saodat saidnazarova <saisaodat75@rambler.ru>](mailto:saodat_saidnazarova@saisaodat75@rambler.ru)

Кому: [wkubitzki@adb.org](mailto:wkubitzki@adb.org)

Дата: Wed, 19 Dec 2007 08:08:04 +0300

Тема: **required information**

[saodat saidnazarova <saisaodat75@rambler.ru>](mailto:saodat_saidnazarova@saisaodat75@rambler.ru)

Кому: [pmuesrp@tojikiston.com](mailto:pmuesrp@tojikiston.com)

Дата: Wed, 23 Apr 2008 12:42:38 +0400

Тема: **документы**

e-mail: [saisaodat75@rambler.ru](mailto:saisaodat75@rambler.ru)

кого: [saodat saidnazarova <saisaodat75@rambler.ru>](mailto:saodat_saidnazarova@saisaodat75@rambler.ru)

Кому: [pmuesrp@tojikiston.com](mailto:pmuesrp@tojikiston.com)

Дата: Thu, 13 Mar 2008 09:35:54 +0300

Тема: **Re: МАП и Памятные Записки 2006 -2007**

Dear Mr. Wolfgang Kubitzki, .Only once, we were able to receive one document from Mr. Qalandarov, which is also available on the web-site.

6. We cannot provide the information about the allotted means namely for Roshtkala district. We were not able to find any information on finances that exactly indicated sum provided for schools of Roshtkala districts. We have found only general information on the whole project from the web-site of ADB. We have never seen any financial papers, no estimates, no budgets. Even the school directors never saw them.

7. We submit the following facts with supporting documents: pictures from the project site.

8. We authorize the Special Project Facilitator to publicly release the information in this complaint.

9. We request that our identities be kept confidential due to given situation in the country, and specifically our region.

Signatures:

Names deleted per complainants' request for confidentiality
---

To: Asian Development Bank  
The Office of the Special Project Facilitator  
Audit Department

We, the undersigned, \_\_\_\_\_ - \_\_\_\_\_ in Rotkalinski Raion,  
\_\_\_\_\_, \_\_\_\_\_ - \_\_\_\_\_, herewith send 3 complaints through  
Saodat Saidnazarova (NGO “Kalam”), Sergei Vorsin (NGO “Tarakiet”) and Maya Eraliyeva  
(ADB Forum on NGO).

Administration of No. 26 school in Rotkalinski Raion together with school AVO and representative of OO visually inspected the No. 26 school building and established:

The educational building was renovated (overhaul) in 2008 by Customer – CUPRSOT and Contractor – Pamirstroi CU-2.

It should be noted that the quality guarantee period for construction-assembly and repair-renewal operations was not met, including the following drawbacks:

- Doors damaged over a short period of time
- Screed coats and wall plasterwork damaged
- Electric equipment in class rooms damaged
- Floors damaged and the roof leaks.
- Refurbished paintwork, ceiling and walls damaged.

Many times we approached CUPRSOT and the Khukumat of Rotkalinski Raion, but they failed to help us. After failed attempts, we through Saodat Saidnazarova (NGO “Kalam”), also sent letters to the local office of Asian Development Bank in Dushanbe. Unfortunately, they gave no response. We requested them to come to Rotkala and see the project results, however everything was unsuccessful.

We think that under the project all results were not achieved, and the bank itself failed to follow its policies and standards.

As a result of the unsuccessful project, every year we have to collect money from parents, who are all the poor, of pupils for repairs of the building, and discontentment of parents grows as their non-understanding of the project objectives.

We ask the bank to carry out an audit of funds spent on repair of the school.

I request not to disclose my name, and also with this letter I authorize Saodat Saidnazarova (NGO “Kalam”), Sergei Vorsin (NGO “Tarakiet”) and Maya Eraliyeva (ADB Forum on NGO) to represent our interests in investigating this case.

24 July 2010

---

CUPRSOT in the Raion Center has constructed the Board of Education building consisting of 4 rooms and 1 assembly hall. The building is operated for the third year. But it should be noted that this building was not accepted by the state commission, and also the acceptance – delivery act of the state commission and other documents concerning the building do not exist. Quality of construction does not meet the present-date requirements. The roof leaks, electric wires inside rooms are out of order. The other day the terrace ceiling has collapsed.

Upon works of CUPRSOT in Rotkalinski Raion, all funds and assets were handed over to the balance of the Board of Education in accordance with the act executed in August 2009 – 12 (twelve) items. However, in fact in delivery the following things were missing:

1. HP-1320 printer
2. 2 arm-chairs
3. 1 P-3 Keonfile computer

“NIVA” vehicle was given to the local Khukumat for disposal.

Moreover, in the building of the Board of Education there are no back rooms and WC.

To: Asian Development Bank  
The Office of the Special Project Facilitator

I, \_\_\_\_\_, \_\_\_\_\_ in Rotkalinski Raion, send a complaint to you.

Under Loan 2053 for education sector reforming, our school is part of the ADB-assisted project. Under this project the school was repaired, and new furniture purchased.

Despite of this, direct and material damage is that during the repair process the following drawbacks were left.

1. The roof of the school not repaired
2. Roof covering not replaced
3. Plasterwork of bad quality
4. Floors replaced in part, but with worn planks
5. Single-pane windows
6. Badly installed doors

Thus, the repaired school is of inferior quality which does not meet the building codes and regulations.

We tried to solve these problems by ourselves and applied to local authorities and the construction firm. Minor works were carried out, but generally the problem was not solved. Through Saodat Saidnazarova from OO CPGO (Kalam) our concerns were voiced several times during meetings with the ADB local representation in Tajikistan, but they failed to react.

We regret to say that we cannot produce any document in relation to repairs of the school. We do not know the cost of repairs, and on what funds have been spent.

Because of poor repairs the roof keeps leaking. Due to rotten floor planks one may fall through them. The roof is unsafe, and it will not keep long.

Besides, single-plane window frames from China were installed that cannot stand mountainous cold winters and keep warmth. Plastic parts of windows have cracks, some windows and doors do not close. Therefore during winter time class rooms are heated with coal and firewood which risky for health of children.

In this connection we ask the bank to carry out an audit of funds spent to repair our school.

We hope that the bank's main office will second a mission to check and help improve the conditions of the school and teaching children in Rotkalinski Raion.

We request to keep our names confidential as we fear pressure from authorities.

With this letter we authorize Saodat Saidnazarova, Sergei Vorsin and Maya Eraliyeva to represent our interests.

\_\_\_\_\_, \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_, \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_, \_\_\_\_\_