Fri, 17th September 2016

Viet Nam: Secondary Cities Development Project
- Ha Tinh Subproject

This resettlement monitoring report is a document of the borrower. The views expressed herein do not necessarily represent those of ADB's Board of Directors, Management, or staff, and may be preliminary in nature.

In preparing any country program or strategy, financing any project, or by making any designation of or reference to a particular territory or geographic area in this document, the Asian Development Bank does not intend to make any judgments as to the legal or other status of any territory or area.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS.......................................................................................................................... ii
LIST OF TABLES .................................................................................................................................. iii
GLOSSARY ............................................................................................................................................. iv

I. INTRODUCTION ................................................................................................................................ 1
  1.1. Secondary Cities Development Project ............................................................................. 1
  1.2. Secondary Cities Development Project – Ha Tinh Subproject ......................................... 1

II. OBJECTIVES AND METHODOLOGY OF RP IMPLEMENTATION INDEPENDENT MONITORING ............................................................................................................................... 4
  2.1. Objectives of RP Implementation Independent Monitoring ............................................. 4
  2.2. Monitoring Indicators and Criteria of RP Implementation ................................................. 4
  2.3. Methodology of RP Implementation Monitoring ............................................................... 6
  2.4. Compositions of the Monitoring Team and Schedule ....................................................... 7

III. MAGNITUDE OF SUBPROJECT’S IMPACTS .............................................................................. 8

IV. THE RP IMPLEMENTATION PROCESS OF SUBPROJECT .................................................... 14

V. RESULTS OF RESETTLEMENT PLAN IMPLEMENTATION MONITORING ............................. 18
  5.1. Information disclosure and Public Consultation ............................................................... 18
  5.2. Detailed Measurement Survey (DMS) ............................................................................... 19
  5.3. Compensation Price imposition ....................................................................................... 20
  5.4. Compensation payment and assistance .......................................................................... 20
  5.5. Resettlement and Site clearance ..................................................................................... 21
  5.6. Grievance redress .......................................................................................................... 21
  5.7. Livelihood and income restoration program .................................................................... 22
  5.8. Issues on Gender ............................................................................................................ 23
  5.9. Compliance level when implementing RP ........................................................................ 23

VI. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS .............................................................................. 29
  6.1. Conclusion ......................................................................................................................... 29
  6.2. Recommendations ............................................................................................................ 29

VII. PLAN FOR THE NEXT MONITORING ..................................................................................... 30

ANNEXES .............................................................................................................................................. 31
  Annex 1: Survey questionnaire for affected households ........................................................... 31
  Annex 2: Minutes of working with the project communes/wards ........................................... 34
  Annex 3: Some pictures of field survey ..................................................................................... 44
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1: List of Packages under Ha Tinh Subproject ......................................................... 2
Table 2.1: Positions and specific tasks of each members of the monitoring team ............... 7
Table 3.1: Comparison between actual number of affected households and that in RPs ......... 9
Table 3.2: Comparison actual magnitude of impact with RPs .............................................. 11
Table 4.1: Progress of compensation, assistance by packages at the time of May, 2016 .... 15
Table 5.1: Form of information disclosure of the Subproject ............................................. 19
Table 5.2: Summary of compliance level in RP implementation .................................... 24
## GLOSSARY

**Affected persons (APs)** - Refers to any person or persons, household, firm, private or public institution that, on account of changes resulting from the Project, will have its (i) standard of living adversely affected; (ii) right, title or interest in any house, land (e.g., residential, commercial, agricultural, and/or grazing land), water resources or any other fixed assets acquired, possessed, restricted or otherwise adversely affected, in full or in part, permanently or temporarily; and/or (iii) business, occupation, place of work or residence or habitat adversely affected, with or without physical displacement.

**Compensation** - This is payment given in cash or in kind to affected persons (APs) at replacement cost or at current market value for assets and income sources acquired or adversely affected by the project.

**Cut-off Date** - Date prior to which the occupation or use of the project area makes a person, household or entity eligible to receive compensation and assistance under the Project. Persons not covered in the census are not eligible for compensation and other entitlements, unless they can show proof that (i) they have been inadvertently missed out during the census and the DMS; or (ii) they have lawfully acquired the affected assets following completion of the census and the DMS and after the conduct of the detailed measurement survey (DMS). For this project, 10 May 2015 is considered as the cut-off date.

**Detailed Measurement Survey (DMS)** - Finalization and/or validation of the results of the inventory of losses (IOL), severity of impacts, and list of APs. The final cost of resettlement can be determined following completion of the DMS.

**Entitlements** - Refers to a range of measures, such as compensation in cash or in kind, income restoration support, transfer assistance, relocation support, etc., which are provided to the APs depending on the type and severity of their losses to restore their economic and social base.

**Land Acquisition** - Process whereby any household under the Secondary Cities Development Project, through the Land Fund Development Centre, will alienate all or part of the land it owns or possesses to the ownership and possession of that agency for the project in return for compensation at replacement costs.

**Relocation** - Physical relocation of an AP from her/his pre-project place of residence and/or business.

**Replacement cost** - Means the amount in cash or in kind needed to replace an asset in its existing condition, without deduction of transaction costs or depreciation and salvageable materials, at prevailing current market value at the time of
compensation payment.

**Resettlement** - Refers to various measures provided to DPs or AHs to mitigate any and all adverse social impacts of the project, including compensation, relocation, and rehabilitation as needed.

**Severely affected Households** - This refers to AHs who will (i) lose 10% or more of their total productive assets, and/or (ii) have to relocate, and/or (iii) lose 10% or more of their total income sources due to the project.

**Vulnerable groups** - These are distinct groups of people who might suffer disproportionately or face the risk of being further marginalized due to the project and specifically include: (i) female-headed households with dependents, (ii) household heads with disabilities, (iii) households falling under the generally accepted indicator for poverty, (iv) elderly households who are landless and with no other means of support, (v) landless households, (vi) severely affected ethnic minorities.
I. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Secondary Cities Development Project

1. The Government of the Socialist Republic of Viet Nam has obtained a loan from the Asian Development Bank (ADB) towards the cost of the Secondary Cities Development Project. The project will finance urban environment improvement through 11 infrastructure subprojects in three secondary cities in central region of Viet Nam which are Buon Ma Thuot (DakLak province), Ha Tinh (Ha Tinh province), and Tam Ky (Quang Nam province).

2. These subprojects will cover (i) solid waste management (SWM) for improved environmental quality; (ii) urban road upgrading for improved connectivity and evacuation during disasters; and (iii) completion of flood dikes, drainage channels, and regulating basins for flood control. The project optimizes development impact by adding to the flood protection and drainage infrastructure initiated through a previous Asian Development Bank (ADB) project (CRUEIP). The project aims to develop urban infrastructure and improved environmental sustainability to the effects of climate changes.

1.2. Secondary Cities Development Project – Ha Tinh Subproject

3. The Project will focus on priority investment items for environment improvement and building of technical infrastructure for enhancing accessibility to social services for population, facilitate commercial intercourse for goods from inner-city to vicinities and vice versa, create precedence for the development of Ha Tinh city. For the extent of Secondary Cities Development Project – Ha Tinh city, some following specific objectives will be focused on:

- Undertake outstanding drainage and anti-flooding volume connecting to items under the Central Urban Environmental Improvement Project (CRUEIP) due to insufficient fund to promote efficiency of the design system.

- Building technical infrastructure around Bong Son regulating lake which was built previously under the CRUEIP to promote efficiency of this item: environmental improvement around the lake, creating green environment to enhance microclimate regulation capacity for vicinities.

- Investment in building urban roads according to the master plan with on-route technical infrastructures (green trees, lighting system, technical tuynel, etc.), step-by-step furnish the master plan of the city. The improvement of urban roads and designed drainage systems aims to improve environment and facilitate local people’s accessibility to business zones and economic services, contributing to promotion of local economic development activities. These roads have been selected by GHK – VICA Consultant and Local Authority because of its conformity to ADB’s criteria on using ADF fund.

- Investment in newly-building some main drains and regulating basin as prescribed in the master plan to ensure the prevailing exploitation and using will take into account capacity increasing and suitable technologies as well as impacts of climate changes.

- Continue increasing capacity of the project management and implementation units, raise community’s awareness and enhance management capacity in operation, monitor and maintenance of works for some key relevant agencies at provincial and city levels to ensure optimal efficiency and sustainability of the project;

4. The Secondary Cities Development Project – Ha Tinh Subproject is implemented in 11 wards/communes of Ha Tinh city, including 8 wards of Tan Giang, Tran Phu, Ha Huy Tap,
Dai Nai, Nguyen Du, Thach Linh, Thach Quy, Van Yen and 3 communes of Thach Trung, Thach Dong, Thach Hung. Ha Tinh Sub-project includes two components with three (03) packages, including: (i) package HT-01: Drains and Thach Trung regulating basin; (ii) Package HT-02: Bong Son lake environment improvement; (iii) Package HT-03: Nguyen Trung Thien road (Center and the South) and Hai Thuong Lan Ong road.

