

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE COMPLETION REPORT

Division: CWSS

TA No. and Name TA4432-PAK: Capacity Building for Environmental Management in Sindh			Amount Approved: \$400,000	
Executing Agency (EA), Implementing Agency (IA) Finance Department of Sindh Province (EA) Local Government Department of Sindh Province (IA)		Source of Funding: TA Special Fund	TA Amount Undisbursed 18,295.61	TA Amount Utilized 18,295.61
Date Approval 12 Nov 2004 Signing 10 Oct 2005 Fielding of Consultants 19 Dec 2005			Completion Date Original 31 July 2005 Actual 31 July 2006 Closing Date Original 31 July 2005 Actual 30 March 2007	
Description. Two thirds of Sindh lies either in the brackish water zone or in the desert zone; only 17% lies in the freshwater zone. Levels of urban services within the province are low and services in most settlements continue to be far from adequate. The percentage of urban dwellers in Sindh with piped water on plot increased from 68% in 1990 to an estimated 80% in 2001 but in rural areas, piped water supply covers 14% and hand pumps 41%; the remaining 45% of households rely on unsafe water such as uncovered wells, rivers, and rain- or canal-fed ponds. Whilst sanitation services provided to planned areas in Karachi were estimated at 85%, services to Katchi Abadis were reported to cover only 12% of the population, and in rural Sindh, 53% of the population lacks access to basic sanitation facilities. Solid waste management figures are even more critical, as formal systems deal with less than 50% of all solid waste produced. Under Pakistan's Devolution Plan, district governments headed by the taluka or town nazims are responsible for planning, investment, and control of municipal services, including water supply, sanitation, and solid waste disposal. Provincial Governments are responsible for policy actions and overall coordination. Major problems encounter, however, include lack of policy frameworks (either at national or provincial level) and weak institutional capacity at local level. Partly due to the inherent problems related to lack of funds and capacity to execute these new responsibilities, the tehsil municipal authorities (TMAs) have not properly assumed the mantle of full responsibilities as envisaged under the Sindh Local Government Ordinance, 2001 (SLGO 2001).				
Expected Impact, Outcome and Outputs. As part of the devolution process, TA4432-PAK was designed to develop provincial and local government capacities in their efforts to improve policy frameworks and planning capabilities. The technical assistance (TA), developed in support of ADB's financed Sindh Devolved Social Services Program (DSSP) was closely implemented in coordination with the DSSP unit. The ultimate goal of the TA is to improve sustainable environmental management, health, and living conditions in Sindh and its aim was to help the Government of Sindh (GoS) develop a participatory strategic planning framework to improve rural and urban environmental conditions in Sindh. Specific outputs designed to achieve this goal and purpose included (i) conducting a cross-sectoral review of developments, issues, and concerns in the solid waste management (SWM) and water supply and sanitation (WSS) sectors; (ii) formulating policies, strategies, and action plans for SWM and WSS sectors in the different districts of Sindh; and (iii) conceptualizing a practical study to help TMAs introduce appropriate tariff methodologies for improved governance, adapted to local needs and conditions. The TA, which was designed to help in the preparation of essential documents required as DSSP tranche conditions and delivery of essential capacity development activities in Sindh, is believed to adequately meet its purpose and needs of the program.				
Delivery of Inputs and Conduct of Activities. A team of international and domestic consultants was selected and engaged by ADB to provide a total of 30.75 person-months' (p-m) consulting services—9.25 p-m international and 21.5 p-m domestic. The team included international experts in SWM, WSS, financial and economic analysis, and institutions and facilitation and national experts in SWM, WSS, policies, tariff economics, institutional and legal aspects, socioeconomic analysis and environmental management. Given large coverage both in terms of area and number of beneficiaries and stakeholders, p-m consultancy allocated was considered adequate by both ADB and GoS. As per written communications with ADB, the consultant's performance was found to be satisfactory by both GoS and ADB, with reported good knowledge of local strengths and weaknesses both in technical and institutional fields. Consultants also adequately delivered the TA outputs. Two review missions were conducted over the 6 month period of TA implementation (end December 2005 to mid July 2006): an Inception Mission, in which ADB and the Government (i) jointly reviewed the Inception Report prepared by the consultant, (ii) confirmed TA outputs and desired outcomes with the EA and IA, (iii) corroborated counterpart contributions, (iv) discussed overall methodology to achieve capacity building for mid-term action planning (through the preparation of detailed sample Action Plans (APs) for 6 TMAs then followed by a series of workshop by which knowledge was transferred to the remaining 113 TMAs in Sindh), (v) agreed methodology and criteria for selection of 6 TMAs for which APs were developed, and (vi) selected pilot TMAs. During the second review, and using the Draft Final Report as reference document, the Mission discussed				

