

**ASIAN DEVELOPMENT FUND (ADF)
ADF IX DONORS' MEETING
Lisbon, 9-11 March 2004**

**ADF IX-RELATED CONSULTATIONS WITH
CIVIL SOCIETY ORGANIZATIONS**

**Asian Development Bank
March 2004**

I. INTRODUCTION

1. At the 2nd ADF IX Donors' Meeting held in Tokyo in December 2003 "representatives welcomed the opportunity for direct engagement between civil society and donors during the period of the 3rd ADF IX Meeting" scheduled for Lisbon in March 2004.

2. In line with the decision to involve nongovernment organizations (NGOs) and other civil society organizations (CSOs) in the ADF IX process, key ADF IX-related documents were posted on ADB's Asian Development Fund website (<http://www.adb.org/ADF/default.asp>). Feedback was invited on the documents as well as ADF-related issues through a direct E-Mail link to ADB's NGO Center. The NGO Forum on ADB, a major NGO network that focuses on ADB-supported activities, was asked to inform its membership about the ADF IX process, including the various documents available for public comment on the ADF IX website.

3. ADB also organized national consultation workshops with CSOs in the five DMCs selected to participate in the ADF IX negotiations as ADF borrowers: Bangladesh, Cambodia, Kyrgyz Republic, Pakistan, and Samoa. Because of the devastating cyclone in Samoa in early-January, no consultation was held there. Instead, a Pacific Islands NGO representative attended the consultation with CSOs in Cambodia. Although the majority of the civil society representatives that participated in these meetings were advocacy and grassroots NGOs, careful attention was given to the inclusion of other CSO representatives. Government representatives of the country where the workshops were held also were invited to attend and participate in the consultations.

Country	Date	Number of NGO/CSO Participants	Number of Government Participants	Total Participants
Bangladesh	29 January	30	1	31
Cambodia	17 February	31	3	34
Kyrgyz Republic	06 February	25	2	27
Pakistan	10 February	26	1	27

4. CSO representatives invited to the four country consultations were provided in advance with the executive summaries of the documents prepared for the December 2003 Tokyo ADF IX meeting (in English and/or Bangla, Khmer, Russian, and Urdu). Because of the direct relevance to facilitating civil society's involvement in ADF IX and because of the somewhat technical nature of many of the ADF IX documents, it was decided that at the workshops ADF IX issues would be discussed in the context of ADB's medium-term action plan for ADB-Government-NGO cooperation.¹ The agenda used for each of the four country consultations is hereby attached. A CSO representative from each of the four countries (plus the Pacific Islands NGO

¹ ADB, 2003. *ADB-Government-NGO Cooperation: A Framework for Action, 2003-2005*, Manila. The *Framework* was prepared through Regional Technical Assistance (RETA) 6102, with financial support from the Governments of Australia and the United Kingdom. It was developed through a series of 14 country and sub-regional workshops involving some 500 representatives from governments, NGOs, civil society, and private sector. Uniquely, the *Framework* and its 24 "action" recommendations was drafted through a week-long "writeshop" involving selected NGOs, governments, private sector, and ADB personnel. The *Framework* was approved by ADB's President in May 2003.

representative) was selected to attend a special meeting with ADF IX donors in Lisbon on 10 March 2004.

5. The following sections provide a summary of comments from CSO representatives attending the four consultations. This summary was jointly prepared by the Strategy and Policy Department and the NGO Center of ADB and is based on discussions during the four workshops and the “proceedings” that documented each workshop. As noted above, the synthesis of workshop discussions and recommendations relate to ADF IX issues as well as to ongoing efforts to enhance ADB-Government-NGO cooperation in support of increased development effectiveness. Copies of the proceedings of the four workshops can be obtained from ADB’s Strategy and Policy Department or ADB’s NGO Center (and also will be available from the Secretariat during the Lisbon ADF IX meeting).

II. ADF ISSUES

6. CSO representatives expressed appreciation to donors and ADB for the opportunity to be involved in the ADF IX process, and indicated their desire for an expanded CSO role in the mid-term review of ADF IX as well as subsequent ADF replenishment exercises.

