

ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK

TAR:STU 37766

**PROPOSED
TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE
FOR
SELECTED EVALUATION STUDIES
FOR 2004**

March 2004

ABBREVIATIONS

ADB	–	Asian Development Bank
CAPE	–	country assistance program evaluation
CSP	–	country strategy and program
DEC	–	Development Effectiveness Committee
DMC	–	developing member country
ECG	–	Evaluation Cooperation Group
GDP	–	gross domestic product
HSP	–	Health Sector Policy
MDG	–	Millennium Development Goal
OED	–	Operations Evaluation Department
RETA	–	regional technical assistance
SAPE	–	sector assistance program evaluation
TA	–	technical assistance

NOTE

In this report, “\$” refers to US dollars.

This report was prepared by N. Bestari and J. Tubadeza.

I. INTRODUCTION

1. The Operations Evaluation Department (OED) of the Asian Development Bank (ADB) independently evaluates ADB's operations, including performance of completed projects, programs, and technical assistance (TA). Evaluation also includes (i) reviewing and selectively validating self-evaluation activities of operational departments; (ii) providing feedback for the design and evaluability of new operations; (iii) evaluating the effectiveness of ADB's policies, practices, and procedures; (iv) monitoring, and reporting on, ADB's and executing agencies' response to OED evaluation recommendations; (v) building evaluation capacity within developing member countries (DMCs); and (vi) coordinating evaluation practices and activities with other multilateral development banks through the Evaluation Cooperation Group (ECG), and with other multilateral and bilateral assistance agencies.¹ OED conducts impact and special evaluation studies as well as sector and country assistance program evaluations (CAPEs). OED's effectiveness was enhanced when it became an independent department reporting to ADB's Board of Directors through its Development Effectiveness Committee (DEC), effective 1 January 2004.²

2. The aims of all ADB's evaluation activities are to provide lessons for future operations, account for use of resources, and recommend ways to sustain the benefits of activities supported by ADB. OED independently selects completed projects, programs, and TAs for performance audits. Topics for evaluation studies are selected in coordination with operational and other departments. OED's 2004 work program features (i) an increase in evaluation of broader development agenda such as policies, practices, and procedures, and in evaluation of sector and country assistance programs; (ii) a focus on inputs to CAPEs; and (iii) improvement of the evaluative content of two OED annual reports. OED's 2004 work program, which was reviewed by the DEC, includes (i) 15 project and 6 program performance audits, and 4 TA performance audits (Appendix 1); (ii) several other outputs of a recurring nature, such as an annual review of evaluation activities, and an annual evaluation of portfolio performance; and (iii) 13 evaluation studies, of which 7 will be funded under this regional technical assistance (RETA). Generally, consulting and other services and materials necessary to carry out evaluation studies are resourced through RETA funding under ADB's knowledge products and services program. A RETA framework for the selected evaluation studies for 2004 is in Appendix 2.³

II. ISSUES

3. Impact evaluation studies seek to assess the results of a group of activities in a particular sector, or to compare the results of similar activities in different DMCs. The emphasis is on the broad institutional and development impacts of ADB-assisted activities. One impact evaluation study is included in the work program. Special evaluation studies are undertaken on a wide range of topics, frequently policies or strategic concerns of ADB. The work program includes seven special evaluation studies: two on ADB policies, two on specific topics, one on a specific feature of ADB operations (cofinancing), one on a specific feature of project implementation (project implementation units), and one on targeted interventions. Initiated in 2003, sector assistance program evaluations (SAPEs) assess the relevance, effectiveness, and sustainability of ADB's assistance with respect to the sector's development and financial performance, as well as the impact of such aid on economic development and poverty

¹ Harmonization of evaluation activities through ECG has focused on good practices for evaluation of individual operations. The ECG agenda emphasizes a broad level of evaluations, involving several operations within a sector, or a country, or for a particular topic or policy.

² ADB. 2003. *Enhancing the Independence and Effectiveness of the Operations Evaluation Department*. Manila.

³ The RETA first appeared in *ADB Business Opportunities* (Internet version) on 19 December 2003.

reduction. The work program includes one SAPE. CAPEs assess the full range of ADB activities within a particular DMC over a decade or more. CAPEs seek to address issues relating to, and make recommendations on, the focus of ADB activities, including the sector mix and use of assistance modalities. CAPEs therefore contribute to assessing current, and formulating new, country strategies and programs. Given the country focus of ADB operations, country-level evaluations will play a large role in evaluation. The work program includes four CAPEs, to be undertaken at different times of the year, and completed between 2004 and 2005.

