

Social Monitoring Report

1st Semiannual Report
January–June 2016

Mongolia: Ulaanbaatar Urban Services and *Ger* Areas Development Investment Program

Prepared by the Municipality of Ulaanbaatar Project Management Office for the Government of Mongolia and the Asian Development Bank.

CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS

(as of 30 August 2016)

Currency unit	–	togrog (MNT)
MNT1.00	=	\$0.000444
\$1.00	=	MNT2,250.00

ABBREVIATIONS

ADB	–	Asian Development Bank
ADF	–	Asian Development Fund
AP	–	affected people
BC	–	business council
CAP	–	community action plan
CPP	–	consultation and participation plan
CDC	–	community development council
CS	–	consulting service
EGM	–	effective gender mainstreaming
FGD	–	focus group discussion
GAP	–	gender action plan
HH	–	household
IEC	–	information education and communication
MUB	–	Municipality of Ulaanbaatar
MSME	–	micro, small, and medium enterprise
PG	–	primary group
PMO	–	project management office
SDC	–	subcenter development council
SDAP	–	social action development plan
SPS	–	Safeguard Policy Statement
USGDIP	–	Ulaanbaatar Urban Services and Ger Areas Development Investment Program

NOTE

In this report, “\$” refers to US dollars.

This social monitoring report is a document of the borrower. The views expressed herein do not necessarily represent those of ADB's Board of Directors, Management, or staff, and may be preliminary in nature.

In preparing any country program or strategy, financing any project, or by making any designation of or reference to a particular territory or geographic area in this document, the Asian Development Bank does not intend to make any judgments as to the legal or other status of any territory or area.

Semi-Annual Social Safeguards Monitoring Report

Project No. 45007
Period Covering January to June 2016
August 2016

Mongolia: Ulaanbaatar Urban Services and Ger
Areas Development Investment Program

This social monitoring report is a document of the borrower. The views expressed herein do not necessarily represent those of ADB's Board of Directors, Management, or staff, and may be preliminary in nature.

Table of Content

Table of Content.....	i
Abbreviations	ii
1 Background of the Report and Project Description.....	3
2 Social Safeguard Activities during the Period.....	4
I. Resettlement	4
i Compensation to land and properties	5
3 Project disclosure, public participation and consultation	5
I. Implementation of Social Action Development Plan (SADP).....	5
II. Implementation of Gender Action Plan (GAP).....	7
4 Grievance Redress Mechanisms	9
5 Monitoring Results – Findings and Recommendation	10
6 Annexes.....	12
Annex 1: Social Action Development Plan (SADP)	12
Annex 2: Gender Action Plan (GAP)	22
Annex 3: Detail of Public Consultation.....	26

Tables

Table 1: Resettlement impacts based on preliminary design.....	4
Table 2: Detail of the available Kindergartens in two sub-centers	7
Table 3: Detail of the available business enterprises in two sub-centers.....	7

Abbreviations

ADB	Asian Development Bank
ADF	Asian Development Fund
AP	Affected people
BC	Business Council
CAP	Community Action Plan
CPP	Consultation and Participation Plan
CDC	Community Development Council
CS	Consultant services
EGM	Effective Gender Mainstreaming
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
GAP	Gender Action Plan
HH	Household
IEC	Information Education and Communication
MUB	Municipality of Ulaanbaatar
MSME	Micro, Small and Medium Enterprise
PG	Primary Group
PMO	Project management office
SDC	Sub-Center Development Council
SADP	Social Action Development Plan
SPS	Safeguard Policy Statement
USGDIP	Ulaanbaatar Urban Services and Ger Areas Development Investment Program

Social Safeguards Monitoring Report

1 Background of the Report and Project Description

1. Ulaanbaatar peri-urban area (ger areas) are characterized by unplanned settlement of low- and medium-income households with unserviced plots, inadequate and mostly unpaved road networks, and a severe lack of social and economic facilities and basic infrastructure and services for water, sewerage, and heating. Poor sanitation—households almost exclusively rely on open pit latrines—and poor waste collections have created highly unsanitary living conditions. Air pollution is among the most severe in the world, particularly during winter because of inadequate household heating systems and unpaved roads. The ger area population is estimated at 800,000, representing 60% of Ulaanbaatar or 30% of the country population. Despite their size, ger areas have until recently been considered temporary settlements.
2. The multi tranche financing facility (MFF) program will support the Ulaanbaatar city master plan in upgrading priority service and economic hubs (sub-centers) in ger areas. The program implementation time will be up to 9 years and will comprise three tranches. The program is geographically targeted with multisector interventions. It proposes an integrated solution to respond to the urgent demand for basic urban services and establish a network of well-developed urban sub-centers providing economic opportunities, housing, and urban services as catalysts for growth in the ger areas.
3. The impact of the program is improved living conditions in Ulaanbaatar. Its outcome is a network of livable, competitive, and inclusive sub-centers in Ulaanbaatar's ger areas providing economic opportunities and urban services, leading to a healthier urban environment. The program is divided into three projects and has four outputs: (i) roads and urban services are expanded within the targeted sub-centers and connectivity between sub-centers is improved; (ii) economic and public services in sub-centers are improved; (iii) service providers become more efficient; and (iv) institutions and capacity for urban development, program management, and service delivery are strengthened.
4. The main proposed components for Tranche-1 are
 - i. construction of sewerage network extension of 6.1 kilometers (km) collector main, sewerage pumping station along with 2.09 km of sewer pipe extension;
 - ii. within the sub-centers, 15 km of priority roads, 18.6 km of water supply, 20 km of sewerage, 21 km of district heating network pipes, and 5 heating facilities;
 - iii. social and economic facilities, including two kindergartens, green areas and small squares, and two business incubators associated with two vocational training centers;
 - iv. multi-interventions in the Ulaanbaatar Water Supply and Sewerage Authority to improve its operations and service delivery efficiency; and
 - v. institutional strengthening and capacity development to prepare detailed design and construction supervision, support community participation and small and medium enterprise development, improve urban planning and sub-center development, strengthen the capacity of the PMO, and support service providers' reforms.