7. As much of the documentation prepared for the ADF IX process is very technical, CSO representatives involved in the consultations found it difficult to provide informed or detailed comment on very complex ADF IX issues that are somewhat outside the experience of most CSOs operating in the Asia and Pacific region. It was suggested that in future, it might be better if ADF donors pose specific questions to CSOs or to otherwise outline particular areas or issues where CSO input is sought.

8. CSO representatives involved in the country consultations fully endorsed development effectiveness as the key criterion by which ADB-supported activities should be measured.

A. Performance-Based Allocation (PBA) at ADB: Strengthening the Policy and Its Implementation

9. CSO representatives involved in the four workshops generally supported the use of some kind of performance-based allocation for ADF resources, although some CSO representatives expressed concern about difficulties in PBA quantification as well as the possible manipulation of results.

10. CSO representatives attached considerable importance to broader government and civil society involvement in the determination of suitable performance indicators as well as the corresponding measurement of development performance.

B. Enhancing Effectiveness: Managing for Development Results

11. While supportive of increased ADB emphasis on Results-Based Management (RBM), the CSO representatives noted the difficulty in assessing short or medium-term results in some areas, such as access to justice, human rights, and women’s empowerment. They thus recommended that ADB develop appropriate indicators to measure development results in such areas.

12. Workshop participants urged ADB to expand or otherwise enhance its cooperation with trade unions, professional associations, and other community groups (i.e. not only NGOs) as well as with the private sector.

13. In addition to facilitating greater CSO involvement in ADB activities, workshop participants suggested that that ADB should devote more effort – including more time – to CSO consultation and participation. Although participants noted that ADB’s consultation with civil society has improved, they noted that ADB often is insensitive to community processes and the dynamics of local decision-making.

14. CSO representatives indicated that borrowing governments must make greater effort to involve civil society in the design, implementation, management, and monitoring and evaluation of development activities that have direct impact on stakeholders and communities. Workshop participants also indicated the need for greater CSO involvement in the elaboration of national development and poverty reduction plans and programs, including an expanded role in national poverty assessments and other sectoral studies and analyses as well as in the development of Country Strategy and Programs (CSPs) and Regional Strategy and Cooperation Programs (RCSPs). Participants also noted that CSOs are eager to play an increased role in the identification, planning, design, implementation, and review of ADB-supported activities.

15. CSO representatives indicated that structural and policy reforms negotiated between ADB and governments should include prior consultation with affected groups, and that such reforms should be assessed in terms of their long-term impacts.

16. CSO representatives noted great scope for enhanced government-NGO cooperation, and requested ADB assistance to promote such collaboration, including through capacity-building activities directed at both government staff and CSO personnel.

17. CSO representatives proposed that ADB give more attention to donor coordination and harmonization issues, particularly at the country level. While donor financial support is greatly appreciated, workshop participants noted that separate donor strategic planning exercises and a multiplicity of programming and reporting formats place real burdens on government staff as well as CSOs.

18. Workshop participants recommended that ADB should devote increased attention to documenting good practice or other development success stories, particularly with respect to good ADB-Government-CSO collaboration.

C. Millennium Development Goals: Initiatives and Challenges

19. CSO representatives agreed that the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) should be reflected in the design of all CSPs/RSCPS as well as all ADB-supported projects.

20. The CSO representatives proposed that some of the MDGs such as provision of food, shelter, health, and education should be given clear priority in some countries, with appropriate donor support.

D. Grants in the Asian Development Fund of the Asian Development Bank

21. CSO representatives proposed that increased levels of ADB funding be channeled through NGOs, including through grants specifically directed to NGO projects and programs.

22. Workshop participants concurred with ADB's recommendation that grant funding should be used to respond to emergencies and natural disasters as well as for countries faced with post-conflict reconstruction. Grant funding similarly should be used to build the capacity of governments and CSOs. CSO representatives also suggested that grant funding be used to support education and professional training as well as to address problems related to social exclusion.