4. Evaluation studies generally require a longer time and a larger budget than evaluations of individual operations. Three or four evaluation studies are expected to be completed in 2005 rather than 2004. Evaluation studies account for more than 25% of total OED staff time. Operational and other departments have a demand for broad studies of development effectiveness of ADB operations to provide lessons for all DMCs in the region and for ADB.

III. THE PROPOSED TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

A. Purpose and Output

5. The purpose of this RETA is to assess the effectiveness of selected ADB operations and policies with respect to their relevance, efficacy, sustainability, impacts, and, where appropriate, efficiency; and to provide timely feedback on operational and policy issues to DMCs and ADB.

B. Methodology and Key Activities

6. The scope of each selected evaluation study of this RETA is as follows:

7. **Sector Assistance Program Evaluation on Asian Development Bank Assistance in the Power Sector in the Philippines.** With average electricity consumption at 578 kilowatt-hours per capita in 2000, and with more than 80% of its 80 million population having access to electricity, the Philippines is one of the most extensively electrified countries in Asia. However, the power sector is financially unhealthy, tariffs are high, and power supply is unreliable. ADB has been supporting development of the power sector since 1971, through 23 public sector loans for \$2.1 billion, 3 private sector loans and equity investments for \$90.5 million, and 21 TA grants totaling \$9.4 million. Coverage has been comprehensive, including power generation, transmission, and distribution. Entering the 1990s, ADB's assistance increasingly emphasized a development strategy of continued physical investment in system rehabilitation and expansion combined with engagement of the Government on a reform agenda, focusing on unbundling the sector, introducing competition, increasing private sector participation, and improving the sector's financial performance.

8. The SAPE's objective is to (i) comprehensively and independently assess ADB's assistance, on an aggregated basis, with regard to the sector's development and financial performance, as well as the impact of such assistance on economic development and poverty reduction; (ii) identify lessons from the past three decades; and (iii) identify key challenges facing the sector, and strategies to move forward for ADB's program.

9. **Special Evaluation Study on the Asian Development Bank's Policy on Fisheries.** The policy was approved in 1997.⁴ It is anchored on three basic objectives: (i) sustainability in conservation and utilization of fisheries and aquatic resources, (ii) equity in balancing the interests of competing resource users, and (iii) efficiency in the development and management

⁴ ADB. 1997. *The Bank's Policy on Fisheries*. Manila.

of aquatic resources. ADB supports a range of fishing activities, from artisanal to industrial, and from capture to aquaculture. Three major challenges are recognized: (i) rationalizing domestic fishing activities and regulating access of foreign fleets into exclusive economic zones; (ii) identifying and targeting underexploited fish resources; and (iii) strengthening monitoring, control, and surveillance systems. Harnessing aquaculture with minimal environmental costs was also recognized as a major challenge. ADB supports research and development, and dissemination of environment-friendly aquaculture technologies.

10. The purpose of this study is to evaluate the effectiveness and relevance of ADB's fisheries policy in (i) providing guidance to ADB's operations in the fisheries sector, (ii) contributing to fisheries management of DMCs, and (iii) promoting regional cooperation in fisheries resource management. The study will use desk reviews, field assessments, key-informant interviews, and country case studies to derive lessons learned and recommend ways to improve the fisheries policy.

11. **Special Evaluation Study on the Asian Development Bank's Policy for the Health Sector.** Approved in February 1999, ADB's Health Sector Policy (HSP)⁵ was set in place to provide direction to ADB operations in the health sector, inform DMCs about ADB priorities, and help DMCs select priorities and develop strategies to achieve them. The policy recommends ways to increase ADB's sector work, loans, and staff in the sector. The HSP highlights five strategic considerations: (i) improving primary health care for vulnerable groups, with particular attention to the poor, women, children, and indigenous peoples; (ii) focusing on achieving tangible results by improving project quality at entry and during project implementation, and strengthening monitoring and evaluation; (iii) supporting innovations and deployment of new technologies; (iv) encouraging DMC governments to reform the health sector; and (v) increasing efficiency of health sector investments by improving managerial capacity, strengthening economic and sector work, and enhancing intersectoral linkages.⁶ The role of health in development has been accentuated by the adoption of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) by external funding agencies and DMCs, and regional recognition of health risks associated with communicable diseases such as HIV/AIDS⁷ and severe acute respiratory syndrome. Four of the eight MDGs have specific targets for the health status of children and women, reproductive health, and control of major communicable diseases, reflecting the fact that health is one of the most important priorities for the poor.

