



Completion Report

Project Number: 37307-013
Loan Numbers: 2266 and 2267
September 2015

Bangladesh: Secondary Education Sector Development Program

This document is being disclosed to the public in accordance with ADB's Public Communications Policy 2011.

Asian Development Bank

CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS

Currency Unit – taka (Tk)

	At Appraisal (23 May 2006)	At Project Completion (31 December 2013)
Tk1.00	= \$0.01445	\$0.01287
\$1.00	= Tk69.18	Tk77.68

ABBREVIATIONS

ADB	– Asian Development Bank
BANBEIS	– Bangladesh Bureau of Educational Information and Statistics
BEDU	– Bangladesh Examination Development Unit
BISE	– Board of Intermediate and Secondary Education
BMED	– Bangladesh Madrasah Education Board
DIA	– Directorate of Inspection and Audit
DICC	– district implementation coordination committee
DSHE	– Directorate of Secondary and Higher Education
EMIS	– Education Management Information System
ERD	– Economic Relations Division
GAP	– gender action plan
GPA	– grade point average
ICT	– information and communication technology
IMED	– Implementation Monitoring and Evaluation Division
MOE	– Ministry of Education
MQA	– Monitoring and Quality Assurance
NAEM	– National Academy of Educational Management
NCTB	– National Curriculum and Textbook Board
NPRS	– National Poverty Reduction Strategy
PIC	– project implementation committee
PIU	– project implementation unit
PMQA	– policy support, school monitoring, and quality assurance
PSC	– project steering committee
SESDP	– Secondary Education Sector Development Program
SDP	– Secondary Education Sector Development Plan
SMC	– school management committee
SPBMS	– School Performance-Based Management System
SSC	– secondary school certificate

GLOSSARY

<i>Upazila</i>	– lowest administrative unit in Bangladesh, earlier known as a <i>thana</i> (subdistrict)
----------------	---

NOTES

- (i) The fiscal year (FY) of the government and its agencies ends on 30 June. FY before a calendar year denotes the year in which the fiscal year ends, e.g., FY2015 ends on 30 June 2015.
- (ii) In this report, "\$" refers to US dollars.

Vice-President	W. Zhang, Operations 1
Director General	H. Kim, South Asia Department (SARD)
Director	K. Higuchi, Bangladesh Resident Mission (BRM), SARD
Team leader	S. M. E. Rahman, Senior Social Sector Officer, SARD
Team member	M. S. Alam, Senior Safeguards Officer (Resettlement), SARD
	M.G. Mortaza, Senior Economics Officer, SARD
	N. Selim, Social Development Officer, SARD
	M. A. Islam, Associate Project Analyst, SARD
	U. Bhattacharjee, Senior Operations Assistant, SARD

In preparing any country program or strategy, financing any project, or by making any designation of or reference to a particular territory or geographic area in this document, the Asian Development Bank does not intend to make any judgments as to the legal or other status of any territory or area.

CONTENTS

	Page
BASIC DATA	i
I. PROGRAM AND PROJECT DESCRIPTION	1
II. EVALUATION OF DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION	2
A. Relevance of Design and Implementation	2
B. Program and Project Outputs	2
C. Program and Project Costs	6
D. Disbursements	6
E. Program and Project Schedule	7
F. Implementation Arrangements	7
G. Conditions and Covenants	8
H. Consultant Recruitment and Procurement	8
I. Performance of Consultants, Contractors, and Suppliers	8
J. Performance of the Borrower and the Executing Agency	9
K. Performance of the Asian Development Bank	9
III. EVALUATION OF PERFORMANCE	9
A. Relevance	9
B. Effectiveness in Achieving Outcome	10
C. Efficiency in Achieving Outcome and Outputs	11
D. Preliminary Assessment of Sustainability	12
E. Impact	13
IV. OVERALL ASSESSMENT AND RECOMMENDATIONS	14
A. Overall Assessment	14
B. Lessons	14
C. Recommendations	14
APPENDIXES	
1. Updated Achievements of Design and Monitoring Framework	16
2. Physical and Financial Progress of Project Implementation	21
3. Status of Implementation of Tribal People's Development	26
4. Project Implementation Schedule – Original and Actual	32
5. Analysis of Achievements of Gender Action Plan (GAP)	36
6. Status of Compliance to Loan Covenants	43
7. Economic Evaluation	49
8. Project Benefits and Impact	55

BASIC DATA

A. Loan Identification

1.	Country	Bangladesh
2.	Loan Number(s)	2266-BAN(SF) and 2267-BAN(SF)
3.	Program Title	Secondary Education Sector Development Program
	Loan 2267-BAN(SF)	Program Loan
	Loan 2266-BAN(SF)	Project Loan
4.	Borrower	People's Republic of Bangladesh
5.	Executing Agency	Ministry of Education
6.	Amount of Loan	
	Program Loan 2267-BAN(SF)	SDR20,292,000 (equivalent of \$30,000,000)
	Project Loan 2266-BAN(SF)	SDR57,493,000 (equivalent of \$85,000,000)
7.	Program Completion Report Number	BAN-1532

B. Loan Data

1.	Appraisal	
	– Date Started	23 May 2006
	– Date Completed	5 June 2006
2.	Loan Negotiations	
	– Date Started	17 September 2006
	– Date Completed	19 September 2006
3.	Date of Board Approval	26 October 2006
4.	Date of Loan Agreement	8 November 2006
5.	Date of Loan Effectiveness	
	Program Loan 2267	
	– In Loan Agreement	8 November 2006
	– Actual	4 December 2006
	– Number of Extensions	0
	Project Loan 2266	
	– In Loan Agreement	6 February 2007
	– Actual	4 December 2006
	– Number of Extensions	0
6.	Closing Date	
	Program Loan 2267	
	– In Loan Agreement	30 September 2009
	– Actual	21 June 2010
	– Number of Extensions	0
	Project Loan 2266	
	– In Loan Agreement	30 June 2013
	– Actual	31 December 2013
	– Number of Extensions	1
7.	Terms of Loan	
	Program Loan 2267	
	– Interest Rate	1% per annum during grace period, 1.5% per annum after grace period
	– Maturity(number of years)	24

- Grace Period (number of years) 8
- Project Loan 2266
- Interest Rate 1% per annum during grace period, 1.5% per annum after grace period
- Maturity (number of year) 32
- Grace Period (number of year) 8

8. Terms of Relending (if any)
- Interest Rate Not applicable for both loan 2266 and 2267
 - Maturity (number of years)
 - Grace Period (number of years)

9. Disbursements
- a. Dates

Project Loan 2266	Initial Disbursement 30 March 2007	Final Disbursement 2 October 2014	Time Interval 90 months
	Effective Date 4 December 2006	Original Closing Date 31 December 2013	Time Interval 84 months
Program Loan 2267	Initial Disbursement 8 December 2006	Final Disbursement Single Tranche	Time Interval Not applicable
	Effective Date 4 December 2006	Original Closing Date 21 June 2010	Time Interval 54 months

- b. Total disbursement amount (SDR million)

Loan No	Category (2)	Original Allocation (3)	Partial Cancellations (4=3–5)	Last Revised Allocation (5)	Amount Disbursed (6)	Undisbursed Balance (7=5–6)
Loan	Total (loan currency SDR)	20,282,000	0	20,282,000	20,282,000	0
2267	Total \$ equivalent	30,000,000	0	30,781,746	30,781,746	0
Loan	Civil Works	15,963,000	477,613	15,485,387	15,485,387	0
2266	Equipment Vehicle and Furniture	2,908,000	1,133,600	1,774,400	1,774,400	0
	Learning, training material, Studies, Monitoring, Campaign and Workshops	3,247,000	2,354,228	892,772	892,772	0
	Capacity Building –Local Training	5,141,000	-4,861,469	10,002,469	10,002,469	0
	Capacity Building- International Training and Study Tours	271,000	26,832	244,168	244,168	0
	Consulting Services	2,029,000	1,512	2,027,488	2,027,488	0
	Stipends	11,904,000	-353,324	12,257,324	12,257,324	0
	Project Operation and Maintenance	10,484,000	5,588,184	4,895,816	4,895,816	0
	Interest Charges	1,894,000	459,177	1,434,823	1,434,823	0
	Unallocated	3,652,000	3,652,000	0	0	0
	Total (loan currency SDR)	57,493,000	8,478,353	49,014,647	49,014,647	0
	Total \$ equivalent	85,000,000	9,388,260	75,611,740	75,611,740	0

Note: SDR1=\$1.466 at appraisal.

10. Local Costs (Financed)

Program Loan 2267 No local cost was financed under the Program Loan 2267

Project Loan 2266

- Amount (\$ million)	98.54
- Percent of Local Costs	92.41%
- Percent of Total Cost	86.94%

C. Project and Program Data

- Project and Program Loan Cost
 Program Loan Cost (\$million) : 30.78 million
 Project Loan Cost (\$million) : 113.33 million

Loan No.	Cost	Appraisal Estimate	Actual
Program Loan 2267	Foreign Exchange Cost	30.00	30.78
	Local Currency Cost	0.00	0.00
	Total Program Loan	30.00	30.78
Project Loan 2266	Foreign Exchange Cost	6.70	2.49
	Local Currency Cost	106.63	98.54
	Total Project Loan	113.33	101.03

- Financing Plan (\$ million)

Loan No.	Cost	Appraisal Estimate	Actual
Program Loan 2267			
	Borrower Financed	0.00	0.00
	ADB Financed	30.00	30.78
	Total	30.00	30.78
	IDC Costs	0.00	0.00
	Borrower Financed	0.00	0.00
	ADB Financed	0.00	0.00
	Other External Financing	0.00	0.00
	Total	30.00	30.78
Project Loan 2266			
	Borrower Financed	21.70	25.42
	ADB Financed	88.78	73.40
	Total	110.48	98.82
	IDC Costs		
	Borrower Financed	0.00	0.00
	ADB Financed	2.85	2.21
	Other External Financing	0.00	0.00
	Total	113.33	101.03

ADB=Asian Development Bank, IDC=interest during construction.

- Cost Breakdown by Project Output (\$ million)

Output(s)	Appraisal Estimate	Actual
Program Loan 2267		
1. Additional assistance to implementing reforms of SESDP 2000-13	30.00	30.78
Project Loan 2266		
1. Strengthened Management and Governance of Secondary Education Management	34.51	32.75
2. Higher Quality Secondary Education	17.21	16.33
3. More Equitable Access to Secondary Education	50.42	47.85
4. Project Management and Construction Supervision	1.98	1.88
Interest During Construction	2.85	2.21

Contingency	6.37	0.00
Total of Project Loan 2266	113.33	101.03

Source: Executing Agency's Project Completion Report. 2014.

4. Project Schedule

Item(s)	Appraisal Estimate	Actual
Project Loan 2266		
Output 1: Strengthened Management and Governance of Secondary Education Management	Q2, 2006	Q3, 2008
Output 2: Higher Quality Secondary Education	Q1, 2006	Q3, 2008
Output 3: More Equitable Access to Secondary Education	Q1, 2006	Q3, 2007
Output 4: Project Management and Construction Supervision	Q1, 2006	Q1, 2006
Program Loan 2267	Q1, 2006	Q1, 2006
Q = starting quarter		

5. Project Performance Report Ratings

Implementation Period	Ratings	
	Development Objectives	Implementation Progress
Program Loan 2267		
From 4 Dec 2006 to 31 Dec 2006	Satisfactory	Satisfactory
From 1 Jan 2007 to 31 Dec 2007	Satisfactory	Satisfactory
From 1 Jan 2008 to 31 Dec 2008	Satisfactory	Satisfactory
From 1 Jan 2009 to 31 Dec 2009	Satisfactory	Satisfactory
From 1 Jan 2010 to 31 Jun 2010	Satisfactory	Satisfactory
Project Loan 2266		
From 4 Dec 2006 to 31 Dec 2006	Satisfactory	Satisfactory
From 1 Jan 2007 to 31 Dec 2007	Satisfactory	Satisfactory
From 1 Jan 2008 to 31 Dec 2008	Satisfactory	Satisfactory
From 1 Jan 2009 to 31 Dec 2009	Satisfactory	Satisfactory
From 1 Jan 2010 to 31 Dec 2010	Satisfactory	Satisfactory
From 1 Jan 2011 to 31 Dec 2011	Satisfactory	Satisfactory
From 1 Jan 2012 to 31 Dec 2012	Satisfactory	Satisfactory
From 1 Jan 2013 to 31 Dec 2013	Satisfactory	Satisfactory

D. Data on Asian Development Bank Missions

Name of Mission(s)	Date(s)	No. of Persons	No. of Person-Days	Specialization of Members
Fact Finding mission	13-Mar-2006 to 29-Mar-2006			
Appraisal mission	5-Jan-2006 to 23-May-2006			
Inception Mission	2-Mar-2007 to 8-Mar-2007	5	35	a,b,d,c,e
Review Mission	19-Aug-2007 to 26-Aug-2007	2	10	a,d
Review Mission	22-Jun-2008 to 26-Jun-2008	2	6	a,d
Review Mission	26-Oct-2008-06-Nov-2008	2	10	a,d
Review Mission	21-Sep-2010 to 25-Sep-2010	2	6	a,d
Review Mission	24-Apr-2011 to 05-May-2011	3	18	a,d
Mid Term Review Mission	13-Nov-2011 to 28-Nov-2011	5	50	a,d,c,e
Review Mission	03-Mar-2012 to 13-Mar-2012	2	10	a,d
Review Mission	01-Oct-2012 to 04-Oct-2012	2	6	a,d
Review Mission	02-Apr-2013 to 17-Apr-2013	3	12	a,d,e
Review Mission	07-Nov-2013 to 19-Nov-2013	4	8	a,b,c,e
Project completion review Mission	12-Jan-28 Feb 2015	3	45	a,d,c

Note: There were no separate missions for Program Loan 2267.

Abbreviations: a=analyst, b=social sector specialist, c=consultant or specialist, d=project officer, e=gender specialist.

I. PROGRAM AND PROJECT DESCRIPTION

1. To bring in reforms in the secondary education sector, the Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh with the assistance of the Asian Development Bank (ADB) prepared the Secondary Education Sector Development Plan (SDP)¹ 2000–2010 in 1998. This was updated in 2008 as SDP 2006–2013. The objectives were to improve access for all primary graduates, and improve efficiency and effectiveness in the secondary education sector.

2. To support implementation of reforms, ADB prepared and financed the Secondary Education Sector Development Program (SESDP), comprising a program loan and a project loan. The program loan² provided budgetary support for pursuing ongoing reforms in the secondary education sector. ADB approved a project loan of \$113 million and a single tranche program loan of \$30 million to implement the planned sector reforms through SDP 2006–2013. The government financed a portion of the costs of implementing the planned reforms (estimated at \$302 million during 2006–2013) by an ongoing project.³

3. The program loan was a single-tranche budgetary support to the government for carrying forward the ongoing reforms of the secondary education sector under the SDP 2006–2013 and the new National Education Policy 2010 (NEP 2010).⁴ The program loan was approved on 26 October 2006. The loan agreement was signed on 8 November 2006, and the loan closed on 30 September 2009. The Ministry of Education (MOE) was the executing agency and the Directorate of Secondary and Higher Education (DSHE) was the implementing agency for the program loan.

4. The project loan was approved on 26 October 2006. The loan agreement was signed on 8 November 2006, and the loan closed on 30 June 2013. The project loan covered the secondary education subsector, including limited support to the madrasah education stream. The project loan was designed to implement the major activities emanating from the sector reform measures such as (i) strengthening management and governance of secondary education, (ii) improving the quality of secondary education, (iii) and improving the equity of access to secondary education. The Ministry of Education was the executing agency and the Directorate of Secondary and Higher Education was the implementing agency for the project loan. A project preparatory technical assistance (TA)⁵ was prepared for the program loan and the project loan.

5. The goal of the program and project loans was to help reduce poverty in Bangladesh by making secondary education more relevant to the needs of the labor market. The principal objectives were to support the implementation of policy reforms aimed at achieving strengthened management and governance, improve the quality of secondary education, and ensure equitable access to secondary education. The major development purpose was to continue the series of policy reforms initiated under the Secondary Education Sector

¹ Ministry of Education. 1998. *Secondary Education Sector Development Plan*. Dhaka: Government of Bangladesh

² ADB. 2006. *Report and Recommendations of the President to the Board of Directors: Proposed Sector Development Program Loans to the People's Republic of Bangladesh for the Secondary Education Sector Development Program*. Manila.

³ ADB. 2004. *Report and Recommendation of the President to the Board of Directors: Proposed Loan to the People's Republic of Bangladesh for the Teaching Quality Improvement in Secondary Education Project*. Manila.

⁴ Ministry of Education. 2010. *National Education Policy 2010 (NEP 2010)*. Dhaka: Government of Bangladesh

⁵ ADB. 1998. *Proposed Project Preparatory Technical Assistance to the People's Republic of Bangladesh: Preparing the Secondary Education Sector Development Program and Secondary Education Sector Development Project* (PPTA No.4532-BAN). Manila.

Improvement Project (SESIP)⁶ in support of the SDP 2006–2013 and NEP 2010. The project loan had three major outputs: (i) strengthening management and governance of secondary education, (ii) improving quality of secondary education, and (iii) enhancing equity of access to secondary education.

II. EVALUATION OF DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION

A. Relevance of Design and Implementation

6. The design of the program loan was relevant. Providing additional budgetary support was needed to support the full, effective, and efficient implementation of SDP 2006–2013. The SDP responded to the development potentials of the secondary education sector. The program loan also supported the implementation of the planned reforms of the SDP 2006–2013—particularly meeting the demands of the labor market, creating jobs, and reducing poverty.

7. The design of the project loan was relevant as the project served as a vehicle for implementing the activities of the SDP 2006–2013. The project loan continued to accomplish the incomplete reform activities necessary to address the consequences of the rising demand for secondary education following the rapid increase in primary education participation and completion. Design and implementation of the project loan was relevant as it fits into the overall sector development plan as reflected in the updated SDP 2006–2013, and NEP 2010. The design of the project loan is consistent with all major aims and objectives of NEP 2010 such as creativity; market-driven skill development; equity of gender and locations (rural, urban, and underserved); high emphasis on ICT, and quality education through appropriate curriculum, syllabus, and training.