2 Social Safeguard Activities during the Period

I. Resettlement

5. Tranche – 1 of the Project is categorized ‘A’ for resettlement. Resettlement plan for Tranche -1 has to be prepared according to ADB’s Safeguard Policy Statement (2009) and prevailing government policies. The guidance given in the Resettlement framework could also be used for the preparation of Resettlement Plan.
6. In order to identify the social impact, the detail design should be finalized by the CS1 Consultants. The final layout plan for the sub components of the project will identify the actual numbers of APs and losses caused to land and properties. However the information available with preliminary design has been used to identify the tentative resettlement impacts to initiate consultation process and also to form groups/committees described in the SADP and CAP. The tentative resettlement impacts are listed in table 1.

Table 1: Resettlement impacts based on preliminary design

Impact	Sub center	
	Selbe	Bayankhoshuu
Affected Household	419	567
Female headed HH	91	121
Poor HH	170	260
Elder HH	44	67
Vulnerable HH	19	24
HH with disabled family member	52	71
Affected structure		
Fully	173	164
Partially	247	120
Affected		
Parcels-Plots	274	357
Organizations/entities	6	12
Affected facilities		
Gers	166	161
Houses	305	476
Kiosks	4	12
Note: Vulnerable HH= HH has 4 or more children aged under 16 and HH head is educated lower than completed secondary + HH has members disabled/need constant care and has no income except pension/allowance +FHH with 4 or more children aged under 16.		
(Source: Preliminary design / Final Survey report on Socio-economic status of persons/entities to be affected by LAR in the Selbe and Bayankhoshuu sub-centers, 2016)		

7. The identification of the Affected People has not been finalized due to delay in detail design. The Socio-economy Survey conducted in 2016 is based on the preliminary design. Therefore the Resettlement impacts need to be reviewed in line with the detail design to update the Resettlement Plan.
8. Drawings for water reservoir which has planned to construct outside of the project area received on the 16th August, 2016. Clarification is needed from ADB whether to prepare separate RPs for two water reservoir.

i Compensation to land and properties

9. Compensation process has not been commenced. The decision on land value is pending and Waiting for MUB decision on the baseline value for compensation per square meter of land.
10. Inventory of losses need to be prepared

3 Project disclosure, public participation and consultation

11. In addition to the resettlement impacts, the social activities related to project implementation has carried out during the first half of year 2016. The main activities carried out under Social Action Development Plan (SADP) and Gender Action Plan (GAP) are elaborated below. The implementation of SADP and GAP has been started during the project preparation phase.

I. Implementation of Social Action Development Plan (SADP)

12. The Social Action Development Plan (SADP) mainly focused on a) Project Preparation Phase, b) Detailed Design Phase and c) Implementation/Construction Phase. Series of activities and targets and indicators have been set in the SADP for achieving the desired project benefits to the community. UN-HABITAT (CS3 Consultants) has been assigned to provide the consultancy services on Community Engagement and SME Development and to implement the SADP for the project.
13. During the Project Preparation Phase, the Community Engagement Consultants conducted series of consultative meetings and information campaign at the kheseq level on (i) project objectives and investments, and (ii) redevelopment options and preferences. Up to end of June 2016, 41 of community consultation meetings were conducted with 51.8% women participation to ensure outreach of inform on project objectives and redevelopment options and preferences.
14. Consultants together with UN Habitat (CS3) and Egis (CS2) organized FGDs among vulnerable groups in project implementing areas during the Detailed Design Phase. The women participated in the FGD prioritized the needs in road and pavement design and are listed below;
 - i. Installation of traffic lights in pedestrian crossings and they must maintain well
 - ii. Construction of Overhead bridge and underground crossing
 - iii. Establishment of pavement and pedestrian crossing for a person with disabilities
 - iv. Introducing Sidewalks for wheelchair users
 - v. Installation of speed breakers/bumps on road
 - vi. Installation of road signs
 - vii. Build quality road with adequate width
 - viii. Accessible parking spaces shall be designated for persons with disabilities
 - ix. Provision of underground parking in all buildings
15. The views obtained from the vulnerable women were shared with the design consultants to incorporate into the design. The detail of the consultation with the community is attached annex 3