12. The objectives of this study are to (i) evaluate the effectiveness and relevance of the HSP; (ii) assess whether the issues and options highlighted are still relevant, particularly in the context of health issues and problems in the region and DMCs; (iii) assess whether ADB's operational strategies for the health sector are in place to meet the relevant MDGs; (iv) review areas where ADB has comparative advantage to make a strategic contribution to the region and DMCs; (v) assess ADB's capability to deliver in the health sector, including staffing; borrower's willingness to seek assistance from ADB; and appropriateness of existing financial instruments; (vi) explore the capacity of the health policy to support and establish direct linkages with specific nutrition and population initiatives; and (vii) derive lessons and recommend ways to improve the HSP.

13. **Special Evaluation Study on the Effectiveness of Targeted Interventions.** As part of the poverty reduction program, ADB-financed projects have increasingly been targeted

⁵ ADB. 1999. *Policy for the Health Sector*. Manila.

⁶ Nutrition issues were not explored in detail in the HSP, but were covered under the ADB Nutrition and Development Series. Population issues were not included in the HSP but were addressed in ADB's Population Policy of 1994. A separate special evaluation study on nutrition is included in OED's 2004 work program.

⁷ Human immunodeficiency virus/acquired immunodeficiency syndrome.

interventions. In the rural sector, for example, these involved targeting poor regions, communities, and households. Interventions have also been formulated to target particular sectors such as primary education and health to directly impact on the non-income dimensions of poverty. The effectiveness of targeted interventions, however, is far from clear. For example, studies on projects driven by community demand report issues related to local elites' manipulation of community demand and investment decisions, as well as these elites' capture of most project benefits. Studies on microcredit projects reveal constraints on targeting the poorest of the poor. In contrast, other studies suggest that indirect poverty reduction through support for private sector job creation may work well under certain conditions, pointing to the important role of labor migration and non-farm employment in reducing rural poverty.

14. This study aims to answer two basic and related questions: (i) How effective and efficient have poverty reduction interventions been? and (ii) What conditions are necessary to make intervention targeting efficient and effective? Major outputs of this study will include (i) a comparison of poverty-reduction impacts under ADB-financed development projects using beneficiary targeting versus those without targeting, and (ii) an analysis of conditions required for successful targeting. The study will involve around five country case studies with multiple projects.

15. **Special Evaluation Study on Capital Market Assistance.** ADB has made considerable efforts to strengthen and deepen the financial markets in the region, in particular capital markets. Through operations that include lending and TA, ADB has tried to (i) launch or strengthen institutions that provide long-term finance for infrastructure projects, (ii) enact enabling regulations and institutions for private sector growth, and (iii) reduce vulnerabilities in the wake of the East Asian financial crisis.

16. This study will examine ADB's efforts to achieve these objectives, by summarizing experiences of selected countries and analyzing problems encountered. This study will investigate the underlying factors that contribute to successful and less successful assistance, and recommend possible future directions for ADB support. The scope of this study includes (i) a comparison of country experiences with long-term support from ADB, design, implementation, beneficiary ownership, and performance; and (ii) an investigation of the conditions for success. Careful attention will be paid to overall status and direction of monetary and structural reform policies of the governments. ADB's experience with emergency lending for capital market reforms will be taken into account to ensure a robust assessment.

17. **Country Assistance Program Evaluation for Bhutan.** Occupying 47,000 square kilometers, landlocked Bhutan has a population of about 700,000 in 2002. Although a relatively late starter in modern economic development, Bhutan has been spared abject poverty. The economy has fairly consistently exhibited robust growth rates, averaging 6.7% from 1997 to 2002. In recent years, the main contributors to gross domestic product (GDP) growth have been hydroelectric power, construction, and transport. Hydropower is the largest source of domestic revenues, contributing 45% of government revenues and more than 10% of the country's GDP. ADB has been one of the principal development partners in socioeconomic development, with lending and non-lending activities, primarily in the social, infrastructure, energy, transport, and agriculture sectors. Since 1983, ADB has provided 19 loans totaling \$111 million, and 85 TA grants for \$32 million.

