

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE COMPLETION REPORT

Division : SERD/Indonesia Resident Mission

TA 4391-INO : Support for Decentralized Education Management II		Amount Approved: \$500,000	
		Revised Amount: \$6,044,000	
Executing Agency Directorate General for Management of Primary and Secondary Education, Ministry of National Education (MONE)	Source of Funding ADB : \$ 500,000 EU : \$ 5,544,000	Amount Undisbursed: \$2,322,705.64	Amount Utilized: \$3,721,294.36
TA Approval Date: 14 Sep 2004	TA Signing Date: 27 Jan 2005	Fielding of First Consultant: 22 Feb 2005	TA Completion Date Original: 30 Apr 2006 ¹ Actual: 31 Dec 2010 Account Closing Date Original: 30 Apr 2006 Actual: 26 Sep 2012
<p>Description. The TA commenced in February 2005 with the aim to assist the Government of Indonesia (GOI) in building capacity to plan and manage basic education services under the newly approved decentralized system². In October 2005, the TA was expanded through a major change in scope with co-financing support from the European Union (EU)³. The expected impact, outcome and outputs were changed as described below. A contribution agreement was signed in December 2007 for \$5,544,000 (equivalent to €3,955,000).</p> <p>Expected Impact, Outcome and Outputs. The expected impact of the TA was improved national capacity to achieve the goals and targets in the Education Strategic Plan (ESP) 2005-2009, Education for All (EFA) and the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) for education. The expected outcome was enhanced capacity to plan, manage and deliver basic education services that meet the minimum service standards (MSS) through: (i) support for the development of clearly specified MSS for basic education, (ii) capacity development programs for district, provincial and central government officials to prepare and implement MSS, and (iii) support for monitoring and evaluation.</p> <p>The expected outputs were: (i) A set of clearly-defined and approved MSS to help districts achieve national targets for basic education, as defined in the ESP 2005-2009, EFA targets and the MDGs for education; (ii) Strengthened district capacity to plan, budget, manage, implement and monitor achievement of MSS for districts and subsequent service performance improvements, including financing arrangements; (iii) Enhanced provincial capacity to plan, budget, manage, implement and monitor achievement of MSS for provinces and subsequent service performance improvements, including support to districts in meeting district's MSS; (iv) Improved central and provincial capacity to support sustainable capacity development processes for MSS at district and school level, and (v) Enhanced central/provincial capacity to monitor and facilitate district MSS, including an action plan to strengthen MSS monitoring and evaluation systems. In general, the TA contributed as expected to the impact and outcome, and achieved the output targets as specified in the Design and Monitoring Framework.</p> <p>Delivery of Inputs and Conduct of Activities. The TA deployed international and national consultants on individual basis to facilitate the development of MSS and to help implementing a capacity building program. Overall, the performance of consultants was rated satisfactory. The consultants were supported by counterparts from relevant inter-ministerial agencies including the Ministry of National Education (MONE), the Ministry of Religious Affairs (MORA), the Ministry of Home Affairs (MOHA), the Ministry of Finance (MOF), the Ministry of State Apparatus (MOSA) and the National Planning Development Agency (Bappenas). The formulation of MSS took longer than envisaged due to the needs for consultation process among stakeholders to reach consensus on defining MSS indicators and integrating the MSS into the overall education regulatory framework. A national consensus was reached by the end of 2009. The TA acted as a catalyst to bring on board all relevant Ministries and national agencies culminating in the issue of the Ministerial Regulation for education MSS in July 2010. The decree includes a set of technical guidelines for government officers at different levels to measure the achievement of MSS indicators, including data collection and interpretation, and reference to relevant regulations on particular indicators. Following the enactment of MSS, the TA implemented socialization campaigns and capacity building activities at the national and regional level, including training/workshop for</p>			

¹ The original closing date was based on the ADB financed TA, which was planned for about two years. After expanding the TA scope through additional financing by the EU, the TA completion date as stipulated in the contribution agreement was July 2009. In 2008 the TA duration was extended to 31 December 2010.

² In 2005 the TA was named "Support for Decentralized Education Management (SDEM-I)" with ADB financing of \$500,000. The TA goal as defined in the DMF was " Support the establishment of decentralized structures capable of delivering equitable, effective and efficient education services"; the TA purpose was "To assist the Government through the Unit for Facilitation of Decentralized Education in policy formulation on decentralized education management".