16. During the PPTA in Bayankhoshuu sub-center, a total of 94 Primary Groups(PG) (composed of 10-20 families as members) were organized with elected leader and secretary. These officers represent the PG to the khoroo level Community Development Council (CDC). Bayankhoshuu has 5 khoroo CDCs with elected officers. These 5 khoroo level CDCs was supposed to constitute the Sub-center CDC under the project. The khoroo CDCs were considered interim CDCs as of PPTA period because they were still in the process of getting to know more each other. In the Selbe Sub-center, there were 57 PGs with officers and formed into 2 khoroo level CDC- I in Chingeltei District and 1 in Sukhbaatar District, since the Selbe sub-center covers these 2 districts.
17. Up to the monitoring reporting period, 7 Khoroo level CDCs (5 in Bayankhoshuu, 2 in Selbe) have been activated under the UN-Habitat's CS. 44 primary groups (27 in Selbe and 17 in Bayankhoshuu) are re-activated and restructured as per the revised boundaries of the sub-centers and revised road alignments. UN-Habitat team is being careful in re-activating the rest part of Primary Groups in order to avoid any misunderstanding and discouragement from community side as those are in the areas where the project will not provide much improvement. Saving groups will be formed under the Primary Groups with the intention to create community funds for individual connections to the infrastructure to be provided under the project. Therefore this activity is planned to be started when the final infrastructure design is ready. However during the monitoring period, workshops for forming Saving Groups have been launched in Sub-center areas.
18. CS3 consultants is waiting for the final detailed design from CS1 consultant to organize consultations with project area community to disclose the final detailed engineering interventions for beneficiaries confirmation including women, elderly, differently-abled persons, and affected persons/families. However due to the communities demand, information of preliminary designs of infrastructures is being provided to the people in every meeting with the communities. There were 8 meetings organized with affected households due to preliminary designs of the roads and infrastructure, out of which 4 are documented.
19. It is also noted that comprehensive Information Education and Communication (IEC) campaign on the final redevelopment schemes, land valuation, engineering designs, resettlement plan, etc. has not fully organized because the CS3 consultants waiting for final design. However, with the available information as per preliminary design, IEC materials were published and campaigns started and moving slowly.
20. IEC program for (i) basic hygiene practices, (ii) water conservation, (iii) community involvement on the ger redevelopment, and (iv) SME development program has started and progress is bit slowly in line with the project progress. Monthly update newsletter designed, published and disseminated to respective target groups regularly.
21. Training need assessment already started to facilitate and support implementation of SME development plan. As per the banks definition, the dominant business runners in the 2 sub-centers are considered to be micro business runners. Therefore UN-Habitat has conducted 3 inventories to identify a) micro business owners with their needs of training, b) Micro and SME runners who want to get bank loan for their business improvement, and c) Micro and SME who want to get involved in the project through supplying of their products. There are 127 micro-business runners in Bayankhoshuu, 103 Business runners including Micro businesses in Selbe, 131

MSME in Bayankhoshuu and 103 MSME in Selbe want to get the bank loan. The first 40 business runners' information was submitted to Khas Bank for loan eligibility checking. These 40 business runners received primary training from Khas bank. In addition to this, 2 women business owners have linked with Asia Foundation Female entrepreneurs' project.

22. A study was conducted to obtain the number of kindergartens in the sub-centers and found that the available numbers of kindergarten in the sub-centers are not able to cater the demand of the available number of children. The study also highlighted that the available kindergartens are loaded with double the number of children population. The details are in table 2. Therefore the proposed kindergartens should be strengthened to cater the community requirement.

Table 2: Detail of the available Kindergartens in two sub-centers

	Bayankhoshuu	Selbe
Number of kindergartens	11	7
Number of children	2510	1154
Capacity of the Kindergartens	1590	610
Children not enrolled to Kindergartens	1793	747

23. A study also conducted to identify the technical or vocational centers in the sub-centers and found that no technical / vocational centers for skill enhancement in the two sub-centers. Prior to the establishment of the vocational training centers, a study on possible business opportunities and labor demand has to be conducted to design suitable courses for trainees to tap labor market
24. Table 3 provides information on available business enterprises in the sub-center areas. It is expected that The proposed business incubators going to serve a hub for promoting employment opportunities to the public including women.

Table 3: Detail of the available business enterprises in two sub-centers

	Bayankhoshuu	Ger	Selbe	Ger
Registered enterprises	1579	1579	1770	1753
No. of active enterprises	598	598	624	618
No. of employee	2432		2640	

25. Due to the delay in detail design if the project interventions for Tranche-1 significantly affect the public consultation process. The consultants responsible for public consultation encounter community pressure at site due to lack of technical information and project affected parameter. Thus cause public lethargic towards community participation and active engagement.
26. Documentation of all level consultation meetings are on tract and available with CS3 consultants. The progress of the SADP is attached in annex 1 for reference.

II. Implementation of Gender Action Plan (GAP)

27. As per ADB gender classification this project (investment program) has classified as Effective Gender Mainstreaming (EGM). Effective Gender Mainstreaming requires Gender Action Plan (GAP) and the GAP describes proposed measures to be included in the project design and implementation in promoting gender equality and in

mainstreaming gender in main outputs of the project. The main output of the project is as follow;

- i. Output 1: Roads and urban services are expanded within the targeted sub-centers and connectivity between sub-centers is improved
 - ii. Output 2: Economic and public services are improved
 - iii. Output 3: Service providers become more efficient
 - iv. Output 4: Institutional capacity building
28. The Gender Action Plan (GAP) prepared for this Tranche 1 is attached in annex 2. The key gender related activities based on the GAP are ensuring the participation of women in community decision making and integrate the gender specific needs in project design and project implementation.
29. The public consultation initiated to obtain the view about gender inclusive design feature with especial focus on vulnerable women. The community needs were prioritized during the consultation and given to the design engineers. The women participated in the consultation mainly raised concerns on road design to ensure road safety and proposed following features to be included in design;
- i. Installation of traffic lights in pedestrian crossings and they must maintain well
 - ii. Construction of Overhead bridge and underground crossing
 - iii. Establishment of pavement and pedestrian crossing for a person with disabilities
 - iv. Introducing Sidewalks for wheelchair users
 - v. Installation of speed decelerator/bumps on road
 - vi. Installation of road signs
 - vii. Build quality road with adequate width
 - viii. Accessible parking spaces shall be designated for persons with disabilities
 - ix. Provision of underground parking in all buildings
30. They also highlighted the need for safe drinking water as wells as heating facilities. Number of women participation and contribution is remarkable and well beyond the set target. 64% of the women participated in the consultations and contributed their views.
31. The women highlighted the need of the kindergartens and said the available kindergartens in the sub-center are not catering the present demand. Table 2 describes the situation in the sub-centers. Under Tranche 1 one kindergartens have been proposed each sub-centers in the designs to meet at least 30% of the demand in the sub-centers For enhance the skills of the women in promoting business income, one Vocational Training Centers have also been proposed for each sub-centers. A study showed that currently there is no any such institution in the sub-centers of Bayankhoshuu and Selbe to meet women demand. The intention of the Vocation Training Centers is to include at least 50% of women for skill enhancement.
32. Activities related to Output 3: Service providers become more efficient, has not been started due to delay in detail design.
33. Institutional Capacity Building is moving on track and the re-activation of primary groups and gender mainstreaming training are well in progress. So far 7 Khoroo CDCs have been re-activated and functioning with the female members' participation of 58%. 2 Business Councils have been formed with 77% of active female participation. With the immense involvement of women participation CAP SME