8. The project loan was relevant as it improved the efficiency of secondary education by strengthening management, accountability, and transparency. It enhanced the quality of secondary education by improving the curriculum and school performance; improved equity of access by improving infrastructure; supported the delivery system of secondary education; and supported poor students, particularly females. The project loan assured equity of access in underserved and overcrowded areas on a need basis both in terms of gender as well as population. The design was relevant for the (i) extensive stakeholder participation and ownership generated, (ii) use of the lessons learned from the earlier phase and similar other programs and projects, (iii) in-depth needs assessment during design, and (iv) due consideration to the sector strategy of both ADB and the government for poverty reduction. The project preparatory TA was instrumental in preparing the SDP and the SESDP. The quality of project preparatory TA was satisfactory. Relevance of the design did not change during implementation, including during midterm review and at completion—rather, the relevance increased further due to enhanced importance placed by the government on the reforms of the secondary education sector.

B. Program and Project Outputs

1. Program Loan

9. The program loan for \$30 million was a single tranche additional financial assistance to the government to provide budgetary support for carrying out the ongoing activities relating to

⁶ ADB. 1999. *Report and Recommendation of the President to the Board of Directors: Proposed Loan to the People's Republic of Bangladesh for the Secondary Education Sector Improvement Project*. Manila.

the secondary education sector reforms. Under the program loan, the government pursued targeted reform activities to achieve the outputs: (i) decentralization of secondary education management, (ii) national implementation of decentralized education management information system (EMIS), (iii) national implementation of school performance-based management system (SPBMS), (iv) functional specialization of the education cadre, (v) revision of curricula for grades 9–10, (vi) reform of secondary school certificate (SSC) examinations, (vii) introduction of school-based assessment (SBA) for grades 6–9, (viii) development of new B.Ed curriculum, (ix) continuation of construction new schools in underserved areas, and (x) review of the secondary stipend program for female students. These were the policy conditions required for releasing the single tranche program loan.

10. Some achievements under the decentralization of functions in the management of secondary education in the DSHE include (i) upgrading and linking of the EMIS to the DSHE planning division, and (ii) establishment of a monitoring and supervision system for more accountability and transparency in school management. The reforms of curriculum and contents, teaching–learning process, and evaluation and examination system improved the quality of secondary education. The reforms introduced information and communication technology (ICT) in secondary education that made students and teachers interested in the application of ICT. The reform initiatives expanded access in the underserved and crowded areas.

2. Project Loan

11. Physical and financial achievements of the project in terms of outputs of the three outputs are satisfactory⁷. The overall status of achievements of outputs is summarized in the following paragraphs, the updated Design and Monitoring Framework (Appendix 1), and in the Status of Physical Progress of Implementation (Appendix 2).

i. Output A: Strengthening Management and Governance of Secondary Education

12. **Decentralized management, responsibility, and functional specialization.** Decentralization of management of the monthly payment order (MPO) to the field could not be implemented due to a court case. This has not however, affected project output, outcome, and impact. Decentralization of management responsibilities and functional specialization were successfully implemented. Field office structure and operational and management systems were reviewed, monitoring and quality assurance (MQA) system established, and relocation of staff and their job descriptions were developed according to planned decentralization.

13. **Improved transparency in the financing of institutions.** The SDP project developed and implemented a monitoring quality assurance system to monitor the quality of assistance to improve the performance of schools and selected madrasahs. DSHE integrated MQA with the School Performance-Based Management System (SPBMS) and renamed SPBMS as policy support, school monitoring and quality assurance (PMQA) to expand the scope of monitoring covering policy and quality. To support planning and MQA, SESDP expanded the existing EMIS data collection nationally. The updated EMIS is accessible to MOE, DSHE, planners and decision makers.

⁷ The program and project's contribution to ADB results framework are: 1,656 classrooms were built and 36 classrooms were upgraded; 542,216 teachers were trained; 6,735,815 students benefited from school improvement programs; and 1,201,151 student-years directly benefited from pro-poor stipend program.

14. **Improved human resources management function.** SESDP supported the DSHE's efforts in improving the human resource management (HRM) function within DSHE and other agencies of MOE. DSHE with the help of its administration wing updated its HRM strategy. The project also supported DSHE in reviewing and updating the job description of its staff. SESDP recruited 860 new staff including 173 females (20%) in different positions under the project. However, all these experienced and skilled staff resources could not be recruited under the follow-on SESIP.⁸

15. **Overseas training and study tours.** The project loan arranged overseas training and study tours for 170 persons (67 persons for overseas training and 103 persons for study tours). The overseas training and study tours were implemented in 12 different batches in Canada, the People's Republic of China, Indonesia, Malaysia, the Philippines, and Thailand covering nine subject areas related to secondary education development and management (Appendix 2, Tables 2.2 and 2.3). The overseas training were intended for short- and medium-term specialist studies on specific subjects in foreign countries while the study tours covered experience-sharing with similar agencies abroad.

ii. **Output B: Improved Quality of Secondary Education**

16. **Improved secondary education curricula.** The SESDP with the help of the National Curriculum and Textbook Board (NCTB) reviewed and revised curricula for grades 6–10 based on the integrated unitrack curricula developed under the SESIP. The updated curricula is skill-based, gender-oriented, and has a smooth interface with both stated and existing competencies of the primary curriculum. SESDP also (i) developed related curriculum support guides and teacher training materials, and (ii) trained 542,216 teachers and curriculum staff of NCTB and others associated with the curricula. Training on curricula started under this project is continuing under the ongoing SESIP.⁹ SESDP supported a review of existing staff resources of the NCTB to consolidate its functional and sustainable capacity to develop quality curriculum—including the curriculum's implementation and training, and undertaking researches. SESDP arranged training of 25 NCTB and project officers abroad for specialist studies related to curriculum development.

17. **Information and communication technology in teaching and learning.** The development of new curricula for grades 6–12 included the updating of computer studies and the ICT subject. The ICT subject and its training and learning materials for grades 9–10 have been refined; teachers were trained; and e-learning has been piloted in 20 schools to support the teaching of English, Mathematics, and Science subjects. SESDP provided NCTB with office equipment including computers; software; curriculum, teacher training, and e-learning materials; and consultants.

18. **Reformed national examinations.** The project supported the government in implementing reforms in the national examinations and in introducing the “creative question” method at grades 6–12 through the Bangladesh Education Development Unit (BEDU). It also supported training of secondary-level teachers, including the madrasah, and the technical education stream on the “creative question” system. Also trained were question setters and moderators of all seven boards of Intermediate and Secondary Education (BISE). The project

⁸ ADB. 2013. *Report and Recommendation of the President to the Board of Directors: Proposed Multitranchise Financing Facility to the People's Republic of Bangladesh for Secondary Education Sector Investment Program*. Manila.

also pilot tested the modernization of the Higher Secondary Certificate (HSC) examination in line with the reformed SSC examination. SESDP further supported study tours for 15 BISE personnel abroad for specialist study on assessment, examination development, methodology, and related areas. The study included an analysis of the comparability of examination standards of different BISEs. The SESDP provided services of one international and one national consultant on examination reforms.

19. **Strengthened school-based assessment system.** The SESDP supported the national implementation of school-based assessment (SBA) in grades 6–9, refining the existing school-based assessment model, training, and related materials. A total of 38,545 teachers were trained under the SESDP on the refined SBA system with the help of NCTB (Appendix 2). This project also supported testing of the SBA in model madrasahs. Necessary implementation support for continuing SBA system will be provided under the ongoing SESIP.

20. **Strengthened school management committee.** The SESDP helped train the members of the school management committee (SMC)—orienting and motivating them toward school development, quality education, and improved school performance.

iii. **Output C: Improving Equity of Access to Secondary Education**

21. **Assistance to underserved areas and overcrowded schools.** To expand access to secondary education in underserved areas, the SESDP established 64 new secondary schools—each with 12 classrooms—and furniture and equipment. Toilet facilities for female students and arsenic-free tube wells were provided to 119 schools in areas where arsenic contamination of the ground water is critical. Three additional classrooms were constructed for each of 249 existing schools, totaling 747 classrooms in underserved areas. (Appendix 2, Table 2.5). Officials of the Education Engineering Department were sent abroad for training on monitoring and assessment of civil works related to education institutions.

22. **Developed model madrasahs.** The SESDP piloted the development of 33 secondary model madrasahs spread all over Bangladesh. It provided two additional classrooms and one science laboratory, library and computer laboratory, in each of these 33 madrasahs. In addition, furniture, teaching equipment, books, learning materials, and sports goods were also provided. (Appendix 2, Table 2.5).

23. **Pro-poor stipend.** The project loan continued to provide stipend to poor students of 53 *upazilas*. This stipend was introduced during the SDP and continued through the SESIP.⁸ In total 1,201,151 student–years benefited (30% girls and 10% boys), who met the criteria of poverty and agreed to the conditions of attendance, remaining unmarried, and having fair academic performance (Appendix 2, Table 2.6).

24. **Equity of access to secondary education:** The project loan added value to government efforts of increasing access⁹ of the girls to all levels of education in general and secondary education in particular. The gross secondary enrollment rates of boys and girls of grades 6–10 in 2013 increased to 47.9% and 57.3% respectively compared with 39.5% and 48.4% respectively in 2004. This indicates both a significant increase and faster rise in enrollment of both boys and girls. Access of female teachers in secondary education also increased slowly from 22% in 2004 to 23.2% in 2011. The number of female teachers in secondary schools, particularly in rural areas, was low due to lack of availability of qualified and

⁹ BANBEIS. 2011, 2012 and 2013. *Bangladesh Education Statistics*. Dhaka.

interested female candidates, and partly due to the low preference on recruiting female teachers by the SMCs of nongovernment secondary schools. This has changed due to the government policy of recruiting qualified and interested female teachers in all secondary schools. The number of female members of the SMC and female education officers and staff in the secondary level has also increased during the project period due to project interventions under the government policy.

25. **Equity of access of tribal students to secondary education.** Considering the lack of sufficient physical facilities in remote areas where most of the tribal people live, the government emphasized improving physical facilities and ensuring increased access of tribal students, particularly girls. Tribal population is high in the three Chittagong Hill Tracts districts (Rangamati, Bandarban and Khagrachari) and in boarder lying districts (Sylhet, Netrokona, Rajshahi), and coastal districts (Patuakhali and Cox's Bazar). SESDP established four secondary schools in the Chittagong Hill Tracts (Ramu, Dighinala, Goaliakhali, and Naikhongchari), one e-learning laboratory, and two madrasahs. SESDP initiated the inclusion of culture and heritage of the tribal population in the national curriculum of secondary education. Although the project loan was categorized as 'A' for indigenous peoples safeguards, the project loan did not impose any negative impact on the small ethnic communities or tribal peoples of the country. The impacts of the project on the tribal people are summarized in Appendix 3.

C. Program and Project Costs

1. Program Loan

26. The original cost of the single tranche program loan was \$30 million provided as a budgetary support to secondary education sector development. The actual cost of program loan was \$30.78 million due to exchange fluctuation between SDR and the US dollar.

2. Project Loan

27. The actual cost of the project loan at completion was \$101.03 million compared to the original estimate of \$113.33 million, a reduction of the original project cost by 10.85%. The actual amount financed by the borrower is \$25.42 million—10.27% lower than the original estimate. The actual local currency and foreign exchange costs are respectively 7.61% and 62.8% less than the original estimate. The reduced cost is due to a reduction in training costs, consultant services, cost-effective procurement of equipment and learning materials, and exchange rate fluctuations.¹⁰ Reduction of the cost of project loan has not affected the scope of the program. An amount of \$9.39 million was cancelled.

D. Disbursements

1. Program Loan

28. ADB disbursed the entire loan proceeds of SDR 20.29 million equivalent of \$30.78 million on 8 December 2006, 4 days after the loan became effective. The actual amount slightly increased due to exchange fluctuations between SDR and the US dollar. There was no provision for any local currency financing by the ADB under the program loan.

¹⁰ \$1= Tk.69.18 at appraisal (2006), and Tk.77.68 at project closing (2013).

2. Project Loan

29. An imprest account was established and statement of expenditure procedure was followed for disbursement of SDR 49.01 million equivalent to \$75.61 million (11% less than original). The disbursement of loan proceeds by ADB and contributions of the government were generally smooth and supportive to program implementation.

E. Program and Project Schedule

30. **Program loan.** The implementation schedule of the program loan was 1 January 2006 to 31 December 2008. The government adopted the policy actions mentioned in the policy matrix at Appendix 7 of the RRP. The project loan implemented the physical activities related to the reform agendas as reflected in updated secondary education sector development plan.

31. **Project loan.** The project loan agreement was signed on 8 November 2006, which was supposed to be effective on or before 6 February 2007. The project loan became effective on 4 December 2006, with scheduled closing on 30 June 2013. However, loan closing date was extended by 6 months up to 31 December 2013. The time overrun was due to initial delays in recruiting consultants. As a result, there was a slight time extension to allow continuation of pro-poor stipend, completion of the ongoing civil works, and bridging between the closing of the SESDP and inception of the follow-up SESIP. An updated project loan implementation status is at Appendix 4.

F. Implementation Arrangements

32. The MOE was the executing agency responsible for implementing the reforms and the new educational policy measures, providing guidance to the DSHE, and monitoring project loan implementation. The reform measures were implemented under the program loan during the program loan period of 1 January 2006 and 31 December 2008. The MOE used the single tranche program loan amount of \$30.78 million as per the agreed tranche action plans.

33. The **Directorate of Secondary and Higher Education (DSHE)** was the executing agency responsible for the implementation of the project loan. The Project Implementation Unit (PIU) of the SESIP was retained and continued in the same role for the SESDP. Other staff were recruited with preference placed on those having similar experience with the SESIP. The PIU within the DSHE was responsible for day-to-day project implementation. There was a full-time project director supported by 755 officers and staff (582 male and 173 female). The PIU was responsible for planning, procurement, and recruitment of consultants, project accounting and auditing, disbursement of funds including submission of withdrawal applications, management of imprest account, coordination with all stakeholders, and reporting to ADB on project progress. Given SESDP's responsibility to support implementation of the updated secondary education development plan, the project had to coordinate with the ongoing Teaching Quality Improvement in Secondary Education Project (TQI-SEP) during implementation.

34. The project steering committee (PSC) was chaired by the secretary of the Ministry of Education, with the project director as the member-secretary. The PSC formulated policies, planned, implemented, and evaluated the reform agenda for the secondary education system under SESDP; and formulated policy reforms within the program that helped implement the

SDP 2006–2013. The PSC also approved the criteria for selecting schools, madrasahs, candidates for foreign study tours, and foreign and local trainings. Other members of the PSC included representatives from the MOE; Economic Relations Division, Ministry of Finance; Ministry of Chittagong Hill Tracts Affairs; Ministry of Establishment; Planning Commission; DSHE; Implementation Monitoring and Evaluation Division, Ministry of Planning; and National Curriculum and Textbook Board. BANBEIS; Board of Intermediate and Secondary Education; Bangladesh Madrasah Education Board; Directorate of Inspection and Audit; Education Engineering Department; and project implementation unit (PIU) of TQI-SEP were also represented. A project implementation committee chaired by the director general of DSHE was established to oversee the day-to-day implementation of the project, with the project director as the member-secretary. The PSC met 16 times while the PIC met six times during the implementation of the project loan. The implementation arrangement was effective and satisfactory for implementation of the program.

35. A district implementation coordination committee was established in each district with the deputy commissioner as chairperson, district education officer as member-secretary, with membership from district education engineering department, the SMCs and head teacher, and nongovernment organizations to coordinate civil works program of respective district. Implementation consultants, were instrumental to successful project implementation.

G. Conditions and Covenants

36. Out of 33 major loan covenants, 32 covenants including those related to audits and inspections were complied with satisfactorily and on time. The covenant (29 of Appendix 6) relating to baseline indicator study to refine and expand verifiable indicators of project inputs, outputs and impact could not be complied with for lack of necessary financial provisions. By not having 2006 baseline data, the project used 2004 data as its baseline. Therefore, sharpening of indicators did not occur. However, the project could use baseline data of other sources. The status of compliance to the loan covenants is summarized at Appendix 6.

H. Consultant Recruitment and Procurement

37. A consulting firm was recruited in July 2008 under the project loan to provide implementation support with the provision of 92 person-months of international and 212 person-months of national consultant inputs. Although there was initial delay in recruiting the consultants, the consultants recruited under loan completed their services in April 2013 with the use of 92 person-months of international and 198 person-months national consultant inputs. The performance of the consultants engaged under the project loan was satisfactory.

38. The consultants were recruited following *ADB's Guidelines on the Use of Consultants*. The project utilized large numbers of different contracts for civil works following *ADB's Guidelines on Procurement of Goods and Services*. There was no major problem with recruitment of consultants for civil works contracts, and procurement of goods (vehicle, furniture, and office equipment). Status of procurement of civil works and goods are at Appendix 2, Table 2.5.

I. Performance of Consultants, Contractors, and Suppliers

39. The performance of consultants for project management advisory services was generally satisfactory and instrumental to the successful implementation of the project. Performance of the civil works contractors was generally satisfactory except in a few sites there were delays for

various reasons such as site selection, contractor recruitment, difficulty for civil works and also construction supervision in remote locations affecting timely completion of civil constructions. The performance of the suppliers of vehicle, furniture, and office equipment was satisfactory.

J. Performance of the Borrower and the Executing Agency

40. The borrower performed satisfactorily during design and implementation of the project, particularly in providing necessary counterpart funds and guidance and prompt administrative and financial approval, and setting up several committees to monitor project implementation. The performance of the DSHE as executing agency was satisfactory, especially in establishing project implementation unit and providing necessary manpower and fund resources and coordinating with all relevant ministries and departments and local level agencies particularly the secondary schools and madrasahs. The executing agency submitted necessary reports on time including the project completion report.

K. Performance of the Asian Development Bank

41. ADB effectively supported project implementation through its Bangladesh Resident Mission and promptly responded to requests from the borrower and the executing agency for approval, disbursement, and monitoring. ADB fielded 13 missions including inception, annual review, periodic review, midterm review, and final project completion review. Moreover, ADB supported project implementation and policy dialogue with the government. ADB satisfactorily coordinated with the government in administering the loan and consulting services. The overall performance of ADB is satisfactory.

III. EVALUATION OF PERFORMANCE

A. Relevance

42. The program and project design are rated as relevant, both at formulation and at completion as the design and intended outcome of the program and project were found to be very relevant to the government's development goals, objectives and purposes, and priorities for market demanded skilled human resources development. Both program and project designs were relevant to the government's plan for reforms and institutional development and improvement of the quality of education. The design was also relevant to ADB's sector strategy for poverty reduction through improvement of human resources especially for increasing access of the female students and students of underserved and overcrowded areas to secondary education.

43. The design included revision of existing curricula and reforms of examination systems of grades 6–12 that are prerequisite to improving the quality of education and needs of the time. The program and project are relevant to take on the continuation of the ongoing reform agenda and activities to achieve targeted improvement of the quality of education and ensuring equitable access of students, especially females of underserved and crowded areas.