with GoS, policies and strategies formulated for WSS and SWM (at provincial level), sample APs, capacity developed for TMAs action planning and applying tariffs. Contributions from the EA and IA were limited both in terms of feedback and interaction with the TA consultant, as well as provision of facilities and supporting documentation.

Evaluation of Outputs and Achievement of Outcome. The TA produced the following specific outputs (i) sector assessment for WSS and SWM in Sindh, (ii) provincial policies for WSS and SWM, (iii) provincial strategies for WSS and SWM, (iv) a tool kit/manual for development of action plans in the WSS and SWM sector at TMA level, (v) guidelines for the preparation and administration of WSS tariffs at TMA level, (vi) option evaluation for promoting private sector participation, (vii) outline strategy for raising awareness. Outputs formulated under the TA were prepared after extensive consultation at taluka, district and provincial level. Particular effort was placed in participation and consensus building stages. Non-government and community-based organizations, as well as locally represented donor agencies were invited to participate and provide comments, particularly at the stages of policy and strategy development. Such activities are expected to provide greater ownership, accountability, as well as realistic implementation and commitment timeliness. Although delivered a few weeks after schedule, the report produced on completion of the TA was considered to be comprehensive and of reasonable quality. Although the TA was timely formulated, long delays in GoS signing of the TA letter of agreement resulted in the delayed delivery of some of the outputs. Quality of outputs is generally satisfactory.

Overall Assessment and Rating Based on the feedback from Government agencies, and the above evaluation, including sustainability issues, the TA is considered successful. Whilst the quality of the outputs is adequate, the success of the outcomes also depends on GoS's commitment to (i) adopting policies and strategies, and (ii) training replication and continued capacity development (some suggestions are provided below).

Major Lessons Learned. The major lessons learned are as follows

(i) The outputs of a TA must be carefully contextualized from the stage of design. The design of this TA was influenced by (a) the devolution process and its support to ADB's DSSP, and (b) specific problems (technical and institutional) affecting GoS and potential solutions to overcome it. It is however essential that this be considered a stepping stone within ADB's decentralization support program and therefore part of longer term policy dialogue.

(ii) Stakeholders from tiers of government displayed different interest and levels of commitment to the various TA's outputs. Although this is related to the responsibilities of each tiers, it also generally reflects the level of priority attributed to WSS and SWM, political commitment/interference and direct contact with existing problems.

(iii) Whilst TA outputs are localized and measurable, the outcome of this assistance will be largely influenced by the capacity of provincial and local governments to (a) sustain the interest generated, and (b) replicate its outcomes.

Recommendations and Follow-Up Actions. Next are some recommendations for immediate and future action:

(i) **Policy Approval.** The formulation of provincial policies for water supply and sanitation and solid waste management in Sindh were defined to be tranche conditions for the Sindh DSSP. Whilst the interim policies have been drafted and conditions fulfilled, their adoption and implementation should be undertaken without delay.

(ii) **Turning Strategies into Practice.** Conditional grants of the GoS are subject to the preparation of annual plans including provisions for education, health and water supply and sanitation services. Since annual plans must be positioned within a medium term framework, the preparation of medium term (5-year) plans for water supply and sanitation should be conducted by the TMAs and submitted to the Government for reference and recording purposes. The Mission recommended that the preparation of medium term APs for WSS and SWM be made an essential requirement of the masterplanning commitments of the GoS. Sindh DSSP may consider their implementation as a possible conditional requirement under future budgeting and lending programs.

(iii) **Replication and Sustainability.** Materials prepared under the TA were conceived taking into consideration future use by TMAs and training replication. Materials and tools developed under the TA as part of the TMA strengthening program may be adopted (and modified as required) by the Sindh DSSP Unit (and District Support Units), and training on Strategic Action Planning for water supply and sanitation and solid waste management could be continued under the ADB's on-going TA loan.

Prepared by Tatiana Gallego-Lizon

Designation Urban Development Specialist