5. The table below indicates project location, division and designing of the packages under the Subproject.

Table 1.1: List of Packages under Ha Tinh Subproject

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Project location</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>HT-01 Package: Major Drains + Thach Trung regulating basin</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Drainage channel T3 and access road</td>
<td>Thach Linh, Tran Phu wards</td>
<td>Drainage of wastewater and stormwater for the Northwest of city, length of channel of 1,609.5m. This route will address demands of drainage for some basins in an area of about 291.8ha in Tran Phu ward and Thach Linh.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Drainage channel T8 and access road</td>
<td>Thach Dong commune</td>
<td>Length of 2,059.13m, the proposed new drainage channel is to drain and minimize level and time of flooding for the East of city, then flows into Rao Cai river. This route will address demands of drainage for some basins in an area of 712.67ha in Thach Quy ward and Thach Hung, Thach Dong communes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Drainage channel T4 and access road</td>
<td>Thach Trung commune</td>
<td>Drainage of wastewater and stormwater for the North of city, length of channel of 1,584.96m. This route will address demands of drainage for some basins in an area of about 683.5ha in Tran Phu ward, Nguyen Du ward and Thach Trung commune.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Thach Trung regulating basin and technical infrastructure surrounding the lake (including access roads D1 and D2a).</td>
<td>Thach Trung commune, Nguyen Du ward</td>
<td>Thach Trung regulating basin has an area of 7.96ha, with the function of storage of stormwater during the period of tidal outlet closing to regulate floodwater for the North of city, minimize level and time of flooding in case of heavy rains and flooding. In addition, the basin also regulates climate and improve regional environment, creating regional landscape, serve recreation and entertainment demands, and to be further invested to become green park in the future.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>HT-02 package: Environmental improvements to Bong Son lake</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Drainage channels T2, and access road (technical infrastructure surrounding Bong Son lake or Hoang Xuan Han road)</td>
<td>Dai Nai, Ha Huy Tap wards</td>
<td>Undertake drainage of wastewater and stormwater for the Southeast of city, including 2 routes of T2 in length of 186 m and T2A in length of 142,2 m Channel T2 will drain for some basins of about 314.47ha, Channel 2A has drainage basin of 452.85ha in Ha Huy Tap ward, Nam Ha, Van Yen, Dai Nai.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Items</td>
<td>Project location</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Drainage channel T2A and access road (Van Yen channel)</td>
<td>Dai Nai, Van Yen wards</td>
<td>The route mainly passes through residential area in street block 10 in Dai Nai ward. The route has start point crossing with Bui Cam Ho road and end point crossing with Le Khoi road.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Drainage channel T2-4 (Bau Ra channel)</td>
<td>Ha Huy Tap ward</td>
<td>Infrastructure surrounding Bong Son lake, including levelling, internal roads surrounding Bong Son lake (Bn=6m), drainage of stormwater, power supply, green trees Hoang Xuan Han road mainly passes through residential area in Tan Giang ward, start point crossing with National Highway 1A, end point at the crossroads of Road 26/03 and existing Nguyen Bieu road</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Drainage channel T2-4 (Bau Ra channel)</td>
<td>Ha Huy Tap ward</td>
<td>The route mainly passes through residential area in street block 10 in Dai Nai ward. The route has start point crossing with Bui Cam Ho road and end point crossing with Le Khoi road.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Nguyen Trung Thien road, central section (Nguyen Trung Thien road from Hai Thuong Lan Ong to Nguyen Du)</td>
<td>Tan Giang and Thach Quy wards</td>
<td>The route with length of 801.15m mainly passes through residential area located in Tan Giang ward with start point at the crossroads of Nguyen Du road and existing Nguyen Trung Thien road and the end point at the crossroads of Hai Thuong Lan Ong road and existing Nguyen Trung Thien road.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Nguyen Trung Thien road, southern section (Nguyen Trung Thien road, section from Vong bridge to the road connecting Van Yen ward centre with Road 26-3)</td>
<td>Tan Giang, Van Yen, Dai Nai</td>
<td>The route include 02 sections: Sections 1’s length is 1,239.97m and section 2’s length is 518.4m, this road mainly passes through residential area and paddy field in Tan Giang, Van Yen and Dai Nai ward, start point at Vong bridge in Tan Giang ward and end point intersecting with Nguyen Trung Thien road section connecting from road 26/3 to the administrative center of Dai Nai ward.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Hai Thuong Lan Ong road from Mai Thuc Loan road to Do Ha bridge</td>
<td>Thach Quy ward, Thach Hung commune</td>
<td>The route with length of 1,048.72m mainly passes through residential area and paddy field in Thach Quy and Thach Hung commune, start point at intersection of Hai Thuong Lan Ong road and Mai Thuc Loan road; end point at the head of Do Ha bridge in Thach Hung commune.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Access road D3 (Nguyen Huy Lung road)</td>
<td>Thach Trung commune, Nguyen Du ward</td>
<td>The route access to Thach Trung lake with length of 1224.29m mainly passes through residential area in Nguyen Du, Thach Quy and Thach Hung commune, start point at intersection of Ha Hoang road and existing Nguyen Huy Lung road; end point at Quang Trung road.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Drainage channel T1 and access road</td>
<td>Thach Quy ward</td>
<td>Drainage channel T1 has start point at the remaining section from Mai Thuc Loan road and end point at marsh in front of Bap Bot culvert then flows into Rao Cai river, with</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
II. OBJECTIVES AND METHODOLOGY OF RP IMPLEMENTATION INDEPENDENT MONITORING

2.1. Objectives

6. The main goal of the independent monitoring on the implementation of the resettlement plan is to ensure the site clearance compensation and resettlement for households affected by the project in accordance with the approved resettlement plan and to ensure the compliance with the regulations of GOV and the People’s Committee of Ha Tinh province and the ADB’s resettlement policy.

7. The overall objective of the independent monitoring is to provide an independent periodical review and assessment if the Project has: (i) Achievements the objectives as resettlement plan outlined or not, (ii) Changes in living standards and domestic life of affected households, (iii) The restoration and/or improvement of the economic and social base of affected persons, (iv) The compliance of resettlement implementation with the approved RPs, (v) The organization effectiveness, the need for further mitigation measures, if any.

8. The monitoring and evaluation activities will be conducted periodically during the implementation phase and after the resettlement period to ensure that land acquisition and resettlement is done according to the rules and guidelines presented in detail in the resettlement plan. The monitoring will provide the participants with regular reflections of the implementation. This activity helps assess success and difficulties of the actual likelihoods of APs in order to recommend timely resolutions during the project implementation phase.


2.2. Monitoring Indicators and Criteria of RP Implementation

Key indicators of independent monitoring and evaluation of RP implementation

10. Key indicators of independent monitoring and evaluation of RP implementation include:

- Payment of compensation as follows: (a) payment, full, sufficient and timely, for all affected persons (b) satisfactory payment to replace affected property.

- Technical support measures: Displaced households have to rebuild houses and structures on their remaining land or building on new locations or new land arranged by the project (if any).

- Public consultation and perceptions for compensation policies: (a) displaced households will be fully informed and consulted about the preparation activities of resettlement sites; (b) The monitoring team will attend public consultation meetings to consider and discuss issues and problems arisen and propose solutions, (c) public perceptions for the rights and compensation and resettlement policies which will be evaluated in the relocated households, (d) assessment of the perceptions for different solutions available to households affected by the project in accordance with the resettlement plan.
- The support measures for income restoration.
- Monitoring the restoration of production activities of the relocated households.
- The level of satisfaction of AHs with different areas of the resettlement plan will be monitored and followed.
- The operating of the grievance redress mechanism and level of satisfaction level for grievance redressing.
- The progress of the site clearance, compensation and resettlement of the Project.

\* Specific Monitoring and Evaluation Indicators \*

11. The independent monitoring consultancy team carried out monitoring all contents of the uRP throughout the resettlement implementation stage. Based on the requirements set out in TOR, the Consultant establish specific indicators for the monitoring as follows:

**Consultation, Participation and Disclosure**

(i) Verify that the affected persons received and understood the public information booklet distributed by PPMUs.

(ii) Verify that the affected persons were adequately notified of public meetings and other consultation activities carried out by PPMUs during resettlement plan updating.

(iii) Assess that affected persons received adequate and timely information on the Project and resettlement process.

(iv) Assess that the affected persons were consulted on their choices and were encouraged to raise suggestions and concerns during the meetings.

**Detailed measurement survey (DMS)**

(i) Verify that the affected persons (men and women) were present the conduct of detailed measurement survey and kept a copy of their DMS form with signatures of representatives of related parties.

(ii) Verify the adequacy and accuracy of DMS and any complaint of AHs about DMS.

**Entitlements and Compensation**

(i) Verify that the compensation plan adheres to the principles and policies of the agreed updated resettlement plan.

(ii) Verify that the affected persons received full compensation amounts and other entitlements as specified in the compensation plan.

(iii) Verify that the pricing in the compensation plan adequately reflects replacement value in the local markets.

(iv) Verify that replacement land (if available) provided by the project as been of equal value and productive capacity as land acquired by the project.

(v) Project and that the affected persons have received land user rights certificates for the replacement land.

(vi) Verify that compensation payments were made in due time to allow affected persons to relocate and make necessary preparations before start of civil works construction.

**Relocation and Rehabilitation**
(i) Verify that resettlement sites and/or replacement land have been provided as planned, that income rehabilitation programs (if any) are progressing appropriately and that affected persons are progress in appropriately in reestablishing their pre-project income and productive levels.

Vulnerability and Gender Strategy specific actions

(i) Verify the special needs and assistance of the poor and vulnerable households have been provided as planned and that any on-going assistance or programs to improve their socioeconomic conditions are progressing appropriately.

(ii) Verify that the gender strategy specific actions are being followed and carried out as per agreed resettlement plan (and as reflected in the updated resettlement plans).

Grievance and Complaints

(i) Assess that the affected persons were aware of and understand the project's mechanism for addressing grievances and complaints.

(ii) Verify that any complaints filed were resolved satisfactorily and in line with the principles and policies of the agreed resettlement plan.

(iii) Verify that the affected persons paid no fees for filing complaints at the commune, district or provincial level.

2.3. Methodology of RP Implementation Monitoring

12. To implement the monitoring tasks, the Consultant used a combination of research methodologies, including qualitative and quantitative methods to accomplish the tasks as convenient and efficient as possible. The main methods are as follows:

(i) Desk review:

13. The Consultant collects and reviews all relevant documents provided by PMU of Ha Tinh city, the Center for Land Fund Development of Ha Tinh province, CARB of Ha Tinh city and the City Resettlement Committee (CRC), including internal monitoring reports, DMS data, compensation plans, etc. The desk review is to verify whether all rights and entitlements of affected persons are included in the compensation plans based on replacement costs or not; checking public consultation, information disclosure and grievance settlement by reviewing internal monitoring reports; assessing capacity of Ha Tinh PMU and CRC for implementation of RPs; and checking the resettlement database.