44. The program and project design supported the government's policies and plans by helping implement the updated secondary education sector development plan. They contributed significantly in building upon the previous contributions in strengthening the institutional capacity of MOE for planning, managing, and monitoring the secondary education system. This was done through support for the strengthening of the DSHE, capacity building of the BEDU and the BISEs, NCTB, and improved management of the secondary schools and selected madrasahs.

The program and project design are also relevant to supporting decentralized management and further development of the school performance-based management system that needed continued follow-up for ensuring enhancement of the efficiency of school management and quality of education. Relevance of the program and project loans did not change during midterm review and at completion.

B. Effectiveness in Achieving Outcome

45. The program and project loan design and implementation are rated as effective in achieving targeted outcome in terms of improved efficiency, quality, and equity of access to education at the secondary level. Effectiveness in achieving outcome has considerably improved in secondary education in terms of reducing dropout rates. The level of reduced dropout rates of 2004 in grades 6-10 not only maintained in 2013 but further reduced (dropout rate in 2004 was 70.0% that reduced to 44.4% in 2013).

46. High effectiveness of the project implementation in achieving outcome is also noted from improved efficiency and equity in gross secondary enrollment. Gross secondary enrollment rates of boys and girls in 2013 not only equaled, but girls' enrollment outnumbered boys' enrollment rates (boys 47.9% and girls 57.4% in 2013) signifying overachievement of equity of access of girls. Gross secondary enrollment in rural areas increased by 24.9% between 2004 and 2013 (47.7% in 2004 and 72.7% in 2013) compared to the target of 10%. The gross secondary enrollment rates of boys and girls increased respectively by 8.4% and 8.9% for boys and girls between 2004 and 2013 compared to the target of 15%. Higher secondary level gross enrollment also increased by 14.2% from 25.7% in 2011 to 39.9% in 2013 compared to the target of 10% between 2004 and 2013. Gross enrollment data of higher secondary level in 2004 is not available.

47. Effectiveness in achieving outcome of the project is also high in terms of high pass rates in secondary education level. The pass rates in the SSC examination increased by 41.2% between 2004 and 2013 (48.0% in 2004 to 89.2% in 2013) compared to the target of only 50.0% in 2013.

48. Project implementation was moderately effective in achieving the outcome of improving the performance of the poor performing schools. The project targeted to reduce the number of poor-performing schools and made considerable progress, but MOE failed to suspend by 25% the subventions to poor performing schools that failed to improve for consecutive 3 years. Considering the prevailing sociopolitical conditions, it is difficult to meet this ambitious target overnight.

49. The reform measures of the program loan and the interventions of the project loan for increasing efficiency, quality, and equity of access contributed together to increasing student gross enrollment, reducing dropout, and increasing pass rates (Appendix 8). Out of seven outcome targets and/or indicators, five are overachieved, one partially achieved (gross enrollment rates increased by 8.3% for boys and 8.9% for girls compared to 15% target), and one could not be achieved as the target was ambitious. The gross enrollment in grades 6–10 increased from 43.7% in 2004 (39.5% for boys and 48.4% for girls) to 52.5% in 2013 (47.9% for boys and 57.3% for girls). Notably, the gross enrollment of girls is higher than that of the boys in secondary level compared to the program target of equal enrollment by 2013. Secondary enrollment in rural areas increased from 47.7% in 2004 to 72.6% in 2013. Overall enrollment in higher secondary level increased between 2004 and 2013 by 48.8% (boys 39.3% and girls 54.2%).

50. Improved efficiency of school management contributed to reducing student dropout rates in secondary education. The dropout rates at grades 6–10 reduced from 70% in 2005 to 56.2% in 2011. Pass rates of students in secondary education level increased for boys and girls between 2004 and 2014 (for boys 49.7% and 93.2% respectively in 2004 and 2014; for girls 45.9% and 92.1% respectively in 2004 and 2014).

51. The program and project loans together provided continued support for reforms in strengthening student assessment as a tool for enhancing the quality of secondary education. The reform activities included: training of grades 6–9 teachers, school-based assessment (SBA), class-based assessment in model madrasahs, and information dissemination on the SBA system.

52. The project supported the reforms on equity of access through expanding school facilities in underserved areas and crowded schools, and providing pro-poor stipend to students from poor families. Under the project loan, 64 new schools in underserved areas and two additional classrooms in each of 249 schools in overcrowded areas were constructed, and 33 model madrasahs were established with modern facilities in 30 districts. Besides, the project loan supported equity of access through providing pro-poor stipend among 1,201,151 students (30% girls and 10% boys) of 2,823 schools who met the criteria of attendance, remaining unmarried, and maintaining good academic performance.

C. Efficiency in Achieving Outcome and Outputs

53. The program loan design and implementation, and the processes and measures adopted are rated as efficient in achieving outcome and outputs. The project loan achieved economic returns to investment in the secondary education sector. The program also achieved outcome and output targets in different degrees for increasing gross enrollment in secondary and higher education, reducing dropout rates in secondary education, and increasing pass rates in secondary school certificate examinations. However, the target for 50% nongovernment poor performing schools to improve in 2008, and at least 25% schools performing poorly for 3 straight years stop receiving subventions from 2010 could not be achieved as the target was ambitious.

54. Though investment in education provides a long-term return to income benefits, the project completion report mission (PCR) conservatively assumed a 20-year return period after the project loan implementation. Based on facts and assumptions and a discount rate of 12% for the benefit and cost streams, the economic internal rate of return (EIRR) is estimated to be 19.1%. The results of the sensitivity analysis (adverse scenarios) also confirm the project viability. Economic and social benefits associated with the sub-output costs are excluded from the economic analysis. The estimated EIRR and sensitivity analysis indicate justified returns and sustainability of the program. The economic analysis is in Appendix 7.

55. Almost all outputs were achieved and there was no cost overrun. The project is completed within cost and minimal delays. However, 6 months' extension of the project was required to enable a smooth transition to the SESIP and continuation of the pro-poor stipend program. With regard to the efficiency of program loan, reform costs are covered by the project loan as mentioned in "effectiveness in achieving outcome" section (paras 45–52).

D. Preliminary Assessment of Sustainability

56. The program loan and project loan interventions is rated as likely sustainable as outcome and outputs can be maintained and continued after closing. Sustainability has been further ensured through approval and commencement of a follow-up SESIP to ensure continuity of the reforms initiated. The government maintained the follow-on systems as introduced, maintained the level of management and governance, reemphasized on the quality of secondary education, and maintained the standards set for equity of access to secondary education.

57. In particular, the MOE is committed to carry forward the implementation of the updated SDP 2006–2013 and expanded budgetary provisions to ensure improved access to quality secondary education. The government has made allocations to sustain the project activities through the ongoing SESIP.

58. The Implementation Monitoring and Evaluation Division, Ministry of Planning (IMED), Government of Bangladesh conducted an in-depth study¹¹ of the SESDP in September 2011. The in-depth monitoring evaluation indicated considerable effectiveness and sustainability of the different reform measures such as (i) implementation and use of the SBA system; (ii) application of the different elements of performance-based management (PBM) of school; (iii) reform of examination and application of creative questions; (iv) assistance to low-performing students; (v) implementation of co-curricular activities; and (vi) organizing collective meetings of head teacher, teachers, and school management committees. The PCR mission also conducted a sample survey following the same methodology and tools in March 2015 to compare the continuity of use of the important tools introduced under the SESDP for quality assurances as important indicators of sustainability of the project.

59. The PCR mission noted sustainable progress of implementation of the SBA, PBM, SPBMS, and policy support, school monitoring, and quality assurance (PMQA) systems. It is found that the number of secondary schools that introduced SBA increased from 87.7% in 2011 to 94.7% in 2015. Likewise, the use of the PBM manual by teachers of secondary schools increased from 50.0% in 2011 to 60.5% in 2015. Further, use of creative questions by teachers increased from 88.7% in 2011 to 91.5% in 2015. The number of teachers trained on performance-based assessment monitoring, SBA, and teaching quality improvement increased from 1.4%, 6.1% and 18.7% in 2011 to 8.5%, 25.5% and 25% respectively in 2015. Participation of students in sports and games as one of the major co-curricular activities increased from 68.2% in 2011 to 70.5% in 2015 (Appendix 8).

60. The program loan and project loan together contributed to partial decentralization in the functional management responsibilities of the staff of the DSHE. The reform initiatives such as the training helped to some extent improving the internal efficiencies by improving the management, accountability, and transparency in secondary education. The decentralization plan of DSHE central and field offices, construction and furnishing of two zonal education offices and four district education complexes, and training of SMCs to assist the head teachers in school management have contributed efficient management of the secondary education.

61. The secondary education management and governance were strengthened by establishing the monitoring quality assurance (MQA) system and introducing third-party validation of the results of MQA. Data for EMIS are regularly collected countrywide and annual

¹¹ IMED. 2011. *In-depth Evaluation Study of the Secondary Education Sector Development Project*. Dhaka.

statistical reports are published. Management and governance were also strengthened by developing job descriptions for all staff, refining staff monitoring and evaluation process, developing the human resource management (HRM) manual, providing in-house training to HRM personnel, and implementing information seminars on the new systems developments.

62. The program loan and project loan contributed to enhancing the quality of secondary education through improving curricula, reforming national education system, strengthening student assessment system, and following school performance assessment system. The reform measures and activities including improvement of secondary education curricula of grades 6–12, teacher training curriculum, modernized curricula of grades 6-12 in madrasahs are major outputs of the project loan.

63. The program loan and project loan contributed to enhancement of the quality of secondary education through introduction of ICT in teaching–learning; teachers’ training on the ICT subject; and piloting e-learning in 20 schools to support the teaching of English, Mathematics, and Science. The project also helped to include selected institutions of madrasah education stream on a pilot basis. It supported assessment and strengthening of the capacity of Bangladesh Madrasah Education Board by arranging study tours for the stakeholders of the board.

64. The program and project loans supported reforms of national examinations to enhance the quality of secondary education. The reform measures included: training of trainers of examination question-setters, markers, and moderators; development of new HSC examination papers; developing madrasah-level SSC equivalent model examinations; study tours for 15 BISE staff instead of local long courses; and research studies on comparative examination standards of boards.

E. Impact

65. The project made significant impact on the education sector in general and secondary education subsector in particular in terms of increased relevance of secondary education to the demands of the labor market, poverty reduction, institutional development, improvement of gender issues, and economic and social development.

66. The project along with other similar programs¹² positively impacted towards Strengthening capability of the MOE planning and monitoring wing, improved organization of the DSHE at all levels with decentralization at some levels and improved human resources, trained teachers, upgraded and updated curricula, improved textbooks, reformed national examinations, improved teaching-learning environment in schools, ensured equity of access for poor and female students and students of under-served areas are clearly visible.

67. Updated and reliable data on employment and or self-employment of grades 10–12 graduates are not available. However, according to available published data of Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics (BBS) 2011, 43% grade 10 graduates were employed or self-employed in 2010, and professional level employment rate of new grade 12 graduates increased from 45% in 2004 to 47% in 2010. These compare to project target of 5% increase from 2004 level to 2015.

¹² Note: Other programs included: ADB funded Secondary Education Development Project, Secondary Education Sector Improvement Project I and II, TQI-SEP, TQI-II projects, and projects funded by other development partners and the Government.

68. Access of female teachers in secondary education increased (Appendix 8). The ratio of female teachers in secondary education increased from 20% in 2005 to 24% in 2013 indicating increased access to employment.

IV. OVERALL ASSESSMENT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

A. Overall Assessment

69. The program as well as the project loans were designed in line with the government's education sector policy, ADB's country strategy and sector development plan, and the needs for major reform of the secondary education subsector. The program and project loans were implemented as designed without major changes.

70. Overall, the program and project loans are rated as successful, based on a detailed assessment of relevance, effectiveness in achieving outcome, efficiency in achieving outputs and outcome, sustainability, and impacts (Paras. 43–68). The program and project loans are relevant, effective in achieving outcome, efficient in achieving outcome and outputs, sustainable and made significant impact.

B. Lessons

71. Implementing reforms under a project loan is generally difficult and less effective in accomplishing outcome than having a dedicated separate program loan meant for pursuing reforms.

72. The decentralization of DSHE at all levels needs political will and supportive top level administrative decision to bring efficiency and transparency through bottom-up management. Without an effective and meaningful decentralization, DSHE may find difficulty in implementing the secondary education sector development plans in the future.

73. Where implementation delays are inevitable, advance actions, proactive project management, and effective progress monitoring are helpful to achieve timeline and targets.

74. Many project implementation support staff were recruited and trained. These staff gained valuable experience under SESDP but could not be retained in the follow-up SESIP. Although it will benefit the education sector broadly, it is more efficient for the project to retain the trained officials.

75. Strengthening the role and capability of the head teacher as a mentor is a key to improving the school performance.

76. Increasing the number of female teachers in secondary schools, particularly in the rural and especially in remote areas is difficult, but for quality of education, this is needed.

C. Recommendations

1. Project Related

77. **Monitoring.** DSHE may effectively decentralize functions and authority at all levels under an action plan, and the MOE can monitor early decentralization.

78. **Follow-up actions—reforms.** The MOE through DSHE may follow-up implementation of the incomplete reform measures and activities under the ongoing SESIP and report to ADB semiannually.

79. ADB may undertake the study for preparation of project performance evaluation report (PPER) by late 2016.

2. General

80. The government may make an overall assessment of the status of achievements and further needs of reforms of secondary education sector including the madrasah stream, and undertake a sectorwide approach for reforms through secondary education sector program framework.

81. The MOE through DSHE may assess the status of existing physical infrastructure facilities of all secondary schools and suitability of the facilities for implementing the reform measures using modern equipment, including ICT and plan for future.

82. The government may continue the efforts to increasing the number of female teachers in the secondary education targeting a minimum ratio of 50:50, if not higher.

UPDATED ACHIEVEMENTS OF DESIGN AND MONITORING FRAMEWORK

Design Summary	Indicators/Targets	Status
Increased relevance of secondary education to the demands of the labor market	1. Percentage of grade 10 graduates employed or self-employed increases 5% from its 2004 level in 2015	The target is partially achieved. Percentage of grade 10 graduates employed or self-employed increased 3% from 40% in 2004 level to 43% in 2010 (Source :BBS:2011;Updated data of 2015 not available)
	2. Professional level employment rate of new grade 12 graduates increases 5% from its 2004 level in 2015	The target is partially achieved. Professional employment rate of new grade 12 graduates increased 2% from 45% in 2004 level to 47% in 2015 (Source :BBS:2011;Updated data of 2015 not available)
Outcome	Indicators/Targets	Status
Improved efficiency, quality, and equity of access to education at the secondary level	1. Grades 6–10 dropout rate maintained at its 2004 level in 2013	The target is achieved. Grades 6–10 dropout rate reduced by 25.6% from 70.0% in 2005 to 44.4% in 2013.
	2. 50% of nongovernment schools with poor performance advised to improve in 2008 and at least 25% of schools performing poorly for 3 straight years stop receiving subventions from 2010	The target could not be achieved. School categorization based on ISAS was carried out consecutively for 3 years i.e., 2010, 2011, 2012. Suspension of subventions to poor performing schools could not be implemented considering sensitivities associated with such a punitive measure. The target was ambitious.
	3. Gross secondary enrollment rates of boys and girls are about equal in 2013	The target is achieved. Gross secondary enrollment rates of boys and girls in 2013 are 47.9% and 57.4% respectively compared to 39.6% and 48.4% respectively in 2004.
	4. Secondary enrollment in rural areas increases 10% from its 2004 level in 2013	The target is over achieved. Secondary enrollment in rural areas increased 24.9% from 47.7% in 2004 level to 72.7% in 2013
	5. SSC pass rate increases from 47.7% in 2004 to 50.0% in 2013	The target is over achieved. SSC pass rate increased from 47.7% in 2004 to 86.3% in 2012 and 92.7% in 2014
	6. Gross secondary enrollment rates of boys and girls increase by 15% from its 2004 level in 2013	The target is partially achieved. Gross secondary enrollment rates of boys and girls increased respectively by 8.4% and 8.9% between 2004 and 2013 levels
	7. HSC enrollment increases 10% from its 2004 level in 2013	The target is achieved. HSC enrollment increased 14.2% from 25.7% in 2011 to 39.9% in 2013. Data of 2004 not available.

Design Summary	Indicators/Targets	Status
Outputs		
<p>1. Strengthened management and governance of secondary education</p> <p>1.1 Decentralization of management responsibilities increased</p> <p>1.2 MQA system established</p> <p>1.3 Functional specialization implemented</p>	1.1.1 BISE,NCTB,DIA and DSHE field office structure and operational and management systems reviewed, vis-à-vis decentralization and necessary reallocations of staff to meet reallocated responsibilities	Recommendations submitted in March 2009 after review of DHSE operational system, management, and office structure. Steps in progress for decentralization of management responsibilities of DSHE. MQA system established BISE,NCTB and DIA operational system, management and office structure reviewed in 2012
	1.1.2 DSHE central and decentralized staffing plan developed	Implemented
	1.1.3 Two zonal education offices and four district education complexes constructed and furnished	Construction of 2 zonal education offices and 3 district education offices completed.
	1.1.4 School management committee trained to assist school development and improve performance	School management committee trained in January 2012 to assist school development and improve performance
	1.2.1 PSPU is transformed into a PMQA unit and plan for a new school MQA system and unit is developed	Implemented
	1.2.2 New MQA system is implemented	Implemented
	1.2.3 SPBMS is included in the MQA system	SPBMS is included in the MQA system
	1.2.4 Results of MQA system is validated by a third party	Conducted in 2013
	1.2.5 Training in SPBMS is conducted and materials are reproduced	All the field officers (about 1400) trained in 2008 and 2009. Training for 20,000 head teachers and 20,000 School Management Committees was conducted in January 2012. SPBMS materials revised in 2009. The revised materials are being annually printed and distributed to all secondary schools.
	1.2.6 SPBMS materials are adapted to needs of madrasah	Testing of PBM materials in 35 model madrasahs began in 2009. Report for adaptation of PBM materials for madrasah was finalized through a workshop in December 2013.
	1.2.7 SPBMS is introduced in at least 30 madrasah	SPBMS introduced in 35 model madrasah.
	1.2.8 EMIS data are collected nationwide	A baseline data for all institutions under DSHE created in 2012 through entry of data at institutions.

