

ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK

TAR: STU 32521

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

FOR

EVALUATION STUDIES

IN THE BANK'S

DEVELOPING MEMBER COUNTRIES

February 1999

ABBREVIATIONS

DMC	—	developing member country
IRGPR	—	Interdepartmental Review Group on Poverty Reduction
NGO	—	nongovernment organization
OEO	—	Operations Evaluation Office
RM	—	resident mission
TA	—	technical assistance

NOTE

In this report, "\$" refers to US dollars.

I. INTRODUCTION

1. The 1999-2000 work program of the Operations Evaluation Office (OEO) includes the evaluation of several issues of operational relevance. Detailed studies that will contribute to six of these evaluations will be done under this regional technical assistance (TA).¹ The six evaluations are (i) the impact of Bank assistance for technical and vocational education, (ii) the impact of Bank assistance to key sectors in Nepal, (iii) the study of Bank assistance for poverty reduction, (iv) the role of nongovernment organizations (NGOs) in Bank-assisted projects, (v) the role of resident missions (RMs) in project implementation, and (vi) the country assistance program for Viet Nam. Under the TA, one study will be conducted for each topic.

II. BACKGROUND AND RATIONALE

2. OEO has increasingly focused on thematic evaluations comprising impact evaluations of Bank lending to specific sectors, and special studies of the Bank's processes and operations. This is distinct from the earlier emphasis on performance audit reports of individual projects and results from a recommendation of the Task Force on Improving Project Quality. While the evaluations are based on the results of individual projects, the thematic approach is expected to widen the applicability of findings and to provide strategic direction to future sector work and to country programming exercises. The specific background and rationale for the six thematic evaluations to which this TA will contribute are briefly described in this section. The topics were selected in close consultation with the Bank's operational departments.

3. **Impact Evaluation Study: Bank Assistance for Technical and Vocational Education.** Since 1980, the Bank has approved 24 technical and vocational education projects, accounting for 29 percent of total Bank lending to the education sector during the period. Human resource development—and within this area, technical and vocational education—is expected to occupy an important role in future Bank operations. In view of concerns about the social impact of the present economic and financial crisis in the region, it will be instructive to reevaluate these projects to determine the long-term impact they have had on the developing member countries (DMCs), and what accounts for the differences and/or similarities in their performance. The DMCs proposed for inclusion in the study, of which four will be selected, have either a number of ongoing projects in the subsector or a need for assistance to develop further skills. An impact evaluation in each country and a comparative assessment of the selected DMCs (e.g., by geographic location, socioeconomic status, and share of industry in gross domestic product) will provide useful lessons for the implementation of ongoing projects and improve the design of future projects in the four focal countries and in other DMCs.

4. **Impact Evaluation Study: Bank Assistance to Key Sectors in Nepal.** The overall performance of Bank-financed projects in Nepal compares unfavorably with that of the Bank's other Group A countries and with other South Asian countries. For instance, of the 22 agriculture projects that have been evaluated, nearly half were less than generally successful, and recent reviews of other sectors conclude that the limited success rate can be traced to country-specific factors. The study will identify the past strengths and weaknesses in programming Bank assistance to Nepal with particular reference to the agriculture, rural development, and social sectors. It will identify common factors in the design of the projects and their implementation that had an impact on project performance. These analyses will be used in formulating guiding principles for future sector assistance by the Bank.

¹ The TA first appeared in *ADB Business Opportunities* in November 1998.

5. **Special Evaluation Study: Bank Assistance for Poverty Reduction.** The Bank adopted poverty reduction as one of its strategic development objectives in its first Medium-Term Strategic Framework. Although from 1991 to 1997, the Bank approved 108 projects with poverty reduction as their primary or secondary strategic development objective, an operational strategy for poverty reduction has yet to be developed. To address this need, the Bank established an Interdepartmental Review Group on Poverty Reduction (IRGPR) in October 1997 to prepare a draft working paper. In the course of its work, the IRGPR became aware that the Bank did not have sufficient evaluative data to assess the impact of its poverty reduction measures or how effectively the poverty reduction objectives were incorporated in the project designs. The study aims to fill this information gap by assessing the impact of current Bank operations on poverty reduction, identifying lessons learned, and providing feedback for use by the IRGPR and in future project design.

6. **Special Evaluation Study: Role of NGOs in Bank-Assisted Projects.** The involvement of NGOs in Bank operations is expanding. In April 1998, the Bank updated its policy in a paper titled *Cooperation between the Asian Development Bank and Nongovernment Organizations*. While NGO involvement in Bank operations is growing rapidly, the Bank's experience with NGOs has not been evaluated. Common perceptions about the effectiveness of NGOs are based mainly on the experiences of individual staff and on anecdotal information. The purpose of the study is to review the Bank's collective experience with NGOs; assess progress with integrating NGO experience, knowledge, and expertise in Bank operations; and provide lessons for future cooperation with NGOs.

7. **Special Evaluation Study: Role of Resident Missions in Project Implementation.** Following the President's approval in 1995 of the report of the Interdepartmental Working Group on Resident Missions, more projects have been delegated to the RMs. Currently, the RMs administer 73 projects or about 17 percent of the Bank's projects under administration. A preliminary review indicates that the performance of RMs has been positive, although their potential for contributing to more effective project implementation and full implementation of the business unit concept has yet to be fully realized. The study will evaluate the relevance, effectiveness, and impact of RMs in enhancing the Bank's portfolio development and management, and provide feedback to enhance the Bank's role in delivering development assistance to its DMCs.