(ii) Qualitative method

The Consultant used in-depth interview and Focus group discussion to collect information from different stakeholders, including APs.

In-depth interview: The Consultant carried out 19 in-depth interviews with key informants including 4 heads of villages and 5 leaders of commune People's Committee and 10 partially affected households that have larger acquired land area than others. Accordingly, the Consultant can hear feedbacks from local people to know level of satisfaction and their expectations. This method maximizes the information that the consultant cannot learn by quantitative method if monitoring on the same objects. These information will supplement for the information obtained from the sample survey by questionnaires and desk review process.

Focus group discussion: The independent monitoring consultant also carried out 6 focus-group discussions with about 40 persons, one of which is carried out with representatives of CARB to understand advantages, disadvantages and solutions during the resettlement
implementation course, understand information to re-assess the project framework and policy framework. Five of which is carried out with representatives of local authorities and affected households in 5 communes/wards (including severely affected households and vulnerable households) to collect opinions about relevant subjects such as community participation, investment efficiency, compensation and site clearance at the locality.

**Quantitative method**

Sample survey (questionnaire): During the 1st periodic monitoring, the Independent Monitoring Consultant carried out the questionnaire survey for 10% of total slightly affected households and 100% of severely affected households by the Subproject. Total number of households surveyed by questionnaire was 110 households, including 20 severely affected households needed to relocate and 90 marginally affected households of the project. The survey was conducted for both men and women, the elderly and other vulnerable groups. Survey sample for AHs by the project is attached to annex.

**Observation:** The Consultant visited the project sites and resettlement sites and survey at resettlement site to determine the project implementation within the scope of land acquisition and observe that the resettlement sites are constructed with full infrastructure and the living conditions of the displaced households has been improved.

2.4. Compositions of the Monitoring Team and Schedule

**Compositions of the Monitoring Team**

14. The independent monitoring of RP implementation in Ha Tinh city was conducted by the monitoring specialists, including one resettlement specialist (team leader) and one field survey consultant.

15. Positions and specific tasks of each member are shown in the table bellowed.

*Table 2.1: Positions and specific tasks of each members of the monitoring team*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Personnel</th>
<th>Assigned tasks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Team leader</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Nguyen Van Trung</strong></td>
<td>▪ Act as a team leader, taking responsibility before Project Director for Consulting Services;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Review all documents of the project (including the Resettlement Policy Framework and other relevant documents), ADB's policies, laws and regulations of the Government relating to involuntary resettlement;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Interview with affected households</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Conduct public consultations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Conduct household survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Analyze and process information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Prepare monitoring report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Support staff</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Nguyen Manh Truong</strong></td>
<td>▪ Prepare necessary documents, information and records;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tran Van Hao</strong></td>
<td>▪ Prepare documents, dispatches, letters of introduction;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Prepare to rent facilities, equipment for carrying out the tasks;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Prepare questionnaires, data entry and processing;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Print and photocopy collected documents and other documents;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Support the Team leader in the monitoring, summarizing and</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Personnel Assigned tasks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Personnel</th>
<th>Assigned tasks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>reporting the working progress;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Support in entering and processing database;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Translate documents (if required);</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Other necessary works.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Monitoring Schedule**

16. The 1st periodic monitoring of the Secondary Cities Development Project – Ha Tinh city Subproject was commenced from 04 May 2016 to 15 May 2016 in 5 project wards/communes of Thach Trung, Van Yen, Ha Huy Tap, Dai Nai and Thach Dong. Specific activities of the monitoring mission include:

- Work with the CARB to discuss the actual implementation of compensation and site clearance of the Subproject at the locality;
- Survey at 5 wards/communes under the Subproject include contents related to public consultation, information disclosure, detailed measurement survey, entitlements and compensation policies, relocation and livelihood restoration, specific policies for vulnerable groups, grievances and redress), particularly determine difficulties and propose corrective solutions (if any).

### III. MAGNITUDE OF SUBPROJECT’S IMPACTS

17. According to the Resettlement Plans approved for the packages under the Secondary Cities Development Project – Ha Tinh City Subproject, the Subproject will be implemented in 11 communes/wards of Ha Tinh city and affect 476,482 m² of land, including 373,352 m² of agricultural land, 9,888 m² of residential land and 93,242 m² of traffic land and public land managed by the ward/commune People’s Committees. Total number of households impacted with land according to the Resettlement Plans approved for the packages is 1,197 households.

18. However, as at May 2016, basing on data collected from the DMS results and the decisions on land acquisition, the Subproject affected 1,017 households and 14 agencies in 11 wards/communes.

Of which:

- 115 households were impacted with residential land and garden land,
- 133 households were impacted with housing, structures and facilities, of which 16 households have to relocate.
- 926 households were impacted with agricultural land (of which 570 households losing over 10% of total existing landholding).

19. Number of affected households and extent of impacts of the Subproject are shown in Tables 3.1 and 3.2 bellowed.
Table 3.1: Comparison between actual number of affected households and that in RPs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Project location</th>
<th>Total affected households/organizations</th>
<th>No of households affected on residential land</th>
<th>No of households affected on housing and architectural structure</th>
<th>No of displaced and resettled households</th>
<th>No of households affected on agricultural land</th>
<th>No of affected households on over 10% total of agricultural land area</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>RP</td>
<td>DMS</td>
<td>RP</td>
<td>DMS</td>
<td>RP</td>
<td>DMS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>HT-01 Package: Major Drains + Thach Trung regulating basin</td>
<td></td>
<td>778</td>
<td>626</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Drainage channel T3 and access road</td>
<td>Thach Linh, Tran Phu wards</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Drainage channel T8 and access road</td>
<td>Thach Dong commune</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>156</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Drainage channel T4 and access road</td>
<td>Thach Trung commune</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Thach Trung regulating basin</td>
<td>Thach Trung commune</td>
<td>275</td>
<td>276</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Access road D1</td>
<td>Thach Trung commune</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Access road D2a</td>
<td>Thach Trung commune, Nguyen Du ward</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>HT-02 package: Environmental improvements to Bong Son lake</td>
<td></td>
<td>52</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Drainage channels T2, and access road (technical infrastructure surrounding Bong Son lake or Hoang Xuan Han road)</td>
<td>Dai Nai, Ha Huy Tap wards</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Drainage channel T2A and access road (Van Yen channel)</td>
<td>Dai Nai, Van Yen wards</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Drainage channel T2-4 (Bau Rach channel)</td>
<td>Ha Huy Tap ward</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>Items</td>
<td>Project location</td>
<td>Total affected households/organizations</td>
<td>No of households affected on residential land</td>
<td>No of households affected on housing and architectural structure</td>
<td>No of displaced and resettled households</td>
<td>No of households affected on agricultural land</td>
<td>No of affected households on over 10% total of agricultural land area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>HT-03 package: Nguyen Trung Thien road (Centre + South) + Hai Thuong Lan Ong road.</td>
<td></td>
<td>367</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>294</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Nguyen Trung Thien road, central section (Nguyen Trung Thien road from Hai Thuong Lan Ong to Nguyen Du)</td>
<td>Tan Giang and Thach Quy wards</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Nguyen Trung Thien road, southern section (Nguyen Trung Thien road, section from Vong bridge to the road connecting Van Yen ward centre with Road 26-3)</td>
<td>Tan Giang, Van Yen, Dai Nai wards</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Hai Thuong Lan Ong road from Mai Thuc Loan road to Do Ha bridge</td>
<td>Thach Quy ward, Thach Hung commune</td>
<td>187</td>
<td>197</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Access road D3 (Nguyen Huy Lung road)</td>
<td>Thach Trung commune, Nguyen Du ward</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Drainage channel T1 and access road</td>
<td>Thach Quy ward</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resettlement site</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>15</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1.197</td>
<td>1.031</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: Summary of mid-term monitoring data in May/2016)
Table 3.2: Impact on lands (Comparison of actual impact and estimated impact of RP)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Project location</th>
<th>Total affected households/organizations</th>
<th>Total affected area (m²)</th>
<th>Types of affected land</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>RP</td>
<td>DMS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>HT-01 Package: Major Drains + Thach Trung regulating basin</td>
<td>778 626</td>
<td>321.816 326.209</td>
<td>259.229 240.594</td>
<td>1.249 7.390</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>88 85</td>
<td>21.023 38.727,1</td>
<td>18.625 18.625</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>160 NA</td>
<td>23.140 NA</td>
<td>18.169 NA NA NA NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>275 276</td>
<td>226.993 226.993,4</td>
<td>196.495 196.495</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>29 42</td>
<td>2.180 2.179,86</td>
<td>1.639 1.639</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>52 18</td>
<td>15.183 5.517</td>
<td>2.431 2.431</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