Action Plan prepared in collaboration with CDCs, BCs and updated during the monitoring period.

34. Women participation in Primary Groups activities are well ahead of the target. 53% of women participation recorded in 44 primary groups and 58% in Khoroo level CDCs.

4 Grievance Redress Mechanisms

35. The project has no project specific Grievance handling mechanism. The Project adopts to the formal mechanism prevails in the MUB. The prevailing mechanism is handling all the public grievances in MUB area in addition to the project related grievances. The available mechanism takes rather long time to resolve project related issues due to procedures. There is no avenue to make complaints at the project site. The CDC level grievance handling mechanism is not effective, because the CDC again takes the complaint to PMO or MUB for further action.

5 Monitoring Results – Findings and Recommendation

- i. Social monitoring for Tranche-1 is based on preliminary design and the implementation of the Resettlement Plan is relying on detail design. The detail of the Affected Persons obtained up to now is based on the preliminary design.
Recommendation The Resettlement Plan for each sub project should be prepared or updated as per the final detail design.
- ii. Identified that the consultation process at this stage encountered issues related to information on final layout plan. Consequently, it has become a challenge to respond to the concerns raised by the Affected People.
Recommendation The consultant should arrange the meeting with adequate hands-on information to avoid issues with Affected People.
- iii. Women participation in the project related meetings and FGD is significant and contributing equal to men.
Recommendation Continue current tendency and ensure women participation towards the end of the project to achieve the set targets in Gender Action Plan (GAP) in annex 2. To ensure equal employment opportunities for men and women tender condition have to be incorporated in the contract agreement of the contractor for emphasis on employment for women with equal pay.
- iv. The available GRM practice is very formal and constitute with legal affiliation. Therefore, access to the GRM system is not possible to all Aggrieved Parties/Affected Persons. Grievance handling process under this context needs adequate awareness.
Recommendation The formation of GRM within the project ensures unconstrained access for APs who wish to resolve their project-related grievances through amicable settlements, outside formal legal processes which are costly, time consuming and from the APs' point of view, unfamiliar and frightening.
- v. The state value of the affected land lots identified during the preliminary are lower than the market value and the value determined by state is not accepted by the affected land owners.
- vi. **Recommendation** Payment of compensation should be based on replacement cost including land and properties value.
- vii. The available numbers of kindergarten in the sub-centers are not able to cater the demand of the available number of children.
Recommendation The capacity of the proposed kindergartens (one in each sub-center) could be increased to meet at least 50% of the demand.
- viii. No Vocational Training Centers available in the Sub- Centers
Recommendation The proposed two centers should enhance the capacity of catering the labor demands.

- ix. The MUB has the opinion that the Business Incubators is not a priority need at the moment to serve the people in the ger area, but the kindergartens will serve as a primary need to cater the demand of the children in the sub-centers.

Recommendation The concern of the MUB should be taken in to account for the establishment of Business Incubators in each sub-center.

- x. Monitoring the community meetings and maintaining meeting database with the help of CS3 consultants is weak. The PMO and the CS2 consultants always rely on CS3 consultants for meeting data.

Recommendation PMO and the CS2 consultants should closely monitor the community meeting and separate data should be established including sex disaggregated attendance to monitor GAP.

- xi. One man month of the National Gender and Safeguard Specialist is remaining to cover entire project activities. The remaining one man month is not adequate to oversee the social and gender monitoring stuff during the implementation phase.

Recommendation The man month of the National Gender and Safeguard Specialist should be increased as per requirement to monitor the gender and safeguard aspect for the remaining period of the project on intermittent basis.

6 Annexes

Annex 1: Social Action Development Plan (SADP)