8. **Evaluation of the Country Assistance Program for Viet Nam.** From being a project financier, the Bank is evolving into a broad-based development institution that provides integrated packages of investment financing, policy support, and capacity building tailored specifically to each recipient DMC. The study will evaluate the Bank's operational strategies, country assistance programs, loans, and TAs provided to Viet Nam since the resumption of operations in 1993. It will derive lessons and recommendations for use in future operations. Viet Nam is an appropriate country for study, as it is likely to seek intensive development assistance from the Bank in its transition to a market economy, yet evaluation results since resumption are limited, comprising 14 TA completion reports and only one TA performance audit report. The country operational strategy for Viet Nam will be prepared by the Programs Department (West) this year, and this study will provide timely input into the strategy.

III. THE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

A. Objectives

9. The TA will assess the Bank's operations and processes within each of the six themes. It will also provide feedback on best practices and past shortcomings to strengthen Bank operations.

B. Scope

10. The TA will comprise six studies. Each study will entail a review of Bank documents, field visits to the countries concerned, survey of beneficiaries from a sample of Bank projects, and discussions with those involved in project implementation. A brief outline of the specific work of each study is provided in this section.

11. **Impact Evaluation Study: Bank Assistance for Technical and Vocational Education.** The study will make a comparative analysis of project performance among four DMCs at different stages of industrial development, identifying the critical variables that contribute to success or failure. It will also examine the effect of the economic downturn on the DMCs and the resultant need for skills development and retraining. It will cover (i) technology transfer as reflected in the performance of graduates in industry, (ii) curriculum change including introduction of new technologies, (iii) teacher performance and student achievements, and (iv) external efficiency in terms of time between graduation and employment and increased earnings of graduates. The study will recommend how to increase efficiency and effectiveness in matching labor demand and supply in light of the evolving economic and social conditions in the selected DMCs. Trends in industry requirements for female workers and the implication this may have on the design of courses to cater to special needs of female enrollees will be examined. Policy issues will be identified and actions recommended to strengthen the technical and vocational education system. The effectiveness of project design and operational performance will also be examined, as well as institutional, financial, and socioeconomic impacts. The study will employ (i) a tracer study of graduates and a survey of schools, students, teachers, administrators, and industry supervisors and employers; (ii) focus group discussions; (iii) field visits and interviews; and (iv) secondary research. An equal number of similar schools, located in the same areas but not assisted under the projects, will be used as the control group. The four subject DMCs will be selected from Indonesia, Malaysia, Pakistan, Papua New Guinea, and Sri Lanka.

12. **Impact Evaluation Study: Bank Assistance to Key Sectors in Nepal.** The study will review clusters of Bank-supported projects, programs, and TAs relevant to ongoing projects, focusing on the agriculture and rural development sectors as well as on social sector initiatives. The study will be supported by international and domestic consultant inputs. The activities will (i) assess how key sector projects and TAs in Nepal are identified and designed within the Bank; discern the appropriateness and effectiveness of the resources applied during the implementation phase; and clarify the roles of the Bank, the Government, and beneficiaries in project design and implementation; (ii) assess the effect of national and sector policies and external factors on project performance; and (iii) identify common strengths and weaknesses within project design and implementation, and develop guiding principles on how future sector assistance by the Bank may be improved.

13. **Special Evaluation Study: Bank Assistance for Poverty Reduction.** The scope of the evaluation includes (i) development of criteria for measuring project impacts on poverty reduction, based on a review of project documents and relevant literature of agencies such as the World Bank; (ii) review of country-specific information on poverty in selected country programming documents, and analysis of how this information was used to develop poverty reduction strategies or was incorporated in project designs; (iii) analysis of the documents of selected projects to assess whether adequate provisions were made for poverty reduction; (iv) field surveys and evaluation of the effects and impacts of these projects; and (v) drawing of lessons from this experience. The study will cover a selection of the 108 approved projects with poverty reduction as the primary or secondary strategic development objective. Missions are expected to visit at least six DMCs.

14. **Special Evaluation Study: Role of Nongovernment Organizations in Bank-Assisted Projects.** The study will (i) assess the effectiveness of NGOs in the roles assigned to them; (ii) assess the impacts of NGO cooperation on development; (iii) identify best practices concerning cooperation with NGOs; (iv) derive lessons to maximize benefits from future Bank cooperation with NGOs; (v) recommend practical steps, including the establishment of performance indicators, to monitor the effectiveness and impacts of NGO involvement in Bank activities; and (vi) update the Office of Environment and Social Development's information base related to NGO involvement in the Bank's operations. The study will review Bank-NGO cooperation in 6-7 countries, selected from Bangladesh, Cambodia, Indonesia, Nepal, Pakistan, Papua New Guinea, Philippines, Sri Lanka, and Viet Nam.

15. **Special Evaluation Study: Role of Resident Missions in Project Implementation.** The study will (i) review and assess the relevance and appropriateness of RMs in enhancing the Bank's development effectiveness in its DMCs; (ii) review and assess the role and impact of RMs on project administration; (iii) assess and evaluate the efficiency of the RMs' role in project administration vis-a-vis headquarters' performance; (iv) assess and evaluate the RMs' role in coordination, particularly with government agencies, executing agencies, other aid agencies, and local development agencies and NGOs; (v) assess and determine the RMs' role in providing early warning on emerging national and economic crises and development issues; (vi) assess and determine the effectiveness of RMs at implementing the business unit concept to improve the Bank's delivery of development assistance to its DMCs; and (vii) recommend how to evaluate the role of RMs in improving the Bank's development effectiveness. An important element to be assessed is the adequacy and effectiveness of the feedback mechanisms and lessons learned in improving the Bank's project processing, implementation, country programming, and policy formulation in each DMC.