II HT-02 package: Environmental improvements to Bong Son lake
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Project location</th>
<th>Total affected households/organizations</th>
<th>Total affected area (m²)</th>
<th>Total affected area (m²)</th>
<th>Types of affected land</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>RP DMS</td>
<td>RP DMS</td>
<td>Agricultural land area (m²)</td>
<td>Residential land area (m²)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Drainage channels T2, and access road (technical infrastructure surrounding Bong Son lake or Hoang Xuan Han road)</td>
<td>Dai Nai, Ha Huy Tap wards</td>
<td>34 0</td>
<td>9.591 NA</td>
<td>NA NA</td>
<td>153 NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Drainage channel T2A and access road (Van Yen channel)</td>
<td>Dai Nai, Van Yen wards</td>
<td>11 11</td>
<td>4.375 4.300,2</td>
<td>2.256 2.256</td>
<td>NA NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Drainage channel T2-4 (Bau Ra channel)</td>
<td>Ha Huy Tap ward</td>
<td>7 7</td>
<td>1.217 1.216,6</td>
<td>175 175</td>
<td>NA NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>HT-03 package: Nguyen Trung Thien road (Centre + South) + Hai Thuong Lan Ong road.</td>
<td></td>
<td>367 387</td>
<td>139.483 203.923</td>
<td>111.692 110.083</td>
<td>8.486 7.305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Nguyen Trung Thien road, central section (Nguyen Trung Thien road from Hai Thuong Lan Ong to Nguyen Du)</td>
<td>Tan Giang and Thach Quy wards</td>
<td>32 34</td>
<td>2.101 2.196,8</td>
<td>122 NA</td>
<td>1.317 1.412,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Nguyen Trung Thien road, southern section (Nguyen Trung Thien road, section from Vong bridge to the road connecting Van Yen ward centre with Road 26-3)</td>
<td>Tan Giang, Van Yen, Dai Nai wards</td>
<td>134 127</td>
<td>57.631 109.808,4</td>
<td>56.401 55.988</td>
<td>971 679,3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Hai Thuong Lan Ong road from Mai Thuc Loan road to Do Ha bridge</td>
<td>Thach Quy ward, Thach Hung commune</td>
<td>187 197</td>
<td>76.456 88.622,8</td>
<td>54.848 54.095</td>
<td>5.958 5.001,2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Access road D3 (Nguyen Huy Lung road)</td>
<td>Thach Trung commune, Nguyen Du</td>
<td>9 25</td>
<td>2.920 2.920</td>
<td>217 NA</td>
<td>212 211.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>Items</td>
<td>Project location</td>
<td>Total affected households/organizations</td>
<td>Total affected area (m²)</td>
<td>Types of affected land</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>RP   DMS</td>
<td>RP   DMS</td>
<td>Agricultural land area (m²)</td>
<td>Residential land area (m²)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>RP   DMS</td>
<td>RP   DMS</td>
<td>RP   DMS</td>
<td>RP   DMS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Drainage channel T1 and access road</td>
<td>Thach Quy ward</td>
<td>5   4</td>
<td>375</td>
<td>375.2</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Resettlement site</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: Summary of mid-term monitoring data in May/2016)
20. **Impacts of land acquisition:** Based on data from the land acquisition decision for each package of Subproject, total 535,649 m$^2$ of land area is permanently acquired to actually implement the project, including 353,108 m$^2$ of agricultural land, 14,695 m$^2$ of residential land, 1,639 m$^2$ of garden land and 333.564 m$^2$ of traffic, irrigation and public land managed by the People’s Committees of communes/wards.

21. **Impacts on trees and crops:** According to data from the decisions of land acquisition and Minutes of detailed measurement survey (DMS) for affected households in 11 the project communes/wards, a total of 353.108 m$^2$ of crops is affected. In which, 241.416 m$^2$ of rice land and 111.692 m$^2$ of others crops, namely: maize, potato, cassava and vegetables. In addition, some fruit trees including oranges, bananas, longan and so on. Have to be cut down in the project implementation process. Total 926 households whose trees, crops are affected, in which 570 severely affected households lose over 10% existing farming land area).

22. **Impacts on houses and structures:** According to uRP approved, in the implementation process, the Subproject has only impacted on houses, structures of 39 households. However, according to independent monitoring results and based on results of detailed measurement survey for affected households, Subproject has impacted on houses, structure of 133 households, in which, 26 affected households have to resettle, mainly concentrated in the implementation area for HT-03 package: Nguyen Trung Thien road (Centre + Southern area) + Hai Thuong Lan Ong road, in communes of Thach Hung and Thach Quy.

23. Thus, it can be seen that PMU and implementation agencies in charge of compensation and site clearance in Ha Tinh city took measures to adjust technical design in order to mitigate impacts of land acquisition and resettlement, avoid negative impacts as much as possible to maximize the benefits of the Project.

**IV. RESETTLEMENT IMPLEMENTATION PROGRESS OF THE SUBPROJECT**

24. Secondary Cities Development Project – Ha Tinh city subproject has been implemented in 11 wards/communes of Ha Tinh city. Ha Tinh city subproject has 2 components which are divided into 3 packages (i) HT-01 package: Major Drains and Thach Trung regulating basin; (ii) HT-02 package: Bong Son lake; (iii) HT-03 Package: Urban roads.

25. The compensation and assistance for households affected by the Secondary Cities Development Project – Ha Tinh city Subproject has been started in Quarter IV, 2014, after updated RP is cleared by ADB. The process of detailed measurement survey for affected households was finished at the end of December/2014.

26. At the time of May/2016, the compensation and site clearance of Ha Tinh Subproject have been completed about 60%. Out of 3 packages including HT1, HT2 and HT3, none of packages completed 100% compensation payment for affected households, however, in order to ensure the progress of project implementation, the Central Region Urban Environment Improvement Project – Ha Tinh city PMU handed over the layout to the construction units in the roads where compensation payment for affected households and organizations was completed. It is estimated that at the end of June 2016, the site clearance compensation of all packages will be completed and in early July/2016, the Central Region Urban Environment Improvement Project – Ha Tinh city PMU will hand over the remaining roads to the construction units.
Table 4.1: Progress of compensation, assistance by packages up to 19 May, 2016

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Project location</th>
<th>No of households / organizations to be assisted</th>
<th>No of households / organizations received assistance and compensation</th>
<th>Total cost of compensation and assistance</th>
<th>Cost paid for compensation and assistance</th>
<th>Remaining cost, unpaid cost for compensation and assistance</th>
<th>Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>HT-01 Package: Major Drains + Thach Trung regulating basin</td>
<td>626 440</td>
<td>58,642,543,715</td>
<td>47,085,460,499</td>
<td>11,557,083,216</td>
<td>3 HHs impacted with residential land have not been approved the compensation and assistance plan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Drainage channel T3 and access road</td>
<td>Thach Linh, Tran Phu wards</td>
<td>85 0</td>
<td>4,749,768,509</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4,749,768,509</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Drainage channel T8 and access road</td>
<td>Thach Dong commune</td>
<td>156 156</td>
<td>4,364,715,879</td>
<td>4,364,715,879</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Drainage channel T4 and access road</td>
<td>Thach Trung commune</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Thach Trung regulating basin</td>
<td>Thach Trung commune</td>
<td>276 253</td>
<td>41,841,196,774</td>
<td>40,638,139,860</td>
<td>1,203,056,914</td>
<td>The project coincides, the compensation and assistance plan has not been approved</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Access road D1</td>
<td>Thach Trung commune</td>
<td>42 31</td>
<td>2,987,087,569</td>
<td>2,087,004,760</td>
<td>841,582,809</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Access road D2a</td>
<td>Thach Trung commune, Nguyen Du ward</td>
<td>67 0</td>
<td>4,604,779,614</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4,604,779,614</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>Items</td>
<td>Project location</td>
<td>No of households / organizations to be assisted compensation</td>
<td>No of households / organizations received assistance and compensation</td>
<td>Total cost of compensation and assistance</td>
<td>Cost paid for compensation and assistance</td>
<td>Remaining cost, unpaid cost for compensation and assistance</td>
<td>Remarks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>HT-02 package: Environmental improvements to Bong Son lake</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 Drainage channels T2, and access road (technical infrastructure surrounding Bong Son lake or Hoang Xuan Han road)</td>
<td>Dai Nai, Ha Huy Tap wards</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>203,780,115</td>
<td></td>
<td>203,780,115</td>
<td>The compensation and assistance plan has not been approved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 Drainage channel T2A and access road (Van Yen channel)</td>
<td>Dai Nai, Van Yen wards</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>165,361,825</td>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>Supplementation of access road 2a (Van Yen – Dai Nai) has not been approved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 Drainage channel T2-4 (Bau Ra channel)</td>
<td>Ha Huy Tap ward</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>38,418,290</td>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>HT-03 package: Nguyen Trung Thien road (Centre + South) + Hai Thuong Lan Ong road.</td>
<td></td>
<td>387</td>
<td>172</td>
<td>56,173,098,346</td>
<td>26,062,725,708</td>
<td>30,110,372,638</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 Nguyen Trung Thien road, central section (Nguyen Trung Thien road from Hai Thuong Lan Ong to Nguyen Du)</td>
<td>Tan Giang and Thach Quy wards</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>10,239,083,690</td>
<td>952,776,340</td>
<td>9,286,307,350</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 Nguyen Trung Thien road, southern section (Nguyen Trung Thien road, section from Vong bridge to the road connecting Van Yen ward centre with Road 26-3)</td>
<td>Tan Giang, Van Yen, Dai Nai wards</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>19,225,000,241</td>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>19,225,000,241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 Hai Thuong Lan Ong road from Mai Thuc Loan road to Do Ha bridge</td>
<td>Thach Quy ward, Thach Hung commune</td>
<td>197</td>
<td>141</td>
<td>24,603,855,517</td>
<td>23,015,581,640</td>
<td>1,588,273,877</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>Items</td>
<td>Project location</td>
<td>No of households / organizations to be assisted</td>
<td>No of households / organizations received assistance and compensation</td>
<td>Total cost of compensation and assistance</td>
<td>Cost paid for compensation and assistance</td>
<td>Remaining cost, unpaid cost for compensation and assistance</td>
<td>Remarks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Access road D3 (Nguyen Huy Lung road)</td>
<td>Thach Trung commune, Nguyen Du ward</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>2,096,462,028</td>
<td>2,096,462,028</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2 HHs impacted with residential land have not been approved the compensation and assistance plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Drainage channel T1 and access road</td>
<td>Thach Quy ward</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8,696,870</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8,696,870</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>Cost approved according to the plan (Subtotal I+II+III)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1,031</td>
<td>612</td>
<td>115,174,422,176</td>
<td>73,348,186,207</td>
<td>41,826,235,969</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Fund arranged for HHs on some routes however they did not receive</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2,872,262,000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Cost has not been approved according to the Plan (estimated)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>9,242,000,000</td>
<td>9,242,000,000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total cost of site clearance (Subtotal A+B+C)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>124,416,000,000</td>
<td>76,220,000,000</td>
<td>48,196,000,000 (Rounded)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: Summary of Subproject progress report of Ha Tinh provincial PMU)
27. Total counterpart fund for cost of site clearance of the Subproject is VND 124,416 billion, of which cost approved by the compensation and assistance plan is VND 115,174 billion and VND 9,242 billion has not been approved the compensation plan (including costs of compensation and operational costs of the Compensation Council and appraisal cost).

