

# TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE COMPLETION REPORT

Division: SOTL

<b>TA No. and Name</b> 3839 TIM: Capacity Building to Develop Public Sector Management and Governance Skills			<b>Amount Approved:</b> \$ 688,000	
			<b>Revised Amount:</b> \$ 688,000	
<b>Executing Agency:</b> Ministry of State Administration		<b>Source of Funding:</b> \$ 338,000 TASF \$ 350,000 JSF Co-financing \$ 110,000 USAID		<b>TA Amount Undisbursed</b> \$ 16,011.08
				<b>TA Amount Utilized</b> \$671,988.92
<b>Dates</b> <b>Approval</b> 05/03/2002 <b>Signing</b> 05/03/2002 <b>Fielding of Consultants</b> 1/10/ 2003			<b>Completion Date</b> <b>Original</b> 30/08/2003 <b>Actual</b> 30/09/2005	
			<b>Closing Date</b> <b>Original</b> 30/09/2003 <b>Actual</b> 18/05/2006	

## Description

On 05 March 2002, just two months before Timor-Leste's restoration of independence, ADB approved TA 3839-TIM, which aimed at building technical and managerial skills in the new administration. Whilst external support was mostly going to the new central administration, this ADB TA would focus on district-level skills to plan and deliver public services. The Ministry of State Administration (MSA) became the TA Executing Agency (EA) after independence. The TA's implementing agency was the MSA's National Institute of Public Administration (NIPA), in collaboration with the National Office of Local Government Administration (NOLGA). The TA used a needs-and-competency-based training curriculum covering eight public sector management and governance skills areas. NIPA, NOLGA and some district officers were trained in planning, organizing, and management of continuous and quality in-service training (INSET) for local authorities and community leaders. National staff, not TA advisers delivered most of the training. This highly participative approach resulted in the TA completion being delayed.

## Objective and Scope

The objective of the TA was to "assist the East Timorese in (i) assuming the functions of the new East Timor government, and (ii) efficiently managing the administration following the principles of good governance and poverty reduction" (TA paper, paragraph 7). The TA sought to develop the proficiencies of local authorities at the district, sub-district, and community levels in planning, administration, and problem-solving. It also intended to build institutional capacity for addressing the training needs of local authorities including the village leaders. The three target groups of beneficiaries were: (a) district and sub-district officers, (b) local trainers, and (c) village leaders. The TA had two phases: (a) training needs analysis and design and development of the training courses for district and sub-district officers within the first six months of TA implementation, and (b) implementation of the training courses within 12 months. The TA aimed to train 13 district administrators, 13 deputy district administrators, 13 district development officers, and 65 sub-district administrators. The TA would use lectures, workshops, distance learning, and study tours.

## Evaluation of Inputs

The TA was adequately formulated. It was designed, developed, and implemented in close collaboration with the Timor-Leste government, local stakeholders, and development partners (DPs) such as the United States Agency for International Development (USAID), Australian Agency for International Development, United Nations Development Programme, and the World Bank. TA inputs adapted to government restructuring, creation of new positions, and hiring of new personnel at the district, sub-district, and community levels.

TA implementation was highly participatory. The target beneficiaries – local authorities and trainers – were actively involved in identifying their training needs as well as in crafting the most appropriate curriculum for them. These principal clients expressed overall satisfaction with the TA inputs. Training courses and source books were developed with the local trainers and academics. The TA did not come in with pre-packaged ideas and materials. The management and delivery training courses were led by INAP in partnership with NOLGA and mobile assistance teams (MATs) comprising volunteer trainers from participating district and sub-district offices. Five MATs were organized to cover the 13 districts, which lay the ground for cluster/district-based and demand-driven INSET without disrupting regular work functions and delivery of services. The TA worked with MAE, the Ministry of Education, and the National University of Timor-Leste to start the process of academic equivalency and accreditation (AEA) of the training courses

Careful mapping of initiatives and networking with DPs enabled the TA to identify a niche in the overall capacity building program for Timor-Leste and avoid overlap and duplication. The TA became the precursor of donor-assisted training programs for local authorities in Timor-Leste. Convinced about the soundness of the approaches and initial progress of the TA, USAID financed a study tour for 18 local officials to selected local governments in the Philippines. The TA helped NIPA

and NOLGA arrange and manage the study tour.