18. The purpose of the proposed CAPE is to assess the development effectiveness of ADB assistance to Bhutan since the start of ADB operations in 1983. The CAPE will (i) identify overall program and project strengths and weaknesses, (ii) assess institutional capacity utilization parameters and constraints, (iii) analyze the role of conditionalities and major implementation

issues, (iv) assess the effectiveness of the country strategy process and the extent to which it has served as an important instrument in improving donor coordination, and (v) derive lessons learned and provide recommendations for the future country strategy and program (CSP).

19. **Country Assistance Program Evaluation for Indonesia.** Indonesia is ethnically diverse and geographically dispersed, with varied natural and human resources. At the end of 2002, Indonesia was ADB's third largest borrower, with 263 lending operations totaling \$19 billion, including social infrastructure (24%), agriculture and natural resources (21%), energy (18%), finance (16%), and transport and communications (13%). Indonesia has also been a major beneficiary of TA grants. From 1975 to 2002, it absorbed about 10% of all ADB TA funds (\$70 million) in about 320 TA operations. Before 1997, Indonesia's economic growth had been rapid. However, the Asian financial crisis exposed a number of key issues confronting the nation. Although dropping from a peak of 23.5% at the height of the crisis, poverty incidence remained at 18.2% in 2002. Overall economic development depends much on the rich natural resource base. With deforestation, deterioration of marine resources, and environmental problems stemming from rapid urbanization, issues of natural resource and environmental management have come to the forefront.

20. The CAPE's objective is to assess the development effectiveness of ADB's operations in Indonesia. In particular, the CAPE will focus on the (i) extent to which ADB's operations and the CSP have addressed priority issues; (ii) level of coordination between ADB and other agencies in addressing these issues; (iii) quality of implementation relating to lending and non-lending operations; and (iv) impact the overall ADB program has had in achieving the Government's development goals. The evaluation will concentrate on operations completed in recent years and those that are ongoing to assess the relevance, efficacy, efficiency, sustainability, and impact of ADB's overall assistance to Indonesia.

C. Cost and Financing

21. The RETA is estimated to cost \$1.4 million (Appendix 3). It will be financed by ADB on a grant basis from ADB's TA funding program.

D. Implementation Arrangements

22. OED will implement the RETA. An evaluation report will be prepared for each selected evaluation study. OED staff will lead the studies with the assistance of international and domestic consultants, who will be recruited individually. Altogether, about 40 person-months of international and about 75 person-months of domestic consulting inputs will be required. The individual areas of expertise, duration of engagement of consultants, and outline terms of reference are in Appendix 4. In keeping with OED's practice, a position paper for each study outlining the detailed approach, methodology, and terms of reference will be prepared before engaging consultants and commencing the studies. Consultants will be engaged according to ADB's *Guidelines on the Use of Consultants* and other arrangements satisfactory to ADB on the engagement of domestic consultants. Operational departments and DMC governments will be consulted at all stages of formulation and implementation, and involved in discussion of results. The RETA will commence in March 2004 and be completed by the end of 2005.

IV. THE PRESIDENT'S RECOMMENDATION

23. The President recommends that the Board approve the provision of technical assistance not exceeding the equivalent of \$1,400,000 on a grant basis for Selected Evaluation Studies for 2004.

EVALUATION REPORTS AND STUDIES TO BE UNDERTAKEN IN 2004

Evaluation Reports and Studies	Number
A. Performance Audit Reports^a	25
1. Project Performance Audit Reports	15
a. Sectors	
i. Social Infrastructure	5
ii. Agriculture and Natural Resources	2
iii. Energy	2
iv. Transport and Communications	2
v. Finance and Industry	2
vi. Others	1
vii. Private Sector	1
b. Countries ^b	
2. Program Performance Audit Reports	6
a. Sectors	
i. Finance	2
ii. Social Infrastructure	2
iii. Agriculture and Natural Resources	1
iv. Multisector	1
b. Countries ^c	
3. Technical Assistance Performance Audit Reports	4
a. Sectors	
i. Energy	1
ii. Social Infrastructure	1
iii. Others	2
B. Evaluation Studies	13
1. Impact Evaluation Study	1
a. Research and Development, and Dissemination of Genetically Improved Farmed Tilapia in Selected Countries ^a	
2. Special Evaluation Studies	7
a. ADB's Policy on Fisheries ^d (for completion in early 2005)	
b. ADB's Policy on Health Sector ^d	
c. Health and Nutrition ^e	
d. Capital Market Assistance ^d	
e. Cofinancing Operations ^e	
f. Role of Project Implementation Units ^e	
g. Effectiveness of Targeted Interventions ^d (for completion in early 2005)	

ADB = Asian Development Bank.