28. Up to 19 May, 2016, the progress of compensation and assistance payment for affected households achieved about 60%. Total fund arranged for site clearance of the Subproject is VND 76,220 billion. The Central Region Urban Environment Improvement Project -Ha Tinh city PMU paid compensation and assistance for 612/1,031 households affected by the Subproject with total cost for compensation and assistance paid for the affected households up to 19 May 2016 was VND $73,348,186,207. In addition, VND 2,872,262,000 was arranged for households on some routes but affected households have not yet received compensation payment for some reasons that land is involved in land dispute and needs to be inspected or that affected persons request being provided with resettlement land. The fund used for implementing compensation and site clearance of the Subproject is taken from counterpart fund of locality, thus allocation of this fund also depends on many elements, namely: budget fund, approval of Departments and agencies, etc. Total fund needed for site clearance of the Subproject is VND 48,196 billion. It is expected that Ha Tinh provincial People’s Committee will promulgate decision to implement needed capital disbursement for payment of remaining affected households of the project at the end of June of 2017.

V. RESULTS OF RESETTLEMENT PLAN IMPLEMENTATION MONITORING

5.1. Information disclosure and Public Consultation

29. Monitoring results showed that information disclosure and public consultation and local people’s participation in the Secondary Cities Development Project – Ha Tinh city Subproject was implemented relatively fully.


31. Results of focused group discussion and in-depth interviews with representatives of compensation staff of the Central Region Urban Environmental Improvement Project of Ha Tinh city PMU and Ha Tinh city Land Fund Development Centre, local authorities and affected households showed information about the Subproject, compensation, assistance policy and implementation plan of the Subproject have been informed to the affected households. Information disclosure is implemented by the commune PCs and leaders of villages. The information related to the Subproject and compensation, assistance policies for affected households is also widely reported through the radio systems of communes and through the public consultation meetings held at the project communes/wards.

32. Survey results showed that in the process of Resettlement Plan implementation in 11 communes/wards affected by the Subproject, the consultancy unit coordinated with the local authorities to organize 11 public consultation meetings in 11 communes/wards. At each commune/ward of Subproject, at least one consultation meeting was held. Contents of public consultation meeting consisted of issues, namely: information disclosure of Subproject; direction on implementation procedures for site clearance; disclosure of policy on site clearance compensation and so on. Participants of the public consultation meetings include representatives of the Central Region Urban Environmental Improvement Project - Ha Tinh city PMU, representatives of commune/ward PCs, villages and households affected by the
Subproject. Each public consultation meeting has from 20 to 25 participants, in which, participation rate of women accounts for 46% of total participants in meetings.

33. Questionnaire-based survey results also showed that, out of total 110 households surveyed by questionnaires, more than 90% households said that they were disclosed with information about the Subproject (compensation plan, compensation policy, implementation time, etc.). In which, 80.9% households were informed of information about the project through the meetings held in villages/hamlets, 79.1% households acknowledged information about the project through local authorities staff and 51.8% households acknowledged information about the project through the mass media.

Table 5.1: Form of information disclosure of the Subproject

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Information source</th>
<th>No of HHs</th>
<th>Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Leaflet</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>30.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>bulletin board</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>21.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Public information</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>51.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Local authorities’ staff</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>79.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Project staff</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>60.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Meetings at streets/hamlets/villages</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>80.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Other information sources</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>40.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: Questionnaire survey, 05/2016, N = 110)

5.2. Detailed Measurement Survey (DMS)

34. The approved Resettlement Plan regulates all affected land and assets on land in the Subproject area should be implemented with detailed measurement survey. The process of DMS includes both acquired land area for building infrastructure and affected area for building banister and sidewalk.

35. The DMS process of the Secondary Cities Development Project – Ha Tinh city Subproject was implemented in Quarter IV, 2014 and completed in the end of December 2014. DMS happen relatively conveniently due to the consensus of majority of households for the Subproject implementation. At each affected commune, CPC organized 01 meeting to inform of the land acquisition policy in order to implement the Subproject, implementation time of DMS with participation of the representatives of the CPC’s leaders, agencies, villages’ leaders in the Subproject area and representatives of households. Key information which was discussed and disclosed in the meetings was summarized and informed to the affected community in general and affected households in particular through the local radio system.

36. Provincial People’s Committee assigned Ha Tinh city LFDC and Ha Tinh provincial LFDC to implement the DMS and prepare land acquisition documents, site clearance compensation plan of items under the Secondary Cities Development Project – Ha Tinh city Subproject. Representatives of compensation staff carried out the DMS and identified land area and number of assets to be affected by the Subproject based on the declaration by households. Participants of the DMS include staff from Ha Tinh city LFDC, cadastral staff of communes/wards, village’s leaders and representatives of affected households. Minutes of DMS showed clearly category of land, land location and category of assets and affected area/ number of households. This minutes was agreed and signed by the participants and served as basis for calculation of compensation and assistance value of AH. price imposition, compensation payment and assistance.
37. Through results of questionnaire survey for affected households, majority of affected households are satisfied with results of DMS. Out of a total of 110 households surveyed by questionnaires, 104 households said that the DMS took place publicly and transparently. 108 households said that results of DMS were exact and adequate. The minutes of DMS was filled fully and in detailed actual impacts of households.

38. In the process of detailed measurement survey, the participation rate of women accounts for 34% of total participants, including household-headed women and representatives of organizations, etc.).

5.3. Compensation Prices and allowances

39. Compensation and assistance rate on land for affected households of the Secondary Cities Development Project - Ha Tinh Subproject is applied in accordance with Decision No.94/2014/QD-UBND dated 27 December 2014 on price list for categories of land in 2015 in Ha Tinh province.

40. According to results of independent monitoring, some households said that land price according to Ha Tinh PPC’s regulations is lower than market price. However, the compensation plans showed that in addition to compensation for land, trees and crops, households were also provided the following allowances: (i) Subsistence allowance (3 month cash allowance equivalent to 30 kg of rice/month for all members of affected households losing from 10% - 30% and from 6 months to 12 months for households losing over 30% of existing agricultural land area), (ii) job training/creation allowance (allowance level from 3.5 - 4.5 times of value of acquired agricultural land). Thus, the households actually received higher compensation rate compared with the market rate.

41. The compensation plans were posted publicly in the People’s Committee of communes and community houses of villages/hamlets within 15-20 days for Ahs’ comment. Out of 110 surveyed households, 98 households acknowledged the posted document, 12 households has paid no attention to this post because the magnitude of Subproject impacts on their land is minor.

42. Results of the focus group discussion and in-depth interviews with affected households showed that majority of affected households are satisfied with the compensation prices for their affected assets. Only 02 households responded that they aren’t satisfied with the compensation rate and stated that this compensation rate is lower than market price.

5.4. Compensation payment and assistance

43. Compensation payment and assistance of the Secondary Cities Development Project - Ha Tinh Sub-project has been implemented directly by the Project Management Unit of the Central Region Urban Environment Improvement Project - Ha Tinh city. At the time of 19 May, 2016, the compensation payment for affected households and organizations was completed about 60%. Households affected due to land acquisition for building two resettlement sites in Cua Lang field and Huong Hoa field and households impacted with graves in Dong Cham cemetery received compensation payments from the Subproject. Total capital allocated for site clearance implementation of the Subproject was 76,220 billion dong, in which, cost was paid to AHs was 73,348,186,207 dong. A total of 612 households received compensation payment from the project.

44. Compensation and assistance is paid one time before construction of the work items under the project. On the payment date, households received fully compensation amounts on land, structures, trees, crops and allowances. Amounts of compensation and assistance are equivalent to those stated in the approved Plan. Payment of compensation, assistance is implemented in office of the People’s Committees of communes/wards. When receiving
compensation and assistance amounts, households signed into the list of paid households. This list showed clearly each item of compensation cost on land, trees, crops and allowances paid to households. However, households are not given copy of this receipt.

45. Questionnaire-based survey results in communes/wards of Thach Trung, Van Yen, Ha Huy Tap, Dai Nai and Thach Dong showed that most of compensation receivers are male household heads, accounting for 65% and female household heads receiving compensation amount account for 35%. However, when asked about satisfaction level of households on compensation rate, out of total 110 households involving in interviews, 92 households are satisfied with compensation rate of the project. 16 households are satisfied a bit. Only 2 households are not satisfied with compensation rate because these households said that this compensation rate is lower than the market price. Thus, 2 households have not yet agreed to receive compensation payment and assistance from the project. Two households in Thach Hung commune under HT-3 package, on Hai Thuong Lan Ong road from Mai Thuc Loan road to Do Ha bridge have not yet agreed to receive compensation and assistance due to low compensation prices for their assets..

5.5. Resettlement and Site clearance

46. Implementation of the Secondary Cities Development Project – Ha Tinh city Subproject has impacted on residential land, houses and structures owned by 133 households, in which, a total of 16 affected households have to displace. The displaced households are mainly in the HT – 03 package: Nguyen Trung Thien road, Southern section (7 households) and Hai Thuong Lan Ong road from Mai Thuc Loan road to Do Ha bridge (19 households). At the same time, the project implementation has removed 787 graves in Dong Cham cemetery in Thach Hung commune.

47. The compensation and site clearance unit has completed payment of compensation and assistance for removed of graves (allowance level of displacement for each type of affected grave is prescribed specifically according to compensation rate issued by Ha Tinh PPC in 2015). At the time of May 2016, all affected graves (787 graves, including 426 owned graves and 361 unowned graves) were removed to other places (in Dong Cham cemetery in Thach Hung commune). Results of focused group discussion with the representatives of local authorities of Thach Hung commune and representatives of affected households showed that households agreed to remove graves to other places. For unowned graves affected by the project, the removal was implemented by local authorities and organizations in subproject communes.