Implementation Matrix for Social Action Development Plan (SADP) Tranche-1

Table 1: Detailed Design and Implementation Phases of the Project Activity	Target /Indicators	Responsible Entity	Time	Performance from January 2016 to June 2016	Issues
I. Project Preparation Phase					
Conduct series of consultative meetings and information campaign at the <i>kheseq</i> level on (i) project objectives and investments, and (ii) redevelopment options and preferences.	20 meetings conducted organized with primary groups, CDCs and SDCs attended by 50% women	Staff consultant	Q2 2013 to Q1 2014	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 61 (accumulated as of June 2016) community consultation meetings conducted with 51.8% women participation. • The consultation meetings ensured the outreach of inform on project objectives and redevelopment options and preferences. 	Consultation based on preliminary design
	SAP and SDC development plans reflect the needs of the communities and considered in the preliminary design of the physical infrastructures	PMO-MUB		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SAP and SDC Updated • The needs of the public prioritized and shared to design consultations to integrate in to the detail design. 	
	Documentation of meeting minutes	CDCs, <i>kheseq</i> and <i>khoro</i> leaders		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Meeting minutes documented • Meeting minutes were attached in the UN-Habitat Quarterly Report. 	
II. Detailed Design Phase					
Continuing organizational formation and strengthening of primary groups, community	90 primary groups in Bayankhoshuu and 70 in Selbe organized and functioning with by-laws, policies, systems, and plans	Staff consultant PMO-MUB	Q1 2013 to Q4 2014	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Out of existing 94 PG in Bayankhoshuu and 57 PG in Selbe 44 primary groups have been re-activated and functioning now in the sub-centers • In Selbe sub-center, 27 groups were re- 	

Table 1: Detailed Design and Implementation Phases of the Project Activity	Target /Indicators	Responsible Entity	Time	Performance from January 2016 to June 2016	Issues
development councils, SME development councils, and savings groups.				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> activated and functioning with 351 members, • While 17 groups with 307 members are re-activated and functioning in Bayankhoshuu 	
	50% women members for each groups and CDCs	CDCs, kheseg and khoroo leaders		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 53% of women participation recorded in consultations of 44 primary groups. • In Selbe sub-center 172 female members • In Bayankhoshuu 141 Female members 	
	5 khoroo level CDCs and 1 subcenter CDC organized and functioning with by-laws, policies, systems, and plans			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 7 Khoroo level CDCs (2 in Selbe and 5 in Bayankhoshuu) have been re-activated and functioning with 58% female representation. • Capacity building workshops were organized one in each subcenter and for BCs and CDCs respectively. A BC in Selbe is registered as a NGO. Other CDCs are being facilitated by the CS4 and working to get the NGO registration from the state registration authority. 	
	Documentation of organizational strengthening activities and training/OJT modules			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Documentation and meeting minutes are available with UN Habitat Quarterly Report. 	
	Savings groups formed and functioning with policies, systems, and ongoing micro-credit project			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The initial information was given to the communities. As a saving group formation should be based on the willingness and commitment of the community members, CS4 team is waiting for community decision in order to come up with its' next action.. 	There are past bad practices around the saving groups, so it may hinder the process.
Conduct series of consultations on the scope and technical/engineering	15 meetings conducted, attended by 50% women	PMO-MUB, staff consultant	Q1 2014 to Q3 2014	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Preliminary designs of planned infrastructures were introduced and consulted with the communities as part of each meeting. 	Detailed Design not yet finalized by CS 1 Consultants

Table 1: Detailed Design and Implementation Phases of the Project Activity	Target /Indicators	Responsible Entity	Time	Performance from January 2016 to June 2016	Issues
design of proposed water supply, sanitation, sewerage, heating facilities, and affordable apartments.	Final detailed design of proposed projects confirmed by the beneficiaries, women, elderly, differently-abled persons, and affected persons/families.	CDCs, primary groups, kheseq and khoroo leaders			Detail Design not yet finalized by CS 1 Consultants
Conduct consultations with households, businesses, and public institutions affected by the construction/right of way requirements for project 1/tranche 1	24 meetings in both sub-centers attended by all affected stakeholders	PMO-MUB, staff consultant	Q1 2014 to Q3 2014	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 8 meetings with potential affected people according to the preliminary designs of planned infrastructures were held. 	Final list of Affected People have not been identified as per the final lay out of the detailed design.
	Documentation of meeting/consultation minutes	CDCs, <i>kheseq</i> and <i>khoroo</i> leaders		4 meeting minutes are documented and attached to the CS4 QR.	
Comprehensive IEC campaign on the final redevelopment schemes, land valuation, engineering designs, resettlement plan, etc.	Comprehensive IEC plan developed	PMO-MUB, staff consultant	Q4 2013		Detailed design, land valuation and LARP have not been finalized.
	Printed IEC materials distributed (i.e., project leaflets/ brochures on FAQs, posters, etc.)	kheseq and khoroo CDC leaders		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Monthly Project Update Newsletter as a IEC material was published and disseminated to the sub centers through CDCs and Kheseq Leaders in August. 	
	16 IEC campaign meetings in both sub-centers conducted; documentation of meeting minutes			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 58 IEC campaign meeting conducted 	UN Habitat reports revealed that documentation available for the meetings' PMO or CS2 consultants not monitoring the meeting progress
Setting up of grievance or feedback mechanisms in the	System for resolution of grievance/feedback established	PMO-MUB, staff consultant	Q3 2013	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Formal system available at MUB adopted as a GRC for this project. 	No Project specific GRM is available.

Table 1: Detailed Design and Implementation Phases of the Project Activity	Target /Indicators	Responsible Entity	Time	Performance from January 2016 to June 2016	Issues
community	CDCs function as the grievance committee with guidelines on handling grievances	<i>Kheseg</i> and <i>khoro</i> CDC leaders		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2 sub-center subproject created Grievance Action Form through CDC to connect the APs to the formal system 	
Preparation and Finalization of the proposed SME development plan	16 meetings of SDC with CDCs in both sub-centers	PMO-MUB, staff consultant	Q2 2013 to Q1 2014	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Prepared in 2015 	
	Skills survey and demand mapping completed and documented	<i>Kheseg</i> and <i>khoro</i> CDC leaders		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • One Skills Survey and demand mapping report completed. 	The report should justify the need for business incubator and vocational training centers.
	Documentation of meeting minutes			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Available with UN Habitat 	
	50% women members actively participating			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Women's participation is 55.2% 	
Capacity building of the CDCs on how to engage meaningfully in the sub-center redevelopment process	Legal support for the CDC to guide them in their engagement in the SRA	PMO-MUB, staff consultant	starting Q1 2014	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Legal support of CDC guidance is not given so far. 	
	Terms of reference of the CDCs in the SRA well defined and understood by them	<i>Kheseg</i> and <i>khoro</i> CDC leaders		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Prepared 	
	Curriculum/training design for CDC engagement in the SRA			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 3 training designs are prepared. 	
	Documentation of capacity building approach and modules			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 3 documentation are available 	
III. Implementation/Construction Stage					