^a To be financed under administrative budget.

^b Covering 10 countries.

^c Covering 6 countries.

^d To be financed under this regional technical assistance (RETA).

^e Covered under previous RETAs.

Continued on next page

Table—Continued

Evaluation Reports and Studies	Number
3. Sector Assistance Program Evaluation a. ADB Assistance in the Power Sector in the Philippines ^d	1
4. Country Assistance Program Evaluations a. Indonesia ^d b. Nepal ^e c. Pakistan ^e (for completion in early 2005) d. Bhutan ^d (for completion in early 2005)	4
C. Annual Evaluation Reports	2
1. Annual Review of Evaluation Activities in 2003 2. Annual Report on Loan and Technical Assistance Portfolio Performance for the Period ending 31 December 2003	

REGIONAL TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FRAMEWORK

Design Summary	Performance Indicators/Targets	Project Monitoring Mechanisms	Risks and Assumptions
1. Goal			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reduce poverty by improving the effectiveness of Asian Development Bank (ADB) operations and enhancing ADB's contribution to the progress of developing member countries (DMCs). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Improved performance and sustainability of ADB-financed operations Higher project and technical assistance success rate 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Annual review of evaluation activities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Commitment of ADB and government decision makers to accept evaluation process and findings
2. Purpose			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Derive lessons from ADB's assessment, and promote sustainability and long-term impact of ADB assistance to DMCs. Recommend appropriate measures for design of future programs, and for changes in ADB policies and procedures. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Use of lessons and best practices in future operations 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Follow-up of recommendations 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Commitment of ADB and DMC governments to implement the lessons and recommendations Dissemination of conclusions and recommendations Cooperation among the agencies involved
3. Outputs			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Seven reports presenting the overall conclusions and recommendations for future actions by ADB and DMC governments, including analysis of crosscutting priorities and survey results 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reports approved for circulation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Position papers, and inception and progress reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Validity of recommendations Quality of outputs from consultants
4. Inputs			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Consulting services Staff resources 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ADB financing of around \$1.4 million to cover the costs of (i) consulting services comprising international consultants for 40 person-months intermittently, and domestic consultants for 75 person-months intermittently; and (ii) surveys and workshops ADB staff input budgeted at 50 person-months of professional staff time 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Project implementation reports, progress reports, consultants' reports, back-to-office reports Financial monitoring by the Controller's Department Contract monitoring by the Consulting Services Division 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Appropriate estimates of costs

COST ESTIMATES AND FINANCING PLAN (\$)

Item	Cost
1. Consultants	
a. Remuneration and Per Diem	
i. International Consultants	820,000
ii. Domestic Consultants	180,000
b. International and Local Travel	180,000
c. Reports and Communications	5,000
2. Seminars/Workshops ^a	25,000
3. Surveys	60,000
4. Miscellaneous Administration and Support Costs	20,000
5. Contingencies (8.5% of total base cost)	110,000
Total	1,400,000^b

^a Seminars and workshops are not technical assistance (TA) outputs but are held as needed either for acquiring inputs for draft reports or disseminating results.

^b Financed by the Asian Development Bank (ADB) TA funding program.

Source: ADB estimates.

OUTLINE TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR CONSULTANTS

A. Sector Assistance Program Evaluation for Asian Development Bank Assistance in the Power Sector in the Philippines

1. International Consultants

1. Two international consultants will be recruited for a total of 4 person-months: (i) an international power sector financial specialist for 2.5 person-months to provide technical inputs in evaluating the overall strategy, design, efficacy, efficiency, and sustainability of Asian Development Bank (ADB) assistance, taking into account the sector's historical and present financial performance, as well as ongoing and future sector restructuring and unbundling; and (ii) an international power engineering and operation specialist for 1.5 person-months to evaluate the technical and operation aspects of ADB assistance to the sector, and to identify key bottlenecks and engineering challenges facing the sector.