³ With EU's financing, the TA was renamed to "Basic Education Sector Capacity Support Program".

government officers from 174 districts and seven provinces, and training of 1,449 trainers (TOT), who, in turn, have trained principals, treasurers, and heads of school committees of 215,000 schools nationwide in 2011. The TA also conducted a baseline study in 60 districts to assess the current status quo of MSS achievement. Results of the baseline study were used to develop recommendations for district administration to plan strategies and estimate investment needs towards achieving MSS. The baseline survey has provided a model for subsequent sampling survey on MSS monitoring. In addition, the TA facilitated specific capacity building models in five districts. Throughout the TA implementation, contribution of government counterparts both at the central and regional level has been significant. The Government has confirmed its commitment to support MSS implementation nationwide as part of the overall strategic education plan.

Although an amount of \$2,322,705.64 was unspent at the TA closing, EU and the Government considered the overall efficiency in managing the TA resources satisfactory since all TA outputs had been achieved. Given that the Government, with the support of AusAID, financed capacity development programs in 215,000 schools nationwide particularly TA funding originally earmarked under cost categories “travel” and “capacity development fund” was not fully utilized. An issue which delayed the final TA closing was related to the outstanding balance of advance payment facilities resulted from currency exchange loss amounted \$2,620 (equivalent to €2,014.33), which should have been refunded to ADB. GOI was unable to refund this outstanding amount due to regulatory constraint, in which the TA counterpart funds were only allowed until 31 December 2010 (TA completion date) while the liquidation took place in July 2011. After a lengthy communication this issue was resolved by writing-off the APF balance in 2012. Overall, the EA performance was satisfactory as indicated by their commitment to further support the MSS implementation.

Evaluation of Outputs and Achievement of Outcome. The TA outcome and outputs as envisaged in the design and monitoring framework were considered relevant in the context of Indonesia's development goals and sector objectives and the ADB Country Strategy. The overall TA design included a mix of policy-level support, organizational development for central, provincial, district and schools, alongside quality improvement measures. In 2004 the Government had launched a major administrative reform in decentralizing the provision of education services. The development of education MSS was essential for supporting more effective and efficient sub-national planning and prioritization processes to improve education performance and address regional disparities. MSS are regarded as a critical policy tool for strengthening governance, accountability and equity-based provision of education services. Using the MSS, local administrations can be compared on the extent to which they are fulfilling their responsibilities – for example, to adequately provide schools that are accessible, furnished, staffed with qualified teachers and appropriately supervised. Schools can likewise be compared on the extent to which they are providing the basic learning resources, the required hours of instruction, appropriate teaching and assessment in classrooms and quality assurance practices and management of the school. Analysis of information on the extent to which schools and districts/cities are complying with the MSS and calculation of the MSS gap provide entry points for improvement at both the school and the local administration level. Due to some start up delays on the Government side, the actual work to formulate the MSS only started in July 2008. To ensure sufficient time to reach agreement on the MSS indicators and to prepare capacity building strategies the TA was extended in 2008 for 18 months until 31 December 2010. The actual closing of the TA account happened only in 26 September 2012 due to prolonged process to settle the refunding issue as mentioned above.

Overall Assessment and Rating. Overall, the TA was considered successful in achieving its envisaged outputs and outcome. The TA was effective in promoting ownership of the government at the central and regional level, and in strengthening cooperation with development partners. The TA was efficient in utilizing its resources. Through a nationwide capacity building program at school level in 2011 with AusAID financing support, the MSS was disseminated to all schools and madrasahs at the primary and junior secondary level, which promote sustainability.

Major Lessons. The key success of the TA was a strong partnership among ADB, Government, and other development partners. Dialog and close consultations took place at every stage in developing the MSS and in preparing capacity building activities. Strong ownership of Government stakeholders was considered very crucial for creating nationwide acceptance to utilize MSS as policy tool to strengthen the quality of education services.

Recommendations and Follow-Up Actions. Following up on the good results of developing MSS and building capacity for MSS under the TA, in 2012, the EU and the Government have invited the ADB to manage additional EU resources for a “Basic Education Minimum Service Standard Capacity Development Program”, which is envisaged to commence 2013. The Program is planned to follow up on the TA achievements and focus particularly on addressing disparities in provincial and district education performance by (i) strengthening capacity of Ministry of Education and Culture and district administrations for planning, budgeting and managing education services in accordance with the MSS, and (ii) promoting advocacy for the education MSS. Potential implementation arrangements are currently discussed with the Government, EU and ADB.

Prepared by: Sutarum Wiryono

Designation: Project Officer (Education)

In preparing any country program or strategy, financing any project, or by making any designation of or reference to a particular territory or geographic area in this document, the Asian Development Bank does not intend to make any judgments as to the legal or other status of any territory or area.