48. Regarding the displaced households, a total of 16 displaced households were arranged with resettlement land in the resettlement site in Thach Hung commune by the PMU. Each resettlement plot allocated to households has an average area of 200 m². However, the results of focus group discussion and questionnaire-based interviews for households in the resettlement site showed that currently, infrastructure in the resettlement site has not been built completely. In the resettlement site, clean water and lighting systems have not been connected. Traffic roads have not been consolidated yet, thus, daily life of households remains many difficulties.

Conformity to resettlement activities with construction progress. To ensure project implementation according to schedule, Central Region Urban Environmental Improvement Project- Ha Tinh city PMU carried out to hand over site for construction unit on the routes in which payment of compensation was implemented to affected households and organizations. By the end of June/2016, it is estimated that compensation, site clearance in all packages will be completed and Central Region Urban Environmental Improvement Project - Ha Tinh city PMU will hand over the remaining routes for construction units at the early July/2016.

5.6. Status of Grievance redress
49. Results of consultations with the Central Urban Environment Improvement Project – Ha Tinh city PMU and stakeholders as well as households survey results showed that benefits of the Subproject for community are significant, thus, most of affected households basically satisfied with compensation rate and assistance on land and assets on land. However, only 2 affected households in Thach Hung commune under HT-3 package complained about the affected land area which was not incorrect and compensation rate for land of households was lower than actual transaction cost on the market.

50. Representatives of local authorities and staff of compensation and site clearance of the project explained for the households; However, 02 households have not agreed to receive compensation and assistance. Through results of consultation with representatives of Thach Hung commune and staff of Central Region Urban Environment Improvement Project- Ha Tinh city PMU on grievance redress plan for these 2 households. In coming time (at the end of May 2016), the Compensation and Site Clearance Council of the Project will coordinate with cadastral staff of Thach Hung commune to re-identify land origin of these 2 households based on land levy paid by households every year and make decision on land price at the same time in order to solve these two cases.

51. Results of interview with households showed that in the process of information disclosure of the Subproject, local people were disclosed with grievance redress mechanism. Out of a total 110 participants in interview, 96 households understood mechanism and procedures for grievance redress of the project.

5.7. Livelihood and Income Restoration Program

52. A total of 1,017 households are affected by land acquisition of the Secondary Cities Development Project – Ha Tinh Subproject in 11 communes/wards. Out of 1,017 affected households, 16 households have to displace and 570 households lose more than 10% of total existing farming land area of households. Thus, these households are likely to be affected to their living standard, job and income.

53. In order to mitigate negative impacts of the project on affected households at minimum level, the project implementation agency selected the shortest road and avoided sensitive areas and informed early for local people prior to land acquisition, thereby, households have enough time to harvest trees and crops or stop planting on the affected land. In addition, severely affected households received other allowances, including: (i) Subsistence allowance (cash allowance equivalent to 30 kg of rice/month within 3 months for all members of households losing from 10% - 30% and from 6 months to 12 months for households losing over 30% of agricultural land area), (ii) job training/creation allowance (allowance level from 3.5 - 4.5 times of value of acquired agricultural land). A total of 586 households will receive amounts of allowances on subsistence and productive stabilization, for 16 relocated and resettled households, these households will be received further other allowances, namely: moving allowance, allowance for houses renting, and so on.

54. Budget for implementing separately the income restoration program for severely affected households(losing more than 10% of total landholding area(this is the main source of income of households) and vulnerable households (poor households) in order to restore their income to the pre-project level and households other affected households to increase their income source through the training and assistance program is insufficient. However, according to Decision No 1965/QD-TTg dated 27 November 2009 by the Prime Minister on approving job training plan for rural workers by 2020, Ha Tinh PPC issued Decision No.06/2014/QD-UBND – NC dated 11 February 2014 on launching regulations on management and implementation of the Vocational Training Plan for rural workers in Ha Tinh province. In Quarter III and Quarter IV, wards of Thach Linh, Dai Nai, Van Yen, Thach Hung organized 04 training courses on agriculture, namely: planting mushroom, planting vegetables, raising chickens, etc. with 35 trainees per class, total 150 persons taking part in
these training courses. Budget source for implementing these training courses for households in the communes, wards ation is taken from "Vocational training for rural workers" Project in 2015.

5.8. **Issues on Gender**

55. The implementation process of compensation and assistance of the Secondary Cities Development Project – Ha Tinh city Subproject as well as in the approved RP applied 2 assistance policies for vulnerable households: female-headed households with dependents and disabled-headed households.

56. In fact, at locality, women participated in phases of compensation, assistance and resettlement. Namely, 46% of women participated in public consultation meetings; 34% involved in DMS, 35% received compensation, assistance payment, a number of women involving in training courses on agriculture, namely: Planting mushroom, planting vegetables, raising chickens in the locality accounted for 58%.

5.9. **Compliance with the regulations of the uRP**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content</th>
<th>Regulations in RP</th>
<th>Actual implementation</th>
<th>Compliance level</th>
<th>Solutions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Information disclosure, public consultation, participation of local people</strong></td>
<td>Ensure affected persons to be fully disclosed with information, compensation and assistance policy of the Subproject</td>
<td>Information about the Subproject, implementation plan, compensation and assistance policy, grievance redress mechanism was disclosed and informed to affected community and households. DMS results and compensation plans were posted publicly for households to check and give comments. No complaints from households related to public consultation and information disclosure.</td>
<td>Complied</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Detailed measurement survey</strong></td>
<td>All affected land and assets attached to land in the Subproject area should be adequately and exactly counted by conducting DMS with participation of representatives of Ahs</td>
<td>DMS was conducted with participation of households heads and results of the DMS were posted publicly. Households were informed on affected assets. All assets affected by Subproject were counted. Minutes of loss inventory showed clearly types of land, land area, kinds and amount of affected assets.</td>
<td>Complied</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Compensation Prices</strong></td>
<td>Compensation for land and assets attached to land at replacement cost (calculating by market price and administrative cost arising and others costs) In the case of no differences between price framework as province’s regulations and market price, compensation is implemented according to price framework of Ha Tinh province.</td>
<td>Compensation for land affected by Subproject is calculated according to compensation price for each type of land issued by Ha Tinh PPC every year. This price is lower than that market price, However assistances (Subsistence, job training/creation....) were provided to make compensation amount equivalent to that made by market price. All affected assets included in compensation plan and posted publicly at public places.</td>
<td>Complied</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content</td>
<td>Regulations in RP</td>
<td>Actual implementation</td>
<td>Compliance level</td>
<td>Solutions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Payment of compensation, assistance</td>
<td>Compensation payment for affected land and assets attached to land was implemented fully. Payment of compensation, assistance is implemented once</td>
<td>Households received full compensation payment for affected land and assets attached to land. Compensation and assistance was paid one time.</td>
<td>Complied</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Resettlement                                 |                                                                                  | Displaced allowance: Affected households are assisted with full cash allowance to displace to new places, namely:  
- Displaced households under 1km: 2.6 million dong  
- Displaced households from 1 to 5 km: 4 million dong  
- Displaced households from 5km – 10km: 6 million dong  
- Displaced households from 10km – 15km: 8,5 million dong  
- Displaced households more than 15 km: 20 million dong  
Accommodation allowance: During the 1st periodic report, the Consultant finds that no house renting allowance was provided for displaced HHs when waiting for building new houses in the resettlement site. Results of in-depth interview with AHs showed that during the time of building new houses in the resettlement site of the project, the displaced households can stay in their old houses until | Incompletely complied | PMU is required to review all displaced households. If any HH has not yet built new house in the resettlement site but has to hand over the affected land to the project, the DRC is required to provide house renting allowance for them according to Article 24, Decision No. 75/2014 |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content</th>
<th>Regulations in RP</th>
<th>Actual implementation</th>
<th>Compliance level</th>
<th>Solutions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Section 4) Accommodation allowance for affected households in the displacement time of building new houses: - Rural area: 800,000 dong/household/month; - Urban area: 1,200,000 dong/household/month</td>
<td>completing building new houses at the resettlement site, therefore, the site clearance unit did not provide house renting allowance for them.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) House renting allowance (Decision 75/2014, Article 24) For persons having no any accommodation and pending for displacement to the resettlement site will be assisted with house renting allowance.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Subsistence allowance : (Decision 75/2014, Article 18, Section 1) - Lose from 10 to 70% production land area: Cash allowance equivalent to 30 kg of rice/household member within 6 months without resettlement and within 12 months with resettlement, and 24 months to resettle at areas</td>
<td>For affected households on income due to loss of agricultural land, implementation unit for site clearance carried out supporting for households, including: (i) Subsistence allowance (cash allowance equivalent to 30 kg of rice/month within 3 months for households losing from 10% - 30% and from 6 months to 12 months for households losing over 30% of agricultural land area), (ii) Subsistence and job creation allowance (allowance level from 3.5 - 4.5 times of value of acquired agricultural land).</td>
<td>Incompletely complied</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content</td>
<td>Regulations in RP</td>
<td>Actual implementation</td>
<td>Compliance level</td>
<td>Solutions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with difficult socio-economic conditions;</td>
<td>- Lose from 70% to 100% production land area: Cash allowance equivalent to 30 kg of rice/ household member within 12 months without resettlement and within 24 months with resettlement, and 36 months to resettle at areas with difficult socio-economic conditions;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Households losing agricultural land are assisted agricultural production, including: crop allowance equivalent 4,000/ m2( Decision 75/2014, Article 18, Section 2) Participated in Income Restoration Program.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allowance for vulnerable households</td>
<td>Special assistance for vulnerable households (Decision No.75/2014, Article 18, Section 6) Vulnerable households are assisted in cash with minimum level of 2 million</td>
<td>For female household heads with dependents or disabled household heads who have to displace or lose over 10% agricultural land area handed over, in addition to allowance as prescribed, each household will be assisted with 2,000,000 dong/ household. - Each household is verified to receive 2,000,000 dong/ household by local authorities.</td>
<td>Incompletely complied</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content</td>
<td>Regulations in RP</td>
<td>Actual implementation</td>
<td>Compliance level</td>
<td>Solutions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>dong/ household. Participated in income restoration program.</td>
<td>Grievance redress mechanism was informed to affected persons in public consultation and information disclosure meetings.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Complied</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grievance redress</td>
<td>Grievance redress mechanism should be disclosed transparently and publicly.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
VI. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

6.1. Conclusion

57. Total counterpart fund for implementation of site clearance of the Secondary Cities Development Project - Ha Tinh city Sub-project has been VND 124,416 billion. Total fund allocated to implement site clearance of the Sub-project was 76,220 billion dong. Up to 19 May, 2016, the progress of compensation and assistance payment for affected households has achieved about 60%. Total number of households that received compensation payment was 612 households with total cost paid of VND 73,348,186,207. The remaining fund needed for site clearance of the Subproject is VND 48,196 billion. It is estimated that Ha Tinh PPC will promulgate decision to implement disbursement of the remaining funds for payment of the remaining affected households from the project at the end of June, 2017.