16. **Evaluation of the Country Assistance Program for Viet Nam.** The study will focus on current issues since the Bank's resumption of assistance to Viet Nam. It will comprise (i) a review of Viet Nam's macroeconomic environment and development plans, the contributions to development of various aid agencies since 1993, and the Bank's diagnosis of the country's development needs and problems; (ii) an assessment of the Bank's assistance strategies for Viet Nam since 1993; (iii) an evaluation of the Bank's operations (both lending and nonlending) and determination of the efficiency and efficacy of its operational programs; and (iv) identification of new opportunities, responsibilities, issues, and lessons learned for future consideration.

C. Cost Estimates and Financing Plan

17. The total cost of the TA is expected to be \$1,000,000 equivalent. The TA will be financed by the Bank on a grant basis from the Bank-funded TA program. Cost estimates are in Appendix 1.

D. Implementation Arrangements

18. OEO will implement the TA. Six OEO staff will independently carry out the six studies with the assistance of international and domestic consultants. A total of 22 person-months of international consultants and about 64.5 person-months of domestic consultants will be required. Their areas of expertise and summary terms of reference, along with frameworks for the six TA components, are included in Appendixes 2-7. Consultants will be engaged in accordance with the Bank's *Guidelines on the Use of Consultants* and other arrangements satisfactory to the Bank on the engagement of domestic consultants. Given the independent nature of the six studies, the selection of individual consultants is considered appropriate. The TA will commence in mid-February 1999 and is expected to be completed by the end of 1999.

IV. THE PRESIDENT'S DECISION

19. The President, acting under the authority delegated by the Board, has approved the provision of technical assistance, on a grant basis, in an amount not exceeding the equivalent of \$1,000,000 for the purpose of Evaluation Studies in the Bank's Developing Member Countries, and hereby reports such action to the Board.

APPENDIXES

Number	Title	Page	Cited on (page, para.)
1	Cost Estimates	7	5,17
2	Bank Assistance for Technical and Vocational Education	8	5,18
3	Bank Assistance to Key Sectors in Nepal	11	5,18
4	Bank Assistance for Poverty Reduction	13	5,18
5	Role of Nongovernment Organizations in Bank-Assisted Projects	16	5,18
6	Role of Resident Missions in Project Implementation	19	5,18
7	Evaluation of the Country Assistance Program for Viet Nam	22	5,18

COST ESTIMATES
(\$)

Item	Foreign Exchange	Local Currency	Total Cost
1. Consultants			
a. Remuneration and Per Diem			
i. International Consultants	449,840	—	449,840
ii. Domestic Consultants	—	257,250	257,250
b. International and Local Travel	92,150	23,700	115,850
2. Reports, Communications, and Surveys	31,500	69,000	100,500
3. Workshops	—	2,000	2,000
4. Contingencies	52,570	21,990	74,560
Total	626,060	373,940	1,000,000

— = magnitude zero.

Source: Staff estimates.

BANK ASSISTANCE FOR TECHNICAL AND VOCATIONAL EDUCATION

A. Summary Terms of Reference

1. An international consultant (6 person-months) and four domestic consultants (one per developing member country, each for 3.25 person-months) will be required. The international consultant, under the guidance of the Operations Evaluation Office staff concerned, will have the following responsibilities: (i) drawing up the analysis plan according to the objectives of the study and design the questionnaires, survey instruments, and secondary research format; (ii) managing the domestic consultants and their survey teams, including remuneration, data encoding, and processing; (iii) supervising and coordinating the work of the survey teams in the processing, analysis, and assessment of primary and secondary data, and verifying their accuracy; (iv) conducting focus group discussions at the policy formulation level, visiting a sample of representative schools; and (v) monitoring tracer study activities. The consultant will also consolidate the data on each country into a single report that will describe overall conclusions and recommendations for future action by the Bank and the governments.

2. The international consultant will be assisted by domestic consultants. Each domestic consultant will organize a survey team to gather primary and secondary data. Each team will be supported by a local research institution conversant in industrial human resource research and educational planning. Data will be compiled, processed, and analyzed using a computerized statistical data analysis and graphics program, i.e., Statistical Package for the Social Sciences. Results will be included in a country report to be presented in a national workshop that the domestic consultants will organize to disseminate information and elicit feedback. The domestic consultants will assist in the design of the survey instruments, pre-test the questionnaires, implement the survey, analyze the data, and write the country report. Additionally, they will facilitate interaction with governments and executing agencies, gather local documents on the subject, and provide assistance to the international consultant.