Table 1: Detailed Design and Implementation Phases of the Project Activity	Target /Indicators	Responsible Entity	Time	Performance from January 2016 to June 2016	Issues
Facilitate consultative meetings for resettlement/relocation	20 meetings in both sub-centers attended by all affected stakeholders	PMO-MUB, staff consultant	Q4 2013 to Q2 2014	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 4 meetings are organized for affected families 	
		CDC leaders			
Facilitate and support implementation of SME development plan	1,000 community members trained so various skills and partnership with SMEs and other institutions developed for employment or contracting for goods and services	PMO-MUB, staff consultant	Q4 2013-Q1 2015	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • As per the banks definition, the dominant business runners in the 2 sub-centers are considered to be micro business runners. Therefore UN-Habitat has conducted 3 inventories to identify a) micro business owners with their needs of training, b) Micro and SME runners who want to get bank loan for their business improvement, and c) Micro and SME who want to get involved in the project through supplying of their products. There are 127 micro-business runners in Byankhoshuu, 103 Business runners including Micro businesses in Selbe, 131 MSME in Bayankhoshuu and 103 MSME in Selbe want to get the bank loan. the first 40 business runners' information was submitted to Khas Bank for loan eligibility checking. These 40 business runners received primary training from Khas bank. In addition to this, 2 women business 	

Table 1: Detailed Design and Implementation Phases of the Project Activity	Target /Indicators	Responsible Entity	Time	Performance from January 2016 to June 2016	Issues
				owners have linked with Asia Foundation Female entrepreneurs project.	
	Trained community members linked with the business incubators for services like work space, business advisory, etc.	<i>Kheseq and khoroo CDC</i> leaders		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2 women business owners are linked Asia Foundation Female entrepreneurs project, • Consultations with City SME development center for possible MSME trainings are ongoing 	
	Documentation of process and results - # of employed, entered into self-employment, recorded increases in income, # of employees generated			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Documentations of meetings are being regularly taken. 	
Conduct community-led monitoring of construction works for quality control	System, tools, and templates developed and used for community-led construction project monitoring	PMO-MUB, staff consultant	Q1- Q2 2014	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Task force established for monitoring of construction work and CDC activity 	Throughout the development work, respective Working Group, Information and Relations Working Group were set up by CDCs
	Trained CDCs with structure on construction project monitoring	<i>Kheseq and khoroo CDC</i> leaders		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Training will start in line with construction start. 	Skill based training is required to monitor the construction progress
Facilitate and support consultations on the implementation of relocation plan from	Number of households provided with transfer assistance to new apartments	PMO-MUB, staff consultant	2015		Detailed design and RP not finalized.

Table 1: Detailed Design and Implementation Phases of the Project Activity	Target /Indicators	Responsible Entity	Time	Performance from January 2016 to June 2016	Issues
temporary housing to new apartments		Kheseg and khoroo CDC leaders			. Detailed design and RP not finalized.
Continuous capacity building for the CDC and primary groups	20 capacity building trainings/workshops and learning exchange conducted in both sub-centers	PMO-MUB, staff consultant	Q1-Q3 2014	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2 capacity building workshops were organized in each of sub-centers for CDCs and primary groups • Small capacity building meetings were organized in the primary groups for their re-activation, re-structuring and review of charters 	
	Training designs of capacity building interventions on Leadership, Team building, Community contracting, participation in the SRA, contracts negotiation, business planning, savings movement, etc.	Kheseg and khoroo CDC leaders		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Leadership, Team Building and savings movement introductory sessions designs are prepared and documented 	
	Registration of the CDCs as NGOs with the State Registration Authority of the Ministry of Justice			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1 BC registered, 2 Khoroo CDCs are under the registration process. 	
Documentation of good practices, lessons learned, feedback, complaints, or grievance issues	Documented good practices, lessons learned and community feedback shared with all stakeholders and reflected in major reports	PMO-MUB	starting Q12014	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • PMO maintain records 	

Table 1: Detailed Design and Implementation Phases of the Project Activity	Target /Indicators	Responsible Entity	Time	Performance from January 2016 to June 2016	Issues
	Complaints and grievance issues documented and resolved	Kheseg and khoroo CDC leaders		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • PMO maintain records 	
IEC program for (i) basic hygiene practices, (ii) water conservation, (iii) community involvement on the ger redevelopment, and (iv) SME development program, etc.	IEC materials developed and disseminated	PMO-MUB	Q3 2014	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Monthly update newsletter designed, published and disseminated 	
		Kheseg and khoroo CDC leaders			
Capacity development activities for CDCs or small neighborhood associations for redeveloped lots on (i) operations and maintenance of new facilities, (ii) estate management, etc.	Curriculum on O&M and estate management developed and implemented	PMO-MUB	Q3-4 2014	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Not yet started 	
	4 trainings on O&M, etc. conducted and documented	Kheseg and khoroo CDC leaders		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Not yet started 	
Conduct series of consultations on the scope and technical/engineering design and implementation arrangements for proposed social and environmental projects (i.e., kindergarten, clinics, bus station, market, khoroo	Consultation plans and minutes documented	PMO-MUB	2015 onwards	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 6 FGD have been organized and documented 	
	Designs reflect the needs of the vulnerable groups	Kheseg and khoroo CDC leaders		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Throughout the focus group interviews, the obstacles, needs and demands have been clarified for women, children, elders and people with disabilities encountered in accessing road, lines, networks and civil facilities to be constructed in sub-centers. Additionally, the concerns on design and construction/development works have been determined with the participatory method. 	