23. CSO representatives attending the four country workshops concurred with the *Framework* recommendation that ADB should establish a small grants window to support development initiatives of NGOs/CSOs involved in ADB-supported activities

III. ADB-GOVERNMENT-NGO COOPERATION: A FRAMEWORK FOR ACTION

24. CSO representatives expressed general satisfaction with ADB's ongoing efforts to promote NGO cooperation. At the same time, CSO representatives indicated concern about some ADB-supported project activity, particularly projects involving resettlement and/or indigenous peoples.

25. Although ADB has made increased efforts to consult with civil society, NGO/CSO representatives expressed a desire for increased development partnerships, including ADB support for enhanced government-NGO/CSO collaboration. CSO representatives commended ADB for the process leading to the development of the *Framework for Action*, noting that the *Framework for Action* represents a "major step in the right direction". CSO representatives fully endorsed the *Framework's* 24 "action" items and urged ADB to provide the necessary financial and institutional support to fully implement the *Framework* over the 2003-2005 period.

26. CSO representatives stressed the need for more and better information about ADB-supported activities, particularly with respect to loan repayment schedules and country debt obligations. It was noted that few local NGOs have good access to information via ADB's website. In addition, it was recommended that more information about ADB activities be made available in local languages, and through different media that are more accessible to the general public. In this regard, CSO representatives proposed that ADB establish NGO Learning Centers and/or Project Information Centers (connected to specific ADB-supported projects) to better disseminate information about ADB and its activities as well as to contribute to the establishment of linkages and development partnerships.

27. Workshop participants also proposed that ADB should work with governments to present expanded information about ADB-supported activities to national and provincial legislatures and other elected bodies.

28. CSO representatives suggested that ADB fund country-level studies to evaluate the role and impact of CSOs at the country and regional level.

29. CSO representatives suggested that ADB should make more use of qualified national/local resource persons (instead of international consultants). ADB also should encourage greater involvement of indigenous peoples in the design and implementation of ADB-supported activities that directly or indirectly affect indigenous groups.

MODEL AGENDA**“ENHANCED DEVELOPMENT EFFECTIVENESS”
NATIONAL CONSULTATION ON ASIAN DEVELOPMENT FUND (ADF IX)**

08:30-09:00	Registration and Coffee
09:00-09:15	Welcome <i>(by Country Director, Resident Mission)</i> Introductions <i>(Name, Organization, Brief Statement of Nature or Extent of Interaction with ADB)</i>
09:15-09:45	Opening Remarks by Government Representative
09:45-10:00	Objectives and Expected Outputs of Consultation: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sharing of NGO/CSO experience working with ADB • NGO/CSO comment on ADF IX discussion papers • Concrete suggestion as to how to improve ADB-Government-NGO collaboration for enhanced development effectiveness
10:00-10:30	Context Setting - Background to ADF IX process by ADB HQ staff <i>(Strategy and Policy Department)</i>
10:30-11:00	Coffee Break
11:00-11:30	Context Setting - ADB-Government-NGO Cooperation: A Framework for Action, 2003-2005 <i>(ADB NGO Center)</i>
11:30-12:00	Questions and Answers
12:00-13:15	Lunch
13:15-16:00	“Brainstorm” sharing of experience on positive and negative aspects of ADB’s cooperation with NGOs/CSOs and identification of problems as well as opportunities <i>(Plenary Discussion)</i> Small Group Discussions on Key ADF IX Documentation (5 groups): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Use of ADF IX Resources • Grants in the Asian Development Fund • Enhancing Effectiveness: Managing for Development Results • Performance-Based Allocation: Strengthening the Policy and its Implementation • Millennium Development Goals: Initiatives and Challenges Issues of Each Group: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Strengthening stakeholder participation in ADB-supported activities • Enhancing transparency and accountability through access to information • Developing ADB’s capacity for NGO cooperation • Building NGO capacity and providing institutional support • Strengthening Government-NGO cooperation and collaboration <i>(Coffee/Tea available during small group discussions)</i>
16:00-16:45	Small Group reports back to Plenary <i>(focus on enhancements to the “Framework for Action”)</i>
16:45-17:00	Summarization of Group Discussions
17:00-17:15	Final Comments by ADB staff (SPD) – Moving Towards Enhanced Development Effectiveness