B. Framework

3. The framework for the study is provided in the following matrix.

FRAMEWORK

Impact Evaluation Study of Bank Assistance for Technical and Vocational Education

Design Summary	Performance Indicators/Targets	Project Monitoring Mechanisms	Risks and Assumptions
1. Goal <ul style="list-style-type: none"> To enhance the Bank's contribution to social development in four developing member countries (DMCs) to be chosen from among Indonesia, Malaysia, Pakistan, Papua New Guinea, and Sri Lanka 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Improved effectiveness and sustainability of Bank-financed technical and vocational education projects 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Bank documents (report and recommendations of the President, project/program completion reports, project/program performance audit reports, sector paper, sector synthesis) Official statistics and reports from sector-related government agencies, as well as other aid agencies such as the World Bank 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Commitment of Bank and government decision makers to apply results of the study Validity of recommendations
2. Purpose and Objectives <ul style="list-style-type: none"> To assess the sustainability and long-term impact of Bank assistance on (i) the quality of technical and vocational education in the selected DMCs, (ii) the supply of qualified technical personnel for industry, and (iii) policy issues that need to be resolved to strengthen the technical and vocational education system To account for the factors contributing to the differences/similarities in the performance of these projects 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Extent of improvement in internal and external efficiencies of project schools Improvement in the supply situation of required personnel for industries Compendium of lessons learned and other useful inputs for the implementation of ongoing projects as well as in the design of future projects in the four focal countries and in other DMCs Enhancement of institutional capabilities of executing agencies and project monitoring units 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Project/program evaluation reports Final report that consolidates the data on each country and presents overall conclusions and recommendations for future action by the Bank and the governments 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Cooperation among the agencies involved Quality of outputs from consultants
3. Outputs <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Tracer study Country impact evaluation reports Comparative assessment of DMCs Consolidated report presenting the overall conclusions and recommendations for future action by the Bank and DMC governments 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Extent to which the required sample size and valid responses are attained Submission as scheduled of comprehensive, coherent, and analytical country report Review of similarities and/or differences in their performance National workshops to discuss findings of individual country reports and to elicit feedback Submission as scheduled of a comprehensive, coherent, and analytical consolidation report of the four country reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Survey results and final report Country reports Consultants' final report incorporating country data and presenting overall conclusions and recommendations 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reliability and accuracy of survey results Cooperation among the agencies concerned Coordination between international consultant and domestic consultants Capability of consultants to produce quality reports

Design Summary	Performance Indicators/Targets	Project Monitoring Mechanisms	Risks and Assumptions
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> National workshops 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Attendance and active participation of desired participants during the workshops 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> National workshop proceedings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Active support of government agencies in national workshops
<p>4. Activities</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Review the current status of technical and vocational education training in the four DMCs Assess the institutional development impact on the executing and implementing agencies Identify lessons that could serve as useful inputs for the implementation of ongoing projects, and in the design of future projects in the four DMCs as well as in other DMCs Plan and conduct a national workshop in each of the four DMCs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Consultant services comprising one international consultant (6 person-months) and one domestic consultant (3.25 person-months) in each of the four DMCs Bank financing of around \$190,000 to cover the cost of consultant services, survey, and national workshops 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Tracer study Country reports and workshop proceedings Consolidated report Back-to-office reports of technical assistance inception and review missions 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Careful selection of consultants and effective coordination of their assignments

BANK ASSISTANCE TO KEY SECTORS IN NEPAL

A. Summary Terms of Reference

1. The study will be completed by an international consultant, a domestic consultant-research analyst at headquarters, and a domestic consultant from Nepal. The international consultant, under the guidance of the Operations Evaluation Office staff concerned, will (i) review relevant Bank documents; (ii) identify factors leading to deficiencies in projects in Nepal; (iii) hold discussions with government officials and executing agencies, nongovernment organizations, and beneficiaries; (iv) examine the scope of involvement of the private sector in projects in Nepal; and (v) prepare a comprehensive final report containing findings and recommendations, and actions for improvement of design and performance of projects in key sectors.

2. The research analyst will assist the international consultant in the (i) review of relevant Bank documents; (ii) examination of the project preparation and design process; (iii) examination of how loan covenants and policy conditionalities are treated during project processing; (iv) review recruitment procedures for consultants, arrangements made for operation and maintenance, procurement and sustainability of project facilities; and (v) preparation of a country profile based on overall findings and recommendations.

3. The domestic consultant will (i) review relevant Bank documents, (ii) collect data and hold discussions with Government personnel and executing agencies, (iii) identify shortcomings and successes in the Bank's projects in Nepal, and (iv) prepare a comprehensive country profile based on findings and formulate realistic and implementable recommendations.

B. Framework

4. The framework for the study is provided in the following matrix.

FRAMEWORK

Impact Evaluation Study of Bank Assistance to Key Sectors in Nepal

Design Summary	Performance Indicators/Targets	Project Monitoring Mechanisms	Risks and Assumptions
1. Goal <ul style="list-style-type: none"> To improve performance of the Bank portfolio in Nepal 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Increase in number of loans rated generally successful at project/program completion reports (PCRs) and project/program performance audit reports (PPARs) Reduction in time overrun and implementation problems 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Project review missions PCR and PPAR missions 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Stakeholder commitment to make suitable adjustments to identification, preparation, and implementation processes
2. Purpose and Objective <ul style="list-style-type: none"> To identify past strengths and weaknesses of Bank assistance to Nepal with particular reference to agriculture, rural development, and social sectors 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Attainment of project objectives, cost-effectiveness, internal rate of return, institutional improvements 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Appraisal reports, PCRs, PPARs, technical assistance (TA) reports, country operational strategy, country assistance program, sector reviews Review missions Discussions with government officials, executing agencies, nongovernment organizations, and beneficiaries 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reliability and accuracy of available information or further information obtained in the course of the study
3. Outputs <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Report on the strengths and weaknesses of Bank assistance to Nepal Guidelines on how future sectoral assistance by the Bank may be improved 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Report with findings and recommendations accepted by stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Conduct of workshop on findings and recommendations with stakeholders (government agencies, Bank, beneficiaries, other external assistance agencies) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Broad consensus on findings and recommendations
4. Activities <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Conduct desk review of agriculture and social sector projects, TAs, and other relevant documents with emphasis on how the loan projects and TAs are designed and supervised during implementation Prepare a country profile that analyzes factors affecting implementation performance Conduct field visits for first-hand observation and discussions with Government and executing agencies 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Consultant services for six person-months comprising one international consultant, a domestic consultant-research analyst at headquarters, and a domestic consultant in Nepal 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Consultants' report Progress reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Availability of qualified consultants and compliance with the terms of reference Cooperation and availability of the Government, nongovernment organizations, executing agencies for discussions