Table 1: Detailed Design and Implementation Phases of the Project Activity	Target /Indicators	Responsible Entity	Time	Performance from January 2016 to June 2016	Issues
building, vocational training centers, public spaces/open parks)				Interview outcome has been presented to engineers of PMO and will be delivered to the construction design company upon the full incorporation of the design	
	Implementation arrangements reflect inputs of the CDCs and community members especially the women and other vulnerable groups			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The challenges of the community members during the construction work especially women and other vulnerable groups were identified during the FGDs and submitted to PMO and Design team for their reflection to the implementation arrangement of respective works 	
Documentation of good practices, feedback, complaints, or grievance issues and lessons learned.	Good practices and lessons learned documented and complaints and grievance issues resolved	PMO-MUB, staff consultant	starting Q3 2014	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Documentation is being done regularly. 	
		CDCs, kheseq and khoroo leaders		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 	
Documentation of schemes/approaches that worked (good practices), feedback, lessons learned,	Documented good practices and lessons learned on the approach shared with all stakeholders	PMO-MUB, staff consultant	starting Q2 2013 to end 2018	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> In total, 11 complaints and grievance issues documented (constructing and expanding-8, quality and safety issues related to the constructing -2, construction reference information and specifications-1). 	

Table 1: Detailed Design and Implementation Phases of the Project Activity	Target /Indicators	Responsible Entity	Time	Performance from January 2016 to June 2016	Issues
complaints, or grievance issues.	Number of complaints and grievance issues documented and resolved	CDCs, kheseq and khoroo leaders		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reported 	
Conduct community-based monitoring and evaluation of new basic infrastructure and services for the community empowerment and SME development.	Community empowerment and SME development component developed and agreed upon by all stakeholders	PMO-MUB, staff consultant	starting Q4 2014 to end 2018	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Task force is established for monitoring 	
	Monitoring reports and final evaluation reports done according to quality standards of ADB and submitted on time	CDCs, kheseq and khoroo leaders	2015	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In progress 	

Annex 2: Gender Action Plan (GAP)

TA 7970 Mongolia: Ulaanbaatar Urban Services and Ger Areas Development Investment Program, Tranche-1

GENDER ACTION PLAN MONITORING MATRIX

Activity	Indicators/Targets	Progress for the period of January 2016 to June 2016	Challenges
Output 1: Roads and urban services are expanded within the targeted sub-centers and connectivity between sub-centers is improved			
1.1 Integrate gender inclusive design measures into road infrastructure to ensure safe and security mobility and access	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 6.15 km in Bayankhoshuu and 8.77 km in Selbe of sidewalks built alongside improved roads 6.15 km in Bayankhoshuu and 8.77 in Selbe of lighting provided on improved roads 	<p>On Track</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Consultants together with UN Habitat and Egis organized 4 FGDs amongst vulnerable groups in project implementing areas. Out of total 65 interviewees in FGDs, 64.6% (n=42) of women. FGDs were conducted 3rd and 10st March, 2016. Committee needs in the detailed design phase of the project have been identified and prioritized through FGDs with vulnerable HH and presented to engineers of PMO. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Obtaining age wise sex disaggregated data on attendance is hard because women participants are reluctant to disclose age.
1.2 Assess impact of improved roads, water, sanitation and heating on population.	<p>4.5 ha and 3.43 ha in Bayankhoshuu and Selbe of landscaping (public spaces) including pedestrian pathways</p> <p>Social indicators included in PPMS such as number of households connected, time and cost savings, health impact, number of nighttime safety incidents,</p>	<p>On Track</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Number of FHH obtained through survey <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Egis consultants together with PMO and UN Habitat (CS3 Consultants) identified the definition of vulnerable households in Ulaanbaatar city context for community based project activities and used it for household mapping at two sub-centers. During the detailed design stage of the project, social safeguard consultant has worked with UN Habitat team to create 	

Activity	Indicators/Targets	Progress for the period of January 2016 to June 2016	Challenges
	(disaggregated by sex, income quintile and female-headed households where possible). Focus group discussions will also be conducted to further assess impact.	<p>database at macro and micro level for two sub-centers based on the existing secondary data and primary data by sex disaggregated (period of 2012-2015).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In 2015, water born disease per 10 000 population at the Ulaanbaatar as following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Dysentery - 17.1 - Viral hepatitis - 3.8 <p>According the hepatitis A, schools and kindergartens are the highest recorded. Over all morbidity, more than half of them were schools and kindergartens disease</p>	
Output 2: Economic and public services are improved			
2.1 One kindergarten facility in each sub-center with 1,800 m ² of floor areas of classrooms, administration and services, and 500 m ² of playground (baseline 0 in 2012)	At least two kindergartens operating by 2018 (number of students served and staff sex disaggregated)	<p>Partially on track Identified the existing</p> <p>a) Number of kindergartens in the sub-centers and b) Number of children served by kindergartens and c) Found the number of children could not access to the facilities is high.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The available numbers of kindergarten in the sub-centers are not able to cater the demand of the available number of children. • At least 50% of the children should be enrolled in the proposed kindergartens.
2.2 One business incubator and vocational training center in each subcenter with 1,800 m ² floor area and 500 m ² of open green area (baseline 0 in 2012)	<p>At least two business incubators and vocational training centers operational by 2018 (number of students and staff served annually, sex disaggregated)</p> <p>At least 20 MSME's, 50% of which are women led graduated from incubation program (baseline 0 in 2012)</p>	<p>Partially on track</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Identified the available Vocational Training Centers in the sub-centers and found nothing in two sub-centers. • At least 50% of the demand should be met with the proposed Vocational Training centers • Existing number of registered enterprises in the sub-centers and Ger areas identified • During the Socio-economic survey 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The proposed two Vocational Training Centers should have enhanced capacity to meet the demands. • A study on possible business opportunities and labor demand has not conducted to design suitable courses for trainees to tap labor market • Sex-disaggregated database on registered enterprises not available. • The SES covered only the Affected HHs.