Design Summary	Indicators/Targets	Status
		This online database is updated regularly.
	1.2.9 Four EMIS education research studies are completed	Could not be undertaken due to time constraint
	1.2.10 Annual EMIS statistical report are published from first year	First EMIS statistical report published in April 2013 based on the data for 2012.
	1.2.11 GIS and DSHE links with BANBEIS are installed	GIS and DSHE links with BANBEIS was installed
	1.3.1 Job descriptions are developed	Job description of staff of all levels developed.
	1.3.2 Staff monitoring and evaluation processes are refined	Staff performance monitoring and evaluation processes were refined.
	1.3.3 HRM manuals are developed	Human resource management manual was developed.
	1.3.4 HRM personnel are trained in-house	HRM personnel were trained in-house
	1.3.5 Information seminars on new systems are conducted	Information seminars on new systems developed were conducted.
2. Enhanced quality of secondary education 2.1 Secondary education curricula improved 2.2 National examinations reformed 2.3 Student assessment Strengthened	2.1.1 Grades 6–8 and 11–12 curricula are reviewed and revised	Curriculum review and revision completed in 2012 for grades 6–12.
	2.1.2 Curriculum teacher support guides are developed for the new grades 6–8 and 11–12 curricula	Curriculum dissemination manuals for all subjects of grades 6–10 completed but that of grades 11–12 passed on to SESIP.
	2.1.3 Information on new curricula is disseminated to teachers	Curriculum dissemination began in February 2013 and completed for 18 districts
	2.1.4 Grades 6–12 madrasah curricula are modernized	Madrasah curriculum modernized in September 2011 and approved by MOE in February 2012
	2.1.5 Madrasah teacher training, teaching and learning materials associated with new curricula are developed	Materials development for training of madrasah teachers completed in 2012 and training completed in February 2013
	2.1.6 Public Information dissemination on new curricula is launched	Public Information dissemination on new curricula undertaken from January 2013
	2.1.7 NCTB staffing rationalized to meet NCTB needs; Services of personnel trained and hired under SESIP extended following performance review	Implemented
	2.1.8 20 NCTB staff strengthened through local higher degree course	Provision transformed to overseas short course training and arranged in November 2012
	2.1.9 ICT subject and teaching and learning materials for grades 9-10 are refined	Implemented
	2.1.10 Teachers are trained to teach refined ICT subject	First round training completed for 400 teachers in 2009. Second round training arranged in June 2013 for 200 teachers

Design Summary	Indicators/Targets	Status
	2.1.11 E-learning is piloted in 20 schools to support teaching of English, mathematics and Science	Piloted.
	2.1.12 Secondary madrasah education sector study is completed	Studied
	2.1.13 Capacity of BMEB is assessed	Assessed
	2.1.14 Capacity strengthening plan for BMEB and related agencies is developed	Implemented
	2.1.15 Study tour of BMEB stakeholders in countries with modern madrasah education systems is undertaken	SESDP sent BMED officials abroad on study tours to study modern madrasah education system
	2.2.1 Training for trainers of examination question-setters, markers, and moderators for planned examination reforms is conducted	474,276 teachers trained including 7,938 question setters and moderators.
	2.2.2 New HSC examination papers are developed	SESDP supported modernization of HSC examination in line with the reformed SSC examination through pilot testing.
	2.2.3 Madrasah SSC equivalent model examinations are developed	SESDP developed SSC equivalent madrasah examinations in line with the reformed SSC examination.
	2.2.4 Fifteen BISE staff are strengthened through local master's degree course	Provision transformed to overseas short course and implemented in September–October 2012
	2.2.5 Research study comparing BISE examination standards is completed	15 BISE staff was sent abroad for specialist study on assessment, examination development, methodology and related areas.
	2.3.1 Training and training materials are provided to grades 6–9 teachers	Existing SBA system was refined through NCTB and supported preparation of training and related materials
	2.3.2 SBA support is provided to schools by NCTB	38,545 teachers were trained on refined SBA system through the NCTB
	2.3.3 Class-based assessment implemented in model madrasah	SESDP tested refined SBA system in model Madrasahs.
	2.3.4 Information dissemination on SBA is launched	SESDP disseminated information about SBA countrywide.
3. Improved equity of access to secondary to education 3.1 School facilities in underserved areas developed 3.2 Stipends given to students from poor families	3.1.1 Fifty-six new schools constructed in underserved areas and recognized by government for subventions	64 new schools constructed.
	3.1.2 A total of 250 crowded schools enrolling girls provided two additional classrooms, female toilets, and arsenic-free tube wells where lacking	Construction of additional classrooms completed in 249 schools. Female toilets and arsenic-free tube wells provided to 144 schools

Design Summary	Indicators/Targets	Status
	3.1.3 One model madrasah each is developed in 30 districts	Target increased to 35. Works completed in 33 sites.
	3.2.1 Poverty-targeted stipends are provided to up to 30% girls enrolled and 10% boys enrolled in 53 <i>upazilas</i> (subdistrict)	A total of \$25.15 million has been distributed among 1,201,151 students (30% girls and 10% boys) of 2,823 schools from the beginning of the project.
	3.1 Confirm the sites for the 56 new schools to be constructed in underserved areas by Year 1	SESDP confirmed sites for new 56 additional schools in underserved areas.
	3.2 Initiate construction of new schools by year 2	New additional schools constructed in 56 underserved locations.
	3.3 Finalize the criteria for selecting crowded schools enrolling girls to receive additional facilities by year 1	Criteria for selecting crowded schools were finalized by the SESDP.
	3.4 Select 250 schools to receive additional facilities by year 1	Selected 250 schools to receive additional facilities.
	3.5 Initiate the upgrade of under resourced schools by year 2	SESDP initiated upgradation of under resourced schools
	3.6 Select areas where 30 model madrasah are to be developed by year 1	SESDP selected areas for developing model madrasahs
	3.7 Develop a national strategy plan for rationalization and improvement of nongovernment secondary school facilities by year 2	Not done.
	3.8 Finalize the criteria for giving stipends to boys and girls from poor families by year 1	SESDP finalized criteria for giving stipend to boys and girls of poor families.
	3.9 Begin monitoring the distribution of stipends by year 2	SESDP monitored distribution of stipends to boys and girls
	3.10 Ensure equitable access of tribal students of underserved areas.	SESDP attached special attention to access of tribal students to quality secondary education and ensured inclusiveness of tribal and ethnic cultural heritage in curriculum.

BANBEIS=Bangladesh Bureau of Educational Information and Statistics, BISE=Board of Intermediate and Secondary Education, BMED=Bangladesh Madrasah Education Board, DEO=District Education Officer, DIA=Directorate of Inspection and Audit, DSHE=Directorate of Secondary and Higher Education, EMIS= education management information system, GIS=geographical informational system, HRM=human resource management, HSC=higher secondary certificate, ICT=information communication technology, MQA=monitoring quality assurance, MOE=Ministry of Education, NCTB=National Curriculum and Textbook Board, PSPU=policy support planning unit, PBM=project benefit monitoring, SSC=secondary school certificate, SESDP=Secondary Education Sector Development Project, SESIP=Secondary Education Sector Improvement Project, SBA=school based assessment, SPBMS=school performance-based management system, TA=technical assistance, and USEO=Upazila Secondary Education Officer.

Source: Executing Agency Project Completion Report, 2014.

PHYSICAL AND FINANCIAL PROGRESS OF PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION
(Target and Actual)

Table 2.1: Progress of different Motivational Campaigns and Workshops

Subject Area(s)	Subject(s)	Target	Progress
Studies, Campaign, workshop	1. Monitoring and quality assurance (MQA)	2	2
	2. School performance-based management system (SPBMS)	1	1
	3. Education management information system (EMIS) DVC	1.	1
	4. Curriculum (science)	1	1
	5. Curriculum (madrasah)	1	1
	6. School-based assessment (SBA)	1	1
	7. Exam review and redevelopment	1	1
	8. Exam reform implementation study	1	1
	9. Stipend evaluation study	1	1
	10. Project public campaign	22	22
	11. Workshops	64	64
Summary	Total participants of 64 workshops is 8,151 and Total participants of 22 awareness campaigns is 1,768		
Education and training materials		176,494	176,494
Training and staff development			
Local training (LT)	CQ PBM E-learning SBA Curriculum		442,091 1,957 600 38,545 53,033
	Total persons		667,230
Overseas training (OT)	Total persons		170

Note: Training for the remaining persons is planned under the in-going SESIP allocation.

EMIS = education management information system, MQA = monitoring quality assurance, PBM = project benefit monitoring, SPBMS=School Performance-Based Management System, and SBA=school-based assessment.

Source: Executing Agency's Project Completion report. 2014.

Table 2.2: Progress of Overseas Study Tours and Training

Batch	Subject(s)	Country	Duration		Participants
			Dates	Days	
A	Study Tours				
1.	Secondary Education Development	Canada	29 Mar–7 Apr 2009	10	6
2.	Secondary Education Development	Canada	16–25 Mar 2009	10	6
3.	Monitoring and Quality Assurance in Secondary Education	Philippines	13–24 Apr 2011	12	15
4.	Monitoring and Quality Assurance in Secondary Education	Philippines	31-Jul–11 Aug 2011	12	15
5.	Development of Madrasah Education	Indonesia	10–21 Aug 2012	12	16
6.	School Design and Construction	Malaysia	26 Jan–6 Feb 2012	12	10
7.	Development of Madrasah Education	Indonesia	8–19 Feb 2012	12	15
8.	Effective Use of EMIS in Education Management	Thailand	22 Jul–2 Aug 2012	12	12
9.	Secondary Education Development	Canada	17–30 Sep 2012	12	8
B	Overseas Training				
10.	Web Application Design, Development and Maintenance	Thailand	23 Sep–13 Oct 2012	18	10
11.	Examination Development	Thailand	13 Sep–22 Oct 2012	30	16
12.	Education Development	Thailand		30	25
13.	Monitoring and Quality Assurance	China		12	16
Total					170

Source: 2013. Secondary Education Sector Development Project. Booklet on Secondary Education Sector Development Project. Dhaka.

Table 2.3: Progress of Overseas Training of Officials of different Agencies by PIU

Particulars of Overseas Training(s)	Units	Target	Actual
1.Regional study tours on MQA for PIU, MoE, DSHE, PC, ERD and IMED	Persons	29	29
2 Regional study tours on MQA for PIU, MoE, DSHE, PC, ERD and IMED	Persons	16	16
2.Regional study tours on effective use of EMIS	Persons	12	12
3.Regional training on Web enable application design	Persons	10	10
4.Regional study tour on Madrasah Education to Indonesia	Persons	31	31
5.Advanced course on curriculum development for NCTB and SESDP staff	Persons	25	25
6.Advanced course on assessment for BISE staff	Persons	16	16
7.Regional training on structural design and construction for EED staff	Persons	10	10
Subtotal (Loan Fund)	Persons	149	149

Note 1: In addition to the overseas training of 149 persons, 21 persons were provided overseas training under the allocation of SESDP-TA Team.

Note 2: Each program had different durations.

DSHE=Directorate of Secondary and Higher Education, EED=Education Engineering Department, ERD=Economic Relations Division, EMIS= education management information system, IMED=Implementation Monitoring and Evaluation Division, MQA=monitoring quality assurance, NCTB=National Curriculum and Textbook Board, PIC=project implementation committee, PIU=project implementation unit, and SESDP=Secondary Education Sector Development Project.

Source: Executing Agency's Project Completion Report. 2014.

Table 2.4: Procurement of Vehicle, Office Equipment and Furniture

	Item(s)	Target	Procured	Note
A	Vehicle			
1	Jeep	2	2	
2	Microbus	1	1	
3	Motorbikes	382	372	Demand was short of target motorbikes
B	Office Equipment			
1	Desk Computer	1624	1426	198 computers were not procured as academic activities in 99 new schools did not start.
2	Laptop Computer	33	33	
3	Multimedia Projector	64	62	Demand was short of target.
4	Photocopier	12	12	
5	Printer	209	209	
6	Printer	2	2	
7	Scanner	8	7	Demand was short of target
8	UPS and PS	752	752	
9	IPS Battery	32	32	
10	Telephone	140	138	Demand was short of target
11	Facsimile	4	4	
12	Modem	665	574	W. Modem: Demand was not placed for 91 W. Modem
13	Science Equipment for model madrasah	105	99	Actual demand was short of target
14	Science equipment for new school	132	113	Demand was short of target as academic activities of some new schools did not start
15	Server	61	59	Demand was short of target
16	Cisco Switch	3	3	
17	IP Camera	1	1	
18	Air Cooler	3	3	
19	Antivirus	26	26	
20	CPM and SPMIS	1	0	Demand was short of target
21	Router	1	1	
22	Store Device	1	1	
23	Firewall	1	1	
24	Oracle Soft	1	1	
25	EMIS Printing	2	1	Demand was short of target
26	Net Cabling	1	1	
27	Hard Enh	1	0	Demand was short of target
28	Digital Camera	1	1	
29	SPB Machine	1	0	Demand was short of target
30	Delegate Unit	1	1	
C	Furniture			
1	Zonal MPO Offices	9	9	
2	District Education Offices	10	10	
3	PIU, HRM, PMQAU, NCTB, BEDU	6	6	
4	Upazila Academic Supervisors	222	222	
5	Model Madrasah	35	35	
6	Zonal Education Office	2	2	

BMED=Bangladesh Madrasah Education Board; EMIS= education management information system; HRM=human resource management; IPS=instant power supply; MPO=monthly payment order; NCTB=National Curriculum and Textbook Board; PMQAU=policy support, school monitoring, and quality assurance unit; SPMIS=school performance monitoring information system; SPBM=school performance-based management; and UPS=uninterrupted power supply.

Source: Executing Agency's Project Completion Report. 2014.

Table 2.5: Civil Works Construction

Item(s)	Number of Facilities		Remarks
	Target	Actual	
1 Construction of Zonal Education Office	2	2	
2 Construction of District Education Office	3	3	
3 Refurbishment of Pilot ICT	20	20	
4 Construction of new schools	66	62	2 cancelled and 2 not completed, total classroom built: 62x12= 744
5 Construction of additional class rooms			
Horizontal Extension	154	153	One cancelled, total classroom built: 249x3=747
Vertical extension	96	96	
New construction (schools)	250	249	
6 Toilet with Tube-wells	146	119	27 Toilet/Tube well was cancelled
7 Construction of Education Complex at Chittagong	1	1	
8 Upgradation of SESIP School Complex	3	3	Total classroom upgraded: 3x12=36
9 Rehabilitation of offices	3	3	
10 Development of facilities in model madrasahs	35	33	Construction of the development of facilities in 2 model madrasahs was cancelled. Total classroom built: 33x5=165

Total classroom built=1,692 and Total classroom upgraded= 36

ICT=information communication technology, and SESIP=Secondary Education Sector Improvement Project.

Source: Executing Agency Project Completion Report, 2014.

Table 2.6: Progress of Distribution of Stipend (January 2007– June 2013)

Academic Year(s)	Installment(s)	Number of Stipend Recipient Students			Amount Distributed (BDT Million)
		Boys	Girls	Total	
2007	#1 (Jan–June)	34,112	102,335	136,447	115.1
	#2 (July–Dec)	36,825	110,475	147,300	129.5
2008	#1 (Jan–June)	41,213	123,639	164,852	144.9
	#2 (July–Dec)	41,649	124,948	166,597	150.1
2009	#1 (Jan–June)	45,837	139,604	185,441	158.2
	#2 (July–Dec)	44,373	133,120	177,493	155.1
2010	#1 (Jan–June)	44,047	132,142	176,189	155.0
	#2 (July–Dec)	43,716	131,151	174,867	156.0
2011	#1 (Jan–June)	44,326	132,978	177,304	159.0
	#2 (July–Dec)	44,139	132,418	176,557	155.0
2012	#1 (Jan–June)	46,688	140,064	186,752	161.5
	#2 (July–Dec)	45,540	136,619	182,159	157.2
2013	#1 (Jan–June)	43,425	130,276	173,701	152.2
Total		299,648	901,038	1,201,151	1,948.8

Abbreviations: BDT=Bangladesh Taka.

Source: Executing Agency's Project Completion Report, 2014.

Table 2.7: Financial Progress of the Government of Bangladesh Fund Utilization

Fiscal Year (FY)	Allocation (Million Taka)			Utilization (Million Taka)		Government Fund Released (Million Taka)
	Original.	First Revision	Last Revision	Amount	% Utilization	
2006–2007	132.8	132.8	132.8	116.3	87.5	35.2
2007–2008	456.2	500.0	707.4	616.2	87.1	150.7
2008–2009	1,100.0	1,100.0	976.9	872.5	89.3	208.5
2009–2010	2,789.3	1,120.0	1,511.4	1,493.5	98.8	249.2
2010–2011	1,290.0	1,200.0	1,180.0	1,176.5	99.7	241.9
2011–2012	1,101.8	1,275.0	1,116.7	1,048.0	93.9	240.4
2012–2013	1,063.3	1,257.1	1,273.0	1,272.8	100.0	325.0
2013–2014	-	1,348.4	1,035.2	935.7	90.4	532.6
Total:	7,933.3	7,933.3	7,933.3	7,531.4	94.9	1,983.3

FY=fiscal year (year ending 30 June).

Source: Executing Agency's Project Completion Report, 2014.

STATUS OF IMPLEMENTATION OF TRIBAL PEOPLE'S DEVELOPMENT

A. Opportunities of Tribal People's Development through Secondary Education Sector Development Program (SESDP)

1. The education sector of Bangladesh in general and the secondary education subsector in particular has unique opportunities for development of the Tribal Population (TP) known as Small Ethnic Communities (SEC) through targeting the minority and underserved and disadvantaged population who lack adequate access. Bangladesh promotes equal opportunities for all the citizens particularly the people in remote areas where educational facilities are weak and inadequate, poverty incidence is high, and social barriers are prevalent. These issues are common among the SECs who have special needs due to cultural and language barriers and lack of necessary employable skills needed by the job markets. The Secondary Education Sector Development Project (SESDP) has availed itself of the opportunities of targeting secondary education students, schools, teachers, school management committees, and parents of the SECs. SESDP placed special attention to tribal students to eliminate their difficulties in educational achievements.

2. The overall objective of the SESDP was to help reduce poverty in Bangladesh by improving the quality of secondary education and increasing access to secondary education. SESDP supported the long-term goal of secondary education reform by establishing a secondary education system that responded to a growing formal economy by producing market demanded effectively skilled manpower. SESDP aim was to: (i) strengthen management of secondary education system, (ii) improve quality of secondary education including madrasah education, and (iii) increase access to secondary education.

3. SESDP comprised critical policy actions related to the four main sector challenges. The policies included, among others: (i) decentralization of secondary education management, (ii) implementation of decentralized education management information system, (iii) implementation of school performance-based management, (iv) functional specialization, (v) introduction of new grades 9–10 curricula, (vi) reform of secondary school examinations, (vii) introduction of school-based assessment (SBA) for grades 6–9, and (viii) review of the female secondary stipends' program.