58. Through consultation with stakeholders, field survey and interview with affected persons, the Consultancy unit evaluated that the compensation and assistance of the Subproject complied with the approved RP. The compensation, assistance policies of the Subproject were disclosed in the public consultation meetings and through local radio system.

59. In the process of implementing the 1st periodic monitoring, consultancy units realized that the project implementation unit has not paid houses-renting amount for displaced households while they have to wait newly-built houses at resettlement sites and income restoration program has not been implemented for AHs on income due to loss of agricultural land and vulnerable groups of households.

60. DMS results are relatively exact. The compensation rate is calculated according to land price framework as prescribed by Ha Tinh PPC every year. In the process of compensation and assistance implementation for affected households, 02 households said that their DMS results were incorrect, however, there was no written complaints to the competent authorities.

61. From the detailed design phase of the Subproject, in order to mitigate negative impacts of the Subproject, the following activities were implemented. Calculation and selection of road alignment in order to recover negative environmental impacts of the Subproject; adequate compensation payment and assistance for affected households to mitigate impacts of land acquisition; consultation with stakeholders and affected persons to achieve general consensus before and during the implementation process of the Subproject.

6.2. Recommendations

62. The Central Region Urban Environment Improvement Project – Ha Tinh city PMU should accelerate the compensation payment for affected households who have not received compensation payment and assistance from the project (424 households), and hand over land for construction in order to implement the project on the planned schedule.

63. For 2 affected households in Thach Hung commune said that DMS results are not exact, the Central Region Urban Environment Improvement Project – Ha Tinh city PMU should coordinate with CPC to re-identify (or identify additionally) affected area to make compensation payment for these 2 households.

64. PMU is required to review all displaced households. If any HH has not yet built new house in the resettlement site but has to hand over the layout to the project implementation agencies, the DRC is required to provide house renting allowance for them according to Article 24, Decision No. 75/2014.

65. Income restoration training programs for severely affected households: regarding rice and livestock... in communes/wards should be implemented. These programs can be
combined with/integrated into the on-going programs at locality, however, it should be paid special attention to serious impacts by land acquisition of the Subproject.

VII. PLAN FOR THE NEXT MONITORING ASSIGNMENT

66. Independent monitoring activities for RP implementation of the Secondary Cities Development Project – Ha Tinh city subproject, the external monitoring consultancy unit will implement 3 monitoring times– the 1st periodic monitoring and the 2nd periodic monitoring and the last monitoring, each monitoring time is every 6 months.

67. According to monitoring plan outlined in TOR, independent monitoring activities of RP implementation of the Secondary Cities Development Project – Ha Tinh city subproject will be implemented from December of 2014 to December of 2016. However, payment of compensation, assistance for households affected by the project is slower than expected schedule, thus, independent monitoring activities of RP implementation of the project are also slower than the outlined plan in TOR.

Table 7.1 Independent monitoring activities on RP implementation of the Project

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Monitoring activities</th>
<th>Time of monitoring</th>
<th>Location of survey</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The 1st periodic monitoring</td>
<td>April /2016</td>
<td>5 communes/wards of the project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The 2nd periodic monitoring</td>
<td>October /2016</td>
<td>6 project communes/wards of the project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The last evaluation</td>
<td>April /2017</td>
<td>The whole project area</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

68. In the 2nd periodic monitoring (expected in October/2016) and the last evaluation (estimated in April/2017), Independent Monitoring Consultancy unit will continue to discuss with staff of Central Urban Environment Improvement Project – Ha Tinh city PMU, at communal level, independent monitoring activities of RP implementation will be carried out in the remaining communes/wards without being monitored in the 1st periodic monitoring in order to consider improvement/compliance level of resettlement plan implementation of communes/wards. For communes/wards in the 1st periodic monitoring time, their RP implementation was well complied, it is not necessary to continue to monitor communes/wards in the 2nd periodic monitoring time.

69. After finishing the periodical independent monitoring and post-resettlement evaluation, the Consultant will coordinate with PMU to organize consultation meetings with relevant agencies in the process of resettlement implementation in order to collect comments for finalizing the final report. The specific works include:

- Summarize and analyze monitoring and evaluation results from the previous work plan;
- Prepare the draft final report;
- Design consultation programs;
- Organize consultation to collect comments.
ANNEXES

Annex 1: Survey questionnaire for affected households

BẢNG HỘI
Giám sát dịch vụ việc thực hiện Kế hoạch Tài Định cứu
Mã phiếu

Lộp ảnh hưởng: ☐ Mật phân Chấn tế ☐ Tài Định cứu

1. Thông tin chung về hộ gia đình:
   1. Họ và tên người trả lời: ..............................................
      Tuổi: ......... Giới tính: Nam ☐ Nữ ☐ Học vấn:........
      Nghề nghiệp: ............................................. Quan hệ với chủ hộ: .............................................
   2. Họ và tên chủ hộ: .............................................
      Tuổi: .................................. Giới tính: Nam ☐ Nữ ☐ Học vấn:........
      Nghề nghiệp: ............................................. Địa chỉ: ............................................. Xã/Phường: ............................................. Thành phố: ............................................. tỉnh/Quảng
   3. Số nhân khẩu sống và an chung cùng chủ hộ: ..............
      Trọng do: ............................................. Nnr: ............................................. Số người đi làm có thu nhập: ............................................. người
   4. Thành phần dân tộc của chủ hộ gia đình?
      Kinh ☐ Hau ☐ Khác ☐ (ghi rõ): .............................................
   5. Gia đình có thường xuyên tiếp cận những lợi ích của việc được hưởng trợ cấp xã hội không?
      Có ☐ Không ☐
   6. Lợi ích ảnh hưởng (Lưu ý 1 hộ có thể thuộc nhiều lợi ích ảnh hưởng)
      ☐ Thiệt hại về đất đai
      ☐ Thiệt hại về đất nông nghiệp (1% 4% mất ruộng)
      ☐ Thiệt hại về nhà và các công trình xây dựng khác
      ☐ Thiệt hại công trình thuê nữa Nhà nước
      ☐ Thiệt hại do dịch vụ, kinh doanh buôn bán
      ☐ Thiệt hại các tiện nghi sinh hoạt

II. Phỏng vấn thông tin dự án
   7. Ông/bà có nhận được các thông tin về dự án không?
      Có ☐ Không ☐ (đoạn cuối 10)
   8. Ông/bà biết được những thông tin đó từ những nguồn nào dưới đây?
      ☐ Truyền thông☐ báo chí, truyền hình ☐ Cuộc họp, báo cáo ☐ Người thân (giới thiệu) ☐ Hợp tác dân phòng
   9. Ông/bà có hiểu hết về chính sách và những quyền lợi mà mình được hưởng qua các doạ truyền truyền không?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Có</th>
<th>Không</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Có thông báo trước về thời gian do đặc, kiểm điểm tài sản thất hại của gia đình ông/ông không?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Có thông báo với việc do đặc, kiểm điểm tài sản bất thường của ông/ông không?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Có tài sản nào bị kiểm điểm sét không?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Việc do đặc đảm, nhà bị thiệt hại có chính xác không?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Ông/ông có được xem lại và ký vào biên bản kiểm điểm không?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Ông/ông có được giữ lại 1 bản timestep giả trị bất thường tài sản cụ thể không?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Ông/ông có được thỏa thuận để chọn lựa các phương án bất thường không? (ví dụ thỏa thuận về phương án bất thường bằng tiền, &quot;đạt tối đa&quot;, đối nhân...)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Ông/ông đã nhận được bất cứ 1 khoản bất thường nào chưa?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Thời gian ông/ông nhận bất thường là khi nào?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Gia đình ông/ông đã nhận những hình thức trợ cấp nào do bất thường?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### III. Kiểm điểm tài sản:

1. Ông/ông có được thông báo trước về thời gian do đặc, kiểm điểm tài sản thất hại của gia đình ông/ông không?

2. Ông/ông có thông báo với việc do đặc, kiểm điểm tài sản bất thường của ông/ông không?

3. Ông/ông có tài sản nào bị kiểm điểm sét không?

4. Việc do đặc đảm, nhà bị thiệt hại có chính xác không?

5. Ông/ông có được xem lại và ký vào biên bản kiểm điểm không?

6. Ông/ông có được giữ lại 1 bản timestep giả trị bất thường tài sản cụ thể không?

### IV. Bất thường và các khoản hỗ trợ:

1. Ông/ông có được thỏa thuận để chọn lựa các phương án bất thường không? (ví dụ thỏa thuận về phương án bất thường bằng tiền, "đạt tối đa", đối nhân...)

2. Ông/ông đã nhận được bất cứ 1 khoản bất thường nào chưa?

3. Thời gian ông/ông nhận bất thường là khi nào?

4. Gia đình ông/ông đã nhận những hình thức trợ cấp nào do bất thường?
21. Ông/bà có cảm thấy hài lòng với giải bồi thường không?
☐ Có ☐ Không

Nếu không hài lòng thì vì sao?