Activity	Indicators/Targets	Progress for the period of January 2016 to June 2016	Challenges
	At least 1,000 beneficiaries, 50% of whom are women, receiving vocational training (baseline 0 in 2012)	(SES) for the preparation of RP, HH unemployed members' labor demand was identified. Gender analysis included in poverty and social assessment of the project affected household was done under SES. The survey report is available.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The MUB has an opinion that need for the incubators are not a top priority than kindergarten.
Output 3: Service providers become more efficient			
3.1 Report on affordability and subsidies included in tariff assessment (disaggregated by income quintile and if possible looking at female-headed households as a special group)	Report by 2018	Not on track	Yet to Commence
3.2 Customers satisfaction survey	Survey report (providing sex disaggregated data where possible)	Not on track	Yet to Commence
Output 4: Institutional capacity building			
4.1 Establishment of Khoroo CDCs and SDCs with women's representation	Khoroo CDCs and SDCs fully functioning in targeted areas, with at least 40% women participating actively	On Track <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 7 Khoroo CDCs have been re-activated and functioning with the female members participation of 58% (n=74) 2 Business Councils have been formed with 77% (n=38) of active female participation 	
4.2 Establishment and agreement on community, gender and MSME plans	Community, gender, and MSME action plans accepted and regularly updated in each sub-center	On Track <ul style="list-style-type: none"> CAP prepared in collaboration with CDC and updated (1Q, 2016). MSME Action Plans prepared in collaboration with business people and 	

Activity	Indicators/Targets	Progress for the period of January 2016 to June 2016	Challenges
4.3 Targets established for and sex disaggregated data collected on participants for all community consultations on urban planning and project activities (see SAP activities) collected and reported on in the GAP	GAP report with targets and sex disaggregated data provided semi annually	updated (1Q, 2016). On Track • Sex disaggregated data is being collected on participant for all community consultation meetings	
4.4 Sub-centers plan and redevelopment process are prepared and endorsed by all the stakeholders through community consultation including at least 50% of women's participation	Consultation meeting attendance and SAP monitoring	On Track • During the reporting period, 20 consultation meetings on project design have been organized by UN Habitat in two sub-centers. 52% (n=413) women participation was recorded.	
xii. 4.5 Establishment of PMO with 30% gender representation	PMO is fully functioning with trained staff at least 30% women	On Track Project implementation units have recruited 15 officers 7 of whom are females. In addition to 1 female project coordinator and 1 male deputy project coordinator, 7 out of 13 (53%) officers in program implementation unit are females.	

CDC = community development council, GAP = gender action plan, HH=Household, MSME = micro-small- and medium- enterprise, MUB = Municipality of Ulaanbaatar, PMO = program management office, RP=Resettlement Plan, SDC = small and medium enterprise development council.

Annex 3: Detail of Public Consultation

Community Consultation Meetings Held during the Monitoring Period

No.	Type of Meeting	Sub-center		Total
		Bayankhoshuu	Selbe	
1	<i>Khoroo Governor's Office, Number of Meetings with Government Officials</i>			0
	Total number of Participants at the Meeting			0
	Male participants at the Meeting			0
	Female participants at the Meeting			0
2	<i>Meetings Held with CDC Council and Members</i>	1	1	2
	Number of Participants at the Meeting	52	12	64
	Male participants at the Meeting	16	9	25
	Female participants at the Meeting	36	3	39
3	Number of Meetings with Khoroo Residents	9	9	18
	Number of Participants at the Meeting	209	170	379
	Male participants at the Meeting		79	79
	Female participants at the Meeting		91	91
	Percentage of Head of Household Females at the Meeting		10.0%	10.0%
	Percentage of Handicapped Participants at the Meeting		2.4%	2.4%
4	<i>Number of Meetings with Business Runners</i>	2	2	4
	Number of Participants at the Meeting	18	29	47
	Male participants at the Meeting	8	18	26
	Female participants at the Meeting	10	11	21
5	<i>Number of Meetings with Khoroo Youth Number of Participants at the Meeting</i>			0
	Number of Participants at the Meeting			0
	Male participants at the Meeting			0
	Female participants at the Meeting			0
	Percentage of Unemployed Youth at the Meeting			0
	Percentage of Handicapped Participants at the Meeting			0
	Percentage of Participants of Youth with Family			0
Total number of Meetings Held, 2Q of 2016		12	12	24
	Number of Participants at the Meeting	279	211	490
	Male participants at the Meeting	Na	106	
	Female participants at the Meeting	Na	105	

Note: Na-Data is not available