BANK ASSISTANCE FOR POVERTY REDUCTION

A. Summary Terms of Reference

1. In each country selected for the study, the domestic consultants (1-3 for each country, for a total of 32 person-months), under the guidance of the Operations Evaluation Office (OEO) staff concerned, will have the following responsibilities:

- (i) Review the survey instrument and reporting format prepared by the OEO, provide feedback, and discuss adjustments required to reflect country-specific issues during the inception mission. Feedback should be provided prior to the inception mission so that the survey instrument can be translated for field testing during the inception mission.
- (ii) Liaise with the governments; arrange and participate in meetings with officials from relevant government units.
- (iii) Organize meetings with representatives of international agencies with active poverty reduction programs, bilateral aid agencies, and nongovernment organizations.
- (iv) Collect information on government policies and targets for poverty reduction; collect information on poverty reduction activities in the same sectors as Bank-financed projects that are undertaken by other external agencies.
- (v) Arrange and participate in field trips to selected project sites during the inception mission. During these field trips, the survey instrument should be tested, semistructured interviews conducted, and focus group discussions organized.
- (vi) Select survey samples, identify control areas, and organize in-depth interviews and focus group discussions at each site. The sample should be gender-balanced.
- (vii) Translate the revised survey instrument, as required; organize a team of enumerators; train survey teams to familiarize them with the objectives of the survey and survey instruments; supervise the surveys, individual in-depth semistructured interviews, and focus group discussions.
- (viii) Review data and identify early whether there is a need to adjust the survey instrument, or whether further in-depth probing is required; encode data and run statistical analyses, and compile all qualitative data; record and translate the responses given during semistructured interviews and focus group discussions.
- (ix) Prepare a report according to the format prescribed by OEO.

2. The contract will require that interim reports be submitted. The work plan should be organized so that survey results can be sent to OEO at prescribed intervals for review and feedback.

B. Framework

3. The framework for the study is provided in the following matrix.

FRAMEWORK

Special Evaluation Study of Bank Assistance for Poverty Reduction

Design Summary	Performance Indicators/Targets	Project Monitoring Mechanisms	Risks and Assumptions
1. Goal <ul style="list-style-type: none"> To increase the effectiveness of Bank assistance in poverty reduction 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reduction in poverty in Bank developing member countries (DMCs) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> National data, socioeconomic surveys, evaluation studies 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Political will to introduce changes Pressures to "do more with less" constraint staff time for addressing poverty reduction requirements Pressures to keep approval rates high and processing time short weaken the desire to implement new requirements for addressing poverty reduction Management ensures that the Bank's resources and mechanisms for poverty reduction are adequate to meet the challenge of reducing poverty in DMCs
2. Purpose and Objective <ul style="list-style-type: none"> To inform the Bank's staff, management, and Board of Directors about the performance of Bank assistance against poverty reduction targets by measuring how effective Bank assistance is in addressing poverty 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Recommendations that are well founded on evaluation evidence and analyses, and are practical Recommendations are reflected in the Bank's Strategy on Poverty Reduction, and in future programs and projects 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Appraisal reports, project/program completion reports, project/program performance audit reports, technical assistance reports, country operational strategy, country assistance program, sector reviews 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Cooperation by concerned stakeholders (i.e., nongovernment organizations, DMC governments, project beneficiaries, and Bank operations staff) The quality of the findings and recommendation is adequate
3. Outputs <p>3.1 Study that synthesizes evaluation findings and identifies</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> whether provisions in country programming, project design, and implementation are adequate to ensure that poverty reduction targets can be attained whether mechanisms to monitor and evaluate poverty reduction components of projects are appropriate what results poverty reduction projects have attained or are likely to attain in the future, and what type of unintended impacts projects have had on poor people affected by them 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> One synthesis report that answers the questions mentioned under 3.1 Six country reports that contain the information mentioned under 3.2 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The quality of reports will be assessed through peer review within the Operations Evaluation Office, and through interdepartmental and government consultation on the draft report 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Data availability Biases in surveys, if consultants or people interviewed have the impression that they should provide "expected" answers rather than their own view The evaluation depends on the quality of the work of consultants DMC governments are willing to cooperate in conducting the study and accept suggested schedules for inception missions and fieldwork

Design Summary	Performance Indicators/Targets	Project Monitoring Mechanisms	Risks and Assumptions
<p>3.2. Six country reports, one per country included in the evaluation, including one profile for each project that was evaluated</p>			
<p>4. Activities</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Analyze policies, strategies, and programs of governments and external agencies, including the Bank, and project documentation, including social impact assessments Prepare country paper, project profiles, including indicators, questionnaires, and outlines for semistructured interviews and focus group discussions Discuss with government, executing agencies, nongovernment organizations, and other external agencies their poverty reduction policies, strategies, and activities Conduct surveys, in-depth interviews, and focus group discussions 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Draft preparatory work is completed prior to mission Fieldwork instruments are adequately designed, specifying the information that fieldwork should be generating Fieldwork is conducted according to contract Data is encoded and processed in a reliable and consistent fashion 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Checklist to see that all activities are conducted as planned Contract agreement with consultants, containing milestones and output-based payment schedules 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Intensive preparatory work is necessary Enough Operations Evaluation Office staff are available for this purpose The deadline for the study is tight; if field surveys require more time, the deadline might not be met

ROLE OF NONGOVERNMENT ORGANIZATIONS IN BANK-ASSISTED PROJECTS

A. Summary Terms of Reference

1. The purpose of the study is to provide feedback on lessons learned and best practices for future Bank cooperation with nongovernment organizations (NGOs). It will require the services of a team of consultants comprising two international evaluation specialists with experience in social development, particularly NGO operations and coordination (5 person-months), and a domestic evaluation analyst (1.5 person-months).