4. SESDP focused on improving the efficiency, quality, and access to secondary education through three outputs: (i) increasing accountability and transparency in secondary education management, (ii) improving the quality of education, and (iii) improving equity of access to secondary education.

5. The reforms undertaken through the SESDP were general, without placing any specific attention to particular section of the population including the 1.4 million tribal populations. However, the secondary schools, and students and teachers in tribal areas were considered as they were situated in underserved areas of special needs.

6. However, the SESDP had no negative impact on the tribal people. Rather, the nationwide program implementation improved the quality of secondary education for every secondary level student of all locations, including the SECs. The limited decentralization of responsibilities at various levels within the secondary education subsector contributed to faster decision making, benefiting rural communities including the tribal people living in rural and remote areas. Monitoring and quality assurance measures developed and implemented were supportive and useful in identifying and taking actions for weak-performing schools and students

particularly of rural areas, and remote areas including the areas of tribal population such as Chittagong Hill Tracts (CHT), Netrokona, Sylhet, Patuakhali, Mymensingh, Kishoreganj, Rajshahi, and Dinajpur where most of the tribal people live.

7. School-based performance monitoring, revision of curricula of grades 6–9, enhanced relevance to labor market, and learning and analytical skills of the students contributed to improved learning relevance to the labor market. This enhanced the opportunities of the secondary education students including the tribal students, to acquire high income-earning skills and jobs.

8. The poverty-targeted stipend reduced absenteeism, improved academic performance, family planning, and population management due to restrictions for getting married early particularly among the students of remote areas and of poor families. Additional classrooms, furniture, office equipment, and computer laboratories expanded access to improved educational environment and information technology. The poor students particularly in remote areas, in crowded schools, girls, or those in underserved areas with no facilities increased their access to a better learning environment. The SESDP support of sanitary toilets especially for girls, and tube wells improved the learning environment.

9. The SECs comprise about less than 2% (1.4 million) of the total population of Bangladesh. Bangladesh is largely a monocultural society, with the notable exception of the minority tribal communities living in the Chittagong Hill Tracts (CHT), in parts of Sylhet, Mymensingh, Dinajpur, Patuakhali, and Rajshahi. Highest concentration of the tribal population is in the three hill districts (Rangamati, Bandarban and Khagrachari of the CHT region. The population of CHT is about 1.4 million out of that nearly 50% are tribal population comprising 12 different ethnic origins. According to a study¹ conducted in 1999 the populations of the 12 ethnic tribal groups are Chakma (21.5%), Marma (15.5%), Tripura (11.3%), Tanchanga (5.0%), Kheyang (3.6%), Pankhua (3.6%) Bawm (3.4%), Khumi (3.4%), Chak (1.6%), Lushai (0.8%), and Rakhain (0.8%). The remaining 26.3% is Bangali. However, the population of Bangali has increased over the years through migration into the CHT and migration of the tribal population to outside the CHT.

10. The tribal populations have different social organizations, marriage customs, birth and death rites, food and other social customs than the rest of the country. There is lack of information on their socioeconomic indicators. Tribal communities largely speak Tibeto-Burman languages. The largest tribal groups are the Chakmas (21.5%), Marmas (15.5%), Tripuras (11.3%), and Tanchanga (5.0%).

11. The tribal population had limited access to education. However, they are increasingly accessing the expanded education facilities of the remote areas through improved communication systems, and establishment of educational institutions.

B. Legal Framework

12. The Bangladesh Constitution recognized equal rights of all citizens irrespective of ethnicity, religion, birthplace, and gender. Accordingly, a specified number of public sector jobs and seats in government education institutions are reserved for tribal populations. Separate laws have also been enacted that contain reference to tribal population including among others, the education of tribal people. These include the East Bengal State Acquisition and Tenancy Act

¹ 1999.Hassall & Associates, New Zealand and Eusuf and Associates, Bangladesh. Dhaka

of 1950; the Chittagong Hill Tracts Regulation of 1900; Hill District Council Acts of 1989; and the Chittagong Hill Tracts Regional Council Act of 1998. The Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) recognizes the problems they face and their lack of opportunities. The PRSP has recommended actions to improve the situation of tribal communities including access to education at all levels.

C. Tribal People's Development Framework

13. The SESDP had a Tribal People's Development Framework (TPDF) uploaded in ADB website in October 2006. Although the project did not focus on any particular indigenous peoples area, the TPDF proposed several strategies for addressing issues related to tribal people of the country in broader perspective which are summarized as follows:

"SESDP will implement reforms to improve the quality, equity of access, and management of secondary education nationwide. As such, SESDP will benefit all schools, government and nongovernment, including those located in rural areas, and secondary school students, including TP [tribal people]. The supported reforms include:

- (i) increased decentralization of management responsibilities;
- (ii) establishment of a monitoring and quality assurance system;
- (iii) national implementation of school performance-based management system;
- (iv) national implementation of education management information system (EMIS);
- (v) revision of curricula towards greater relevance to the labor market and further education;
- (vi) strengthened student assessment;
- (vii) underserved areas, including rural areas, assisted; and
- (viii) implementation of poverty-targeted stipends."

14. In addition, during project implementation, the following strategies were included to facilitate addressing the indigenous peoples issues:

- (i) In the CHT and other parts of Bangladesh with tribal people and are underserved, provision will be made to help ensure that equitable access to quality secondary education is available to all children through the establishment of new schools and classrooms targeted to underserved areas. The new secondary schools will be established in underserved areas meeting the criteria of no school within 3 kilometers, 5 minimum of 280 students, and a minimum population of 4,600 for a coeducational secondary school.
- (ii) Given the poverty faced by many tribal people households, the project is reducing the barriers that prevent children of tribal people access and participation in general secondary schools by introducing poverty-targeted stipends.
- (iii) The Project loan will support the construction of schools in at least 5 underserved thanas where tribal people live and meet the criteria for civil works;
- (iv) The Project loan will support the construction of additional classrooms in at least 25 schools that meet the criteria for civil works and are located in *thanas* (subdistricts) where tribal people reside;
- (v) The services of a social development and gender specialist to support Program implementation will be obtained. The specialist will, among others, help develop a

situation analysis, strategy, and action plan for the participation of tribal peoples in secondary education;

- (vi) The Project Implementation Unit (PIU) and the Directorate of Secondary and Higher Education (DSHE) will collect project baseline tribal people-disaggregated data, and, thereafter, regularly collect and maintain tribal people-disaggregated data in its database.
- (vii) The PIU, in cooperation with the DSHE will regularly analyze project output and impact indicators, including by the tribal people; and
- (viii) In recruiting new teaching staff in new schools serving communities with tribal people built through project funds, priority will be given to those who are from the immediate community.

15. Apart from guided by the TPDF, SESDP also followed the Government of Bangladesh universal strategy and policy to ensure quality education of all secondary level students of all parts of the country enrolling at grade 6. Highest emphasis was placed on ensuring secondary education to all students that passed the primary grades. This assures access to all students, including those in the tribal and remote areas, and poor students irrespective of gender.

16. Since there was no particular area identified to have specific negative impact to indigenous peoples, the project had no specific tribal people's action plan. Focusing on tribal population to prevent exclusion of tribal people from project beneficiary group, specific needs of tribal population under SESDP, and formulating common community action plan where tribal people live with non-tribal people in the same area was built in within the project scope applicable all over the country.

D. Achievements of Secondary Education Sector Development Project for Addressing Issues Related to Tribal People

17. The SESDP implemented reforms to improve the quality, equity of access, and management of secondary education nationwide and benefited 19,070 secondary schools and 223,555 teacher and 7,510,218 students (including the 275 schools in the CHT and 2,671 teachers and 92,755 students along with 577 female teachers and 46,376 female students of the CHT). In the CHT, nearly 50% secondary level students are from tribal population. Besides CHT, there are tribal populations and tribal students in other parts of the country as mentioned in paragraph 6.

18. The SESDP is a countrywide major program covering all secondary schools and limited numbers of secondary Madrashas. The program supported reforms through: decentralization of management responsibilities; education quality monitoring; school performance-based management system; education management information system; upgrading and updating curricula toward greater relevance to the labor market and further education; strengthened student assessment; addressing the needs of underserved areas (including rural areas and areas of tribal population) and pro-poor stipends.

29. The SESDP organized a national workshop in the Rangamati on inclusion of the issues and cultural history of the indigenous population in the national curriculum for secondary level. SESDP constructed additional classrooms in crowded secondary schools of the CHT to expand

existing access to secondary schools. In addition, the SESDP established three new secondary schools in the underserved remote areas of the CHT to expand existing access to quality secondary education. Further, the SESDP supported working of the tribal teachers in the CHT areas so that they can follow their cultural tradition and religious rituals and also serve their community. This was supported also to allow the tribal students and tribal teachers to ensure teaching learning in their local mother tongues. The SESDP also provided increased stipend in the CHT to help the poor tribal students in pursuing secondary education.

20. In addition, SESDP during its implementation pursued the following strategies including facilitation addressing the tribal student issues:

- (i) In the CHT and other parts of Bangladesh with tribal people and people of underserved areas, provision was made to ensure equitable access to quality secondary education to all children;
- (ii) Given the poverty faced by many tribal households, SESDP reduced the barriers that prevent tribal children access to secondary education by introducing poverty-targeted stipends;
- (iii) The SESDP supported construction of schools in underserved thanas where tribal people live and meeting the needs for educational facilities;
- (iv) The SESDP supported the construction of additional classrooms in crowded schools with higher preference to areas where tribal people live to expand the access to quality educational facilities;
- (v) The SESDP used the services of a social development/gender specialist in program implementation to facilitate among others undertake situation analysis, strategy, and action plan to smoothen effective participation of tribal students in secondary education;
- (vi) The PIU of the SESDP and the DSHE gathered baseline data disaggregated by districts, institutions, gender through strengthening Education Management Information System that also included data of institutions, teachers and students of under-served areas and tribal areas.
- (vii) The PIU, in cooperation with the DSHE analyzed output and impact indicators in general and underserved areas and areas of high concentration of tribal community and students in particular; and
- (viii) The SESDP while recruiting new teaching staff used the government standard quota provisions for the tribal people in employment and also allowing tribal staff to serve in their tribal areas.

E. Implementation Arrangements

21. The executing agency for the SESDP was the Ministry of Education (MOE), while the DSHE was the implementing agency. The DSHE ensured that total inclusiveness is ensured through the SESDP and all covenants are fully met with. The PIU implemented the project, ensuring all design parameters and objectives including social and gender and other aspects with ultimate goal of ensuring quality secondary education and inclusiveness for the secondary level students enrolling at grade 6.

F. Cost Estimates and Financing

22. There was separate budget allocation for three outputs and activities. The allocations were adequate as almost all activities were achieved after cancellation of a considerable amount of the funds. However, there was no separate budget allocation for addressing tribal population issues.

G. Monitoring and Evaluation

23. The MOE monitored the project implementation to ensure the issues of tribal population relating to secondary education. Considering the heightened importance placed by the government on the overall development of the tribal population and the disadvantaged sections of all sections of the population and underserved areas, the MOE addressed the tribal population issues under the SESDP effectively through an overall national strategy and policy and the plan in a holistic manner.

PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION SCHEDULE – ORIGINAL AND ACTUAL

Description	Year	Year 1 2006				Year 2 2007				Year 3 2008				Year 4 2009				Year 5 2010				Year 6 2011				Year 7 2012				Year 8 2013			
	Quarter	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4
Strengthening Management and Governance of Secondary Education																																	
Review structure and systems of DSHE, DIA, and MOE agencies and make recommendations to support functional specialization and decentralization	Original																																
	Actual																																
Review HRM within DSHE and MOE agencies	Original																																
	Actual																																
Develop plan to update HRM within MOE and DSHE	Original																																
	Actual																																
Implement new HRM system	Original																																
	Actual																																
Develop plan to upgrade zonal and district offices and establish <i>upazila</i> (subdistrict) education offices	Original																																
	Actual																																
Initiate the upgrade of zonal and district offices and establish upazila (subdistrict) offices	Original																																
	Actual																																
Initiate hiring of more personnel at the upazila(subdistrict) level	Original																																
	Actual																																
Develop plan for a new MQA system	Original																																
	Actual																																
Develop the staffing plan to support the new MQA system	Original																																
	Actual																																
Implement the new MQA system	Original																																
	Actual																																
Implement SPBMS nationwide	Original																																
	Actual																																
Adapt SPBMS materials to the needs of madrasahs	Original																																
	Actual																																
Train selected madrasah school administrators and teachers in SPBMS	Original																																
	Actual																																
Introduce SPBMS in selected madrasah schools	Original																																
	Actual																																

Description	Year	Year 1 2006				Year 2 2007				Year 3 2008				Year 4 2009				Year 5 2010				Year 6 2011				Year 7 2012				Year 8 2013			
	Quarter	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4				
Develop the plan to expand secondary EMIS nationally and link with BANBEIS	Original																																
	Actual																																
Develop the plan for installing GIS	Original																																
	Actual																																
Implementation of GIS and national secondary EMIS	Original																																
	Actual																																
Training of SMC members	Original																																
	Actual																																
Quality of Secondary Education Enhanced																																	
Review grades 6–8 and 11–12 curricula	Original																																
	Actual																																
Revise grades 6–8 and 11–12 curricula	Original																																
	Actual																																
Develop teacher support guides for grades 6–8 and 11–12 curricula	Original																																
	Actual																																
Develop training plan for teachers	Original																																
	Actual																																
Develop dissemination plan to parents, communities, and other stakeholders	Original																																
	Actual																																
Initiate teacher training in new curricula	Original																																
	Actual																																
Disseminate information on the new curricula	Original																																
	Actual																																
Review and make recommendation to modernize grades 6–12 madrasah curricula	Original																																
	Actual																																
Revise grades 6–12 madrasah curricula	Original																																
	Actual																																
Develop training, teaching, and learning materials for the revised madrasah curricula	Original																																
	Actual																																
Refine SBA	Original																																
	Actual																																

Description	Year	Year 1 2006				Year 2 2007				Year 3 2008				Year 4 2009				Year 5 2010				Year 6 2011				Year 7 2012				Year 8 2013			
	Quarter	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4				
Develop SBA expansion plan to other districts	Original																																
	Actual																																
Implement SBA nationwide	Original																																
	Actual																																
Develop plan to implement class-based assessment	Original																																
	Actual																																
Develop teacher guides for class-based assessment Implement class-based assessment	Original																																
	Actual																																
Implement class-based assessment	Original																																
	Actual																																
Refine the ICT subject in grades 9–10 and related teaching and learning materials	Original																																
	Actual																																
Train teachers in new ICT subject	Original																																
	Actual																																
Finalize the school selection criteria for piloting e-learning	Original																																
	Actual																																
Initiate the piloting of e-learning	Original																																
	Actual																																
Develop new HSC examination papers	Original																																
	Actual																																
Develop training plan for master trainers for planned examination reforms	Original																																
	Actual																																
Develop information dissemination plan for planned examination reforms	Original																																
	Actual																																
Train master trainers	Original																																
	Actual																																
Train examination development personnel in new examinations	Original																																
	Actual																																
Conduct a comparative study of BISE examination standards	Original																																
	Actual																																
Review the structure, functions, and activities of the BMEB	Original																																
	Actual																																

Description	Year	Year 1 2006				Year 2 2007				Year 3 2008				Year 4 2009				Year 5 2010				Year 6 2011				Year 7 2012				Year 8 2013			
	Quarter	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4				
Develop recommendation towards strengthening the BMEB	Original																																
	Actual																																
Strengthen the BMEB and stakeholders	Original																																
	Actual																																
Equity of Access to Secondary Education Enhanced																																	
Confirm the sites for the 56 new schools to be constructed in underserved areas	Original																																
	Actual																																
Construction of new schools	Original																																
	Actual																																
Finalize the criteria for selecting madrasahs and overcrowded schools Select 250 schools to receive additional classrooms and toilets enrolling girls to receive additional facilities	Original																																
	Actual																																
Select 250 schools to receive additional classrooms and toilets	Original																																
	Actual																																
Construct additional classrooms and toilets	Original																																
	Actual																																
Select areas where model madrasahs are to be developed	Original																																
	Actual																																
Develop a national strategy plan for rationalization and improvement of nongovernment secondary school facilities	Original																																
	Actual																																
Finalize the criteria for giving stipends to boys and girls from poor families	Original																																
	Actual																																
Third-party validation of stipends	Original																																
	Actual																																

Original ————
Actual ————

ADB=Asian Development Bank, BANBEIS=Bangladesh Bureau of Educational Information and Statistics, BMED=Bangladesh Madrasah Education Board, DSHE=Directorate of Secondary and Higher Education, DIA=Directorate of Inspection and Audit, DEO=District Education Officer, EMIS= education management information system, ICT= information and communication technology, MQA=monitoring quality assurance, SBA= school based assessment, SMC= school management committee, Source: Executing Agency.

ANALYSIS OF ACHIEVEMENTS OF GENDER ACTION PLAN (GAP)

1. The project is categorized as effective gender mainstreaming (EGM). The gender action plan factors the gender concerns into all project outputs to promote women's participation equally as agents and as beneficiaries in secondary education system. Achievements of girls' in the secondary education will facilitate their progression to higher education and increase their competitiveness in the labor market. Girls, who constitute half of the pupils in the secondary education level, need to be prepared for their future employment and decision-making roles through quality education. Similarly, women are forming a major part of education providers, yet women's contributions often go unrecognized. The gender action plan aims to (i) increase women's participation as students and stakeholders in education, (ii) increase women's social benefits from the project, (iii) develop women as contributors to the educational management system, and (iv) support women's empowerment in decision making and public life.

2. A project-wide gender action plan (GAP) mainstreams gender design features across all project outputs. The operational system and curriculum was reviewed from gender perspectives and identified gender based needs and provided recommendations to address them. An orientation was organized for curriculum developers of National Curriculum and Textbook Board (NCTB) to ensure gender sensitiveness in new skill-based curriculum. Madrasah curriculum was modernized and included gender perspectives. The key elements included in GAP are: (i) decentralized set up to include at least 40% of women at all level and women's participation in school management stakeholders groups; (ii) Education Management Information System (EMIS) data and analysis to include gender-based information and women views; (iii) human resource management functions to address women's needs; (iv) revised and reviewed curriculum from a gender perspective; (v) reformed national examination and at least 40% of female teachers orientation on new exam system; (vi) gender-focused curriculum for teachers, teacher trainers and administrators; (vii) girls access to information communication technology; (viii) classrooms, common room, and toilet facilities for girls; and (ix) at least 50% of women included in the school management committee. Gender perspectives and recommendations are reflected in the modification of curriculum. Curriculum modification for grades 6–8 (total 51 subjects) was completed in September 2011 and for grades 9–10 (total 27 subjects) was completed in May 2012. The objectives, targets, and learning outcomes of the curriculum were designed from gender perspectives. For an example: pictures showing a girl doing odd job while a boy was operating a computer was dropped from the curriculum.