Other in-country partnerships leveraged TA inputs as the program became widely known and appreciated. This helped increase the efficiency of TA inputs and so the scope was expanded to include (i) source books in subject areas (problem solving, co-operating with others, practical math, project development and management, leadership and management, and local development administration), (ii) procurement training curriculum, source book, and teaching guides for the Procurement Division (PD) of the Ministry of Planning and Finance (MPF), and (iii) additional dissemination of TA experiences, results, and lessons learned (see Evaluation of Outputs).

The performance of the TA EA and implementing agency was satisfactory to highly satisfactory, especially NIPA whose Director took a personal interest in the TA and delivered some training. ADB's performance was satisfactory.

Consultant inputs totaled 59 person-months, comprising 46 domestic and 13 person-months international (rounded). This exceeded the original Terms of Reference, which included 18 person-months of domestic and 12 person-months of international consulting services. The consultants' performances were satisfactory, which is consistent with their individual performance evaluation reviews.

### **Evaluation of Outputs**

The TA was implemented efficiently and it exceeded the expected outputs. The TA conducted 64 training programs across six subject areas for 1,403 trainees. In addition to the local authorities targeted in the original design, the following were trained: (a) 13 district personnel officers, (b) 13 district economic and social officers, (c) 13 district administrative assistants, (d) 65 sub-district community and development officers, and (d) 65 sub-district local government officers. The six sets of source books and teaching guides (in English and Bahasa Indonesia languages) have been field tested and attuned to the local context and learning profiles of the trainees. They are now being widely used by INAP in their training programs for other training groups.

The procurement assistance to MPF-PD included selected field trials of the source book and teaching guides as well as mentoring key PD personnel. TA funding was insufficient to complete this additional component so the World Bank funded the remaining inputs to ensure complete and good quality deliverables.

TA experiences and lessons learned were shared through *ADB Review*, *ADB Today*, and *ADB website*. Four TA workshops were delivered in ADB headquarters in Manila and ADB Special Office in Timor-Leste. Two videos about the history and accomplishments have been produced.

The participatory nature of TA implementation required additional time, but within this revised framework TA outputs were timely. NIPA management is clearly satisfied with the outputs. Testimonials from the trainees and documentation of the initial results and outcomes of the training programs also indicate a high level of satisfaction. TA reports were submitted on time and mission reports and the Final Report were good quality.

### **Overall Assessment and Rating**

The TA is rated successful. It effectively responded to the needs of the Timor-Leste government to train its district and sub-district-level civil servants. The groundwork for planning, managing, and sustaining good quality INSET has been established. INSET sustainability will be consolidated through the follow-on TA 4272-TIM: Capacity Building to Strengthen Public Sector Management and Governance Skills (Phase II). Sustainability of skills and competencies attained by trainees will depend partly on district administration budgets being increased to enable officers to ply their trade.

### **Major Lessons Learned**

The TA reinforced that capacity building cannot and should not be fast-tracked. This has implications for TA modalities; the TA could stay engaged longer because it used high quality individual consultants from a prestigious Developing Member Country university. Stakeholders' participation and applying local knowledge enhance project effectiveness. Partnerships and collaboration improve efficiency by leveraging TA resources. Finally, an effective champion is important, in this case the Director of NIPA.

### **Recommendations and Follow-Up Actions**

The program should be continued under TA 4272-TIM and extended to (i) newly elected local councils leaders and members, and (ii) civil servants from other ministries. The initiatives to establish a system of academic equivalency and accreditation should be pursued.