2. The international consultants, under the guidance of the Operations Evaluation Office staff concerned, will have the following responsibilities: (i) review the institutional arrangements, policies, and practices relating to cooperation with NGOs by the Bank and other funding agencies; (ii) establish an approach and criteria to assess the impacts of NGO involvement on the effectiveness, sustainability, and quality of the Bank's development interventions; (iii) conduct country studies to evaluate the Bank's experience with NGOs, including the level and direction of Bank cooperation with NGOs; (iv) update the Bank's information base on NGO involvement in lending and nonlending operations, including performance indicators to monitor the impacts of NGO involvement; and (v) provide practical recommendations on future NGO involvement in Bank operations.

3. The international consultants will be assisted by a domestic consultant to be assigned at Bank headquarters. The domestic evaluation analyst will undertake, among others, the following activities: (i) assist in identifying and reviewing alternative sources of information of relevance to the study; (ii) prepare profiles of Bank projects and technical assistance activities with NGO involvement as well as provide specific data tables during report preparation; (iii) assist in reviewing Bank's procedures, policies, and guidelines relating to NGOs; (iv) assist in developing a methodological framework in evaluating effectiveness and efficiency of Bank cooperation with NGOs; (v) conduct, if requested, a country study using a sample of Philippine projects; and (vi) assist in drawing meaningful lessons from the Bank's collective experience and in preparing a report on the effectiveness and efficiency of Bank cooperation with NGOs.

4. The first phase of the assignment will involve a systematic desk review to evaluate the Bank's collective experience with NGOs, and assess progress made in integrating Bank experience, knowledge, and expertise in NGO operations. The second phase of the assignment comprises country visits to six or seven representative developing member countries (e.g., Bangladesh, Cambodia, Indonesia, Nepal, Pakistan, Papua New Guinea, Philippines, Sri Lanka, Viet Nam), where the Bank's NGO experience is either extensive or expanding. The consultants will then prepare a summary of findings for each of the country visits, and a comprehensive final report, taking into account the outcomes of the institutional reviews and country studies.

B. Framework

5. The framework for the study is provided in the following matrix.

FRAMEWORK

Special Evaluation Study of the Role of Nongovernment Organizations in Bank-Assisted Projects

Design Summary	Performance Indicators/Targets	Project Monitoring Mechanisms	Risks and Assumptions
1. Goal <ul style="list-style-type: none"> To improve the effectiveness, sustainability, and quality of development assistance the Bank provides 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Improved cooperation and effectiveness of nongovernment organization (NGO) involvement in the design and implementation of future Bank lending and technical assistance (TA) activities Improved mandates, procedures, methodology, and guidelines for NGO involvement in Bank operations 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Bank documents (e.g., report and recommendations of the President, TA papers, project/program and TA completion reports, project/program performance audit reports) Bank operational policies and administrative procedures Database on NGO involvement in Bank operations 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Commitment of Bank decision makers to apply results of the study Effective and sustainable monitoring system on the level and direction of NGO involvement in Bank operations
2. Purpose and Objective <ul style="list-style-type: none"> To provide feedback on lessons learned and best practices for future Bank cooperation with NGOs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Review of the Bank's collective experience with NGOs Assessment of Bank progress in integrating Bank experience, knowledge, and expertise in NGO operations 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Final report that draws together the study's findings and recommended actions to strengthen Bank cooperation with NGOs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Cooperation by concerned stakeholders (i.e., NGOs, developing member country [DMC] governments, project beneficiaries, and Bank operations staff)
3. Outputs <p>3.1 Institutional review</p> <p>3.2 Methodological framework in evaluating effectiveness and efficiency of Bank cooperation with NGOs</p> <p>3.3 Country studies on 6-7 representative DMCs where the Bank's NGO experience is extensive or expanding</p> <p>3.4 Information base on NGOs in the Bank's operations</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Review of current Bank procedures, policies, and guidelines on NGO involvement Establish approach and criteria in assessing the impacts of NGO involvement on effectiveness, sustainability, and quality of development interventions Review of Bank policies, experience, and best practices on cooperation with NGOs Review of policies and best practices in other funding agencies Updated information base on NGO involvement in Bank operations Establish performance indicators to monitor the effectiveness and impacts of NGO involvement 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Final report Country reports on DMC-level research Country reports on DMC-level research Project site visits Database on NGO involvement in Bank operations, including performance indicators to monitor impacts of NGO involvement 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Effective analytical framework in evaluating the effectiveness and efficiency of Bank cooperation with NGOs Effective analytical framework in evaluating the effectiveness and efficiency of Bank cooperation with NGOs Effective analytical framework in evaluating the effectiveness and efficiency of Bank cooperation with NGOs