3. The overall objective of the project for contributing to poverty reduction through human resources development was by improving the relevance of secondary education to improve the needs of the labor market provides the premise for opportunity and needs for equitable access of women to labor market. This necessitated mainstreaming the gender issues targeting equity in employment of women and girls as teachers and education administrators and planners, as students to acquire labor market demanded education and skills to fight poverty and deprivation, and as members of school management committee members to take part in social work and leadership in the school management and community along with the men.

4. The project design was based on poverty and social context. The project had the potential to promote gender equality or women's empowerment and poverty reduction by improving women's access to secondary education and use of opportunities of quality secondary education, resources, assets, and participation in decision making. Equity of access of women in education has been attained but there is need for effective gender mainstreaming in education consistent to labor market demand and to create a conducive environment for all women on a sustainable basis including the underserved or difficult to access areas and areas

of disadvantaged population such as the indigenous people and ethnic minorities. The GAP framework provides overview and summary of the achievements of opportunities of mainstreaming gender issues under the project.

Gender Action Plan Results

Gender Action Plan Results	
Output wise Activities, Indicators and Targets	Progress up to March 2014
Program Loan	
1. Strengthened Management And Governance of Secondary Education	
Increased Decentralization	
Ensure decentralized, gender-oriented HR functions within the DSHE and the field	A gender oriented report prepared for decentralized HR functions within DSHE.
Ensure implementation of the government circulars and National Action Plan	Orientation on the gender-related government circulars and National Action Plan was arranged for a total of 872 <i>upazila</i> (subdistrict) and district officers. Total 293 women officers (33.5%) attended the program
Ensure women's participation in school management stakeholders groups	The latest act on SMCs enacted in June 2009 has ensured female participation in the SMCs. At present, women SMC members total of 26,670 (16%) out of 1,66,844 members.
Orientation of SMCs, PTAs, Head Teachers through other projects	A total of 35,600 SMC members and head masters (17,990 + 17,610) were trained under SESDP in January 2012
Monitoring and Quality Assurance System Established	
Establish gender-based monitoring and quality assurance system	The project has supported and established a gender-based monitoring and quality assurance system for DSHE. All the sex- segregated data are available in www.emis.gov.bd EMIS data flow includes sex-segregated information, such as number of students, number of teachers, teachers training. A data baseline for all institutions under DSHE created in 2012 under EMIS that included gender-based information. Online data update for 2013 has been completed. Different reports generated from EMIS represents women's views
Include gender-based information in the reporting process	
Include gender-based information and women's views in the EMIS data and analysis	
Functional specialization established within education agencies	
The functional specialization activities within educational agencies to include women and HR management functions to address women's needs	Two women officers are working at HRM Unit of DSHE out of total six to promote women's participation in the process of functional specialization within educational agencies and HR management functions
Improved operations and management systems	
Review operational system with gender perspectives, identify gender-based needs and Provide appropriate recommendations to address them	SESDP-TACT gender specialist reviewed the operational system and provided recommendations to the project including promoting gender friendly working atmosphere, circulars to ensure gender based needs

Output wise Activities, Indicators and Targets	Progress up to March 2014
2. Higher Quality Secondary Education	
Reviewed and Revised Curricula	
Review curriculum from gender perspectives and modify as needed	A new curriculum for grades 6–12 developed under SESDP based on curriculum review in 2010. One recommendation for example included in the new curriculum was deleting pictures showing a girl doing odd jobs while a boy operating a computer was from the textbooks
Ensure the new skill-based curriculum to be gender sensitive	An orientation was done for the curriculum developers of NCTB on gender sensitive skill based curricula. The number of participants in the orientation program was 50 including 25 women participants. Through this, special subjects like ICT have been made compulsory for all that would facilitate skills-based learning for girls as well
Modernized madrasah curricula to include gender perspectives	Madrasah curricula was modernized and revised from gender perspectives in 2011. Five core subjects are now similar with mainstream which include the same gender neutral information, pictures, examples etc.
Skill-based curriculum to be introduced to ensure girls' education in diverse areas	New curriculum framework introduced that includes subjects like ICT, home economics, agriculture, garments and sewing technology, food management etc. to ensure girls, education in diverse areas
Promote math and science education for girls through campaigns and motivation	Various campaigns and motivations undertaken under the project to ensure increased number of girls enrolled in math and science. To encourage students, teachers are provided training on campaigns where about 30% female teachers participated among total 4,880 teachers.
Review staffing pattern, operating and management system of NCTB with gender perspectives; identify gender-based needs and address them	Currently a total of 25 female specialists are working at NCTB out of total 54 specialists (including SESDP supported specialists) meaning about 50% female participation.
Building capacity of NCTB officials in addressing gender	SESDP TACT gender specialist conducted training sessions for 50 (25 women) NCTB officials including all NCTB curriculum specialists and other staff
Ensure recruitment and training of women staff in NCTB	At present total 25 (46%) women specialists are working at NCTB out of total 54 specialists which is higher than government-approved quota
Strengthened student assessment	
The schools and community (including women) to be oriented on the new SBA system	Total 65,000/ teachers and community people (including women) received orientation on the new SBA system in 2006. Orientation on new version of SBA called Continuous Assessment (CA) arranged in 2013 for about 50,000 students. It was part of curriculum dissemination program

Output wise Activities, Indicators and Targets	Progress up to March 2014
Reformed national examinations	
Ensure female teachers' orientation on new exam system	A total of 4,42,091 teachers of different subjects have been trained on new examination systems including all women teachers under SEDDP. Around 30% were women participants.
Ensure 30 staff at all levels of BEDU and the new central entity	BEDU does not have 30% women staff. All four specialists working at BEDU are male.
Strengthened teacher education	
Ensure gender-focused curriculum for teachers, teacher-trainers, and administrator	The new B. Ed. curriculum developed is effectively gender-focused
Staffing, training, and HR functions of NTRCA to address gender aspects and implement the NAP	Gender aspects are addressed and NAP is being followed. At present, one member and other key officials of NTRCA are women
Ensure implementation of the government's circulars in recruiting and training female teachers in schools and madrasah	MOE issued circular on 14 May 2009 readjusting the women quota for recruitment of teachers in different slabs: urban (40%), suburban (30%) and rural areas (20%).
The new central coordination authority for teacher education to develop gender-oriented HR provisions (recruitment, training, transfer, posting, accommodation support, etc.) and follow NAP	A central coordination authority named NTRCA for teacher education formed that developed gender oriented HR provisions and followed the NAP
Promotion of ICT	
Encourage and ensure girls' access to ICT through issuance of directives and taking measures	Access for 1,500 girl students are ensured in ICT lab of 20 pilot schools and 35 model madrasah established under SEDDP. In the new curriculum for grades 6–10, ICT has been made compulsory for all.
3. More Equitable Access	
School facilities developed	
Ensure classroom and toilet facilities for girls	Construction of toilet and tubewells in 144 schools with girls' enrollment has almost been completed under SEDDP funding.
Provide common room facilities for girls	Additional classroom constructed in 249 schools in the underserved areas under SEDDP will benefit the girl students.

Output wise Activities, Indicators and Targets	Progress up to March 2014
Poverty-targeted stipends	
Poverty targeted stipend policy to include 30% girls	In total 1,201,151 student-years (girls 904,519 student-years; boys 301,157) were benefited since January 2007 under the stipend program of SESDP
Project Loan	
Strengthened Management And Governance of Secondary Education	
Increased decentralization of management facilities	
Decentralized setup to include at least 40% women at all levels	Included women at different levels as per government rules but reliable data is not available
HR management provisions to be reviewed and made gender-oriented	HR management reviewed the existing provisions and prepared a report that included recommendations on how to make HR management gender oriented that was approved by DSHE
Ensure women's participation in management positions, training, and career planning at the field levels	Women's participation was ensured at different levels as per government rules but reliable data is not available
The terms of references for the staff of various levels to include responsibilities related to addressing gender-based needs	HRM unit of DSHE prepared the terms of reference for different positions that included gender-sensitive elements as much as possible.
Improved transparency in financing institutions	
Ensure gender-based data collection, analysis, and information flow for management decisions at all levels	A web-based gender oriented data collection system was developed under SESDP (www.emis.gov.bd)
Staff in pilot program to orient on gender aspects in monitoring and gender-based indicators	Orientation program for gender issues were arranged for concerned staff
Ensure a gender-oriented reporting system	Regular quarterly progress reports were submitted with sex-disaggregated data where possible and against the gender action plan
Strengthened Human resources management	
Assess the situation of staffing, training, and other issues in the institutions from gender perspectives	HRM unit of DSHE assessed the situation and reported on gender inclusiveness

Output wise Activities, Indicators and Targets	Progress up to March 2014
Review the manuals, guidelines, performance management system, etc., and incorporate gender perspectives as needed	Manuals for performance-based management system was reviewed and revised from gender perspective in 2009 and again in 2012
2. Higher Quality Secondary Education	
Reviewed and revised curricula	
Ensure that the skills-based curricula and other curricula are gender-oriented	The new curriculum developed in 2011 was skill-based and gender-oriented
Review existing curriculum (including for madrasah), and ensure incorporation of appropriate gender aspects	The secondary curriculum including madrasa was reviewed in 2009 from a gender perspective
Reformed national examinations	
Women teachers comprise at least 40% of those to be trained and involved in the model exams and pilot tests	Among 410,000 teachers trained, 125,000 were female involved in model exams and pilot tests
Women will form at least 40% of the participants in specialist studies	BEDU conducted three specialist studies with female teacher participation but reliable data is not available
Strengthened Student assessment	
Teachers (male and female) to be oriented on gender-friendly learning methodology	Curriculum dissemination program included gender-friendly learning methodology was arranged for 52,000 teachers, with approximately 16,000 female teachers
Ensure fulfillment of the government quota for female teachers in schools and train them	Government quota for female teachers were fulfilled as per government rules
Conduct a public information campaign with appropriate methodology to reach all groups	Plan was developed and implemented for public information campaign
Strengthened School Management	
SMC member to include at least 50% women	Initiatives undertaken to ensure women participation in SMC but no data available.
All SMC member to be oriented on girls' education and gender-based needs	An orientation program was arranged for total 17,610 SMC members in January 2012 where orientation was given on girls' education and gender-based needs.
4. More Equitable Access	
The new school construction to include women laborers	Women labor are included in construction of new schools as far as practicable. No data is available.

Output wise Activities, Indicators and Targets	Progress up to March 2014
Contractors to be oriented on equal wage for equal work	Education Engineering Department provided orientation on equal wage for equal work to total 353 contractors.
Monitor wages to reduce the wage gap between women and men	Labor wage is monitored to equal wage for male and women labor. No data is available.

BEDU=Bangladesh Examination Development Unit, DSHE=Directorate of Secondary and Higher Education, EMIS=educational management information system, HR=human resource, ICT=information and communications technology, NAP=National Action Plan, NCTB=National Curriculum and Textbook Board, NTRCA=Non-government Teachers Registration and Certification Agency, PTA=parent-teacher associations, SMC=school management committee.

Source: Executive Agency's Progress Reports.

STATUS OF COMPLIANCE TO LOAN COVENANTS

Covenant(s)	Reference to Agreement	Status of Compliance
ADB's Review of Procurement Decisions		
1. All contracts procured under international competitive bidding procedures and contracts for consulting services shall be subject to prior review by ADB, unless otherwise agreed between the Borrower and ADB and set forth in the Procurement Plan.	Para. 9, Schedule 4	Complied with.
Conditions for Approval of Civil Works Activities		
2. Before approval of civil works activities for each of the schools, the following conditions shall be fulfilled: (i) the areas in which schools are going to be constructed are underserved, (ii) the land is available for its construction, and (iii) the community supports the management of the school.	Para. 10, Schedule 4	Complied with.
Project Executing Agency and Implementing Agency		
3. The MOE shall be the Project Executing Agency. The DSHE shall be the Implementing Agency responsible for planning, organizing, managing, supervising, coordinating and monitoring the Project.	Para. 1, Schedule 5	Complied with.
Project Implementation Unit (PIU)		
4. The structure of the PIU of SESIP shall be retained and continue to function as the PIU for the Project. Staff of the Project shall be recruited directly, but preference could be given to those staff who worked in similar type of projects like SESIP, subject to satisfactory performance. The PIU shall be responsible for day-to-day Project implementation and shall be located in the DSHE building. The PIU shall be headed by a full-time Project Director selected in consultation with ADB. The PIU shall be responsible for ensuring (i) detailed Project planning and scheduling; (ii) procurement of Goods and Works, except as may be otherwise agreed between the Borrower and ADB; (iii) recruitment and supervision of international and national consultants, other technical assistance and training; (iv) Project accounting, including but not limited to arranging necessary audits; (v) disbursement of funds, including but not limited to timely submission of withdrawal applications; (vi) management of the imprest account; and (vii) reporting to ADB on Project progress.	Para. 2, Schedule 5	Complied with.
District Implementation Coordination Committees (DICC)s)		
5. The DICC's shall be established in each district, where the Project finances subprojects, to coordinate the civil works program. Each DICC shall be chaired by the deputy commissioner and shall include representatives from the district EED, Facilities Department, concerned SMCs, head teachers, and non-government organizations (NGOs). The District Education Officer (DEO) shall act as member secretary.	Para. 3, Schedule 5	Complied with.

Covenant(s)	Reference to Agreement	Status of Compliance
The Project Steering Committee (PSC)		
6. The PSC shall be responsible for the detailed policy formulation, planning, implementation, and evaluation of the reform agenda for the secondary education system under the Project, including but not limited to all policy reforms within the program that help implement the SDP. Among other things, the PSC shall approve (a) the selection process for madrasahs; and (b) the criteria for the selection of (i) communities to receive new school construction and schools to receive additional classrooms, (ii) schools for piloting e-learning, (iii) madrasahs to be upgraded to become model madrasahs, and (iv) personnel for foreign study tours and foreign and local training. The PSC shall meet at least quarterly. The PSC shall be chaired by the secretary of MOE and shall consist of representatives from BANBEIS, BISE, BMEB, DIA, DSHE, EED, ERD, Implementation Monitoring and Evaluation Division of the Ministry of Planning of the Borrower, the Ministry of Chittagong Hill Tracts Affairs of the Borrower, the Ministry of Establishments of the Borrower, MOE, NAEM, NCTB, the PIU of TQI, the Planning Commission of the Borrower, or any other appropriate persons and specialists, as required.	Para. 4, Schedule 5	Complied with.
Project Implementation Committee (PIC)		
7. The PIC shall be responsible for overseeing the day-to-day implementation of the Project. The PIC shall be chaired by the Director General, DSHE, and a Project Director shall act as member secretary.	Para. 5, Schedule 5	Complied with.
Project Implementation Arrangements		
8. The Borrower shall ensure the continuity of the implementation of activities in the MOE agencies, DSHE, and upazila, district and zone offices initiated by SESIP between the completion of SESIP and the Effective Date.	Para. 6, Schedule 5	Complied with.
9. The Borrower shall ensure that the Policy Support and Planning Unit of DSHE is given an additional responsibility of school MQA and shall be renamed Policy Support, School Monitoring and Quality Assurance (PMQA) Unit. PMQA Unit shall conduct (i) reviews, assessment and studies and shall publish annually a report on school performance; and (ii) at least 4 policy research studies on secondary education using EMIS data.	Para. 7, Schedule 5	Complied with.
10 The Borrower shall ensure that EMIS data is made available to government agencies, researchers, development partners, and education stakeholders.	Para. 8, Schedule 5	Complied with.
11. The Borrower shall ensure that additional staff will be directly recruited under the Project. Project operational costs after review and scrutiny by the relevant and appropriate authorities of the Borrower may be transferred to the recurrent budget promptly after the Project completion in accordance with the Borrower's applicable rules and regulations. Women shall be given preference in recruitment, if they have equal qualifications.	Para. 9, Schedule 5	Complied with.

Covenant(s)	Reference to Agreement	Status of Compliance
12. The Borrower shall ensure that a public information campaign is developed to disseminate to communities and stakeholders information on the nature of and reasons for the policy changes being implemented under SDP.	Para. 10, Schedule 5	Complied with.
13. The Borrower shall ensure that the continuation of subsidies is linked to the performance-based assessment of the schools.	Para. 11, Schedule 5	Complied with.
14. The Borrower shall ensure that payment of stipends is poverty-targeted.	Para. 12, Schedule 5	Complied with.
15. The Borrower shall ensure that ADB is consulted before changes of the Project Director.	Para. 13, Schedule 5	Complied with.
Subproject Selection, Approval and Implementation		
16. The Borrower shall ensure that all subprojects to be financed by the Loan proceeds are selected in accordance with the criteria agreed upon between ADB and the Borrower as more fully described in Appendix 10 to the RRP. The PIU shall ensure that local communities, NGOs, women and representatives from tribal people are involved in subproject identification, planning, and implementation. The proposals shall be prepared by DICC's, in consultation with the community and NGOs. The proposals shall be sent to DSHE and the PIU for review and approval. Each consecutive year, DICC's shall submit to the PIU an updated implementation schedule, including work to be accomplished and a budget. The first 10 subproject proposals shall be sent to ADB for its concurrence. Thereafter, ADB may require that randomly selected subproject proposals are submitted to ADB for its concurrence. ADB reserves the right to refuse to finance any subproject that does not meet the agreed criteria.	Para. 14, Schedule 5	Complied with.
17. The Borrower shall ensure that within 3 months of the Effective Date, the criteria and procedures for selecting the 30 madrasahs for Project assistance and the 20 schools for piloting e-learning activities are finalized.	Para. 15, Schedule 5	Complied with.
Staff Development and Training		
18. The Borrower shall ensure that ADB's prior approval is obtained before the award of any overseas training. For this purpose, ADB shall be provided with a list of (i) the nominated candidates, (ii) their qualifications, (iii) justification and relevance of training, and (iv) detailed cost of proposed training. The Borrower shall ensure that, for the recipients of training, necessary arrangements, which require the recipients to remain in their institutions for a minimum period in accordance with the Borrower's procedures, are made.	Para. 16, Schedule 5	Complied with.
Anticorruption		
19. The Borrower acknowledges that consistent with its commitment to good governance, accountability and transparency, ADB reserves the right to investigate, directly or through its agents, any alleged corrupt,	Para. 17, Schedule 5	Complied with.