2. Domestic Consultants

2. To provide a vital local perspective to the evaluation, two domestic consultants will be recruited for a total of 4 person-months. The domestic power sector specialist, who will be well versed in local institutions and issues facing the power sector will be engaged for 2 person-months, and will provide critical support to international consultants, particularly for institutional aspects of the evaluation, and ensure that recommendations are feasible and practical. A domestic socioeconomic impact specialist will be engaged for 2 person-months to assess socioeconomic impacts of ADB assistance in the power sector. Under the supervision of an Operations Evaluation Department mission leader, the socioeconomic impact specialist will carry out a survey of key customers and stakeholders, including but not confined to industrial, commercial, and residential users and affected families.

B. Special Evaluation Study on the Asian Development Bank's Policy on Fisheries

1. International Consultants

3. Two international consultants will be recruited for a total of 5 person-months to (i) review the design and implementation of selected ADB-financed projects (loans and technical assistance [TA] operations) in the fisheries sector, and assess the extent to which the fisheries policy has been used as a guide; (ii) identify and assess relevant issues related to the relevance, efficacy, efficiency, sustainability, and institutional aspects of the implementation of the fisheries policy to guide ADB's lending and TA operations in the fisheries sector; (iii) identify lessons learned from the implementation of the fisheries policy; (iv) develop case studies as part of the evaluation approach; (v) identify options to overcome constraints on implementing the fisheries policy; and (vi) recommend ways to improve the fisheries policy to guide future ADB operations.

2. Domestic Consultants

4. Domestic consultants will be engaged for 20 person-months to undertake the following in the selected developing member countries (DMCs): (i) collect, analyze, and interpret data in-country; (ii) identify and synthesize key design and implementation issues of selected projects; (iii) qualitatively assess specific issues in-depth by interviewing key informants and stakeholders, including project beneficiaries; (iv) synthesize contextual conditions of relevance

to the fisheries policy, and identify key avenues, shortcomings, and constraints that have influenced implementation of the fisheries policy; and (v) help prepare country case studies.

C. Special Evaluation Study on the Asian Development Bank's Policy for the Health Sector

1. International Consultants

5. Two international consultants—an expert in health policy and another in health economics—will be recruited for a total of 5 person-months, intermittently. The consultants will help (i) review selected ADB health sector operations, and examine their relevance to the Health Sector Policy (HSP); (ii) assess selected DMCs' health, population, and nutrition plans, strategies, policies, and their performance in the context of ADB operations; (iii) identify the strengths, constraints, and weaknesses of the HSP and its implementation, and explore possible options and solutions to overcome shortcomings; (iv) assess how much ADB health sector operations have helped meet the Millennium Development Goals; (v) prepare a comparative analysis of ADB and key development partner programs to determine ADB's role in the health sector; (vi) derive lessons learned; and (vii) recommend ways to improve the HSP for future ADB operations.

2. Domestic Consultants

6. Five domestic consultants, one for each DMC representing each subregion, will be recruited for a total of 10 person-months, intermittently. The consultants will help the international consultants (i) assess the Government's health, population, and nutrition strategies, policies, plans, constraints; and the performance of these sectors in the context of ADB operations; (ii) prepare summary evaluations of completed operations in these sectors to assess the performance and impacts of ADB's assistance; and (iii) prepare a comparative analysis of ADB and key development partner programs.

D. Special Evaluation Study on the Effectiveness of Targeted Interventions

1. International Consultants

7. Two international consultants will be engaged for a total of 5 person-months to (i) help select countries or regions with remarkable achievements in reducing poverty as well as those with persistent poverty in spite of substantial development interventions; (ii) assess social, economic, and cultural factors and contexts, and development interventions, including policy and institutional reforms as well as public investments; (iii) assess and compare poverty-reduction dimensions and effects of direct and indirect interventions; (iv) assess the contribution of selected ADB-financed development projects to poverty reduction; (v) compare the effectiveness and efficiency of targeted and nontargeted interventions of selected ADB-financed projects; (vi) compare the impacts of different targeting strategies (for sectors, geographic areas, communities, or households, for example); (vii) assess and synthesize factors that make a difference in poverty reduction impacts; and (viii) recommend ways to design targeting strategies under different conditions.