V. Khối phủ và cải thiện cuộc sống
22. Mức sống của gia đình ông/bà thay đổi như thế nào so với trước khi có dự án?
☐ Tốt hơn ☐ Không thay đổi ☐ Khổ khốn hơn

Nếu khó khăn hơn thì gì?

23. Khi bị thu hồi đất thì gia đình có thành viên nào bị mất việc làm không?
☐ Có ☐ Không

24. Gia đình ông/bà có nhận được sự giúp đỡ nào của chính quyền địa phương trong việc ổn định cuộc sống không? (của hỗ trợ dành cho những hộ mất trên 10% diện tích đất nông nghiệp)
☐ Đào tạo nghề mới ☐ Hỗ trợ tìm việc làm mới
☐ Hỗ trợ tín dụng, cho vay vốn SX ☐ Hỗ trợ khác

VI. Khcieu nại và giải quyết khiếu nại
25. Gia đình ông/bà có xác nhận khiếu nại gì không?
☐ Có ☐ Không (Chuyên câu 46)

26. Văn đề khiếu nại của ông/bà đã được giải quyết chưa?
☐ Đã giải quyết ☐ Chưa giải quyết

Thời gian là bao lâu

VII. Đóng góp:
27. Ông/bà có đóng góp gì về việc cải thiện cuộc sống và các đóng góp khác cho việc thực hiện dự án khu vực gia đình mình ở không?
☐ Có ☐ Không

Nếu có thì là:
☐ Tiền ☐ Dất ☐ Khác

28. Ông/ba có thể cho sự kiến ý kiến nhận xét và góp ý gì về Dự án không?

Xin cảm ơn sự hợp tác của Ông/ba

Người được phong văn

Ngày tháng năm 2015

Điều tra viên
Annex 2: Minutes of working with the project communes/wards
CÔNG HÒA XÃ HỘI CHỦ NGHĨA VIỆT NAM
Độc lập - Tự do - Hạnh phúc

BIÊN BAN LÀM VIỆC

Tên dự án: Dự án Phát triển đô thị loại hai, tỉnh Hà Tĩnh
Thời gian họp: ngày .... tháng .... năm ....
Địa chỉ nơi họp: ...

1. Thành phần tham dự: (Danh sách chi tiết dính kèm theo)

1.1. Đại diện Ủy ban nhân dân xã/phường:
- Ông/Bà ...
- Ông/Bà ...

1.2. Đại diện Chủ đầu tư:
- Ông/Bà ...
- Ông/Bà ...

1.3. Đại diện đơn vị Tư vấn:
- Ông/Bà ...
- Ông/Bà ...

1.4. Đại biểu tham dự:
- Ông/Bà ...
- Ông/Bà ...

2. Nội dung làm việc:

2.1. Chủ trì cuộc họp thông báo lý do cuộc họp và giới thiệu thành phần tham dự.

2.2. Đại diện Chủ đầu tư Giới thiệu về các hạng mục, cấu phần của dự án

2.3. Tư vấn trạng thái đối với đại diện UBND phường/xã về phạm vi bị ảnh hưởng và ranh giới tối của Dự án Xây dựng các hạng mục cống trình trước dự án

2.4 UBND xã cung cấp cho tư vấn danh sách các hộ bị ảnh hưởng bởi Dự án

2.5. UBND xã xác nhận tư vấn danh sách hộ bị ảnh hưởng trong dự án (có danh sách kèm theo)
3. Kết luận

Phát biểu về việc kiểm tra chất lượng dự án:

Ngày 21-11-2018, cụm thi đua xã... đã kiểm tra chất lượng dự án... Công việc đã hoàn thành tốt.

Đại diện UBND xã

Đại diện Chủ dự án
CỘNG HÒA XÃ HỘI CHỦ NGHĨA VIỆT NAM
Độc lập - Tự do - Hạnh phúc

BIỂN BẢN LÀM VIỆC

Tên dự án: Dự án Phát triển đô thị logic hai, tỉnh Hà Tĩnh
Thời gian họp: ngày ... tháng ... năm ...
Địa chỉ nơi họp: Xã ... Phường ...

1. Thánh phần tham dự: (Danh sách chữ tiểu định kèm theo)

1.1. Đại diện Ủy ban nhân dân xã phường:
- Ông/Bà ... Phường, Thành Phố ...
- Ông/Bà ... Số... Phường, Thành Phố ...

1.2. Đại diện Chủ dự án:
- Ông/Bà ...
- Ông/Bà ...

1.3. Đại diện đơn vị Tư vấn:
- Ông/Bà ...
- Ông/Bà ...

1.4. Đại biểu tham dự:
- Ông/Bà ...
- Ông/Bà ...

2. Nội dung làm việc:

2.1. Chú trọng cuộc họp thống bao lý do cuộc họp và giới thiệu thành phần tham dự.
2.2. Đại diện Chủ dự án Giới thiệu về các hạng mục, cấu phần của dự án
2.3. Tư vấn trao đổi với đại diện UBND phường/xa về phần vi bị ảnh hưởng và minh giải tỏa của Dự án xây dựng các hạng mục công trình thuộc dự án
2.4 UBND xã cung cấp cho tư vấn danh sách các hộ bị ảnh hưởng bởi Dự án.
2.5. UBND xã xác nhận tư vấn dự kiến hành khách sai điều tra hiện trạng Kinh tế - xã hội và tài sản bị ảnh hưởng của ... hộ bị ảnh hưởng bởi dự án trên địa bàn xã (cô danh sách kèm theo)
DÀI DIỄN UBND PHƯỚC/XÀ

DÀI DIỄN CHỦ DỰ ÁN

Phan Tiến Dũng
Tên dự án: Dự án Phát triển đô thị hai, tỉnh Hà Tĩnh
Thời gian hợp: ngày .... tháng .... năm .......
Địa chỉ nơi hợp: ........................................
1. Thành phần tham dự: (Danh sách chi tiết đính kèm theo)
1.1. Đại diện Ủy ban nhân dân xã/ phường:
   - Ông/Bà. Nguyễn Văn Hiền................................. Chức vụ Phạm Chủ tịch UBND
   - Ông/Bà. Bùi Văn Đức........................................ Chức vụ Cán bộ đồn điền
1.2. Đại diện Chủ dự án:
   - Ông/Bà.......................................................... Chức vụ
   - Ông/Bà.......................................................... Chức vụ
1.3. Đại diện đơn vị Tư vấn:
   - Ông/Bà.......................................................... Chức vụ
   - Ông/Bà.......................................................... Chức vụ
1.4. Đại biểu tham dự:
   - Ông/Bà .......................................................... Chức vụ
   - Ông/Bà .......................................................... Chức vụ
2. Nội dung làm việc:
2.1. Chu trì cuộc họp thông báo lý do cuộc họp và giới thiệu thành phần tham dự.
2.2. Đại diện Chủ dự án Giới thiệu về các hạng mục, cấu trúc dự án
2.3. Tư vấn trao đổi với đại diện UBND phường/xã về phạm vi bi ảnh hưởng và ranh giới tạo của Dự án Xây dựng các hạng mục công trình thuộc dự án
2.4 UBND xã cung cấp cho tư vấn danh sách các hộ bị ảnh hưởng bởi Dự án
2.5. UBND xã xác nhận tư vấn đất tiền hạn khó tạo điều kiện, huấn luyện, hỗ trợ, tiến hành dịch vụ điện, nước, dịch vụ xã hội, dịch vụ y tế trên địa bàn xã (có danh sách đính kèm theo)

Người đại diện đơn vị dự án: an.s Tips linh
Thành phố Hà Nội, ngày ..........................
3. Kết luận

Người dân dần dần biết và ủng hộ việc triển khai dự án này.
Người dân dần dần đồng tình ủng hộ việc thực hiện dự án và dự án và những mục tiêu khác mà nhận được.
Tên dự án: Dự án Phát triển đô thị loại hai, tỉnh Hà Tĩnh
Thời gian họp: ngày .... tháng .... năm ....
Địa chỉ nơi họp: ...Văn.......

1. Thành phần tham dự: (Danh sách chi tiết đính kèm theo)
1.1. Đại diện Ủy ban nhân dân xã/ phường:
   - Ông/Bà... Lê TICK... THƯỜNG... Chức vụ... Chủ tịch... UBND
   - Ông/Bà... Nguyễn... THƯỜNG... PHÚ... Chức vụ... CBN... xã... thị xã...

1.2. Đại diện Chủ đầu tư:
   - Ông/Bà... Chức vụ...

1.3. Đại diện đơn vị Tư vấn:
   - Ông/Bà... Chức vụ...

1.4. Đại biểu tham dự:
   - Ông/Bà... Chức vụ...

2. Nội dung làm việc:
2.1. Chủ trì cuộc họp thông báo lý do cuộc họp và giới thiệu thành phần tham dự.
2.2. Đại diện Chủ đầu tư Giới thiệu về các hạng mục, cấu phần cụ thể dự án
2.3. Tư vấn trao đổi với đại diện UBND phường/xã về phần việc bị ảnh hưởng và phương án tạo điều kiện
   Dự án Xây dựng các hạng mục công trình thuộc dự án
2.4. UBND xã cung cấp cho tư vấn đánh giá các bộ bị ảnh hưởng bởi Dự án.
2.5. UBND xã xác nhận tư vấn đánh giá sắt định trong Kinh tế - xã hội và tài sản
   bị ảnh hưởng của ......... bộ bị ảnh hưởng bởi dự án trên địa bàn xã (có danh sách kèm theo)

......

......

......

......

......

......
3. Kết luận

[Content written in Vietnamese, but not legible due to handwriting]

[Signatures and seals present]

Dại diện UBDN Phường/Xã
(Ký, ghi họ tên)

Dại diện Chủ Dự án
(Ký, ghi họ tên)
Annex 3: Some pictures of field survey

Picture 1: Some pictures of survey with affected households

Picture 2: Some pictures of resettlement site in Thach Hung commune