Covenant(s)	Reference to Agreement	Status of Compliance
fraudulent, collusive, or coercive practices relating to the Project. To support these efforts, relevant provisions of ADB's Anticorruption Policy are included in the Loan Regulations and the bidding documents for the Project. In particular, all contracts financed by ADB in connection with the Project shall include provisions specifying the right of ADB to audit and examine the records and accounts of the Project Executing Agency and all contractors, suppliers, consultants, and other service providers as they relate to the Project.		
20. The Borrower shall cause the PIU, DSHE and MOE to take concrete proactive steps listed in Appendix 14 to the RRP to ensure good governance and prevent corruption by, among other things, preparing an action plan, implementing such action plan, and including in quarterly reports of the measures taken.	Para. 18, Schedule 5	Complied with.
21. The Borrower shall ensure that the Project implementation includes frequent regular monitoring of Project activities, including school selection and tendering and poverty targeted stipends. The PIU shall have a Project website that has information on procurement and status of procurement. Third-party assessment validation studies shall also be undertaken for SPBMS, EMIS, outputs and activities. Training of staff shall have good governance modules.	Para. 19, Schedule 5	Complied with.
Environment, Involuntary Resettlement, Tribal Peoples and Gender		
22. The Borrower shall ensure compliance with ADB's Environment Policy, 2002, and the Borrower's existing environmental laws and regulations.	Para. 20, Schedule 5	Complied with.
23. The Borrower shall ensure that the land selected for construction of new schools is clear of occupation and not under use as defined in ADB's Policy on Involuntary Resettlement, 1995. In the event of unforeseen resettlement as defined in ADB's Policy on Involuntary Resettlement, 1995, the Borrower shall promptly inform ADB of such unforeseen resettlement and prepare necessary resettlement planning documents in accordance with ADB's Policy on Involuntary Resettlement, 1995.	Para. 21, Schedule 5	Complied with.
24. The Borrower shall ensure that the Project is implemented in accordance with the tribal people's development framework and the gender action plan (GAP).	Para. 22, Schedule 5	Complied with.
Civil Works		
25. The Borrower shall ensure that civil works contractors (i) comply with all applicable labor laws, (ii) do not employ child labor for construction and maintenance activities, and (iii) do not differentiate wages between men and women for work of equal value.	Para. 23, Schedule 5	Complied with.
26. Reports		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Without limiting the generality of Section 6.05 of the Loan Regulations, the Borrower shall ensure that the PIU prepares quarterly reports on the status and progress of the Project 	Para. 24, Schedule 5	Complied with.

Covenant(s)	Reference to Agreement	Status of Compliance
<p>implementation and submits them to ADB and MOE within 20 days after each quarter. The reports shall have a format acceptable to ADB and indicate (i) progress made against established targets, (ii) status of performance indicators, (iii) problems encountered and actions taken to address them, (iv) compliance with the covenants of this Loan Agreement, and (v) proposed program of activities for the following quarter.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Within 3 months after Project completion, the Borrower shall prepare and submit to ADB a Project completion report describing Project implementation, accomplishments, benefits, impact, costs, and compliance with the covenants of this Loan Agreement. 		
Project Performance Monitoring System		
<p>27. The Borrower shall prepare and provide ADB with the next FY's Project operational plan at least 30 days before the start of the next FY. The operational plan shall include, but is not limited to: (i) Project activities with cost estimates proposed for each output/subcomponent with performance targets; (ii) a plan for complying with outstanding covenants of this Loan Agreement; (iii) a breakdown of financial requirements, including Loan proceeds withdrawal and counterpart funds from the Borrower; and (iv) details of how Project activities are to be integrated into other ongoing programs.</p>	Para. 25, Schedule 5	Complied with.
<p>28. Within 1 year of the Effective Date, the Borrower shall cause DSHE and the PIU to have completed the establishment of a monitoring and evaluation system for the Project, acceptable to ADB. Project monitoring and evaluation (M&E) shall be the responsibility of DSHE through the PIU.</p>	Para. 26, Schedule 5	Complied with.
<p>29. Within 6 months of the Effective Date, a baseline indicator study shall be conducted to refine and expand verifiable indicators of Project inputs, outputs, and impact.</p>		Not complied with due to lack of necessary financial resources.
Project Review		
<p>30. The Borrower and ADB shall jointly review the Project's progress at least twice a year. In addition to regular reviews, the Borrower and ADB shall jointly undertake a midterm review during the Project's third year. At least 1 month before the review, the PIU shall submit to ADB a comprehensive report on the issues to be discussed during the review.</p>	Para. 27, Schedule 5	Complied with.
Particular Covenants		
<p>31. The Borrower shall (i) maintain, or cause to be maintained, separate accounts for the Project; (ii) have such accounts and related financial statements audited annually, in accordance with appropriate auditing standards consistently applied, by independent auditors whose qualifications, experience and terms of reference are acceptable to ADB; (iii) furnish to ADB, as soon as available but in any event not later than 6 months after the end of each related fiscal year, certified copies of such audited accounts and financial statements and</p>	Section 4.02 (a), Article IV	Complied with.

Covenant(s)	Reference to Agreement	Status of Compliance
the report of the auditors relating thereto (including the auditors' opinion on the use of the Loan proceeds and compliance with the financial covenants of this Loan Agreement as well as on the use of the procedures for imprest account/statement of expenditures), all in the English language; and (iv) furnish to ADB such other information concerning such accounts and financial statements and the audit thereof as ADB shall from time to time reasonably request.		
32. The Borrower shall enable ADB, upon ADB's request, to discuss the Borrower's financial statements for the Project and its financial affairs related to the Project from time to time with the auditors appointed by the Borrower pursuant to Section 4.02(a) here above, and shall authorize and require any representative of such auditors to participate in any such discussions requested by ADB, provided that any such discussion shall be conducted only in the presence of an authorized officer of the Borrower unless the Borrower shall otherwise agree.	Section 4.02 (b), Article IV	Complied with.
33. The Borrower shall enable ADB's representatives to inspect the Project, the goods financed out of the proceeds of the Loan, and any relevant records and documents.	Section 4.03, Article IV	Complied with.

ADB=Asian Development Bank, BANBEIS=Bangladesh Bureau of Educational Information and Statistics, BISE=Board of Intermediate and Secondary Education, BMED=Bangladesh Madrasah Education Board, DSHE=Directorate of Secondary and Higher Education, DIA=Directorate of Inspection and Audit, DEO=District Education Officer, EED=Education Engineering Department, EMIS= education management information system, GAP=gender action plan, MOE=Ministry of Education, MQA=monitoring quality assurance, M&E=monitoring and evaluation, NGO=non-governmental organization, NAEM=National Academy for Education Management, PIU=project implementation unit, PSC=project steering committee, PIC=project implementation committee, PMQA=policy monitoring quality assurance, RRP=Report and Recommendation of the President, SESIP=Secondary Education Sector Improvement Program, SDP=Secondary Education Sector Development Program, SESIP=Secondary Education Sector Improvement Project, and SPBMS=School Performance-Based Management System.

Source: Executing Agency.

ECONOMIC EVALUATION

A. Overall Assessment

1. The project comprised three major outputs: (i) strengthened management of, and transparency in secondary education management, (ii) higher quality secondary education, and (iii) more equitable access to secondary education. As envisaged, each of these has provided (and will continue to provide) economic benefits for individuals and society. However, the quantitative economic analysis for the project completion report focused only on the improved efficiency and quality of education, and the associated benefits from reduced private and public costs and increased earnings of existing and additional school education completers.

2. At project design, the general aim of the project was to contribute to poverty reduction through human resources development by improving the relevance of secondary education to improve the needs of the labor market. In particular, the project was designed to continue and accomplish the incomplete policy reform activities necessary to address the consequences of the rising demand for the secondary education following the rapid increase in primary education participation and completion. The project introduced major reforms such as strengthening management through decentralization (e.g., school based assessment) and training (e.g., intensive teacher training), improving quality of secondary education (e.g., creative questions and curriculum improvements), and expanding equitable access, with focus on girls, underserved, and crowded population. Such reforms through the project brought considerable changes in the quality of overall secondary education system. Since 2007 (the project implementation starting year), the enrollment rate (both gross and net), completion rate, and internal efficiency of the education system have been increasing in almost every year.

3. Though there was no economic analysis during the project processing, the project completion report includes the economic rationale based on the standard economic analysis format that are used for ADB's project completion report.

B. Project Costs

4. Costs include project costs incurred by the government, and the Asian Development Bank (ADB). The estimated direct costs of the project comprise the project investment, and the public and private costs of each additional pupil-year, comprising both recurrent and capital costs. The project capital and recurrent costs are spread over the 7-year implementation period, while the project benefits in the form of higher efficiency, earnings and employability are assumed to continue for 20 years after the end of the Project.

5. At project design, the total cost, including physical and price contingencies, and taxes and duties, was envisaged at \$133.33 million. ADB approved a loan of \$85.0 million equivalent to finance 77% of project cost. The government provided \$21.7 million equivalent (23% of total cost). However, the actual project cost at the project completion stage stood at \$101.03 million with \$75.61 million from ADB, and \$25.4 million from the government.

6. In terms of output-wise cost structure, \$45.1 million (44.6% of total spending) was spent for implementing more equitable access to secondary education, followed by \$30.87 million (30.1 %) for strengthening management, and governance of secondary education management, and \$15.39 million (15.2%) for ensuring higher quality secondary education (Table 1).

Table 1: Project Cost by Outputs (\$ million)

Component(s)/Output(s)	Project Costs at	
	Appraisal	Actual
Strengthened Management and Governance of Secondary Education Management	34.51	30.87
Higher Quality Secondary Education	17.21	15.39
More Equitable Access to Secondary Education	50.42	45.10
Project Management and Construction Supervision	1.98	1.77
Other expenses (taxes, duties, interest during construction and contingencies)	15.58	7.90
Total	113.33	101.03

7. In calculating economic values of project costs, the annual financial costs (from ADB, and the government) for the project were converted into economic values using (i) shadow exchange rate factor, for both traded and nontraded goods; and (ii) shadow wage rate factor, for both skilled and unskilled labor. Taxes and duties were also deducted. Annual costs were also converted to fiscal year (FY) 2014 constant price terms.

8. There are no operations and maintenance costs included with the project costs as operations and maintenance related issues were not considered after the project completion. However, the government will continue the funding for the secondary education, especially those outputs covered by the project, although that would be beyond the scope of project funds. Therefore, as in the case of original economic analysis, the evaluation analysis also didn't incorporate operations and maintenance costs.

C. Project Benefits

9. During the project design, it was envisaged that, annually, the 56 new schools that were planned would benefit an additional 16,800 students, while the 560 additional classrooms in schools and madrasah will benefit more than 22,000 secondary school students. By 2013, civil works, stipend assistance, and improvements in education quality were expected to increase enrollment rates by 15% and raise secondary school certificate (SSC) pass rates by 5%. Further, with the expected increase in enrollments and greater pressure on resources, dropout rates at a minimum were envisaged to be retained at the 2004 level.

10. At the project appraisal, it has been found that the project has been successfully able to develop and implement a Monitoring Quality Assurance (MQA) System to monitor the quality of providing assistances to improve the performance of schools and selected madrasahs. With the help of National Curriculum and Textbook Board (NCTB), the project has supported review and revision of curricula for grades 6–10 based on the integrated untrack curricula for grades 9–10 developed under the project making it updated, skill-based, and with smooth interface with both stated and existing competencies of the primary curriculum. The project also developed related curriculum support guides and teacher training materials, and trained 53,033 teachers and curriculum staff of NCTB. The development of new curricula for grades 6–12 included the updating of computer studies/information communications technology subject. The project supported the national implementation of school based assessment (SBA) in grades 6–9 refining the existing SBA model, training, and related materials. To expand access to secondary education in underserved areas, the project established 64 new secondary schools. Under the project, the government recruited 860 new staff including 173 females (20%) in different

positions. The project supported continuation of the pro-poor targeted stipend to students of 53 and provided stipend to 1,201,151 poor students (30% girls and 10% boys) of poor families who met criteria of poverty and compliance of agreed conditions of attendance, remaining unmarried, and having fair academic performance.

11. Though this economic analysis follows the similar approach that is followed in other economic analyses, however the factors and assumptions for the benefit quantification would vary because of the inclusion of project specific information. In particular, the benefits are estimated considering the improved efficiency and improved education quality. Because of the project interventions through quality improvement and more equitable access to education, the benefits are broadly assumed from two possible sources: (i) the benefits from improved efficiency derived from the public and private cost saved and increased net income because of the project intervention, and (ii) the benefits from improved education quality is associated with higher earnings because of the project benefits.

D. Economic Analysis

12. The economic analysis is based on the cost-benefit analysis (CBA), which has been conducted considering the project completion. It uses the methodology and techniques in ADB guidelines, including the *Guidelines for the Economic Analysis of Projects* and *Framework and Criteria for the Appraisal and Socioeconomic Justification of Education Projects*.¹ This economic analysis at the project completion involves the calculating two major investment criteria: (i) the economic internal rate of return (EIRR), and (ii) the net present value (NPV) for those who got benefited through getting education, higher quality education and received employment because of the project intervention.

13. **General assumptions:** The approach and assumptions underlying the economic reevaluation included the following:

- (i) All costs and prices are valued in a world price numeraire in FY2014 constant prices.
- (ii) Economic prices of investment costs and recurrent costs are estimated by converting the financial prices with a shadow exchange rate factor of 1.07 for traded goods (net taxes and duties), a factor of 1.0 for nontraded goods, a shadow wage rate factor of 1.0 for skilled labor and 0.75 for unskilled labor.²
- (iii) Taxes and duties are excluded because they represent transfer payments.
- (iv) A 12.0% economic discount rate has been used.
- (v) As education provides longer term benefits, the economic life of the project is assumed at 20 years after the project completion.

14. **Quantification of benefits.** The analysis estimates the EIRR for the project based on three criteria: (i) public and private costs saved for improved internal efficiency; (ii) increased net income attributed to improved external efficiency; and (iii) Increased net income attributed to

¹ ADB. 1997. *Guidelines for the Economic Analysis of Projects*. Manila; ADB. 1994. *Framework and Criteria for the Appraisal and Socioeconomic Justification of Education Projects*. Manila.

² Conversion factors for the shadow exchange rate factor and shadow wage rate factor are based on recently approved ADB-financed projects in Bangladesh: (i) ADB. 2014. *Report and Recommendation of the President to the Board of Directors: Proposed Loan and Administration of Loan to Bangladesh for the Third Urban Governance and Infrastructure Improvement (Sector) Project*. Manila; and (ii) ADB. 2014. *Report and Recommendation of the President to the Board of Directors: Proposed Multitranchise Financing Facility to Bangladesh for the Skills for Employment Investment Program*. Manila.

improved education quality. Therefore, the EIRR represents both public and private rate of return captured by improved internal and external efficiency and education quality. Although the methodology used for this economic analysis follows that used for the initial economic analysis during the project design, the factors and assumptions formed on the basis of the actual information after the project completion. The base case factors and assumptions are set out as follows:

- (i) The project intervention contributed to dropout and repetition rates declining more quickly. The completion rate increased from approximately 34.4% in 2007 to 58.1% in 2013 for secondary education. This implies an estimated increase in the completion rate by around 5% points for grade 10. The higher improvement in secondary education can be explained in view of continued intervention from the investment program for grades 6–12.
- (ii) Internal efficiency reduces the number of student years to complete the secondary cycle per graduate. Analysis of secondary cycle completion of grade 10 indicates that the investment program will increase the saves by 2.9 student-years per completer, from 9.98 years in 2007 to 7.11 years in 2014, with an assumed improvement of 28.7 percentage point of internal efficiency.
- (iii) The workforce participation rate is 50% for secondary completers. Monthly wages are used to price the benefits. Savings apply to public unit costs and private household expenditure and opportunity costs.
- (iv) A secondary completer earns 19.0% higher wages than a non-completer.³
- (v) A conservative 5.0% of the wage of a secondary completer is credited to higher-quality education, an external efficiency factor that results in a higher wage premium for all secondary completers.
- (vi) The benefit stream accruing from lifetime earnings for grade 10 new completers are assumed to continue for 20 years (a typical secondary completer will earn beyond 20 years, but discounting makes the value insignificant beyond this period). These completers are from 7 batches of grade 10 students who are covered by the investment program in 2007–2013.

15. Net present value, economic internal rate of return and sensitivity analysis. Based on above factors and assumptions and a discount rate of 12% for the benefit and cost streams described above, the economic internal rate of return (EIRR) is estimated to be 19.2% (Table 2), which is quite standard and comparable to economic analyses done for other education project of ADB.

³ See, for instance, Sen, Binayak; and Rahman, Mahbubur. (2015). *Earnings Inequality, Returns to Education and Demand for Schooling: Addressing Human Capital for Accelerated Growth in the Seventh Five Year Plan of Bangladesh*, A background paper written for formulating the Seventh Five Year Plan: Planning Commission.

Table 2: Base Case Scenario (Tk million)

Year	Aggregate Costs			Aggregate Benefits			Total Benefit	Net Benefit	NPV at 12%
	Capital	Recurrent	Total Cost	Efficiency	Improved education quality				
				Internal	External				
1	228	457	685	(5,919)	395	514	(5,010)	(5,695)	(5,695)
2	405	327	732	(12,036)	1,081	540	(10,415)	(11,147)	(9,953)
3	783	269	1,051	(18,424)	2,105	566	(15,752)	(16,804)	(13,396)
4	1,158	632	1,790	(23,276)	3,417	556	(19,303)	(21,092)	(15,013)
5	766	607	1,373	(23,900)	5,113	590	(18,197)	(19,570)	(12,437)
6	804	350	1,154	(20,801)	7,522	633	(12,646)	(13,800)	(7,831)
7	353	68	421	(19,602)	10,390	680	(8,532)	(8,953)	(4,536)
8				21,310	10,390	775	32,474	32,474	14,690
9				21,310	10,390	831	32,531	32,531	13,139
10				21,310	10,390	891	32,591	32,591	11,753
11				21,310	10,390	956	32,656	32,656	10,514
12				21,310	10,390	1,026	32,725	32,725	9,408
13				21,310	10,390	1,087	32,787	32,787	8,416
14				21,310	10,390	1,152	32,852	32,852	7,529
15				21,310	10,390	1,222	32,921	32,921	6,736
16				21,310	10,390	1,295	32,995	32,995	6,028
17				21,310	10,390	1,373	33,072	33,072	5,395
18				21,310	10,390	1,455	33,155	33,155	4,829
19				21,310	10,390	1,542	33,242	33,242	4,323
20				21,310	10,390	1,635	33,334	33,334	3,870
21				21,310	10,390	1,733	33,433	33,433	3,466
22				21,310	10,390	1,837	33,536	33,536	3,104
23				21,310	10,390	1,947	33,647	33,647	2,781
24				21,310	10,390	2,064	33,764	33,764	2,491
25				21,310	10,390	2,188	33,887	33,887	2,233
26				21,310	10,390	2,319	34,019	34,019	2,001
27				21,310	10,390	2,458	34,158	34,158	1,794
							NPV	55,637	
							EIRR	19.17%	

EIRR = economic internal rate of return, NPV = net present value, numbers in parenthesis represent negative value.
Source: ADB.