2. Domestic Consultants

8. Five domestic consultants will be recruited for a total of 10 person-months to (i) take part in planning details and logistics and in developing approaches for field visits, (ii) develop information-gathering instruments, (iii) conduct interviews and fieldwork, (iv) facilitate on-site

translation, and (v) synthesize field assessments and findings and help write reports. The domestic consultants should have extensive experience in grassroots fieldwork and be prepared to spend considerable time, including staying overnight, in villages.

E. Special Evaluation Study on Capital Market Assistance

1. International Consultants

9. International consultants will be recruited for 4 person-months. They will have extensive work experience in capital market development and regulation, and private sector development issues. The consultants will also need to be well versed in project design, with implementation experience and a proven track record in pursuing issues on time and analytically. The consultants will (i) assess significant lessons relating to program design and implementation, and examine their relevance and applicability to formulating similar policy-based program loans in the future, in general and in specific country circumstances; (ii) identify and quantify, to the extent possible, the impact and output of the reform programs, and substantiate them with supporting data; (iii) identify unintended program impacts; (iv) assess how much program reforms have been sustained in terms of policy and actual implementation; and (v) assess the performance of related TAs and their relevance to reform objectives.

2. Domestic Consultants

10. Domestic consultants with a background in capital market development will be recruited for a total of 12 person-months to (i) help develop indicators, (ii) compile statistical appendices on the capital markets, and (iii) provide country background and conduct literature reviews. The consultants will be based in the Philippines, work in the ADB headquarters, and go on mission as needed to meet their work requirements.

F. Country Assistance Program Evaluation for Bhutan

1. International Consultants

11. Two international consultants will be engaged for a total of 5 person-months to (i) review Bhutan's macroeconomic environment and development plans, other development agencies' contributions, and ADB's diagnosis of the country's development needs and problems; (ii) assess ADB's assistance strategies to Bhutan and the relevance and appropriateness of ADB's operational strategies and interventions; (iii) evaluate ADB's operations (lending and non-lending to private and public sectors), and determine the efficiency and efficacy of ADB's operational programs; (iv) assess the implications of the country's changing environment; and (v) identify new opportunities and responsibilities, issues, and lessons learned for consideration in preparing and implementing the country strategy and program.

2. Domestic Consultants

12. Two domestic consultants will be engaged for a total of 7 person-months to help the study team (i) review relevant country program documents, government plans and reports, and documents from other sources (including private sector where available); and undertake key-informant interviews with selected local beneficiaries of ADB's assistance to gauge the impact of such assistance; (ii) identify key sectors of ADB's assistance and assess the level of achievements of stated objectives of various assistance programs; and (iii) assess ADB's assistance to the country.

G. Country Assistance Program Evaluation for Indonesia

1. International Consultants

13. Four international consultants will be recruited for a total of 12 person-months to provide a complementary mix of experience and expertise in finance, macroeconomic and sector reforms, governance, legal and judiciary reforms, poverty, participatory appraisal, human development, and environment and natural resource management. The international consultants will (i) review relevant documents related to their area of focus in Indonesia, including the country strategy and program (CSP), economic and sector work, project documents, and evaluation reports; (ii) review ADB's country portfolio, including completed and ongoing projects; (iii) collect secondary data, undertake fieldwork, and work with domestic consultants to gather information; (iv) interview, and collect information from, key informants, including central and local governments, development agencies, nongovernment organizations, and other stakeholders; (v) assess the relevance, efficacy, efficiency, sustainability, and impact of ADB's assistance program during the period selected; (vi) analyze and attribute the impact of the overall program to the extent possible, taking into account the contribution of other agencies and exogenous factors; (vii) evaluate borrower and ADB performance in the assigned area of focus; and (viii) synthesize lessons learned and recommend ways to dispense ADB assistance in the medium term.

2. Domestic Consultants

14. Four domestic consultants with sector expertise will be engaged for 12 person-months. The domestic consultants will (i) review relevant documents related to the sector assigned, including the CSP, related project documents, and relevant reports from the government and other sources; (ii) under the guidance of the international consultants, collect and collate relevant secondary and primary data related to overall country and sector developments; (iii) undertake key-informant interviews and conduct stakeholder surveys as necessary; (iv) assess the impact and sustainability of ADB's assistance program in the selected sectors; and (v) highlight recommendations for ADB assistance to the sector based on lessons learned.