

## TA COMPLETION REPORT

Division: IETC

<b>TA NO./NAME:</b> 1958-MAL: URBAN TRANSPORT PLANNING PROJECT				<b>TA AMOUNT APPROVED:</b> US\$600,000.00	<b>SOURCE:</b> Government of France
				<b>REVISED AMOUNT:</b>	
<b>EXECUTING AGENCIES</b> The Highway Planning Unit (HPU) of the Ministry of Works, Malaysia				<b>TA AMOUNT UNDISB.:</b> US\$58,143.63 *	<b>TA AMOUNT UTILIZED:</b> US\$541,856.37 *
<b>DATE:</b>	<b>APPROVAL:</b> 29 September 1993	<b>SIGNING:</b> 24 January 1994	<b>FIELD:</b> 04 April 1994	<b>CLOSING:</b> ORIGINAL: 31 January 1995	<b>ACTUAL:</b>

### TA DESCRIPTION (Background/Rationale)

Rapid economic development accompanied by increased urbanization and affluence has resulted in a substantial increase in traffic related problems in urban areas. Most notably it has generated traffic congestion, increased parking problems and highlighted the inadequate public transport services in urban centers. Effective transport plans and strategies are required to address the increase in demand and improve the utilization of infrastructure facilities and public transport services. Institutionally, urban transport planning is the responsibility of municipalities but as there is little such expertise at the local level, the Highway Planning Unit (HPU) of the Ministry of Works has historically provided assistance to municipalities outside of Kuala Lumpur. To assist HPU in providing such assistance the Government requested that a practical transport planning manual be prepared to guide planners at the local level and reduce the burden on the HPU.

### TA OBJECTIVES AND SCOPE

The TA had two objectives: i) the development of efficient road network systems, cost effective traffic management and control measures and promotion of efficient and effective public transport and services in the three towns of Johor Bahru, Ipoh and Sungei Petani; and ii) produce a manual that will assist in developing transport planning and traffic management techniques over the long term. The scope of work included collection of field data through traffic surveys, formulation of transport planning models for each town, delineation and testing of various transport policies and strategies to meet future demand, preparation of traffic management action plans for the short and medium terms and preparation of a manual illustrating analytical techniques and methodologies suitable for undertaking transport planning in Malaysia.

### TA INPUTS EVALUATION (Adequacy of Formulation/Terms of Reference/Performance of Consultants/Other Inputs/ Review Missions/Inputs of Recipients)

During formulation, visits were made to each of the towns which contributed to understanding the problems at the local level and preparing appropriate terms of reference. The consultants performed well under difficult circumstances. The foreign consultants provided considerable additional input to make up for deficiencies in the skills of the local consultants who had relatively limited practical experience in transport planning techniques. Due to school vacation at the commencement of the TA, the traffic surveys had to be undertaken in the three towns simultaneously which overburdened the consultants and HPU and contributed to the need to extensively check field data to eliminate errors and omissions. The EA provided good, well furnished office accommodation and a fulltime vehicle and support staff, but were unable to provide sufficient counterpart staff either full or part time. Several experienced counterparts were assigned to the study but left Government service regularly and as a result the EA could not fully benefit from the TA. The lack of a Director at HPU also meant that supervision was not very close. Despite the lack of transport planning skills in HPU, staff were enthusiastic and benefitted from bimonthly technical seminars given by the consultants.

A lack of travel budget constrained the number and effectiveness of Bank Review Missions but discussions held during other Missions (2 meetings were held during reviews of 2 RETAs based in Malaysia) largely made up for the shortcomings. An Inception Mission (2 days) was fielded in addition to a Review Mission (4 days) to attend the 2-day seminar on the study findings, and undertake tripartite meetings with the EA and the Economic Planning Unit.

\* Amounts are subject to change as final billings have yet to be received.

**TA OUTPUTS EVALUATION (Reports Generated/Institution Building/Training/Analysis of Quality and Comparison with Terms of Reference)**

The reports provided by the Consultants were adequate but would have been better if more funds were allocated for report production to allow for maps, schemes and strategies to be presented in color. The Manual is of high technical quality and should prove to be of significant use in developing urban transport planning in the future. The lack of qualified staff skilled in transport planning techniques is a major constraint in HPU and the municipalities. Due to the lack of counterpart staff participation (see above) the HPU and municipalities did not maximize their benefits from the TA. The study results were presented at a seminar attended by over 150 staff from Government, including many of the municipalities from around the country, and was a major success.

**TA OVERALL ASSESSMENT/RATING: (i.e. Generally Successful/Partially Successful/Unsuccessful)**

The TA achieved its major objectives and is rated generally successful.

**MAJOR LESSONS LEARNED (if any)**

The sustained economic growth of Malaysia has generated a very substantial demand for technical expertise in the private sector with the result that many vacancies exist in Government and many of the capable staff leave Government service as soon as their commitment period is over. This, coupled with staff rotation, has resulted in a situation where senior staff are both inexperienced and working in positions without the requisite technical skills. There is a considerable lack of urban transport planning skills in both the public and private sectors in the country and this issue remains to be addressed. The TA has identified the training requirements to develop the necessary skills and has suggested a training strategy for implementation.

**FOLLOW-UP ACTION AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

The Economic Planning Unit regards the development of human resources in transport planning as high priority and recognizes that in the short and medium term foreign and local consultants will continue to be required to assist the Government to formulate plans and assess strategies and policies for the sector. There is scope to develop a possible Urban Transport Planning project based on the results of the TA and this should be followed-up with the Government.

Prepared by: CHARLES M. MELHUISE

Designation:

Sr. Project Economist