16. **Sensitivity analysis.** As there is much uncertainty about the various assumptions, sensitivity analysis is warranted to test the robustness of the economic viability with respect to various adverse selections. Like the standard economic analysis for other projects, three scenarios are prepared. First, under the 20% decline in external efficiency, the EIRR is reduced to 17.7% (Table 3). Second, under the 20% decline in internal efficiency, the EIRR declines to 14.7%. Finally, a switching scenario was simulated through a 20% reduction of both external and internal efficiency, which reduces the EIRR to 13.3%. Therefore, the project viability is robust in all three adverse scenarios. It also indicates that internal efficiency has more impact

than external efficiency, reflecting the need to stress more on improving internal efficiency when the baseline sector performance has reached a relatively high level in terms of larger enrollment.

Table 3: Sensitivity Analysis

Scenarios	EIRR (%)	NPV (\$ million)
Base Case	19.17	713.30
20% reduction in external efficiency	17.68	565.68
20% reduction in internal efficiency	14.67	288.98
Switching scenarios: 20% reduction in both external and internal efficiency	13.31	141.37

EIRR = economic internal rate of return, NPV = net present value.

Source: ADB.

E. Nonquantified Economic Benefits

17. Benefits to the society are not captured. The estimated EIRR here represented private rate of return captured by direct beneficiaries only, and has not taken into account of the external benefits that accrue to the society. However, in reality, project intervention not only brought benefit to the direct school graduates, but also has long-run consequential impact on other social agents, who have been directly or indirectly involved with the project.

18. Benefits to the underserved are not equality-assessed. The project interventions added value to the all-out efforts of the government in increasing access of the girls to secondary education. Also, the project brought tribal people under its coverage of intervention. As tribal people live in the remote areas, which have the lack of sufficient physical facilities, the project placed increased emphasis on improving the physical facilities and giving special attention for ensuring increased access of tribal students, particularly the girls. The project benefit estimation in this economic analysis captured those students living in tribal areas while assuming the same or equal impact on those as that on other student. However, in reality, because of the low base, supplying equal benefits to the underserved may bring the higher benefits to them than those who are not underserved.

Benefits from technology transfer are not fully covered. Under the project intervention, the information and communication technology subject, and its training and learning materials for grades 9–10 have been refined, and teachers were trained accordingly. Also, e-learning has been piloted in 20 schools to support the teaching of English, Mathematics, and Science subjects. The project provided NCTB with office equipment including computer, software, curriculum materials, teacher training material, e-learning material, and consultant support. Although in the project benefit estimated, the efficiency improvement is captured through faster completion rates and higher earning abilities, however the true benefits from technology transfer are not fully covered. For example, these technology transfers not only provided employment and self-employment to the graduates, but also created a possibility of similar technology transfers from graduates in the future.

PROJECT BENEFITS AND IMPACT

A. Improvement of Internal Efficiencies

1. The project completion report (PCR) mission assessed the impact of the Secondary Education Sector Development Project (SESDP) based on secondary documents and findings of the mission survey¹ of the status of implementation of important reform measures intended for enhancing the quality of secondary education. The mission reviewed the findings of two relevant important studies² conducted by the Implementation Monitoring and Evaluation Division (IMED) of the Ministry of Planning, reports of Bangladesh Bureau of Educational Information and Statistics (BANBEIS)³, executing agency PCR of SESDP, and other documents on SESDP. The PCR mission survey of March 2015 assessed the status of implementation and use of different reform measures supported by the SESDP for improving the quality of secondary education.

1. Student Enrollment

2. Average enrollment of students increased during the project per school for both boys and girls across all grades in rural and urban schools (Table 8.1). It is found that annual average growth of enrollment of boys is 4.7% compared to 4.1% of the girls. In rural schools, growth of student enrollment of boys is higher compared to the girls—annual growth of enrollment of boys is 5.2% and that of the girls is 3.1%. In urban schools, growth of enrollment of girls is higher compared to boys—growth of enrollment of girls is 5.9% compared to 3.4% for boys.

Table 8.1: Student Enrollment (2004–2011)

Area(s)	Boys		Girls	
	2004–2011	Annual	2004–2011	Annual
Rural Schools	36.5	5.2	21.9	3.1
Urban Schools	24.0	3.4	41.7	5.9
All Schools	32.8	4.7	28.5	4.1

Source: 2012.IMED.Independent Impact Study of TQI-SEP. Dhaka.

2. Student Attendance

3. The SESDP and other similar projects contributed to increasing the student attendance in schools during the project. Increased school attendance is an indicator of improved school performance and a measure of greater inputs and efforts of teachers and students to education towards improved secondary education. Annual average increase is higher in rural schools compared to the urban schools and higher for boys compared to girls. The increase is across all five grades. Further, higher the grade, lower is the increase of rate of attendance. The increase of student attendance in schools is due to among others overall improvement of school environment and management, quality teaching, and better school academic and other performances. Annual average rate of increase ranges between 0.53% to 1.10% for boys and 0.30% to 1.04% for girls.

¹ PCR Mission conducted a sample survey in all seven administrative divisions in March 2015.

² 2011. IMED. *In-depth Study of the SESDP*. Dhaka & 2012. IMED. *Independent Impact Study of TQI-SEP-I*. Dhaka.

³ 2012 and 2013. BANBEIS. *Bangladesh Education Statistics*. Dhaka.

Table 8.2: Student Attendance (2004–2011)

Area(s)	Growth of Attendance (%)			
	Boys		Girls	
	2004–2011	Annual	2004–2011	Annual
Rural Schools	7.7	1.10	7.3	1.04
Urban Schools	3.7	0.53	2.1	0.30
All Schools	5.9	0.84	6.1	0.87

Source: Source: 2012. IMED. Independent Impact Study of TQI-SEP. Dhaka.

3. Teacher Attendance (2006 and 2011)

4. Different reform initiatives for improving the quality of secondary education were undertaken through improving performance of the teachers, which included increased attendance of teachers in schools. It is found that average annual rate of attendance of teachers increased by 2% in 2006 and 2011 (Table 8.3). Increased attendance is due to among other improvement of school management, increased motivation and commitment of teachers for teaching, improved accountability and transparency and disciplines among the teachers, and proper role played by the head teacher and members of the school management committee. Increased teacher attendance indicates increased teaching inputs ensuring effective teaching–learning manifesting improved quality of secondary education.

Table 8.3: Attendance of Teachers (2006 and 2011)

Teachers' Annual Attendance in School		Percent
1	Average attendance of all teachers in 2006	93.4
2	Average attendance of all teachers in 2011	95.5

Source: 2012. IMED. Independent Impact Study of TQI-SEP. Dhaka.

4. Student Dropout

5. Student dropouts at secondary education level were a major problem before the project. The government took different measures through number of projects including the SESDP to reduce the dropout rates. Dropout rates of both boys and girls declined across all grades during the project in both rural and urban schools (Table 8.4).

Table 8.4: Student Dropout Rate

Class	Student Dropout Rates (%) by Year															
	2004		2005		2006		2007		2008		2009		2010		2011	
	Boy	Girl	Boy	Girl	Boy	Girl	Boy	Girl	Boy	Girl	Boy	Girl	Boy	Girl	Boy	Girl
VI	4.4	4.3	3.2	4.0	3.6	2.9	2.9	3.7	3.8	3.2	2.7	3.5	2.3	3.2	1.8	2.5
VII	3.7	4.8	3.2	4.3	3.0	4.1	3.7	4.7	3.0	3.8	3.0	3.4	2.8	2.9	1.8	2.5
VIII	3.6	4.6	4.6	4.4	2.9	4.2	2.7	4.1	2.9	4.0	2.5	3.3	2.7	3.4	1.7	4.4
IX	3.5	4.8	2.8	3.9	3.1	4.5	3.3	4.4	2.7	4.6	2.6	4.8	2.1	3.0	1.7	2.7
X	3.4	5.4	3.7	5.9	3.1	5.7	3.0	6.3	3.4	5.3	2.5	5.7	2.2	3.6	1.4	2.7

Source: 2011. BANBEIS, Ministry of Education. Dhaka.

5. Student Repetition

6. High repetition rates in the same grade at secondary level had been a major constraint of secondary education. SESDP and several other projects took different measures for

improving the quality of secondary education to reduce the repetition rates of both boys and girls. Repetition rates of boys and girls at all five grades reduced considerably between 2004 and 2011 and later (Table 8.5).

Table 8.5: Repetition Rate of Students

Class	2004		2005		2006		2007		2008		2009		2010		2011	
	Boy	Girl	Boy	Girl	Boy	Girl	Boy	Girl	Boy	Girl	Boy	Girl	Boy	Girl	Boy	Girl
VI	4.9	4.2	3.4	4.2	3.3	3.0	4.0	4.3	3.2	3.2	3.3	4.1	3.7	3.2	2.7	2.4
VII	3.8	5.5	3.7	4.5	3.7	4.4	3.3	4.1	3.3	4.1	2.8	3.9	3.0	3.4	2.6	2.8
VIII	3.9	5.2	3.6	5.0	3.3	4.4	3.7	3.8	3.0	4.0	2.8	3.8	3.7	5.0	3.9	4.9
IX	3.4	4.1	3.3	3.6	3.3	3.6	3.9	4.1	3.5	3.6	2.9	4.2	3.4	3.7	2.9	3.4
X	7.5	9.2	6.2	9.9	5.7	9.4	7.2	8.9	5.7	10.0	5.8	8.1	4.6	7.8	4.1	6.3

Source: 2012. IMED. Independent Impact Study of TQI-SEP. Dhaka.

B. Project Impacts

6. Student Academic Achievement in Public Examination—Secondary School Certificate

7. Success of students in examinations is major indicators of performance of school, teachers, and students in particular, and the education sector at large. Government conducts public examination at grade 10 every year through the Boards of Intermediate and Secondary Education (BISE). The PCR mission analyzed the pass rates of the secondary school certificates (SSC) from 2004 to 2014 and found that the pass rates significantly increased between 2004 and 2014 (Table 8.6).

8. Analysis of the results of SSC examination between 2004 and 2014 indicated a rapid increase of pass rates (Table 8.6). Pass rates increased by 44.67% between 2004 and 2014 (4.06% per annum). The average increase of pass rate for boys during the period is 43.54% (3.96% per annum) and for the girls is 43.32% (3.93% per annum). The mission estimated that the SEDDP had major contributions toward increasing the pass rates as a result of introduction and implementation of the numbers of reform measures such as school-based assessment, examination reforms and creative questions, and upgrading curriculum.

Table 8.6: Success Rate of Student in Secondary School Certificate Examination

Year(s)		Pass Rates (% Total Students Passes out of Total Students Appeared)		
		Boys	Girls	Combined
1	2004	49.70	46.00	48.00
2	2005	54.90	49.90	52.60
3	2006	54.90	49.90	52.60
4	2007	61.40	57.30	59.50
5	2008	72.60	70.40	70.80
6	2009	69.70	68.40	67.40
7	2010	80.00	76.40	78.20
8	2011	83.50	80.70	82.20
9	2012	87.30	85.40	86.30
10	2013	90.23	89.22	89.67
11	2014	93.24	92.12	92.67

Source: Bangladesh Education Development Unit (BEDU), 2015 and mission reviews.

9. The PCR mission analyzed student pass rates in terms of increase of the percentage of students passed securing minimum 33% marks out of the total number of students appeared in the SSC

examination, and also the increase of the percentage of students securing higher grade-point average (GPA) grades (securing GPA 5 in a 5-points scale). Analysis indicated that number of students securing GPA 5 rapidly increased unabated manifesting higher quality achievement beyond mere passing the examinations. Higher levels of excellence by students in general indicated improved quality of the secondary schools (Table 8.7).

Table 8.7: Higher Academic Performance of Students

Year(s)		Number of Students Secured GPA 5 (A+)		
		Total	Boys	Girls
1	2014	122,313	64,414	57,899
2	2013	77,381	42,886	34,495
3	2012	65,252	36,571	28,681
4	2011	62,778	36,000	26,778
5	2010	62,134	35,955	26,179
6	2009	45,934	26,951	18,983
7	2008	41,917	24,654	17,263
8	2007	25,732	15,365	10,367
9	2006	24,384	14,562	9,822
10	2005	15,631	9,388	6,243
11	2004	8,597	5,164	3,433

Source: 2014.BBS. Bangladesh Education Statistics 2013. Dhaka.

7. School Performance—All Passed Schools and None Passed Schools

10. The PCR mission also assessed performance of secondary education sector in terms of the trend of increasing the number of all passed schools as well as the trend of reducing the number of zero passed schools in SSC examination (Table 8.8). The mission noted that number of all passed schools rapidly increased during SESDP and the number of zero-passed schools sharply declined to almost zero during the same period. It is also found that number of all passed schools in 2005 was only 537 and the number of all passed schools dramatically increased to 3,377 in 2012 (6 times). Similarly, the number of zero passed schools was 424 in 2005 and it reduced to only 14 in 2011.

Table 8.8: Number of all Passed Schools and Number of None Passed Schools

Year(s)	Number of all Passed Schools	Number of None Passed Schools
1 2005	537	424
2 2006	1,429	193
3 2007	774	248
4 2008	2,272	91
5 2009	2,726	72
6 2010	2,927	49
7 2011	2,017	28
8 2012	3,377	14

Source: Bangladesh Education Development Unit (BEDU), 2015.

8. Progress of Implementation of SBA in Secondary Schools

11. In-depth monitoring and evaluation study conducted by the Implementation Monitoring and Evaluation Division (IMED) in 2011 found that due to initial delay in starting SESDP important reform measures particularly the introduction of School-Based Assessment (SBA) and examination reforms were delayed. Consequently, all head teachers and assistant teachers could not be adequately trained. Therefore, status of implementation of the SBA system and its

six tools and implementation and use of creative questions remained low until 2011. In-depth monitoring and evaluation of IMED in 2011 found quite low achievements of the introduction and implementation and use of the SBA tools and creative question. However, SEDDP took measures for full introduction and use of the SBA tools and creative questions by all teachers in every school. The PCR mission survey carried out in March 2015 found relatively better implementation performance and increased use of the SBA tools and creative questions compared to the IMED in-depth Monitoring Evaluation study (Table 8.9–8.14).

Table 8.9: Status of Physical Infrastructures for Quality Secondary Education

Indicator(s)	% Schools in 2011			% Schools in 2015		
	Adequate	Inadequate	Unavailable	Adequate	Inadequate	Unavailable
Drinking Water	56.00	40.00	4.00	80.00	20.00	0.00
Sanitary Toilet	42.00	56.00	2.00	85.00	12.50	2.50
Play Ground	56.00	39.00	5.00	62.00	35.00	3.00
Sc. Laboratory	22.00	75.00	3.00	35.00	62.50	2.50
ICT Laboratory	28.00	37.00	35.00	34.00	45.00	21.00

Source: 2011. Implementation Monitoring and Evaluation Division. In-depth Monitoring Study. Dhaka; PCR Mission Survey, May 2015. Dhaka.

Table 8.10: Status of Implementation of SBA in Secondary Schools

Indicator(s)	Findings of IMED Study, 2011			PCR Mission Survey 2015		
	Regularly	Partly	Not Use	Regularly	Partly	Not Use
%Schools follow SBA	87.50	9.72	2.78	94.70	4.20	1.10
% Teachers follow SBA	66.20	28.17	5.63	84.40	13.90	1.70

Source: 2011. Implementation Monitoring and Evaluation Division. In-depth Monitoring Study. Dhaka; PCR Mission Survey, May 2015. Dhaka.

Table 8.11: Status of Use of PBM Materials in the Schools

Indicator(s)	% Schools in 2011				% Schools in 2015	
	Use Regularly	Use Irregularly	Not Used at All	Used Regularly	Use Irregularly	Not Used at All
PBM Manual	50.00	38.00	12.00	60.50	36.60	2.70
5-Year Plan	19.00	0.00	78.00	46.40	50.60	3.00
HT Register	58.00	33.00	9.00	65.55	29.95	4.50
Teacher Diary	63.00	29.00	8.00	55.60	35.00	9.40
Lesson Plan	60.00	25.00	15.00	68.45	26.25	5.30

Source: 2011. Implementation Monitoring and Evaluation Division. In-depth Monitoring Study. Dhaka; PCR Mission Survey, May 2015. Dhaka.

Table 8.12: Status of Use of Creative Questions in Secondary Schools

Indicator(s)	% Teachers Use of Creative Questions	
	IMED Study 2011	PCR Mission Study 2015
% Teachers regularly use creative questions	88.73	91.50
% Teachers partially use creative questions	5.63	7.35
% teachers do not use creative questions at all	5.64	1.15

Source: 2011. Implementation Monitoring and Evaluation Division. In-depth Monitoring Study. Dhaka; PCR Mission Survey, May 2015. Dhaka.

Table 8.13: Status of Training of Teachers for Implementation of Reform Activities in Schools

% Teachers Received Training on	% Teachers Received Training as of	
	IMED Study 2011	PCR Study 2015
Continued professional development (CPD)	43.33	45.50
Creative questions (CQ)	6.10	16.70
English Language/TIP	3.7	6.80
Performance based assessment monitoring (PBAM)	1.40	8.50
School based assessment (SBA)	6.10	25.50
Teaching quality improvement (TQI)	18.78	25.50

Source: 2011. Implementation Monitoring and Evaluation Division. In-depth Monitoring Study. Dhaka; PCR Mission Survey, May 2015. Dhaka.

Table 8.14: Status of Participation of Students in Co-curricular Activities in Schools

% Students Participated in Co-curricular Activities like	% Participation of Students in Co-curricular Activities as of	
	IMED Study 2011	PCR Mission Study 2015
% students participated in sports and games	68.20	70.50
% students participated in debating	20.97	25.65
% students participated in social works	3.60	6.50
% students participated in other activities	7.23	14.25

Source: 2011. Implementation Monitoring and Evaluation Division. In-depth Monitoring Study. Dhaka; PCR Mission Survey, May 2015. Dhaka.