Design Summary	Performance Indicators/Targets	Project Monitoring Mechanisms	Risks and Assumptions
<p>3.5 Recommendations on future direction of NGO involvement in Bank operations</p> <p>4. Activities</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Review institutional arrangements, policies, and practices relating to cooperation with NGOs by the Bank and other funding agencies Conduct country studies on the level and direction of Bank cooperation with NGOs Develop a monitoring and evaluation approach to assess the impacts of cooperation with NGOs on effectiveness, sustainability, and quality of development interventions 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Recommended courses of action taking into account outcomes of the institutional review and country studies Consultant services of two international evaluation specialists (5 person-months), and one domestic evaluation analyst (1.5 person-months) Bank financing of \$170,000 equivalent to cover the cost of consultant services Completion of study in six months with draft final report of study completed within four months 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Final report with recommendations for improved procedures, methodology and guidelines, and a proposed action plan Consultant's inception and final reports Country reports on DMC-level research 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Careful selection of consultants and effective coordination of their assignments

ROLE OF RESIDENT MISSIONS IN PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION

A. Summary Terms of Reference

1. The international consultant (institutional/project evaluation specialist for 4 person-months), under the guidance of the Operations Evaluation Office staff concerned, will (i) review relevant Bank documents; (ii) review and assess progress made in implementing the recommendations and action plan of the Interdepartmental Working Group on Resident Missions (RMs); (iii) examine the administrative aspects of the Bank's RMs; (iv) determine the scope, methodology, and issues to be covered in a consultative workshop and a rapid appraisal survey on the impact of RMs and prepare the survey instruments; (v) visit selected RMs and discuss with staff of RMs, concerned executing and implementing agencies, and other stakeholders, on the strengths and weaknesses of RMs and prepare individual country reports; (vi) review the requirements and actual experience of RMs in the implementation of Bank-financed loan projects and technical assistance and evaluate the cost effectiveness of RMs in relation to achievement of RM objectives; (vii) assess and determine the function/role of RMs in providing early warning of emerging crises and project implementation issues; (viii) assess the effectiveness of RMs vis-a-vis that of the much-strengthened RMs of the World Bank; (ix) assess the adequacy and effectiveness of the RMs in improving Bank's project processing, country programming, and policy formulation; (x) collaborate with the Bank's Special Working Group on Review of the Bank's Business Processes in its study on the role of the RMs in the Bank's operational business processes; (xi) assess the scope for RMs to adopt a larger role in the implementation of projects and take on additional responsibilities in approval for change in project scope and budget reallocations; (xii) review and assess the role of the Bank's RMs and their functions; (xiii) review the current role and functions of RMs of other funding agencies, in particular the World Bank, in the developing member countries concerned; (xiv) derive meaningful lessons from the experience of RMs in project implementation; and (xv) prepare a comprehensive report drawing together the study's findings and recommending actions for enhancing the effectiveness of the Bank's RMs in the implementation of projects.

2. The headquarters-based evaluation analyst (domestic consultant for 6 person-months) will (i) assist the international consultant in identifying, gathering, and reviewing alternative sources of information that could contribute to a database for the study; (ii) assist in reviewing the Bank's procedures, policies, and guidelines relating to RMs and in analyzing the findings and evaluating the impact of RMs; (iii) conduct a comprehensive desk review of a sample of Bank-financed projects administered by RMs and headquarters; (iv) prepare profiles of RMs for use by the international consultant and provide specific data on organization, performance indicators, functions, nonlending operations, institutional aspects, and lessons learned; (v) assist in data tabulation, trend analysis, and research for information relevant to the RMs study; (vi) assist in identifying meaningful lessons from the actual experience of the Bank's RMs; (vii) assist the international consultant in preparing the comprehensive report; and (viii) assist in other activities as required.

B. Framework

3. The framework for the study is provided in the following matrix.

FRAMEWORK

Special Evaluation Study of the Role of the Bank's Resident Missions in Project Implementation

Design Summary	Performance Indicators/Targets	Project Monitoring Mechanisms	Risks and Assumptions
1. Goal <ul style="list-style-type: none"> To enhance the role of the Bank in delivering development assistance to its developing member countries (DMCs) through strengthened role and empowered resident missions (RMs) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Improved administration of Bank's loan and technical assistance (TA) portfolio in the DMCs Increased visibility of and contribution by the Bank in aid coordination, and improved interface between the Bank and the DMC governments, local development agencies, private sector, and nongovernment organizations (NGOs) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Bank's annual performance evaluation program Official statistics and reports from RMs, funding agencies, DMC governments, and NGOs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Support and commitment of Bank Management to implement evaluation results
2. Purpose and Objective <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Evaluate the relevance, effectiveness, and impact of RMs in contributing to the development and management of the Bank's portfolio, and provide feedback to enhance the RMs' role in delivering development assistance to the DMCs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reform process based on study findings from all DMCs, with particular focus on DMCs with project administration function 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Project documents and files Results of consultative workshop with RMs, aid agencies, DMC governments, and NGOs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Cooperation of RM management and staff, aid agencies, DMC governments, and NGOs
3. Outputs <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Conceptual framework for expanding the role of RMs in the Bank's delivery of development assistance to DMCs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Assessment of the role and impact of RMs in the administration of Bank-assisted project loans and TAs; appropriate recommendations for improvements Assessment of the role of RMs in coordination particularly with government agencies, executing agencies, aid agencies, local development agencies, NGOs; recommended areas for expansion Assessment of RMs' role in providing early warning on emerging national and economic crises and development issues; recommended changes and/or expansion of scope of responsibility Deliberations and recommendations on enhancing the role of RMs formulated from organized consultative workshops in selected RMs to be attended by representatives of RMs, government agencies, executing agencies, aid agencies, local development agencies, and NGOs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Study completion report Consultant's individual RM reports Workshop proceedings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Effective and appropriate analytical framework used as basis for the study Cooperation of partners in carrying out the study Synchronization of study with other ongoing Bank-related studies Coordination between consultants

Design Summary	Performance Indicators/Targets	Project Monitoring Mechanisms	Risks and Assumptions
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Assessment of the effectiveness of RMs to implement the business unit concept to enhance the Bank's role in delivering development assistance to DMCs; recommended changes and/or expansion of scope of responsibility Recommended process for evaluating the role of RMs in improving the Bank's development effectiveness 		
<p>4. Activities</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Review of documents of a sample of RM-administered projects compared with headquarters-administered projects, including Board papers, RM files, and other official reports to assess the requirements and experience of RMs in implementing Bank-financed loans and TAs, and identify strengths and weaknesses of the RMs vis-a-vis headquarters in terms of performance Conduct a consultative workshop in selected RMs and a rapid appraisal survey of all RMs on the impact of RMs Visit selected RMs to discuss with staff of RMs, concerned executing and implementing agencies, and other stakeholders the strengths, weaknesses, and potential of RMs Develop a conceptual framework for assessing the role and effectiveness of RMs in the Bank's delivery of development assistance to its DMCs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Consultant services comprising one international consultant knowledgeable about the Bank's operations (particularly a project processing and implementation) and institutional development, and familiar with other multilateral development institutions (4 person-months) and one domestic evaluation analyst (6 person-months) Bank financing of \$165,000 equivalent to cover the cost of consultant services, rapid appraisal survey, and consultative workshops 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Consultant's inception and final reports Country reports on RM, appraisal surveys 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Careful selection of consultants and effective supervision and coordination of their assignments Availability of and facility of access to required documents and information

EVALUATION OF THE COUNTRY ASSISTANCE PROGRAM FOR VIET NAM

A. Summary Terms of Reference

1. The international consultant (program evaluation specialist for 4 person-months), under the guidance of the Operations Evaluation Office staff concerned, will identify key evaluation criteria and assess the Bank's country operational strategies, economic work, and country assistance programs in terms of their appropriateness, relevance, efficiency, and effectiveness in meeting the developmental needs and improving the macroeconomic environment of the country. The consultant will also make a comparative analytical study of the assistance programs of other aid agencies, derive lessons, and make recommendations to improve Bank assistance to Viet Nam.

2. The domestic consultants (two macroeconomic/sector evaluation specialists for 3 person-months each) will assist the international consultant in the review of relevant country program documents, government plans and reports, and documents from other sources (including private sector where available), and interview selected local beneficiaries of the Bank's assistance to gauge its impact. They will identify key sectors of Bank assistance and assess the level of achievement of stated objectives. They will support the international consultant in assessing Bank assistance to the country.

B. Framework

3. The framework for the study is provided in the following matrix.

FRAMEWORK

Evaluation of the Country Assistance Program for Viet Nam

Design Summary	Performance Indicators/Targets	Project Monitoring Mechanisms	Risks and Assumptions
1. Goal <ul style="list-style-type: none"> To contribute to the overall efficiency and efficacy of Bank assistance to Viet Nam 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Appropriate linkages between Viet Nam's needs and the Bank's country operational strategy and assistance program Improved success rate for Bank projects and programs in Viet Nam 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Evaluation reports (e.g., project/program completion and project/program performance audit reports) Bank Medium-Term Strategic Framework Country operational strategy document Country assistance plan Government medium-term development plan 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Commitment of Bank's decision makers to incorporate evaluation results into the processing of Bank assistance Cooperation from Government
2. Purpose and Objective <ul style="list-style-type: none"> To assess the relevance, efficiency, and effectiveness of Bank operations and draw lessons 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Bank performance and lessons learned fed back into the Bank's strategy formulation and country programming Assessment of linkages between Viet Nam's needs and the Bank's country assistance strategy and program 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Final report Country operational strategy Country assistance plan Bank Medium-Term Strategic Framework Government medium-term development plan 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Cooperation from concerned stakeholders (e.g., Government, Bank operations staff)
3. Output <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Country assistance program evaluation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Assessment on the relevance of the Bank strategy and assistance program with respect to needs of Viet Nam, and the constraints that narrow the choice of operational options Evaluation of lending and nonlending operations in terms of efficiency and effectiveness Compendium of lessons learned for future Bank operations 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Country assistance program evaluation study and review missions final report 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Cooperation from concerned stakeholders (e.g., Government, Bank operations staff) Any controversial findings will be verified and resolved Study will be carried out as scheduled Data availability

Design Summary	Performance Indicators/Targets	Project Monitoring Mechanisms	Risks and Assumptions
4. Input <ul style="list-style-type: none"> International and domestic consultant services 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Consultant services of one international evaluation specialist with experience in program evaluation (for 4 person-months), and two domestic consultants (for 1.5 person-months each) with experience in macroeconomic/sector evaluation Bank financing of \$160,000 equivalent to cover consultant services Completion of study in five months, with draft final report of study completed within three months Domestic consultants' reports to be completed within three months 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Consultant's inception and final reports Back-to-office report of country assistance program evaluation study and review missions 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Careful selection of consultants and effective coordination of their assignments Consultants will complete their assignments